

Homework 2, Statistical Mechanics: Concepts and applications

2016/17 ICFP Master (first year)

Werner Krauth, Olga Petrova, Jacopo De Nardis

(Dated: September 10, 2017)

In lecture 02, we treated the maximum likelihood approach as one of the key methods for estimating the parameters of a distribution. Here we treat two examples. The second one was of great historical importance on the battlefields of WW2 although it proved necessary to go one step farther than we will do here.

I. POINT ESTIMATE FOR THE PARAMETERS OF A GAUSSIAN DISTRIBUTION

Suppose that we have n data points $x_1, x_2, x_3, \dots, x_n$ (these points are real numbers between $-\infty$ and ∞), and we know that they are drawn from a Gaussian distribution with unknown values of the variance σ^2 and the mean value $\langle x \rangle$:

$$p(x) = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi\sigma^2}} \exp(-(x - \langle x \rangle)^2 / (2\sigma^2)). \quad (1)$$

What is the maximum likelihood estimator for the mean value $\langle x \rangle$ and variance σ^2 of this Gaussian distribution from the data?

Hint1 Remember (from the first lecture) that the likelihood function is given by

$$p(x_1)p(x_2)\dots p(x_n).$$

Hint2 If you use the log likelihood function, explain why this can be done.

Carefully explain your calculation.

II. UNIFORM DISTRIBUTION

1. Preparation

What follows, a preparation for Section III, is described in Wasserman¹ (example 9.12 p. 124) as a hard example “that many people find confusing”. 124). It will not confuse You!

2. Application

Suppose a uniform distribution between 0 and θ , and consider k samples drawn from this distribution.

- What is the likelihood function $L(\theta)$ given x_1, \dots, x_k ? (Hint: suppose that “the probability to sample x_i ” is $1/\theta$. The $1/\theta$ factor is “physically” clear). Plot $L(\theta)$.
- What is the maximum-likelihood estimator of θ given x_1, \dots, x_k , that is, the samples?
- Comment your finding.

III. GERMAN TANK PROBLEM (FREQUENTIST APPROACH)

This example has been of considerable importance, first in WW2, then in the theory of statistics. It is the discrete version of Section II.

A. Preparation

Consider N balls numbered $1, 2, 3, \dots, N$, and take k out them (urn problem without putting them back). What is the probability $p_N(m)$ that the largest of them is equal to m ?

Hint0 How many ways are there to pick k (different) balls out of N ?

Hint1 To solve this simple combinatorial problem, consider that m must be contained in $k, k+1, k+2, \dots, N$.

Hint2 Count the number of ways to pick $(k-1)$ balls so that they are smaller than m .

Carefully explain your calculation.

B. Application

From an urn with an unknown number N of balls (tanks), the following $k = 4$ balls were drawn (without putting them back):

1, 2, 4, 14

What is the maximum likelihood estimator of the total number N of balls (tanks) (based on the probability distribution of the sample maximum m , here 14) that are contained in the urn (destroyed tanks left on the battlefield)?

The (disappointing) result of the maximum likelihood estimator (here in the famous "German tank problem") points to one of the limitations of the maximum likelihood method, namely that it presents a bias. Comment on this property. A trick allows to arrange the situation. In simple terms it consists in supposing that the mean of the intervals between the first ball and zero, the second and the first ball, the third and the second... etc is probably as large as the interval between the largest ball and N .

IV. GERMAN TANK PROBLEM (BAYESIAN APPROACH)

The Bayesian approach treats the total number N of the balls (tanks) as a random variable, and it has been much studied in the literature. But to start, simply write a program for $k = 4$ that samples N from a discretized exponential distribution with parameter λ . Then sample k *different balls* from this distribution, if possible.

A. Maximum

Numerically compute the probability distribution of all the N for which the largest of the $k = 4$ balls is equal to 14 (see previous example). Do this by sampling: Sample N , then sample $k = 4$ balls, and enter N into a histogram if the largest of the 4 balls is equal to 14.

Plot this distribution (histogram), its expectation and variance for different values of λ . For your convenience you find the Python program, already 95% written, on the course website. Modify it (to compute the expectation and variance as a function of λ), and run it.

B. Total sample

Numerically compute the probability distribution of all the N for which the $k = 4$ balls exactly equal 1, 2, 4, 14. Plot this distribution (histogram), its mean value and variance for different values of λ . Do these distribution differ (empirically) from the ones in Section IV A? For your convenience, the Python program on the course website already contains the crucial modification. Is the outcome

different from the one of the maximum version (Section IV A)?

¹ L. Wasserman, *All of Statistics*. Springer New York, 2004.