

# An exact solution method for binary equilibrium problems with compensation and the power market uplift problem

Daniel Huppmann, Sauleh Siddiqui  
huppmann@iiasa.ac.at, siddiqui@jhu.edu

Mathematical cheat sheet, October 1, 2017

This document summarizes the mathematical formulation for easier reference of the GAMS implementation provided at [http://danielhuppmann.github.io/binary\\_equilibrium/](http://danielhuppmann.github.io/binary_equilibrium/). All equation numbers are identical to those in the manuscript (version as of February 4, 2016).

Please cite as:

D. Huppmann and S. Siddiqui. An exact solution method for binary equilibrium problems with compensation and the power market uplift problem.  
*European Journal of Operation Research*, accepted for publication,  
doi.org/10.1016/j.ejor.2017.09.032

## Theoretical formulation (Section 3.4)

$$\min_{\substack{x_i, y_i, \tilde{y}_i^{(\bar{x}_i)}, \tilde{\lambda}_i^{(\bar{x}_i)} \\ \kappa_i^{(\bar{x}_i)}, \zeta_i^{(\bar{x}_i)}}} F\left((x_i, y_i)_{i \in I}\right) + G\left((\zeta_i^{(\bar{x}_i)})_{i \in I}\right) \quad (14a)$$

$$\text{s.t.} \quad \nabla_{y_i} f_i\left(\mathbf{1}, \tilde{y}_i^{(1)}, y_{-i}\right) + (\tilde{\lambda}_i^{(1)})^T \nabla_{y_i} g_i\left(\mathbf{1}, \tilde{y}_i^{(1)}\right) = 0 \quad (14b)$$

$$0 \leq -g_i\left(\mathbf{1}, \tilde{y}_i^{(1)}\right) \perp \tilde{\lambda}_i^{(1)} \geq 0 \quad (14c)$$

$$\nabla_{y_i} f_i\left(\mathbf{0}, \tilde{y}_i^{(0)}, y_{-i}\right) + (\tilde{\lambda}_i^{(0)})^T \nabla_{y_i} g_i\left(\mathbf{0}, \tilde{y}_i^{(0)}\right) = 0 \quad (14d)$$

$$0 \leq -g_i\left(\mathbf{0}, \tilde{y}_i^{(0)}\right) \perp \tilde{\lambda}_i^{(0)} \geq 0 \quad (14e)$$

$$f_i\left(\mathbf{1}, y_i^{(1)}, y_{-i}\right) + \kappa_i^{(1)} - \zeta_i^{(1)} - \kappa_i^{(0)} + \zeta_i^{(0)} = f_i\left(\mathbf{0}, y_i^{(0)}, y_{-i}\right) \quad (14f)$$

$$\kappa_i^{(1)} + \zeta_i^{(1)} \leq x_i \tilde{K} \quad (14g)$$

$$\kappa_i^{(0)} + \zeta_i^{(0)} \leq (1 - x_i) \tilde{K} \quad (14h)$$

$$\tilde{y}_i^{(0)} - x_i \tilde{K} \leq y_i \leq \tilde{y}_i^{(0)} + x_i \tilde{K} \quad (14i)$$

$$\tilde{y}_i^{(1)} - (1 - x_i) \tilde{K} \leq y_i \leq \tilde{y}_i^{(1)} + (1 - x_i) \tilde{K} \quad (14j)$$

$$x_i \in \{0, 1\}, (y_i, \tilde{y}_i^{(\bar{x}_i)}) \in \mathbb{R}^{3m}, (\lambda_i^{(\bar{x}_i)}, \kappa_i^{(\bar{x}_i)}, \zeta_i^{(\bar{x}_i)}) \in \mathbb{R}_+^{2k+4}$$

## The power market application (Section 4)

### The generator's optimization problem

Each generator  $i \in I$  seeks to maximize her profits from generating and selling electricity over the time horizon  $t \in T$ :

$$\min_{x_{ti}, y_{ti}, z_{ti}^{\text{on}}, z_{ti}^{\text{off}}} -p_{tn(i)}y_{ti} + c_i^G y_{ti} + c_i^{\text{on}} z_{ti}^{\text{on}} + c_i^{\text{off}} z_{ti}^{\text{off}} \quad (15a)$$

$$\text{s.t. } x_{ti}g_i^{\min} \leq y_{ti} \leq x_{ti}g_i^{\max} \quad (\alpha_{ti}^{\text{on}}, \beta_{ti}^{\text{on}}) \quad (15b)$$

$$x_{ti} - x_{(t-1)i} = z_{ti}^{\text{on}} - z_{ti}^{\text{off}} \quad (15c)$$

$$x_{ti} \in \{0, 1\}, \quad y_{ti}, z_{ti}^{\text{on}}, z_{ti}^{\text{off}} \in \mathbb{R}_+$$

### Demand for electricity and network feasibility (market clearing)

The spot market is cleared by a player seeking to maximize the welfare (utility) of consumers while guaranteeing feasibility of the transmission system. She takes the unit commitment at time  $t$  and the dispatch of each power plant as given, written here as  $y_{ti}$ , and she assigns locational prices  $p_{tn}$ , which the generators consider in their optimization problems:

$$\min_{d_{tj}, \delta_{tn}} \sum_{j \in J} -u_{tj}^D d_{tj} \quad (16a)$$

$$\text{s.t. } \sum_{j \in J_n} d_{tj} - \sum_{i \in I_n} y_{ti} + \sum_{m \in N} B_{nm} \delta_{tm} = 0 \quad (p_{tn}) \quad (16b)$$

$$d_{tj}^{\max} - d_{tj} \geq 0 \quad (\nu_{tj}) \quad (16c)$$

$$f_l^{\max} - \sum_{n \in N} H_{ln} \delta_{tn} \geq 0 \quad (\mu_{tl}^+) \quad (16d)$$

$$f_l^{\max} + \sum_{n \in N} H_{ln} \delta_{tn} \geq 0 \quad (\mu_{tl}^-) \quad (16e)$$

$$\pi - \delta_{tn} \geq 0 \quad (\xi_{tn}^+) \quad (16f)$$

$$\pi + \delta_{tn} \geq 0 \quad (\xi_{tn}^-) \quad (16g)$$

$$\delta_{t\hat{n}} = 0 \quad (\gamma_t) \quad (16h)$$

<b>Sets &amp; Mappings</b>	
$n, m \in N$	... nodes
$t \in T$	... time step, hours
$i \in I$	... generators, power plant units
$j \in J$	... load, demand units
$l \in L$	... power lines
$i \in I_n, j \in J_n$	... generator/load unit mapping to node $n$
$n(i), n(j)$	... node mapping to generator $i$ /load unit $j$
$\phi \in \Phi$	... set of dispatch options (schedules) for each generator
$t \in T_\phi$	... hours in which a generator is active in dispatch option $\phi$
<b>Primal variables</b>	
$x_{ti}$	... on/off decision for generator $i$ in hour $t$
$z_{ti}^{\text{on}}, z_{ti}^{\text{off}}$	... inter-temporal start-up/shut-down decision
$y_{ti}$	... actual generation by generator $i$ in hour $t$
$y_{ti}^{\text{on}}$	... generation if binary variable is fixed at $\bar{x}_i$
$d_{tj}$	... demand by unit $j$ in hour $t$
$\delta_{tn}$	... voltage angle
<b>Dual variables</b>	
$\alpha_{ti}^{\text{on}}, \beta_{ti}^{\text{on}}$	... dual to minimum activity/maximum generation capacity
$p_{tn}$	... locational marginal price
$\nu_{tj}$	... dual to maximum load constraint
$\mu_{tl}^+, \mu_{tl}^-$	... dual to voltage angle band constraints
$\xi_{tn}^+, \xi_{tn}^-$	... dual to thermal line capacity constraints
$\gamma_t$	... dual to slack bus constraints
<b>Switch and compensation variables</b>	
$\kappa_{ti}^{\text{on}}, \kappa_{ti}^{\text{off}}$	... switch value (defined per time step)
$\zeta_i$	... compensation payment (defined over entire time horizon)
<b>Parameters</b>	
$c_i^G$	... linear generation costs
$c_i^{\text{on}}, c_i^{\text{off}}$	... start-up/shut-down costs
$c_\phi^D$	... total commitment costs in dispatch option $\phi$ (start-up, shut-down)
$g_i^{\min}$	... minimum activity level if power plant is online
$g_i^{\max}$	... maximum generation capacity
$x_i^{\text{init}}$	... power plant status at start of model horizon ( $t = 0$ )
$u_{tj}^D$	... utility of demand unit $j$ for using electricity
$d_{tj}^{\max}$	... maximum load of unit $j$
$f_l^{\max}$	... thermal capacity of power line $l$
$B_{nk}, H_{lk}$	... line/node susceptance/network transfer matrices

Table 2: Notation for the nodal power market problem

### The bi-level multi-objective program

$$\min \sum_{t \in T} \left[ \sum_{i \in I} c_i^G y_{ti} + c_i^{\text{on}} z_{ti}^{\text{on}} + c_i^{\text{off}} z_{ti}^{\text{off}} - \sum_{j \in J} u_{tj}^D d_{tj} \right] + \sum_{i \in I} \zeta_i \quad (20)$$

$$\text{s.t.} \quad 0 \leq -u_{tj}^D + p_{tn(j)} + \nu_{tj} \quad \perp \quad d_{tj} \geq 0 \quad (19a)$$

$$0 = \sum_{m \in N} B_{mn} p_{tm} + \sum_{l \in L} H_{ln} (\mu_{tl}^+ - \mu_{tl}^-) + \xi_{tn}^+ - \xi_{tn}^- - \begin{cases} \gamma_t & \text{if } n = \hat{n} \\ 0 & \text{else} \end{cases} \quad , \quad \delta_{tn} \text{ (free)} \quad (19b)$$

$$0 = \sum_{j \in J_n} d_{tj} - \sum_{i \in I_n} y_{ti} + \sum_{m \in N} B_{nm} \delta_{tm} \quad , \quad p_{tn} \text{ (free)} \quad (19c)$$

$$0 \leq d_{tj}^{\text{max}} - d_{tj} \quad \perp \quad \nu_{tj} \geq 0 \quad (19d)$$

$$0 \leq f_l^{\text{max}} - \sum_{n \in N} H_{ln} \delta_{tn} \quad \perp \quad \mu_{tl}^+ \geq 0 \quad (19e)$$

$$0 \leq f_l^{\text{max}} + \sum_{n \in N} H_{ln} \delta_{tn} \quad \perp \quad \mu_{tl}^- \geq 0 \quad (19f)$$

$$0 \leq \pi - \delta_{tn} \quad \perp \quad \xi_{tn}^+ \geq 0 \quad (19g)$$

$$0 \leq \pi + \delta_{tn} \quad \perp \quad \xi_{tn}^- \geq 0 \quad (19h)$$

$$0 = \delta_{t\hat{n}} \quad , \quad \gamma_t \text{ (free)} \quad (19i)$$

$$0 = c_i^G - p_{tn(i)} + \beta_{ti}^{\text{on}} - \alpha_{ti}^{\text{on}} \quad , \quad y_{ti}^{\text{on}} \text{ (free)} \quad (17a)$$

$$0 \leq -g_{ti}^{\text{min}} + y_{ti}^{\text{on}} \quad \perp \quad \alpha_{ti}^{\text{on}} \geq 0 \quad (17b)$$

$$0 \leq g_{ti}^{\text{max}} - y_{ti}^{\text{on}} \quad \perp \quad \beta_{ti}^{\text{on}} \geq 0 \quad (17c)$$

$$x_{(t-1)i} + z_{ti}^{\text{on}} - z_{ti}^{\text{off}} = x_{ti} \quad (21a)$$

$$\beta_{ti}^{\text{on}} g_{ti}^{\text{max}} - \alpha_{ti}^{\text{on}} g_{ti}^{\text{min}} - \kappa_{ti}^{\text{on}} + \kappa_{ti}^{\text{off}} = 0 \quad (21b)$$

$$|\kappa_{ti}^{\text{on}}| \leq x_{ti} \tilde{K} \quad (21c)$$

$$|\kappa_{ti}^{\text{off}}| \leq (1 - x_{ti}) \tilde{K} \quad (21d)$$

$$\sum_{t \in T} \left[ \kappa_{ti}^{\text{on}} - c_i^{\text{on}} z_{ti}^{\text{on}} - c_i^{\text{off}} z_{ti}^{\text{off}} \right] + \zeta_i \geq \sum_{t \in T_\phi} \left[ \beta_{ti}^{\text{on}} g_{ti}^{\text{max}} - \alpha_{ti}^{\text{on}} g_{ti}^{\text{min}} \right] - c_{\phi i}^D \quad (21e)$$

$$\forall \phi \in \Phi \quad (21e)$$

$$0 \leq y_{ti} \leq x_{ti} g_{ti}^{\text{max}} \quad (21f)$$

$$y_{ti}^{\text{on}} - (1 - x_{ti}) g_{ti}^{\text{max}} \leq y_{ti} \leq y_{ti}^{\text{on}} + (1 - x_{ti}) g_{ti}^{\text{max}} \quad (21g)$$