

For each observation i of species j , we assumed that the timing of phenological events were generated from the following sampling distribution:

$$y_{i,j} \sim \mathcal{N}(\mu_j, \sigma_e^2) \quad (1)$$

where

$$\mu_j = \alpha_j + \beta_{chill,j}X_{chill} + \beta_{force,j}X_{force} + \beta_{photo,j}X_{photo} \quad (2)$$

and σ_e^2 represents random error unrelated to the phylogeny.

Predictors X_{chill} , X_{force} , X_{photo} are standardized chilling, forcing, and photoperiod, and their effects on the phenology of species j are determined by parameters $\beta_{chill,j}$, $\beta_{force,j}$, $\beta_{photo,j}$, representing species' responses (or sensitivities) to each of the cues. These responses, including the species-specific intercept α_j , are elements of the following normal random vectors:

$$\begin{aligned} \boldsymbol{\alpha} &= [\alpha_1, \dots, \alpha_n]^T \text{ such that } \boldsymbol{\alpha} \sim \mathcal{N}(\mu_{\boldsymbol{\alpha}}, \boldsymbol{\Sigma}_{\boldsymbol{\alpha}}) \\ \boldsymbol{\beta}_{chill} &= [\beta_{1,1}, \dots, \beta_{chill,n}]^T \text{ such that } \boldsymbol{\beta}_{chill} \sim \mathcal{N}(\mu_{\boldsymbol{\beta}_{chill}}, \boldsymbol{\Sigma}_{\boldsymbol{\beta}_{chill}}) \\ \boldsymbol{\beta}_{force} &= [\beta_{2,1}, \dots, \beta_{force,n}]^T \text{ such that } \boldsymbol{\beta}_{force} \sim \mathcal{N}(\mu_{\boldsymbol{\beta}_{force}}, \boldsymbol{\Sigma}_{\boldsymbol{\beta}_{force}}) \\ \boldsymbol{\beta}_{photo} &= [\beta_{3,1}, \dots, \beta_{photo,n}]^T \text{ such that } \boldsymbol{\beta}_{photo} \sim \mathcal{N}(\mu_{\boldsymbol{\beta}_{photo}}, \boldsymbol{\Sigma}_{\boldsymbol{\beta}_{photo}}) \end{aligned} \quad (3)$$

where the means of the multivariate normal distributions are root trait values (i.e., values of cue responses prior to evolving across a phylogenetic tree) and $\boldsymbol{\Sigma}_i$ are $n \times n$ phylogenetic variance-covariance matrices of the form:

$$\begin{bmatrix} \sigma_i^2 & \lambda_i \times \sigma_i \times \rho_{12} & \dots & \lambda_i \times \sigma_i \times \rho_{1n} \\ \lambda_i \times \sigma_i \times \rho_{21} & \sigma_i^2 & \dots & \lambda_i \times \sigma_i \times \rho_{2n} \\ \vdots & \vdots & \ddots & \vdots \\ \lambda_i \times \sigma_i \times \rho_{n1} & \lambda_i \times \sigma_i \times \rho_{n2} & \dots & \sigma_i^2 \end{bmatrix} \quad (4)$$

where σ_i^2 is the rate of evolution across a tree for trait i (here assumed to be constant along all branches), λ_i scales branch lengths and therefore is a measure of the “phylogenetic signal” or extent of phylogenetic relatedness on each model parameter (i.e., α_j , $\beta_{force,j}$, $\beta_{chill,j}$, $\beta_{photo,j}$), and ρ_{xy} is the phylogenetic correlation between species x and y , or the fraction of the tree shared by the two species.

The above specification is equivalent to writing equation ?? in terms of root trait values and residuals, such that:

$$\mu_j = \mu_{\boldsymbol{\alpha}} + \mu_{\boldsymbol{\beta}_{chill}}X_{chill} + \mu_{\boldsymbol{\beta}_{force}}X_{force} + \mu_{\boldsymbol{\beta}_{photo}}X_{photo} + e_{\alpha_j} + e_{\beta_{force,j}} + e_{\beta_{chill,j}} + e_{\beta_{photo,j}} \quad (5)$$

where the residual phylogenetic error terms (e.g., e_{α_j}) are elements of normal random vectors from multivariate normal distributions centered on 0 with the same phylogenetic variance-covariance matrices as in equation ???. Model code, including priors used here, are given in the supplement.