presentation of the entirety of these votive materials, which certainly constitutes a useful contribution toward our understanding of the many facets of Metapontum's religious practices. Various features of these terracottas lead the author to suggest that Dionysos was the divinity to whom the deposit was dedicated, with whom one could join Persephone.

The author suggests that this particular cult with its agricultural connotation, inserted within the urban sanctuary, should be linked to the greater interest in the countryside—and the wealth associated with it—that at the end of the fourth century B.C. must have involved a larger number of Metapontum's citizens. The deposited material may thus be supposed to be the manifestation of a religiousness proper to classes that were not aristocratic, whose emergence is connected with the renewed social equilibria of the period. This attractive supposition, however, requires cautious assessment. Its truth can only be determined when all the materials from the other deposits at Metapontum are better known.

In addition, while we may agree that in this period some cults were common to city and country alike, a closer analysis must be made of the areas around the polis of Metapontum. As matters now stand, I do not believe it is possible to place on the same level the Metapontine chora and the indigenous sites close by, particularly Cozzo Presepe and Pomarico (the two mentioned on p. 151), since the most recent literature, especially that dealing with the latest excavations and their identification of regular layouts, shows that they were independent settlements and can no longer be regarded as phrouria.

MARCELLA BARRA BAGNASCO

UNIVERSITÀ DEGLI STUDI DI TORINO
VIA JUVARRA 16 BIS
10122 TURIN
ITALY

TEL ANAFA I.1–2: FINAL REPORT ON TEN YEARS OF EXCAVATION AT A HELLENISTIC AND ROMAN SETTLEMENT IN NORTHERN ISRAEL, by *Sharon C. Herbert*, with contributions by *D.T. Ariel*, *W. Farrand*, *G. Finkielsztejn*, *Y. Meshorer*, *R. Redding*, and *A. Stein*. (*JRA* Suppl. 10.I.1–2; Kelsey Museum Fieldwork Series.) I.1: pp. 334, pls. 3, figs. 148, plans 35, maps 6, tables 25; I.2: pp. 153, foldout figs. 2, figs. 49. Journal of Roman Archaeology, Ann Arbor 1994. $129. ISSN 1047-7594.

TEL ANAFA II.1: THE HELLENISTIC AND ROMAN POTTERY: THE PLAIN WARES AND THE FINE WARES, by *Andrea Berlin* and *Kathleen Warner Slane*, with contributions by *L. Cornell*, *J. Elam*, *M. Glascock*, *H. Neff*, *J. Gunneweg*, *A. Rautman*, and *J. Yellin*. (*JRA* Suppl. 10.II.1; Kelsey Museum Fieldwork Series.) Pp. 418, pls. 155, figs. 11, tables 58. Journal of Roman Archaeology, Ann Arbor 1997. $89.50. ISBN 1-887829-98-9; ISSN 1063-4304.

The small site of Tel Anafa in northern Galilee was occupied from the Bronze Age through the Roman period, with a Medieval Arab reoccupation after its abandonment in the first century A.D. Only the Hellenistic and Roman phases produced substantial remains of architecture and associated artifacts. In her introduction, Sharon Herbert characterizes Tel Anafa as a "type site" for almost all classes of artifacts found there because of the well-stratified contexts and the excavators' policy of saving all recovered material.

In addition to a long chapter on the history and occupation of the site, the first volume (in two parts) contains studies of the stamped amphora handles (D.T. Ariel and G. Finkielsztejn), coins (Y. Meshorer), a Tyrian sealing (A. Stein), the geological setting (W. Farrand), and vertebrate fauna (R. Redding), while the second volume is devoted to pottery. Other finds will be the subject of a planned third volume. The studies included in the present volumes permit a reconstruction of changes in agricultural practices, patterns of trade, and eating habits, allowing for conjectures about changing ethnicity of the inhabitants.

One of the strengths of these volumes is the detailed discussion of strategies of excavation and the presentation of the material. The section on occupational history and stratigraphy is organized to permit reading at different levels of detail. For each phase, an overview section is followed by more extended discussion of the remains and the associated deposits; material from important deposits is summarized in footnotes, and readers are referred to the specialized studies. Balk drawings and locus summaries are included in volume I.2. Information is presented in both narrative and chart form, creating a very accessible book.

A strategic decision was made to concentrate excavation on a large Hellenistic structure built in the late second century B.C., according to the datable finds. The plan of the building, like a Greek courtyard house, and the stucco decoration of its walls find their best parallels at Pergamon and Delos, while the sizable bath complex is most closely comparable to the baths in the palaces and houses of the Greek colony of Aï Khanoum in Afghanistan. Noting the rarity of elaborate baths in Greek private houses and their presence in Punic houses, Herbert suggests that the Tel Anafa bath complex may reflect Punic custom. That seems an unlikely explanation for Aï Khanoum, however, so that Paul Bernard's suggestion that such complexes may have been characteristic of Seleucid palace architecture is worth considering. Only the discovery of more Seleucid sites in the area between the eastern Mediterranean and Central Asia can answer this question.

The character of the site changed dramatically following the construction of the large Hellenistic building. For example, the plain-ware pottery of the earlier period was almost entirely local, and Berlin convincingly demonstrates an increasingly sophisticated assemblage of cooking wares, drawn from Phoenicia rather than from southern Palestine, but with a substantial number of amphoras and drinking vessels, suggesting a strong influence from Greek culture. Berlin feels that the change in pottery assemblage argues for an influx of a new group of more cosmopolitan settlers, while Herbert more cautiously suggests that the difference could be due to changing habits of the same population. According to Redding, the faunal remains sug-

gest that the Late Hellenistic phase saw a change from sheep pastoralism to cattle pastoralism with little involvement in agriculture, an idea that Berlin finds confirmed in the changing pottery assemblage. The Roman period brought further changes, with much of the plain-ware pottery coming from the lower Galilee. Berlin also remarks on the large number of pans, a form rarely found in the Levant but common in Italy; she suggests that some at least of the settlers of the Roman period must have been Italians. Redding's careful and sophisticated analysis of the faunal remains suggests that in terms of animal husbandry Tel Anafa functioned as part of a regional economy.

Tel Anafa also sheds light on the vexed question of the origins of Eastern Sigillata A, which constituted an overwhelming proportion of the fine wares from the site. Slane suggests tentatively either an origin in northern Syria, from which the ware traveled down the Orontes River, or an origin between Tel Anafa and Hama, from which the ware traveled up the Orontes. In her opinion the current evidence favors a northern Syrian origin. Slane's discussion of the difficult question of the relation between Eastern Sigillata A and Arretine ware is admirably lucid.

These volumes are a model of collaborative effort among specialists in various domains of archaeology. A particularly admirable trait is the clear distinction between data and analysis, which allows the reader to form his or her own conclusions.

Susan B. Downey

department of art history
university of california, los angeles
405 hilgard avenue
los angeles, california 90095-1417
downey@humnet.ucla.edu

Sacred Realm: The Emergence of the Synagogue in the Ancient World, edited by *Steven Fine*. Pp. 203, color pls. 53, figs. 105, plans 4, maps 2. Oxford University Press, New York 1996. $25. ISBN 0-19-510225-8.

The ancient world was saturated with bloody cults that embraced sacrifice at the core of sacred rite. As these religions effectively died out in the face of new, more spiritually-based cults—namely, Christianity with its symbolic sacrifice—one ancient creed weathered the revolutionary transition and rose above the ashes of its sacrificial altar to endure to this day: Judaism. The responsibility for this survival lies squarely on the shoulders of one institution: the ancient synagogue.

Synagogues acted as the operative link that transfigured an ancient religion devoted to animal sacrifice to a modern rite based on prayer and Scripture. The study of this innovative institution has, however, been largely overshadowed by a focus on the emerging church, an organization that took its cue from contemporary synagogues. Until recently, moreover, the lack of physical evidence has traditionally relegated ancient synagogues to the domain of textual scholars. The last few decades have, however, witnessed a dramatic shift in that situation as the "discipline of Jewish archaeology" (in the words of Eric Meyers) developed specifically after the establishment of the State of Israel in 1948. Excavations of and concurrent scholarship on mosaic-filled synagogues are now rapidly taking a front seat in archaeological and art historical circles, as evidenced in the critical articles and monographs cropping up on the subject. Edited volumes on ancient synagogues seem to be the most popular venue, however, and many of them have appeared in the last two decades. *Sacred Realm* joins this trend, yet breaks from it as an exhibition catalogue to accompany a 1996 show of synagogue artifacts at Yeshiva University Museum. Appropriately then, *Sacred Realm* is geared to a broad public with general surveys of synagogues—in both the Land of Israel and the Diaspora—as well as numerous color plates and illustrations.

In the foreword, the eminent historian of Second Temple Judaism, Lawrence Schiffman, introduces the audience to the ancient synagogue by positioning its development in relation to the destruction of the single most important worship place in Judaism: the Jewish Temple in Jerusalem. Eric Meyers, the leading American-based archaeologist who has excavated synagogues in Israel, reveals the multifarious dimensions of discovery by linking synagogue archaeology to the political molding of the Jewish state. Louis Feldman's article on epigraphical evidence gives us a smattering of inscriptions and papyri, mostly in Greek, from Diaspora synagogues. Such evidence is crucial in the face of literary testimony that has undergone editorial revisions and that often employs the synagogue as a polemical device—for example, the Palestinian and Babylonian competition for authority based on the holiness of each community's synagogue. The case of the Babylonian synagogue, located in modern-day Iraq, is intriguing in itself. While the Babylonian Talmud attests to a whole culture of synagogues, no archaeological evidence of them has surfaced. Drawing from epigraphical and archaeological evidence, Leonard Rutgers demonstrates that Diaspora synagogues were not remote, obscure structures crouching on the periphery of urban centers. Rather, they held prominent places near town squares and were conspicuous and magnificent enough to warrant appropriation, often violent and destructive, by pagan and Christian communities. Concentrating on the Land of Israel, Rachel Hachlili confirms the relative newness of the field by reevaluating the classification paradigm set up by M. Avi-Yonah for synagogues in 1971. Recent finds have thrown an unsettling wrench into these categories, pointing to the increased importance of regional factors as opposed to chronological ones. Hachlili also puts to rest the over-discussed prohibition concerning the making of art in the Second Commandment by establishing the rich and diverse artistic tradition of ancient Judaism. Giving the reader a vivid picture of synagogue liturgy, Avigdor Shinan focuses on translations of Scripture, public sermons, and liturgical texts and poetry. It is of particular interest that Shinan places liturgical texts in relation to art that appears in synagogues by researching several texts that discuss the *Aqedah* or Binding of Isaac—a prominent motif found in synagogue iconography.

The most significant contribution of this volume comes from the editor himself. Steven Fine's discussion of the synagogue's developing status as "sacred" flies in the face