



Review

Author(s): R. Ross Holloway

Review by: R. Ross Holloway

Source: *American Journal of Archaeology*, Vol. 102, No. 3 (Jul., 1998), pp. 626-627

Published by: Archaeological Institute of America

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/506413>

Accessed: 19-06-2016 13:40 UTC

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at

<http://about.jstor.org/terms>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



Archaeological Institute of America is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *American Journal of Archaeology*

excavations. The text is enhanced by clear diagrams of each tumulus, and photographs taken before and during excavation, the variable quality of which cannot be blamed on the author. Description of each tumulus is followed by a catalogue of finds according to their position within each monument. Comparanda discussed in the catalogues retain the Gordion field numbers for which a concordance is provided (pp. 247–49). The catalogues of finds are also complemented by drawings and photographs, although drawings of many of the most important objects and pottery vessels have not been included (e.g., TumH 2, 3, and 4, are woefully inadequate; TumH 5, where the incised decoration just visible on pl. 27G and mentioned in the text is not shown on the drawing). Many of the photographs are perhaps too small. Both figures and plates, in order to present objects in the same order as in the catalogue, contain a plethora of scales, resulting in irritating inconsistency. Some fragmentary and broken objects are not illustrated. Clearly, the catalogue of finds and accompanying illustrations are largely, if not completely, based on the records made before Young's death. This publication has, then, been 22 years in the making.

Part 3 comprises a commentary divided into five chapters. Since the volume is one of an as yet incomplete series of excavation reports, only selective issues relating to the inhumation tumuli, including evidence from the three Great Tumuli published in *Gordion I*, are discussed. Wider issues and an overview of the tradition and practices of tumulus burial at Gordion have, inevitably, been held over for report on the cremation tumuli. Chapter 17, "Construction Methods," provides a clear, valuable summary and discussion, leading to a suggested grouping of the tumuli according to their characteristics rather than their contents. Chapter 18, "Platforms, Coffins, and Assemblage Patterns," contains sections on "Pre-Kimmerian Traditional Burial Assemblages," "Assemblages in the Lesser Pre-Kimmerian Chambers," "Assemblages in the Lesser Post-Kimmerian Chambers," and "Assemblages Found in the Stone Caps." The division into Pre- and Post-Kimmerian is based on comparanda of grave gifts with excavated pre- and post-destruction material from the City Mound at Gordion. Chapter 19 is a brave attempt at establishing an internal chronological sequence and assigning absolute dates on the evidence presented in the two previous chapters. The suggested date for Tumulus B, ca. 630 B.C., has been recently confirmed by a dendrochronological date of 627 ± 1 B.C., and a new date of 718 B.C. for Tumulus MM (Midas Mound) (P. Kuniholm et al., *Nature* 381 [1966] 782; *XII. Arkeometri Sonuçları Toplantısı* [Ankara 1997] 166). Chapter 20, "Selected Forms of Gifts," pulls together classes of material, but again leaves much wider discussion for the next volume. The final seven-page chapter, "Summary and Conclusions," succinctly summarizes the preceding 226 pages, and tantalizingly mentions, but defers discussion of, some of the wider issues. It will be to this final chapter that most readers will turn in the first instance, and beyond which few outside the specialist fields of the Anatolian Iron Age or the archaeology of death will need to venture. The "Turkish summary" is condensed into two pages.

There are two appendices: the first, by C. Brixhe and M. Lejeune, deals in a single page with the signs carved into the wood of Tumulus B and graffiti from Tumulus J;

the second, by Sebastian Payne, discusses the pair of equids found in Tumulus KY. The index is clearly set out, comprehensive, and extremely useful.

This volume, and its companions, must find their way into any library that covers the archaeology of Phrygia, the ancient Near East, the Balkans, or the Eurasian Steppes. They will be heavily used, frequently referred to, and of lasting value.

GEOFFREY D. SUMMERS

DEPARTMENT OF POLITICAL SCIENCE AND
PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION
MIDDLE EAST TECHNICAL UNIVERSITY
ANKARA 06531
TURKEY
SUMMERS@RORQUAL.CC.METU.EDU.TR

EARLY SOCIETIES IN SICILY: NEW DEVELOPMENTS IN
ARCHAEOLOGICAL RESEARCH, edited by *Robert Leighton*. (Accordia Specialist Studies on Italy 5.) Pp. viii + 211, figs. 86, tables 2. Accordia Research Centre, University of London, London 1996. £32. ISBN 1-873415-13-3.

There was a time when 90% of Sicilian prehistory was published in three national Italian journals, *BPI*, *NSc*, and *MonAnt*. Then came regionalization. For archaeology, the change was not immediate, but today 90% of Sicilian prehistory is made known through regional journals, monographs sponsored and published on the island, local conferences, and Sicilian exhibitions. The outside world, and especially the world outside Italy, is frequently left in the dark. This is why a volume such as the one reviewed here is so useful. As Robert Leighton is at pains to point out in his introduction, *Early Societies in Sicily* is not intended as a compendium of Sicilian prehistory. Rather, it is a collection of stimulating papers in the tradition established by the Conferences on Italian Archaeology, of which four have taken place in recent years in England. There are 16 papers in all, spanning periods from the Palaeolithic to the end of the Sicilian Iron Age in the seventh century B.C.

Leighton's introduction gives a review of radiocarbon dates and a rapid-fire summary of what he sees as currently important areas of discussion. Contributions on early faunal and human populations and the development of the Mesolithic, the first by Laura Bonfiglio and Marcello Piperno, the second by Biancamaria Aranguren and Anna Revedin, come next. Sebastiano Tusa then discusses the transition from hunting and gathering to farming in western Sicily. His view of gradual adaptation, based on his well-known excavations at the Grotta dell' Uzzo, has been presented before, but in this paper he also adds a section on a remarkable discovery at Partanna, a cleft dug to a depth of over 13 m in the sixth or fifth millennium B.C. and then filled with debris of the Middle Neolithic. Fabrizio Nicoletti's paper on lithic industries of the Neolithic and Bronze Age is singularly welcome because it deals with an aspect of Sicilian prehistory that traditionally has been woefully neglected. We move on to Tusa on the Sicilian bell beakers, a theme that has attracted his atten-

tion before. This phenomenon of foreign connection in the third millennium—with Sardinia and perhaps the Iberian peninsula—spans more than one phase of the Sicilian Early Bronze Age (including part of what is often called the “Copper Age”). In northwest Sicily, the closely spaced beaker-style incision was transferred to local pottery. Along the south coast the beaker presence becomes episodic. The beaker may well be a signpost of social differentiation that the author and others believe accompanied the arrival of metallurgy.

The “elite” of the Early Bronze Age has another manifestation in the carefully executed chamber tombs of Santa Febronia presented by Laura Maniscalco. Metallurgy in the second and first millennium is also the topic of Rosa Maria Albanese. Both foreign connections with the Aegean and the development of a rich industry between the 13th and eighth centuries are examined. In this connection, Claudio Gardino’s paper on mining and metallurgical techniques is especially important, detailing the notable mineral resources of the northeast corner of the island, especially in copper, but also in iron, silver, and lead. Leighton asks if the transition from the Bronze Age through Final Bronze to the Iron Age cannot be described as the passage from chiefdom to tribe. Massimo Frasca, Dario Palermo, Francesca Spatafora, and Rosa Maria Albanese all describe separate regions of the island at the end of prehistory. Finally, Claire Lyons reviews Sikel burials at Morgantina and the interesting but incomplete acculturation of this community in the seventh and sixth centuries.

As is perhaps inevitable in a collection such as this, there is more of the detail than of the grand theme. Moreover, the grand themes—chiefdoms, metals and social differentiation, elites and their tombs (perhaps also serving as territorial markers)—seem a bit shopworn because they are all second-hand. It would be foolish to deny that Sicily participated in the universals of human experience. But one might hope that grand themes closer to the singular identity of this great island could be identified. Some of the more promising sites for this purpose were barely published when these papers were collected and so unfortunately are not considered or mentioned only in passing. The excavations of Giuseppe Castellana at Monte Grande and Ernesto De Miro’s work at Polizzello have amplified the initial discovery of the regional sanctuary at La Muculufa, showing that these places were the organizing centers of early Sicilian society, as regional sanctuaries were in mainland Italy. Much more could be said about commerce within the island and abroad, as Leighton has done with stone tools and Maniscalco with the export of ocher. The Sicilian cult of the dead has been illustrated in a spectacular fashion in the excavations of Castellana at Ciavallaro, a site that also brings new evidence to the difficult problem of the chronological overlap of the Castelluccian pottery style and that defined at Tindari, Rodi, and Vallelunga.

One should not forget the remarkable continuity of Sicilian culture. Whatever the aspirations of emerging elites, whatever the influence of Mycenaeans and others from abroad, there remain the constants of Sicilian life: the veneration of the dead, the perpetuation of the simple Sicilian house, and most characteristic of all, sitting on the floor or on a low bench to eat from a conveniently elevated pedestal bowl. At the outset of the collection, Leighton quotes

Leonardo Sciascia’s assertion that the history of Sicilian culture must be written from the most ordinary facts. For this reviewer, it is these facts that make such history live.

R. ROSS HOLLOWAY

CENTER FOR OLD WORLD ARCHAEOLOGY AND ART
BROWN UNIVERSITY
PROVIDENCE, RHODE ISLAND 02912
R_HOLLOWAY@BROWN.EDU

A ROUGH AND ROCKY PLACE: THE LANDSCAPE AND SETTLEMENT HISTORY OF THE METHANA PENINSULA, GREECE, edited by *Christopher Mee and Hamish Forbes*. (Liverpool Monographs in Archaeology and Oriental Studies.) Pp. ix + 370, figs. 236, tables 23. Liverpool University Press, Liverpool 1997. £55. ISBN 0-85323-741-7.

The tone in the introduction (ch. 1) to this, the most recent book on archaeological survey work carried out in the Peloponnese, is refreshingly British in its use of amusing epithets and understatements. Regarding Ovid, for example, it is said that he is “not renowned as a geologist” (1). Talking about survey methodology, Forbes and Mee say that “strict adherence to the finer tenets of field survey theory . . . might lead to sudden death” (3–4). Their style of writing alone succeeds in making the reader eager to read on.

The survey of the Methana peninsula was carried out between 1984 and 1986. Thus, it has taken 11 years for this final publication to appear. As will become evident for any user of this volume, however, the end product is a substantial presentation of data that has completely filled the “blank spot on the map” previously represented by Methana.

The second chapter, written by James et al., deals with the physical environment of Methana—or, more exactly, the formation, exploitation, and change of this environment. There are several longer, expertly written sections about the rocks, soils, and geomorphological development of Methana. Easier to digest for a nonspecialist are the more general parts on environmental change and human settlement. Of special interest is the discussion about the age of terraces (frequently found in the Mediterranean landscape). It is argued that the distribution, age, and quality of artifacts on and within (20 cm) terrace soil, taken in conjunction with enhanced phosphorus values across several terraces, can be used to date these. This seemed like a promising start in how to deal with the dating of a recurring feature in any Mediterranean survey: therefore, it was somewhat of an anticlimax when the authors concluded that “the age of terraces requires further and urgent investigation” (28).

In a useful table (30–31) the authors have summarized the environmental events from one million years ago to the present, in relation to the human settlement pattern on Methana. The only reservation I have is that the events said to have occurred during EH I–II are contradicted several times in previous pages. Thus, how can there be talk of an extensive deforestation when no evidence has been