

Review

Author(s): Linda Jones Roccos Review by: Linda Jones Roccos

Source: American Journal of Archaeology, Vol. 102, No. 2 (Apr., 1998), pp. 446-447

Published by: Archaeological Institute of America Stable URL: http://www.jstor.org/stable/506490

Accessed: 19-06-2016 11:39 UTC

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at http://about.jstor.org/terms

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



 $Archaeological\ Institute\ of\ America\ {\rm is\ collaborating\ with\ JSTOR\ to\ digitize,\ preserve\ and\ extend\ access\ to\ American\ Journal\ of\ Archaeology}$

of much previous scholarship that casts synagogues as commonplace, democratic organizations in contradistinction to Judaism's prototype of sanctity—the Jerusalem Temple. Specifically, Fine shows that the source of holiness for synagogues resides in the Torah scrolls housed there and in the use of Temple imagery. While Fine is not the first to make this point, his work is unprecedented in its clear chronological analysis of rabbinic texts and epigraphical sources that disclose the cultivation of synagogue sanctity. Fine's interpretation of the synagogue's unproblematic appropriation of Temple motifs may, however, underestimate the tensions inherent in allocating characteristics from a locus fraught with sacred history for a thousand years to a comparatively young and developing assembly center. Mixed signals within rabbinic literature and in synagogue art itself sometimes belie an uneasy displacement of Temple sanctity to synagogues.

While any given publication can only do so much, this volume might have been stronger with an added chapter on the context of ancient synagogues, comparing them to pagan worship places and churches. Although several of the authors do comment on Christian structures and Christian attitudes toward synagogues, the reader comes away with a limited snapshot of the synagogue's artistic environment. Moreover, in light of recent attention devoted to gender in archaeology, this volume gives short shrift to the role of women in ancient synagogues. A couple of authors refer to inscriptional evidence that name women, but there is no extended discussion of the question bevond the familiar claim that a synagogue gallery does not necessarily point to a women's gallery. (Bernadette Brooten's book, Women Leaders in Ancient Synagogues [Chico 1982], still remains the work to consult.) The reader should also be prepared to encounter repetition and overlap among the seven contributors that might have been avoided with stronger editorial direction. A discussion of the Greek origin for the term "synagogue," for example, shows up in five of the seven essays (with the most thorough treatment by Louis Feldman), as if introduced to the reader for the

Despite these minor shortcomings, the book is an excellent addition to the nascent field of synagogue research, and of value to scholars and graduate students because of its rigorous footnoting and helpful bibliography. It is also suitable material for the classroom—I found it useful in my seminar on Jewish art—with its many illustrations and reasonable price. Ultimately, Sacred Realm is a timely publication as we stand poised to usher in the next millennium. Scholars are finally giving due attention to an institution that witnessed the turn of the Common Era itself 2,000 years ago and that remains vital to this day.

JOAN R. BRANHAM

DEPARTMENT OF ART AND ART HISTORY PROVIDENCE COLLEGE PROVIDENCE, RHODE ISLAND 02918-0001 JBRANHAM@PROVIDENCE.EDU HELLENISTIC ARCHITECTURAL SCULPTURE: FIGURAL MOTIFS IN WESTERN ANATOLIA AND THE AEGEAN ISLANDS, by *Pamela A. Webb.* (Wisconsin Studies in Classics.) Pp. xiv + 225, figs. 142. University of Wisconsin Press, Madison 1996. \$60. ISBN 0-299-14980-3.

Here is a most welcome addition to the meager corpus of informative works on Hellenistic sculpture. The monuments discussed provide an amazing view of little-known sites such as Chryse in the Troad, Alabanda in Caria, and Sagalassos in Pisidia, out of 25 sites altogether and 57 monuments. This is an extremely thoughtful book, with comprehensive bibliographies, lengthy descriptions, and thorough discussions of each monument, in addition to a detailed index and plentiful illustrations. More than 100 pages of catalogue entries provide the essentials of date, shape, size, order, and extant sculptures for each monument. Discussions for each entry provide background information on the ancient literary sources as well as excavation and publication histories. Webb points out that this "sample is representative," not exhaustive, and that the work is based on her dissertation, Hellenistic Architectural Sculpture (Bryn Mawr College 1989).

Part I gives an all too brief "overview" to the sculptural corpus, briefer than we would hope for, yet about as much as we might expect given our current state of understanding of the Hellenistic sculptural monuments. In the introduction, Webb observes that although the repetitious frieze associated with Ionic buildings is more common in the Hellenistic East, figural motifs are found on most important buildings. Her purpose is threefold: "to examine how figural sculpture was used . . . ; to determine patterns of usage . . . ; and to gain understanding as to why figural motifs were employed" (3). According to Webb, it was not merely a matter of extra expense or time involved to construct buildings with sculpture. She believes that the motifs were of paramount importance and indicate a strong religious component. Webb wisely emphasizes the interdependence of sculpture and architecture and most fortunately considers both together, beginning her "overview" with "Architecture."

In the chapter on architecture, there are effective tables for a chronological view (Early–Middle–Late) of types of buildings (temple, altar, civic, domestic, cultic, heroa). For the orders, Webb observes that Doric is more common for civic and cultic buildings, Ionic for temples and altars. Less well known than temples, seven pi-shaped altars have figural sculpture, and most occur in the Middle Hellenistic period, the second century B.C. Cultic buildings and heroa are among the more curiously shaped and ornamented structures and almost defy classification. Such structures occur for the most part in the Early Hellenistic period, generally before 150 B.C., and are quite thoroughly discussed. A chapter on the "Placement of Sculpture" points out the rare use of pedimental figural motifs as well as the lesser use of figures in traditional Doric metopes and Ionic friezes.

The Hellenistic period saw an increasingly wide variety of locations for sculpture, such as column drums and shafts, capitals, pedestals, and ceiling coffers, and these are treated effectively. The chapter on "Motifs" seems all too brief, but more discussion of individual monuments is provided with those discussed in part II. Nonnarrative motifs used as pattern more than statement-such as bull's heads and bucrania, rosettes, tripods, phialai, and garlands-are considered first. Following this are griffins, heads and masks, erotes, akanthos figures and caryatids, shields, and imagines clipeatae. The use of narrative themes is then analyzed, first human figures, then the traditional mythological themes of Gigantomachy (Pergamon, Ilion, Lagina), Amazonomachy (Ephesos, Magnesia, Alabanda), Centauromachy (Belevi, Limyra, Samothrace), and other battles. The Telephos frieze receives its due, and Webb's agreement with lowering the date of the Pergamon Altar to ca. 165 B.C. (see part II) supports the view that this frieze is one of the earliest extant examples of continuous narrative in sculpture.

Part II, "The Sites," contains the meat of the book, but is somewhat harder to assess, given the fine line taken by the catalogue between exhaustiveness and conciseness. In addition to the basic background and descriptive information about the sculptures from each site, Webb discusses problems in dating and identifying the monuments. For example, the Mausoleum at Belevi in Ionia, patterned after that at Halicarnassos, is attributed to Lysimachos (died 281 B.C.), despite Pausanias's description of the death and burial of Lysimachos near the Chersonese. Webb concludes that the Belevi Mausoleum was planned for that successor of Alexander, but left unfinished upon his sudden death, and her analysis of the ceiling coffer sculptures places them stylistically in the early third century B.C.

Webb includes many little-known monuments, such as that of Caius Memmius, a grandson of Sulla, in Ephesos, with its caryatids and attic reliefs, along with muchdiscussed monuments such as the Altar of Athena at Priene, with its now-lost sculptures of Apollo and the Muses. A particular strength of the work is Webb's competent overall discussion of each monument, covering architectural elements and pottery deposits as well as the sculptural finds. Additional references might reinforce and expand the descriptions. For example, in the discussion of the Temple of Apollo Smintheus at Chryse, dated to the mid-second century B.C., there is no mention of the fact that the temple held a famous statue of Apollo by Skopas. The reference given is only to Strabo 13.604 (cited by A.F. Stewart, Skopas of Paros [Park Ridge 1977] 128); surely this conflict in dating (Skopas being a mid-fourth-century sculptor, or even a first-century one) deserves some explanation?

There is little that could be improved here, but one can always make a few suggestions for ease of use. First, there is no overall list of the monuments discussed, and not only is there a large selection, but many are little known. They deserve more notice. The monuments can be ascertained, however, from the very useful lists by building types in tables 1–6. Second, notes are placed at the end of each

site rather than at the end of each monument, where one would most naturally expect them, given that the bibliographies are placed with each monument. Finally, the bibliographies could be arranged chronologically for a more useful sequence of excavation and publication events, rather than alphabetically.

Altogether, this volume is a most useful and informative work, and we eagerly await the promised companion volume on architectural sculptures from the Greek mainland.

LINDA JONES ROCCOS

THE COLLEGE OF STATEN ISLAND CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK 2800 VICTORY BOULEVARD STATEN ISLAND, NEW YORK 10314 ROCCOS@POSTBOX.CSI.CUNY.EDU

The Alexander Mosaic: Stories of Victory and Defeat, by *Ada Cohen.* (Cambridge Studies in Classical Art and Iconography.) Pp. xiv + 279, color pls. 8, figs. 81. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge 1997. \$60. ISBN 0-521-56339-9.

Cohen's monograph, originally a Harvard University dissertation, is less concerned with the classic problems of the Alexander Mosaic's authorship, identification, date, and so on, than with its "richness, its openness to discussion and interpretation, the multiple contexts that it evokes" (1). In true fin-de-siècle fashion, the author guides us discursively and undogmatically through a maze of contexts, effectively mobilizing contemporary critical theory and visual comparanda ranging from Altdorfer to the Iwo Jima Memorial.

In chapter 1, Cohen begins with a description (which omits several figures, and could have benefited from numbering them all), then turns to methodology, deftly reviewing the main problems and the central issue of the relationship between image and history-as-text. Chapters 2 and 3 then establish the mosaic's general accuracy as a copy and its model's inaugurative status within the genre.

Chapters 4–6 are the heart of the book, investigating the work's "first level of existence" as a Graeco-Macedonian painting. Chapter 4 addresses content, narrative structure, general historicity, and author. Chapter 5 examines narrative technique, relating it to tragedy and Hellenistic "tragic history," and chapter 6 takes up Alpers's classic opposition between description and narration, focusing upon such showstoppers as the shield-mirror and costumes, postures, gestures, and facial expressions.

In chapter 7, Cohen shifts to "the second level of existence"—the Roman. She examines the Casa del Fauno and its owners, then the plunder of Greek works and the beginnings of copying, and finally the mosaic's possible meaning(s) to the Roman viewer. A brief epilogue concludes the book.

This is a rich, subtle, well-researched, fair, and often