



Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location:	Red Lake, Minnesota	Accident Number:	CEN24LA072
Date & Time:	December 19, 2023, 09:05 Local	Registration:	N46056
Aircraft:	Cessna 172M	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:	Landing area overshoot	Injuries:	2 None
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General aviation - Personal		

Analysis

The pilot reported that they overflew the frozen lake and passed on the original landing area due to ice cracks and heaves. He flew to another area of the lake and located a suitable landing spot. He completed a low pass to survey the landing area and confirm its suitability. During the landing roll, he was unable to stop the airplane in the surveyed area; the airplane continued into a crack in the ice and became partially submerged. The airplane sustained substantial damage to the firewall and lower fuselage. The pilot reported that there were no preimpact mechanical malfunctions or failures that would have precluded normal operation.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be:

The pilot's inadequate landing surface evaluation and failure to stop the airplane on the frozen lake, which resulted the airplane continuing into a crack in the ice.

Findings

Environmental issues	Snow/slush/ice covered surface - Contributed to outcome
Personnel issues	Identification/recognition - Pilot

Factual Information

History of Flight

Landing-landing roll	Landing area overshoot (Defining event)
----------------------	---

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Private	Age:	72, Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	3-point
Instrument Rating(s):	None	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	
Medical Certification:	BasicMed With waivers/limitations	Last FAA Medical Exam:	January 25, 2023
Occupational Pilot:	No	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	March 28, 2022
Flight Time:	853.7 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 17.8 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 8.6 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 0 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Cessna	Registration:	N46056
Model/Series:	172M	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:	1974	Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	17264174
Landing Gear Type:	Tricycle	Seats:	4
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	July 21, 2023 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	2550 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:		Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	5506 Hrs as of last inspection	Engine Manufacturer:	Lycoming
ELT:	C126 installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	O-360-A4M
Registered Owner:	DAIGLE LAWRENCE J	Rated Power:	180 Horsepower
Operator:	On file	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	KVWU, 1181 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	25 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	09:15 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	57°
Lowest Cloud Condition:		Visibility	10 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	Overcast / 10000 ft AGL	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	4 knots /	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	210°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	29.81 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	-2°C / -8°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
Departure Point:	Grand Rapids, MN (GPZ)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	Red Lake, MN	Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	08:25 Local	Type of Airspace:	Class G

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	2 None	Latitude, Longitude:	47.929656,-95.032922(est)

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Lindberg, Joshua
Additional Participating Persons:	Gregory Thurston; Federal Aviation Administration; Minneapolis, MN
Original Publish Date:	February 20, 2024
Last Revision Date:	February 22, 2024
Investigation Class:	Class 4
Note:	The NTSB did not travel to the scene of this accident.
Investigation Docket:	https://data.nts.gov/Docket?ProjectID=193566

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, “accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person” (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB’s statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available [here](#).