

**Exercise 2.1.13.**

Let  $f : X \rightarrow X$  be a topological dynamical system. (1)

Show that  $\mathcal{R}(f) \subseteq \text{NW}(f)$ . (2)

**Proof + reasoning:**

Let  $x \in \mathcal{R}(f)$ . (3)

Let  $U$  be a neighborhood of  $x$ , and  $V$  an open set such that  $V \subseteq U$  and  $x \in V$ . (4)

We need to show that there exists an  $n \geq 1$  such that  $f^n(U) \cap U \neq \emptyset$ . (5)

By (3) and (4), there exists a recurrent point  $y$  in  $U$ . (6)

By (6), there exists an increasing sequence  $(n_k)$  such that

$$f^{n_k}(y) \rightarrow y \quad \text{and} \quad n_k \rightarrow \infty. \quad (7)$$

Intuitively, the sequence of sets  $f^{n_k}(U)$  should eventually intersect with  $U$ , giving our required result. (8)

A possible problem in the proof so far is that  $y$  may not be in the interior of  $U$ , so  $x$  is not necessarily in a neighborhood of  $y$ , so it is possible that  $f^{n_k}(U)$  comes arbitrarily close to  $y$  but never intersects with  $U$ . (9)

I think we can avoid this problem by making a stronger statement than (6), using  $V$  instead of  $U$ : (10)

By (3) and (4), there exists a recurrent point  $z$  in  $V$ . (11)

By (11), there exists an increasing sequence  $(m_k)$  such that

$$f^{m_k}(z) \rightarrow z \quad \text{and} \quad m_k \rightarrow \infty. \quad (12)$$

Since  $V$  is a neighborhood of  $z$ , by (12) there exists an  $M \geq 1$  such that  $\forall i \geq M$ ,  $f^{m_i}(z) \in V$ , so  $f^{m_M}(z) \in U$ , hence  $f^{m_M}(U) \cap U \neq \emptyset$ . (13)

By (13),  $\mathcal{R}(f) \subseteq \text{NW}(f)$ .  $\square$  (14)