

ally engaged populace functioned, Ziser argues, as Latourian “speech prostheses” (see *Politics of Nature*, 2004) by which the voices of nonhumans were translated for humans. Environmental culture as organized by these verbal technologies was bioregionally specific, as Ziser shows in a table of major nineteenth-century agricultural journals with their places of publication, indicating environmental collectivities fine-grained enough to give voice to nonhuman actors. This national but locally diversified culture would be suppressed through the selective filtering of nonhuman voices by industrial agriculture and its urban counterpart, the pastoral literature that views the nonhuman world merely as a space of retreat and recreation for humankind.

TIMOTHY SWEET *West Virginia University*

*A World Not to Come:
A History of Latino Writing and Print Culture*

RAÚL CORONADO

Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2013

555 pp.

Officially, Mexico is not simply México. It is, more properly, los Estados Unidos Mexicanos: the United States of Mexico or the United Mexican States. For many today, the echo implied by this name suggests that Mexico—and Spanish America more broadly—attempted and failed to replicate the structure and government of the United States of America.

It is against this assumption and its long history that Raúl Coronado writes in *A World Not to Come: A History of Latino Writing and Print Culture*. The intellectual heritage and ideological transformations traced throughout *A World Not to Come* are vital to understanding the development of Spanish America as a site both independent of and yet in relation to the United States. For *A World Not to Come* uncovers a now-forgotten—or now-incomprehensible—conception of modernity, one that emerges in Spanish America from amid a collision of Catholic, Protestant, and secular theological-political Enlightenment discourses. The world of print culture named in Coronado’s subtitle is one not only of material culture and circulation but of oral, visual, and performative religious and political texts.

Print, orality, and performance then intersect with extensive etymologies and discussions of translation as *A World Not to Come* explicates the religious and political histories that shaped both practices of print and the construction of language in Spanish America during the late eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. In tracing the contexts that shaped Spanish American discourses of independence and nationhood, Coronado emphasizes that such discourses are neither poor imitations nor simple derivations of Euro-Anglo Enlightenment articulations of rights, liberty, freedom, individualism, and so on.

Within Latina/o studies and literary scholarship, critics such as Kirsten Silva Gruesz and Marissa K. López have begun to delineate a history of Latina/o print culture; they and others, including scholars such as John-Michael Rivera and Jesse Alemán, engage in broader discussions regarding the transformations Latina/o writing and culture undergo as US-Mexico relations shift throughout the Texas Revolution and the US-Mexican War. Border historians Andrés Reséndez, Karl Jacoby, Louise Pablos, Rachel St. John, Omar Valerio-Jiménez, and others have contributed political, economic, military, multiethnic, governmental, and cartographic histories vital to reconstructing borderland culture and what Rivera terms “the emergence of Mexican America.” Coronado brings to these discussions not only an extended time line, one that stretches from the sixteenth century to the nineteenth, but also an emphasis on religion. In order to understand Latina/o reactions to US imperialism, Coronado asserts, we must “understand the world of nineteenth-century Latinas/os on their own terms, *prior* to their being colonized” (391). Such an understanding, Coronado argues, requires excavating the Catholic Scholastic tradition that underlies Spanish America’s alternate path to modernity.

The care with which Coronado sets out the structure and evolution of Catholic Scholasticism, its intersections with, and its implications for Spanish American thought justifies the scale of *A World Not to Come* (its five hundred pages include an introduction, nine chapters, conclusion, several primary-source appendixes, and notes). Following the Protestant Reformation, Coronado writes, the Catholic Reformation “reaffirmed the importance of visibility, orality, and community as a means of accessing the divine” (47). Hispanic Enlightenment thought, moreover, developed within a world that “refused the split between the rational mind and the spiritual life” (61). Thus central “Enlightenment” concepts, including “the

genealogy of individualism, of thinking of agency as embodied solely in human beings, follows a different path in the Catholic Hispanic world" (51–52). In part by tracing the intricacies and transformations of terms such as *patria*, *nación*, *país*, and *pueblo*, Coronado sets forth a discursive tradition in which not the individual but a sense of community (defined through concentric circles of belonging) grounds the language of reform and revolution.

This tradition, Coronado argues, leads to an essential difference in the ways that British and Spanish Americans approached independence and nationalism:

Unlike their American neighbors to the north, these *Americanos* develop a nationalism not by rejecting Europe, king, and God; nor does it develop through the circulation of print culture. Rather, Spanish-American nationalism begins in communal, public forums, through proclamations and festivals. These, in turn, work to reconfigure the enduring symbols that had served as the foundation of the Hispanic world as foundations for the new nation: God, king, law, language. . . . For many of these *Americanos*, their connection to the past is not one to be rejected but corrected, allowing them to proclaim that "nosotros somos ahora los verdaderos Españoles [we are now the true Spaniards]." (74)

Even as Spanish Americans begin to rely on the language of rights, moreover, their usage of the term carries a fundamentally different connotation: "The concept of rights emerges *prior* to the clear articulation of a sense of an autonomous self; rather, rights emerge as something the family or corporate body possesses" (232).

The sense of "correction" rather than "rejection" that Coronado highlights becomes important to understanding independence discourses in Spanish America. As Coronado makes clear through the extended history that he traces, Spanish Americans considered revolution as a return to the past rather than a break from it. Even within "one of the first, if not *the* first," of the documents "to refer to the residents of all of New Spain" as Mexicanos, Coronado writes, "the rupture in time is actually a return to the past, a period in time when Mexicans . . . ostensibly had more freedom" (220). This is crucial, for it means that "[r]evolution arrives in Texas, but not in the modern sense of the word as something rebellious, transformative. Instead, revolution is a complete rotation, a return, in the original

connotation of the word, to a previous order” (220). In this case, that order is the Habsburg dynasty, during which “Spain emerged as a consolidated monarchy, a quasi-confederation of kingdoms, governed by viceroys and an entire political structure that included *ayuntamientos* (town councils) and *audiencias* (high courts)” (220). Coronado thus articulates how the intellectual tradition backed by Catholic Scholasticism overlaps with a political tradition of Spanish (imperial) governance to create the “alternative model of modernity [that] unfolded in the Americas” (8).

A World Not to Come explores the intellectual heritage of Spanish America through the ideological transformations that occur as Texas transitions from Spanish colony to Mexican state to Texan republic to US state. The world of Coronado’s Texas is an elite realm connected to Spain, Britain, France, the United States, and the Caribbean—the world that produces the broadsides, pamphlets, and declarations through which Coronado traces the development of an alternative Spanish American modernity. It is, at times, a world that seems distant from the nineteenth-century northern Mexico delineated by historians such as Brian DeLay and Pekka Hämäläinen: one beset by Comanche and Apache raids and struggling with a sense of military as much as economic abandonment—a less severe problem in Texas than elsewhere in northern Mexico, but a significant issue nonetheless. Such specifics are here secondary to the detailed intellectual, theological, and philosophical contexts of Texan and Spanish American political conversations.

Coronado establishes the broader implications of Tejano nationalism and independence discourses over the course of four parts, the first of which, “Imagining New Futures,” focuses on the writings of two brothers. Father José Antonio and José Bernardo Gutiérrez de Lara first articulate and then envision a new nationalism in New Spain. In so doing, they draw upon and revise the longstanding Catholic Scholastic tradition that Coronado carefully sets out. The etymologies that Coronado traces in the first part are vital to the second, “Pursuing Reform and Revolution.” This part elaborates the importance of Catholic-based visions of economic reform before tracing linguistic transformations that explain a Spanish American shift from reform to revolution. Revolution and the *nación* become possible as prestige, honor, valor, and the role of the state become defined by the *pueblo* rather than the monarch.

Part 3, “Revolutionizing the Catholic Past,” delineates clashes between

traditional imperial and Scholastic worldviews and rising revolutionary rhetoric. “[M]ore than a new way of thinking,” Coronado writes, modern philosophy “was an epistemic shift. For the royal commanders, agency in the modern sense was unfathomable because God had produced the world” (198). Yet even among revolutionaries the influence of Catholic Scholasticism persists. While myriad historians see “the ‘clear and evident influence of U.S. republican discourse’” in the 1813 Texas Declaration of Independence, Coronado argues that this affinity is largely formal: “in content—the discursive trace of the *pueblo* and rights of the community, not of individuals—the language is adamantly Catholic political philosophy” (245). With “The Entrance of Life into History,” which tracks Texas from Mexican independence through US statehood, comes Coronado’s most focused discussion of print history per se. Even as Tejanos begin to produce printed documents, Coronado argues, their sense of imagined community emerges not from the press but from a sense of communal action. At key moments they offer handwritten manuscripts for traditional public, collective readings—but “with a difference. Rather than reading aloud declarations of the viceroy’s or commandant’s sovereignty which rang down to the *pueblos*, the *pueblos* . . . authorized [a] language of sovereignty” (310–11). The final chapters of part 4 turn to print culture via the newspaper, and argue that only in the mid-nineteenth century after Texas statehood and the US-Mexican War do Spanish Americans begin to echo US political discourses with “little conceptual hybridity,” and they do so as a way of countering US racism (336).

As *A World Not to Come* draws to a close, however, Coronado argues against assuming that this linguistic turn means that Spanish Americans had discarded “the concentric relationships of belonging that had been part of the Hispanic world” (337). He asserts instead that figures from throughout Spanish America came together through their “shared language and Spanish-American creole cultural heritage” (369). In other words, “the issue is not that [Tejanos] had not developed the concept of a nation. It is that the idea itself was elastic. These nineteenth-century Spanish Americans, now Tejanos, now Cubans, used the concept of *nación* as it had long been used throughout the Hispanic world: to denote the inhabitants of a certain territory united by language, religion, and culture” (370). The sense of community that emerges from this alternate intellectual past, Coronado writes, transcends the nation and “continues to reverberate among Latin Ameri-

cans” who consider themselves linked by a “sense of cultural-linguistic solidarity” (392). In this solidarity, Coronado asserts, lies the broader implications and longer reach of the failed social imaginaries delineated in *A World Not to Come*.

Coronado’s cultural and literary history thus shares in a broader trans-american and American studies project to reframe the Americas in ways that shift basic understandings of Enlightenment concepts and US-Americas relations. Like Jennifer Rae Greeson’s work on the Enlightenment as a New World phenomenon and Doris L. Garraway’s arguments redefining the freedom theorized and established by the Haitian Revolution as “unslavery,” Coronado’s cultural history seeks to uncover the Americas’ lost, forgotten, or now misunderstood intellectual and ideological trajectories. Writ large, *A World Not to Come* does indeed offer what it terms “a historical-archeological account of an alternative West, one that has its roots in Catholic thought” (8). In so doing, it alters our assumptions about Spanish American political development and about what the Enlightenment was, what it meant, and what it might have become—assumptions that underlie both American and Latina/o literary studies.

MARIA A. WINDELL *University of Colorado, Boulder*

BETHANY WIGGIN is associate professor in the Department of Germanic Languages and Literatures at the University of Pennsylvania and associate faculty in English. She is the author of *Novel Translations: The European Novel and the German Book* (Cornell UP, 2011) as well as the forthcoming *Germanopolis: Utopia Found and Lost in Penn's Woods* (Pennsylvania State UP, 2015). She has edited *Babel of the Eighteenth-Century Atlantic* (Pennsylvania State UP, 2015), coedited *UnTranslatables: New Maps across Germanic Literatures* (Northwestern UP, 2014), and is at present editing an issue of the *Germanic Review*. She has written essays on globalism and the emergence of consumer culture, fashion, writing against slavery, and mysticism across the Atlantic world. She is the founding director of the Environmental Humanities Fellows Program at the University of Pennsylvania and will direct the Penn Humanities Forum in 2015–16.

MARIA WINDELL is assistant professor of English at the University of Colorado, Boulder. She is completing a manuscript titled "Sentimental Diplomacy: US Literary History and the Transamerican Nineteenth Century."

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.