Detecting and Addressing Influence Tactics in Online Propaganda Coding Manual

Updated on October 13th, 2020

<u>Instructions</u>: Please label whether each text contains the categories described below. You will indicate whether each category is present or absent. Texts may have zero, one, or more of these categories. Sometimes one phrase/sentence could trigger more than one category. Code only the text (including the text in the picture).

Category (as seen in Qualtrics coding sheet)	Explanation	Examples
Coder Name	Please select your name	
Text ID	The content you should code	Usually shown as "Click here"
Was the text redacted? 1) Yes 2) No	-Select yes if the text is redacted and results in no text for you to code. Sometimes only a few words are redacted, then you should do your best to code. -Select yes if the text is not available or you can't open the link. When you select yes, you will be prompted to code the next text. When you select no, you will continue coding the current item	This is possible to code: Ad Text Join the event, bring your friends, feel safe with us! Don't miss the opportunity to train with our coach! You will enjoy it for sure. It's free! Organized on a donation basis. Join the event, bring your friends, feel safe with us! Don't miss the opportunity to train with our coach! You will enjoy it for sure. It's free! Organized on a donation basis. Free Self-Defense class in Lansing, MI Free Self-Defense class in Lansing, MI This is not possible to code: Ad Text repost Ad Landing Page https://www.facebook.com/blacktivists/ Ad Targeting Location: United States Age: 16 - 65+ This is not possible to code: This is not possible to code: This behappens, it suadalble Right New When the happens, it suadalble range the comer only shared it with a radial group of people changed who can see it or it's been defend. This behappens, it's usualble behaped who can see it or it's been defend. This content is the following who can see it or it's been defend.

Democratic presidential candidate."

Concept 1: Persuasion 1.1. Authority or Expertise/Source "Follow an expert" - Virgil -From P(1)0002145.pdf 2015/Q2: Credibility "The McKinney Police Department, Chief 1) Present Humans tend to comply with requests Of Police Greg Conley said" (uses 2) Absent made by figures of authority and/or authority/expertise) possess credibility/expertise. -From P(1)0002119.pdf 2015/Q2 Text can include: "Tupac Shakur was indeed not just one of the greatest rappers (expertise) of all time - Literal authority (e.g., law enforcement but a worldly icon whose status in hip-hop personnel, lawyers, judges, politicians) culture can never be replaced. His revolutionary knowledge mixed with street - Reputable/credible entity that could experience made him powerful exert some power over a person (e.g., a unstoppable force that spoke to the hearts bank, personnel) or not (e.g., a report) of millions of people" - Indirect authority (especially a fictitious -From P(1)0002125.pdf 2015/Q2 company/character) that builds a setting of "According to data (credibility) from authority Mapping Police Violence" (authority/expertise) Text related to this concept could be linked to some action verb, such as "said", -From P(1)0002244.pdf 2015/Q2 "provide", "talked", etc. The verb should "Autopsy Says" (expertise) describe what the authority figure did/does/is doing. -From 2016-q3 P(1)0000024 "Fox & Friends" hosts declare" Text could also describe qualifications of (expertise/credibility) the source of authority/expertise/credibility. "The Republican National Committee has developed (expertise/credibility/authority) a ""Spend-O-Meter"" to argue that the United States cannot afford all of the proposals Sen. Hillary Clinton has made as a

"Arkansas does indeed have (authority) an amendment to its state constitution concerning human life, but Huckabee overstates (authority) the impact of the amendment. "Forwarded message -VM#890-512-3806 Cell Phone voice message from office caller (authority), please click to listen for free." "Silicon Valley investor and Donald Trump transition team member, Peter Thiel (authority/expertise) says Apple is past its peak..." "We are factory specializing in manufacture and export to PCB(printed circuit board) 17 years. (expertise/authority). We have profuse designs with series quality grade, and expressly ,our price is very competitive because we are manufacturer, we are the source." 1.2. Reciprocation "The old give and take ... and take" - Cialdini From P(1)0000712 Q2 2017 1) Present "Aww! Because you need such a cutie 2) Absent Humans tend to repay, in kind, what (offering something that could lead to another person has provided them. You reciprocation) on your timeline!" reciprocate the good action, by doing something in return. -From P(1)0002584 "Good morning, dear friends! Have a tasty -Text might give/offer something, such information, something that makes you and colorful morning! All you need is love,

	smile, a picture. The expectation is that the person/user will reciprocate (in this case, share, like, comment, join, click, etc.). Even if the person does not reciprocate, s/he will still keep the "gift." Therefore, if the user <i>thinks</i> they received a gift, they may reciprocate the kindness.	coffee, and rainbow dishes!" (offering something, reciprocation)
1.3. Commitment and Consistency 1) Present 2) Absent	"It is easier to resist at the beginning than at the end" - Leonardo da Vinci Once humans have taken a stand (commitment), they will feel pressured to behave in line (consistency) with their commitment. -Text leverages a role assumed by the target and their commitment to that role. -Text might include petitions, donations/charity, related but not limited to gun control, animal abuse, children's issue, political issues, social issues, political affiliations, engagements.	"Black Matters" (implies commitment to a cause) -From P(1)0002119.pdf 2015/Q2 "But let's remember Tupac and his ability to question the social order. Changes, one of his popular songs, asks everyone to change their lifestyles for better society. He always asked people to share with each other and to learn to love each other." (last sentence, commitment & consistency) -From P(1)0002119.pdf 2273/Q2 Patriotism comes from your heart follow its dictates and don't live a false life (commitment). Join! -From P(1)0002424.pdf 2273/Q2 "we will stand for our right to keep and bear arms!" (commitment)

"Former host David Letterman took aim at President Donald Trump and the members of his administration in a lengthy interview with New York magazine this week, explaining that he'd still love to interview the real estate one final time. The former Late Night host, who retired in 2015, said that today's shows have an "obligation" to challenge the president (commitment), and described how he would interview Trump if he could get one final shot at him." "After a slow start to their Wild Card game vs. the New York Giants, the Green Bay Packers warmed up in the second quarter, thanks, as always, to Aaron Rodgers. At the end of the second quarter, with the Packers leading Rodgers made magic happen yet again." (last part indicates commitment/consistency) 1.3.1. Commitment: Indignation "Anger can be a bitterness that devours -From P(1)0002112.pdf 2015/Q2: your soul while righteous indignation is 1) Present "Why should we (indignation) be a target 2) Absent morally driven, it's ethically driven." for police violence and harassment?" Cornel West -From P(1)0002123.pdf 2015/Q2 -Text that focuses on anger or annoyance "Why the pool party in Georgia is a silent provoked by what is perceived as unfair story? (indignation) Why the police was not treatment, unjust, unworthy, mean. aware of a large party? (indignation) Why -Text that questions the status quo, that this story has no national outrage? Is it ok questions how things are currently. when a blackteenager dies?" (indignation)

-From P(1)0002243.pdf 2015/Q2: "Obama never tried to protect (indignation) blacks from police pressure" Sunday on ABC's "This Week," while discussing the American Health Care Act, Sen. Susan Collins () said it would be "a mistake" to defund Planned Parenthood. Collins said, "That is an important issue to me because I don't think that women should be denied their choice of health care providers, for family planning, cancer screenings, for well, women care. It's not the only issue in this huge bill. But I certainly think it's not fair (indignation) and it is a mistake to defund Planned Parenthood. It's one of many issues. " Follow Pam Key on Twitter @pamkeyNEN 1.3.2. Commitment: Call to action An exhortation or stimulus to do something -From P(1)0002122.pdf 2015/Q2 1) Present in order to achieve an aim or deal with a "Stop racism! (call to action) We all belong 2) Absent problem. to ONE HUMAN RACE." -Text intended to induce a viewer, reader, -From P(1)0002194.pdf 2015/Q2: or listener to perform a specific act. "We really can change the world if we stay typically taking the form of an instruction united" (call to action) or **directive**, such as buy now! click here, join today!, let's go, stop racism!, we can change, etc. -From P(1)0002226.pdf 2015/Q2: "We can be heard only when we stand together" (call to action)

-From P(1)0002256.pdf 2015/Q2: "White House must reduce (call to action) the unemployment rates of black population"

-From P(1)0000184.pdf 2016-Q3:

If this is a war against police - we're joining this war on the cop's side! (call to action)
-From P(1)0003514 2016/q3

If we want to stop it, we should fight as our ancestors did it for centuries. (call to action)

"System Administrator

To:

Dear Account User, Your E-mail mailbox has exceeded the limit of 23,432, which is as set by the ADMINISTRATOR, you are currently

at 23,000, very soon you will not be able to send or receive email until you validate your mailbox. To re-validate your mailbox, click on the link (call to action) below and follow the instruction (call to action) for your upgrade. To prevent your email account from being closed, re-validate your mailbox below please click here (call to action)

Sincerely, System Administrator."

1.4. Liking

- 1) Present
- 2) Absent

"The main work of a trial attorney is to make a jury like his client." —Clarence Darrow

Humans tend to comply with requests from people they like or with whom they share similarities.

Forms of Liking:

- Physical attractiveness: Good looks suggest other favorable traits. i.e. honesty, humor, trustworthiness
- Similarity: We like people similar to us in terms of interests, opinions, personality, background, etc.
- Compliments: We love to receive praises, and tend to like those who give
- Contact and Cooperation: We feel a sense of commonality when working with others to fulfill a common goal.
- Conditioning and Association: We like looking at models, and thus become more favorable towards the cars behind them

May also come in the form of establishing a familiarity or rapport with the object of liking.

-From P(1)0000198.pdf 2017-05: "What a beautiful and intelligent child she is. How magnificent is her mind..." (liking, attractiveness)

-From P(1)0002584 "Good morning, dear friends! (liking: compliment). Have a tasty and colorful

morning! All you need is love, coffee, and

rainbow dishes!"

"I do not have enough happiness, passion and warmth. (similarity) Give me this feeling! Dear, It's a beautiful day and i'am in a hurry to get in touch with you asap! My name is Sevgi, and I'm from Turkey. I really do believe in a destiny with a bright future for myself and that you could become a part of it become my true soulmate. I do want to be next to a loving man. (compliment). I love traveling. movies, pop music, seafood, and doing crazy things, but i feel like loneliness is swallowing me intensely lonely sometimes. I wish to find for my second half, who a man that will give me a real hope and true love! Hope you're interested in becoming a part of my adventure and will reply back soon. In the next letter, I'll send you my photo. Please write me back using my personal email: sevgilonely88@aol.com ----- Your true soul, Sevgi."

		-From P(1)0002186 "Your life matter. (compliment) My life matter. (similarity) Black matter. (commonality)"
1.5. Scarcity/Urgency/Opportunity 1) Present 2) Absent	"The rule of the few." - Cialdini The less there is of something, the more valuable. Implies a sense of short supply. The scarcity concept can appear as: -a sense of shortage, something that is in short supply -as opportunity: opportunities seem more valuable when their availability is limited. Text that leads users to think that they will be missing out on an opportunity if they do not engage. -as urgency: related to taking swift action. Creates a sense of urgency.	-From P(1)0002116.pdf 2015/Q2: "Is it time to call out the national guard?" (urgency) -From P(1)0002117 2015/Q2 "Free Figure's Black Power Rally at VCU:" (opportunity) -From P(1)0002127.pdf 2015/Q2: "CLICK TO GET LIVE UPDATES ON OUR PAGE" (opportunity) "Life is a gift, and it offers us the privilege, opportunity, and responsibility to give something back by becoming more. I am the greatest, I said that even before I knew I was. Success consists of going from failure to failure without loss of enthusiasm. Whatever you want to do, do it now. There are only so many tomorrows. (scarcity) Best Regards" "This message has been sent to you from National Westminster Bank because we have noticed invalid login attempts into your account, due to this we are temporarily limiting and restricting
		(scarcity) your account"

		-From P(1)0002424 "Republican strategist Karl Rove said on "Fox News Sunday" the only way to stop gun-related violence, like the Wednesday massacre at Emmanuel African Methodist Church in Charleston S.C., was to repeal American citizen's Second Amendment rights." (urgency)
1.6. Social Proof 1) Present 2) Absent	"Where all think alike, no one thinks very much." — Walter Lippmann People tend to mimic what the majority of people do/think or seem to be doing/thinking. Text that references what everyone else (or group of people) appears to be doing or thinking (i.e., herd mentality). The actions of the group drive the decision making process.	-From P(1)0002127.pdf 2056/Q2: "More riots (implies social proof, majority) are coming this summer" -From P(1)0003246 2016/Q3 "America is deceased. Islamic terror has penetrated our homeland (social proof) and now spreads (social proof) at a threw Remember Victims Of Islamic Terror" "As of September, an estimated had fled their homes since the war started in March 2011. They escaped to neighboring countries like Turkey, Iraq, Jordan, Egypt, and Lebanon, as well as to Europe. ''As migrants made the trek from their homes to new and unfamiliar places, many of them used (social proof) messaging apps like WhatsApp, Viber, and Line in order to communicate with their families."
1.6.1. Social Proof: Admonition 1) Present	Text that includes the following:	-From P(1)0005201.pdf 2017 Q2 April

2) Absent	 -To caution, advise, or counsel against something. -To reprove or reprimand, especially in a mild and good-willed manner: The teacher admonished him about excessive noise. -To urge to a duty; remind: to admonish them about their obligations. 	"Time to stop the ignorance" "A viral online story claims that Democratic U.S. Rep. Alexandria Ocasio-Cortez said Christianity should be ignored as ""superstitious nonsense."" -From P(1)0002586 "Silent no more! We deserve equal rights!"
Concept 2: Subjectivity vs. Objectivity		
2.1. Subjective 1) Present 2) Absent	Subjective sentences generally refer to personal opinion, emotion, or judgment. The use of popular adverbs (e.g, very, actually), upper case, exclamation and interrogation marks, hashtags, indicates subjectivity.	"I doubt that it's true" (personal opinion) -From (P(1)0000180.pdf, 2015/Q2) "A beautiful message was seen on the streets of the capitol," (personal opinion) "A timely message for today." (personal opinion) "No matter (personal opinion) what Defense Secretary or POTUS are saying they don't fool me (emotion) with promises of gay military equality as key to the nation's agenda." -From P(1)0002116.pdf 2015/Q2: "This is something that America has a serious issue with - RACISM!" (judgment, personal opinion, upper case, exclamation)

		"Is it time to call out the national guard?" (personal opinion, judgment, use of interrogation mark) -From P(1)0002112.pdf 2015/Q2: "This makes me ANGRY!" (emotion, upper case, escalation mark) -From P(1)0002122.pdf 2015/Q2 "Stop racism! We all belong to ONE HUMAN RACE." (judgment, upper case, exclamation mark) "A recent Facebook post appears (subjective, vague) to show former President Barack Obama peering through the wrong end of a pair of binoculars while a general crowd watches."
2.2. Objective 1) Present 2) Absent	Objective sentences refers to factual information, based on evidence, or when evidence is presented. May or may not include statistics.	"It has been discovered that" (firm, objective) -From P(1)0002125.pdf 2015/Q2 "According to data (objective, evidence) from Mapping Police Violence" -From P(1)0002145.pdf 2015/Q2: "The McKinney Police Department, Chief Of Police Greg Conley said"

		He did appear on Fox & Friends on Nov. 6 (objective, factual), and declared that though his dad wasn't on the ballot that election day, Republicans should get out and vote for other races.
		"Donald Trump is playing a round of golf with Tiger Woods on Friday morning, multiple sources (objective) reported." "It snowed on December 19 in the Sahara Desert, and NASA's Landsat 7 satellite was there (or rather, hundreds of miles overhead) to see it." (objective, factual)
		"First off, Barack Obama's middle name is not Mohammed; it's Hussein. He was named after his father, a Kenyan who came to the United States from Africa as a student." (objective, factual)
		-From P(1)0002578 The ninth transgender was found dead in the USA" (factual, objective)
Concept 3: Framing	Gain/Loss Framing refers to the presentation of a message (e.g., health message, financial options, advertisement etc.) as implying a possible gain (e.g., refers to possible benefits of performing a behavior) vs. implying a possible loss (e.g.,	

	refers to the costs of not performing a behavior).	
3.1. Gain 1) Present 2) Absent	People are likely to act in ways that benefit them in some way. A reward will increase the probability of a behavior. Examples: "Think about the benefits of recycling"; Think about what you can gain if you join" -Text can reference a promise that a product (or something else, such as group, person) can provide some form of self-improvement or benefit to the user. This product can come in the form of an ad, job offer, joining a group, etc.	"Review your ticket A new ticket was received against your account at Connectria Managed center and has been placed into the support queue. To view the details of this ticket please use the following link URL REMOVED. The complete details of the ticket are only accessible via the Connectria link provided above (gain, complete details = benefit). Subject: Connectria Notification: Network Maintenance - August 20, 2018 Thanks, Information technology service" "we have detected an irregular activity on your account and we are placing a hold on your account for your protection (gain, protection = benefit). Please click Here and follow the instructions to unlock your account." "I can not imagine my life alone. I need a beloved one. Good day, dear sir. My name is Sevgi. I am a woman, who believe in a destiny with a cheerful future for myself and that you could become a part of it. I do want to be next to a loving man. I wish to find a man that can give me a real hope and love! Hope you're interested in becoming a part of my adventure and will

		reply back soon! If you are interested in getting to know me closer (gain), please write to my personal e-mail - beautysevgi@fastmail.com Your true soul, Sevgi.
3.2. Loss 1) Present 2) Absent	People are likely to act in ways that reduce loss/harm to them. Avoiding loss will increase the probability of a behavior. Examples: "Think about the costs of not recycling"; "Think about what you lose if you don't join." -Text that can reference a promise that a product (or something else, such as a group, person) can help avoid some behavior/outcome.	"System Administrator To: Dear Account User, Your E-mail mailbox has exceeded the limit of 23,432, which is as set by the ADMINISTRATOR, you are currently at 23,000, very soon you will not be able to send or receive email until you validate your mailbox (loss). To re-validate your mailbox, click on the link below and follow the instruction for your upgrade. To prevent your email account from being closed (loss), re-validate your mailbox below please click here Sincerely, System Administrator."
Concept 4: Attribution of blame/guilt	When the text references an "another" (who/what) for the wrong/bad things happening	
4.1. Who/What 1) Present 2) Absent	Who can be a person/organization, etc. What can be a cause, object.	-From P(1)0003125.pdf 2017-05 "Hillary (who, attribution of guilt) is a Satan, and her crimes and lies had proved just how evil she is."

		"A photo (what) shared on Facebook falsely shows Democratic presidential candidate Pete Buttigieg dressed in a black leather suit and standing on the street posing for a picture alongside two other men." -From P(1)0002578 "Police in George County, Mississippi have charged a suspect Josh Brandon Vallum." (who)
Concept 5: Emphasis 5.1. Did the text use emphasis? 1) Present 2) Absent	Emphasis refers to the use of all caps text, exclamation points (either one or multiple), several question marks, bold text, italics text, or anything that is used to call attention. PS: acronyms are not considered emphasis, such as LGBT, TMZ, NASA, etc.	"The article starts off by saying Democrats are well known "for being anti-Christianity," and claims Ocasio-Cortez recently said this about the religion: "That religion is all very superstitious. They believe in all this nonsense. They believe in things that they don't understand, so they suffer. Superstition ain't the way??¬"" (double interrogation mark) -From P(1)0002569 "THE COLORFUL ACTIVISM OF NEW YORK'S MOST RADICAL QUEERS" (all caps)