



University of  
Zurich<sup>UZH</sup>

# Dynamic Distributed Constraint Optimization

---

Thesis

January 8, 2015

---

**Daniel Hegglin**

of Oerlikon ZH, Switzerland

Student-ID: 08-721-102

dani.hegglin@gmail.com

---

Advisor: **Mihaela Verman**

Prof. Abraham Bernstein, PhD

Institut für Informatik

Universität Zürich

<http://www.ifi.uzh.ch/ddis>



---

## Acknowledgements



---

# Zusammenfassung



---

# Abstract

This thesis is about understanding the performance and behaviour of various existing distributed constraint optimization algorithm approaches (complete, local-iterative message-passing, local-iterative best-response) in context of a dynamic environment, e.g changing constraints or other parameters. The use case for this analysis will be the scheduling problem, which needs to be mapped to the algorithms accordingly. The goals are adding a general module to the existing framework for dcops, which can simulate dynamic environments / parameter changes in various ways, mapping existing dco algorithms to signal collect and evaluate their performance. An additional goal would be to suggest or test a blended algorithm with local-iterative characteristics that handles change better by applying techniques from dynamic approaches which are not local-iterative. The benchmarking is done with respect to change (resilience to change / stability, amount of variable value changes necessary to bounce back), solution quality (how fast can the algorithms reach a defined quality), Time-to-Convergence (how long does it take to converge).





---

# Table of Contents

<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1	Subject & Motivation . . . . .	1
1.2	Goal . . . . .	1
1.3	Structure . . . . .	1
<b>2</b>	<b>Background &amp; Related Work</b>	<b>3</b>
2.1	Distributed Constraint Optimization . . . . .	3
2.2	Typical Problems . . . . .	3
2.2.1	Graph Coloring Problem . . . . .	3
2.2.2	Meeting Scheduling Problem . . . . .	3
2.3	Algorithm Design Approaches . . . . .	3
2.3.1	Complete . . . . .	3
2.3.2	Local-Iterative - Best Response . . . . .	3
2.3.3	Local-Iterative - Message Passing . . . . .	3
2.3.4	Other Approaches . . . . .	3
2.4	Dynamic Environments . . . . .	3
<b>3</b>	<b>Design</b>	<b>5</b>
3.1	Meeting Scheduling Problem Definition . . . . .	5
3.2	Complete - DPOP . . . . .	5
3.2.1	Design Considerations . . . . .	5
3.2.2	Graph . . . . .	5
3.2.3	Vertices . . . . .	5
3.3	Local Iterative Best-Response - Maximum Gain Messaging . . . . .	5
3.3.1	Design Considerations . . . . .	5
3.3.2	Graph . . . . .	5
3.3.3	Vertices . . . . .	5
3.4	Local Iterative Message Passing - MaxSum . . . . .	5
3.4.1	Design Considerations . . . . .	5
3.4.2	Graph . . . . .	5
3.4.3	Vertices . . . . .	5
3.5	Dynamic Environment Extension . . . . .	6

3.6	Testbed, Monitoring . . . . .	6
3.6.1	Evaluation . . . . .	6
<b>4</b>	<b>Implementation</b>	<b>7</b>
4.1	Complete - DPOP . . . . .	7
4.2	Local Iterative Best-Response - Maximum Gain Messaging . . . . .	7
4.3	Local Iterative Message-Passing - Max-Sum . . . . .	7
4.4	Dynamic Environment Extension . . . . .	7
4.5	Testbed, Monitoring . . . . .	7
<b>5</b>	<b>Experiments</b>	<b>9</b>
5.1	Experiment Design . . . . .	9
5.2	Testing Environment . . . . .	9
5.3	Results I: Algorithms Performance Basic . . . . .	9
5.3.1	Resilience to dynamic Environments . . . . .	9
5.3.2	Solution Quality . . . . .	9
5.3.3	Time to Convergence . . . . .	9
5.3.4	Scalability . . . . .	9
5.3.5	Hardware Requirements . . . . .	9
5.4	Results II: Algorithms Performance after Adjustments . . . . .	10
5.4.1	Resilience to dynamic Environments . . . . .	10
5.4.2	Time to Convergence . . . . .	10
5.4.3	Scalability . . . . .	10
5.4.4	Hardware Requirements . . . . .	10
5.5	Discussion . . . . .	10
<b>6</b>	<b>Limitations 2</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>7</b>	<b>Future Work 1</b>	<b>13</b>
<b>8</b>	<b>Conclusions 3</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>A</b>	<b>Appendix 15</b>	<b>19</b>
A.1	Lorem Ipsum . . . . .	19

# Introduction

## 1.1 Subject & Motivation

The goal of this thesis is explore dynamic distributed constraint optimization. Constraint optimization itself is well-researched field and even distributed constraint optimization has been under research. The aspect of having a dynamic environment and dynamic meaning changing constraints is very under-developed and underinvestigated.

## 1.2 Goal

The thesis tries to bring further what previously has been achieved in several bachelor and master thesis. The main goal is to show the capabilities of the signal-collect framework and the performance in distributed environments. Important is also mapping of the chosen Meeting Scheduling Problem and And how algorithms like the Max-Sum algorithm can be extended to better perform in dynamic environments. All those implementations shall be tested in benchmarking situations.

## 1.3 Structure

First I will give an overview about various definitions and aspects of constraint optimization in general, as well as the aspects of distributed and dynamic environments. I am also going to give an overview about different approaches of algorithms to solve constraint optimization problems and their advantages and disadvantages in various contexts. Then I will choose appropriate algorithms for the experiments and comparisons and map them to the meeting scheduling problem. I also will design an attempt of introducing dynamic environments that fits into the given framework provided by DDIS. Then I will describe the implementation details of the algorithms and the testbed, as well as the dynamic environment modelling. After that I will conduct experiments in various testsets, various algorithms, various setups and analyze the limitations of existing algorithms to the problem in dynamic environments, as well as options to optimize defined benchmarks like bounce-back time after amount of change, time to reach certain quality, etc.



## 2

# Background & Related Work

### 2.1 Distributed Constraint Optimization

### 2.2 Typical Problems

#### 2.2.1 Graph Coloring Problem

#### 2.2.2 Meeting Scheduling Problem

### 2.3 Algorithm Design Approaches

#### 2.3.1 Complete

#### 2.3.2 Local-Iterative - Best Response

#### 2.3.3 Local-Iterative - Message Passing

#### 2.3.4 Other Approaches

### 2.4 Dynamic Environments



# 3

## Design

### 3.1 Meeting Scheduling Problem Definition

- General problem and definitions - General constraints Different, Same (sources for that) - Considerations for all algorithms

### 3.2 Complete - DPOP

#### 3.2.1 Design Considerations

#### 3.2.2 Graph

#### 3.2.3 Vertices

### 3.3 Local Iterative Best-Response - Maximum Gain Messaging

#### 3.3.1 Design Considerations

#### 3.3.2 Graph

#### 3.3.3 Vertices

### 3.4 Local Iterative Message Passing - MaxSum

#### 3.4.1 Design Considerations

#### 3.4.2 Graph

#### 3.4.3 Vertices

- Local Iterative - Good fit for dynamic - Better than the above - Fewer information disclosure

## 3.5 Dynamic Environment Extension

## 3.6 Testbed, Monitoring

### 3.6.1 Evaluation



# 4

## Implementation

### 4.1 Complete - DPOP

Graph

Vertices

### 4.2 Local Iterative Best-Response - Maximum Gain Messaging

Graph

Vertices

### 4.3 Local Iterative Message-Passing - Max-Sum

Graph

Vertices

### 4.4 Dynamic Environment Extension

### 4.5 Testbed, Monitoring



# Experiments

## 5.1 Experiment Design

The experiments are designed in a two-step procedure according to ?

## 5.2 Testing Environment

## 5.3 Results I: Algorithms Performance Basic

### 5.3.1 Resilience to dynamic Environments

- Mainly to proof flaws of the other approaches when it comes to dynamic

### 5.3.2 Solution Quality

- Static / Dynamic - Mainly to proof the ability of new approaches to keep stable and reach certain goals

### 5.3.3 Time to Convergence

### 5.3.4 Scalability

- Number of Messages - Number of Agents - Mainly to show that local-iterative scales well because the number of messages is low

### 5.3.5 Hardware Requirements

- Additional layer of argumentation and analysis

## 5.4 Results II: Algorithms Performance after Adjustments

### 5.4.1 Resilience to dynamic Environments

### 5.4.2 Time to Convergence

### 5.4.3 Scalability

### 5.4.4 Hardware Requirements

## 5.5 Discussion

## Limitations 2

Lorem ipsum dolor sit amet, consectetur adipiscing elit. Nullam a tellus. Aliquam commodo dui non ipsum. Duis mollis nisi id turpis. Donec quis ipsum. Curabitur sed nibh. Morbi suscipit justo quis orci. Ut massa tortor, ultricies vitae, lacinia eu, facilisis eu, nisl. Nulla mattis urna sed metus imperdiet ornare. Praesent sodales. Etiam laoreet. Mauris quam magna, sagittis et, pharetra eget, congue vitae, arcu. Fusce sollicitudin justo. Suspendisse lectus. Sed lobortis dolor quis lectus scelerisque ornare. Integer purus. Phasellus vel elit at nibh sagittis lobortis. Aliquam iaculis malesuada eros. Mauris metus.



## Future Work 1

Lorem ipsum dolor sit amet, consectetur adipiscing elit. Nullam a tellus. Aliquam commodo dui non ipsum. Duis mollis nisi id turpis. Donec quis ipsum. Curabitur sed nibh. Morbi suscipit justo quis orci. Ut massa tortor, ultricies vitae, lacinia eu, facilisis eu, nisl. Nulla mattis urna sed metus imperdiet ornare. Praesent sodales. Etiam laoreet. Mauris quam magna, sagittis et, pharetra eget, congue vitae, arcu. Fusce sollicitudin justo. Suspendisse lectus. Sed lobortis dolor quis lectus scelerisque ornare. Integer purus. Phasellus vel elit at nibh sagittis lobortis. Aliquam iaculis malesuada eros. Mauris metus.





## Conclusions 3

Lorem ipsum dolor sit amet, consectetur adipiscing elit. Nullam a tellus. Aliquam commodo dui non ipsum. Duis mollis nisi id turpis. Donec quis ipsum. Curabitur sed nibh. Morbi suscipit justo quis orci. Ut massa tortor, ultricies vitae, lacinia eu, facilisis eu, nisl. Nulla mattis urna sed metus imperdiet ornare. Praesent sodales. Etiam laoreet. Mauris quam magna, sagittis et, pharetra eget, congue vitae, arcu. Fusce sollicitudin justo. Suspendisse lectus. Sed lobortis dolor quis lectus scelerisque ornare. Integer purus. Phasellus vel elit at nibh sagittis lobortis. Aliquam iaculis malesuada eros. Mauris metus.

In tellus mauris, nonummy eget, vestibulum in, interdum at, nulla. Vestibulum eu justo. Vivamus lobortis pellentesque arcu. Aliquam enim risus, pulvinar quis, pulvinar tempor, pharetra vitae, dolor. Aliquam ac sapien. Aenean augue eros, malesuada nec, tincidunt eget, aliquet bibendum, odio. Maecenas eu est eu nisi pulvinar bibendum. Lorem ipsum dolor sit amet, consectetur adipiscing elit. Pellentesque eleifend varius enim. Ut pharetra diam ac nulla. Aliquam a turpis ac mi semper porttitor. Vivamus sodales molestie nibh. Vivamus in sapien sit amet mauris sagittis lobortis. Aenean pretium. Suspendisse eu leo at quam vehicula aliquam. Nunc a ipsum. Sed placerat fringilla nibh. Aliquam sagittis. Integer a augue vitae libero elementum pretium. Proin metus.



---

## References



# A

## Appendix 15

### A.1 Lorem Ipsum

Lorem ipsum dolor sit amet, consectetur adipiscing elit. Nullam a tellus. Aliquam commodo dui non ipsum. Duis mollis nisi id turpis. Donec quis ipsum. Curabitur sed nibh. Morbi suscipit justo quis orci. Ut massa tortor, ultricies vitae, lacinia eu, facilisis eu, nisl. Nulla mattis urna sed metus imperdiet ornare. Praesent sodales. Etiam laoreet. Mauris quam magna, sagittis et, pharetra eget, congue vitae, arcu. Fusce sollicitudin justo. Suspendisse lectus. Sed lobortis dolor quis lectus scelerisque ornare. Integer purus. Phasellus vel elit at nibh sagittis lobortis. Aliquam iaculis malesuada eros. Mauris metus.

Lorem ipsum dolor sit amet, consectetur adipiscing elit. Nullam a tellus. Aliquam commodo dui non ipsum. Duis mollis nisi id turpis. Donec quis ipsum. Curabitur sed nibh. Morbi suscipit justo quis orci. Ut massa tortor, ultricies vitae, lacinia eu, facilisis eu, nisl. Nulla mattis urna sed metus imperdiet ornare. Praesent sodales. Etiam laoreet. Mauris quam magna, sagittis et, pharetra eget, congue vitae, arcu. Fusce sollicitudin justo. Suspendisse lectus. Sed lobortis dolor quis lectus scelerisque ornare. Integer purus. Phasellus vel elit at nibh sagittis lobortis. Aliquam iaculis malesuada eros. Mauris metus.

Lorem ipsum dolor sit amet, consectetur adipiscing elit. Nullam a tellus. Aliquam commodo dui non ipsum. Duis mollis nisi id turpis. Donec quis ipsum. Curabitur sed nibh. Morbi suscipit justo quis orci. Ut massa tortor, ultricies vitae, lacinia eu, facilisis eu, nisl. Nulla mattis urna sed metus imperdiet ornare. Praesent sodales. Etiam laoreet. Mauris quam magna, sagittis et, pharetra eget, congue vitae, arcu. Fusce sollicitudin justo. Suspendisse lectus. Sed lobortis dolor quis lectus scelerisque ornare. Integer purus. Phasellus vel elit at nibh sagittis lobortis. Aliquam iaculis malesuada eros. Mauris metus.

Lorem ipsum dolor sit amet, consectetur adipiscing elit. Nullam a tellus. Aliquam commodo dui non ipsum. Duis mollis nisi id turpis. Donec quis ipsum. Curabitur sed nibh. Morbi suscipit justo quis orci. Ut massa tortor, ultricies vitae, lacinia eu, facilisis eu, nisl. Nulla mattis urna sed metus imperdiet ornare. Praesent sodales. Etiam laoreet. Mauris quam magna, sagittis et, pharetra eget, congue vitae, arcu. Fusce sollicitudin justo. Suspendisse lectus. Sed lobortis dolor quis lectus scelerisque ornare. Integer

purus. Phasellus vel elit at nibh sagittis lobortis. Aliquam iaculis malesuada eros. Mauris metus.

Lorem ipsum dolor sit amet, consectetur adipiscing elit. Nullam a tellus. Aliquam commodo dui non ipsum. Duis mollis nisi id turpis. Donec quis ipsum. Curabitur sed nibh. Morbi suscipit justo quis orci. Ut massa tortor, ultricies vitae, lacinia eu, facilisis eu, nisl. Nulla mattis urna sed metus imperdiet ornare. Praesent sodales. Etiam laoreet. Mauris quam magna, sagittis et, pharetra eget, congue vitae, arcu. Fusce sollicitudin justo. Suspendisse lectus. Sed lobortis dolor quis lectus scelerisque ornare. Integer purus. Phasellus vel elit at nibh sagittis lobortis. Aliquam iaculis malesuada eros. Mauris metus.

---

## List of Figures





---

## List of Tables