

madelaine

Job: second

Generated: 2025-10-23T02:00:30Z

Overall Score

14/20 (14 / 20)

Summary

The essay presents a clear argument about the origin of Chronic Wasting Disease from TSE, with solid organization and adequate support from sources, demonstrating a good understanding of the topic. Strengths include logical progression and relevant evidence, but improvements are needed in deepening the critical analysis and polishing language mechanics to eliminate noticeable errors. Overall, it effectively addresses the prompt but could benefit from more original insights and precise writing.

Criteria

thesis_argument — Thesis and Argument (Score: 3)

Assigned Level: Thesis is clear and focused, with a solid argument that adequately addresses the prompt. (3)

Description: Evaluates the clarity, insight, and guidance provided by the thesis in addressing the prompt.

Example 1 excerpt: Due to the disease's relatedness in transmission, effects, and symptoms, it is the most likely origin of chronic wasting disease through the evolution of the virus.

Example 1 comment: This thesis statement clearly outlines the main argument linking TSE to CWD through shared characteristics, providing a focused direction for the essay that adequately responds to exploring the disease's origin.

Example 2 excerpt: Despite this, one possible determination of CWD may be that it evolved from a preexisting disease. One such possibility that researchers know of is called transmissible spongiform encephalopathy (Emerging).

Example 2 comment: The introduction sets up the argument by introducing the evolutionary link to TSE, supporting the thesis's focus on relatedness, though it could be more precise in terminology.

Improvement Suggestion: To reach the top level of a clear, insightful thesis that effectively guides the essay with a strong, original argument, refine your statement to incorporate unique insights, such as potential ecological implications. For example, revise to: 'Given the

prion-based similarities in transmission, neurological effects, and symptoms, CWD likely originated from TSE through natural adaptation in shared habitats, posing risks to wildlife management.' This earns the highest level by adding originality and depth, ensuring the thesis not only states the connection but also hints at broader impacts for a more guiding and insightful framework.

organization_coherence — Organization and Coherence (Score: 3)

Assigned Level: Clear structure with effective transitions; ideas flow logically overall. (3)

Description: Assesses the structure, transitions, and logical flow of ideas.

Example 1 excerpt: TSE is a disease transmitted in the same or similar ways when compared to CWD. These diseases can be transmitted in three ways: through bodily fluids, contaminated environmental factors (such as water or food), and infected carcasses (U.S. Geological Survey).

Example 1 comment: This paragraph opener smoothly transitions from the introduction to detailing transmission, maintaining logical progression by building on the thesis's mention of relatedness.

Example 2 excerpt: Alongside the many ways that TSE could have been transmitted to cervid populations, the way it affects sheep and goat species makes it clear that it has commonalities with CWD (3).

Example 2 comment: The phrase 'Alongside the many ways' effectively links the previous section on transmission to the new focus on effects, ensuring coherent flow despite minor citation issues.

Improvement Suggestion: Aim for the top level of exceptionally well-organized writing with seamless transitions and coherent progression by enhancing connectivity between sections with more varied transitional phrases. For instance, instead of 'Alongside the many ways,' use: 'Building on these transmission parallels, the neurological impacts of TSE further mirror those of CWD, as both involve prion misfolding that leads to brain degeneration.' This change achieves the highest level by creating seamless idea progression, eliminating any sense of disjointedness and elevating the overall coherence through precise, engaging links.

development_support — Development and Support (Score: 3)

Assigned Level: Adequate evidence and examples that effectively support main points. (3)

Description: Examines the use of evidence and examples to support main points.

Example 1 excerpt: An example of how this may work is infected livestock leaving waste behind in a pasture and deer passing through that pasture and being exposed (U.S. Geological Survey).

Example 1 comment: This concrete example illustrates transmission effectively, drawing on a credible source to support the argument about crossover from livestock to wildlife.

Example 2 excerpt: Both diseases have been diagnosed as misfolded proteins in the brain (Merck). These proteins are known as prions, which are often produced by mammals for common cellular functions and then recycled or degraded.

Example 2 comment: The explanation of prions as the cause provides adequate support by citing Merck and detailing the mechanism, reinforcing the similarity between TSE and CWD.

Improvement Suggestion: To attain the highest level of rich, relevant evidence from credible sources integrated smoothly to strongly support the argument, expand examples with more specific data or studies and weave them seamlessly. For example, revise the pasture example to: 'For instance, USGS reports document prions persisting in soil for years, allowing deer to ingest contaminated grass from livestock waste, as observed in Colorado outbreaks (U.S. Geological Survey, 2023).' This secures the top level by integrating detailed, source-specific evidence that not only supports but also strengthens the argument through vivid, authoritative reinforcement.

critical_analysis — Critical Analysis and Understanding (Score: 3)

Assigned Level: Solid analysis with clear interpretation and appropriate engagement with the topic. (3)

Description: Evaluates the depth of analysis and engagement with the topic.

Example 1 excerpt: Their resistance to natural disease elimination methods may have contributed to the spread of chronic wasting disease among deer populations.

Example 1 comment: This sentence interprets the prion resistance's role in CWD spread, showing clear engagement by connecting TSE properties to broader implications for wildlife.

Example 2 excerpt: Similarities in symptomatology lead to the same path from differing disease origin.

Example 2 comment: The analysis here appropriately links symptoms to shared developmental patterns, demonstrating solid understanding of how these traits support an evolutionary origin theory.

Improvement Suggestion: Strive for the top level of sophisticated analysis with original insights and deep engagement by exploring implications or counterarguments. For example, expand on prion resistance: 'Beyond mere similarity, the prions' environmental persistence—resistant to degradation for over a decade, per Emerging Infectious Diseases—suggests TSE adaptation via natural selection in cervid habitats, challenging containment efforts in mixed livestock-wildlife areas.' This reaches the highest level by introducing original insights on adaptation and policy challenges, fostering deeper critical engagement beyond description.

language_style_mechanics — Language, Style, and Mechanics (Score: 2)

Assigned Level: Readable but with noticeable errors in grammar, style, or mechanics that affect clarity. (2)

Description: Reviews clarity, precision, and error-free writing.

Example 1 excerpt: This is a disease that causes the local populations of elk, deer, reindeer , and moose to die slowly over a few years.

Example 1 comment: The extra space before the comma in 'reindeer ,' disrupts readability, exemplifying mechanical errors that slightly hinder the flow despite the sentence being otherwise clear.

Example 2 excerpt: Symptoms that are commonly held between TSE and chronic wasting disease include behavioral changes, excessive drooling, weight loss, hair pulling, and incoordination (Merck & Chronic).

Example 2 comment: While the list is readable, the ampersand in the citation '(Merck & Chronic)' is informal and inconsistent, affecting professional style and clarity in sourcing.

Improvement Suggestion: Target the top level of polished, engaging prose with precise language, varied sentences, and no errors by proofreading for spacing, formatting, and consistency. For instance, correct and vary the symptoms sentence: 'Both TSE and CWD manifest in striking behavioral shifts—such as excessive drooling, rapid weight loss, self-inflicted hair pulling, and severe incoordination—ultimately leading to fatal neurological decline (Merck Veterinary Manual; Chronic Wasting Disease Alliance).' This attains the highest level by eliminating errors, using precise terminology, and varying structure for engagement, resulting in fluid, error-free prose that enhances overall impact.