gest that the Late Hellenistic phase saw a change from sheep pastoralism to cattle pastoralism with little involvement in agriculture, an idea that Berlin finds confirmed in the changing pottery assemblage. The Roman period brought further changes, with much of the plain-ware pottery coming from the lower Galilee. Berlin also remarks on the large number of pans, a form rarely found in the Levant but common in Italy; she suggests that some at least of the settlers of the Roman period must have been Italians. Redding's careful and sophisticated analysis of the faunal remains suggests that in terms of animal husbandry Tel Anafa functioned as part of a regional economy.

Tel Anafa also sheds light on the vexed question of the origins of Eastern Sigillata A, which constituted an overwhelming proportion of the fine wares from the site. Slane suggests tentatively either an origin in northern Syria, from which the ware traveled down the Orontes River, or an origin between Tel Anafa and Hama, from which the ware traveled up the Orontes. In her opinion the current evidence favors a northern Syrian origin. Slane's discussion of the difficult question of the relation between Eastern Sigillata A and Arretine ware is admirably lucid.

These volumes are a model of collaborative effort among specialists in various domains of archaeology. A particularly admirable trait is the clear distinction between data and analysis, which allows the reader to form his or her own conclusions.

Susan B. Downey

department of art history
university of california, los angeles
405 hilgard avenue
los angeles, california 90095-1417
downey@humnet.ucla.edu

Sacred Realm: The Emergence of the Synagogue in the Ancient World, edited by *Steven Fine*. Pp. 203, color pls. 53, figs. 105, plans 4, maps 2. Oxford University Press, New York 1996. $25. ISBN 0-19-510225-8.

The ancient world was saturated with bloody cults that embraced sacrifice at the core of sacred rite. As these religions effectively died out in the face of new, more spiritually-based cults—namely, Christianity with its symbolic sacrifice—one ancient creed weathered the revolutionary transition and rose above the ashes of its sacrificial altar to endure to this day: Judaism. The responsibility for this survival lies squarely on the shoulders of one institution: the ancient synagogue.

Synagogues acted as the operative link that transfigured an ancient religion devoted to animal sacrifice to a modern rite based on prayer and Scripture. The study of this innovative institution has, however, been largely overshadowed by a focus on the emerging church, an organization that took its cue from contemporary synagogues. Until recently, moreover, the lack of physical evidence has traditionally relegated ancient synagogues to the domain of textual scholars. The last few decades have, however, witnessed a dramatic shift in that situation as the "discipline of Jewish archaeology" (in the words of Eric Meyers) developed specifically after the establishment of the State of Israel in 1948. Excavations of and concurrent scholarship on mosaic-filled synagogues are now rapidly taking a front seat in archaeological and art historical circles, as evidenced in the critical articles and monographs cropping up on the subject. Edited volumes on ancient synagogues seem to be the most popular venue, however, and many of them have appeared in the last two decades. *Sacred Realm* joins this trend, yet breaks from it as an exhibition catalogue to accompany a 1996 show of synagogue artifacts at Yeshiva University Museum. Appropriately then, *Sacred Realm* is geared to a broad public with general surveys of synagogues—in both the Land of Israel and the Diaspora—as well as numerous color plates and illustrations.

In the foreword, the eminent historian of Second Temple Judaism, Lawrence Schiffman, introduces the audience to the ancient synagogue by positioning its development in relation to the destruction of the single most important worship place in Judaism: the Jewish Temple in Jerusalem. Eric Meyers, the leading American-based archaeologist who has excavated synagogues in Israel, reveals the multifarious dimensions of discovery by linking synagogue archaeology to the political molding of the Jewish state. Louis Feldman's article on epigraphical evidence gives us a smattering of inscriptions and papyri, mostly in Greek, from Diaspora synagogues. Such evidence is crucial in the face of literary testimony that has undergone editorial revisions and that often employs the synagogue as a polemical device—for example, the Palestinian and Babylonian competition for authority based on the holiness of each community's synagogue. The case of the Babylonian synagogue, located in modern-day Iraq, is intriguing in itself. While the Babylonian Talmud attests to a whole culture of synagogues, no archaeological evidence of them has surfaced. Drawing from epigraphical and archaeological evidence, Leonard Rutgers demonstrates that Diaspora synagogues were not remote, obscure structures crouching on the periphery of urban centers. Rather, they held prominent places near town squares and were conspicuous and magnificent enough to warrant appropriation, often violent and destructive, by pagan and Christian communities. Concentrating on the Land of Israel, Rachel Hachlili confirms the relative newness of the field by reevaluating the classification paradigm set up by M. Avi-Yonah for synagogues in 1971. Recent finds have thrown an unsettling wrench into these categories, pointing to the increased importance of regional factors as opposed to chronological ones. Hachlili also puts to rest the over-discussed prohibition concerning the making of art in the Second Commandment by establishing the rich and diverse artistic tradition of ancient Judaism. Giving the reader a vivid picture of synagogue liturgy, Avigdor Shinan focuses on translations of Scripture, public sermons, and liturgical texts and poetry. It is of particular interest that Shinan places liturgical texts in relation to art that appears in synagogues by researching several texts that discuss the *Aqedah* or Binding of Isaac—a prominent motif found in synagogue iconography.

The most significant contribution of this volume comes from the editor himself. Steven Fine's discussion of the synagogue's developing status as "sacred" flies in the face

of much previous scholarship that casts synagogues as commonplace, democratic organizations in contradistinction to Judaism's prototype of sanctity—the Jerusalem Temple. Specifically, Fine shows that the source of holiness for synagogues resides in the Torah scrolls housed there and in the use of Temple imagery. While Fine is not the first to make this point, his work is unprecedented in its clear chronological analysis of rabbinic texts and epigraphical sources that disclose the cultivation of synagogue sanctity. Fine's interpretation of the synagogue's unproblematic appropriation of Temple motifs may, however, underestimate the tensions inherent in allocating characteristics from a locus fraught with sacred history for a thousand years to a comparatively young and developing assembly center. Mixed signals within rabbinic literature and in synagogue art itself sometimes belie an uneasy displacement of Temple sanctity to synagogues.

While any given publication can only do so much, this volume might have been stronger with an added chapter on the context of ancient synagogues, comparing them to pagan worship places and churches. Although several of the authors do comment on Christian structures and Christian attitudes toward synagogues, the reader comes away with a limited snapshot of the synagogue's artistic environment. Moreover, in light of recent attention devoted to gender in archaeology, this volume gives short shrift to the role of women in ancient synagogues. A couple of authors refer to inscriptional evidence that name women, but there is no extended discussion of the question beyond the familiar claim that a synagogue gallery does not necessarily point to a women's gallery. (Bernadette Brooten's book, *Women Leaders in Ancient Synagogues* [Chico 1982], still remains the work to consult.) The reader should also be prepared to encounter repetition and overlap among the seven contributors that might have been avoided with stronger editorial direction. A discussion of the Greek origin for the term "synagogue," for example, shows up in five of the seven essays (with the most thorough treatment by Louis Feldman), as if introduced to the reader for the first time.

Despite these minor shortcomings, the book is an excellent addition to the nascent field of synagogue research, and of value to scholars and graduate students because of its rigorous footnoting and helpful bibliography. It is also suitable material for the classroom—I found it useful in my seminar on Jewish art—with its many illustrations and reasonable price. Ultimately, *Sacred Realm* is a timely publication as we stand poised to usher in the next millennium. Scholars are finally giving due attention to an institution that witnessed the turn of the Common Era itself 2,000 years ago and that remains vital to this day.

JOAN R. BRANHAM

DEPARTMENT OF ART AND ART HISTORY
PROVIDENCE COLLEGE
PROVIDENCE, RHODE ISLAND 02918-0001
JBRANHAM@PROVIDENCE.EDU

HELLENISTIC ARCHITECTURAL SCULPTURE: FIGURAL MOTIFS IN WESTERN ANATOLIA AND THE AEGEAN ISLANDS, by *Pamela A. Webb*. (Wisconsin Studies in Classics.) Pp. xiv + 225, figs. 142. University of Wisconsin Press, Madison 1996. $60. ISBN 0-299-14980-3.

Here is a most welcome addition to the meager corpus of informative works on Hellenistic sculpture. The monuments discussed provide an amazing view of little-known sites such as Chryse in the Troad, Alabanda in Caria, and Sagalassos in Pisidia, out of 25 sites altogether and 57 monuments. This is an extremely thoughtful book, with comprehensive bibliographies, lengthy descriptions, and thorough discussions of each monument, in addition to a detailed index and plentiful illustrations. More than 100 pages of catalogue entries provide the essentials of date, shape, size, order, and extant sculptures for each monument. Discussions for each entry provide background information on the ancient literary sources as well as excavation and publication histories. Webb points out that this "sample is representative," not exhaustive, and that the work is based on her dissertation, *Hellenistic Architectural Sculpture* (Bryn Mawr College 1989).

Part I gives an all too brief "overview" to the sculptural corpus, briefer than we would hope for, yet about as much as we might expect given our current state of understanding of the Hellenistic sculptural monuments. In the introduction, Webb observes that although the repetitious frieze associated with Ionic buildings is more common in the Hellenistic East, figural motifs are found on most important buildings. Her purpose is threefold: "to examine how figural sculpture was used . . . ; to determine patterns of usage . . . ; and to gain understanding as to why figural motifs were employed" (3). According to Webb, it was not merely a matter of extra expense or time involved to construct buildings with sculpture. She believes that the motifs were of paramount importance and indicate a strong religious component. Webb wisely emphasizes the interdependence of sculpture and architecture and most fortunately considers both together, beginning her "overview" with "Architecture."

In the chapter on architecture, there are effective tables for a chronological view (Early–Middle–Late) of types of buildings (temple, altar, civic, domestic, cultic, heroa). For the orders, Webb observes that Doric is more common for civic and cultic buildings, Ionic for temples and altars. Less well known than temples, seven pi-shaped altars have figural sculpture, and most occur in the Middle Hellenistic period, the second century B.C. Cultic buildings and heroa are among the more curiously shaped and ornamented structures and almost defy classification. Such structures occur for the most part in the Early Hellenistic period, generally before 150 B.C., and are quite thoroughly discussed. A chapter on the "Placement of Sculpture" points out the rare use of pedimental figural motifs as well as the lesser use of figures in traditional Doric metopes and Ionic friezes.