

$$4. ((\forall R)C) \sqcap (\exists R)C' \sqsubseteq (\exists R)C$$

① Form counter example
 $\neg((\exists R)C) \rightsquigarrow \forall R(\neg C)$

$$A := \{((\forall R)C \sqcap (\exists R)C')(a), (\forall R(\neg C))(a)\}$$

② Negations pushed inside

③ Apply Rules

$$\begin{array}{l} \sqcap\text{-Rule on } (\forall R.C \sqcap \exists R.C')(a) \\ A := A \cup \{((\forall R)C)(a), ((\exists R)C')(a)\} \end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{l} \exists\text{-Rule on } (\exists R.C')(a) \\ A := A \cup \{(R(a,b))C'(b)\} \end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{l} \forall\text{-Rule on } (\forall R.C)(a) \\ A := A \cup \{C(b)\} \end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{l} \forall\text{-Rule on } (\forall R.\neg C)(a) \\ A := A \cup \{\neg C(b)\} \end{array}$$

... contradiction as $C(b) \sqcap \neg C(b)$

However

no contradiction to $C'(b)$

\therefore subsumption does not hold

$$5. \forall R(C \sqcup C') \sqsubseteq (\forall R)C \sqcup (\forall R)C'$$

① Form counter Example

$$\neg(\forall R(C) \sqcup \forall R(C'))$$

$$\leadsto \neg(\forall R(C)) \sqcap \neg(\forall R(C'))$$

$$\leadsto \exists R(\neg C) \sqcap \exists R(\neg C')$$

$$A := \{ \forall R(C \sqcup C')(a), (\exists R(\neg C) \sqcap \exists R(\neg C'))(a) \}$$

② Negations pushed inside

③ Apply Rules

\sqcap -Rule on $(\exists R(\neg C) \sqcap \exists R(\neg C'))(a)$

$$A := A \cup \{ (\exists R(\neg C))(a), (\exists R(\neg C'))(a) \}$$

\sqcup -Rule on $(\forall R(C \sqcup C'))(a)$

$$A_1 := A \cup \{ (\forall R(C))(a) \}$$

$$A_2 := A \cup \{ (\forall R(C'))(a) \}$$

\exists -Rule on $((\exists R(\neg C))(a)$ on A_1

$$A_1 := A_1 \cup \{ R(a, b), \neg C(b) \}$$

\forall -Rule on $(\forall R(C))(a)$ on A_1

$$A_1 := A_1 \cup \{ C(b) \}$$

... contradiction as $C(b) \sqcap \neg C(b)$

5. contd.

\exists -Rule on ~~$(\exists x)C'(x)$~~ $(\exists x)(\neg C'(x))(a)$ on A_2

$$A_2 := A_2 \cup \{R(a, c), \neg C'(c)\}$$

\forall -Rule on $(\forall x)C'(x)(a)$ on A_2

$$A_2 := A_2 \cup \{C'(c)\}$$

... contradiction as $C'(c) \wedge \neg C'(c)$

\therefore subsumption holds.