

ED/PEQ/PHR/2006/FRP/H/1

Studies on the Palestinian Curriculum and Textbooks

Consolidated Report



United Nations
Educational, Scientific and
Cultural Organization

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The project coordination team wishes to thank Mr. David Webb, Dr. Maher Hashweh, Dr. Roger Avenstrup and the staff of the Palestinian Ministry of Education and Higher Education, in particular the Palestinian Curriculum Development Center (PCDC) staff for making this report possible.

Headquarters coordination and editing: Jean Bernard and Jade Maître

The designations employed and the presentation of material throughout this publication do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of UNESCO concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries.

The authors are responsible for the choice and the presentation of the facts contained in this report and for the opinions which are expressed therein, which are not necessarily those of UNESCO.

Project Coordination:

UNESCO Ramallah Office
UNESCO Headquarters Paris – Division of Quality Education

ED/PEQ/PHR2006/FRP/H/1

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABBREVIATIONS.....	ii
INTRODUCTION.....	1
1. THE CURRICULUM IN PALESTINIAN SCHOOLS.....	2
2. ISSUES SURROUNDING THE NEW CURRICULUM.....	6
3. THE CONSOLIDATED STUDY.....	7
4. ANALYSIS OF THE STUDIES.....	10
5. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....	14

ANNEXES

- A. Study Description Sheet (Paper 1): *Peace is our Dream* (An Impact Study of the Palestinian Curriculum)
- B. Study Description Sheet (Paper 2): *The New Palestinian History Textbooks for Grades 6-8*
- C. Study Description Sheet (Paper 3): *Civic Education in the Palestinian Curriculum: A Review of the New Textbooks*
- D. Study Description Sheet (Paper 4): *Palestinian Textbooks for Civic Education (Grades 1-3)*
- E. Study Description Sheet (Paper 5): *Palestinian Geography Textbooks*
- F. Study Description Sheet (Paper 6): *Palestinian Society-Population Education*
- G. Study Description Sheet (Paper 7): *The New Palestinian Textbooks for National Education – A Review*
- H. Study Description Sheet (Paper 8): *Democracy, History and the Contest over the Palestinian Curriculum*
- I. Study Description Sheet (Paper 9): *Palestinian Textbooks on the Subject of Islamic Religion*
- J. Study Description Sheet (Paper 10): *How Ethnic, Religious and Gender-Specific Issues are Presented in Palestinian School Textbooks: An Analysis of Selected Natural Science and Mathematics Textbooks*

ABBREVIATIONS

AEC	Assessment and Evaluation Centre
EU	European Union
MOE	Ministry of Education
MOEHE	Ministry of Education and Higher Education
PA	Palestinian Authority
OPT	Occupied Palestinian Territory
PCDC	Palestinian Curriculum Development Centre
SDS	Study Description Sheet
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation

INTRODUCTION

The curriculum delivered in Palestinian schools has been the subject of extensive study for more than a decade. Much of the interest, but by no means all, has focused on the new Palestinian curriculum and its associated textbooks which have been progressively introduced from 2000¹. Studies of different aspects of the new curriculum have been undertaken, some of which focus on possible prejudice in the materials, in particular the potential of the curriculum to promote *incitement to hatred* against Jews, Judaism and Israel. The studies vary significantly in terms of their authorship, scope and focus. The curriculum has attracted comment not only from recognised academic institutes around the world, but also from groups and individuals representing a wide range of political beliefs. Some of the studies discuss the impact of the curriculum on major concepts such as *democracy* and *national identity*, while in others the focus is narrower, perhaps on the teaching of a particular subject at a specific phase in the education system. The form of the publications varies from the single-sheet, press release type of document to the substantial research study paper.

The need to consolidate the findings of the various studies into a single report through a detailed examination of a representative sample has been widely recognized within the international textbook research community. In response to this need, and following agreement with the key curriculum stakeholders in the Occupied Palestinian Territory (OPT), this consolidated report has been prepared by a team of two international and one Palestinian consultants with the support of UNESCO.

It was anticipated that an extrapolation of the major findings would identify strengths and weakness in contemporary curriculum delivery, demonstrate the need for further studies, and provide general indicators to the future development of the Palestinian curriculum.

In undertaking this consolidated desk study of ten selected papers, the team has sought to maintain an unbiased stance on the contents of the studies examined. In presenting its findings, the team wishes to focus on the lessons to be learned for future curriculum development, rather than on the legitimacy of the arguments presented for and against the incitement charge in the studies under consideration.

¹ Prior to the introduction of the new curriculum, the Jordanian and Egyptian curricula were delivered in the West Bank and Gaza respectively.

1. THE CURRICULUM IN PALESTINIAN SCHOOLS

1.1 History

Prior to finalisation of the Oslo Accords in 1994, the Israeli Civil Administration managed the education system in the Palestinian territories. The Civil Administration assigned Jordanian books to schools in the West Bank and Egyptian books to schools in Gaza, and content of which the Administration disapproved was censored. There were, in effect, two different curricula in operation in Palestinian schools, neither of which was Palestinian, until the introduction of the so-called 'new', but, in effect, 'first' Palestinian curriculum, which began in 1998.

The Oslo Accords granted Palestinians control over their own civil affairs, allowing them for the first time to control education in the West Bank and Gaza. The potential role of the school curriculum in the creation of a national identity and national unity was recognised from the start. The newly-created Palestinian Authority (PA), therefore, took upon itself the task of creating an independent Palestinian curriculum, immediately establishing the Curriculum Development Centre, the precursor of the similarly named body which currently leads curriculum development nationally in Palestine (see below), and charging it with the development of the principles on which the new curriculum was to be designed. In the meantime, schools continued to use the Jordanian and Egyptian books, but these were supplemented by a new series of books on *National Education* for Grades 1-9.

The Curriculum Development Centre published its report on national curriculum development in 1996. The report was harshly critical of almost every aspect of the educational system. Changes in the methodology adopted in schools were proposed, encouraging the promotion of critical thinking skills at the expense of the traditional rote learning, and an holistic approach to curriculum development was recommended in order to exploit fully the links between subjects through an integrated approach to teaching and learning. In considering the radical nature of these initial proposals, it is perhaps significant that the Curriculum Development Centre was at that time an autonomous body, independent of the PA and its Ministry of Education (MOE). Its curriculum development team consisted of Palestinian academics, education specialists and teachers, rather than ministry officers. The team was empowered to interview teachers and students directly without having to pass through MOE. The outcome of the work of the team resulted not only in far-reaching criticisms of the system, but also in significant and detailed proposals for improvement.

The report became the basis in 1997 for MOE's formal proposal for the development of a Palestinian curriculum, later approved by the Legislative Council. It is perhaps not surprising, however, that a new body was created to continue the development of the curriculum – the Palestinian Curriculum Development Centre (PCDC) – this time under the direct authority of MOE.

1.2 The Curriculum Development Process

The process of curriculum development – the establishment of objectives, the identification of outcomes, agreement on the skills to be mastered and the

content to be learned etc. – and the design, preparation, publication and dissemination of the textbooks have all been the responsibility of PCDC.

Preparation of the curriculum has involved four consecutive stages:

- i. Formation of the national teams for each subject or subject area
- ii. Formation of teams of authors for specific textbooks
- iii. Linguistic and scientific editing, verification and revision
- iv. Piloting and evaluating the curriculum

The introduction of the curriculum has been phased and there have been only minor deviations from the original plan (see Diagram 1). The introduction will be completed in the academic year 2006-2007).

Diagram 1: Phased Introduction of the New Palestinian Curriculum

Phase	Target Grade	Planned introduction	Actual Introduction
Phase 1	Grade 1 and 6	2000	2000
Phase 2	Grade 2 and 7	2001	2001
Phase 3	Grade 3,8, and 10	2002	2002 Grades 3 and 8 2004 Grade 10
Phase 4	Grade 4,9, and 11	2003	2003 Grades 4 and 9 2005 Grade 11
Phase 5	Grade 5 and 12	2004	2004 Grades 5 and 10 2006 Grade 12

1.3 The New Curriculum

1.3.1 Guiding principles

The Palestinian curriculum demonstrates clearly the aspirations of Palestinians for the future and their understanding of the role that education plays in the development of society². It is based on the general educational philosophy of Palestinian-Arab society, the principles of which have been derived from its heritage, religion, and the Declaration of Independence³. These guiding principles, as described in the Curriculum Plan⁴, are as follows:

- Palestine is a democratic state, ruled by a democratic parliamentary system.
- Palestine is a peace-loving state, working towards international understanding and cooperation based on equality, liberty, dignity, peace and human rights.
- Palestinian national and cultural identity must be fostered and developed.
- The Palestinian people are an integral part of the Arab nation, working toward unity, liberty, development and prosperity of the nation.
- Social justice, equality and the provision of equal learning opportunities for all Palestinians, to the limits of their individual

² *First Palestinian Curriculum Plan*, Palestinian Curriculum Development Centre, MOE, 1998

³ The declaration of independence of the Palestinian people was made on 15 November 1988.

⁴ Chapter 1

capacity, must be ensured without discrimination on grounds of race, religion, colour, or sex.

- Opportunities must be provided to develop all Palestinians intellectually, socially, physically, spiritually and emotionally, to become responsible citizens, able to participate in solving the problems of their community, their country and the world.
- Education plays a vital role in social and economic development within the context of the Arab world in particular and the world in general.

1.3.2 Some salient features

The curriculum has been planned to take account of national, Arab, religious, and international dimensions. More specifically, the prominent features of the new curriculum, some of which are listed below, represent significant improvements on the previously employed Jordanian and Egyptian models.

i. Curriculum Provision in the Lower Basic Phase (*Preparatory Stage*) Grades 1-4:

The curriculum in this phase comprises religion, languages (Arabic and English), mathematics, general science, social sciences and national education, free activity, arts and crafts, civics and physical education⁵. In particular, the following should be noted:

- English is introduced for the first time
- Civics is a new subject aimed at preparing *a responsible citizen*
- A Free Activity session is introduced for the first time

ii. Higher Basic Phase (*Empowerment Stage*) Grades 5-10:

The curriculum in this phase includes all the subjects delivered in the lower basic phase and, in addition, the following: technology and applied sciences, and an elective subject⁶. The following major features of this phase should be noted:

- Increased specialisation
- An integrated social science programme (history, geography and national education)
- Elective subjects include home economics, a third language, and health and the environment
- Four technical subjects are introduced at Grade 10

ii. Secondary Phase (*Take Off Stage*) Grades 11-12:

Students are given the opportunity to develop their skills according to their desires and abilities. They can decide to pursue either an academic education leading to higher education or a vocational and technical education and training, either through formal technical education or through non-formal technical education, leading to participation in the labour market.

⁵ See First Palestinian Curriculum Plan (1998), Chapter 3, Section 3.1, p18

⁶ See First Palestinian Curriculum Plan (1998), Chapter 3, Section 3.1, p18

The curriculum comprises the following subjects at this stage: religion, languages, mathematics, technology and applied sciences, sciences (chemistry, biology, physics), literary subjects (social sciences, economics and management, history, geography), arts and crafts, and physical education.⁷

1.4 Evaluating the New Curriculum and its Associated Textbooks

Planning for the new curriculum began with the preparation of the *First Palestinian Curriculum Plan* completed in 1998. This laid down the general principles for curriculum development and identified a curriculum implementation mechanism. Syllabuses were then prepared for all grades (1-12) and in all subjects. These were evaluated both nationally and internationally. Textbook requirements for the delivery of the new curriculum and suitable authors were then identified and the first draft of the books produced.

The first draft of a textbook is presented to a teachers' workshop for evaluation in terms of its readability and its potential for use in the classroom. Comments are sent back to PCDC. PCDC also sends the draft to selected panels of academics for editing in terms of its content and pedagogy. The manuscript is also checked by editors for language. The writing team revises the draft on the basis of feedback and the final design is completed in consultation with the writing team.

Following the initial introduction of the textbooks into schools, they are submitted to for panels further evaluation and editing. The teacher's manuals and the questions, exercises and activities in the textbooks are intended to assist teachers to adopt the associated teaching methodology. Supervisors also support teachers in textbook utilisation and teaching approaches at school level. The evaluation conducted by the Assessment and Evaluation Centre (AEC) provides evaluation of the efficacy of the textbooks and the methodological effectiveness of the teacher.

Approximately 250 teachers, covering all subjects, use a pre-designed instrument to evaluate the first print run of the textbook, unit by unit, during the first year of implementation. AEC sends feedback to PCDC, where any necessary modifications ('enrichment') of the textbook are undertaken in preparation for the next print run.

AEC also organises a content analysis of the syllabus framework for each grade and the corresponding textbook and instructional materials after the second print run. Experts not involved in the curriculum or textbook development process are appointed and trained for the task, which is based on a checklist prepared by AEC. In addition, structured classroom observations are conducted to evaluate the operational curriculum, the actual content delivered and the methodology adopted in the classroom. A sample of schools is selected and visited.

It should be noted, however, that due to the circumstances of the occupation, it has not been possible to complete all these steps fully in all cases. AEC has used email, fax and telephones extensively to ensure that as much as possible has been completed.

⁷ See First Palestinian Curriculum Plan (1998), Chapter 3, Section 3.1, p18

2. ISSUES SURROUNDING THE NEW CURRICULUM

2.1 A Curriculum to Incite?

Successive Israeli governments and their supporters have attacked Palestinian school textbooks for allegedly inciting hatred of Israel and the Jews. Since the formation of the PA, Israel has repeatedly claimed that the textbooks preach anti-Semitism and marginalise Jewish history.

Most Palestinian officials and educationists dismiss the Israeli charges as being politically motivated, claiming that the current books only reflect the historical reality.

This is the issue, baldly stated, which accounts for most of the extensive body of literature on the Palestinian curriculum already accumulated and which is the focus of this report. Proponents of both sides of the argument can draw upon substantial evidence and influential support.

The starting point for the controversy was a report⁸ issued in 2001 by an American non-governmental organisation, the Center for Monitoring the Impact of Peace (CMIP). The study claimed that the textbooks did not teach peace and coexistence with Israel, but rather instilled a culture of hatred. The report has been the springboard for an effective advertising campaign which has drawn in support from other American groups and from some influential American politicians.

On the other hand, a research initiative involving institutional, academic, and independent researchers has resulted in a consensus which holds that the Palestinian curriculum is not anti-Semitic and does not incite violence. This view has not only the support of many eminent researchers and academics, but also that of the European Union (EU). The EU, through its missions on the ground, reviewed Palestinian textbooks in 2001. The findings of the review, presented in a statement⁹ the following year, indicated that the new textbooks, although suffering from some important weaknesses, do not incite, that they represent a significant improvement on the previous textbooks, and constitute a valuable contribution to the education of young Palestinians.

2.2 A Broader Debate

Consideration of the accusations of incitement in the Palestinian curriculum also features in this consolidated report. It is important to note, however, that the authors do not wish to focus on this issue to the exclusion of others, a characteristic of so many of the papers reviewed in this report.

Much of the body of literature which has arisen out of the preparation and introduction of the new curriculum focuses on the incitement debate to the neglect of other, more didactic features of curriculum evaluation. This study seeks to achieve an appropriate balance between a review of the 'incitement debate' in the selected sample of papers and the need to adopt a broader perspective which includes consideration of 'technical' criteria for curriculum development and evaluation such as breadth, balance, progression, relevance, integration, and differentiation.

⁸ A Survey of the Textbooks Published by the Palestinian National Authority in the Years 2000-2002, CMIP, New York: November 2001

⁹ *European Union Statement on Palestinian Schoolbooks*, General Secretariat of the European Union Press Office, Brussels: 15 May 2002

3. THE CONSOLIDATED STUDY

3.1 Rationale

The development and introduction of the new curriculum in Palestinian schools has generated much discussion and many published and unpublished papers¹⁰. The issue most frequently addressed by the papers, though by no means the only one, is the charge that the curriculum is anti-Semitic and that it incites hatred against Israel. The papers represent the views not only of academics and academic institutions with international research reputations, but also of individuals and pressure groups of many and various political persuasions. The focuses of the papers are equally varied. Some, for example, take a broad view such as the impact of the curriculum on the development of national identity, while others address specific curriculum concerns of teaching a specific subject to a specific age group. Presentational forms used range from short pamphlet-like statements to extensive research studies.

Given the seemingly *ad hoc* approach to evaluation of the curriculum and the avalanche of print and internet discussion which has been generated, it is appropriate and timely that a review of the studies has been undertaken in order to extrapolate key findings which might not only suggest further *planned* study of the new curriculum, but which might also inform the future development of the curriculum itself.

3.2 Methodology

The preparation of the study is a UNESCO initiative and the methodology adopted has been influenced significantly by parameters described in the terms of reference. The study was to be concise and it was to be a desk study undertaken by a team consisting of both international and national experts. It was clear, therefore, that it would be necessary to *select a sample* of papers for review and devise a *common format* for the review which could be used by team members in their different locations. It is important to note that only studies in English, and none in Arabic or Hebrew, were considered for review.

The selection of papers for review was undertaken in consultation with PCDC staff, with senior MOEHE officers, with other experts within the education sector, and with relevant representatives of the donor community. A list of ten papers was agreed upon, although minor changes were made at a late stage in order to provide a more representative, manageable and ultimately more productive sample. The details of the selected papers can be found in section 3.3.

A common format – Study Description Sheet (SDS) – for the presentation of the review of each paper was prepared and agreed to by the team. The areas of review covered in the SDS include:

- Statement of purpose/objectives
- Intended readership
- Study parameters and limitations
- Coverage
- Theoretical base
- Research questions
- Main findings
- Wider implications

¹⁰ It is difficult to find a term which can adequately describe the different kinds of paper which have been prepared. The terms '*paper*' and '*study*' are, therefore, used interchangeably to describe presentational forms which range from a single page press release to an extensive research study.

The completed SDS for each paper is annexed to this report. See Table 1 below.

3.3 The Studies

3.3.1 The sample

At a late stage in study planning, one¹¹ of the ten papers originally agreed upon for review was replaced with a substitute¹² which, it was felt, was more representative and which offered more useful insights and findings. A final amendment to the list was made by selecting one paper¹³ from the compendium of papers¹⁴ which was a single item on the original list. There was insufficient time to consider all of the 35+ articles in this publication, and few fulfilled the criteria described in the terms of reference.

Table 1 below lists the ten studies together with available details. Most are published as monographs. The SDS for each study is annexed to the report in the location shown in the Table.

Table 1: Details of the Papers Reviewed

Number	Title	Author	Date/Place	Location in Report
1	<i>Peace is our Dream</i> (An Impact Study of the Palestinian Curriculum)	Not stated (Consultant report)	2004 Undated No place noted ¹⁵	Annex A
2	<i>The New Palestinian History Textbooks for Grades 6-8</i>	Anabel Rett	2003 Cologne	Annex B
3	<i>Civic Education in the Palestinian Curriculum: A Review of the New Textbooks</i>	Götz Nordbruch	2003 Marseille	Annex C
4	<i>Palestinian Textbooks for Civic Education (Grades 1-3)</i>	Andrea Zempel	2003 Erlangen-Nuremberg	Annex D
5	<i>Palestinian Geography Textbooks</i>	Adel El Sayed	2003 Innsbruck	Annex E
6	<i>Palestinian Society-Population Education</i>	Götz Nordbruch	2003 Berlin	Annex F

¹¹ *European Union on Palestinian Schoolbooks*, Brussels: 15 May, 2002.

¹² *How Ethnic, Religious and Gender-Specific Issues are Presented in Palestinian School Textbooks. An Analysis of Selected Natural Science and Mathematics Textbooks.* W Reiss and N Ihtiyar, 2003.

¹³ *Democracy, History and the Contest over the Palestinian Curriculum.* Nathan Brown, 2001.

¹⁴ *Palestinian School Textbooks (Research Reports and Articles)*, Ministry of Education and Higher Education, January 2005

¹⁵ Based on field work carried out in 2004 in the West Bank and Gaza by the Belgian Technical Cooperation (BTC)

7	<i>The New Palestinian Textbooks for National Education – A Review</i>	Götz Nordbruch	2003 Berlin	Annex G
8	<i>Democracy, History and the Contest over the Palestinian Curriculum</i>	Nathan Brown	2001 ¹⁶	Annex H
9	<i>Palestinian Textbooks on the Subject of Islamic Religion</i>	W Reiss	2003 Langen	Annex I
10	<i>How Ethnic, Religious and Gender-Specific Issues are Presented in Palestinian School Textbooks. An Analysis of Selected Natural Science and Mathematics Textbook</i>	W Reiss and N Ihtiyar	2003 No place noted	Annex J

3.3.2 The nature of the selected studies

The nature of the sample is, like the whole written output generated by the new curriculum, varied. Few documents have the necessary rigour to be considered ‘research studies’ although papers 1, 8 and 10 fall into this category. The same papers also address the incitement charge in some detail. Most of the sample could be classified as textbook reviews using accepted curriculum evaluation criteria (Papers 3, 4, 6, 7, 9), although many of these are excessively descriptive and insufficiently analytical. Other studies, however, although still classified as textbook reviews, adopt international understanding, cooperation, peace and human rights as key evaluation criteria (Papers 2, 4, and 5) and tend to be more analytical in their approach. (For a more detailed discussion on the nature of the studies under review, especially their methodological strengths and weaknesses, see section 4.2 in the next chapter.)

¹⁶ Paper presented at the Adam Institute Conference on “Attitudes Toward the Past in Conflict Resolution,” Jerusalem: 2001.

4. ANALYSIS OF THE STUDIES

4.1 Introduction

This section of the report seeks to indicate the major findings in the sample of papers selected for review. The findings are drawn from the descriptions of the studies presented on the SDS in the annexes. The convention adopted for reference to individual studies is by the number allocated to the study in Table 1 in the previous chapter.

It should be noted, however, that it has not been possible to reflect the complexity of the ten papers in this section. In order to gain a deeper understanding of the issues raised, it is essential that the reader consult the full review of the studies in the SDS located in the annexes.

The incitement debate is a major feature in all of these studies. In presenting this synthesis of the major findings, however, the authors have felt it important to give due consideration to other issues relating to the curriculum which might inform its future development.

4.2 Research Methodology

4.2.1 Meeting research criteria

Few of the studies under consideration meet the accepted criteria for being defined as *research*. Papers 1, 8 and 10 come closest to meeting these criteria, but even here there is an absence of an explicit theoretical base and a lack of reference to key curriculum documents (Papers 8 and 10).

In most of the other papers, there is an almost total absence of a statement of purpose and of a description of specific objectives. The lack of a statement of purpose in those studies undertaken on behalf of the Georg Eckert Institute for International Textbook Research could be explained by the following statement in the introduction to these studies:

*'A team of academics and teachers reviewed the books using a common set of criteria prescribed for all of them by the Institute that complies with UNESCO's standards for textbook analyses. It comprises questions on self-image and the image of the other; the status and value of war and peace; the language; the didactic conception; the status of visual material etc. As for the factual background, against which historical descriptions, for instance, were assessed, every reviewer had to rely on the literature familiar to her/him and give the respective references. Although we tried to describe the texts accurately, our assessments of their contents are of course influenced by our different opinions on the Arab-Israeli conflict.'*¹⁷

The statement might also account for the failure of individual authors to specify the study's parameters or limitations, its theoretical bases, and the main research questions. It remains a concern, however, that few of the studies under consideration display sufficient methodological rigour to be considered 'research'.

¹⁷Jonathan Kriener, Introduction to the Report of the Project *Textbook Project with Israel and Palestine*, can be found at <http://www.gei.de/english/projekte/israel.shtml>

4.2.2 Scope of the studies

There is, in most of the studies, a lack of reference to areas of the curriculum other than that under consideration in the study. The focus of many of the studies is narrow – *self-image and the image of the other; the status and value of war and peace* etc. – determined largely by the desire to contribute in some way to the ‘incitement debate’. An exception is Paper 1, which was based on the Palestinian curriculum development plan and which adopted a whole curriculum approach. In other words, many of the studies reinforce the view of a *segregated* curriculum, rather than the *integrated* view, which is a longer-term aim in Palestinian curriculum development. Indeed, the treatment of didactic considerations generally tends to be neglected in most of the samples reviewed, an issue discussed later in this report.

4.2.3 Levels of analysis

The level of analysis displayed in the studies, especially in the textbook reviews, is often low, with an emphasis on the descriptive. Paper 6 is described in the SDS as:

‘largely a description of the content of the textbook, with comments by the author...’

while in Paper 5:

‘the author gives descriptive data, some of it quantitative, about the number of pages of the textbook, the number of maps, pictures etc. but there is no real didactic analysis.’

4.3 The Incitement Debate

There is extensive reference to the ‘incitement debate’ in all of the selected studies. There is no support in any of the studies for the view that the Palestinian curriculum can be accused of incitement to hatred of Israel or to anti-Semitism.

Paper 1 views the curriculum intention as seeking to contribute to cooperation, peace and reconciliation; our review of Paper 3 notes clear emphases on a respect for cultural and linguistic differences and on plurality. The same study demonstrates a genuine interest in educating for democracy, secularism and human rights; in Paper 4 peaceful, cooperative approaches to conflict resolution are promoted; the author of Paper 5 finds that the geography textbooks contain no material which incites against Israel; a promotion of peace can be found in Paper 9, while the relevance of tolerance in contemporary Palestinian society is explored in Paper 7.

Perhaps the most balanced view of the ‘incitement debate’ can be found in Paper 8. The author finds that, although the curriculum should be defined as nationalistic, it does not incite hatred, violence, nor anti-Semitism. His analysis of the incitement charges suggests that a similar exercise undertaken with Israeli textbooks or indeed the textbooks used in many other countries would reveal similar findings. In conclusion, the author acknowledges that the Palestinian curriculum does little to promote peace, but finds that the charges laid against it are wildly exaggerated and/or inaccurate.

As already indicated, the ‘incitement debate’ is the major feature of the sample of papers reviewed. There is some evidence that the preoccupation with this single issue is leading to ‘blinker’ or even unjustified comment by the authors. In Paper 5, for example, the author notes that in the textbooks examined, the fact that Israelis are referred to as Jews is in itself a clear indication, according to the author, that *‘the (textbook) authors wanted to avoid*

mentioning the antagonists by their nationality'. What he failed to realise, however, perhaps in his anxiety to contribute to the 'incitement debate', was that the textbook was referring to pre-1948 when there were only 'Jews' and not 'Israelis'.

4.4 Guilty by Omission?

Perhaps a much more realistic charge to level at the Palestinian curriculum, which probably arises from some of the underlying features of the 'incitement debate' and which has a much stronger didactic underpinning, is that the curriculum is 'guilty by omission' of, at best, maintaining ignorance of, and, at worst, promoting antagonisms towards Israel and its people.

There is considerably more evidence that sensitive issues are 'ducked' and omitted from the curriculum than there is evidence of incitement. Paper 3, for example, notes that the Civic Education curriculum discusses important challenges facing Palestinian society such as children's rights and domestic violence, but neglects to address human rights issues resulting from the occupation; in the geography textbooks (see Paper 5), Israel is not named nor shown on a map, while 'Palestine' is left ambiguous in terms of territory or demography. Paper 7 suggests that the National Education textbooks provide no information about Israel and fail to address the challenges of contemporary Palestinian society since there is a lack of information about the Israel-Palestinian conflict. Finally, in Paper 8 the author claims that in the history textbooks there is no evidence of hostility towards other versions of history; they are simply not mentioned.

Some of the studies speculate on the reasons for these omissions. In Paper 4, for example, the author argues that *'these omissions are, of course, no accidents, but clear political decisions of the PA and its ministry of education'*. An explicit decision may indeed have been taken at a high level of the Ministry to omit this kind of sensitive issue, but there is no evidence which suggests that this is anything other than speculation. Equally probable and plausible is the argument that the authors of the textbooks – teachers, lecturers, and other Palestinian educators from within and outside the OPT – decided that it was 'safer' to avoid controversial issues related to the Palestinian-Israeli conflict. It may even be that some of the omissions are simply a reflection of the *status quo* at the time of the preparation of the curriculum, since no agreement had been reached at that stage on the final borders of the future Palestinian state and many issues remained unresolved at the time of writing.

The evidence of the omission of sensitive issues from the curriculum has important implications, however, for the overall quality of the new Palestinian curriculum. It could and should be argued that an effective curriculum is one which does not fear to address sensitive issues in society. Some of those issues which curriculum developers have a responsibility to address are global in nature (environment, terrorism, poverty, etc.), while others have a stronger national aspect (occupation, political system, and in particular the treatment of historical events). Many would argue that it is only in addressing such issues that solutions will be found.

4.5 Other Curriculum Features

It has already been noted that the authors of most of the studies are preoccupied with the 'incitement debate' and with omissions from the curriculum to the exclusion of other didactic considerations which should be central to the process of curriculum evaluation. The authors of this report feel that didactic issues are underrepresented and probably undervalued by many of the authors of the papers reviewed and that a change of direction and emphasis in curriculum evaluation is overdue. There is, however, limited comment on some important didactic aspects of the curriculum to be found in the papers.

For example, the notion of an *integrated* curriculum, although formally espoused by the curriculum planners, is absent from the papers reviewed. Rather, the subject basis of all the textbook studies reinforces the *segregated* curriculum. There is little evidence in the papers of cross-referencing between subjects on the curriculum, although Papers 1, 8 and 10 adopt a cross-curricular perspective where it is appropriate in the individual study. Directly linked to the notion of *curriculum integration* is the need for *coherence* in the curriculum. Paper 9 identifies some inconsistencies in the way in which women are treated in the religious education textbooks and the way they are treated in the civic education textbooks. A similar inconsistency can be seen in the encouragement offered to the adoption of a *student-centred approach* to teaching and learning (Papers 3, and 4) and the '*authoritarian subject matter*' identified in Paper 8. It is not only a lack of an appropriate overall structure to the curriculum which is of concern, but also in some cases a lack of structure within the individual textbooks. (See Paper 4).

Critical to the delivery of the curriculum is its *scope, sequence and progression*. The problem of potential curriculum '*overload*' is raised in Papers 1 and 4, but there is no evidence of further consideration of the scope of the curriculum. Sequencing and progression are raised as issues by the authors of this report in SDS 7, where they note that the author of Paper 7 appears to misunderstand these key aspects of curriculum planning and delivery.

There is little coverage of the issue of *curriculum relevance* in the papers reviewed, but Paper 2 regrets the lack of content on the *history of Palestine* in Grades 6-8. Environmental issues are raised (Paper 6) and gender is an important focus in some of the papers (Papers 6 and 10).

5. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1 An Unplanned Approach

There is no evidence in the sample of papers selected for review nor in the titles which make up the body of literature generated in the wake of the new Palestinian curriculum that there has been a planned research programme of curriculum evaluation. Rather the contrary. There is considerable evidence to suggest that the approach to curriculum evaluation adopted has been arbitrary, *ad hoc*, and reactive, although it is recognised that the PCDC itself has sought to evaluate the curriculum as it has been introduced (see section 1.4). The PCDC has commissioned analyses of several subjects (Arabic and mathematics, for example) and has plans to commission studies across phases and across the curriculum.

5.2 A Narrow Definition

The overriding concern of most of the authors of the sample of papers selected for review, especially those specifically focusing on textbooks, is two-fold. Firstly, and most importantly, they have been anxious to assess the extent to which the curriculum and its textbooks promote incitement to hatred of Israel and Jews; secondly, they have identified omissions from the curriculum and speculated on the reasons for those omissions

In targeting these dimensions of the curriculum, they have neglected other, and many would argue, more central features of curriculum planning and delivery and have applied too narrow a definition of curriculum evaluation.

There is, therefore, too little evidence to offer a comprehensive evaluation of the new curriculum at this point in time. However, the existing anecdotal and circumstantial evidence suggests that some of the basic principles on which the curriculum was originally conceived have been breached. In particular, the potential to promote critical thinking among students has been questioned and some concern has been expressed about possible curriculum overload as the views of various groups on the inclusion of curriculum content have been accommodated.

5.3 A Comprehensive Curriculum Review

In light of the findings of this study, there is a need for a comprehensive evaluation of the new Palestinian curriculum to be undertaken as a matter of urgency. There are many criteria against which the curriculum should be evaluated, among which the following are important:

- Breadth
- Balance
- Progression
- Integration
- Differentiation

As in all curriculum evaluation, the curriculum should be analysed for possible bias of all kinds, but especially for bias against Israel and Jews. This focus, however, should not become the dominant feature as in many of the earlier studies and future evaluations should adopt a much more balanced approach.

Equally important, the new curriculum has associated with it teaching and learning methodologies, which promote a more participatory and student-centred approach. Given previous practice in Palestinian schools and the acknowledged difficulty in changing teachers'

practice, there is little evidence that the desired delivery mode for the new curriculum will be implemented without substantial capacity-building initiatives. Consideration should be given in this respect to establishing links between those responsible for curriculum development, especially PCDC, and those responsible for other relevant education initiatives, in particular the development of a national strategy for teacher education.

5.4 Recommendations

It is recommended that:

- i. A curriculum review body be (re-)established, based on the PCDC, but with membership drawn from both PCDC and other key stakeholder groups. The activities of the review body should be monitored by a group representing key international stakeholders.**
- ii. As a matter of urgency, the review body plan a comprehensive research-based evaluation of the curriculum, based on established educational criteria for curriculum evaluation.**
- iii. The review body design a long-term evaluation plan which ensures a process of regular curriculum review and development and views the curriculum as dynamic and ever-changing.**
- iv. There be a continuing review and revision of textbooks, based on the evaluation of the curriculum review body and on feedback from stakeholders including teachers, students, and community representatives.**

ANNEX A

Study Description Sheet

Paper 1

***Peace is our Dream* (An Impact Study of the Palestinian Curriculum)**

STUDY DESCRIPTION SHEET

Title of paper	<i>‘Peace is our dream’: An Impact Study of the Palestinian Curriculum (Belgian Technical Co-operation)</i>
-----------------------	--

Section 1: Objectives/Purposes

Overall objective/purpose	To determine the impact of the new Palestinian curriculum on grade 5 and grade 10 students
Specific objectives/purposes	<p>The study:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Indicates the ways in which the next generation is beginning to display the qualities of the kind of citizen Palestine needs ii. Identifies the factors which promote or constrain the impact of the Palestinian curriculum iii. Notes whether the intended consequences are starting to be evident iv. Notes any unintended consequences
Intended readership of paper	Unclear
Study parameters and limitations	<p>The authors are explicitly aware of the limitations of a case study approach and of a small non-representative sample which was not cross-sectional.</p> <p>The authors also acknowledged practical constraints preventing them from adhering strictly to their research design/methodology.</p>

Section 2: Coverage

Main subjects, topics, themes covered	An analysis of the Palestinian Curriculum Plan was conducted to identify its fundamental intentions in terms of learning and teaching. Three generic conceptual areas could be identified that included the different components of the system objectives and curriculum philosophy identified in the Plan. The three conceptual areas were identity, values, and thinking skills. These were taught in almost all subjects of the curriculum.
Main grades covered	Grades 1 to 10
Other subjects etc. referred to	None
Other grades referred to	None

Section 3: Theoretical Base

Theoretical base of the study	The base of the study is clearly and explicitly explained. There is a clear definition of what impact means, as positive or negative long-term and sustainable changes introduced by a given intervention. It is qualitative of research – the “fourth generation evaluation” approach proposed by Guber and Lincoln – which is a thorough and participatory approach using grounded theory.
The researcher’s position within the theoretical base	The researchers clearly subscribe to the theoretical approach described above.

Section 4: Analysis

Main research questions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. In what ways is the next generation beginning to become the kind of citizen Palestine requires? ii. What factors promote or constrain the impact of the Palestinian curriculum? iii. Are the intended consequences beginning to be evident? In particular, how does the curriculum impact on students' values, identity, and thinking skills? iv. Are there any unintended consequences?
Strategies employed for keeping questions in focus	The researchers studied the curriculum plan and extracted three important objectives of the curriculum: to develop students' identity, values, and thinking skills. The researchers observed lessons and conducted focus group interviews with students, teachers, and parents. They also used questionnaires that were answered by teachers and administrators. The researchers analysed and presented the responses of each group separately and then searched for converging evidence for the development of the three foci (selected areas). The results are synthesised in a final section of the report.
Examples used from textbooks	None (The research methodology did not include an analysis of the textbooks.)
References made to Palestinian curriculum development plans	This formed the basis of the analysis and the whole study, a major difference when this study is compared to the others.
Examples from other curricula/ systems used for comparison	None.
Main findings	<p>The Palestinian curriculum is having its intended impact on students in the three selected areas (values, identity, and critical skills):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Students have a strong sense of identity anchored in being a member of a Palestinian family and are beginning to have a sense of their own culture, history and geography. • Integrated in their identity are strong values based on Islamic beliefs and these include tolerance, reconciliation, faith in God, and acceptable behaviour. The way they express their values is distinctly <i>other-related</i> rather than ego-centred or individualistic. • The students showed a high level of competence in communication and social skills, the ability to deal with complex issues through analysis and synthesis, and to handle dilemmas. They also demonstrated mature emotional intelligence. <p>Many factors promoted this impact:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The students are enthusiastic to learn, active in answering questions in the classroom, and actively participated in focus group discussions. • The teachers exhibited commitment and a sense of ownership of the curriculum. • There is a high degree of shared understanding of the curriculum among teachers, parents, administrators and students, and a high degree of consensus around the central tenets of the curriculum plan. There is evidence of the effective communication of the curriculum plan to all.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Active support by the community as a whole for the national curriculum <p>Three areas of constraints on the impact of the curriculum were identified:</p> <p>Curriculum content:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There seems to be a curriculum content overload and the curriculum fails to make sufficient provisions for slower learners. The authors were not able to reach a conclusion about this and recommend further studies. • Controversial contemporary issues are avoided. • Parents want more about the geography and history of Palestine. <p>Teaching methodology:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Most teaching is good conventional teaching that is dominated by teacher talk and little student-initiated questions and student-to-student interaction. • There is heavy reliance on textbooks. • Usually there is one interpretation of phenomena, and tasks requiring low-level thinking skills. • The authors call for better teacher education programmes. <p>Peace and conflict resolution:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Students had a genuine desire for a peacefully negotiated resolution to the occupation and the Israel-Palestine conflict, even though they saw that dialogue has still not produced results. • All stakeholders emphasised that the greatest constraints on the curriculum succeeding in this area is the occupation and the violence perpetrated against the students. • In other words, the Palestinian curriculum intends to foster cooperation, peace and reconciliation and is achieving this to some extent, but its impact is being weakened by Israeli intervention.
Apparent inconsistencies/ Limitations	<p>The study investigated the impact of curriculum exposure on values, identity, and critical thinking. However, we are not sure that these changes are due to the curriculum and not to any other factors. It would have been better to compare this group that has been exposed to the curriculum for 4-5 years with another group that has not. Grade 6 and 11 students, for example, have not been exposed to the curriculum at all.</p> <p>It would have been interesting to observe not just any lesson, but the teaching of particular lessons that textbooks analysis shows are crucial for imparting values, or developing identity or critical thinking skills.</p>
Key points omitted	
Wider implications of the study	<p>This empirical study is in stark contrast to the limited textbook analysis studies which have been undertaken. Many of these studies make generalisations about the Palestinian curriculum after examining a few textbooks. They fail also to examine the</p>

	<p>Palestinian curriculum plan, which is the basis of textbook development, and the ways in which the curriculum is introduced in schools. This study is much more comprehensive since it examines the plan and the enacted curriculum. Observations might have been made of the curriculum enacted in specific crucial lessons that deal with values, identity, peace, or critical thinking.</p> <p>The study is also strong in methodological terms. The theoretical background, the research methodology, and the research questions are all explicit, in contrast to the textbook analysis studies. One concern is the lack of a control group, the achievement of which could have been compared to that of the 'experimental' group exposed to the Palestinian curriculum.</p> <p>This study corroborates the finding in earlier textbook analysis studies that the curriculum shuns discussion of controversial issues. It also corroborates other studies that found the curriculum emphasises Islamic values and the Islamic religion. Some studies were more critical than the present study of the religious component of the curriculum.</p> <p>Finally, the study corroborates the findings of other studies that the curriculum transmits values related to peace, co-existence, tolerance, and pluralism.</p>
--	--

ANNEX B

Study Description Sheet

Paper 2

The New Palestinian History Textbooks for Grades 6-8

STUDY DESCRIPTION SHEET

Title of paper	<i>The New Palestinian History Textbooks for Grades 6 to 8 (Anabel Rett)</i>
-----------------------	--

Section 1: Objectives/Purposes

Overall objective/purpose	Not explicitly stated. Implicitly, the study seeks to examine textbooks to determine if they encourage education for international understanding, co-operation, peace and human rights (as in the <i>UNESCO Guidebook on Textbook Research and Textbook Revision</i> (Pingel, 1999) used by researchers associated with the Georg Eckert Institute).
Specific objectives/purposes	Implicitly, the study seeks to achieve two objectives: i. Examine textbooks for negative stereotypes and distorted views of "the other" ii. Examine textbooks for facilitating reconciliation on the basis of the 1993 Oslo Agreement
Intended readership of paper	Unclear
Study parameters and limitations	No limitations acknowledged.

Section 2: Coverage

Main subjects, topics, themes covered	History: Grade 6: from birth of Islam to the Abbasid period; Grade 7: the Middle Ages; and Grade 8: the history of the Islamic-Arab civilization
Main grades covered	6, 7, 8
Other subjects etc. referred to	None
Other grades referred to	None

Section 3: Theoretical Base

Theoretical base of the study	None explicitly described. Examination of the Georg Eckert Institute's website suggests that the authors of the different studies of the Palestinian curriculum conducted by the Institute used the <i>UNESCO Guidebook for Textbook Research and Textbook Revision</i> . The theoretical base is eclectic. The approach, as described by Pingel, is sometimes quantitative, using frequency and space measures, and sometimes qualitative using hermeneutic, linguistic, and discourse analyses. Other genres of analysis, such as critical analysis or question analysis, are not used by the approach.
The researcher's position within the theoretical base	Not made explicit, but see note below.

Section 4: Analysis

Main research questions	Not explicitly stated, but textbooks analysis is categorised under certain subheadings, indicating the questions were related to the contents, self-image, the image of the other, the status and value of war and peace or prominent values and terms, the language, the didactic conception, and the status of visual material.
--------------------------------	---

Strategies employed for keeping questions in focus	Each textbook is analysed utilizing the eight categories (corresponding to the questions above) in most cases. In the Grade 7 textbook, the visual materials section is missing, while in the Grade 9 textbook the didactic conception and the visual materials sections are missing.
Examples used from textbooks	Many.
References made to Palestinian curriculum development plans	None
Examples from other curricula/ systems used for comparison	None
Main findings	<p>The main findings are not summarized systematically in the conclusions or the summary of the study. The following have been identified in different locations in the text.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Contents: Two textbooks cover the history of Arabs and Islam from the birth of Islam to the Middle Ages, while the third focuses on the Arab-Islamic civilization. Consequently, there is little coverage in these grades of the history of Palestine. ii. Didactics: There is an emphasis on presenting facts to be learnt by the students. However, some exercises encourage self learning, relate the history to the surrounding reality, and require students to take different perspectives. The didactic analysis, however, is short and underdeveloped. iii. Maps and illustrations: There seems to be little use of these in the textbooks. iv. Self-image: The Arabs are largely defined by their religion and not by language or nationality. The textbooks portray a proud self-image. The campaigns to spread Islam are described as being fairly peaceful and justified. Islam respected religious minorities (Jews and Christians). v. Image of the other: This is usually the second largest section in each textbook review and received major attention by the author of the study. It also is discussed in the conclusion to the study. While the textbooks acknowledge important intellectual input from the ‘others’, the textbooks do not offer detailed descriptions of these others. The others are sometimes portrayed as aggressive and greedy intruders and occupiers, although sometimes they are portrayed as courageous. The author calls for teaching more about the ‘others’. vi. Prominent values and terms: This is the largest section in all three reviews. Religious devotion, education, progress, justice, unity, and leadership are important values, and, of course’ war. The author finds too much stress on religion and military matters. He fears that the emphasis on aggression being directed towards Palestine during the Middle ages and the need for war to defend oneself and country might have negative consequences on relationships with Israel. vii. Language: The language used in the textbooks is usually neutral. Only a positive perspective of Islam and the Arabs is shown. On rare occasions, negative attributes of others are used.
Apparent inconsistencies	When discussing the ‘image of the other’ developed in the Grade 6 textbook, the author describes how the textbook describes

	<p>other religious groups, mainly the Jews. While citing examples from the textbook she introduces information from another author in the same paragraph, giving the impression that this information is actually found in the textbook. The added information is printed in blue in the following quotation from the study (ibid refers to the Grade 6 textbook):</p> <p><i>‘The description of other religious groups is rather short. Jews, as one part of the original population of Medina, had economic influence in Medina (ibid 38). Jewish and Christian religion and property were respected as long as they kept to the treaty (ibid 38). Jews and Christians were furthermore welcome in the councils (ibid.: 134). In the course of the expansion of Islam Muhammad had the ambition also to convert Jews to Islam to turn them into allies (Haarmann: 42). Their refusal and participation with the Quraysh and other tribal Arab groups in a battle to conquer Medina (History of the Muslims and Arabs: 42), is still regarded by Muslims as one of the origins of the conflict between them and the Jews (Haarmann: 43). The ‘trench battle’ or siege of Medina (Ghazwat al-Khandaq) in which Muhammad defended Medina successfully against this attack (History of the Muslims and Arabs.: 42) is famous for the military strategy pursued.’</i></p> <p>Some conclusions are forced or imposed in a strange manner, in order to relate textbooks on old history to the current Israeli-Palestinian conflict. In her conclusion to the Grade 6 textbook review, the author states: “The relationship between Palestine and Israel and the features of both countries are not mentioned explicitly. But parallels to the current situation are quite obvious”. In fact, the relations are not even implied. Yet, she goes on to discuss these parallels. (In this case she compares the beneficial occupation of Palestine by the Moslems to the negative impact of the Israeli occupation on the inhabitants). In the final conclusion of the study, the author again draws parallels with the current situation, stating that comparisons with the current situation arise frequently. The possibility for comparison arises, but we do not know if the teachers or the students make these comparison. This discussion could be seen as forced and unfair; you cannot assess a textbook by the probable analogies that students might draw from it. And what are the implications of this discussion anyway? Should we not teach some important historical information because the students might then draw some analogies, whether favourable or not, with the current situation?</p> <p>The author in many places criticises the emphasis on religion, especially since Palestine aspires in its declaration of independence to become a democratic and secular state. While partly agreeing with the author on the importance of democracy and secularism, it could be argued that she underestimates the role Islam has played in defining Arab history since Mohammad. Most wars and internal strife had a major religious component and many of the leaders of the Arab countries, as well as their most important thinkers, were non-Arab Moslems. The history of Arabs and Moslems is very closely intertwined.</p>
Key points omitted	<p>The didactic and other educational analyses are short and underdeveloped, while the main emphasis is on self-mage, the image of the others, and the values stressed in the textbook. Of course, this reflects the author’s implicit agenda as indicated by the main aim of the study.</p> <p>There are limitations in the presentation used; there is no introduction, no definition of the problem nor research questions,</p>

	<p>and no discussion of the methodology used. Additionally, there are no indications that the study was peer reviewed.</p> <p>There is an analysis of the textbooks, but no examination of the Palestinian curriculum plan that forms the context for these textbooks, and no examination of the ways in which teachers and students use these textbooks.</p> <p>The conclusion of the review of two textbooks (there is no conclusion for one textbook) and the final conclusion of the study focus on some findings related to the main aim of the study, but neglect pedagogical and educational findings.</p> <p>There is no comparison with other Palestinian textbooks or with Israeli or other international textbooks.</p>
Wider implications of the study	The study lends to future inquiries about how to teach history for peaceful coexistence.

ANNEX C

Study Description Sheet

Paper 3

***Civic Education in the Palestinian Curriculum: A Review of
the New Textbooks***

STUDY DESCRIPTION SHEET

Title of paper	<i>Civic Education in the Palestinian Curriculum – A Review of the New Textbooks (Götz Nordbruch)</i>
-----------------------	---

Section 1: Objectives/Purposes

Overall objective/purpose	Unclear (It does not seem similar to other Georg Eckert Institute studies in its purpose)
Specific objectives/purposes	Not explicitly stated. (Implicitly, it seeks to identify themes (important ideas and values) that are emphasised in the textbooks).
Intended readership of paper	Unknown.
Study parameters and limitations	None acknowledged.

Section 2: Coverage

Main subjects, topics, themes covered	Civic Education
Main grades covered	Grades 1–9
Other subjects etc. referred to	None
Other grades referred to	None

Section 3: Theoretical Base

Theoretical base of the study	Unclear. The study does appear not seem to use the criteria suggested by the Institute and UNESCO, (<i>UNESCO Guidebook on Textbook Research and Textbook Revision</i>). The approach used here is to identify important ideas and values cutting across the textbooks for the nine grade levels. The author inductively identifies the themes and uses many examples to illustrate them. The study is largely descriptive. Only towards the end is there a critical evaluation of the approach adopted in the textbooks to show their limitations.
The researcher's position within the theoretical base	Unspecified.

Section 4: Analysis

Main research questions	Implicit: What themes are emphasised in the civic education textbooks for grades 1-9? (Implicit)
Strategies employed for keeping questions in focus	Each theme identified is explicated in a separate section of the study with sufficient examples to support it.
Examples used from textbooks	Many examples are used to illustrate each theme.
References made to Palestinian	None.

curriculum development plans	
Examples from other curricula/ systems used for comparison	None.
Main findings	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Textbooks teach universal civic education concepts within a Palestinian context. ii. Textbooks encourage a student-centred approach iii. The students' experience within the family is taken as an image of life in society itself. iv. Important values include: assistance and mutual support, obligations to society, democracy, cooperation, important roles of women, equality, and the balance between rights and duties. v. Textbooks have a clear emphasis on respect of differences and on plurality. vi. Textbooks, on many occasions, make the link between the fulfilment of duties and individual rights, although they sometimes focus on rights alone. They also emphasise the importance of work as a right and as a duty and on the rights of women. vii. The textbooks emphasise the importance of participation by the individual in the life of the society, the importance of civil society, and responsibility and obligations. viii. The textbooks discuss important challenges to Palestinian society, including children's rights and domestic violence. ix. There is neglect or avoidance in the textbooks of discussion of particular human rights problems resulting from the occupation. x. The author points out that the approach used in the textbooks of using family relations to understand social relations is appealing, but it has serious drawbacks due to the substantial differences between the structures of the family and of society. However, he admits that in higher grades a different approach is used that challenges the harmonious image of Palestinian society presented in earlier grades and that acknowledges conflict within society and presents strategies for dealing with them.
Apparent inconsistencies	None could be identified. This is a well-balanced study that samples all the textbooks (grades 1 to 9) in a comprehensive manner and without bias.
Key points omitted	The limitations of the study have been identified previously: a lack of objectives or research questions and no explicit methodology.
Wider implications of the study	<p>This study shows the existence of genuine interest in educating for democracy, secularism, and human rights in the Palestinian curriculum.</p> <p>As in other studies, it shows that Palestinian textbook authors decided to avoid discussing politically delicate issues that might cause heated discussions with the Israelis or the American/European countries involved in the peace process or in funding the Palestinian Authority and curriculum or textbook production. This leads sometimes to ignoring human-rights violations in the occupied territories in a civic education curriculum or failing to discuss the conflict with Israel in some of the history textbooks which promote such discussion.</p>

ANNEX D

Study Description Sheet

Paper 4

Palestinian Textbooks for Civic Education (Grades 1-3)

STUDY DESCRIPTION SHEET

Title of paper	<i>Palestinian textbooks for civic education (Grades 1-3) (Andrea Zempel)</i>
-----------------------	---

Section 1: Objectives/Purposes

Overall objective/purpose	Not explicitly stated. While the author seems to accept the Georg Eckert Institute's purpose of examining the textbooks to determine if they encourage international understanding, peace, and human rights, the author is also interested in an educational/didactic analysis of these textbooks.
Specific objectives/purposes	Using the main section in the study, the specific objectives which could be identified concern the recognition of the main contents and learning objectives, the didactic and teaching/learning methodological approach used, the presentation of non-Palestinians, the status and values of war and peace, and self-perception.
Intended readership of paper	Unclear
Study parameters and limitations	Not delineated

Section 2: Coverage

Main subjects, topics, themes covered	Civic Education
Main grades covered	Grade 1 and Part 1 of the textbooks for Grades 2 and 3. (In each Grades 2 and 3 the textbooks are divided into Part 1 and Part 2)
Other subjects etc. referred to	None
Other grades referred to	None

Section 3: Theoretical Base

Theoretical base of the study	The approach advocated in the <i>UNESCO Guidebook on Textbook Research and Textbook Revision</i> (described elsewhere) is implicit in this study.
The researcher's position within the theoretical base	Unknown

Section 4: Analysis

Main research questions	None is explicitly stated, but textbook analysis is categorised under certain subheadings, indicating the questions were related to the contents, self-image, the image of the other, the status and value of war and peace or prominent values and terms, and the didactic conception. The status of visual material and the language are not analysed although these are part of Pingel's (1999) criteria.
Strategies employed for keeping	Each 'question' is dealt with under a separate section of the study.

questions in focus	
Examples used from textbooks	There are sufficient examples to support findings or conclusions.
References made to Palestinian curriculum development plans	None
Examples from other curricula/ systems used for comparison	None
Main findings	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. The books focus on promoting certain civil and ethical values seen as important for the creation and preservation of a Palestinian civil society. The rights and duties of the individual are linked to the society and peaceful and cooperative methods for conflict resolution are encouraged. ii. There is some lack of structure in the textbooks and unwarranted redundancy in some topics. iii. Non-traditional student-centred teaching methods are encouraged. iv. Much content is provided, perhaps overburdening young learners. v. There is a good mix of texts, exercises and illustrations. There are many open questions posed in the exercises, but some of these convey certain subject matter or values in too simple or too direct a manner. vi. There are few references to non-Palestinians in the examined textbooks. “The few that exist give a positive picture of ‘the other. and how to deal with them.’” (p.8) vii. There is an omission in the textbooks of Israel and the Jewish religion. viii. “A clear reference to terms of war and peace or the Israeli–Palestinian conflict is not visible in any of these textbooks. Actually these words do not even occur. These omissions may be connected to the omission of Israel or may stem from the textbooks’ explicit focus on issues within Palestinian society.” (p.11) ix. The picture conveyed in the textbooks is of a Palestinian society that lives and works together on the basis of freedom, tolerance, respect for others and democratic decision-making without referring to nationalistic phrases and without anti-Israeli incitement. x. However, the picture neglects conflict within the Palestinian society and the issues of occupation. xi. The textbooks try to pursue two contradictory (in the author’s viewpoint) aims: maintaining a conservative and traditional society, while at the same time becoming a liberal and a modern one.
Apparent inconsistencies	<p>The author criticises the omission of Israel and the Jewish religion. “These omissions are of course no accidents but clear political decisions of the PA and its ministry of education” (p. 10). There is no evidence for this claim, given that the author has examined only the textbook for grade one and part of the textbooks for grades 2 and 3, and without any knowledge of the curriculum development process or of the curriculum plan. She does not give equal importance to the omission of discussing human rights issues under Israeli occupation.</p> <p>When authors are given certain categories to look for in their review of the textbooks, they usually discuss one or two examples that they were able to find in all the textbooks. The author in this case had to analyse books on civic education for</p>

	<p>issues of war and peace, issues that are not usually dealt with in civic education textbooks. In this study the author found two references: a reference to independence day and a peace dove graffiti in a background of a picture in the textbooks.</p> <p>The author reaches the conclusion that the textbooks present a harmonious Palestinian society. Had she reviewed other textbooks, as another study did, she would have discovered that conflict within the Palestinian society is discussed at higher grade levels. This shows the limitations of taking a few textbooks and examining them without reviewing other textbooks for other grade levels or without consulting the curriculum plan.</p> <p>The author's discussion of the books' contradictory aims of preserving a traditional society and creating a modern one risks being seen as superficial. One can point to examples that have achieved some marriage between traditions and modernity, Japanese society, for instance.</p>
Key points omitted	Omission of the rest of the civic education textbooks and the curriculum plan are serious omissions.
Wider implications of the study	Empirical research on the enacted curriculum is needed. Research on the same subject by different researchers is needed to corroborate the findings. The two studies of civic education corroborate many findings: the encouragement of student-centred approach, the emphasis on civic education values such as tolerance, respect of others, peaceful conflict-resolution, plurality. They also agree on the emphasis on connecting rights to duties - emphasising individual rights and duties to the community, and . on the omission of the discussion of the effects of occupation on human rights.

ANNEX E

Study Description Sheet

Paper 5

Palestinian Geography Textbooks

STUDY DESCRIPTION SHEET

Title of paper	<i>Palestinian Geography Textbooks (Adel El Sayed)</i>
Section 1: Objectives/Purposes	
Overall objective/purpose	Not explicitly stated. The implicit aim is to examine textbooks to determine if they encourage education for international understanding, co-operation, peace and human rights (as declared in Pingel's introduction to the <i>UNESCO Guidebook on Textbook Research and Textbook Revision</i> used by authors of the Georg Eckert Institute studies).
Specific objectives/purposes	The implicit specific objectives are to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Examine textbooks for negative stereotypes and distorted views of "the other" ii. Examine textbooks to determine whether they facilitate reconciliation of the basis of the 1993 Oslo Agreement
Intended readership of paper	Unclear
Study parameters and limitations	No limitations acknowledged
Section 2: Coverage	
Main subjects, topics, themes covered	Human geography, geography of pre-1948 Palestine, and environmental geography for grades 6, 7 and 8 respectively.
Main grades covered	Six, seven, and eight
Other subjects etc. referred to	None
Other grades referred to	None
Section 3: Theoretical Base	
Theoretical base of the study	The base is similar to the other Georg Eckert Institute studies that use the <i>UNESCO Guidebook</i> approach to textbook analysis. There are, however, some differences. The author gives descriptive data, some of it quantitative, about the number of pages of the textbook, number of maps, pictures, etc, but there is no real didactic analysis. This is followed by more descriptive data about the introduction to the textbook, its cover, and its structure. After these very short sections comes a long section for each of the three textbooks called "Contents". This is the descriptive and analytic main section for each book reviewed and it seems to focus on two issues: the Islamic religious messages explicitly or implicitly found in the textbooks, and the treatment, or rather the non-treatment (or omission), of the other, both of which he is strongly critical. The author fails to apply most of the other categories of analysis suggested by the UNESCO Guidebook.
The researcher's position within the theoretical base	Unclear
Section 4: Analysis	
Main research questions	None are explicitly asked. Implicitly, the study is asking: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. What implicit or explicit values are presented in the textbooks? ii. How do the books present the "other" and how do they deal with the Palestinian-Israeli conflict?
Strategies employed for keeping questions in focus	Unclear

Examples used from textbooks	Many examples are used to defend conclusions.
References made to Palestinian curriculum development plans	None.
Examples from other curricula/ systems used for comparison	None.
Main findings	<p>The books do not contain any material that incites against Israel, although the author does not explicitly mention this conclusion. Neither, however, does he refer to any negative findings. The 6th grade textbook imparts positive values such as promoting neighbourly relations with bordering states and explicit anti-racist values.</p> <p>Islamic religious values are imparted explicitly and implicitly in all textbooks, but least in the 8th grade textbook which, although defining and discussing an Islamic world climatic region, starts with a secular approach that discusses different schools of thought in environmental geography.</p> <p>There is avoidance in the three textbooks of mentioning or naming Israel or of showing it on the map. Palestine is left ambiguous in terms of territory or demography, or the term is used to refer to historical Palestine (under the British Mandate before 1948). Palestine is treated as belonging to Greater Syria.</p>
Apparent inconsistencies	<p>In this study, it could be argued that the author is reading too much into a single sentence and making unjustified conclusions. He cites the textbooks as explaining that migration was “the main reason for the increase of the number of Jews in Palestine” (p.3 of the 6th grade textbook). He mentions that the Israelis are referred to as “the Jews” “a clear indication that the authors wanted to avoid mentioning the antagonists by their nationality”. The textbook, however, was referring to pre-1948 when they were Jews and not Israelis and the textbook’s intention was to compare the Jewish to the Arab population.</p> <p>Islamic world climatic region or regions? The author objects to treating Palestine as part of greater Syria, but this is justified, geographically, since the mountain chains continue from Lebanon and Syria into Palestine without respecting the borders.</p>
Key points omitted	<p>It is a selective study of three textbooks undertaken without reference to the curriculum plan. It ignores the fact that Israel has not yet defined its borders yet with the West Bank.</p> <p>The study ends with a six-line conclusion that does not try to synthesise the findings across the textbooks, but concludes that it is difficult to give any advice on writing a geography textbook about a disputed homeland.</p>
Wider implications of the study	It shares with other studies the finding that the authors of the textbooks tried to stay away from taking a position on controversial issues with Israel and within their own society, failing to discuss the present reality in which the students live.

ANNEX F

Study Description Sheet

Paper 6

Palestinian Society-Population Education

STUDY DESCRIPTION SHEET

Title of paper	<i>Palestinian Society – Population Education (Götz Nordbruch).</i>
-----------------------	---

Section 1: Objectives/Purposes

Overall objective/purpose	No objective or purpose of the study is stated. The assumed objective is to provide a summary of content and methodology.
Specific objectives/purposes	Not stated
Intended readership of paper	Not stated. It could be assumed it is for a readership of persons interested in the Palestinian curriculum, but who cannot read Arabic. Donors?
Study parameters and limitations	Not stated

Section 2: Coverage

Main subjects, topics, themes covered	Population Education textbook from 2000
Main grades covered	Grade 11
Other subjects etc. referred to	None
Other grades referred to	None

Section 3: Theoretical Base

Theoretical base of the study	There is no explicit theoretical basis for the study. It can be deduced that the textbook is being examined in terms of scope and teaching methodology.
The researcher's position within the theoretical base	None stated

Section 4: Analysis

Main research questions	None stated
Strategies employed for keeping questions in focus	None noted
Examples used from textbooks	The article is largely a description of the content of the textbook, with comments by the author. The author closely follows each unit and provides occasional specific quotes and references.
References made to Palestinian curriculum development plans	Refers to MOEHE decision to replace previous materials on this theme.
Examples from other curricula/	None made

systems used for comparison	
Main findings	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. The controversial nature of concepts such as 'development' and 'value' are made visible. ii. There is a special focus on environmental questions iii. Equality of women is frequently mentioned as a central goal of Palestinian society iv. Israeli occupation is presented as an obstacle to social development v. Israeli politics, interests and history are neglected vi. Gives broad insight into factors of social development and change
Apparent inconsistencies	The author is consistent at what is only a low level of analysis. Since no objectives or theoretical framework are clear, it is not possible to say to what extent the author is consistent within a framework.
Key points omitted	None noted
Wider implications of the study	None drawn
Reviewer comments	The study shows that this textbook is up to date and presents a progressive view of social development (e.g. equality of women). This could be taken to indicate that a more thorough study should be undertaken throughout the curriculum.

ANNEX G

Study Description Sheet

Paper 7

The New Palestinian Textbooks for National Education – A Review

STUDY DESCRIPTION SHEET

Title of paper	<i>The New Palestinian Textbooks for National Education – A Review (Götz Nordbruch)</i>
-----------------------	---

Section 1: Objectives/Purposes

Overall objective/purpose	No objective stated. It can be assumed that the objective is to give a summary of content and methodology.
Specific objectives/purposes	Not stated
Intended readership of paper	Not stated. It could be assumed to be readers interested in the Palestinian curriculum who cannot read Arabic, donors etc.
Study parameters and limitations	Not stated

Section 2: Coverage

Main subjects, topics, themes covered	National Education
Main grades covered	Grades 1, 2 (vol 1), 6, 7 (Vol 2)
Other subjects etc. referred to	A brief reference to Civic Education
Other grades referred to	None

Section 3: Theoretical Base

Theoretical base of the study	Not stated. The study is largely a summary of content, with the author's comments.
The researcher's position within the theoretical base	None evident

Section 4: Analysis

Main research questions	No research questions set. The author states that the paper is a 'review'
Strategies employed for keeping questions in focus	None evident
Examples used from textbooks	The author makes extensive reference to the units in each book and includes occasional quotes
References made to Palestinian curriculum development plans	Brief reference to A Comprehensive Plan for the Development of the First Palestinian Curriculum for General Education (1997)
Examples from other curricula/ systems used for comparison	None
Main findings	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Grades 1 and 2 reflect different aspects of identity and desirable patterns of behaviour and values ii. Interesting focus on the relevance of tolerance in Palestinian society, but it is limited by functionality within the context of Palestinian society

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> iii. Concrete information about Israel is missing iv. Palestinian history is one of constant threats. Encouragement to discuss and adopt different patterns of resistance to occupation is implied. v. Focus on institutional framework of Palestinian society. vi. Implied self-perception as a homogenous society with rich historical background and long standing traditions. vii. Fails to address challenges of contemporary Palestinian society since there is a lack of relevant information about the Israel-Palestine conflict. viii. Calls for unity and the individual's function in society are at the forefront.
Apparent inconsistencies	<p>The author does not take sufficient account of the need for progression of content and presentation according to the developmental stage of the child (e.g. about Grade 1 and 2: "Corresponding with the average age of students... compared with Grade 6 "Contrary to the textbooks for grade one and two, the textbooks offer lengthy paragraphs and texts...". What textbooks for Grades 1 and 2 in any country would have lengthy texts??).</p> <p>The author states that the textbooks deny any legitimate rights to Jews living in the region by not including information on Palestine's connection to Judaism and by presenting a negative depiction of recent Jewish history. However, it is an interpretative jump to claim that there is active denial - there is no evidence in the textbooks for this – from the fact that the textbooks are silent on the issue.</p>
Key points omitted	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. The statements of what constitutes national identity in the Curriculum Plan are ignored as a framework for describing national education in the textbooks. ii. National Education in any country is precisely what it says. What one would expect from a subject called national education is not elaborated.
Wider implications of the study	None drawn
Reviewer comment	The study itself is not particularly significant. Like Nordbruch's paper, it is a resume with comments for those interested who cannot read Arabic and not a research paper. What is needed is a more complete coverage and analysis of National Education as a whole seen from an education perspective including appropriateness of scope and sequence.

ANNEX H

Study Description Sheet

Paper 8

Democracy, History and the Contest over the Palestinian Curriculum

STUDY DESCRIPTION SHEET

Title of paper	<i>Democracy, History and the Contest over the Palestinian Curriculum. (Nathan Brown)</i>
Section 1: Objectives/Purposes	
Overall objective/purpose	An examination of the Palestinian curriculum, especially approaches to issues of history and identity
Specific objectives/purposes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. To clarify misconceptions about the curriculum ii. To present patterns in treatment of history – what it covers and declines to cover iii. To examine goals motivating coverage of history iv. To examine alternative education vision among Palestinian educators
Intended readership of paper	Adam Institute and, presumably, others interested in the incitement debate
Study parameters and limitations	Not stated
Section 2: Coverage	
Main subjects, topics, themes covered	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Overview of the history of the Palestinian curriculum ii. The incitement charge iii. History in the Palestinian curriculum iv. Identity v. Authority vi. A democratic vision vii. A different image of democracy
Main grades covered	Grades 1,2,6,7
Other subjects etc. referred to	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Islamic education ii. Civics
Other grades referred to	None
Section 3: Theoretical Base	
Theoretical base of the study	None stated, but is a political science approach comparing discourse and positioning
The researcher's position within the theoretical base	Secular humanist
Section 4: Analysis	
Main research questions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Is the curriculum a war or a peace curriculum? ii. What does the curriculum cover and not cover in history? iii. What are the motivations behind the coverage/non-coverage? iv. What is the impact of an alternative education vision?
Strategies employed for keeping questions in focus	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Detailed reference to primary sources, interviews ii. Detailed reference to documents

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> iii. Detailed reference to textbooks iv. Reference to own experience v. Analyses the incitement charges and shows that a similar approach would easily find comparable material in Israel and other countries vi. Shows how the view of history in the textbooks is not hostile to other versions of history, it just ignores them vii. Shows how national and religious identity is merged. viii. Shows how alternative democratic groups influenced the curriculum development process to be participatory; pedagogy to be participatory; non-stereotypical gender roles presented in several subjects; critical thinking and constructivist approaches in e.g. science applied; but has not had much influence in history and Islamic religion subject areas. ix. Shows how a fully democratic modern approach is not possible throughout because of populist consensus on issues of authority and identity.
Examples used from textbooks	Many specific references.
References made to Palestinian curriculum development plans	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Summary given of the background of the development of the Palestinian curriculum ii. Refers at length to the original Lughod committee report.
Examples from other curricula/ systems used for comparison	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Brief reference to Israeli textbooks. ii. General comparisons with the former Egyptian and Jordanian textbooks
Main findings	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. The curriculum is nationalistic but does not incite hatred, violence and anti-Semitism. It does little to support peace but the charges against it are wildly exaggerated or inaccurate. ii. The curriculum is authoritarian in some respects, but it is simultaneously democratic to reflect the national consensus rather than an elitist approach iii. The alternative vision (development of active learners, critical thinkers and democratic citizens) has had some impact, but does not approach the issues of identity directly. iv. The educational system is designed to inculcate identity and legitimate authority, largely ignoring the sensitive issues connected with peace. v. Some of the fundamental charges of authoritarian subject matter and pedagogy from progressive educators have not been answered.
Apparent inconsistencies	The paper is well thought through and consistent.
Key points omitted	None
Wider implications of the study	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Can internal progressive critique begin to transform the Palestinian educational system? ii. Can students think critically about their past and present? iii. Specific issues of Israel, Jews and war probably matter far less than critics claim. iv. What matters is what skills are fostered and rewarded.

ANNEX I

Study Description Sheet

Paper 9

Palestinian Textbooks on the Subject of Islamic Religion

STUDY DESCRIPTION SHEET

Title of paper	<i>Palestinian Textbooks on the subject of Islamic Religion. (W Reiss)</i>
Section 1: Objectives/Purposes	
Overall objective/purpose	Not stated. It seems to be to summarise the content and methodology of the textbooks.
Specific objectives/purposes	Not stated, but the responsibility of donors for the content of the textbooks seems to be a key issue.
Intended readership of paper	Not stated, but the implied readership is those interested in the Palestinian curriculum, especially donor agencies.
Study parameters and limitations	Not stated.
Section 2: Coverage	
Main subjects, topics, themes covered	Islamic Education
Main grades covered	Grades 1,2,3 (vol. 1) and Grades 6,7,8 (vol.2)
Other subjects etc. referred to	Civic education
Other grades referred to	None
Section 3: Theoretical Base	
Theoretical base of the study	Not stated, but this study is very well grounded in thorough knowledge of Arabic history, culture and of Islam.
The researcher's position within the theoretical base	Not stated
Section 4: Analysis	
Main research questions	Not stated. It is not a research paper.
Strategies employed for keeping questions in focus	None evident
Examples used from textbooks	Frequent references to the contents
References made to Palestinian curriculum development plans	None
Examples from other curricula/ systems used for comparison	Egypt
Main findings	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Cultural concept - a conservative Islamic society. All females shown as covered, classes segregated, only male gender pronouns used. ii. Democracy and human rights not dealt with. iii. Diametrically opposite to the textbooks for Civic education. iv. Civic education ignores conservative Islam: Islamic education ignores less conservation and secular Moslems. v. Positive promotion of peace, but self-defence and removal of oppression in Grade 7 text is not treated as a problem. vi. List of wars in Ramadan inappropriate to show that Ramadan is not a period of inertia. Cultural, religious and social

	<p>achievements would have been more appropriate.</p> <p>vii. Concept of Fatherland not problematised and clarified. To defend the Fatherland ‘by all possible ways’ can be used to justify suicide attacks even though they are not explicitly mentioned.</p> <p>viii. Actual limitations on right to return to one’s exact house, village or city is not discussed.</p> <p>ix. Issue of Judaism and the people of Israel not discussed as an issue in its own right, nor is Christianity discussed.</p> <p>x. Factual errors in describing the books of Judaism and Christianity seen from Judaism and Christian point of view, although the Koranic view is stated. Should include both.</p> <p>xi. Considerable progress when the textbooks are compared to the Egyptian textbooks.</p> <p>xii. Grade 3 textbook does not endorse general freedom of faith or practical assistance as to how religious tolerance can be learned.</p> <p>xiii. Description of tolerance of adherents of other religions in Grade 8 textbook only partly correct. It does not mention the limitations set.</p> <p>xiv. The reference to making peace in Grade 8 textbook (quote from Sura 60, 8-9) could be interpreted as uncompromising towards Israel. If Israel showed signs of reconciliation, this Sura could have a positive character.</p>
Apparent inconsistencies	None
Key points omitted	None
Wider implications of the study	None given
Reviewer comment	Because of the knowledgeable background of the author, this study points the way to looking at the curriculum as a whole rather than subject by subject, and to looking at how variously texts can be interpreted depending on context.

ANNEX J

Study Description Sheet

Paper 10

***How Ethnic, Religious and Gender-Specific Issues are
Presented in Palestinian School Textbooks: An Analysis of
Selected Natural Science and Mathematics Textbooks***

STUDY DESCRIPTION SHEET

Title of paper	<i>How Ethnic, Religious and Gender-Specific Issues are Presented in Palestinian School Textbooks. An Analysis of Selected Natural Science and Mathematic Textbooks. (W Reiss and N Ihtiyar)</i>
-----------------------	---

Section 1: Objectives/Purposes

Overall objective/purpose	Analysis of ethnic, religious or gender-specific prejudices as well as pejorative statements, especially regarding Israel and the Jewish people.
Specific objectives/purposes	None stated
Intended readership of paper	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Georg Eckert Institute for International Textbook Research and UNESCO International Textbook Research Network ii. Others interested in the Palestinian curriculum and the debate about incitement to hatred of Jews, who cannot read Arabic.
Study parameters and limitations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. 115 textbooks analysed: 50 Jordanian and 35 Egyptian being phased out of the Palestinian system, and 30 new Palestinian textbooks ii. The study covers elementary and secondary levels. iii. Texts, maps, illustrations and photographic material analysed.

Section 2: Coverage

Main subjects, topics, themes covered	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Natural Science and Mathematics ii. Ethnic, religious or gender-specific prejudice or pejorative statements
Main grades covered	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Jordanian: Grades 1, 2,4,5,9,10, 11,12 ii. Egyptian: Grades 1,2,4,5,9,10 iii. Palestinian: Grades1,2,3,6,7,8,10
Other subjects etc. referred to	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Palestinian textbooks for Islamic education. (where strong gender stereotypes are shown) ii. Palestinian textbooks for Civic education (where gender equity is strongly marked, including in the home)
Other grades referred to	None

Section 3: Theoretical Base

Theoretical base of the study	The theoretical basis is not explicit. It is a comparative education approach based on a generally Western liberal-humanist stance of moderate, not radical, gender balance, and active tolerance.
The researcher's position within the theoretical base	Not clear

Section 4: Analysis

Main research questions	Is there any evidence of ethnic, gender or religious prejudice, especially to Israel and the Jews?
Strategies employed for keeping questions in focus	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Using the three themes systematically on each of the three groups of textbooks ii. Selecting any and all examples which provide evidence one way or the other iii. Showing how different interpretations can be used on the same material iv. Systematic tabulation of religious, ethnic and gender references textbook by textbook
Examples used from textbooks	A rich array of relevant references to the textbooks is made available. The study builds on a thorough analysis of text, illustrations, maps, pictures.
References made to Palestinian	None

curriculum development plans	
Examples from other curricula/ systems used for comparison	None
Main findings	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. There is no evidence of signs for an attack on Israel or promoting hatred. No animosity towards the West or other cultures. ii. Omission of references to Israel, especially maps and geographical data is ambiguous. Egyptian and Jordanian textbooks withhold information about Israel and about Palestine and Palestinians. iii. No evidence of anti-Semitism or anti-Jewish sentiment. No attacks on other religions. iv. Gender specific roles not established, but nor are there especially affirmative adult female role models or male/female work sharing in the home. v. The Palestinian textbooks are better quality, and didactically a great improvement. vi. Palestinian content and approach is far more contemporary. vii. Egyptian and Jordanian textbooks excluded any sense of Palestinian identity and of Israel. Palestinian textbooks strengthen awareness of identity viii. Judaism and Christianity not mentioned in the science and maths textbooks, whereas Islam is. ix. Co-educational settings are shown.
Apparent inconsistencies	<p>The authors do not make sufficient allowance for the fact that borders are still under negotiation and MOEHE has therefore deliberately not drawn country borders. Only delineations (the Oslo Accords) accepted by the International Community are shown on maps, apart from maps which have been reprinted from Israeli textbooks which also do not show borders.</p> <p>The liberal stance on gender equity leads to the contradiction in terms. If females are not shown affirmatively in non-stereotypical roles, the status quo is supported. This point is not made strongly enough.</p>
Key points omitted	None
Wider implications of the study	The authors do not draw out wider implications; they leave their findings to speak for themselves.