

IMPACT-se

## **European Textbooks: France Review**

**Author:** Shaul Wachsstock

**Editor:** Madeleine Ferris



**May 2025**

## Table of Contents

---

<i>Executive Summary</i>	3
<i>Main Findings</i>	5
<i>Introduction</i>	8
<i>Data on the Jewish Population and antisemitism in France</i>	8
<i>Literature Review of Representation of Jews, Judaism, and Antisemitism in French School Curriculum</i>	9
<i>Key Findings from Literature</i>	11
<i>Jews and Judaism in Christian and Muslim Religious Context</i>	22
<i>Jews as Part of the National Fabric</i>	28
<i>The Holocaust</i>	35
<i>Jews and the Israeli-Palestinian Conflict</i>	38
<i>Conclusion</i>	42
<i>Policy Recommendations</i>	45
<i>Recommendations for Teachers</i>	45
<i>Recommendations for Policymakers</i>	45
<i>Recommendations for Textbook Authors</i>	46
<i>Our Methodology</i>	53
<i>List of Textbooks</i>	55

Author of Cover Image : Freepik

[https://www.freepik.com/free-photo/low-angle-medium-shot-teenage-girls-talking\\_4956108.htm#fromView=search&page=1&position=4&uuid=8d318057-2856-4017-881b-ce408d46622c&query=french+school+children](https://www.freepik.com/free-photo/low-angle-medium-shot-teenage-girls-talking_4956108.htm#fromView=search&page=1&position=4&uuid=8d318057-2856-4017-881b-ce408d46622c&query=french+school+children)

## Executive Summary

---

This IMPACT-se report analyzes both high school textbooks (Grades 10-12), which are written based on curriculum guidelines of the French Ministry of Education, and the official History state curriculum for Grades 4-9. This report specifically focuses on the portrayal of Jews, Judaism, antisemitism, the Holocaust, and the Israeli-Palestinian conflict, and finds that the content broadly conforms to UNESCO standards in its coverage of this material. However, there are notable absences in depicting the contributions of Jews to French society throughout history, and in detailing the Jewish connection to Israel before its founding in 1948.

- **Holocaust:** The Holocaust is covered in detail, alongside the persecution of the Roma people, and is described as a “genocide of Jews and Gypsies” within the context of the Nazi “war of annihilation.” The radical Nazi ideology is presented, yet the unique ideological underpinnings of the Shoah are not fully explored.
- In the Grade 5 History program and Grade 12 *History-Geography, Geopolitics and Political Science* textbook, Jews are explicitly identified as victims of the Holocaust, with the figure of six million Jewish deaths cited and a firsthand account from a Jewish child included to illustrate the persecution.
- **Israel and Zionism:** The establishment of the State of Israel is addressed within the context of post–World War II geopolitical reordering and decolonization, framed largely as a response to European antisemitism. Textbooks tend to focus heavily on the Arab-Israeli conflict and regional tensions, often overlooking the historical Jewish connection to the land and the impact of the Holocaust on the founding of the state.
- Textbooks link Theodor Herzl’s coverage of the Dreyfus Affair to the emergence of Zionism, offering a unique illustration of the interconnection between these events. However, they fall short of providing a comprehensive background on the broader historical and existential necessity for the creation of the State of Israel.
- There are notable gaps in discussions of Zionism, with little exploration of its diverse ideological strands, and only limited attention given to Israel’s sociopolitical makeup. This restricts a comprehensive understanding of the complexity of Israeli identity. Additionally, the use of terms like “Zionist settlers” can be misleading and may carry unintended political implications when discussing Jewish immigrants.
- **Antisemitism:** Textbooks address the theme of antisemitism and include examples to illustrate the concept, including the Vichy regime’s policies, but often lack historical depth and contemporary relevance. While key historical incidents are mentioned, the recent resurgence of antisemitism is notably absent.
- Although the curriculum should be credited with thorough presentation of the Holocaust, Jewish history is frequently framed through the lens of victimization, with a strong emphasis on persecution, which tends to overshadow more positive and multifaceted aspects of Jewish life in France and beyond. For instance, students learn about Clairvaux, a Crusade leader who sought to protect Jews from forced conversion; a well-intentioned example that nonetheless reinforces a narrative of Jews primarily as victims.
- **Jewish French history:** The role of the Jewish community in French public life is largely absent from the curriculum. Key historical figures such as Rashi and the Tosafist school of thought are excluded from historical narratives, while Jewish intellectuals who contributed to French culture, along with political activists, are insufficiently represented.

- **Ancient Jewish history:** Judaism is implicitly acknowledged as the precursor to Christianity and Islam due to their shared monotheistic roots. However, the curriculum primarily emphasizes the rise of Christianity and Islam within the Roman and Arab empires, respectively, without explicitly presenting Judaism as a distinct religion with its own historical and cultural identity. Similarly, Jewish contributions to trade, scientific advancement, and philosophical discourse within Christian and Muslim contexts are largely overlooked.

## Main Findings

---

The Official Third Cycle (Grades 4-6) History program alongside the college (Grades 7-9) and lycée (Grades 10-12) History textbooks adhere to the official curriculum set by the Ministry of Education and are used by most schools in France. The history-geography program is a crucial and central component of the official educational system in France. It is the main tool for shaping the Republic and its values, inculcating in students the history of his or her country. Analysis of the content has revealed conclusions with respect to how French textbooks portray Jews, Judaism, and antisemitism:

- **Coverage of Jewish Historical Events:** French textbooks include a selection of historical events related to Jewish life, both within France and in a broader global context. Although some positive examples of Jewish protagonism exist, with particular reference to the Dreyfus Affair and its impact on Zionism, historical events are often framed primarily through the lens of Jewish victimization, focusing disproportionately on antisemitism and persecution—most notably through episodes such as the Dreyfus Affair and the Holocaust. While it is vital to teach these tragic and defining moments, the emphasis on suffering risks reducing Jewish history to a narrative of oppression and exclusion.

This narrow framing overlooks the broader and more complex tapestry of Jewish historical experience. The long-standing presence of Jewish communities in France—from the Middle Ages through the Enlightenment, and into modern times—has included not only persecution but also cultural flourishing, intellectual contributions, economic participation, and engagement with wider society. Similarly, the global history of the Jewish people includes rich traditions of scholarship, innovation, community resilience, and leadership in social, political, and artistic movements. One example covering the Crusades highlights Clairvaux, a Crusade leader who sought to protect Jews from forced conversions as he traveled through the Rhineland, attempting to dissuade Crusaders from targeting them due to their religious and spiritual significance. This example underscores the importance of respecting religious minorities, promoted in the curriculum.

In the aftermath of World War II, Jewish life in France and elsewhere did not come to a halt; rather, it entered a phase of reconstruction and renewal. Contemporary Jewish communities in France have played significant roles in civic life, education, and public discourse. Yet these contributions are rarely mentioned in textbooks, leaving students with an incomplete and imbalanced understanding.

To foster a more accurate and inclusive historical perspective, curricula should integrate a wider range of Jewish experiences—highlighting not only persecution but also creativity, agency, and cultural continuity. This would provide students with a fuller understanding of Jewish history as an integral part of both French and global narratives.

- **Jews in French Social and Cultural Narratives:** Historical narratives reflecting on integral members of the French social fabric, culture and history largely exclude Jews such as

Rashi and the *Tosafist* school, which significantly contributed to the flourishing of the Jewish community in France.

Key events, such as the expulsion of Jews from France, the persecution of French Jewish communities during the Crusades, their status and involvement during the Enlightenment and emancipation are either omitted or only briefly mentioned. In contemporary French society, the absence of Jewish figures in mainstream cultural and social narratives persists, despite their significant contributions. For instance, prominent Jewish intellectuals (Jacques Derrida, Emmanuel Levinas), artists (Marc Chagall, Haim Soutine, Jean Ferrat, Barbara), and activists such as Simone Veil, who played a crucial role in advancing women's rights and Holocaust remembrance, are often underrepresented in general historical discussions. This omission can hinder a comprehensive appreciation of the ongoing impact of Jewish history on modern French identity and social development.

- **Underrepresentation in Medieval Mediterranean and French Culture and History:** In discussions regarding the influence of the three monotheistic religions—Judaism, Christianity, and Islam—on shaping the social, cultural, and political landscape of the medieval Mediterranean and France, the contributions of Jewish communities are often minimized or entirely overlooked. While Christian and Islamic influences receive significant attention, the vital role played by Jewish populations in fostering trade, intellectual exchange, and cultural development during this period is frequently marginalized. For example, Jewish scholars, merchants, and poets contributed to the vibrant intellectual life of cities such as Toulouse, Carpentras, and Provence, yet their achievements are seldom highlighted in mainstream historical narratives. Additionally, Jewish participation in medieval scientific and philosophical debates, as well as their interactions with Christian and Muslim communities, are often underrepresented. This omission diminishes a comprehensive understanding of the multicultural and interconnected nature of medieval Mediterranean and French societies, where Jewish communities played a crucial role in shaping cultural, economic, and intellectual developments.
- **Discrimination and Antisemitism:** When addressing themes of discrimination and antisemitism, the textbooks tend to offer limited or superficial examples that lack both historical depth and contemporary relevance. While they may reference general forms of prejudice or isolated historical incidents, they often fail to engage with more recent and severe manifestations of antisemitism, such as the rise in hate crimes, the resurgence of conspiracy theories targeting Jews, or terrorist attacks specifically directed at Jewish communities and institutions. This omission not only diminishes the urgency of the issue but also prevents students from fully understanding the evolving nature of antisemitism and its impact on Jewish life today in France
- **Holocaust Representation:** The Holocaust is addressed in considerable detail across several textbooks, often alongside the persecution of the Roma people, and is accurately described as a “genocide of Jews and Gypsies” within the broader framework of the Nazi “war of annihilation.” Radical Nazi ideology is clearly presented, and in both the Grade 5 History program and the Grade 12 *History-Geography, Geopolitics and Political*

Science textbook, Jews are explicitly identified as victims of the Holocaust. These texts include the widely recognized figure of six million Jewish deaths and feature a powerful firsthand account from a Jewish child, helping to humanize the historical narrative and foster empathy among students.

While these efforts are commendable, further distinction between the genocides of Jews and Roma would enhance historical understanding. The Shoah was driven by a singular ideological commitment to the total eradication of the Jewish people, who were portrayed by the Nazi regime as an existential threat to the Aryan race. Omission of the distinct motivations, historical trajectories, and mechanisms behind each genocide diminishes student comprehension of the unique character of antisemitism within Nazi ideology, without diminishing the gravity of other atrocities.

- **Vichy Regime and Holocaust Memory:** Although the collaborationist role of the Vichy regime during World War II is addressed in most textbook accounts, there is a noticeable tendency—particularly in sections dealing with the collective memory of the Holocaust and the Roma genocide—to downplay the extent of Vichy's active participation in the identification, arrest, and deportation of Jews from France. This understatement may reflect broader societal and political struggles with national memory and responsibility. However, such omissions hinder students' grasp of the internal complicity in the Holocaust and obscure the critical historical truth that antisemitic policies were not merely imposed by the Nazi occupiers but were also implemented by French authorities.
- **Israel and Zionism:** The history of the establishment of the State of Israel is typically taught within the framework of the post-World War II geopolitical reordering and the decolonization movements of the mid-20th century. While this contextualization is important, it often leads to a narrow focus on the Arab-Israeli conflict and the regional tensions that followed Israel's founding in 1948. This conflict-centered narrative frequently overlooks key aspects of Jewish historical and cultural continuity in relation to the Land of Israel, including the centuries-long religious, spiritual, and national connection that underpinned the modern Zionist movement. The diverse ideological streams within Zionism—political, cultural, religious, and socialist—are rarely explored in depth, leaving students with a limited understanding of the motivations and character of the emerging Israeli society. Moreover, the sociopolitical makeup of early Israeli society—shaped by mass immigration from Europe, North Africa, and the Middle East, as well as by the trauma of the Holocaust—is often omitted or only briefly mentioned. This omission undermines an appreciation for the complexity and diversity of Israeli identity and the challenges of state-building under existential pressure. On a more positive note, some textbooks incorporate Israel's Declaration of Independence as a primary source document. This is an effective pedagogical tool, as it exposes students to the foundational values and aspirations of the Israeli state, including its commitment to democracy, equality, and peace, alongside its explicit identification as the realization of the Jewish people's right to self-determination. However, this valuable inclusion would be more impactful if paired with further historical background and discussion, enabling students to better understand both the historical context and the contemporary implications of the document.

## Introduction

---

### Data on the Jewish population and antisemitism in France

As of 2024, France has the largest Jewish population in Europe, with an estimated "core" Jewish population of around 446,000 (300,000 in the Parisian region).<sup>1</sup> The Jewish community has had a meaningful role in French history since antiquity, throughout the Middle Ages and during the Revolution; it has retained this status throughout modernity.

Historically, antisemitism has been a persistent issue in France. In recent decades, the rise in antisemitic acts has been alarming. The 2012 Toulouse school shooting and the 2015 *Hypercacher* kosher supermarket attack, both perpetrated by Islamists, have intensified feelings of insecurity within the French Jewish community. A report published by Tel Aviv University and the Anti-Defamation League, showed a near-quadrupling of antisemitic incidents in France, from 436 in 2022 to 1,676 in 2023.<sup>2</sup> *"From October 7 to December 12, 2023, there were 484 antisemitic incidents recorded in Paris alone, compared to the 436 incidents recorded across the whole of France in all of 2022."*<sup>3</sup>

The French government has consistently and firmly condemned those acts and taken steps to address antisemitism, including enhancing security measures for Jewish institutions and schools. This was clearly demonstrated by the French Minister of the Interior, who on October 7, 2023, gave the order to reinforce security around Jewish institutions and religious sites.<sup>4</sup>

Based on the Ipsos survey conducted for CRIF in September 2024, antisemitism in France appears to be a growing concern.<sup>5</sup> 70% of the French population believe that antisemitism has become more prevalent in recent years. The conflict in the Middle East is seen as a significant factor, with 75% of respondents indicating that the situation in the region has contributed to rising antisemitism in France. As a result, 64% of French people believe there are legitimate reasons for French Jews to feel concerned about living in France, a substantial increase of 14 points compared to 2020.

The survey also reveals that antisemitic prejudices remain deeply rooted in French society. Only 3% of respondents rejected all 16 antisemitic stereotypes tested in the survey. The most common prejudice is the belief that "Jews are very united among themselves" (89%), while approximately half believe that "Jews are more attached to Israel than to France" (52%), that "Jews have very powerful lobbies that operate at the highest level" (49%), or that "the vast majority of Jews support Israeli policy, including its worst aspects toward Palestinians" (48%). The number of French people who subscribe to six or more antisemitic opinions has increased significantly, rising 9 points since 2020 to reach 46%. These statistics are clear evidence of the pervasiveness of antisemitism in French society, which points to the importance of national education in the process of unpicking these prejudices.

1 [https://www.jewishdatabank.org/api/download/?studyId=1185&mediaId=bjdb%5c2021\\_World\\_Jewish\\_Population\\_AJYB\\_\(DellaPergola\)\\_DB\\_Public.pdf](https://www.jewishdatabank.org/api/download/?studyId=1185&mediaId=bjdb%5c2021_World_Jewish_Population_AJYB_(DellaPergola)_DB_Public.pdf)

2 [https://cst.tau.ac.il/wp-content/uploads/2024/05/AntisemitismWorldwide\\_2023\\_Final.pdf](https://cst.tau.ac.il/wp-content/uploads/2024/05/AntisemitismWorldwide_2023_Final.pdf)

3 p. 29

4 [https://www.bfmtv.com/politique/israel-gerald-darmanin-donne-l-ordre-aux-prefets-de-proteger-les-lieux-communautaires-juifs\\_AV-202310070250.html](https://www.bfmtv.com/politique/israel-gerald-darmanin-donne-l-ordre-aux-prefets-de-proteger-les-lieux-communautaires-juifs_AV-202310070250.html)

5 <https://www.ipsos.com/fr-fr/antisemitisme-en-france-ou-en-est-on-en-2024>

## Literature Review of Representation of Jews, Judaism, and Antisemitism in French School Curriculum

The representation of Jews, Judaism, and antisemitism in French school curricula has become a subject of academic and public interest and has a complex history. Historically, the representation of Jews in French textbooks has been riddled with antisemitic stereotypes and has omitted key elements of French Jewish history. Over the past few decades, a concerted effort has been made to address these issues and provide a more accurate and comprehensive portrayal of Jewish history and culture.<sup>6</sup> However, there remain significant gaps in how Jews and Judaism are represented in educational materials, despite some notable improvements. These gaps highlight the need for a more inclusive and accurate portrayal of Jewish contributions and experiences within French history. This literature review aims to synthesize key findings from various studies, reports, and scholarly articles.<sup>7</sup>

Over the last few years, many articles have been published discussing the lack of Jewish representation in French history and education. For instance, "*The Jews, a Blind Spot in the National Narrative*" (2021) and "*Jews in France - The Forgotten History*," the title of the May-June 2024 issue of the *Revue des Deux Mondes* dedicated to Jews in France, address these concerns. The latter publication even includes an article on the portrayal of Jews and Judaism in textbooks.<sup>8</sup> The titles of these articles reflect the longstanding nature of French antisemitism, which extends beyond textbooks to encompass France's broader historiography and collective memory.

To corroborate this, in December 1983, in an interview with the French Jewish newspaper *L'Arche*, President François Mitterrand lamented "the silence in textbooks on the history of the Jews of France... It is high time to teach how much civilization in France owes to the Jewish people."<sup>9</sup> While there have been some improvements since then, his call remains highly relevant today as expressed in the words of Jean-Claude Kuperminc, Director of the Library and Archives of the *Alliance Israélite Universelle* in Paris "We don't teach enough that the Jews are part of French geography, that they did not all come from abroad, and that they are eager to integrate without losing their identity."<sup>10</sup>

"*The Jewish History of France*,"<sup>11</sup> a comprehensive scholarly work published in 2023, presents the groundbreaking argument that there is a distinct Jewish history of France, not merely a Jewish history in France. This claim is meticulously supported throughout the book's thousand pages, with contributions from leading scholars, both Jewish and non-Jewish.

---

6 Groulez, M. (2011). Les Juifs dans les manuels scolaires d'histoire en France. *L'Harmattan*

7 Lefebvre, B. (2010). L'image du peuple juif dans l'enseignement primaire. *Revue d'Histoire de la Shoah*, 193, 51-63. <https://doi.org/10.3917/rhsho.193.0051>

Blaustein-Niddam, A. (2010). L'image des Juifs dans les manuels scolaires d'histoire en France, classes secondaires (1957-2007). *Revue d'Histoire de la Shoah*, 193, 89-108. <https://doi.org/10.3917/rhsho.193.0089>

Groulez, M. (2011). Les Juifs dans les manuels scolaires d'histoire en France. *L'Harmattan*

8 Reinhartz, D. (2024) Dans les manuels scolaires. *Revue des Deux Mondes* No 3847 - MAI-JUIN 2024

9 quoted in: Kuperminc, J. (2021) Écrire l'histoire des Juifs de France: tache aveugle ou présence aveuglante? <https://k-larevue.com/ecrire-histoire-juifs-france/>

10 Kuperminc, J. (2021) Écrire l'histoire des Juifs de France: tache aveugle ou présence aveuglante? <https://k-larevue.com/ecrire-histoire-juifs-france/>

11 Goldberg, S.A. *L'histoire Juive de la France*, Albin Michel 2023

It explicitly states on its back cover: "Since the time of the Roman Gauls, the presence of Jews on French soil has never been merely a demographic fact, as they have constantly contributed to the life of the country in all its aspects - political, economic, social, intellectual, and artistic. Yet the history of the Jews of France has mainly given rise to 'ghettoized' narratives in which they are portrayed not as active, creative subjects, but essentially as passive objects - objects of discrimination, persecution, expulsion, emancipation, integration... and even extermination. It was time for a change of perspective."

The article "*Les Juifs, une tâche aveugle dans le récit national*" ("The Jews, a Blind Spot in the National Narrative") by professors Christine Guimonnet and Alexandre Bande examines the representation of Jewish history and contributions within the French national narrative, particularly in educational curricula, and highlight the marginalization of Jewish experiences in historical education.

The authors explore how Jewish history has been inconsistently addressed in French education and society, often being marginalized or oversimplified. They argue that this marginalization creates a "blind spot" in the national narrative, which fails to fully acknowledge the role of Jewish communities in shaping French and European history. The text is structured around the question: "*Quelle place est construite aux juifs?*" ("What place is constructed for the Jews?") and examines this through various historical periods, educational programs, and societal attitudes.

Their main insights are that Jewish history in France is often reduced to specific events like the Dreyfus Affair, antisemitic periods (e.g., the Middle Ages, the French Revolution, Vichy France), or the Holocaust, without a broader integration into the national story. The authors note that Jewish contributions to French culture, science, and intellectual life (e.g., figures like Marcel Proust or Sigmund Freud) are rarely emphasized in educational settings. Antisemitism has historically led to exclusionary practices, such as expulsions (e.g., in the Middle Ages) and pogroms, which are taught, but the resilience and cultural contributions of Jewish communities are often overlooked.

The text advocates for a more comprehensive inclusion of Jewish history in French education, suggesting that it should not be limited to victimhood but should also highlight contributions to art, science, philosophy, and politics. The authors propose integrating Jewish history into broader themes of French history, such as the Renaissance, the Enlightenment, and modern cultural movements, to reflect their active role in these periods. They also suggest that teacher training should include more resources on Jewish history to address ignorance and stereotypes.

The authors conclude that the marginalization of Jewish history in the French national narrative reflects a broader issue of exclusionary historical memory. They argue that this "blind spot" has several consequences:

In summary, Guimonnet and Bande argue that the French national narrative has historically sidelined Jewish contributions, and this omission needs to be addressed through educational reform and a broader societal shift toward inclusivity. They advocate for a curriculum that reflects the full spectrum of Jewish experiences in France, from their cultural and intellectual contributions to their struggles, to create a more accurate and equitable historical memory.

These conclusions accurately reflect the findings of this report, underscoring the need for a shift in how Jewish history is represented in the context of French history. They highlight the significant contributions Jews have made to French society, contrasting with the limited portrayals in existing narratives. This IMPACT-se report echoes the call for a more inclusive and accurate depiction of Jewish history, one that recognizes the active roles (agency as opposed to passivity) that Jews have played throughout French history.

## Key Findings from Literature

- 1. Omission of Jewish History:** The official program and textbooks typically focus on a few key events: the Hebrew period, the Dreyfus Affair, the Holocaust, and the establishment of Israel, often neglecting nearly two thousand years of Jewish history and contributions to civilization and to France.
- 2. Christian Bias:** Jewish history is often framed as a precursor to Christianity, implying Judaism is outdated or incomplete, thereby downplaying its continuous and independent development.
- 3. Emancipation and Assimilation:** The period of Jewish emancipation during the Enlightenment is often overlooked.
- 4. Lack of Representation:** Jewish contributions to European and French history are largely ignored, especially during the medieval period and the Renaissance. Significant events like the Jewish presence in various French regions and their expulsion received little attention.
- 5. Focus on Persecution:** Jewish history is often taught primarily through the lens of persecution, such as the Holocaust, rather than highlighting positive contributions to society.
- 6. Modern Implications:** The portrayal of Jews in textbooks contrasts with modern perceptions of Israel, juxtaposing the victim narrative of the Holocaust with the image of Israelis and their wars in the Israeli-Palestinian conflict.

## French Education System

In France, publishers develop textbooks based on the national curriculum guidelines, yet there is no specific permit or formal approval required for textbooks to be used in schools. Unlike some countries that have a centralized textbook approval process, France operates under a system where the Ministry of National Education establishes the national curriculum (*programmes scolaires*), which outlines the content that must be taught at each grade level and in each subject.

However, the choice of specific textbooks is decentralized and made at the school level. Teachers, often working in subject-area teams within their schools, have the freedom to select which textbooks they will use in their classrooms, as long as these materials align with the national curriculum requirements. This system allows for pedagogical freedom while still ensuring that educational content aligns with national educational objectives and standards.

This report first explores a sample of the History Official Program (Cycle 3), which is a crucial component of the educational ethos for the shaping of the Republican French citizen. A critical

analysis is provided emphasizing the missed educational opportunities for Jews to be portrayed as part of the French historic and societal fabric. The report then continues with a survey of History textbooks for secondary education (Grades 10, 11, and 12) and Moral and Civic Education (EMC) materials. EMC in the French educational system aims to cultivate students' understanding of civic responsibility, ethics, and social values.

Since this report addresses the presentation of Jews as a religious and ethnic group, the analysis focuses on the History Official Program since religion is not taught as an independent subject in France due to the principle of *laïcité* (secularism), a foundational aspect of the French Republic. Instead, religious topics are incorporated into the History curriculum under the framework of teaching the "religious fact." *Laïcité* means the separation of religion from the state, ensuring that public institutions, including schools, remain neutral regarding religious matters. This principle was established with the 1905 law on the separation of church and state (**loi du 9 décembre 1905 de séparation des Églises et de l'État**), which aimed to promote unity and equality by preventing any religious influence on public education. It was similarly solidified in the 2002 Debray Report on "Teaching the religious fact in the secular school,"<sup>12</sup> which offered recommendations for teaching "the religious facts" within a secular framework, ensuring neutrality and respect for all beliefs.

---

<sup>12</sup> <https://www.vie-publique.fr/rapport/25911-lenseignement-du-fait-religieux-dans-lecole-laique>

## Part 1: Official History Program Third Cycle

The Official History Program for the third cycle focuses mainly on French history with the exception of Grade 6 and includes mandatory historical themes.

### Grade 4 (CM1) History program:

The Grade 4 (CM1) French History Curriculum covers three main key periods from antiquity to the early modern era, highlighting major civilizations such as the Celts, Gauls, Greeks, Romans, and later, the Merovingians and Carolingians. A central theme is the Christianization of France, tracing the spread of Christianity from the 2nd to the 8th centuries. The themes are divided in three chapters: 1. And Before France?<sup>13</sup> 2. The Time of the Kings<sup>14</sup> 3. The Time of the revolution and the Empire.<sup>15</sup>

#### 1. And Before France?

Even within themes that could naturally incorporate Jewish history—such as the cultural diversity of Roman Gaul, the impact of religious transformations, or major population movements—the curriculum omits any reference. The presence of Jewish communities in cities like Lyon, along with evidence of synagogues and trade networks, could have been integrated into discussions of early medieval society. Similarly, the theme of *grands mouvements et déplacements de population* (large population movements) focuses exclusively on "barbarian" migrations, overlooking Jewish mobility and their role in cultural and economic exchanges.

#### 2. Kings

The omission of Jewish history continues into the medieval and early modern sections. The curriculum devotes significant attention to the development of the French state, emphasizing monarchs such as Louis IX, François I, Henri IV, and Louis XIV. Yet the only reference to Jews appears under Louis IX, in the context of his 1269 decree mandating the *rouelle* (a distinctive badge for Jews). This policy is presented merely as an aspect of his piety, alongside his crusades, without deeper discussion of its impact or the broader treatment of Jewish communities in medieval France.

Beyond this single negative mention, Jewish history is absent from key topics such as their economic roles (e.g., trade, moneylending), expulsions (notably in 1306 and 1394), or intellectual contributions. There is no discussion of Rashi, the renowned 11th-century Jewish scholar from Troyes, nor any acknowledgment of Jewish communities' resilience and influence within French society. Even when the curriculum explores themes of religious tolerance—such as the Edict of Nantes (1598), which granted Protestants limited protections—it fails to address that Jews remained excluded from such rights.

#### 3. Revolution and The Empire

This pattern of exclusion extends into the Revolutionary and Napoleonic eras. The French Revolution marked a turning point for Jewish history: in 1791, France became the first

<sup>13</sup> <https://eduscol.education.fr/document/16732/download>

<sup>14</sup> <https://eduscol.education.fr/document/16735/download>

<sup>15</sup> <https://eduscol.education.fr/document/16738/download>

European country to grant full citizenship to Jews, aligning with the principles of equality and liberty enshrined in the *Déclaration des Droits de l'Homme et du Citoyen* (1789). Yet, despite the curriculum's focus on the Declaration and its articles, this landmark moment is omitted. Likewise, Napoleon's policies toward Jewish communities—including the 1806 Assembly of Jewish Notables, the Grand Sanhedrin of 1807, and the restrictive "Infamous Decree" of 1808—are absent, despite their significance in shaping Jewish integration into French society.

#### **Grade 5 (CM2) History program:**

The French History curriculum for Grade 5 covers three historical themes: the establishment of the French Republic, the Industrial Age, and the 20th century with a focus on the two world wars and European construction. The themes are divided in three chapters: 1. Time of the République<sup>16</sup> 2. Industrial age in France<sup>17</sup> 3. France, from the world wars to the European Union.<sup>18</sup> The curriculum, designed to foster historical understanding and citizenship education, reveals a limited portrayal of Jewish experiences and contributions, missing opportunities to present a more inclusive narrative.

#### **1. The French Republic and Its Values**

The curriculum on the French Republic examines its establishment from the late 19th century, emphasizing the centenary of 1892, Jules Ferry's educational reforms (1881–1882), and republican values like liberty, equality, fraternity, and laïcité (e.g., 1905 law on the separation of Church and State). Jews are not explicitly mentioned, despite their relevance to these themes. The 1791 Jewish emancipation, a landmark of the Revolution aligning with republican ideals, is omitted, though it could have illustrated the application of equality to minorities. The Dreyfus Affair (1894–1906), a defining moment testing the Republic's commitment to justice amidst antisemitism, is also absent, despite its proximity to the 1892 centenary and its role in affirming republican values. The impact of Ferry's secular education laws on Jewish integration—enabling Jewish children to join a unified national system—is ignored, as is the 1905 law's significance for Jewish communities in ensuring religious equality. The Crémieux Decree (1870), granting citizenship to Algerian Jews, could have highlighted the Republic's complex colonial policies but is not included. This complete omission sidelines Jews' role in shaping and benefiting from the republican project, reinforcing a homogenized narrative that overlooks minority contributions to France's identity.

#### **2. The Industrial Age**

Covering the late 18th to mid-20th century, this curriculum explores industrialization's impact on work, society, and landscapes, including the rise of industrial cities, worker conditions, and social changes like urbanization. Jews are not mentioned at all, despite their significant presence. Jewish families like the Rothschilds, instrumental in banking and railway development (a key focus of the curriculum), are excluded, missing a chance to highlight their economic contributions to industrial growth. Jewish immigrants from Eastern Europe, arriving in the late 19th and early 20th centuries,

<sup>16</sup> <https://eduscol.education.fr/document/16741/download>

<sup>17</sup> <https://eduscol.education.fr/document/16744/download>

<sup>18</sup> <https://eduscol.education.fr/document/16747/download>

worked in industries like textiles and tailoring and were active in labor movements, yet their roles in the working class and syndicalism (post-1884 legalization of unions) are ignored. Urbanization's impact on Jewish communities, such as those in Paris's Marais district, and cultural contributions like Camille Pissarro's role in Impressionism (tied to the curriculum's artistic focus) are also omitted. This absence erases Jews' contributions to and experiences within France's industrial transformation, perpetuating a majority-focused narrative.

### 3. Two World Wars in the Twentieth Century and European Construction

This curriculum covers the two World Wars (1914–1918, 1939–1945) and European integration (e.g., 1951 CECA, 1992 Maastricht Treaty), emphasizing their societal impact and the pursuit of peace. Jews are explicitly mentioned as victims of the Holocaust: 5.1 to 6 million Jews were killed (two-thirds of Europe's Jewish population), with 75,000 deported from France, mostly to Auschwitz, of whom only 3,000 survived. A Jewish child's testimony is given to illustrate the persecution, personalizing the narrative. However, the curriculum frames Jews solely as victims, omitting broader contributions like Jewish involvement in the Resistance (e.g. Marc Bloch) or post-war reconstruction. The Jewish community's experience during the interwar period and their resilience post-1945 are also absent. This is a missed opportunity to connect local heritage (e.g., Jewish communities in France) to the broader narrative of European unity and peacebuilding.

#### **Grade 6 History program (*sixième*):**

The Grade 6 History-Geography curriculum explores human history through three main themes:

1. Long history of humanity and migrations<sup>19</sup> 2. Foundational Stories, Beliefs, and Citizenship in the Ancient Mediterranean in the 1st Millennium B.C.<sup>20</sup> 3. The Roman Empire in the Ancient World<sup>21</sup> These themes aim to develop historical skills such as situating events in time and space, understanding documents, and distinguishing between history and myth. Jews and Judaism are primarily addressed in Themes 2 and 3, linked to foundational narratives and the rise of Christianity within the Roman Empire.

#### 1. Foundational Narratives, Beliefs, and Citizenship in the Ancient Mediterranean in the 1st Millennium BCE

Judaism is explored through the lens of "the birth of Jewish monotheism in a polytheistic world." The curriculum highlights the Hebrews' transition from monolatry to monotheism, particularly during the Babylonian exile (587–538 BCE), a pivotal moment in the composition of biblical texts like Genesis. Jews are presented as a people whose history is marked by a significant religious shift, supported by verifiable historical events such as the Babylonian capture of Jerusalem. However, this portrayal is largely text-focused and symbolic, juxtaposed with Greek (Homer) and Roman (Aeneas, Romulus) myths. Judaism is thus reduced to a precursor of monotheism, with little exploration of its culture, practices, or broader impact beyond this period.

#### 2. The Roman Empire in the Ancient World

Jews and Judaism appear within the sub-theme "Christians in the Empire," as a backdrop

19 <https://eduscol.education.fr/document/16750/download>

20 <https://eduscol.education.fr/document/16753/download>

21 <https://eduscol.education.fr/document/16756/download>

to the emergence of Christianity. The curriculum mentions Jewish communities around the Mediterranean, notably through the letters of Paul, a "Hellenized Jew" who serves as a cultural bridge. Events like the Jewish revolt of 66-70 CE and the destruction of the Jerusalem Temple by Titus are cited to explain the gradual distinction between Judaism and Christianity. Jews are depicted as a religious group in conflict with Roman authority, rejecting the imperial cult, which marginalizes them before Christianity emerges as a unifying religion under Constantine and Theodosius. This perspective relegates Judaism to a secondary role, overshadowed by Christianity's rise, without emphasizing its continuity or resilience amidst Romanization.

Overall, the representation of Jews and Judaism in this curriculum is limited and functional. It primarily serves to illuminate the emergence of monotheism and Christianity, without giving sufficient attention to Jewish identity as a vibrant and influential civilization in the ancient world. Jews are rarely portrayed as autonomous actors, but rather as a steppingstone in a broader narrative dominated by Rome and Christianity. This approach reflects a Eurocentric and Romano-Christian bias, where Judaism is a preamble rather than a subject of study in its own right.

#### **Grade 7 History program (*cinquième*):**

The Grade 7 History-Geography curriculum covers three thematic units: "Christianity and Islam from their Origins to the 13th Century," "Society, Church, and Political Power in the Feudal West (11th-15th Centuries)," and "Transformations of Europe and Opening to the World (15th-17th Centuries)."

These themes aim to develop skills such as chronological understanding, document analysis, and spatial awareness, while exploring the medieval and early modern periods. Jews and Judaism appear sporadically across these themes, primarily as a contextual element rather than a central focus, reflecting a limited and often functional portrayal.

##### **1. Christianity and Islam from their Origins to the 13th Century**

Judaism is implicitly present as the precursor to Christianity and Islam, given their shared monotheistic heritage. The curriculum emphasizes the emergence of Christianity and Islam within the Roman and Arab empires, respectively, but does not explicitly address Judaism as a distinct entity. For instance, the Great Mosque of Damascus is highlighted as a site of religious succession (from a Roman temple to a Christian church to a mosque), with the tomb of John the Baptist serving to illustrate connections among the three monotheisms. However, Judaism itself is not explored beyond this genealogical link, missing an opportunity to discuss Jewish communities and their role in the Mediterranean world during this period. The focus remains on Christian and Muslim empires, with Jews absent as active participants.

##### **2. Society, Church, and Political Power in the Feudal West (11th-15th Centuries)**

Jews are marginally referenced within the context of medieval Christian society. The curriculum emphasizes the dominance of the Church and feudal structures, with the Crusades and *Reconquista* (reconquest) as key dynamics of expansion. Jews are indirectly implicated in these events—living under Christian rule in Europe or Muslim

rule in Al-Andalus—but their experiences, such as expulsions, pogroms, or economic roles (e.g., moneylending), are not addressed. The text mentions cultural exchanges in Al-Andalus, a region of significant Jewish intellectual activity (e.g., Maimonides), yet this is framed broadly as a "flourishing civilization" without specifying Jewish contributions. The curriculum thus portrays Jews as a periphery group, overshadowed by the Christian feudal order.

### 3. Transformations of Europe and Opening to the World (15th-17th Centuries)

Jews appear briefly in the context of the *Reconquista* (reconquest) and their expulsion from Spain in 1492, tied to the unification efforts of Ferdinand and Isabella. This event, though significant, is subsumed by the narrative of European exploration and the "Great Discoveries," with no discussion of its consequences for diasporic Jewish communities, such as those in the Ottoman Empire or the Netherlands. The curriculum also notes the Treaty of Tordesillas (1494) but omits the broader context of religious homogenization in Spain, including the Inquisition's impact on Jews. Judaism is thus reduced to a footnote in the transition to modernity, with little attention to its resilience or cultural influence during this transformative period.

Overall, the representation of Jews and Judaism is minimal and instrumental, serving to contextualize Christian and Muslim developments rather than presenting them as a vibrant, autonomous civilization. This reflects a Eurocentric and Christo-Islamic focus, where Jews are either precursors to these religions or victims of them, and are rarely presented as agents of history. Their cultural, intellectual, and economic contributions—such as in medieval trade, philosophy, and science—are largely absent, perpetuating a narrative that sidelines their historical significance.

#### **Grade 8 History program (*quatrième*):**

The Grade 8 History-Geography curriculum "The 18th Century: Enlightenment and Revolutions," "The Industrial Age and Colonial Expansion," and "The Consolidation of Democracy in France (19th Century)." These themes aim to foster skills such as chronological reasoning, critical analysis, and understanding societal transformations. However, the representation of Jews and Judaism within these themes is minimal, often incidental, and lacks depth, reflecting a broader focus on European political, economic, and intellectual developments rather than the diverse communities within them.

##### 1. The 18th Century: Enlightenment and Revolutions

The curriculum explores the Enlightenment, international trade (including the slave trade), and the French Revolution. Jews and Judaism are scarcely mentioned. The Enlightenment section highlights European intellectual movements, with figures like Voltaire and Montesquieu, but does not address Jewish thinkers like Moses Mendelssohn, a key figure in the *Haskalah* (Jewish Enlightenment), who bridged Jewish and European intellectual traditions. The discussion of the French Revolution includes the Declaration of the Rights of Man and Citizen (1789), which implicitly laid the groundwork for Jewish emancipation in France (granted in 1791), yet this milestone is not explicitly noted. The slave trade section focuses on economic and moral debates, but Jewish

involvement—whether as merchants or victims of broader Atlantic systems—is absent, despite their presence in port cities like Bordeaux and Nantes.

## 2. The Industrial Age and Colonial Expansion,

The curriculum examines industrialization, urbanization, and imperialism from the late 18th to early 20th centuries. Jews are not explicitly referenced, though they were significant in industrial and colonial contexts. For instance, Jewish communities in industrializing regions like Alsace contributed to textile and trade networks, yet this is overlooked in favor of a general focus on workers and technological progress. The colonial narrative centers on European powers and colonized societies, mentioning figures like Jules Ferry, but omits Jewish roles—such as traders in North Africa or settlers in Algeria—within the French empire. The "*mission civilisatrice*" is critiqued, but its impact on Jewish populations in colonized regions, who often navigated complex identities between colonizers and colonized, is ignored.

## 3. The Consolidation of Democracy in France (19th Century)

The curriculum traces the development of the Third Republic, universal suffrage, and social reforms. The Dreyfus Affair (1894–1906) is listed as a key chronological marker and briefly noted as a political crisis challenging republican principles. This event, centered on Captain Alfred Dreyfus, a Jewish officer falsely accused of treason, is a rare explicit mention of Jews, yet its treatment is limited to its political implications rather than its significance as a moment of antisemitism and indicative of the Jewish experience in France. The broader Jewish integration into French society—marked by emancipation, participation in education (e.g., the *École Normale Israélite Orientale*), and contributions to republican culture—is absent. The focus remains on suffrage, secularism, and women's rights, sidelining Jewish contributions and struggles.

Overall, Jews and Judaism are underrepresented, appearing only tangentially through the Dreyfus Affair or implicitly via revolutionary principles. This marginalization reflects a Eurocentric and state-centric narrative that prioritizes political and economic transformations over cultural or minority perspectives. Jewish contributions to intellectual life, economic development, and civic identity are largely omitted, rendering them invisible in a curriculum meant to explore societal diversity and change.

### **Grade 9 History program (*troisième*):**

The Grade 9 History-Geography curriculum, comprises three key themes: "The World Between the Two World Wars," "A World Dominated by Conflicts and New Ideologies (1939–1945)," and "The French Republic and the Contemporary World Since 1945." These themes aim to develop students' understanding of 20th-century crises, political transformations, and global dynamics while fostering skills like document analysis and civic engagement. However, the representation of Jews and Judaism within this curriculum is limited, often confined to the context of the Holocaust, and lacks a broader exploration of Jewish contributions or experiences beyond victimhood.

## 1. The World Between the Two World Wars

The curriculum examines imperial rivalries, nationalism, and the rise of totalitarianism, culminating in the crises leading to World War II. Jews and Judaism appear tangentially

in the context of the Armenian Genocide (1915) as a precursor to later mass violence, but the specific persecution of Jews under rising Nazi ideology is not emphasized. The Nazi regime (1933–1945) is a chronological marker, yet the curriculum does not explicitly address early antisemitic policies like the Nuremberg Laws (1935) or Kristallnacht (1938), which targeted Jews before the war. Jewish agency—such as resistance movements or cultural resilience—is absent, and the focus remains on broader political and economic crises.

## 2. A World Dominated by Conflicts and New Ideologies (1939–1945)

Jews and Judaism are more directly referenced through the Holocaust. The curriculum highlights the "genocide of Jews and Gypsies" as part of the "war of annihilation" on the Eastern Front, linking it to the radicalization of Nazi ideology after the 1941 invasion of the Soviet Union. The earlier Cycle 3 mention of "the genocide of the Jews" (CM2) is built upon, but the treatment remains narrow, focusing on Jews as victims without exploring their pre-war lives, contributions to European society, or resistance efforts (e.g. the Warsaw Ghetto Uprising, 1943). The Vichy regime's collaboration is noted, yet its specific role in deporting French Jews (e.g., the *Vel' d'Hiv* Roundup, 1942) is not detailed, limiting the understanding of Jewish experiences in France.

## 3. The French Republic and the Contemporary World Since 1945

The curriculum shifts to post-war reconstruction, decolonization, and the Cold War, with no explicit mention of Jews or Judaism. The establishment of Israel (1948) and its role in Cold War dynamics—such as the Israeli-Palestinian conflict—are briefly noted as a conflict influenced by superpower rivalry, but Jewish perspectives or the Holocaust's impact on Israel's creation are not explored. The integration of Jewish survivors into post-war France, their contributions to the Fifth Republic (e.g., figures like Simone Veil), or the persistence of antisemitism are overlooked, despite the theme's focus on citizenship and social evolution.

Overall, Jews and Judaism are underrepresented beyond the Holocaust, framed primarily as passive victims rather than active participants in history. This reflects a curriculum prioritizing geopolitical narratives over the social and cultural histories of minority groups. Jewish intellectual, economic, and political contributions—such as those in the Resistance, post-war reconstruction, or global diaspora—are sidelined, perpetuating a one-dimensional portrayal.

## Part 2: High School Textbooks

### Focus of the Second Part of the Research:

In this second part of the research, we have undertaken a close examination of specific examples drawn directly from French history and Civic Education textbooks currently in use across various educational levels. This analytical focus allows us to move beyond general observations and engage with the actual narratives, language, and frameworks presented to students in the classroom.

The report concentrates on four interrelated and thematically significant areas where Jewish identity, history, and representation come into play:

#### 1. Jews and Judaism in Christian and Muslim Religious Contexts:

This theme explores how Jewish history and religious identity are positioned in relation to Christianity and Islam, particularly in discussions of European medieval history, the rise of monotheistic religions, and interfaith dynamics. We assess whether the textbooks reflect historical complexity or perpetuate reductionist or marginalizing portrayals, and how these representations may impact students' understanding of Jewish continuity and difference within broader religious narratives.

#### 2. Jews Within the National Fabric:

This section investigates how Jews are portrayed as part of the national history of France. We examine whether Jewish citizens are integrated into the broader narrative of French republicanism, citizenship, and contributions to national culture and identity, or whether they remain peripheral, often only mentioned in moments of crisis or controversy. The treatment of events such as Jewish emancipation during the French Revolution, participation in French public life, and responses to antisemitism are key points of analysis.

#### 3. The Holocaust:

While the Holocaust is generally addressed in textbooks, we explore the depth, framing, and context of its presentation. Special attention is given to how the Shoah is integrated into broader historical narratives—whether it is contextualized within Nazi ideology, antisemitic policies, and the unique targeting of Jews, or whether it is generalized alongside other atrocities. The role of the Vichy regime, the experience of French Jews, and the legacy of Holocaust memory in France are also examined for their accuracy and nuance.

#### 4. Jews and the Israeli-Palestinian Conflict:

The final theme investigates how textbooks present the State of Israel, Zionism, and the broader Israeli-Palestinian conflict. We analyze how the historical and ideological roots of Zionism are explained, how the Jewish connection to the Land of Israel is contextualized, and whether the complexity of the conflict is communicated in a balanced and informed manner. We also examine how the State of Israel is framed—whether as a historical actor, a controversial geopolitical entity, or a symbolic figure in wider discussions of postcolonialism, nationalism, and identity.

By structuring the report around these four key themes, we aim to provide a comprehensive and nuanced understanding of how Jewish history, identity, and political presence are depicted in educational materials, and what implications these portrayals may have for the shaping of collective memory, civic understanding, and intergroup relations among students in France today.

## Jews and Judaism in Christian and Muslim Religious Context

---

### Example 1

**History, Grade 10, (2019) updated for 2024, Magnard pp.62-63**

The official Grade 10 History program only briefly mentions Jews as actors within society. It aims to “show how civilizations come into contact, foster relations, and create conflicts in a space marked by Jewish, Christian, and Muslim monotheisms”<sup>22</sup> in the medieval Mediterranean.

Interactions in this region featured rich cultural, economic, and religious exchanges among the three monotheistic faiths. The Mediterranean was a vital trade hub where Jewish, Christian, and Muslim merchants engaged with one another. Jewish traders, especially the Radhanite merchants, played a crucial role as intermediaries between Christian Europe and the Muslim world, promoting economic prosperity and cultural diffusion. Additionally, Jewish communities navigated the complex political landscapes, often serving as diplomats or advisors to rulers of both faiths. A notable example is Samuel ibn Nagrela, a Jewish vizier in Muslim Granada, who influenced politics and maintained peace between the two communities.

This course takes an in-depth look at the Mediterranean as a center of exchange, particularly exploring how commercial and cultural trading flourished in the region. It is structured into three chapters: the first examines the dominance of Italian merchants from the 11th to 13th centuries; the second investigates the cultural exchanges facilitated by trade; and the third centers on Sicily and Spain as pivotal areas for cultural transfer. While Jewish merchants and diplomats played crucial roles in these interactions, the textbook predominantly emphasizes relations between Christians and Muslims, with only a brief mention of Jews as cultural transmitters

[See the next page for the continuation of the example.]

---

<sup>22</sup> [https://cache.media.education.gouv.fr/file/SP1-MEN-22-1-2019/69/9/spe577\\_annexe1CORR\\_1063699.pdf](https://cache.media.education.gouv.fr/file/SP1-MEN-22-1-2019/69/9/spe577_annexe1CORR_1063699.pdf) pp. 7

**Cours**

**PLAN**

- Les îles chères de la Méditerranée p. 10
- Le Méditerranéen, lieu d'échanges et de conflits p. 11
- Le Méditerranéen, lieu d'échanges p. 12

**La Méditerranée, lieu d'échanges**

**Comment la Méditerranée voit-elle s'accroître ses échanges commerciaux et culturels ?**

**A. Les marchands italiens à la conquête de la Méditerranée (xi<sup>e</sup>-xii<sup>e</sup> siècle)**

- L'expansion chrétienne favorise le commerce. Crisols et marchands importent les cultures étrangères. Palerme gagne en 1070. Avec l'empereur romain (1155) sont ajoutés des ports importants qui peuvent venir contrôler davantage. Mais surtout, les portes n'empêchent pas la poussée du commerce entre chrétiens et musulmans.
- Des cités marchandes italiennes favorisées par leur position centrale en Méditerranée. Des îles siciles, l'empereur byzantin accorde à Venise, Génova et Pise d'importants privilégiés commerciaux. Les marchands sont exemptés de taxes dans les ports de l'empire. Ces privilégiés semblables leur sont accordés par les autorités musulmanes à Alexandrie, Tunis ou Alger. Les Italiens y fondent des **comptoirs** appelés **Kantab**.
- Un nouveau réseau commercial. L'île d'origine entre l'Italie du Nord, la Sicile, Constantinople, Alexandrie et les ports des Balkans d'Orient comme Zara. Les cheftaines exportent draps, laine et soie. D'Orient proviennent également certains produits comme l'Inde, cette dernière, etc. Un du Sud est affue en Italie et en Espagne où sont propagées les premières monnaies d'or.
- Venise, puissance commerciale mais aussi militaire et territoriale. La cité est dotée d'une flotte de guerre et pratiquent un commerce avec les marchands. C'est donc une ville qui tient les îles de la mer Adriatique et possède une flotte par la mer. Sa puissance est telle qu'en 1204, le **croisement** contribue à détruire la **Quatrième croisade** vers Constantinople. Venise se voit récompensée d'une partie des territoires byzantins et se retrouve à la tête d'un **empire** oriental.

**Point de passage et d'ouverture p. 11**

**B. Le commerce favorise aussi les échanges culturels**

- Apprentissage des techniques de navigation arabe. Les marchands italiens utilisent l'astrolabe, un instrument qui permet de se diriger grâce à un système précis des étoiles. Au début du xi<sup>e</sup> siècle, le Normand fait son appariation en Italie. Cet instrument inventé en Chine a été diffusé par les Arabes. A la même époque, les navigateurs italiens utilisent des cartes nautiques italiennes à partir de cartes et de manuels de géographie arabes.
- Des nouvelles techniques commerciales. Le commerce au long cours impose aux marchands italiens de résoudre par des contrats complexes. Le change entre différentes monnaies suppose des calculs plus élaborés. Pour ces raisons, les élites urbaines italiennes se tournent à l'arithmétique d'origine arabe.
- Le goût pour l'Orient. Les marchands italiens, pour maintenir leur réussite, font édifier des palais qui empruntent à l'architecture byzantine pour arabe.

**La Sicile et l'Espagne, régions de transferts culturels**

- La cour des normands, siège d'un double héritage. Les Normands ont connu une île qui avait une tradition peu musulmane. Ils en conservent certaines traditions. Les musulmans représentent le riz avec les légumes. Au contraire, l'administration des finances est dirigée par le terme arabe chahra ou le terme grec akhrylos. Son principal avantage est l'arachide, de l'arachide aux siennes. Le royaume a repris le système fiscal byzantin qui impose sur l'alimentation d'un **odatre**, c'est une première en Occident.
- Architecture normande, une spécificité originale. Les églises sont créées de mosquées. Les galeries et les coupoles rappellent les arcs en fer à cheval ou les accolades, les dômes en stuc, les arabesques, autant d'éléments que l'on trouve dans les mosquées.
- Une grande cour des traducteurs. A Palerme, les musulmans sont de véritables **scholaires** qui attirent des intellectuels arabisés comme le géographe al-Idrisi. C'est alors que les chiffres arabes font leur apparition dans les manuels scolaires au xi<sup>e</sup> siècle. À Tolède, la présence de juifs et de chrétiens arabes favorise également les traductions. Pierre le Vénérable fait ainsi appeler un théâtre pour traduire le Coran en Occident.
- Une renaissance intellectuelle au sein de l'école. Grâce à cet apport de traducteurs, on redécouvre, par l'intermédiaire des termes arabes, la philosophie et les sciences des Anciens comme Aristote.

**Point de passage et d'ouverture p. 11**

**1204 : la quatrième croisade détournée**

Le pape Innocent III appelle à une quatrième croisade en 1202 pour expérimenter l'Asie. Les croisés se rendent à Nicée pour attaquer le Béotie ottomane. L'empereur, alors en route pour le pays, passe la mer d'Azov et débarque par la steppe. L'empereur Iouann II propose alors de passer les îles des îles de l'Adriatique pour arriver par mer. C'est ce qu'il fait. Peter le Vénérable et les Latins se partagent l'Empire et ses richesses, le Pape offre de la croisade des quatre chevaux de Saint-Marc aux grecs à Venise.

Les quatre chevaux de Saint-Marc sont exposés au musée du Louvre, Paris.

### The Mediterranean is a place for exchanges.

#### A. Italian Merchants Conquering the Mediterranean (11th-13th Century)

Christian expansion favors trade.

Italian merchant cities are favored by their central position in the Mediterranean.

A new commercial network.

Venice was a commercial power but also a military and territorial one.

#### B. Trade also promotes cultural exchanges.

The adoption of Arab navigation techniques

New commercial techniques.

A taste for the Orient.

#### C. Major centers of translation.

In Palermo, the Norman kings were true patrons of the arts, attracting Arab intellectuals such as the geographer al-Idrisi. This is how Arabic numerals began to appear in Latin manuscripts in the 11th century. In Toledo, the presence of Arabized Jews and Christians also facilitated translations. Peter the Venerable, for instance, commissioned a Toledan scholar to translate the Quran in 1141.

## Example 2

**History, Grade 10, (2019) updated for 2024-Magnard pp.52-53**

In this Grade 10 class on the “Three Shores of the Mediterranean,” the textbook explores three major aspects of medieval Mediterranean history: the Byzantine Empire, the resurgence of Occidental Christianity, and the flourishing Muslim society. However, Jews are mentioned only twice in the pages without necessary context. The first mention addresses the status of Jews in the Muslim world, identifying them as protected citizens (*dhimmi*) obligated to pay special taxes. The second mention features a drawing of Maimonides accompanied by a very brief description.

Only those with prior knowledge can grasp the significance of Maimonides’ inclusion as a representative of the esteemed scholars involved in the translation movements in places such as Toledo, Spain, where Muslim, Christian, and Jewish scholars collaborated. This intellectual cooperation enabled the transfer of knowledge from the Islamic world to Christian Europe. Jewish scholars, conversant in Arabic, Hebrew, and Latin, were crucial in translating key philosophical and scientific texts, thereby facilitating the spread of knowledge across religious divides.

While it is commendable that Maimonides is acknowledged as a scholar who contributed to this rich cultural and philosophical milieu, his mention is disjointed and lacks depth. The text fails to explore the broader contributions of Jews to the cultural landscape of the Mediterranean. This omission of context and detail makes it challenging for students to fully appreciate the significance of Maimonides’ work and its lasting impact.

- Un vaste empire. Après la mort de Mohammed en 632, ses successeurs, qui portent le titre de *califes*, conquièrent un empire qui s'étend de l'Espagne aux frontières de l'Inde. Les conversions sont nombreuses parmi les peuples soumis. Toutefois, les juifs et les chrétiens reçoivent le statut de *dhimmi* car l'islam reconnaît les prophètes évoqués dans la Bible, qu'elle soit hébraïque ou chrétienne. À ce titre, ils peuvent exercer librement leur culte mais doivent le paiement d'une taxe. La langue arabe se diffuse dans l'empire comme langue des élites, mais l'arabisation n'est pas systématique.
- Un âge d'or intellectuel jusqu'au XII<sup>e</sup> siècle. Le développement de l'empire arabo-musulman favorise la synthèse des héritages scientifiques perse, hindou et surtout grec. Les villes sont les foyers de la culture arabo-musulmane. Des lettrés y développent la poésie, la philosophie, la médecine ou la géographie. En s'appuyant sur les traductions d'Aristote et de Platon, des intellectuels comme Averroès cherchent à expliquer le contenu du Coran par la logique. Les juristes ont également recours à celle-ci pour adapter la loi divine, la *charia*, dans le droit. Cette adaptation est nécessaire tant la société est diverse dans un monde musulman si étendu. Se développent également un artisanat raffiné et une architecture qui emprunte aux cultures des différents peuples du monde musulman.

Étude p.56



**Averroès**  
(1126-1198)

Médecin et théologien musulman de Cordoue, il a cherché à interpréter le Coran en s'appuyant sur la logique du philosophe grec Aristote.

  


**Maimonide**  
(1138-1204)

Philosophe juif né à Cordoue, Maimonide introduit dans le judaïsme le raisonnement philosophique pour expliquer le sens de la Bible hébraïque.

[See the next page for the continuation of the example.]

*Three shores of the Mediterranean*

(A drawing of Maimonides on the right side of page 53 under Averroes.)

Maimonides (1138-1204)

Jewish philosopher born in Cordoba. Maimonides introduces philosophical reasoning in Judaism to explain the Hebrew Bible.

3. A Golden Age of Intellectual Achievement until the 12th Century

The development of the Arab-Muslim empire fostered the synthesis of Persian, Hindu, and especially Greek scientific heritage. Cities became centers of Arab-Muslim culture, where scholars developed poetry, philosophy, medicine, and geography. Relying on translations of Aristotle and Plato, intellectuals such as Averroës sought to explain the contents of the Quran through logic. Jurists also used logic to adapt divine law, Sharia, into legal practice. This adaptation was necessary due to the diversity of society within such a vast Muslim world. Additionally, a refined craft industry and architecture evolved, drawing from the cultures of various people.

**Example 3**

**History and Geography, Grade 10, 2023 • Hatier pp.74-75**

The Crusade era remained a horrific period for Jews, marked by persecution, forced conversions, and massacres. Unfortunately, these significant events and their impact on Jewish communities are notably absent from the textbooks, leaving a critical gap in the historical narrative. The textbook narratives surrounding the Crusaders, who departed from France to liberate Jerusalem and the Holy Land from Muslim control, primarily emphasize their violent battles against Muslims. However, as aforementioned, the impact on Jewish communities was also significant.<sup>23</sup> Firstly, economically, Jews in France suffered as those who volunteered for the Crusades were, by royal decree, exempt from repaying debts owed to Jewish moneylenders.

Additionally, although there was no official mandate to harm Jews, many Crusader groups perpetrated massacres and spread fear among Jewish communities on their way to Jerusalem. During the First Crusade, thousands of Jews were massacred in France and Germany, particularly in the Rhineland, where they faced severe persecution. None of this is mentioned in the many analyzed textbooks. Omitting the various ways the Crusades impacted Jewish communities on their journey to the Holy Land misses an opportunity to explore both the flourishing of Jewish communities in France at the time and the discrimination and persecution they endured.

Positively, the official program requires students to learn about Bernard of Clairvaux, a prominent leader of the Second Crusade. He traveled to the Rhineland and attempted to dissuade the Crusaders from forcibly converting Jews, arguing that they were "the flesh and bones of the Lord." Despite his efforts, Jewish communities lived in fear and endured hardship during that era.

[See the next page for the continuation of the example.]

---

<sup>23</sup> Goldberg, Sylvie-Anne (ed.) *L'histoire juive de la France*, Albin Michel 2023 pp. 83-85.

## ÉTUDE Croisades et djihad

Dès la fin du VIII<sup>e</sup> siècle, la reconquête chrétienne de la péninsule ibérique commence, c'est la Reconquista. À partir de la fin du XI<sup>e</sup> siècle, le pape lance des croisades pour reprendre et conserver Jérusalem. Ces expéditions guerrières bouleversent les équilibres géopolitiques et poussent les autorités musulmanes à réactiver l'obligation du djihad.

► Pourquoi et comment s'affrontent les trois civilisations de la Méditerranée médiévale ?

**1 L'appel du pape Urbain II (1095)**

Il importe que, sans tarder, nous vous portiez au secours de vos frères qui habitent les pays d'Orient et qui déjà bien souvent ont réclamé votre aide. En effet, comme la prophétie l'avait alors suivi, un peuple venu de Perse, les Turcs, a envahi leur pays [...] Ils s'intendent continuellement au détriment des terres des chrétiens [...] À tous ceux qui y participent et qui meurent en route, que ce soit sur terre ou sur mer, ou qui perdent la vie en combattant les païens, la rémission de leurs peccats sera acordée. Et je l'accorde à ceux qui participeront à ce voyage, en vertu de l'autorité que je tiens de Dieu [...] Qu'ils aillent donc au combat contre les infidèles - un combat qui vous verra engagé et qui mènera de l'achèvement en récompense, ceux-là qui jusqu'ici s'adonnaient à des paix privées et abusives, au grand dam des fidèles ! Qui ils soient dévoués des chevaliers du Christ, ceux-là qui n'hésitent que des brigands [...] Ce sont les récompenses éternelles qu'ils vont gagner !

Prise de Chartres, Histoire du pillage des Proses à Jérusalem, XII<sup>e</sup> siècle.

**2 Un appel au djihad**

Les infidèles mènent encore avec ardeur le djihad contre les musulmans ; ceux-ci en revanche font preuve de manque d'énergie et d'esprit d'union dans les guerres, chacun essayant de laisser cette tâche aux autres. Alors les Francs sont-ils prêts à conquérir des territoires beaucoup plus grands qu'ils n'en avaient eu l'intention, notamment et enfin leurs habitants [...] Il s'arrête donc qu'en cas de nécessité la guerre sainte devient un devoir d'obligation personnelle, comme à l'heure actuelle où ces troupes-ci fondent à l'improvisé sur le territoire musulman. Tous musulmans qu'il soit riche ou pauvre doit s'engager contre elles. Appliquez vous à remplir le principe de la guerre sainte ! Prêchez vous assistance les uns les autres afin de protéger votre religion et vos frères !

Titre et futur inventé de Domini, Poème de djihad, vers 1095.

**3 La prise de Jérusalem en 1099**

(Manuscrit, manuscrit français du XIII<sup>e</sup> siècle, BNF, Paris.)

Godefroy de Ty (chancelier du royaume de Jérusalem) raconte ainsi la prise de la ville : « On voyait tomber de tous côtés de nombreux victimes, les têtes détachées des corps s'amoncelaient là et là, et déjà l'on ne pouvait passer dans les rues qu'à travers des montagnes de cadavres. »

**4 Les affrontements en Méditerranée (jusqu'en 1291)**

**5 Le sac de Constantinople par les croisés (1204)**

Afin de punir aux Vénitiens la révolte de la Méditerranée, les croisés pillent la capitale de l'Empire byzantin.

Tenant leurs chevaux qui étaient accoutumés au tumulte de la guerre, au son de la trompette et de l'opéra dessous, les renomés se mirent à piller les maisons et les églises [...] Et bien ! Ils brûlèrent scandaleusement les saintes images ! Et bien ! Ils jetèrent dans des lieux malins les reliques<sup>1</sup> des martyrs du Christ [...] Ces précurseurs de l'Antichrist s'emparèrent des vases sacrés pour en arracher les pierres et les autres ornements, et ils en faisaient des coupes à boire [...] Quant à la profanation de la grande figure Sainte Sophie, comment en parler sans frémir ? Ils fracassèrent la table de l'autel qui avait fait faire de diverses matières précieuses, et si ce les partageait avec tous les autres biens nombreux et opulueux de l'Église [...] C'étaient là les hommes qui avaient pris la croix sur leurs épaules et porté sur elle et sur les saintes terres de traverser les terres des chrétiens sans verser le sang [...] Il est bien clair que sous couvert de défendre le Saint-Sépulcre, c'étaient des enragés contre le Christ. \*

Nicolas Chosat (1195-1215, vénitien et historien byzantin), Histoire, édition XIII<sup>e</sup> siècle.

**6 Partez de cette carte pour apprendre à défendre le Saint-Sépulcre !**

**7 Le territoire du Christ**

**QUESTIONS**

D. Doc. 4 Durant quelle période l'Asie est-elle reprise aux musulmans ?

D. Doc. 5 Pour quelles raisons le pape appelle-t-il à la croisade ? Que promet-il aux croisés ?

D. Doc. 6 Décourez le trajet de la première croisade.

D. Doc. 2 et 4 Quelles transformations les croisés apportent-ils au Proche-Orient ?

D. Doc. 3 Selon ce tableau, comment s'impliquent les croisés dans les croisades ? Quel est ce qui rend le djihad obligatoire ?

D. Doc. 4 et 5 Quelle est la particularité de la question posée par l'homme qui interroge le pape ? Comment les barbares perçoivent-ils alors les croisés ?

**BILAN** Réalisez un schéma sur les affrontements en Méditerranée :

- reproduisez trois rectangles pour les trois civilisations : Occident chrétien, Empire byzantin, Pays d'Orient
- identifiez les deux causes des croisades : à rattacher à l'Occident chrétien :
- reliez les trois rectangles avec des flèches légendées indiquant les affrontements.

**1. Trois civilisations**

**2. Croisades et djihad**

**3. L'expansion catholique (1071-1099)**

**4. Régions dominées catholiques**

**5. États latins d'Orient (après 1099)**

**Carte interactive**

### Title: Crusade and Jihad

Starting at the end of the 8th century, the Christian reconquest of the Iberian Peninsula began, known as the Reconquista. From the late 11th century onward, the Pope initiated the Crusades to reclaim and hold Jerusalem. These military expeditions disrupted the geopolitical balance and prompted Muslim authorities to revive the obligation of jihad.

#### 5 historical sources

- 1 The call of Pope Urban II
- 2 The Conquest of Jerusalem (drawing)
- 3 Call for Jihad (text)
- 4 Conflict in the Mediterranean (until 1240) (Maps)
- The plunder of Constantinople by the Crusaders (text)

European Textbooks: France Review

May 2025

## Jews within the National Fabric

---

### Example 4

*History, Grade 11, 2019 • Hatier pp.48-49*

The omission of Napoleon's pivotal actions toward the Jewish community, which were instrumental in shaping the French model of Jewish identity, significantly downplays the strong presence and influence of Jews during his era. By neglecting these key developments, the historical narrative loses a critical dimension that highlights how Napoleon's policies not only integrated Jews into French society but also set the foundation for the unique French-Jewish identity that emerged during this period.

The textbook emphasizes Napoleon Bonaparte's introduction of numerous reforms that had a lasting impact on France, Europe, and the world. He reformed the French administration, codified French law through the Napoleonic Code, implemented a new education system, and established the first French central bank. However, his policies in relation to the Jewish community are not referenced by the textbook. One of his significant contributions was the implementation of civil and religious equality for Protestants and Jews, which was groundbreaking at the time. In this context, Napoleon laid the foundations for a unique model of citizenship for Jews in France by convening the "Great Sanhedrin" in 1806. This assembly brought together Jewish religious and lay leaders to discuss the integration of Jews into French society while maintaining their religious identity. The creation of the Great Sanhedrin was a pivotal moment in the history of French Jewry, as it symbolized a formal acknowledgment of Jews as equal citizens and their integration into the national fabric.<sup>24</sup> This paved the way for the Jewish religious institutions, the "Consistoire" regulating the religious affairs of the Jewish community, until this day.

There appears to be no valid reason for excluding Napoleon's actions toward the Jewish community as an additional historical insight.

[See the next page for the continuation of the example.]

---

<sup>24</sup> L'organisation Française des cultes et le statut des minorités pp. 404-411

# L'ordre napoléonien (1799-1815)

► Quels changements Napoléon Bonaparte met-il en œuvre en France et en Europe ?

## A Le nouvel ordre politique en France

### 1. Napoléon Bonaparte, consul puis empereur

- Bonaparte, premier des trois consuls, s'impose très vite comme le véritable maître du pouvoir : en 1799, la **Constitution de l'an VIII** lui donne un rôle considérable au sein du Consulat.
- En 1802, Bonaparte se fait proclamer **consul à vie par plébiscite**. Puis, en décembre 1804, il se fait sacrer empereur par le pape Pie VII. Devenu Napoléon I<sup>er</sup>, il se comporte désormais comme un roi, organise une cour impériale et reconstitue une noblesse d'**Empire** (sans priviléges). Les Assemblées perdent toute importance.
- Napoléon instaure rapidement une forme de **diktature** : arrestation des opposants politiques ; contrôle de la population par la police et ses nombreux informateurs ; surveillance de la correspondance privée ; censure des journaux et des livres.

### 2. L'ordre et la paix civile

- Dès le début du Consulat, l'**administration** est réorganisée de manière à renforcer l'autorité du gouvernement. Bonaparte **centralise** le pouvoir entre ses mains : il désigne un **préfet** à la tête de chaque département à la place des assemblées élues, et nomme les juges ainsi que les maires des grandes villes. Le préfet nomme quant à lui les maires des petites villes.
- Bonaparte maintient les **acquis de la Révolution** en confirmant l'égalité devant la loi ou la vente des biens du clergé. Il établit des règles juridiques claires entre les individus et communes à tous (**Code civil, 1804**). ► **Point de passage, p. 41**
- Les premiers **lycées publics**, créés en 1802, forment des fonctionnaires dociles et qualifiés. La **légion d'honneur** récompense les mérites militaires ou civils et permet à Bonaparte de s'attacher l'élite de la nation. Il crée aussi la **Banque de France** (1800) et une nouvelle monnaie stable, le franc germinal (1803).
- Bonaparte mène une **politique de réconciliation nationale**. Il rallie les catholiques à son régime en signant le **Concordat de 1801** avec le pape Pie VII. Il rappelle les **nobles** qui avaient émigré pendant la Révolution et leur offre des postes dans l'administration. Mais il s'entoure aussi d'**anciens révolutionnaires**.

*The Napolean Order (1799-1815)*

*What are the changes Napoleon brings to France and Europe?*

*A new political order in France*

*2. Order and civil peace*

*Bonaparte leads a policy of national reconciliation. He rallies the Catholics to his regime...he brings back the nobles who left during the revolution*

### Example 5

**History Geography, Geopolitics, and Political Science, Grade 11, (2019) updated for 2024**  
**Magnard pp.226-227**

The Dreyfus Affair is a central historical event covered in French textbooks in at least two contexts. One is in reference to the Republican project in History classes where antisemitism is emphasized, and the second appears in History Geography, Geopolitics, and Political Science classes where a different angle is offered, namely in the context of the role of the press in shaping public opinion and historical events.

The Grade 11 History Geography, Geopolitics, and Political Science textbook (Magnard) minimizes the antisemitic core of the Dreyfus Affair. It does offer a comprehensive class on the Dreyfus Affair but fails to mention the antisemitism that was integral to the controversy. It only states that "In contrast to the Dreyfusards, who fight in the name of justice and truth, the anti-Dreyfusards defend the honor of the army and fuel a virulent antisemitic campaign against the "Jew Dreyfus." Most other textbooks explored the antisemitic core of the Affair, rather than limiting it to a campaign.

JALON 1

## L'AFFAIRE DREYFUS ET LA PRESSE

En révélant la condamnation du capitaine Dreyfus pour espionnage et en relançant l'enquête, les journaux contribuent à transformer un fait divers judiciaire en véritable affaire d'État qui passionne l'opinion. Quel rôle la presse a-t-elle joué dans la mobilisation de l'opinion publique durant l'affaire Dreyfus ?

**1 Repères chronologiques**

Décembre 1894	Le capitaine Dreyfus est condamné à la déportation sur l'île du Diable pour espionnage.
Novembre 1896	Publication par <i>Le Matin</i> du bordereau ayant permis de condamner Dreyfus qui entraîne l'identification du coupable, Esterhazy, par le colonel Picquart.
Janvier 1898	Acquittement d'Esterhazy. En publiant « J'accuse ! » à la une de <i>L'Aurore</i> , Émile Zola relance l'affaire.
Juillet	Picquart est emprisonné ; Émile Zola condamné pour son article s'exile à Londres.
Août	Jean Jaurès écrit une série d'articles sur l'affaire dans <i>La Petite République</i> .
Juillet 1899	Esterhazy reconnaît sa culpabilité dans un récit publié dans <i>Le Matin</i> .
Septembre	Dreyfus, condamné au terme de son second procès, est gracié.



**2 « Le traître »**

Une du *Le Petit Journal*, le 13 janvier 1898.  
*Le Petit Journal*, quotidien parisien d'information, qui titre ici sur la dégradation d'Alfred Dreyfus, tire à près d'un million d'exemplaires à la fin du XIX<sup>e</sup> siècle.

**Title:** The Dreyfus Affair and the Press

**Intro:** By revealing that Captain Dreyfus had been convicted of espionage and re-launching the investigation, the newspapers helped to transform a judicial misdemeanor into a genuine affair of state that aroused public passion. What role did the press play in mobilizing public opinion during the Dreyfus Affair?

**Example 6**

***History Geography, Geopolitics, and Political Science, Grade 11, (2022) Hachette pp.286-287***

The textbook's historical linkage between Theodore Herzl's coverage of the Dreyfus Affair and the rise of Zionism is an exemplary way of demonstrating the interconnection between these pivotal events.

By highlighting how Herzl's exposure to the rampant antisemitism during the Dreyfus Affair galvanized his vision for a Jewish homeland, the textbook effectively illustrates the profound impact of this episode on the emergence of modern Zionism. This connection not only enriches students' understanding of both the Dreyfus Affair and Zionism but also underscores the broader historical forces that shaped the Jewish struggle for self-determination.

In Grade 11 Specialty History, Geography, Geopolitics, and Political Science, the Dreyfus Affair is examined through its impact on the relationship between public opinion and the press. However, this focus runs the risk of overshadowing the underlying antisemitic elements, as highlighted in the previous example. In this textbook (Hachette), the authors wisely include a brief excerpt from Theodore Herzl, in which he reflects on the antisemitism he observed during the Affair and how it inspired him to advocate for establishing a Jewish state. This inclusion is an important educational choice that effectively creates historical interconnectedness, enhancing the reader's understanding of this significant historical event.

[See the next page for the continuation of the example.]

## 2 La montée de l'antisémitisme dans la presse française au moment de l'affaire Dreyfus

Theodor Herzl est un journaliste viennois d'origine juive qui couvre l'affaire Dreyfus. Devant l'antisémitisme qu'il voit en France, pays qui pourtant a émancipé et intégré les Juifs dès 1790, il prend conscience de la nécessité de créer un État juif pour les persécutés, et fonde en 1897 le mouvement sioniste.

La France d'aujourd'hui est antisémite, cela ne fait pas de doute. *Le Figaro*, l'un des journaux les plus riches et les plus influents, qui avait pendant un certain temps pris la défense de Dreyfus, fut contraint par l'opinion publique à capituler. Le rédacteur en chef a dû démissionner pour ne pas mettre en danger l'existence même du journal. Et pourtant, un journaliste de l'importance du rédacteur en chef du *Figaro* est bien plus libre et plus indépendant qu'un député, dont la popularité est bien instable. Les scandales parlementaires de ces dernières années avaient considérablement diminué leur prestige. Oseraient-ils, même s'ils pensaient autrement, s'opposer aux passions de la population ? Les élections approchent et il est facile de prévoir que l'antisémitisme en sera le cheval de bataille. Des conservateurs à l'extrême gauche, on n'entend qu'un seul cri : « Contre les Juifs ! ». C'est une ambiance des temps d'émeute et ceux que cette affaire intéressera en premier lieu sont sourds et aveugles ; ils pensent toujours que cela passera. Certes, tout se passe, mais de quelle manière ?

D'après T. Herzl, « La situation en France », *Die Welt*, 24 décembre 1897, trad. L. Vogel, Éd. Fédération sioniste de France, 1958.

Information dependent on the opinion: Dreyfus affair.

Degradation of Dreyfus (front of newspaper).

Rise of Antisemitism in the French press during the time of the Dreyfus Affair.

Theodor Herzl, a Viennese journalist of Jewish origin, covered the Dreyfus Affair. Witnessing the antisemitism in France—a country that had emancipated and integrated Jews since the 1790s—he realized the necessity of creating a Jewish state for the persecuted. In 1897, he founded the Zionist movement text from “The Situation in France” *Die Welt* 24 December 1897

Famous Caricature

Front page of an anti-Dreyfuss newspaper

## Example 7

**Moral and Civic Education, Grade 10, lelivrescolaire.fr 2019, pp. 522-523**

### Antisemitism is downplayed as a form of discrimination.

This Moral and Civic Education textbook (*lelivrescolaire*) includes a section titled “*Fighting Racist and Antisemitic Discrimination*.” While the title and introduction explicitly mention antisemitism, they fall short of providing a thorough exploration of the topic. Wording and framing are crucial, and presenting racism and antisemitism merely as general forms of discrimination is problematic and fails to specify its relationship to Jews as a minority. Even more concerning is the absence of a focused case study of antisemitism, which would provide a more concrete understanding of the issue. This is particularly important because Moral and Civic Education classes are designed to reinforce the core values of the French Republic, in which defending minorities and combating prejudice and discrimination is crucial to promoting and upholding the principles of freedom.

The screenshot shows a page from a French Moral and Civic Education textbook for Grade 10. The title of the section is "Lutter contre les discriminations racistes et antisémites". The page includes several boxes with text, images, and icons related to the topic of discrimination.

**Section 1: Le rôle des réseaux sociaux**

Text: "Tentative d'enlèvement à Lognes, toujours le même mode opératoire, antisémitisme blanc avec trois hommes costauds. Ils sont chez nous pour nous à vous enfants. « Ça message », publié mardi 27 mars sur Facebook, ressemble à beaucoup d'autre qui ont circulé en ligne ces derniers jours. Sur Facebook, Snapchat ou encore Twitter, la rumeur évoque « des vagues d'agressions de gosses », un risque de « prostitution » et de « trafic d'organes » dans différentes villes d'Ile-de-France. Résultat : des Roma ont été victimes d'agressions ces derniers jours en Seine-Saint-Denis, [...] Dans la plupart des cas, les messages relaying la rumeur incluent les instructions à « faire monter ». « C'est n'est pas une fake news », affirme Fux. [...] Ces rumeurs, qui ont débouché sur des agressions ces derniers jours, ont donc pour principal terrains de diffusion les réseaux sociaux. Ce qui affirme l'association SOS Racisme, qui a interpellé ces plates-formes mardi : « Nous appellen donc Twitter, Snapchat, Facebook et [les forums] Jeunesses.com à leurs responsabilités ! Des vies sont en jeu, vous devez supprimer les contenus haineux et dénoncer les auteurs. » [...] ». La question est délicate. En ce qui concerne les réseaux sociaux de supprimer les rumeurs et fausses informations ? C'est ce que va décider de ce qu'écrit de la vérité ou du mensonge ?

Text: "Margaux Tard, « Agresseurs de Roma à cause d'une rumeur : la responsabilité anticipée des réseaux sociaux », LeMonde.fr, 27 mars 2018.

**Section 2: Le racisme anti-asiatique**

Text: "Dong Chouen, homme de 49 ans d'origine chinoise, est décédé vendredi 12 avril des suites des blessures liées à l'agression qu'il a subie en pleine rue, à Aubervilliers, le 7 avril dernier. [...] Le racisme anti-asiatique, au contraire des autres formes de racisme, est un racisme silencieux qui approuve et prône une impunité insidie dans certaines quartiers. Il doit être combattu avec la même force et la même détermination que doivent faire l'antisionisme et les autres formes de racisme. Il suffit d'entendre certains commentaires des Jeux olympiques devant des athlètes asiatiques pour comprendre le poids des idées reçues et la haine à l'égard de nos compatriotes d'origine asiatique."

Text: "Article de la Ligue Internationale Contre le Racisme et l'Antisémitisme, « Au-delà des frontières : le racisme anti-asiatique hier », lire.org, 16 août 2018.

**Vocabulaire**

- Antisionisme : haine des Juifs.
- Discrimination : mal à soi.
- Homophobie : haine des homosexuels.
- Racisme : fait de considérer qu'il existe une hiérarchie entre les groupes humains, de systématiquement considérer un groupe humain inférieur au groupe humain.

**Section 3: Lutter contre le racisme : que dit la loi ?**

Text: "Sous peine d'un an d'emprisonnement et de 45 000 euros d'amende l'intera commettre par les mêmes moyens envers une personne ou un groupe de personnes à raison de leur origine ou de leur appartenance ou de leur non-appartenance à une ethnie, une nation, une race ou une religion déterminante.

Text: "Le 29 juillet 1991, article 22 (injures en vigueur). La provocation, la diffamation ou l'insulte non publique commise envers une personne ou un groupe de personnes à raison de leur origine ou de leur appartenance ou de leur non-appartenance, crise ou rappelle, à une ethnie, une nation, une province, race ou une religion déterminante est punie d'une amende de 1 500 euros [...] et des peines complémentaires suivantes : l'introduction de dommages ou perte, pour une durée de trois ans au plus, une arme servant à assassinat ; [...] le travail d'intérêt général pour une durée de vingt à cent vingt heures ; l'obligation d'assécher, le cas échéant à ses frais, un siège de citoyenneté.

Text: "Code pénal, Article 162 bis-1.

**Section 4: Analyser une action (Bac, 1)**

Text: "1. Quel message veut faire passer l'affiche ?

Text: "2. En ligne, cherchez une action organisée lors de la Semaine d'éducation et d'actions contre le racisme puis présentez-la à la classe.

**Section 5: L'analyse**

Text: "1. Avez-vous élaboré des actions intéressantes ?

Text: "2. Pourquoi ne pas aller plus loin ? Organiser une action (affiche, exposition, conférence, etc.)

Text: "3. Dans la prochaine Semaine d'éducation et d'actions contre le racisme,

**Annexe 2: Général les libertés, étendre les libertés : les libertés en débat**

[See the next page for the continuation of the example.]

**EMC Activité 2**

# Lutter contre les discriminations racistes et antisémites

**Axe 2 : Garantir les libertés, étendre les libertés : les libertés en débat**

- ▶ Chap 1. Libertés, égalités, discriminations
- ▶ Chap 2. L'exercice de la liberté
- ▶ Chap 3. Libertés en question

**COMPÉTENCES**

- ▶ Être capable de considérer les autres dans leur diversité et leurs différences.
- ▶ Être rigoureux dans ses recherches et ses traitements de l'information.

Le racisme revêt différentes formes dans la société française : racisme lié aux origines, islamophobie, antisémitisme, etc. Après les attentats terroristes de 2015, les actes racistes et antisémites ont fortement augmenté en France, tandis qu'Internet permet la banalisation des propos racistes et antisémites. Comment lutter contre ces formes de discriminations ?

**Après avoir étudié les documents, vous analyserez une action organisée dans le cadre de la Semaine d'éducation et d'actions contre le racisme et l'antisémitisme.**

*Title: Fighting Racist and Antisemitic Discrimination*

*Racism takes various forms in French society: racism based on origins, Islamophobia, antisemitism, etc. After the 2015 terrorist attacks, racist and antisemitic acts increased significantly in France, while the internet has facilitated the normalization of racist and antisemitic remarks. How can we combat these forms of discrimination?*

1. the role of social media: the item relates to a fake story about Romanians trying to kidnap people
2. Discrimination in access to a job: a graph showing that Mohammed needs to send 20 resumes to get a job while Michel only 5 and Dov 7.
3. Anti-Asian racism - a story about an Asian man who died from aggression on the street.
4. The Law against discrimination.
5. Poster from a campaign against racism and antisemitism with a quote from Saint-Exupery.

## The Holocaust

---

### Example 8

***History Geography, Geopolitics and Political Science, Grade 12, (2023) Hachette, pp.216-217***

In this Grade 12 Specialty History, Geography, Geopolitics, and Political Science textbook, World War II is covered in extensive detail. However, almost all mentions of the extermination of Jews are linked with the killing of the Roma. Students are not provided with adequate information that differentiates and explains these atrocities in greater detail, namely the distinct genocidal policies targeting each population. While the Holocaust and the Porajmos share similarities as genocides perpetrated by the Nazi regime, they differ significantly in ideological motivations, scope, recognition, and execution. The Holocaust was marked by a systematic, global effort to exterminate Jews, driven by deep-seated antisemitic ideology. In contrast, the genocide of the Roma, while equally brutal, was less systematically pursued and historically under-recognized. These differences highlight the complexity of Nazi racial policies and the varied experiences of targeted communities.

Linking both populations deprives students of a nuanced historical understanding of the specific contexts and ideologies behind these atrocities and the uniqueness of the Shoah in the European context.



### Example 9

**History Geography, Geopolitics and Political Science, Grade 12, Magnard (2020), pp.194-195**

In the French educational system, the Holocaust (referred to as "La Shoah" in French) is taught as a key historical event and a crucial part of understanding the broader context of World War II, antisemitism, and human rights. The curriculum covers the rise of Nazi ideology and the mechanisms of genocide; the events of the Holocaust, including the persecution, deportation, and extermination of six million Jews and other targeted groups; the role of the Vichy regime in collaborating with Nazi Germany, particularly in the deportation of Jews from France; the moral and ethical implications of the Holocaust, including discussions on human rights, racism, and antisemitism.

The Holocaust is studied in great depth in High School, often within the context of European history, the development of totalitarian regimes, and human rights. High school students engage in more complex discussions about the implications of the Holocaust, the importance of remembrance, and its ongoing impact on society.

The Vichy Regime's collaborationist policies and antisemitic decrees are extensively covered in the curriculum. However, neither Vichy nor the infamous Rafle du Vel d'Hiv are mentioned in the separate chapter on memory and justice in this textbook (Magnard), where students are encouraged to explore ways to remember and learn from historical sites of memory. The Memorial to the 'Unknown Jewish Martyr' in Paris is detailed, yet it lacks a connection to the specific experiences of the Jewish victims of deportation in France (see insert). This omission is also evident in discussions of the memory of the Shoah in literature and film, where the collaborationist chapter of France's history is absent from the material provided to students. This limited focus misses an opportunity to fully engage students in understanding the long-term impact of Vichy policies on contemporary French society and the importance of acknowledging historical injustices as part of the national narrative.

[See the next page for the continuation of the example.]

## 2 La montée de l'antisémitisme dans la presse française au moment de l'affaire Dreyfus

Theodor Herzl est un journaliste viennois d'origine juive qui couvre l'affaire Dreyfus. Devant l'antisémitisme qu'il voit en France, pays qui pourtant a émancipé et intégré les Juifs dès 1790, il prend conscience de la nécessité de créer un Etat juif pour les persécutés, et fonde en 1897 le mouvement sioniste.

La France d'aujourd'hui est antisémite, cela ne fait pas de doute. *Le Figaro*, l'un des journaux les plus riches et les plus influents, qui avait pendant un certain temps pris la défense de Dreyfus, fut contraint par l'opinion publique à capituler. Le rédacteur en chef a dû démissionner pour ne pas mettre en danger l'existence même du journal. Et pourtant, un journaliste de l'importance du rédacteur en chef du *Figaro* est bien plus libre et plus indépendant qu'un député, dont la popularité est bien instable. Les scandales parlementaires de ces dernières années avaient considérablement diminué leur prestige. Oseraient-ils, même s'ils pensaient autrement, stopper aux passions de la population ? Les élections approchent et il est facile de prévoir que l'antisémitisme en sera le cheval de bataille. Des conservateurs à l'extrême gauche, on n'entend qu'un seul cri : « Contre les Juifs ! ». C'est une ambiance des temps d'émeute et ceux que cette affaire intéressera en premier lieu sont sourds et aveugles ; ils pensent toujours que cela passera. Certes, tout se passe, mais de quelle manière ?

D'après T. Herzl, « La situation en France », *Die Welt*, 24 décembre 1897, trad. L. Vogel, Ed. Fédération sioniste de France, 1958.

Title: Function of Memorials

The Memorial to the Unknown Jewish Martyr in Paris

"The Memorial to the Unknown Jewish Martyr represents a kind of national as well as international anachronism due to its early establishment and serves as a model due to its design. In April 1943, [Isaac Schneersohn] founded the Center for Contemporary Jewish Documentation (CDJC) on Bizanet Street in Grenoble. [He] gathered all possible archives, produced studies of great historical value, and organized the first European conference on genocide. However, these efforts seemed insufficient to its founder. Thus, the idea was born to build a memorial tomb, with its pantheon-museum. Schneersohn invented a concept, which has today become the norm for all memorials: the grouping in the same place of a library, an archive center, and a memorial. The day after the inauguration [1953], a debate opened in the Knesset [Israeli Parliament]. "All the members who spoke agreed that Jerusalem was the only appropriate place for the construction of a memorial for the victims of Nazism." The "Law on the Remembrance of Heroes and Martyrs," promulgated on August 19, 1953, created an organization, Yad Vashem. This law has two parts. The first lists what must be commemorated: the 6 million victims, the annihilated families, the destroyed synagogues, the annihilated communities, the Righteous who helped save the Jews. The second assigns to Yad Vashem the responsibility for memory and commemoration: centralization of documentation, initiative, and direction of the construction of monuments. Memorials have sprung up around the world, the most significant by far being the Holocaust Memorial in Washington, which has notably undertaken a gigantic microfilming operation of all the archives concerning the genocide of the Jews. It testifies to the centrality of the United States in the memory of the Shoah. But it also shows that the memorial landscape of such an event cannot be described within the framework of a single national territory."

\*Annette Wieviorka, "The Representation of the Shoah in France: Memorials and Monuments," in Jean-Yves Boursier (ed.), \*War Museums and Memorials\*, © EMSH, 2005.

## Jews and the Israeli-Palestinian Conflict

### Example 10

*History, Geography, Geopolitics and Political Science, Grade 12. Hachette 2020, pp. 144-145*

In Grade 12 specialty Political Science textbooks, students learn about the Arab-Israeli conflict. The curriculum fails to provide a comprehensive background on the necessity for the state's creation, offering only vague explanations such as, "In the 19th century, Zionism emerged as a movement to establish a state to protect Jews from European antisemitism." Additionally, the language used can be misleading, referring to Jewish immigrants as "Zionist settlers," which may carry unintended connotations.

**JALON**

Du conflit israélo-arabe au conflit israélo-palestinien : les tentatives de résolution, de la création de l'État d'Israël à nos jours

**ÉTUDE**

### Israël face aux États arabes (1948-1979)

Le 14 mai 1948, David Ben Gourion proclame l'indépendance de l'État d'Israël dans un contexte d'extrême tension entre colons sionistes et Arabes palestiniens. Cette proclamation entraîne l'attaque conjointe des États arabes voisins : Liban, Syrie, Égypte, Transjordanie, Irak. Cette première guerre israélo-arabe inaugure une série de quatre conflits interétatiques sur trois décennies et structure durablement le conflit israélo-palestinien.

➤ Quels sont les différents enjeux des conflits israélo-arabes ?

#### *Israel in the face of Arab States (1948-1979)*

*On May 14, 1948, David Ben-Gurion declared the independence of the State of Israel in a context of extreme tension between Zionist settlers and Palestinian Arabs. This proclamation led to a joint attack by neighboring Arab states: Lebanon, Syria, Egypt, Transjordan, and Iraq. This first Arab-Israeli war marked the beginning of a series of four interstate conflicts over three decades and has durably shaped the Israeli-Palestinian conflict.*

### Example 11

**History, Geography, Geopolitics and Political Science, Grade 12. Hachette 2020, pp. 144-145**

The text provides a broad overview but lacks depth in explaining why specific peace efforts failed or succeeded. For example, the reasons behind the ineffectiveness of the UN's efforts and the challenges faced during the bilateral negotiations could be elaborated. It also omits the Khartoum Resolution of the Arab League, issued on September 1, 1967, which declared that there would be no peace, no recognition, and no negotiations with Israel following the Six-Day War. It emphasized the continued state of belligerency and the Arab commitment to reject any diplomatic or peaceful resolution with Israel at that time.

The text oversimplifies the reasons for the failure of peace efforts by attributing them mainly to the exclusion of extremists like the terrorist organization Hamas which in turn is defined as an armed movement and not as a terrorist organization.

More historical context could be provided for the peace efforts mentioned. For example, explaining the background and implications of Security Council Resolution 242, the details of the Camp David Accords, and the specific provisions of the Oslo Accords would enrich the narrative.

#### C • Une paix impossible à trouver

... De nombreux plans de paix sont proposés pour apaiser les relations entre Israël, les États arabes voisins et les Palestiniens: cessez-le-feu, conventions d'armistice, conférence de conciliation, accords de paix. On distingue deux phases dans leur histoire.

... De 1948 aux années 1970, l'ONU dirige des négociations multilatérales qui conduisent à des paix négatives - seule la résolution 242 du Conseil de sécurité de 1967 servira de base à un éventuel règlement du conflit. L'irrésolution de l'ONU et les faiblesses de la sécurité collective, l'affaiblissement de l'Union soviétique puis sa disparition, le sentiment d'Israël de vivre dans un monde qui lui est globalement hostile apparaissent alors comme des obstacles majeurs à la résolution du conflit.

... Le cadre multilatéral laisse place, à partir de 1973, à des négociations bilatérales menées sous l'égide américaine. Déjà impliqués dans les accords onusiens de désengagement militaire en 1973-1974, les États-Unis sont à l'origine des accords de Camp David entre l'Égypte et Israël (1978), de l'accord de paix entre le Liban et Israël (1982) et surtout des accords d'Oslo entre Israël et l'OLP (1993). Plus efficaces, ces traités n'aboutissent pas cependant à une véritable paix positive car ils excluent les extrémistes de chaque bord: ultra-nationalistes israéliens, extrémistes arabes, **Hamas** palestinien.

[See the next page for the continuation of the example.]

**C • An Impossible Peace to Find**

Numerous peace plans have been proposed to ease relations between Israel, neighboring Arab states, and the Palestinians: ceasefires, armistice conventions, conciliation conferences, and peace agreements. Their history can be divided into two phases.

From 1948 to the 1970s, the UN-led multilateral negotiations that resulted in negative peace—only Security Council Resolution 242 from 1967 served as a basis for a potential conflict resolution. The UN's indecisiveness, the weaknesses of collective security, the weakening and eventual collapse of the Soviet Union, and Israel's sense of living in a generally hostile world were major obstacles to resolving the conflict.

Starting in 1973, the multilateral framework gave way to bilateral negotiations under American auspices. Already involved in the UN's military disengagement agreements of 1973-1974, the United States was behind the Camp David Accords between Egypt and Israel (1978), the peace agreement between Lebanon and Israel (1982), and especially the Oslo Accords between Israel and the PLO (1993). Although more effective, these treaties did not lead to a true positive peace as they excluded extremists on both sides: Israeli ultra-nationalists, Arab extremists, and the Palestinian Hamas.

**Example 12**

**History, Geography, Moral and Civic Education, Grade 12, 2020, lelivrescolaire.fr, pp. 126**

The statement that the UN proposed a partition plan and civil war immediately broke out oversimplifies the sequence of events. It obliterates the fact that the plan was accepted by Israel but refused by the Arab League.

In addition, the text frames Zionism solely as a response to European antisemitism, which is accurate but incomplete. It should also mention the cultural and religious motivations that were part of the Zionist movement. To provide a balanced perspective, the text could acknowledge the perspectives of the Arab population in Palestine, who saw the influx of Jewish immigrants and the partition plan as a threat to their national aspirations.

## 1948 : la naissance de l'État d'Israël

Depuis la fin du XIX<sup>e</sup> siècle s'est développé le sionisme, un mouvement réclamant la création d'un État juif afin de protéger les Juifs de l'antisémitisme européen. En 1947, dans un contexte tendu marqué par de nombreuses violences, alors que le mandat anglais sur la Palestine se termine bientôt, l'ONU propose un plan de partage du territoire entre populations juives et arabes. La guerre civile éclate immédiatement entre ces deux populations. Le 14 mai 1948, David Ben Gurion proclame l'indépendance de l'État d'Israël.

- 1897 : Premier congrès sioniste à Bâle
- 1917 : Déclaration Balfour
- 1947 : Plan de l'ONU
- 14 mai 1948 : Naissance d'Israël

*Since the late 19th century, Zionism, a movement advocating for the creation of a Jewish state to protect Jews from European antisemitism, has developed. In 1947, in a tense context marked by numerous acts of violence, as the British mandate over Palestine was coming to an end, the UN proposed a plan to partition the territory between Arab and Jewish populations. Civil war immediately broke out between these two populations. On May 14, 1948, David Ben-Gurion declared the independence of the State of Israel.*

## Conclusion

---

Overall, French textbooks adhere to UNESCO standards of peace and tolerance in education and reflect a strong effort to promote democracy, human and civil rights, and freedom from racism, prejudice, and discrimination as the main values of the French Republic.

The report focused on five key themes, offering examples of how Jews, Judaism, and Jewish history are represented in the ministry Cycle 3 curriculum (2023) Grades 10-12 History, Specialty History, Geography, Geopolitics and Political Sciences and Moral and Civic Education textbooks. While this report does not offer an exhaustive analysis, it clearly highlights significant gaps in the coverage of these subjects within French education.

In the chapter addressing Jews within Christian and Muslim contexts, we observed a tendency to omit or downplay the role of Jews as active participants in the cultural, social, and political spheres. Their contributions to Mediterranean and European history during the Middle Ages were substantial. Acknowledging and studying prominent Jewish cultural figures—such as philosophers, poets, and scientists—highlights their significant impact on society and underscores the integral role of Jewish people in shaping the broader cultural landscape.

The textbooks' omission of Crusader violence against Jewish communities and the resulting economic harm misses an opportunity to provide a more nuanced understanding of the persecution Jews faced during this era, particularly in communities that had previously been flourishing centers of creativity. The textbook also overlooks the complex internal debates within Crusader leadership regarding the treatment of Jewish communities. For instance, Bernard de Clairvaux, a leading figure of the Second Crusade, traveled to the Rhineland to dissuade Crusaders from forcibly converting Jews, arguing that they were "the flesh and bones of the Lord." Despite his interventions, the Crusade era remained a horrific period for Jews, marked by widespread persecution, forced conversions, economic devastation, and massacres. Including these details would enrich the historical narrative and provide a fuller picture of the challenges Jewish communities faced during this tumultuous period.

In exploring the theme of Jews as part of the national fabric, the omission of Napoleon's role in institutionalizing the Jewish community—through the convening of the Grand Sanhedrin and the establishment of the *Consistoire Israélite de France*—overlooks a pivotal moment in understanding how France integrated its religious minority. This omission denies students the opportunity to grasp how the state played a direct role in shaping Jewish identity within the French context, crafting a unique framework that defined the relationship between Jewish citizens and the broader nation. The establishment of these institutions not only formalized Jewish communal life in France but also represented a significant step in the broader narrative of Jewish emancipation in Europe, highlighting the complex interplay between national identity and religious affiliation.

When teaching the Dreyfus Affair through the lens of its impact on public opinion and the press, there is a risk of overlooking the deeply antisemitic nature at the heart of the controversy, as evident in the Magnard textbook. The affair was not merely a clash between the media and public perception but a profound manifestation of the pervasive antisemitism in French

society. Moreover, the coverage of the affair by journalist Theodor Herzl, who was galvanized by the incident to spearhead the Zionist movement, provides a compelling example of historical interconnectedness. The Dreyfus Affair also offers a valuable opportunity to explore the complexities of French-Jewish identity, particularly in the context of integration and emancipation. The fact that Dreyfus, a Jewish man, could rise to the rank of Captain in the French army underscores the successes of Jewish integration into French society. Yet, his persecution also reveals the fragility of that acceptance and the persistent undercurrents of prejudice. This duality makes the Dreyfus Affair a crucial topic for discussing the nuanced realities of Jewish life in France during this period.

When teaching about the Holocaust, the persistent coupling of it with the persecution of the Roma can obscure the distinct differences between these two genocides. It is crucial to acknowledge the atrocities committed against the Roma and the unique aspects of the *Shoah* without engaging in a comparison of suffering or diminishing either experiences. It was characterized by a systematic, industrialized extermination of Jews, driven by an ideology that sought their total annihilation. Understanding the specific historical, ideological, and logistical underpinnings of the *Shoah* allows for a more accurate historical perspective. By distinguishing these differences, educators can provide a deeper, more nuanced understanding of both tragedies, ensuring that the unique features of each genocide are not lost in a broader narrative.

When addressing the issue of justice and memory, the textbook under scrutiny downplayed the French role in the persecution of Jews and the collaboration with Nazi occupiers. To engage in a more effective and honest process of remembrance, it is not sufficient to merely learn about these dark chapters of history; it is also crucial to critically reflect on them and actively incorporate this reflection into memorial practices. True remembrance involves acknowledging the past and its implications, understanding the societal conditions that allowed such atrocities to occur, and ensuring that these lessons are integrated into the collective memory. This deeper engagement fosters a more comprehensive and responsible approach to memory work, one that confronts uncomfortable truths and helps prevent the repetition of such horrors.

In addressing the fight against antisemitism, the textbooks under analysis appear to reduce antisemitism to a mere form of discrimination, which fails to capture the harsh realities faced by Jews, particularly during periods of crisis. This oversimplification does not do justice to the violent and often existential threats that Jews and their institutions have historically encountered. Antisemitism is not merely a form of prejudice; it is a deeply ingrained societal pathology that has led to physical attacks, systemic oppression, and widespread persecution, especially during times of social and political turmoil. By downplaying the severity and complexity of antisemitism, the textbook risks obscuring the true dangers it poses, and the resilience required to confront and combat it. A more accurate portrayal would emphasize the historical and contemporary realities of antisemitism as a potent and destructive force rather than merely another form of discrimination.

The final theme centers on Israel, which is predominantly depicted through the lens of its ongoing conflict. Unfortunately, this portrayal often lacks the essential historical context surrounding the establishment of the state. For instance, terminology such as 'Zionist settlers' is used to describe

the Jewish population in the pre-state era. In the same example, Palestinians are mentioned and implicitly presented as native, whereas Jews are not. While this language may have been descriptive of the period it refers to, it carries significant negative connotations in contemporary discourse. This choice of words can lead to misunderstandings or misinterpretations of the complexities of Israel's history and the diverse narratives that shape its societal landscape today. A more nuanced approach that acknowledges the historical, social, and political dimensions would provide learners with a deeper understanding of Israel's past and present.

## Policy Recommendations

---

Textbook authors, typically a group of experienced teachers, follow the official curriculum when writing textbooks. However, there are no specific guidelines for addressing Jewish history and Judaism within the curriculum. To affect meaningful change in how Jews and Judaism are represented in French textbooks, it is essential to engage with decision-makers within the Ministry of Education. Once the official curriculum is established, textbook writers conduct thorough historical research to align with the ministry's guidelines.

### Recommendations for Teachers:

1. Teachers should follow a simple yet essential principle: whenever Jews appear in textbook narratives, often portrayed in contexts of victimization or passivity, it presents an opportunity for deeper exploration. Such portrayals imply that, while Jews were integral to the social fabric, textbook authors have largely emphasized how others treated them, rather than highlighting their active roles and contributions. When encountering such one-dimensional representations, educators need to take a moment to conduct additional research and explore how Jews actively contributed to the society, culture, and economy of that particular time and place. By doing so, teachers can provide students with a more balanced and accurate understanding of Jewish history, highlighting the significant roles Jews have played as agents of change, innovation, and resilience throughout history. This approach not only enriches the historical narrative but also fosters a more nuanced appreciation of the diverse ways in which Jewish communities have shaped and been shaped by the societies in which they lived.
  
2. Regarding the examples highlighted in our report, teachers have a valuable opportunity to enhance their students' critical thinking skills. By encouraging students to examine the position of the Jewish minority within historical narratives, educators can prompt them to explore the nature of interactions between Jews and the broader society. Students should be guided to question why Jewish communities are often relegated to the margins of these narratives. This inquiry can lead to a deeper understanding of how history is constructed, whose perspectives are prioritized, and the reasons behind the exclusion or minimization of certain groups. By fostering this level of critical analysis, teachers can help students develop a more nuanced and comprehensive view of history, one that recognizes the importance of minority voices and challenges the dominant narratives that have often overlooked them.

### Recommendations for Policymakers:

1. Establish a committee composed of a historian specializing in French history, a history teacher, and a specialist in French Jewish history. This committee would be tasked with developing a policy paper that provides specific recommendations for incorporating Jewish history into the broader context of French history. The focus should be on highlighting the interconnectedness of both histories, emphasizing that Jewish history is an integral and inseparable part of the French historical narrative.

2. The committee would also be responsible for creating sample lessons that demonstrate how French history can be enriched by systematically and comprehensively including the contributions and experiences of Jews in France. These lessons should aim to present Jews not merely as a distinct or isolated community but as active participants and contributors to the broader tapestry of French history. By doing so, the curriculum would reflect a more accurate and inclusive portrayal of the past, ensuring that the role of Jews is recognized as a fundamental component of the French historical experience.
3. Effective teacher training is a critical factor in shaping how Jewish history is introduced and integrated into broader history curricula. Educators are not only responsible for delivering content but also for shaping students' perceptions, sensitivities, and understanding of complex historical narratives. Without adequate training, teachers may lack the confidence, background knowledge, or pedagogical tools needed to present Jewish history with accuracy, depth, and nuance. Jewish educational organizations—particularly those with long-standing expertise in both education and community engagement—can play a pivotal role in this effort. Institutions such as the Alliance Israélite Universelle, which has been committed to the promotion of Jewish education and values since the 19th century, are well positioned to contribute. Through teacher seminars, curriculum development, and interfaith dialogue initiatives, such organizations can provide both content and context, fostering a more informed and balanced educational approach.

## Recommendations for Textbook Authors:

1. Portray Jews as Active Historical Agents, Not Solely as Victims

In many current history and civic education textbooks, Jewish individuals and communities are often presented through a limited and passive lens, most commonly as victims of discrimination, persecution, or genocide—particularly in reference to the Holocaust. While the accurate portrayal of these tragic chapters is essential, this singular focus risks obscuring the broader and richer historical presence of Jews as dynamic participants and contributors to society over time.

Throughout history, Jews have been active agents in shaping the political, cultural, economic, and intellectual landscapes of the societies in which they lived. In the context of France, this includes their roles as traders and community leaders in pre-French Gaul, their intellectual engagement and legal advocacy during the Enlightenment, their participation in the revolutions of the 19th century, and their involvement in shaping the fabric of modern French republicanism. Jewish resistance movements during World War II—both in France and across Europe—are often underrepresented, despite their crucial role in the fight against fascism. Likewise, the contributions of Jews to post-war French society in areas such as politics, science, philosophy, literature, and education are rarely highlighted.

In addition, references to key historical events involving Jews—such as the 1492 expulsion from Spain or the reception of the Hebrew Bible during the Renaissance—are frequently

presented as isolated facts or minor footnotes, without a full exploration of their significance or the agency of Jewish communities in responding to and shaping these moments. This minimal treatment perpetuates a narrative in which Jews are acted upon, rather than actors within the broader currents of history.

To provide a more balanced and inclusive historical narrative, it is vital that educational materials integrate the voices, perspectives, and achievements of Jewish individuals and communities. This includes not only acknowledging their suffering but also celebrating their creativity, resilience, and leadership across different eras and societies. By doing so, textbooks can foster a deeper understanding of the complexity and diversity of Jewish life, and help students appreciate the central role Jews have played in shaping both national and global history.

## 2. Integrate Jewish History into Core Narratives, Not Sidebars

In many history textbooks, significant events in Jewish history—such as the 1791 emancipation of Jews in France, the Dreyfus Affair, or the 1656 readmission of Jews to England—are either entirely omitted or included in peripheral sidebars, supplementary boxes, or optional readings. This editorial choice sends a subtle but powerful message: that Jewish history is separate from, and somehow less integral to, the broader national or European story. It reinforces a perception of Jewish communities as marginal to the main historical flow, rather than deeply embedded within it. Such treatment not only diminishes the role of Jews in shaping modern societies, but it also misses key opportunities to use Jewish experiences as windows into larger historical processes. For example, the 1791 emancipation of the Jews by the French National Assembly was not simply a “Jewish event”—it was a landmark moment in the evolution of Enlightenment thought, citizenship, and the emergence of secular republican values. Similarly, the Dreyfus Affair is not just a chapter in Jewish history, but a profound crisis of justice and national identity that shook the foundations of the French Republic and fueled the birth of modern human rights discourse. Moreover, the practice of isolating Jewish experiences from the central curriculum perpetuates the idea that Jewish life exists only at the edges of national narratives, emerging solely in moments of persecution or controversy. This does a disservice not only to Jewish history, but also to the pedagogical goals of inclusion, complexity, and critical thinking.

## 3. Connect Jewish Experiences to Contemporary Relevance and Local Contexts

**Rationale:** Jewish history is often presented in isolation (e.g., Holocaust as a standalone tragedy) or without links to students’ lives, missing chances to reinforce citizenship education and historical continuity. Local Jewish heritage (e.g., synagogues, communities) and modern parallels (e.g., inclusion debates) are overlooked.

These recommendations address the core issues of absence, passivity, isolation, and disconnection in the portrayal of Jews across the curricula. By portraying Jews as active agents within core narratives, using engaging stories and sources, and linking to contemporary and local contexts, textbook authors can create a richer, more inclusive history.

This document outlines several recommendations for more inclusive and accurate representation of Jews and Judaism in history curricula. It identifies key historical moments where Jewish presence, thought, and contributions can be better highlighted—not as isolated episodes, but as integral parts of broader historical narratives. Below are specific periods and contexts where such integration could be enriched.

## 1. The Rise of Monotheism (Antiquity)

**Current Gap:** Judaism is often framed solely as a precursor to Christianity, with little attention to its independent theological and cultural evolution.

**Recommendations:**

Balance the Narrative: Highlight the development of rabbinic Judaism, especially through the compilation of the Mishnah and Talmud after 70 CE, as evidence of a

- vibrant post-Temple religious life.

Show Jewish Agency and Diversity: Include examples of Jewish sects during the Second Temple period, as well as Jewish involvement in trade, scholarship, and governance

- within the Roman Empire.

Expand Context: Situate Judaism within the broader Near Eastern religious milieu.

Emphasize the continuity of Jewish communities, particularly after the Edict of Caracalla

- (212 CE), which granted citizenship to many Jews in the Roman world.

**Example:**

Time Period: 4th century BCE – 4th century CE

Context: Mediterranean Antiquity curriculum centers on Greek and Roman legacies.

Judaism fades after Christianity's rise.

Recommendation: Include Philo of Alexandria as a figure blending Jewish and Hellenistic thought. Feature a diaspora map (e.g., Alexandria, Rome) showing Jewish presence and influence.

## 2. Jews in France Before France (Pre-10th Century)

**Current Gap:** Jewish communities in Roman Gaul and early medieval France are often overlooked.

**Recommendations:**

Integrate Local Heritage: Use archaeological sites, ancient synagogues, and community records to illustrate the long-standing Jewish presence in French territories.

- Emphasize Contributions: Discuss Jews as merchants, physicians, and landowners under rulers like Charlemagne.

**Example:**

Time Period: 1st – 9th centuries CE

Context: Early medieval period often omits non-Christian populations.

Recommendation: Feature Jewish life in Lyon or Marseille, showing how Jews contributed to early economic and intellectual development.

### 3. Medieval Interactions and the Crusades

**Current Gap:** Jewish experiences are underrepresented, particularly during periods of upheaval like the Crusades.

**Recommendations:**

Highlight Jewish Roles: Emphasize Jewish participation in Mediterranean trade,

- especially in places like Al-Andalus and Venice.

Address Persecution: Use chronicles like that of Solomon bar Simson to discuss Jewish resilience during the 1096 Rhineland massacres.

**Example:**

Time Period: 11th–15th centuries

Context: Bernard of Clairvaux is mentioned, but Jewish voices are largely missing

Recommendation: Include Cairo Geniza records and personal accounts to humanize and contextualize Jewish experiences.

### 4. Atlantic Opening and the 1492 Expulsion

**Current Gap:** The expulsion of Jews from Spain is framed as a Christian geopolitical act, ignoring post-expulsion Jewish agency.

**Recommendations:**

Trace the Diaspora: Show how Sephardic Jews rebuilt communities in the Ottoman

- Empire and Amsterdam.

Global Contributions: Highlight Jewish roles in trade networks, science, and diplomacy—

- e.g., Joseph Nasi in the Ottoman court.

**Example:**

Time Period: Late 15th century

Context: Focuses on colonization, omitting Jewish migration and global impact.

Recommendation: Use maps and excerpts (e.g., Samuel Usque's writings) to portray Sephardic resilience and influence.

### 5. Renaissance and Humanism

**Current Gap:** Jewish intellectuals are nearly absent from discussions of the Renaissance.

**Recommendations:**

Include Jewish Thinkers: Present Judah Abravanel's dialogues alongside Erasmus as

- part of the humanist movement.

Show Jewish Printing Innovations: Highlight Daniel Bomberg's Talmud printing in

- Venice as a milestone in the spread of knowledge.

**Example:**

Time Period: 15th–16th centuries

Context: Renaissance is taught through Christian lenses.

Recommendation: Feature a printed page of the Bomberg Talmud with context on Jewish involvement in the printing revolution.

## 6. The Enlightenment and Haskalah

**Current Gap:** Jews are often excluded from Enlightenment discourse, despite being a key test case for modern concepts of tolerance.

**Recommendations:**

Include the Haskalah: Present Moses Mendelssohn as an Enlightenment figure engaging

- with rationalism and Jewish identity.

Highlight the 1791 Emancipation: Frame it as an outcome of Enlightenment ideals,

- using primary sources such as Abbé Grégoire's advocacy.

**Example:**

Time Period: 18th century

Context: Focuses on figures like Rousseau and Voltaire.

Recommendation: Contrast Mendelssohn and Voltaire's ideas on religion and freedom to prompt classroom discussion.

## 7. French Revolution and Napoleonic Emancipation

**Current Gap:** Jewish emancipation is treated passively, if at all.

**Recommendations:**

Use Primary Documents: Include the 1791 decree granting Jews citizenship. Feature the

- 1806 Napoleonic Sanhedrin to show Jewish engagement in redefining their legal status.

Connect to Broader Ideals: Show how Jewish emancipation reflects republican values

- of equality and secularism.

**Example:**

Time Period: 1789–1815

Recommendation: Include illustrations and excerpts from revolutionary debates with questions like: "How were Jews integrated into the new France?"

## 8. Industrialization, Colonialism, and the Crémieux Decree

**Current Gap:** Jewish roles in 19th-century France and its colonies are minimized.

**Recommendations:**

Show Economic Participation: Highlight Jewish contributions in banking and textiles.

- Discuss Colonial Implications: Use the Crémieux Decree (1870) to explore complex colonial identities and the differentiated treatment of Jews and Muslims in Algeria.

**Example:**

Time Period: 19th century

Recommendation: Map Jewish communities in colonial territories and discuss implications of French citizenship.

**9. The Dreyfus Affair and Republican Identity**

**Current Gap:** Often reduced to a legal scandal, without deeper engagement in social, political, and cultural dimensions.

**Recommendations:**

- Highlight Antisemitism and Resistance: Examine how the Affair fueled both antisemitic movements and Jewish political thought (e.g., Herzl's Zionism).
- Show Jewish Integration: Use figures like Léon Blum to illustrate Jewish participation in French republicanism.

**Example:**

Time Period: 1894–1906

Recommendation: Include Zola's *J'Accuse...!* and Jewish newspaper clippings to offer varied perspectives on justice and identity.

**10. Jewish Life Before the Holocaust: Context, Culture, and Early Persecution**

**Current Gap:** Jewish existence in Europe prior to the Holocaust is often reduced to a prelude to destruction, omitting vibrant cultural, intellectual, and social life.

**Recommendations:**

- Showcase Jewish Cultural Contributions: Introduce students to Jewish life in interwar Europe, with examples such as Yiddish theater, the flourishing of Jewish journalism, and contributions in science and philosophy (e.g., Albert Einstein, Martin Buber).
- Provide Context for Nazi Antisemitism: Examine the legal and social discrimination of Jews before the Holocaust, such as the Nuremberg Laws (1935), through primary sources like Victor Klemperer's diaries or Jewish newspapers. This helps students understand the gradual erosion of rights and social belonging.
- Humanize Through Emigration Case Studies: Trace the experience of Jewish families who fled Germany in the 1930s, showing both the bureaucratic barriers to asylum and the personal resilience involved in starting anew.

**Pedagogical Tools:**

Diaries, newspaper clippings, and early Nazi propaganda posters

Classroom discussion: "What were the warning signs?"

Map activity tracking Jewish migration routes out of Nazi Germany

**11. The Establishment of the State of Israel**

**Current Gap:** The founding of Israel is often presented as a byproduct of post-Holocaust

international guilt, with limited treatment of the historical process or internal developments.

**Recommendations:**

- Detail Pre-State Institutions and Social Structures: Include the role of the Yishuv (Jewish community in pre-state Palestine), the Haganah (defense force), kibbutzim, and the Hebrew language revival as key steps toward statehood.
- Teach the 1947 UN Partition Plan and 1948 War with Nuance: Show competing narratives while grounding them in historical documents, such as UN Resolution 181, the Israeli Declaration of Independence, and Arab League statements.
- Explore the Character of the Emerging Society: Highlight themes of immigration, integration of Holocaust survivors, Mizrahi Jews, and state-building challenges in economy, education, and defense.

**Pedagogical Tools:**

Primary sources: Israeli Declaration of Independence (annotated), UN partition map, photographs from early statehood

Biography study: Golda Meir, David Ben-Gurion, or Henrietta Szold

Discussion prompt: "How does a society build itself from multiple diasporas?"

**Conclusion**

Across all these historical contexts, Jewish experiences should not be relegated to the margins or simplified as victimhood narratives. Instead, curricula should portray Jews as active historical agents—thinkers, traders, citizens, and political actors—deeply embedded in the fabric of local, national, and global histories. By integrating Jewish history into the core of textbook narratives rather than the sidelines, we enrich not only the portrayal of Jewish life but also the broader understanding of world history.

## Our Methodology

is designed to consider every detail within the textbooks; it does not paraphrase, rely on interpretations, or attempt to illustrate preconceived notions.

The following is an updated, condensed version of the IMPACT-se UNESCO-derived standards for peace and tolerance in school education:



**IMPACT-se applies methodological standards which are based on UNESCO and UN declarations, and international recommendations and documents on education for peace and tolerance. (see notes)**

1

### Respect

The curriculum should promote tolerance, understanding and respect toward the “Other,” his or her culture, achievements, values and way of life. [1]

2

### Individual Other

The curriculum should foster personal attachment toward the “Other” as an individual, his or her desire to be familiar, loved and appreciated. [2]

3

### No Hate

The curriculum should be free of wording, imagery and ideologies likely to create prejudices, misconceptions, stereotypes, misunderstandings, mistrust, racial hatred, religious bigotry and national hatred, as well as any other form of hatred or contempt for other groups or peoples. [3]

4

### No Incitement

The curriculum should be free of language, content, and imagery that disseminate ideas or theories which justify or promote acts and expressions of violence, incitement to violence, hostility, harm and hatred toward other national, ethnic, racial or religious groups. [4]

5

### Peacemaking

The curriculum should develop capabilities for non-violent conflict resolution and promote peace. [5]

[1] As defined in the Declaration of Principles on Tolerance Proclaimed and signed by Member States of UNESCO on November 16, 1995, Articles 1, 4.2. See also the UN Declaration on the Promotion among Youth of the Ideals of Peace, Mutual Respect and Understanding Between Peoples (1965), Principles I, III. Universal Declaration of Human Rights (1948): Education shall be directed to the full development of human personality and to the strengthening of respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms. It shall promote understanding, tolerance and friendship among all nations, racial and religious groups and shall further the activities of the United Nations for the maintenance of peace.

[2] The goal of education for peace is the development of universally recognized values in an individual, regardless of different socio-cultural contexts. See Ibid., Article 6. See also, on exchanges between youth, the UN Declaration on the Promotion among Youth of the Ideals of Peace, Mutual Respect and Understanding between Peoples (1965), Principles IV, V.

[3] Ibid., and based on Articles III.6, IV.7 and VII.39; and on the Integrated Framework for Action on Education for Peace, Human Rights and Democracy, approved by the General Conference of UNESCO at its twenty-eighth session, Paris, November 1995, Article 18.2.

[4] As defined in Article 4 of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (ICERD), adopted by the United Nations General Assembly Resolution 2106 (XX) on December 21, 1965. See also Article 20 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR), adopted by the United Nations General Assembly Resolution 2200A (XXI) on December 16, 1966.

[5] Based on the Integrated Framework for Action on Education for Peace, Human Rights and Democracy, approved by the General Conference of UNESCO at its twenty-eighth session, Paris, November 1995, Article 9; and on the Declaration of Principles on Tolerance proclaimed and signed by member states of UNESCO on November 16, 1995, Article 5.

**6****Unbiased Information**

Educational materials (textbooks, workbooks, teachers' guides, maps, illustrations, aids) should be up-to-date, accurate, complete, balanced and unprejudiced, and use equal standards to promote mutual knowledge and understanding between different peoples. [6]

**7****Hate Gender Identity and Representation**

The curriculum should foster equality, mutual respect, and should aim for equal representation between individuals regardless of their gender identity. It should also refrain from language, content, and imagery that depicts limiting and/or exclusionary gender roles. [7]

**8****Sexual Orientation**

The curriculum should be free of language, content, and imagery that promulgates violence or discrimination on the basis of sexual orientation. [8]

**9****Sound Prosperity and Cooperation**

The curriculum should educate for sound and sustainable economic conduct and preservation of the environment for future generations. It should encourage regional and local cooperation to that effect. [9]

[6] Based on UNESCO recommendation concerning education for international understanding, cooperation and peace and education relating to human rights and fundamental freedoms, adopted by the General Conference at its eighteenth session, Paris, November 19, 1974, Article V.14.

[7] The preamble to the Declaration of Principles on Tolerance proclaimed and signed by member states of UNESCO on November 16, 1995, notes the Convention on the Elimination of Any Form of Discrimination against Women and emphasizes respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms for all, without distinction as to gender.

[8] Based on Resolutions 32/2 (adopted June 30, 2016) and 17/19 (adopted July 14, 2011) of the UN Human Rights Council, and numerous UN General Assembly resolutions expressing concern and condemnation of laws and practices around the world which target individuals based on their gender identity and/or sexual orientation for discrimination, violence, and even extrajudicial, summary or arbitrary executions—all of which contradict the most basic principles of the UN and have no place in education.

[9] Based on UNESCO recommendation concerning education for international understanding, cooperation and peace and education relating to human rights and fundamental freedoms, adopted by the General Conference at its eighteenth session, Paris, November 19, 1974, Articles III.6, and IV.7. On the imperative for developing "systematic and rational tolerance teaching methods that will address the cultural, social, economic, political and religious sources of intolerance," see the Declaration of Principles on Tolerance proclaimed and signed by member states of UNESCO on November 16, 1995, Article 4.2. On education for international cooperation, see also the UN Declaration on the Promotion among Youth of the Ideals of Peace, Mutual Respect and Understanding between Peoples (1965), Principle II.

## List Of Textbooks

---

1. History and Geography Grade 10 HACHETTE 2022
2. History, Geography, Geopolitics and Political science Grade 11 HACHETTE 2022
3. History, Geography, Geopolitics and Political science Grade 12 HACHETTE 2023
4. History and Geography Grade 10 HATIER 2023
5. History, Geography, Geopolitics, and Political Science Grade 11 HATIER 2019
6. History Grade 11 HATIER 2019
7. History and Geography Grade 12 HATIER 2023
8. History Grade 10 lelivrescolaire.fr 2019
9. History Grade 11 lelivrescolaire.fr 2019
10. History Geography Moral and Civic Education Grade 12 lelivrescolaire.fr 2019
11. History and Moral and Civic Education Grade 12 lelivrescolaire.fr 2020
12. History Grade 10 MAGNARD 2019
13. History, Geography, Geopolitics and Political science Grade 11 MAGNARD 2019
14. History, Geography, Geopolitics and Political science Grade 12 MAGNARD 2020
15. Moral and Civic Education Grades 10-11-12 MAGNARD 2020