Pragmatics of Rust and C++: The implementation of a window manager

Max van Deurzen

June 20, 2021

Technische Universität München

Agenda

Agenda

- 1. What is *Pragmatics*?
- 2. The Common Objective
- 3. External Dependency Management
- 4. Main Event Loop
- 5. Input Bindings
- 6. Clients
- 7. Results
- 8. Discussion

Pragmatics

Definition Pragmatics

1. Syntax

Set of rules that define the *structure* and *composition* of allowable symbols into correct statements or expressions in the language

2. Semantics

The *meaning* of these syntactically valid statements or expressions

3. Pragmatics

"...[T]he third general area of language description, referring to practical aspects of how constructs and features of a language may be used to achieve various objectives."

Robert D. Cameron, 2002

1. **Syntax** (*structure*)

$$x = y * 3;$$

2. Semantics (meaning)

- X
 Location in memory
- y * 3
 Computation of a value based on an expression
- x = y * 3;
 Store result of expression evaluation in location in memory

3. **Pragmatics** (purpose)

Which objectives are assignment statements used for?

- Setting up a temporary variable used to swap the values of two variables
- Modifying some part of a compound data structure
- ...

The Common Objective

Case Study: The implementation of a window manager

- System Software
 - Low-level
 - Platform-specific
- Medium to Large-Sized
 - Increased Risk of Code Smells
 - Monolithic classes
 - Global data
 - High interdependence (Coupling)
 - ..
- Event-Driven
 - Reacts to windowing system events
 - Deterministic event dispatch

Case Study: The implementation of a window manager

- External Dependency Management
 - Package management
 - Abstracting and decoupling
- Main Event Loop
 - Windowing system events
 - Internal events
 - Event dispatch
- Input Bindings
 - Storing and retrieving callable objects
- Clients
 - Distributed, mutable state

Case Study: The implementation of **two** window managers

- Same structure
 - Built on top of the X Window System
 - Library to communicate with the X server as external dependency
- Same behavior
 - ICCCM and EWMH compliant
 - Reparenting, tiling
- Different languages
 - One implemented in C++: WMCPP
 - One implemented in Rust: WMRS

External Dependency Management

External Dependency Management

Practicalities of working with external code

- 1. Package management
 - Availability of external code
- 2. Decoupling dependencies
 - Maintainability of external code

Managing the availability of external code

- The ability to aid the programmer in assuring availability
 - Automatically download and compile source code
 - Built-in version control
 - Conflict detection
- Part of the ecosystem of a language
 - Installed with its compiler or development environment
- A must for any modern programming language

- No official package manager
- Ad hoc package management
 - Third-party package management tools
 - Conan
 - Vcpkg
 - build2
 - Custom configure and build scripts
 - Let the user manage the dependencies themselves (e.g. through their distribution's package manager)
- Example: Make script

```
CXXFLAGS := -std=c++20 -march=native -03
LDFLAGS := `pkg-config --libs x11 xrandr` -flto
SRC_FILES := $(wildcard src/*.cc)
OBJ_FILES := $(patsubst src/%.cc,obj/%.o,${SRC_FILES})
all: ${OBJ_FILES}
    g++ ${OBJ_FILES} ${LDFLAGS} -o bin/wmCPP
Obj/%.o: src/%.cc
    g++ ${CXXFLAGS} -MMD -c $< -o $@</pre>
```

- Cargo, Rust's official package manager
 - Automatically downloads and compiles dependencies
 - A Rust project is a Cargo package
 - A package is a collection of source files plus a manifest file
 - The manifest file describes the package's *meta-information*, *dependencies*, and a set of *target crates*
 - A crate represents a library or binary executable program
- Example: Cargo.toml manifest file

```
[package]
name = "wmRS"
version = "0.1.0"
edition = "2018"
license = "BSD3"
default-run = "core"
description = """
An ICCCM & EWMH compliant X11
reparenting, tiling window manager,
written in Rust
"""
```

```
[lib]
name = "winsys"
path = "src/winsys/mod.rs"
[[bin]]
name = "core"
path = "src/core/main.rs"
[[bin]]
name = "client"
path = "src/client/main.rs"
[dependencies]
x11rb = "0.8.0"
```

Managing the maintainability of external code

- The ability to decouple own code from external code
 - Changes to own code don't affect interface with external code
 - Changes to external code only affect inerface with external code
- When external code changes:
 - Only interface with external code needs to be recompiled
- When own code changes:
 - Only own code needs to be recompiled

Decouple window manager from windowing system

- 1. Hide the connection with the windowing system behind an interface
 - Provide abstraction and encapsulation
 - Describe common behavior
 - Usage is agnostic of concrete implementation
- 2. Implement the interface for each targeted windowing system
 - X Window System
 - Wayland
 - Desktop Window Manager (Windows)
 - Quartz Compositor (macOS)
 - ...
- 3. Have the window management logic call into the interface

1. Hide the connection with the windowing system behind a trait

• Zero-overhead collection of methods "What you don't use, you don't pay for [Stroustrup, 1994]. And further: What you do use, you couldn't hand code any better."

Bjarne Stroustrup

- Comparable to, but not the same as, the concept of an OOP interface
 - Implementation does not require changes to the implementor
 - Traits can be implemented on external code
 - No ambiguity when two implemented traits share method name and signature
- Can define stateless default implementations

1. Hide the connection with the windowing system behind a trait

- No inheritance, only implementation
 - No downcasting or reference casting
- Declared for some (at declare-time) unknown type Self
 - When implemented Self becomes the implementing type
- Example: WMRS's Connection trait:

```
pub trait Connection {
    fn step(&self) -> Option<Event>;
    fn move_window(&self, window: Window, pos: Pos);
    fn resize_window(&self, window: Window, dim: Dim);
    fn close_window(&self, window: Window);
    // ...
}
```

2. Implement the trait for each targeted windowing system

• Example: WMRS's XConnection structure:

```
use x11rb::connection;
pub struct XConnection<'xconn, XConn: connection::Connection> {
    xconn: &'xconn XConn,
    // ...
}
impl<'xconn, XConn: connection::Connection> Connection
    for XConnection<'xconn, XConn>
{
    fn step(&self) -> Option<Event> { /* ... */ }
    // ...
}
```

- x11rb: Rust library to interact with the X Window System
 - External dependency
 - Rust bindings to interact with the X server

3. Have the window management logic call into the interface

• Example: WMRS's core window manager logic:

```
pub struct Model<'model> {
  conn: &'model mut dyn Connection,
  // ...
}
```

- Polymorphism to abstract away from the concrete implementation
- Model contains a reference to some Connection implementor
- The trait methods of this implementor are called where needed
 - Static dispatch
 - Concrete method to call is baked into the binary
 - Dynamic dispatch
 - Concrete method to call is looked up at runtime

Static dispatch

- Concrete method to call is baked into the binary
 - Monomorphization at compile time
 - Generic code is converted into "specific" code
 - One version for each concrete type used as generic argument
 - Size of concrete type is always known
- No additional time overhead at runtime
- Example: WMRS's Cycle structure:

```
pub struct Cycle<T>
where
    T: Identify + Debug,
{ /* ... */ }
impl<T> Cycle<T>
where
    T: Identify + Debug,
{ /* ... */ }
impl<T> Cycle<T>
where
    T: Identify + Debug,
{ /* ... */ }
}
pub struct Model<'model> {
    // ...
workspaces: Cycle<Workspace>,
    // ...
}

pub struct Workspace {
    clients: Cycle<Window>,
{ /* ... */ }
}
```

Dynamic dispatch

- Concrete method to call is looked up at runtime
- Trait objects keep instances abstract until concretization is required
 - Opaque value of a type that implements some set of traits
 - Until further inspection, concrete type is unknown
 - Dynamically sized: size of underlying concrete type is not known up front
- Under the hood, 2 pointers:
 - 1 pointer to data
 - 1 pointer to virtual method table (vtable)
- Virtual method table points to that object's concrete method implementations

Dynamic dispatch

ullet Example: WMRS's XConnection's xconn reference:

```
x11rb::connection;
pub struct XConnection<'xconn, XConn: connection::Connection> {
    xconn: &'xconn XConn,
    // ...
}
```

• Example: WMRS's conn trait object:

```
pub struct Model<'model> {
    conn: &'model mut dyn Connection,
    // ...
}
```

Dynamic dispatch

• Example: WMRS's XConnection's xconn reference:

```
use x11rb::connection;
pub struct XConnection<'xconn, XConn: connection::Connection> {
    xconn: &'xconn XConn,
    //...
}
```

• Example: WMRS's conn trait object:

```
pub struct Model<'model> {
   conn: &'model mut dyn Connection,
   // ...
}
```

1. Hide the connection with the windowing system behind an abstract class

- Abstract type that cannot be implemented, only derived
- Establish common denominator between types
- Can define stateful default implementations
- Same as OOP interface when it only contains pure virtual methods
 - No associated inline logic
 - Must be implemented by inheriting subclasses
- Derived class concrete method invocation *only* through dynamic dispatch

1. Hide the connection with the windowing system behind an abstract class

• Example: WMCPP's Connection abstract class interface:

```
class Connection
{
public:
    virtual ~Connection() {}
    virtual Event step() = 0;
    virtual void move_window(Window, Pos) = 0;
    virtual void resize_window(Window, Dim) = 0;
    virtual void close_window(Window) = 0;
    // ...
};
```

- Connection contains at least 1 virtual method
 - Connection is an abstract class
- Connection has 0 inline method implementations
 - Connection is a proper OOP interface

1. Hide the connection with the windowing system behind an abstract class

- Pure virtual methods can be defined to be called statically
- Example: WMCPP's Connection's implementation:

```
#include "connection.hh"
#include "log.hh"
void
Connection::close_window(Window window)
{
    Logger::log_info("Closing 0x%#08x.", window);
}
// ...
```

2. Derive the abstract class for each targeted windowing system

• Example: WMCPP's XConnection derived class:

```
#include "connection.hh"
extern "C" {
#include <X11/Xlib.h>
// ...
}
class XConnection final: public Connection
{
public:
    void close_window(Window window) override {
        Connection::close_window(window); // non-virtual call
        // ...
}
// ...
};
```

- <X11/...>: Xlib library to interact with the X Window System
 - External dependency

3. Have the window management logic call into the interface

• Example: WMCPP's core window manager logic:

```
#include "connection.hh"
class Model final
{
public:
    Model(Connection& conn): conn(conn) { /* ... */ }
    // ...
private:
    Connection& conn;
    // ...
};
```

- Polymorphism to abstract away from the concrete implementation
- Model contains a reference to some Connection implementor
- The overridden methods of this implementor are dynamically called where needed

Additional C++ external dependency management difficulties:

- Problem: double inclusion
- Possible solution: header guards
 - Preprocessor directives
 - Include idempotence
 - Not fail-safe
 - Hard-to-trace symbol collision errors
 - #pragma once as unofficial solution
- Problem: includes are non-commutative
- Possible solution: none
- Rust's *module* system does not have these issues

Rust traits vs C++ abstract classes

- Abstract classes: inheritance
 - 1. Describe common behavior
 - 2. Code reuse
 - 3. Polymorphism
- Traits: implementation
 - 1. Describe common behavior
 - 2. Code reuse with **generics**: abstraction over different types
 - Polymorphism with trait bounds: constraints on these type abstractions

Main Event Loop

Main Event Loop

Three core stages:

- 1. Listen for windowing system events
 - Block until an event has been generated
- 2. Create windowing system agnostic event abstraction
 - Extract and bundle concrete information into abstract window manager consumable
- 3. Delegate work to different parts of the program
 - Perform window management actions based on the type of the concrete event

1. Listen for windowing system events

- 1. Concrete Connection's external dependency generates events
 - Input events
 - Map notification events
 - ...
- 2. Convert windowing system specific event information into higher-level event abstraction
 - Decouple windowing system event from window manager event
- 3. Connection::step method propagates event abstraction up to window manager logic
 - WMRS: fn step(&self) -> Option<Event>;
 - WMCPP: Event step();

2. Create windowing system agnostic event enum

- Definition of a type by enumerating its variants
- Encodes meaning
 - Associated integer called discriminant
 - Tagged union
- May attach data
 - Data can be directly associated with a variant
- Size as large as its largest variant
- Example: WMRS's Event enumeration:

```
pub enum Event {
    Mouse { event: MouseEvent },
    Key { event: KeyEvent },
    CloseRequest { window: Window },
    ScreenChange,
    // ...
}
```

2. Create windowing system agnostic event std::variant

- Definition of a type by enumerating its alternatives
- Type-safe tagged union class template
- Encodes meaning
- Contains data
 - Data can only *indirectly* be associated with an alternative
 - Strong type alias required for same-type alternatives
- Size as large as its largest variant
- Example: WMRS's Event enumeration:

```
typedef std::variant
std::monostate,
Mouse,
Key,
CloseRequest,
ScreenChange,
// ...
> Event:
struct Mouse { MouseEvent event; };
struct Key { KeyEvent event; };
struct CloseRequest { Window window; };
struct ScreenChange {};
// ...
> Event:
```

 $\label{eq:wmRS: wmCPP: wmCPP: fn step(&self) -> Option<Event>; Event step();} \\$

```
WMRS:
fn step(&self) -> Option<Event>;

pub enum Event {
    Mouse { event: MouseEvent },
    Key { event: KeyEvent },
    CloseRequest { window: Window },
    ScreenChange,
    // ...
}
```

```
WMCPP:
Event step();

typedef std::variant<
    std::monostate,
    Mouse,
    Key,
    CloseRequest,
    ScreenChange,
    // ...
> Event;
```

- match on specific type of event
 - Call appropriate handler
 - Pass encoded information to handler
- Example: WMRS's main event loop:

```
while self.running {
    if let Some(event) = self.conn.step() {
        match event {
            Event::Mouse { event, }
                => self.handle_mouse(event, /*...*/),
            Event::Key { keycode, }
                => self.handle_key(keycode, /*...*/),
            Event::CloseRequest { window, }
                => self.handle_close(window),
            Event::ScreenChange
                => self.handle_screen_change().
            // ...
```

• Example: WMRS's main event loop:

```
while self.running {
   if let Some(event) = self.conn.step() {
        // ...
   }
}
```

Equivalent to:

- Visit the alternatives in std::variant using std::visit
 - Visitor object implementing function-call operator overloads
 - std::variant instance to visit

• Example: WMCPP's visitor object:

```
struct EventVisitor
{
    EventVisitor(Model& model): model(model) {}

    void operator()(std::monostate) {}

    void operator()(Mouse event) { model.handle_mouse(event); }

    void operator()(Key event) { model.handle_key(event); }

    void operator()(CloseRequest event) { model.handle_close(event); }

    void operator()(ScreenChange) { model.handle_screen_change(); }

    // ...

private:
    Model& model;
} event_visitor = EventVisitor(*this);
```

• Example: WMCPP's visitor object:

```
struct EventVisitor
{
    EventVisitor(Model& model): model(model) {}
    void operator()(std::monostate) {}
    // ...
private:
    Model& model;
} event_visitor = EventVisitor(*this);
```

- Implicit "no valid event" encoding
- Analogous to no-op event

• Example: WMCPP's main event loop:

```
while (running)
   std::visit(event_visitor, conn.step());
```

- 1. Retrieve generated event from windowing system connection
- 2. Rely on visitor to deduce type of event
- 3. Call associated handler

- Rust and C++ achieve desired behavior
- Visiting tagged unions in C++ is more verbose, less clear in communicating intent
- Difference worsens as more complex (or pattern-reliant) situations arise

Input Bindings

Input Bindings

- Bind functionality to sets of peripheral input states
 - Mouse bindings
 - Keyboard bindings
 - Sensors
 - ...
- Hardware and platform dependent
 - Initiated by the connection with the windowing system
- Concrete input information to abstract window manager events
 - Mouse event variant
 - Key event variant
 - ..

Input Bindings

Three-step process:

- 1. Establish abstract notion of input
 - Convert concrete input states to abstract input events
 - Mouse input abstractions, keyboard input abstractions, ...
 - Windowing system specifics to window manager abstractions
- 2. Map input to window management actions
 - Input abstractions to closures
- 3. Retrieve and perform window management actions

• Example: WMRS's mouse input abstractions:

```
#[derive(Clone, Copy, PartialEq, Eq, Hash)]
pub enum MouseEventKind { Press, Release, Motion, }
#[derive(Clone, Copy, PartialEq, Eq, Hash)]
pub enum Button { Left, Middle, Right, ScrollUp, /* ... */ }
#[repr(u8)]
#[derive(Clone, Copy, PartialEq, Eq, Hash)]
pub enum Modifier {
    Ctrl = 1 << 0.
    Shift = 1 << 1,
    Super = 1 \ll 2.
   Alt = 1 << 3.
   // ...
// ...
```

• Example: WMRS's mouse input abstractions (cont.):

```
// ...
#[derive(PartialEq, Eq)]
pub struct MouseInput {
    pub button: Button,
    pub modifiers: HashSet<Modifier>,
}
#[derive(PartialEq, Eq, Hash)]
pub struct MouseEvent {
    pub kind: MouseEventKind,
    pub input: MouseInput,
    pub window: Option<Window>,
}
```

• Example: WMCPP's mouse input abstractions:

```
enum class MouseEventKind { Press, Release, Motion };
enum class Button { Left, Middle, Right, ScrollUp, /* ... */ };
enum Modifier {
   Ctrl = 1 << 0,
   Shift = 1 << 1,
   Super = 1 << 2,
   Alt = 1 << 3,
   // ...
};
// ...</pre>
```

• Example: WMCPP's mouse input abstractions (cont.):

```
// ...
struct MouseInput final {
    Button button;
    std::unordered_set<Modifier> modifiers;
};
struct MouseEvent final {
    MouseEventKind kind;
    MouseInput input;
    Option<Window> window;
};
```

```
pub type KeyAction = Box<
     dyn FnMut(&mut Model<'_>)
>;
pub type MouseAction = Box<
     dyn FnMut(&mut Model<'_>, Option<Window>) -> bool
>;
pub type KeyBindings = HashMap<
     KeyInput, KeyAction
>;
pub type MouseBindings = HashMap<
     MouseInput, MouseAction
>;
```

```
pub type MouseAction = Box<
     dyn FnMut(&mut Model<'_>, Option<Window>) -> bool
>;
// ...
```

- Box<T>: store value of type T on the heap
 - Constant size: pointer to heap address
- FnMut: closure trait that describes calling of function that mutates state
 - dyn FnMut(...): trait object (dynamic dispatch)
 - Hooks into main window manager logic
 - Operates on clicked-on window (if any)

```
#[derive(PartialEq, Eq)]
pub struct MouseInput {
    pub button: Button,
    pub modifiers: HashSet<Modifier>,
}
pub type MouseBindings = HashMap<
    MouseInput, MouseAction
>;
```

- MouseInput used as key to HashMap
 - PartialEq and Eq

```
#[derive(PartialEq, Eq)]
pub struct MouseInput {
    pub button: Button,
    pub modifiers: HashSet<Modifier>,
}
pub type MouseBindings = HashMap<
    MouseInput, MouseAction
>;
```

- MouseInput used as key to HashMap
 - PartialEq and Eq (#[derive(PartialEq, Eq)])

```
#[derive(PartialEq, Eq)]
pub struct MouseInput {
    pub button: Button,
    pub modifiers: HashSet<Modifier>,
}
pub type MouseBindings = HashMap<
    MouseInput, MouseAction
>;
```

- MouseInput used as key to HashMap
 - PartialEq and Eq (#[derive(PartialEq, Eq)])
 - Hash

```
#[derive(PartialEq, Eq)]
pub struct MouseInput {
    pub button: Button,
    pub modifiers: HashSet<Modifier>,
}
pub type MouseBindings = HashMap<
    MouseInput, MouseAction
>;
```

- MouseInput used as key to HashMap
 - PartialEq and Eq (#[derive(PartialEq, Eq)])
 - Hash (not automatically derivable)

```
#[derive(Clone, Copy, PartialEq, Eq, Hash)]
pub enum Button { Left, Middle, Right, ScrollUp, /* ... */ }
#[derive(PartialEq, Eq)]
pub struct MouseInput {
    pub button: Button,
    pub modifiers: HashSet<Modifier>,
}
```

- Hash (not automatically derivable)
 - HashSet not automatically derivable
 - Manual implementation

• Example: WMRS's MouseInput's Hash implementation:

```
#[derive(PartialEq, Eq)]
pub struct MouseInput {
    pub button: Button,
    pub modifiers: HashSet<Modifier>,
}
impl Hash for MouseInput {
    fn hash<H: Hasher>(&self, state: &mut H) {
        self.button.hash(state);
        self.modifiers.iter()
            .fold(@u8, acc, &m acc | m as u8)
            .hash(state);
    }
}
```

• Example: WMRS's MouseInput's Hash implementation:

- <H: Hasher>: hashing function's logic
 - Streaming hasher
 - State changes as data is being hashed
 - Final state is hashed value

• Example: Registering a mouse binding in WMRS:

```
let mut mouse bindings = HashMap::new():
mouse_bindings.insert(
    MouseInput {
        button: Button::Middle,
        modifiers: {
            let mut modifiers = HashSet::with capacity(2):
            modifiers.insert(Modifier::Ctrl);
            modifiers.insert(Modifier::Super):
            modifiers
        },
    Box::new(|model: &mut Model, win: Option<Window>| -> bool {
        if let Some(window) = win {
            model.set_floating_window(window);
            true
    })
);
```

2. Map input to window management actions in a std::unordered_map

• Example: WMCPP's input mappings:

```
typedef
    std::function<void(Model&)>
    KeyAction;

typedef
    std::function<bool(Model&, std::optional<Window>)>
    MouseAction;

typedef
    std::unordered_map<KeyInput, KeyAction>
    KeyBindings;

typedef
    std::unordered_map<MouseInput, MouseAction>
    MouseBindings;
```

2. Map input to window management actions in a std::unordered_map

```
typedef
   std::function<bool(Model&, std::optional<Window>)>
   MouseAction;
// ...
```

- std::function<T>: class template
 - Polymorphic function wrapper
 - Callable target
 - C++ type erasure
 - Dynamic dispatch
 - Small Buffer Optimization

2. Map input to window management actions in a std::unordered_map

```
struct MouseInput final {
    Button button;
    std::unordered_set<Modifier> modifiers;
};
typedef
    std::unordered_map<MouseInput, MouseAction>
    MouseBindings;
```

- MouseInput used as key to std::unordered_map
 - operator==
 - std::hash<MouseInput>::operator()

2. Map input to window management actions in a std::unordered_map

• Example: WMCPP's MouseInput's operator== overload:

```
struct MouseInput final {
    Button button;
    std::unordered_set<Modifier> modifiers;
};
inline bool
operator==(const MouseInput& lhs, const MouseInput& rhs)
{
    return lhs.button == rhs.button
        && lhs.modifiers == rhs.modifiers;
}
```

• Example: WMCPP's std::hash<MouseInput>::operator() implementation:

```
struct MouseInput final {
    Button button;
    std::unordered_set<Modifier> modifiers;
namespace std
    template <>
    struct hash<MouseInput>
        size t
        operator()(const MouseInput& input) const
            size_t button_hash = hash<Button>()(input.button);
            size t modifiers hash = hash<size t>()(
                accumulate(input.modifiers.begin(), input.modifiers.end(),
                    static_cast<Modifier>(0), bit_or<Modifier>())
            );
            return button_hash ^ modifiers_hash;
   };
```

• Example: WMCPP's std::hash<MouseInput>::operator() implementation:

- std::hash<T>::operator(): T's hashing function's logic
 - Hash coding hasher
 - Final state within function

- No automatic deriving of operator overloads
- Example: WMCPP's Modifier's operator| implementation:

• Example: Registering mouse bindings in WMCPP:

3. Retrieve and perform window management actions

ullet Example: WMRS's mouse event handler:

```
pub struct MouseEvent {
                                    pub type MouseBindings = HashMap<</pre>
    pub kind: MouseEventKind,
                                         MouseInput, MouseAction
    pub input: MouseInput,
                                    >;
    pub window: Option<Window>.
}
fn handle_mouse(
 &mut self,
 event: MouseEvent.
 mouse_bindings: &MouseBindings,
  // ...
  if let Some(action) = mouse_bindings.get(&event.input) {
      action(self, event.window);
 // ...
```

3. Retrieve and perform window management actions

• Example: WMCPP's mouse event handler:

```
struct MouseEvent final {
    MouseEventKind kind;
    MouseInput input;
    Option<Window> window;
};

void
Model::handle_mouse(MouseEvent& event)
{
    MouseBindings& mb = this->mouse_bindings;
    if (mb.count(event.input) > 0)
        mb.at(event.input)(*this, event.window);
}
```

Input Bindings: Remarks

- Rust and C++ achieve desired behavior
- Rust: *streaming* hasher
 - Arbitrary amount of data
 - Byte-per-byte
 - Central hash function (Hasher trait)
- C++: hash coding hasher
 - Reduced into single integer
 - · Local hash function

Input Bindings: Remarks

- Rust: operator overloading through *traits*
 - Trait bounds
- C++: non-uniform operator overloading
 - Class methods
 - Non-method functions
 - Non-method friend functions
 - Concrete templated class implementations

Clients

Second Frame

Hello, world!