

# The limits of the Curry-Howard isomorphism

Anton Setzer\*

August 31, 2013

The well-known Curry-Howard isomorphism relates functions with proofs and can be considered as one of the conceptional bases of Martin-Löf's type theory.

For our considerations, the crucial correspondence is the one between (intuitionistic) proofs of an implication  $A \rightarrow B$  and functions of the type  $A \rightarrow B$ . To make sense out of this correspondence, the functions need to be, of course, *total*, i.e., for every element of  $A$  the function need to associate an element of  $B$ .

Nonetheless that totality of functions is a desirable property, it does not match with computational reality. It is not only the case that non-terminating computations appear natural; even more importantly, modern recursion theory gains its power from the admission of *partial* functions.

.... partial recursive functions etc pp - auch Zitat von Kleene bzgl. Diagonalisierung von "Church's These" ...

Partial functions are easily integrated in *type-free* contexts, and we may address shortly some interesting historical considerations regarding *functional self-application*, cf. [?]. The main of this talk is, however, to illustrate the role of partial functions in the formalization of Anton Setzer's *extended predicative Mahlo universe*, [KS10].

A Mahlo universe is ....

Axiomatically, such a Mahlo universe can be introduced roughly as follows: ... Strahm...

This axiomatization is clearly highly impredicative, as (the type of) the function used in the premise refers to the Mahlo universe which is some "to be constructed".

A corresponding axiomatization in Martin-Löf type theory was given by Setzer [Set00], whose formalization is, however, more involved due to the specific technicalities of this type theory, but which suffers from the same impredicativity.

Setzer proposed an alternative construction of a Mahlo universe "from below", which has a predicative flavour. Since the resulting theory will

---

\*Dept. of Computer Science, Swansea University. [a.g.setzer@swan.ac.uk](mailto:a.g.setzer@swan.ac.uk)

proof-theoretically go beyond what is called the limit of predicativity (i.e., theories with the proof-theoretic strength of  $\Gamma_0$ ), this approach is dubbed *extended predicative*.

The rough idea is to ....

In doing so, we will construct “sub-universes” of  $M$  which are closed under a function  $f$  which *need not to be total on  $M$* ; thus,  $f$  is a partial function (seen from  $M$ ).

The sub-universes, together with their corresponding functions under which they are closed, are now essential to formulate a sound induction rule for such a Mahlo universe (corresponding to an elimination rule in Martin-Löf type theory) or, what’s the same, defining a *least Mahlo universe*.

It turns out that the permission of partial functions is substantial for the axiomatization of a least Mahlo universe, which, hence, cannot be formulated in Martin-Löf type theory.

This result suggests, on the proof-theoretic side, that the least Mahlo universe already exceeds the “limit of Martin-Löf type theory”; on the more conceptional side, it challenges the restriction to total functions in the Curry-Howard correspondence, although the question what the meaning of a “partial implication” could be remains a desideratum.

## References

- [KS10] Reinhard Kahle and Anton Setzer. An extended predicative definition of the Mahlo universe. In Ralf Schindler, editor, *Ways of Proof Theory*, Ontos Series in Mathematical Logic, pages 309 – 334. Ontos Verlag, 2010.
- [Set00] Anton Setzer. Extending Martin-Löf type theory by one Mahlo-universe. *Arch. Math. Log.*, 39:155 – 181, 2000.