Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location:	Newdale, Idaho	**Accident Number:**	WPR23LA242
Date & Time:	June 26, 2023, 18:45 Local	**Registration:**	N730SC
Aircraft:	Piper PA-28-140	**Aircraft Damage:**	Substantial
Defining Event:	Aerodynamic stall/spin	**Injuries:**	2 None
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General aviation - Instructional		

Analysis

The flight instructor reported that while his student was at the controls, he initiated a simulated engine failure, and the student executed the emergency procedures for a forced landing. The student chose a place to land and configured the airplane for landing, including full flaps. The instructor noticed that the airplane's airspeed was "a little slow", and he instructed the student to check the airspeed, then recover from the simulation. The student retracted the flaps instead of adding engine power, and the airplane stalled and sank. The instructor immediately attempted to take over the airplane's controls from the student and verbally commanded "my controls", but the student was "stuck on the controls and locked up." The airplane continued to descend and touched down in a field and nosed over. Both wings, the fuselage, the vertical stabilizer, and the rudder sustained substantial damage. The instructor reported that there were no preaccident mechanical malfunctions or failures that would have precluded normal operation.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be:

The premature retraction of the flaps by the student pilot, while just above the airplane's stall speed. Contributing to the accident was the flight instructor's inadequate supervision and failure to regain aircraft control from the student pilot.

Findings

Personnel issues	Use of equip/system - Student/instructed pilot
Personnel issues	Incorrect action sequence - Student/instructed pilot
Aircraft	Airspeed - Not attained/maintained
Personnel issues	Delayed action - Instructor/check pilot
Personnel issues	Monitoring other person - Instructor/check pilot

Factual Information

History of Flight

Emergency descent	Simulated/training event
Maneuvering-low-alt flying	Aerodynamic stall/spin (Defining event)

Flight instructor Information

Certificate:	Commercial; Flight instructor	**Age:**	29,Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land	**Seat Occupied:**	Right
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	**Restraint Used:**	Lap only
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	**Second Pilot Present:**	Yes
Instructor Rating(s):	Airplane single-engine	**Toxicology Performed:**	
Medical Certification:	Class 1 Without waivers/limitations	**Last FAA Medical Exam:**	February 1, 2022
Occupational Pilot:	Yes	**Last Flight Review or Equivalent:**	October 29, 2021
Flight Time:	602 hours (Total, all aircraft), 318 hours (Total, this make and model), 544 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 119 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 50 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 4 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Student pilot Information

Certificate:	Student	**Age:**	24,Male
Airplane Rating(s):	None	**Seat Occupied:**	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	**Restraint Used:**	Lap only
Instrument Rating(s):	None	**Second Pilot Present:**	Yes
Instructor Rating(s):	None	**Toxicology Performed:**	
Medical Certification:	Class 1 Without waivers/limitations	**Last FAA Medical Exam:**	October 26, 2022
Occupational Pilot:	No	**Last Flight Review or Equivalent:**	
Flight Time:	33 hours (Total, all aircraft), 33 hours (Total, this make and model), 13 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 5 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 1 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Piper	**Registration:**	N730SC
Model/Series:	PA-28-140	**Aircraft Category:**	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:	1972	**Amateur Built:**	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	**Serial Number:**	28-7225546
Landing Gear Type:	Tricycle	**Seats:**	4
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	March 8, 2023 100 hour	**Certified Max Gross Wt.:**	2150 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:		**Engines:**	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	4281.13 Hrs at time of accident	**Engine Manufacturer:**	Lycoming
ELT:	Installed, not activated	**Engine Model/Series:**	O-320-E3D
Registered Owner:	On file	**Rated Power:**	160 Horsepower
Operator:	On file	**Operating Certificate(s) Held:**	None

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	**Condition of Light:**	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	KRXE,4858 ft msl	**Distance from Accident Site:**	10 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	17:53 Local	**Direction from Accident Site:**	255°
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Clear	**Visibility**	10 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	None	**Visibility (RVR):**	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	10 knots /	**Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:**	/ None
Wind Direction:	240°	**Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:**	/ Light
Altimeter Setting:	29.9 inches Hg	**Temperature/Dew Point:**	26°C / 4°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
Departure Point:	Rexburg, ID (KRXE)	**Type of Flight Plan Filed:**	None
Destination:	Rexburg, ID (KRXE)	**Type of Clearance:**	None
Departure Time:	17:30 Local	**Type of Airspace:**	Class G

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	2 None	**Aircraft Damage:**	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:		**Aircraft Fire:**	None
Ground Injuries:		**Aircraft Explosion:**	None
Total Injuries:	2 None	**Latitude, Longitude:**	43.876,-111.579

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Blocher, Kristyn
Additional Participating Persons:	Andy Grover; Federal Aviation Administraton; Salt Lake City, UT
Original Publish Date:	November 2, 2023
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	Class 4
Note:	The NTSB did not travel to the scene of this accident.
Investigation Docket:	https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=192463