

# Exercises Lecture V

## Numerical Integration in 1D

### 1. Equispaced points: comparison trapezoidal-Simpson rules

Consider the definite integral :

$$I = \int_0^1 e^x dx = e - 1 = 1.718282\dots$$

Write a code (e.g. `int.f90`) to calculate the integral using the (1) trapezoidal rule or (2) the Simpson rule. In general, we indicate with  $F_n$  the estimate of the integral from  $x_0$  to  $x_n$  using a discretisation in  $n$  intervals (even for the Simpson algorithm) of width  $h = \frac{x_n - x_0}{n}$ . Therefore:

$$\int_{x_0}^{x_n} f(x)dx = F_n^{trap} + \mathcal{O}(h^2) = F_n^{Simpson} + \mathcal{O}(h^4)$$

where

$$F_n^{trap} = h \left[ \frac{1}{2}f_0 + f_1 + \dots + f_{n-1} + \frac{1}{2}f_n \right]$$

and

$$F_n^{Simpson} = h \left[ \frac{1}{3}f_0 + \frac{4}{3}f_1 + \frac{2}{3}f_2 + \frac{4}{3}f_3 + \dots + \frac{4}{3}f_{n-3} + \frac{2}{3}f_{n-2} + \frac{4}{3}f_{n-1} + \frac{1}{3}f_n \right]$$

- (a) Which is the dependence on  $n$  of the error  $\Delta_n = F_n - I$  ? You can choose  $n = 2^k$  (with  $k = 2, \dots, 8$ , at least) in order to have equispaced points when doing a log-log plot. You should find  $\Delta_n \approx 1/n^2$  for the *trapezoidal rule* and  $\Delta_n \approx 1/n^4$  for the *Simpson rule*.

## 2. Monte Carlo method:

### generic sample mean and importance sampling

- (a) Write a code to compute the numerical estimate  $F_n$  of  $I = \int_0^1 e^{-x^2} dx = \frac{\sqrt{\pi}}{2} \text{erf}(1) \approx 0.746824$  with the MC *sample mean* method using a set  $\{x_i\}$  of  $n$  random points uniformly distributed in  $[0,1]$ :

$$F_n = \frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^n f(x_i)$$

- (b) Write a code (a different one, or, better, a unique code with an option) to compute  $F_n$  using the *importance sampling* with a set  $\{x_i\}$  of points generated according to the distribution  $p(x) = Ae^{-x}$  (Notice that *erf* is an intrinsic fortran function; useful to compare the numerical result with the true value). Remind that in the *importance sampling* approach:

$$\int_a^b f(x)dx = \left\langle \frac{f(x)}{p(x)} \right\rangle \int_a^b p(x)dx \approx \frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^n \frac{f(x_i)}{p(x_i)} \int_a^b p(x)dx = F_n$$

with  $p(x)$  which approximates the behaviour of  $f(x)$ , and the average is calculated over the random points  $\{x_i\}$  with distribution  $p(x)$ .

Notes: pay attention to:

- the normalization of  $p(x)$ ;
- the exponential distribution: `expdev` provides random numbers  $x$  distributed in  $[0, +\infty[$ ; here we need  $x$  in  $[0,1]$  ...

- (c) Compare the efficiency of the two sampling methods (uniform and importance sampling) for the estimate of the integral by calculating the following quantities:  $F_n$ ,  $\sigma_n = (\langle f_i^2 \rangle - \langle f_i \rangle^2)^{1/2}$ ,  $\sigma_n/\sqrt{n}$ , where  $f_i = f(x_i)$  in the first case, and  $f_i = \frac{f(x_i)}{p(x_i)} \int_a^b p(x)dx$  in the second case (make a log-log plot of the error as a function of  $n$ : what do you see?).

## 3. MC Method: acceptance-rejection

Using the acceptance-rejection method, calculate  $\pi = 4I$  with  $I = \int_0^1 \sqrt{1-x^2} dx$ .

The numerical estimate of the integral is  $F_n = \frac{n_s}{n}$  where  $n_s$  is the num-

ber of points under the curve  $f(x) = \sqrt{1-x^2}$ , and  $n$  the total number of points generated. An example is given in `pi.f90`. Estimate the error associated, i.e. the difference between  $F_n$  and the true value. Discuss the dependence of the error on  $n$ .

(Notice that many points are needed to see the  $n^{-1/2}$  behavior, which can be hidden by stochastic fluctuations; it is easier to see it by averaging over many results (obtained from random numbers sequences with different seeds))

4. MC method–sample mean (generic);  
error analysis using the “average of the averages” and the “block average” NOTE: THIS EXERCISE IS VERY IMPORTANT !!!

- (a) Write a code to estimate the same integral of previous exercise,  $\pi = 4I$  with  $I = \int_0^1 \sqrt{1-x^2} dx$ , using the MC method of sample mean with uniformly distributed random points. Evaluate the error  $\Delta_n = F_n - I$  for  $n=10^2, 10^3, 10^4$ : it should have a  $1/\sqrt{n}$  behaviour.
- (b) Choose in particular  $n = 10^4$  and consider the corresponding error  $\Delta_n$ . Calculate  $\sigma_n^2 = \langle f^2 \rangle - \langle f \rangle^2$ . You should recognize that  $\sigma_n$  CANNOT BE CONSIDERED A GOOD ESTIMATE OF THE ERROR (it's much larger than the actual error...)
- (c) In order to improve the error estimate, apply the following two different methods of variance reduction: 1) “average of the averages”: do  $m=10$  runs with  $n$  points each, and consider the average of the averages and its standard deviation:

$$\sigma_m^2 = \langle M^2 \rangle - \langle M \rangle^2$$

where

$$\langle M \rangle = \frac{1}{m} \sum_{\alpha=1}^m M_{\alpha} \quad e \quad \langle M^2 \rangle = \frac{1}{m} \sum_{\alpha=1}^m M_{\alpha}^2$$

and  $M_{\alpha}$  is the average of each run. You should recognize that  $\sigma_m$  is a good estimate of the error associated to each measurement (=each run) and  $\sigma_m \approx \sigma_n/\sqrt{n}$  is the error associated to the average over the different runs.

- (d) 2) Divide now the  $n = 10,000$  points into 10 subsets. Consider the averages  $f_s$  within the individual subsets and the standard deviation if the average over the subsets:

$$\sigma_s^2 = \langle f_s^2 \rangle - \langle f_s \rangle^2.$$

You should notice that  $\sigma_s/\sqrt{s} \approx \sigma_m$ .



```

integer, intent(in) :: i
real, intent(in) :: min, max
integer :: n
real :: x, interval
simpson = 0.
interval = ((max-min) / (i-1))
! loop EVEN points
do n = 2, i-1, 2
    x = interval * (n-1)
    simpson = simpson + 4*f(x)
end do
! loop ODD points
do n = 3, i-1, 2
    x = interval * (n-1)
    simpson = simpson + 2*f(x)
end do
! add extrema
simpson = simpson + f(min)+f(max)
simpson = simpson * interval/3
return
end function simpson

end module intmod

program int
    use intmod
    !
    ! variable declaration
    !     accuracy limit
    !     min and max in x
    !
    implicit none
    real :: r1, r2, theo, vmin, vmax, t0, t1
    integer :: i, n
    ! exact value
    vmin = 0.0
    vmax = 1.0
    theo = exp(vmax)-exp(vmin)
    print*, ' exact value = ', theo
    open(unit=7, file='int-tra-sim.dat', status='unknown')
    !
    write(7,*)"# N, interval, exact, Trap-exact, Simpson-exact"
    call cpu_time(t0)
    do i = 2, 8
        n = 2**i
        r1 = trapez(n+1, vmin, vmax)

```

