

Peter Liberman<sup>a</sup> and Linda J. Skitka<sup>b</sup>, "Vicarious Retribution in U.S. Public Support for War Against Iraq," *Security Studies* (forthcoming, 2019).

## Online Appendix

<sup>a</sup> Political Science at Queens College and the Graduate Center of the City University of New York (liberman@qc.cuny.edu)

<sup>b</sup> Psychology and Political Science, University of Illinois at Chicago (lskitka@uic.edu)

Table A1. Confirmatory Factor Analysis of Multi-item Measures

Survey Question	Factor	Loading
How did you feel during the first few hours after learning the news about the terrorist attacks: <sup>a</sup> Angry		.85
Desire to fight back	<i>Anger9/01</i>	.88
Hatred		.81
Outrage		.83
Vulnerable		.90
Frightened	<i>Fear9/01</i>	.78
How much have your feelings about the following groups changed since September 11: <sup>b</sup> People who live in Islamic or Middle Eastern countries		.91
Palestinians	<i>Anti-Arab</i>	.89
Arab-American U.S. citizens		.84
Fire fighters		.80
American political leaders	<i>Pro-</i>	.78
Americans as a whole	<i>American</i>	.72
Police		.73
How do you feel, right now, about the events of September 11: <sup>a</sup> Angry		.87
Desire to fight back	<i>Anger1/02</i>	.83
Hatred		.79
Outrage		.81
Frightened		.89
Vulnerable	<i>Fear1/02</i>	.86
How worried are you about: <sup>c</sup> Future terrorist attacks?		.87
Getting infected with anthrax?	<i>Terror</i>	.79
Other kinds of bioterrorism?	<i>Worry</i>	.86
Please indicate your level of agreement or disagreement with the following statements: <sup>d</sup>		
The way our country can get through future crises is to get back to our traditional values, put tough leaders in power, and silence trouble makers spreading bad ideas.		.90
Our country will be great if we honor the way of our forefathers, do what authorities tell us, and get rid of the 'rotten apples' who are ruining everything.	<i>RWA</i>	.87
Our country will be destroyed someday if we do not smash the perversions eating away at our moral fiber and traditional beliefs.		.88
Our country desperately needs a mighty leader who will do what has to be done to destroy the radical new ways and sinfulness that are ruining us.		.80

Superscripted notes indicate response options: a) not at all, slightly, moderately, much, very much; b) much more positive, more positive, no change, more negative, much more negative (reversed for the *Pro-American* items); c) not at all, slightly, moderately, a lot, very much; d) strongly disagree, disagree, neutral, agree, strongly agree. Apart from the *Terror Worry* items, all items randomized beneath each question stem, and intermixed with additional items not shown here (except for *RWA*). Estimated by the Mplus 7.1 program's weighted-least-squared means- and variance-adjusted estimator, to minimize bias from categorical and non-normal data. Factor loading figures are standardized ordered probit coefficients, all significant at  $p < 0.001$ . There are no cross-factor loadings in the model (i.e., all are constrained to zero). Model statistics:  $N=595$ ; Chi-square 518.35 ( $df=266$ ),  $p < .000$ ; RMSEA=0.04; CFI=0.98; TLI=0.98; WRMR=0.936; all indicating a good fit with the data, except for Chi-square, which tends to be inflated by large samples and non-normal data, according to recommended thresholds of  $\leq 0.05$  for Root Mean Square Error of Approximation (RMSEA),  $> 0.95$  for Comparative Fit Index (CFI) and Tucker-Lewis Index (TLI), and  $< 0.95$  for Weighted Root Mean Square Residual (WRMR); see Barbara M. Byrne, *Structural Equation Modeling with Mplus: Basic Concepts, Applications, and Programming* (New York: Routledge, 2012) and Linda K. Muthén and Bengt O. Muthén, *Mplus User's Guide*. 7th ed. (Los Angeles: Muthén & Muthén, 2012)

Table A2. Zero-Order Correlations, Multi-Item Measures

	<i>Anger 9/01</i>	<i>Fear 9/01</i>	<i>Anti-Arab</i>	<i>Pro- American</i>	<i>Anger 1/02</i>	<i>Fear 1/02</i>	<i>Terror Worry</i>
<i>Fear9/01</i>	.26	—					
<i>Anti-Arab</i>	.29	.06 <sup>ns</sup>	—				
<i>Pro-American</i>	.25	.23	.13 <sup>**</sup>	—			
<i>Anger1/02</i>	.72	.25	.43	.40	—		
<i>Fear1/02</i>	.25	.68	.14 <sup>**</sup>	.27	.51	—	
<i>Terror Worry</i>	.26	.51	.22	.19 <sup>**</sup>	.45	.77	—
<i>RWA</i>	.27	.03 <sup>ns</sup>	.18	.35	.34	.21	.22

Figures are the correlations among latent variables, estimated from the CFA model detailed in Table A2. All correlations significant at  $p < 0.001$  except as noted: ns  $p > 0.10$ ; †  $p < 0.1$ ; \*\*  $p < 0.01$ .

Table A3. Predictors of support for expanding “the war on terrorism...to Iraq and any other country suspected of harboring or encouraging terrorists.”

	(1) Iraq War	(2) Iraq War	(3) Iraq War	(4) Iraq War
Anti-Arab	0.53*** (0.09)		0.46*** (0.08)	
Anger9/01	0.41*** (0.10)	0.33*** (0.09)	0.23* (0.10)	
Anger9/01 X Anti-Arab	0.22* (0.11)			
Fear	-0.14 (0.13)	-0.33* (0.14)	-0.28* (0.14)	
Fear X Anti-Arab	-0.46** (0.15)			
Terror Worry	0.13 (0.13)	0.28* (0.14)	0.17 (0.14)	
Terror Worry X Anti-Arab	0.40** (0.15)			
Pro-American		0.46*** (0.12)	0.49*** (0.11)	
Conservative		0.55* (0.23)	0.53* (0.22)	0.34 (0.52)
RWA		0.43*** (0.10)	0.40*** (0.10)	
Male		0.19† (0.11)	0.16 (0.11)	
Black <sup>a</sup>		0.00 (0.23)	0.08 (0.22)	
Age		-0.17 (0.34)	-0.24 (0.34)	
Education		-0.21 (0.34)	-0.22 (0.32)	-1.39* (0.65)
Income		0.43 (0.30)	0.32 (0.29)	
Conservative X Education				1.15 (1.04)
Constant 1	-1.55*** (0.10)	-1.23*** (0.33)	-1.42*** (0.31)	-1.57*** (0.34)
Constant 2	-0.58*** (0.07)	-0.19 (0.32)	-0.32 (0.30)	-0.67* (0.32)
Constant 3	0.25*** (0.07)	0.66* (0.31)	0.58† (0.30)	0.06 (0.32)
Log likelihood	-675.60	-650.07	-627.68	-722.90
Chi2 (df)	93.78 (7)	112.51 (11)	165.72 (12)	25.56 (3)
Pseud. R2	0.10	0.12	0.15	0.03
Observations	600	594	594	595

Two-tailed significance levels indicated by: †  $p < 0.10$ , \*  $p < 0.05$ , \*\*  $p < 0.01$ , \*\*\*  $p < 0.001$  (two-tailed)

The “strongly disagree” and “disagree” categories of the dependent variable were combined to satisfy the parallel regression assumption. Figures are unstandardized ordered probit coefficients with robust standard errors in parentheses; estimates employ sampling weights and listwise deletion of missing data.

<sup>a</sup>In preliminary models, Hispanics and “other” were not significantly different from “White, non-Hispanic,” and so these categories were collapsed in the rest of our analyses.

Table A4. Predictors of Anti-Arab, Anger9/01, and Anger1/02

	(1) Anti-Arab	(2) Anti-Arab	(3) Anti-Arab	(4) Anger9/01	(5) Anger9/01- Anger1/02	(6) Anger1/02
Anti-Arab					-0.12*** (0.03)	0.17*** (0.03)
Anger9/01	0.26*** (0.06)	0.24*** (0.06)				0.66*** (0.03)
Anger9/01 X Anti-Arab						0.07* (0.03)
Fear	-0.20* (0.09)	-0.19* (0.09)				0.50*** (0.05)
Fear X Anti-Arab						-0.09† (0.05)
Terror Worry	0.31*** (0.08)	0.30*** (0.08)				-0.10* (0.05)
Terror Worry X Anti-Arab						0.03 (0.05)
Pro-American	0.04 (0.08)	0.03 (0.08)				
Conservative	0.12 (0.15)	0.10 (0.15)	0.09 (0.34)	-0.30 (0.30)		
RWA	0.09 (0.06)	0.09 (0.06)				
Male	0.08 (0.07)	0.06 (0.07)				
Black <sup>a</sup>	-0.20† (0.11)	-0.21† (0.12)				
Age	0.08 (0.21)	0.07 (0.21)				
Education	-0.11 (0.20)	-0.11 (0.20)	-0.64 (0.46)	-1.35*** (0.37)		
Income	0.26 (0.16)	0.28† (0.16)				
Strong		0.05 (0.04)				
Conservative X Educ.			0.38 (0.76)	1.14† (0.60)		
Constant	-0.18 (0.18)	-0.34† (0.20)	0.16 (0.20)	0.43* (0.19)	-0.00 (0.03)	-0.02 (0.02)
Adjusted R <sup>2</sup>	0.163	0.165	0.017	0.052	0.035	0.794
Observations	597	593	598	598	595	595

Two-tailed significance levels indicated by: †  $p < 0.10$ , \*  $p < 0.05$ , \*\*  $p < 0.01$ , \*\*\*  $p < 0.001$ .

Figures are unstandardized linear regression coefficients with robust standard errors in parentheses; estimates employ sampling weights and listwise deletion of missing data.

<sup>a</sup>In preliminary models, Hispanics and “other” were not significantly different from “White, non-Hispanic,” and so these categories were collapsed.

Table A5. Path Model Testing Indirect Effect of September 2001 Anger on War Support,  
Mediated by Anti-Arab/Muslim Affect

Excerpted Mplus 7.11 output

#### SUMMARY OF ANALYSIS

Number of groups	1
Number of observations	597
Number of dependent variables	2
Number of independent variables	11
Number of continuous latent variables	0
Estimator	WLSMV
Maximum number of iterations	1000
Convergence criterion	0.500D-04
Maximum number of steepest descent iterations	20
Maximum number of iterations for H1	2000
Convergence criterion for H1	0.100D-03
Number of bootstrap draws	
Requested	500
Completed	500
Parameterization	DELTA

#### MODEL FIT INFORMATION

Number of Free Parameters 28

WRMR (Weighted Root Mean Square Residual)

Value 0.002

#### MODEL RESULTS

	Estimate	S.E.	Est./S.E.	Two-Tailed P-Value
IRAQ_WAR ON				
MALE	0.157	0.104	1.505	0.132
BLACK	0.086	0.169	0.508	0.611
AGE	-0.206	0.282	-0.731	0.465
EDUC	-0.167	0.259	-0.644	0.520
INCOME	0.321	0.238	1.350	0.177
CONSERV	0.500	0.185	2.705	0.007
RWA	0.392	0.080	4.877	0.000
TER_WORRY	0.144	0.117	1.234	0.217
PROAMERCN	0.448	0.092	4.842	0.000
FEAR	-0.239	0.125	-1.905	0.057
ANGER9/01	0.222	0.075	2.966	0.003
ANTI_ARAB	0.434	0.063	6.863	0.000
ANTI_ARABON				
MALE	0.076	0.061	1.237	0.216

BLACK	-0.196	0.094	-2.091	0.037
AGE	0.078	0.171	0.458	0.647
EDUC	-0.112	0.166	-0.677	0.498
INCOME	0.262	0.136	1.925	0.054
CONSERV	0.121	0.131	0.923	0.356
RWA	0.088	0.051	1.727	0.084
TER_WORRY	0.310	0.072	4.322	0.000
PROAMERCN	0.037	0.060	0.624	0.533
FEAR	-0.200	0.077	-2.591	0.010
ANGER9/01	0.259	0.048	5.423	0.000
Intercepts				
ANTI_ARAB	-0.181	0.139	-1.296	0.195
Thresholds				
IRAQ_WAR\$1	-1.313	0.232	-5.648	0.000
IRAQ_WAR\$2	-0.269	0.238	-1.134	0.257
IRAQ_WAR\$3	0.584	0.235	2.488	0.013
Residual Variances				
ANTI_ARAB	0.505	0.034	15.026	0.000

#### STANDARDIZED MODEL RESULTS

	StdYX Estimate	Std Estimate
IRAQ_WAR ON		
MALE	0.064	0.157
BLACK	0.022	0.086
AGE	-0.028	-0.206
EDUC	-0.028	-0.167
INCOME	0.059	0.321
CONSERV	0.110	0.500
RWA	0.240	0.392
TER_WORRY	0.097	0.144
PROAMERCN	0.234	0.448
FEAR	-0.157	-0.239
ANGER9/01	0.136	0.222
ANTI_ARAB	0.279	0.434
ANTI_ARAB ON		
MALE	0.048	0.076
BLACK	-0.078	-0.196
AGE	0.016	0.078
EDUC	-0.029	-0.112
INCOME	0.075	0.262
CONSERV	0.042	0.121
RWA	0.084	0.088
TER_WORRY	0.326	0.310
PROAMERCN	0.030	0.037
FEAR	-0.205	-0.200
ANGER9/01	0.247	0.259

Intercepts		
ANTI_ARAB	-0.230	-0.181

Thresholds		
IRAQ_WAR\$1	-1.075	-1.313
IRAQ_WAR\$2	-0.221	-0.269
IRAQ_WAR\$3	0.478	0.584

Residual Variances		
ANTI_ARAB	0.822	0.505

#### R-SQUARE

Observed Variable	Estimate	Residual Variance
IRAQ_WAR	0.393	0.905
ANTI_ARAB	0.178	

#### TOTAL, TOTAL INDIRECT, SPECIFIC INDIRECT, AND DIRECT EFFECTS

	Estimate	S.E.	Est./S.E.	Two-Tailed P-Value
Effects from T1ANGER_ to IRAQ_WAR				
Total	0.335	0.073	4.609	0.000
Total indirect	0.113	0.025	4.429	0.000
Specific indirect				
IRAQ_WAR ARAB_3 T1ANGER_	0.113	0.025	4.429	0.000
Direct				
IRAQ_WAR T1ANGER_	0.222	0.075	2.966	0.003

#### STANDARDIZED TOTAL, TOTAL INDIRECT, SPECIFIC INDIRECT, AND DIRECT EFFECTS

#### STDYX Standardization

	Estimate	S.E.	Est./S.E.	Two-Tailed P-Value
Effects from T1ANGER_ to IRAQ_WAR				
Total	0.205	0.042	4.827	0.000
Total indirect	0.069	0.016	4.376	0.000



# Specific indirect

IRAQ_WAR ARAB_3 T1ANGER_	0.069	0.016	4.376	0.000
--------------------------------	-------	-------	-------	-------

# Direct

IRAQ_WAR T1ANGER_	0.136	0.044	3.089	0.002
----------------------	-------	-------	-------	-------

## CONFIDENCE INTERVALS OF TOTAL, TOTAL INDIRECT, SPECIFIC INDIRECT, AND DIRECT EFFECTS

	Lower .5%	Lower 2.5%	Lower 5%	Estimate	Upper 5%	Upper 2.5%	Upper .5%
Effects from T1ANGER_ to IRAQ_WAR							
Total	0.147	0.202	0.225	0.335	0.462	0.484	0.534
Total indirect	0.050	0.066	0.073	0.113	0.156	0.165	0.178
Specific indirect							
IRAQ_WAR ARAB_3 T1ANGER_	0.050	0.066	0.073	0.113	0.156	0.165	0.178
Direct							
IRAQ_WAR T1ANGER_	0.032	0.078	0.098	0.222	0.341	0.378	0.423

## CONFIDENCE INTERVALS OF STANDARDIZED TOTAL, TOTAL INDIRECT, SPECIFIC INDIRECT, AND DIRECT EFFECTS

### STDYX Standardization

	Lower .5%	Lower 2.5%	Lower 5%	Estimate	Upper 5%	Upper 2.5%	Upper .5%
Effects from T1ANGER_ to IRAQ_WAR							
Total	0.096	0.122	0.135	0.205	0.275	0.288	0.314
Total indirect	0.028	0.038	0.043	0.069	0.095	0.100	0.110
Specific indirect							
IRAQ_WAR ARAB_3 T1ANGER_	0.028	0.038	0.043	0.069	0.095	0.100	0.110
Direct							
IRAQ_WAR T1ANGER_	0.023	0.050	0.064	0.136	0.208	0.222	0.249