

## Problem

Prove that an oracle  $C$  exists for which  $NP^C \neq coNP^C$

## Step-by-step solution

### Step 1 of 2

It is known that an oracle  $A$  exists such that  $P^A \neq NP^A$  and  $L_A \notin P^A$ . For a given oracle  $A$ ,  $L_A$  may be defined as:

$$L_A = \{w : |w| = |x| \text{ for some } x \in A\}$$

Then, it is clear that  $L_A$  is in  $NP^A$ . So, finally  $L_A \notin coNP^A$  will have to prove (that is, same as  $\bar{L}_A \notin NP^A$ ).

• For this purpose, first of all  $A$  will be constructed and  $M_1, M_2, \dots$  is now a list of all nondeterministic polytime oracle TMs, instead of all deterministic polytime oracle TMs.

---

[Comment](#)

### Step 2 of 2

**For Stage  $i$** , choose  $n$  and run  $M_i$  in input  $1^n$ . It respond NO to the query if  $M_i$  queries a string  $y$  whose status has not yet been determined.

• If there does not exist any computation and also, if  $M_i$  does not accept  $1^n$  under these conditions then  $M_i$  is forced to make a mistake. It is performed because  $A$  can be maintained permanently that contains no string of length  $n$ . Then,  $1^n \in \bar{L}_A$ , but  $M_i$  does not accept  $1^n$ .

If, on the other hand, there is an accepting computation for  $M_i$  with input  $1^n$ , then it may be noted that this accepting computation can only query polynomially many strings  $y$ .

• Hence, there is a string  $x$  of length  $n$  which this computation does not query. We specify that this string  $x$  is in  $A$  and no other string of length  $n$  is in  $A$ .

•  $M_i$  Still has the same accepting computation on input  $1^n \notin \bar{L}_A$ . So makes a mistake in this case also. So, it may be concluded from the above explanation is that, an oracle  $C$  exists for which  $NP^C \neq coNP^C$ .

---

[Comment](#)