

## JOURNAL ARTICLE

# Human Decisions and Machine Predictions

[Get access](#)

Jon Kleinberg, Himabindu Lakkaraju, Jure Leskovec, Jens Ludwig,  
Sendhil Mullainathan

*The Quarterly Journal of Economics*, Volume 133, Issue 1, February  
2018, Pages 237–293, <https://doi.org/10.1093/qje/qjx032>

**Published:** 26 August 2017

## Abstract

Can machine learning improve human decision making? Bail decisions provide a good test case. Millions of times each year, judges make jail-or-release decisions that hinge on a prediction of what a defendant would do if released. The concreteness of the prediction task combined with the volume of data available makes this a promising machine-learning application. Yet comparing the algorithm to judges proves complicated. First, the available data are generated by prior judge decisions. We only observe crime outcomes for released defendants, not for those judges detained. This makes it hard to evaluate counterfactual decision rules based on algorithmic predictions. Second, judges may have a broader set of preferences than the variable the algorithm predicts; for instance, judges may care specifically about violent crimes or about racial inequities. We deal with these problems using different econometric strategies, such as quasi-random assignment of cases to judges. Even accounting for these concerns, our results suggest potentially large welfare gains: one policy simulation shows crime reductions up to 24.7% with no change in jailing rates, or jailing rate reductions up to 41.9% with no increase in crime rates. Moreover, all categories of crime, including violent crimes, show reductions; these gains can be achieved while simultaneously reducing racial disparities. These results suggest that while machine learning can be valuable, realizing this value requires integrating these tools into an economic framework: being clear about the link between predictions and decisions; specifying the

scope of payoff functions; and constructing unbiased decision counterfactuals.

**JEL:** [C10 - General](#), [C55 - Large Data Sets: Modeling and Analysis](#), [K40 - General](#)

**Issue Section:** [Article](#)

© The Author(s) 2017. Published by Oxford University Press on behalf of the President and Fellows of Harvard College. All rights reserved. For Permissions, please email: [journals.permissions@oup.com](mailto:journals.permissions@oup.com)

You do not currently have access to this article.

## Signed in as

### Institutional account

Università degli Studi di Padova

## Sign in

 [Get help with access](#)

### Personal account

- Sign in with email/username & password
- Get email alerts
- Save searches
- Purchase content
- Activate purchases and trials

Sign in [Register](#)

### Institutional access

Sign in through your institution

[Sign in with a library card](#)

[Sign in with username / password](#)

[Recommend to your librarian](#)

**Institutional account management**

[Sign in as administrator](#)

**Purchase**

[Subscription prices and ordering for this journal](#)

[Purchasing options for books and journals across Oxford Academic](#)

**Short-term Access**

To purchase short-term access, please sign in to your personal account above.

Don't already have a personal account? [Register](#)

Human Decisions and Machine Predictions\* - 24 Hours access

EUR €36.00      GBP £32.00      USD \$39.00

Buy

**Rental**



This article is also available for rental through DeepDyve.