

RLGS 4453: BTT — THE FATE OF THE DEAD

Fall 2009; Mon & Wed, 1:00-2:15 PM; Room #2083

Dr. Daniel R. Driver, ddriver@tyndale.ca, 416.226.6620 x2201 Office #1107, Hours Mon & Wed, 2:30–4:00 (or by arrangement) Website: www.tyndale.ca/~ddriver

Commuter Hotline — 416.226.6620 x2187

Class cancellations due to inclement weather or illness will be announced/posted here.

class.tyndale.ca — This course has resources pages (Moodle) which you will need to use to complete some assignments. Make sure that you are properly enrolled and can log in.

MyTyndale.ca — I will send notices to your official school email. Please check it regularly.

Mailboxes — Every student is responsible for information communicated through the student mailboxes (a mailbox directory is posted beside the mailboxes). I will return assignments here.

I. COURSE DESCRIPTION (BIBLICAL THEOLOGICAL THEMES):

Each course in this series examines a selected biblical theological theme such as the theology of the Hebrew Scriptures, the kingdom of God, Pauline theology, Johananine theology or the biblical view of disadvantaged people. Offered occasionally. Prerequisites: RLGS 1013, 1023 & 2013 (or 3603).

II. COURSE OBJECTIVES:

Ideas about death have changed dramatically in the history of reflection on the scriptures shared by Jews and Christians. A standard critical position holds that belief in life after death is a late development, found unambiguously in canonical Old Testament books only in Daniel (with traces elsewhere, such as in Isaiah). Yet exciting new work has sought to bring traditional beliefs back into play. The aim of this course is to introduce the historical-critical problem, and then to explore the biblical-theological horizons of a full complement of witnesses: the Old Testament, the New Testament, extra-biblical literature, and the outgrowth in Western Christianity through about 1300.

III. REQUIRED TEXTS:

- 1. Kevin J. Madigan and Jon D. Levenson, *Resurrection: The Power of God for Christians and Jews* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2008). Abbrev.: **M&L**
- 2. George W. E. Nickelsburg and James C. VanderKam, *1 Enoch: A New Translation* (Minneapolis: Augsburg Fortress, 2004). Abbrev.: **Enoch**
- 3. N. T. Wright, *The Resurrection of the Son of God* (Christian Origins and the Question of God, Vol. 3; Minneapolis: Augsburg Fortress, 2003). Abbrev.: **Wright**

4. Caroline Walker Bynum, *Resurrection of the Body in Western Christianity*, 200–1336 (New York: Columbia University Press, 1995). Abbrev.: **Bynum**

IV. SUPPLEMENTARY TEXTS:

- 1. Richard Bauckham, *The Fate of the Dead: Studies on the Jewish and Christian Apocalypses* (NovTSup, 93; Leiden: Brill, 1998; paperback repr. Atlanta: SBL, 1998).
- 2. Jon D. Levenson, Resurrection and the Restoration of Israel: The Ultimate Victory of the God of Life (Yale University Press, 2006).
- 3. N. T. Wright, Surprised By Hope: Rethinking Heaven, the Resurrection, and the Mission of the Church (New York: HarperOne, 2008).
- 4. Angelika Berlejung and Bernd Janowski, eds., *Tod und Jenseits im Alten Israel und in seiner Umwelt: Theologische, religionsgeschichtliche, archäologische und ikonographische Aspekte* (FAT, 64; Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2009).

V. COURSE EVALUATION:

- 1. Most weeks will commence with a **reading quiz**. These cover the reading assignments listed under the week in question. Competent reading is rare but crucial in the pursuit of higher learning; I design quizzes to ensure that you have read the material carefully, and to challenge you to improve your reading habits and abilities. Quizzes may not be made up in the case of absence, though in special cases they may be taken in advance.
- 2. Each week, you are to contribute **two discussion questions**, also based on the reading. Please submit these to the appropriate forum on Moodle by 7:00 a.m. on Wednesdays, (except in Week 7, in which case on Monday). Then, before class that afternoon, <u>read all questions and rate them</u>. (You cannot rate your own of course.) Mostly you earn points just for delivering two questions on time; however, questions that prove to be especially thoughtful, probing or profound will be rewarded.
- 3. Your **midterm review essay** will discuss the reading (Madigan and Levenson, Wright) in light of additional research into some period or problem it canvasses. An obvious candidate is the problem for traditional faiths, Jewish and Christian, raised by the modern scholarly consensus that the Old Testament does not envision life after death. (The bibliography at the end is geared toward this issue.) Other points of focus are possible as well, subject to my approval. Approaches to consider include:
 - a. Compare one author with his previous or subsequent work in the area. Wright has recently written another book on heaven and resurrection. You could trace the way his ideas have developed. Similarly, Levenson has at least two earlier titles comparable to the one he authored with Madigan. How does this work anticipate his latest book? If you detect changes, can you account for them? Explore and describe the significance of either author's book in the broader scope of his career.
 - b. Do you detect differences between the perspectives we have encountered? How do Madigan and Levenson differ because of their respective Christian and Jewish faiths? Develop a thesis about the coherence or success of their collaboration. Do they deal differently with the apparent lack of a traditional afterlife in the OT? In what ways? Where does Wright fit in? Theologically, what is at stake? You might also consider the vast literature in the area. How does another scholar's understanding of death in the OT measure up against one or more of our authors?

- c. Dig more deeply into some of the literature on 1 Enoch. Where does this work come from, and what does it mean? (I can guide you toward good secondary literature if this option interests you.) How do we think of it in relation to texts of our Bible, Old Testament and New? In what ways does it illuminate a study of the history of ideas about life after death? How does it pertain to our biblical theological theme?
- d. Focus on some part of the literature listed in the bibliography. (Practice your French or German if you feel up to it!) Give a full presentation of a contrasting perspective, making explicit connections with the primary course texts (and perhaps a critique).
- 4. The **final position paper** is to be the culmination of everything you have learned about this biblical theological theme over the semester. Take ownership of the topic and articulate your considered theological position on the fate of the dead. Your paper can have a personal tone, but it should be stylistically polished, well documented and appropriately formatted. It should reflect deep engagement with scripture and the other literature. Consider three major aspects from the course: the Old Testament witness, the New Testament witness, and the legacy of the Church's reflection on the theme. Failure to **significantly revise a draft** will automatically result in a 5% deduction.
- 5. To help you revise, there will be a **writing workshop** in Week 12. You must hand in a complete draft before class on Monday, 30 Nov, by uploading it as PDF to Moodle. You are then to read and respond to the papers of two classmates by Wednesday (2 Dec). I cannot stress enough how important this exercise will be: do not fail to show up, ready to work, except under the direct circumstances. For my part, I will work hard to set up and coach you through a peer-review process that should invigorate your thinking and make you a more effective communicator.
- 6. The semester's work will be weighted as follows, though the instructor reserves the right to adjust the balance as necessary:

Reading Quizzes 25% Discussion Questions 15%

Midterm Review 25% = TBA: Presentation or Moodle (5%) + Paper (20%) Final Position Paper 35% = Draft & Peer Review (10%) + Full Revision (25%)

Students are responsible to keep a backup print copy of all assignments.

On writing: Good writing, like good reading, is a skill that must be honed in the practice. It takes work. It also involves revision: the *re*working of first and second attempts. Alan Jacobs underscores the difference between *editing*—tidying up around the house—and *revising*—the remodeling of your house. There are a number of excellent resources available to help you with this task, and I strongly urge you to use them. One is Tyndale's Writing Centre. Others are freely available online. Jacobs, for instance, lists a number of questions to which you should have good answers. I augment them here:

Do you have a thesis? What is it?
Do your sub-theses support it? Do you explain how?
Are your paragraphs well-organized?
Are they healthy (supported, well-illustrated) and not anemic?
Do you know what a comma splice is and how to avoid it?
Is your writing clear and vivid?

For more, see Prof. Jacobs' page, here: http://ayjay.jottit.com/on_revising
On on home, http://hog.hod.fordstrearting.gom/hod.fordsreagershor/links/yyriting.gom/

Or go here: http://bcs.bedfordstmartins.com/bedfordresearcher/links/writingprocess.asp#revising

Also excellent, and currently being updated: http://owl.english.purdue.edu/

Remember, Tyndale offers a *free* tutoring service: http://www.tyndale.ca/writingcentre/

VI. COURSE OUTLINE & SCHEDULE OF READINGS:

Week 1 (14 Sep)	Outlook: Introducing an OT Problem; Christian Hope and its Jewish Roots Reading: M&L Preface, 1–2; Wright 3.1–3.2*
Week 2 (21 Sep)	Outlook: Sheol, Heaven on Earth Reading: M&L 3–5; Wright 3.3–3.5
Week 3 (28 Sep)	Outlook: Death and Restoration Reading: M&L 6–8; Wright 4.1–4.3
Week 4 (5 Oct)	Outlook: Life through Death Reading: M&L 9–11; Wright 4.4
Week 5 (12 Oct)	Outlook: The Power of God for Christians and Jews Reading: M&L 12–13; THANKSGIVING (No class Mon)
Week 6 (19 Oct)	Outlook: The Book of the Watchers, Tours of Hell Reading: Enoch 1–36; Bauckham TBA
Week 7 (26 Oct)	Outlook: Of Animals and Apocalypses Reading: Enoch 83–104; READING DAYS (27–28 Oct; No class Wed)
Week 8 (2 Nov)	Outlook: Paul's Writings and 1 Corinthians 15 Reading: Midterm Review Essay Due (Mon, 2 Nov); Wright 5, 7
Week 9 (9 Nov)	Outlook: Rising Corpses in Matthew, Belief in Easter Reading: Wright 15, 18
Week 10 (16 Nov)	Outlook: Resurrection and Body in the Patristic Period Reading: Bynum Intro, 1–2
Week 11 (23 Nov)	Outlook: Image, Spirit and Burial in the Twelfth Century Reading: Bynum 3–5
Week 12 (30 Nov)	Writing Workshops: Draft Your Considered Position on the Fate of the Dead Position Paper Draft Due (Mon); Workshop Feedback Sheets Due (Wed)
Week 13 (7 Dec)	Outlook: Scholastic Debate and the Beatific Vision—Around 1300 Reading: Bynum 6–8
Week 14 (TBA)	READING DAY (10 December): The final exam will be held during exam week, 11–21 December 2009 (including Sat.), as scheduled by the Registrar. For this class, in lieu of a regular exam, you must submit a revised copy—along with your draft and two sets of peer reviews —of your position paper on the fate of the dead. On the draft I want you to highlight (along the margin) everything you rewrite. All this is due at the start of the exam period.

^{*}Note that all reading assignments refer to chapters, not pages. Wright 4.4 means Chapter 4, Section 4; Enoch 1–36 means the first 36 Chapters in 1 Enoch (aka "The Book of the Watchers").

VII. FURTHER BIBLIOGRAPHY:

Literature on the course topic is vast, spanning many areas of specialization and many generations of scholarship. Although this bibliography is by no means exhaustive, it gives a sample of some relevant works in English, French and German.

Lest this format be too daunting or unwieldy, I have started a Death Wiki on the class Moodle site. Begin to get to know this literature by improving our wiki (instructions online).

Also be sure to consult the bibliographies that accompany your primary and supplementary texts.

- Anderson, Gary A. A Time to Mourn, a Time to Dance: The Expression of Grief and Joy in Israelite Religion. University Park, Pa.: Pennsylvania State UP, 1991.
- Assmann, Jan. Tod und Jenseits im Alten Ägypten. Munich: C H Beck, 2001.
- Assmann, Jan. Resurrection in Ancient Egypt. Resurrection. Grand Rapids/Cambridge: Eerdmans, 2002.
- Assmann, Jan. Death and Salvation in Ancient Egypt. Translated by David Lorton. Ithaca: Cornell UP, 2005.
- Barr, James. The Semantics of Biblical Language. Oxford: Oxford UP, 1961.
- Barth, Christoph. Die Errettung vom Tode in den individuellen Klage- und Dankliedern des Alten Testaments. Zürich: Zollikon, 1947. Repr. as C. Barth, Die Errettung vom Tode in den individuellen Klage- und Dankliedern des Alten Testaments: Mit einer Bibliographie und zwei Anhängen neu herausgegeben von B. Janowski (3rd ed.; Stuttgart/Berlin/Cologne: Kohlhammer, 1997).
- Bauckham, Richard. *The Fate of the Dead: Studies on the Jewish and Christian Apocalypses*. Vol. 93, *Supplements to Novum Testamentum*. Atlanta: Society of Biblical Literature, 1998.
- Berlejung, Angelika, and Bernd Janowski, eds. *Tod und Jenseits im Alten Israel und in seiner Umwelt:* Theologische, religionsgeschichtliche, archäologische und ikonographische Aspekte. Vol. 64, Forschungen zum Alten Testament. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2009.
- Bertholet, Alfred. Die israelitischen Vorstellungen vom Zustand nach dem Tode. Freiburg: Mohr, 1899.
- Blumberg, Herman J, Benjamin Braude, and Bernard H Mehlman. "Open thou Mine Eyes": FS Rabbi William G Braude. Hoboken, NJ: Ktav Pub House, 1992.
- Cavallin, Hans C. C. Life after Death: Paul's Argument for the Resurrection of the Dead in 1 Cor 15, Part I, An Enquiry into the Jewish Background. Vol. 7/1, Coniectanea biblica, New Testament. Lund: Gleerup, 1974.
- Childs, Brevard S. "Death and Dying in Old Testament Theology." In *Love and Death in the Ancient Near East*, 89-91. Guilford, CN: Four Quarters Pub Co, 1987.
- Collins, John J. "The Root of Immortality: Death in the Context of Jewish Wisdom." *Harvard Theological Review* 3/4 (1978): 177–92.
- Cooper, Alan. "Psalm 24:7-10: Mythology and Exegesis." *Journal of Biblical Literature* 102 (1983): 37–60. Couffignal, Robert. "Le psaume de Jonas (Jonas 2:2-10): Une catabase biblique, sa structure et sa fonction." *Biblica* 71/4 (1990): 542–52.
- Delitzsch, Friedrich. Das Land ohne Heimkehr: Die Gedanken der Babylonier-Assyrer über Tod und Jenseits. Stuttgart: Deutsche Verlags-Anstalt, 1911.
- Ebeling, Erich. Tod und Leben nach den Vorstellungen der Babylonier. Berlin: Gruyter, 1931.
- Ebner, Martin, and Erich Zenger, eds. *Leben trotz Tod. Jahrbuch für Biblische Theologie* 19. Neukirchen-Vluyn: Neukirchener, 2005.
- Elledge, C. D. Life after Death in Early Judaism: The Evidence of Josephus. Vol. II/208, Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2006.
- Fischer, Ulrich. Eschatologie und Jenseitserwartung im hellenistischen Diasporajudentum. Vol. 44, Beihefte zur Zeitschrift für die neutestamentliche Wissenschaft. Berlin: de Gruyter, 1978.
- Fosdick, Harry Emerson. The Assurance of Immortality. London: Student Christian Movement, 1918.
- Frazer, James G. The Golden Bough. Abridged Edition ed. London: Macmillan, 1922.

- Gese, Hartmut. "Der Tod im Alten Testament." In *Zur biblischen Theologie: Alttestamentliche Vorträge*, 31–54. Munich: Kaiser, 1977.
- Gulde, Stefanie U. Der Tod als Herrscher in Israel und Ugarit: Eine motiv- und religionsgeschichtliche Studie. Vol. II/22, Forschungen zum Alten Testament. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2007.
- Himmelfarb, Martha. *Tours of Hell: An Apocalyptic Form in Jewish and Christian Literature*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1983.
- Himmelfarb, Martha. "From Prophecy to Apocalypse: The Book of the Watchers and Tours of Heaven." In *Jewish Spirituality: From the Bible through the Middle Ages*, edited by Arthur Green, 145–65. New York: Crossroad, 1986.
- Hodge, Charles. "Doctrine of a Future Life Revealed under the Old Testament." In *Systematic Theology*, *Vol. III*, 716–23. London/Edinburgh: Thomas Nelson, 1874.
- Janowski, Bernd. "Die Toten loben JHWH nicht: Psalm 88 und das alttestamentliche Todesverständnis." In *Auferstehung*, edited by F. Avemarie, and H. Lichtenberger, 3–45. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2001.
- Janowski, Bernd. "Das Buch der unverfälschten Spiritualität: Zum neuen Psalmenkommentar von F.-L. Hossfeld und E. Zenger." *Biblische Zeitschrift* 47 (2003): 43–65.
- Janowski, Bernd. Der Gott des Lebens: Beiträge zur Theologie des Alten Testaments. Neukirchen-Vluyn: Neukirchener, 2003.
- Janowski, Bernd. "Sehnsucht nach Unsterblichket: Zu J. Assmann, Tod und Jenseits im alten Ägypten." In *Leben trotz Tod*, 431–45. *JBTh* 19. Neukirchen-Vluyn: Neukirchener, 2005.
- Johnson, Aubrey R. *The Vitality of the Individual in the Thought of Ancient Israel*. Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 1949.
- Knibb, Michael. "Life and Death in the Old Testament." In *The World of Ancient Israel: Sociological, Anthropological and Political Perspectives*, edited by Ronald E. Clements, 395–412. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1991.
- Kraus, Hans-Joachim. "Vom Leben und Tod in den Psalmen: Eine Studie zu Calvins Psalmen-Kommentar." In *Biblisch-theologische Aufsätze*, 258–77. Neukirchen-Vluyn: Neukirchener, 1972.
- Leuenberger, Martin. "Deine Gnade ist besser als Leben" (Ps 63,4): Ausformungen der Grundkonstellation von Leben und Tod im alten Israel." *Biblica* 86/3 (2005): 343–68.
- Levenson, Jon D. The Death and Resurrection of the Beloved Son: The Transformation of Child Sacrifice in Judaism and Christianity. Yale UP, 1993.
- Levenson, Jon D. *The fact of death and the promise of life in Israelite religion. Papers of the Henry Luce III Fellows in Theology Vol 6.* Pittsburgh: Assoc of Theological Schools in the US and Canada, 2003.
- Levenson, Jon D. Resurrection and the Restoration of Israel: The Ultimate Victory of the God of Life. Yale UP, 2006.
- Lewis, Theodore J. *Cults of the Dead in Ancient Israel and Ugarit*. Vol. 39, *Harvard Semitic Monographs*. Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1989.
- Lewis, Theodore J. "How Far Can Texts Take Us? Evaluating Textual Sources for Reconstructing Ancient Israelite Beliefs about the Dead." In *Sacred Time, Sacred Place: Archaeology and the Religion of Israel*, edited by Barry M. Gittlen, 189–202. Winona Lake, Ind.: Eisenbrauns, 2002.
- Liess, Kathrin. Der Weg des Lebens: Psalm 16 und das Lebens- und Todesverständnis der Individualpsalmen. Vol. II/5, Forschungen zum Alten Testament. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2004.
- Liess, Kathrin. "Tod und Totenreich im Alten Testament." *Religion in Geschichte und Gegenwart* 8 (2005): 429–31. ET may be available in RPP (Religion Past and Present), which is in our library.
- Lods, Adolphe. La croyance à la vie future et le culte des morts dans l'antiquité israélite. Paris: Fischbacher, 1906.
- Nickelsburg, George W. E. "Der Leib der Auferstehung: Studien zur Anthropologie und Eschatologie des palästinischen Judentums im neutestamentlichen Zeitalter." *Catholic Biblical Quarterly* 35 (1973): 555–56.
- Nickelsburg, George W. E. "Life after Death: Paul's Argument for the Resurrection of the Dead in 1 Cor 15, Part I, An Enquiry into the Jewish Background." *Journal for the Study of Judaism in the Persian, Hellenistic and Roman Period* 6 no 1 Je (1975): 100–02.

- Nickelsburg, George W. E. Resurrection, Immortality, and Eternal Life in Intertestamental Judaism and Early Christianity. 2nd ed. Vol. 56, Harvard Theological Studies. Cambridge, Mass: Harvard UP, 2006.
- Olyan, Saul M. Biblical Mourning: Ritual and Social Dimensions. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2004.
- Paxton, Frederick S. *Christianizing Death: The Creation of a Ritual Process in Early Medieval Europe*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell UP, 1990.
- Pedersen, Johannes. "The World of Life and Death." In *Israel: Its Life and Culture, Vols. I–II*, 453–96. London/Copenhagen: G. Cumberlege/Povl Banner, 1926.
- Puech, Émile. La croyance des Esséniens en la vie future: immortalité, résurrection, vie éternelle? Histoire d'une croyance dans le Judaïsme ancien, 2 v. Vol. 21–22, Études bibliques. Paris: Gabalda, 1993.
- Puech, Émile. La croyance à la résurrection des justes dans un texte qumranien de sagesse: 4Q418 69 ii. Sefer Moshe. Winona Lake, Ind: Eisenbrauns, 2004.
- Rad, Gerhard von. *Old Testament Theology, Vol. 1: The Theology of Israel's Historical Traditions*. Translated by D. M. G. Stalker. New York: Harper, 1962.
- Rad, Gerhard von. "Life and Death in the OT." *Theological Dictionary of the New Testament* 2 (1965): 843–49. = "Leben und Tod im AT." *Theologisches Wörterbuch zum Neuen Testament* 2 (1935): 844–50.
- Rad, Gerhard von. "Righteousness' and 'Life' in the Cultic Language of the Psalms." In *The Problem of the Hexateuch and Other Essays*, 243–66. Edinburgh/London: Oliver and Boyd, 1966.
- Raharimanantsoa, Mamy. *Mort et espérance selon la Bible hébraïque*. Vol. 53, *Coniectanea biblica, Old Testament*. Stockholm: Elanders Gotab, 2006.
- Roussel, Bernard. "De Strasbourg à Bâle et Zurich: Une 'école Rhénane' d'exégèse." *Revue d'histoire et de philosophie religieuses* 68 (1988): 19–39.
- Rutherford, Richard. *Psalm 113 (114-115) and Christian Burial*. Vol. 13, *Studia Patristica*. Berlin: Akademie, 1975.
- Schmidt, Brian B. Israel's *Beneficent Dead: Ancestor Cult and Necromancy in Ancient Israelite Religion and Tradition*. Winona Lake, Ind.: Eisenbrauns, 1996.
- Schultz, Hermann. *Old testament theology: the religion of revelation in its pre-Christian stage of development*. German original 1869 ed. Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1892.
- Schwally, Friedrich. Das Leben nach dem Tode. Giessen: J. Ricker, 1892.
- Sedlmeier, Franz. "Psalm 102.13–23: Aufbau und Funktion." Biblische Zeitschrift 40 (1996): 219–35.
- Segal, Alan F. *Life After Death: A History of the Afterlife in Western Religion. ABRL.* New York: Doubleday, 2004.
- Stade, Bernhard. Über die alttestamentlichen Vorstellungen vom Zustand nach dem Tode. Leipzig: Vogel, 1877
- Stemberger, Günter. Der Leib der Auferstehung: Studien zur Anthropologie und Eschatologie des palästinischen Judentums im neutestamentlichen Zeitalter. Vol. 56, Analecta biblica. Rome: Biblical Institute, 1972.
- Tromp, Nicholas J. *Primitive Conceptions of Death and the Nether World in the Old Testament*. Rome: Pontifical Biblical Institute, 1969.
- Tylor, Edward B. Primitive Culture. London: John Murray, 1871.
- VanderKam, James C. Review of E. Puech, La croyance des Esséniens en la vie future: immortalité, résurrection, vie éternelle? histoire d'une croyance dans le Judaïsme ancien, 2 v. Journal of Biblical Literature 114 (1995): 320-22.
- Wächter, Ludwig. Der Tod im Alten Testament. Stuttgart: Calwer, 1967.
- Westermann, Claus. *Theologie des Alten Testaments in Grundzügen*. Vol. 6, *Grundrisse zum Alten Testament*. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1978.
- Wright, N. T. Surprised by Hope: Rethinking Heaven, the Resurrection, and the Mission of the Church. New York: HarperOne, 2008.
- Zenger, Erich. "Mit Gott ums Leben kämpfen: Zur Funktion der Todesbilder in den Psalmen." In *Leben trotz Tod*, 63–78. Neukirchen-Vluyn: Neukirchener, 2005.