MODULE *voldemort*

/*Replicated storage protocol with clienside routing.

/**Debaditya Basak*, 11 *Nov* 2016

EXTENDS *Integers*, *Sequences*, *FiniteSets*, *TLC*

CONSTANTS N, C, $STOP$, $ReadQ$, $WriteQ$, $FAILNUM$

ASSUME $N = 5 \land C = 1 \land STOP < 10 \land 1 \leq ReadQ \land ReadQ \leq 3$
$\land 1 \leq WriteQ \land WriteQ \leq 3 \land 0 \leq FAILNUM \land FAILNUM \leq 2$

$Nodes \triangleq 1 \,..\, N$

$Clients \triangleq N + 1 \,..\, N + C$ /*should give different *ID* space to Client

```
--algorithm voldemort{
    variable FailNum = FAILNUM,
             state = "Reading",
             state1 = "InProcess",
             wQ = WriteQ,
             up  = [n ∈ Nodes ↦ TRUE],   /*Initially all nodes are up
             db  = [n ∈ Nodes ↦ [ver ↦ 0, val ↦ 0]] ;
              /*All nodes have database, wherein [ver = 0, val = 0] stored for the item

    define {
    UpNodes ≜ {i ∈ Nodes : up[i] = TRUE}
    ReturnReadQ ≜ CHOOSE i ∈ SUBSET (UpNodes) : Cardinality(i) = ReadQ
    ReturnWriteQ ≜ CHOOSE i ∈ SUBSET (UpNodes) : Cardinality(i) = WriteQ
    NodeR ≜ CHOOSE i ∈ ReturnReadQ : ∀ j ∈ ReturnReadQ : db[i].ver ≥ db[j].ver
    NodeW(Q) ≜ CHOOSE i ∈ Q : ∀ j ∈ Q : i ≤ j
    ClientNotWriting ≜ state1 = "InProcess"     ∧ state  = "Reading"
    ClientAtomicWriteDone ≜ state = "Writing" ∧ state1 = "WriteEnd"
     }

    fair process ( c ∈ Clients )
    variable cntr = 0, hver = 0, Q = {} ;
    {
     CL: while ( cntr ≤ STOP ) {
           state := "Reading" ;
           state1 := "InProcess" ;
           cntr := cntr + 1 ;
           hver := db[NodeR].ver + 1 ;
           Q := ReturnWriteQ ;
            /*Nodes can fail or come back up between atomic states CL and CL1
           CL1: while ( Q ≠ {} ) {
                 state := "Writing" ;
                 db[NodeW(Q)].ver := hver || db[NodeW(Q)].val := cntr ;
                 Q := Q \ {NodeW(Q)} ;
                 if ( Q = {} ) {
                  state1 := "WriteEnd" ;
                  }
```

```
                }
            }
        }

    fair process ( n ∈ Nodes )
    {
     NODE: while ( TRUE ∧ ClientNotWriting ) {
       /*To make Clients-process WRITE atomic
       /*Nodes state change only when ClientNotWriting is TRUE
            if ( FailNum > 0 ∧ up[self] = TRUE ) {   /*Storage node can fail
                  up[self] := FALSE ;
                  FailNum := FailNum − 1 ;
                  }
            else if ( up[self] = FALSE ) {   /*Or recover
                  up[self] := TRUE ;
                  FailNum := FailNum + 1 ;
                  }
          }
    }

}
```

****

BEGIN TRANSLATION

VARIABLES $FailNum$, $state$, $state1$, wQ, up, db, pc

define statement

$UpNodes \triangleq \{i \in Nodes : up[i] = \text{TRUE}\}$
$ReturnReadQ \triangleq \text{CHOOSE } i \in \text{SUBSET } (UpNodes) : Cardinality(i) = ReadQ$
$ReturnWriteQ \triangleq \text{CHOOSE } i \in \text{SUBSET } (UpNodes) : Cardinality(i) = WriteQ$
$NodeR \triangleq \text{CHOOSE } i \in ReturnReadQ : \forall\, j \in ReturnReadQ : db[i].ver \geq db[j].ver$
$NodeW(Q) \triangleq \text{CHOOSE } i \in Q : \forall\, j \in Q : i \leq j$
$ClientNotWriting \triangleq state1 = \text{“InProcess”} \quad \wedge state = \text{“Reading”}$
$ClientAtomicWriteDone \triangleq state = \text{“Writing”} \wedge state1 = \text{“WriteEnd”}$

VARIABLES $cntr$, $hver$, Q

$vars \triangleq \langle FailNum,\ state,\ state1,\ wQ,\ up,\ db,\ pc,\ cntr,\ hver,\ Q \rangle$

$ProcSet \triangleq (Clients) \cup (Nodes)$

$Init \triangleq$ Global variables
$\wedge\ FailNum = FAILNUM$
$\wedge\ state = \text{“Reading”}$
$\wedge\ state1 = \text{“InProcess”}$
$\wedge\ wQ = WriteQ$
$\wedge\ up = [n \in Nodes \mapsto \text{TRUE}]$
$\wedge\ db = [n \in Nodes \mapsto [ver \mapsto 0,\ val \mapsto 0]]$

Process c

$\land\ cntr = [self \in Clients \mapsto 0]$
$\land\ hver = [self \in Clients \mapsto 0]$
$\land\ Q = [self \in Clients \mapsto \{\}]$
$\land\ pc = [self \in ProcSet \mapsto \text{CASE } self \in Clients \to \text{“CL”}$
$\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad \square \quad self \in Nodes \to \text{“NODE”}]$

$CL(self) \triangleq \land\ pc[self] = \text{“CL”}$
$\qquad\qquad \land\ \text{IF } cntr[self] \leq STOP$
$\qquad\qquad\qquad \text{THEN } \land\ state' = \text{“Reading”}$
$\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\quad \land\ state1' = \text{“InProcess”}$
$\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\quad \land\ cntr' = [cntr \text{ EXCEPT } ![self] = cntr[self] + 1]$
$\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\quad \land\ hver' = [hver \text{ EXCEPT } ![self] = db[NodeR].ver + 1]$
$\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\quad \land\ Q' = [Q \text{ EXCEPT } ![self] = ReturnWriteQ]$
$\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\quad \land\ pc' = [pc \text{ EXCEPT } ![self] = \text{“CL1”}]$
$\qquad\qquad\qquad \text{ELSE } \land\ pc' = [pc \text{ EXCEPT } ![self] = \text{“Done”}]$
$\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\quad \land\ \text{UNCHANGED } \langle state, state1, cntr, hver, Q\rangle$
$\qquad\qquad \land\ \text{UNCHANGED } \langle FailNum, wQ, up, db\rangle$

$CL1(self) \triangleq \land\ pc[self] = \text{“CL1”}$
$\qquad\qquad\ \land\ \text{IF } Q[self] \neq \{\}$
$\qquad\qquad\qquad \text{THEN } \land\ state' = \text{“Writing”}$
$\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\quad \land\ db' = [db \text{ EXCEPT } ![NodeW(Q[self])].ver = hver[self],$
$\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\quad ![NodeW(Q[self])].val = cntr[self]]$
$\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\quad \land\ Q' = [Q \text{ EXCEPT } ![self] = Q[self] \setminus \{NodeW(Q[self])\}]$
$\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\quad \land\ \text{IF } Q'[self] = \{\}$
$\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad \text{THEN } \land\ state1' = \text{“WriteEnd”}$
$\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad \text{ELSE } \land\ \text{TRUE}$
$\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\quad \land\ \text{UNCHANGED } state1$
$\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\quad \land\ pc' = [pc \text{ EXCEPT } ![self] = \text{“CL1”}]$
$\qquad\qquad\qquad \text{ELSE } \land\ pc' = [pc \text{ EXCEPT } ![self] = \text{“CL”}]$
$\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\quad \land\ \text{UNCHANGED } \langle state, state1, db, Q\rangle$
$\qquad\qquad\ \land\ \text{UNCHANGED } \langle FailNum, wQ, up, cntr, hver\rangle$

$c(self) \triangleq CL(self) \lor CL1(self)$

$NODE(self) \triangleq \land\ pc[self] = \text{“NODE”}$
$\qquad\qquad\qquad\ \land\ \text{IF TRUE } \land\ ClientNotWriting$
$\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad \text{THEN } \land\ \text{IF } FailNum > 0 \land up[self] = \text{TRUE}$
$\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad \text{THEN } \land\ up' = [up \text{ EXCEPT } ![self] = \text{FALSE}]$
$\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\quad \land\ FailNum' = FailNum - 1$
$\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad \text{ELSE } \land\ \text{IF } up[self] = \text{FALSE}$
$\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad \text{THEN } \land\ up' = [up \text{ EXCEPT } ![self] = \text{TRUE}]$
$\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\quad \land\ FailNum' = FailNum + 1$
$\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad \text{ELSE } \land\ \text{TRUE}$
$\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\qquad\quad \land\ \text{UNCHANGED } \langle FailNum, up\rangle$

$$\begin{array}{rl} & \wedge\ pc' = [pc \text{ EXCEPT } ![self] = \text{“NODE”}] \\ \text{ELSE} & \wedge\ pc' = [pc \text{ EXCEPT } ![self] = \text{“Done”}] \\ & \wedge \text{ UNCHANGED } \langle FailNum,\ up\rangle \\ \wedge \text{ UNCHANGED } & \langle state,\ state1,\ wQ,\ db,\ cntr,\ hver,\ Q\rangle \end{array}$$

$$n(self) \triangleq NODE(self)$$

$$\begin{array}{rl} Next \triangleq & (\exists\, self \in Clients : c(self)) \\ & \vee\ (\exists\, self \in Nodes : n(self)) \\ & \vee\ \text{Disjunct to prevent deadlock on termination} \\ & \quad ((\forall\, self \in ProcSet : pc[self] = \text{“Done”}) \wedge \text{UNCHANGED } vars) \end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{rl} Spec \triangleq & \wedge\ Init \wedge \Box[Next]_{vars} \\ & \wedge\ \forall\, self \in Clients : \mathrm{WF}_{vars}(c(self)) \\ & \wedge\ \forall\, self \in Nodes : \mathrm{WF}_{vars}(n(self)) \end{array}$$

$$Termination \triangleq \Diamond(\forall\, self \in ProcSet : pc[self] = \text{“Done”})$$

END TRANSLATION

InvP is the Invariant function which checks *db* consistency after every atomic Client WRITE ends.

$$\begin{array}{rl} InvP \triangleq & \forall\, p \in Clients : (ClientAtomicWriteDone = \text{TRUE} \Rightarrow \\ & \qquad (db[NodeR].ver \quad = hver[p] \wedge db[NodeR].val = cntr[p])) \end{array}$$

* Observation: Model checking the system with $FAILNUM = ReadQ$ and $ReadQ = WriteQ$
* causes it to violate the Invariant. This is evident, as, the size
* of $WriteQ/ReadQ$ is then not enough to overcome the node failure
* count in case $FAILNUM$ number of nodes fail. So say $ReadQ/WriteQ = 2$
* and $FAILNUM = 2$. In this case the Client process atomically Reads
* the highest version from 2 $ReadQ$ nodes, and fetches the $WriteQ$ to
* write the latest entries into. But if now the system decides to
* fail the two nodes which were selected as the $WriteQ$, the next
* invocation of the Client process will write data to FAILED nodes.
* - This is where the Invariant will fail because it will try to get
* the values from a $ReadQ$ which is not consistent with nodes to
* which the Client process is writing the latest updates to.
*
* - The Invariant is also violated if $ReadQ <= FAILNUM$ and
* $WriteQ > FAILNUM$. This is because even though $WriteQ$ selects safe
* number of up-nodes to perform the writes, the $ReadQ$ is only
* returning the highest version from a subset of nodes in $WriteQ$.
* Thereby failing to return the true highest version that exists in
* the up-nodes.
*
* - So, Invariant will only be satisfied if $FAILNUM < ReadQ$ and
* $FAILNUM < WriteQ$. This is the pre-requisite that guarantees single
* -copy consistency in the system.
*
* *teamMember*: Debaditya *Basak*, 50206177