# The Relative Impact of Economics Journals: A Cross-Country Survey and Comparison

Jean-Louis Malouin and J.-François Outreville

This study provides a ranking of journals according to their quality and impact as perceived by academic economists stratified by countries (U.S.A., U.K., France, Québec) and languages (English, French).

Although the results tend to agree with the most recent findings, they also indicate differences between economists of different countries and of different languages.

### I. Introduction

Coe and Weinstock (1983) and Liebowitz and Palmer (1984) acknowledge that published research plays an increasingly important role in academic promotion decisions and in disseminating scientific information. Since the quality of an article is frequently associated with the quality of the journal in which it is published, there have been several efforts to rank journals in economics and finance using criteria such as institutional affiliation (Moore 1972), peer evaluation and journal familiarity (Hawkins, Ritter, and Walter 1973), and citation frequency (Coats 1969; Vandermeulen 1972; Billings and Viksnins 1972; Skeels and Taylor 1972; Bush, Hamelman, and Staaf 1974; Liebowitz and Palmer 1984).

The pros and cons of each criterion have been discussed in the literature (Billings and Viksnins 1972), but no consensus has been reached as to the superiority of a given criterion over the others. McDonough (1975) suggests that in fact each criterion is a valid component of a journal's quality but that each by itself provides only partial information on the quality.

This study provides a ranking of journals based on a sample of North American and European economists. The next section presents the methodology of this study. We discuss our rankings of journals in Section III, and interpret the differences among the respondents in Section IV.

Jean-Louis Malouin and J.-Francois Outreville are from the Business School, Universite Laval, Quebec, Canada.

Address reprint requests to Jean-Louis Malouin, Business School, Universite Laval, Quebec, Canada. This paper was written while the second author was at the University of Texas at Austin as a visiting scholar (May 1986).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Skeels and Fairbanks (1968) found that the quantity of publications, rather than their quality, was the most significant determinant of career advancement. Jauch and Glueck (1975) similarly concluded that the best objective measure of research performance and effectiveness was the simple count of publications modified by weighting the count by a journal quality index: "this could be accomplished by preparing a list of quality journals and counting only those publications from this list."

## II. Methodology and Sample

This study uses a two-step approach: first, we generate a list of the most familiar journals; second, we evaluate the prestige of those journals.

An initial ("step one") questionnaire with a list of 284 journals<sup>2</sup>, arranged in alphabetical order and including two dummy journals, was sent to 1045 economists selected randomly from members of the American Economic Association (600), the Royal Economic Society (150), the French Economic Association (150), and the Association of Quebec Economists (145). The all-membership sample was modified to include only academic members and to control for geographic distribution within each country. In terms of field specialization, the subjects were asked whether they considered themselves in general economics, business economics, or finance.

Country	Number of Questionnaires Mailed in Step One	Number of Respondents	Response Rate (%)
United States	600	195	32.5
Great Britain	150	66	44.0
France	150	57	38.0
Quebec	145	66	45.5
Total	1045	384	36.7

In this "step one" questionnaire, subjects were asked to indicate whether or not the following journals are known to you, if you are aware of their existence, or if they are unknown to you and to add to the list pertinent journals that could otherwise have been omitted. The purpose was to determine a "familiarity index" (known = 5 points; aware = 2 points; unknown = 0 point) in order to propose a final list of journals to be submitted for "prestige" evaluation in "step two."

From the "step one" questionnaire, the first (most familiar) 90 journals of each respondent's country were selected. This generated a list of 130 journals which were arranged in alphabetical order for the "step two" questionnaire and sent only to those subjects who had responded to the first questionnaire.

In "step two," respondents were asked this time to indicate for each journal that you know in this list, the prestige an article would obtain if published in it on the basis of a point score ranging from 20 (highest) to 0 (lowest). They were also asked to omit any journal with which you are not familiar.

## III. Evaluation of Journals—All Respondents

The results obtained from the 194 "step two" respondents (50.5% response rate) are shown in Table 1. The 112 highest ranking journals are presented in descending order of prestige (the arithmetic mean value of the responses). The standard deviation and the mode of the distributions are also given.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The method of selecting journals for inclusion in a questionnaire is critical to a study of unbiased nature. A partial list of journals prepared entirely by a researcher may omit pertinent journals with which he is unfamiliar. We avoided this problem by allowing respondents to suggest journals they consider important.

Table 1. Rating of Journals (Prestige)—All Respondents

			Standard	
Rank	Journal	Mean	Deviation	Mode
1	American Economic Review	18.4	2.9	20
2	Journal of Political Economy	18.2	2.5	20
3	Econometrica	18.2	2.7	20
1	Journal of the American Stat. Assn.	17.1	3.0	20
5	Journal of Finance	16.8	3.4	20
5	Journal of Economic Theory	16.7	3.2	20/15
7	Quarterly Journal of Economics	16.6	3.1	20/18
3	Review of Economics and Statistics	16.4	3.5	18
•	Review of Economic Studies	16.3	3.4	20
10	Journal of Economic Literature	16.2	3.9	20
11	Economic Journal	16.1	3.7	20
12	Journal of Financial Economics	16.0	4.2	20
13	Bell Journal of Economics	15.9	2.9	15
14	Journal of the Royal Statistical Society	15.8	3.8	18
15	Journal of Business	15.8	3.3	16/15
16	Journal of Econometrics	15.4	3.2	15
17	Economica	15.3	3.3	18
18	Journal of Financial and Quant. Analysis	15.0	3.7	18
19	Journal of Money, Credit and Banking	14.9	3.2	15
19	Journal of Monetary Economics	14.9	3.4	15
21	Brookings Papers on Economic Activity	14.8	3.4	15
22	International Economic Review	14.7	3.7	18/15
23	Management Science	14.6	3.9	16
24	Journal of Law and Economics	14.5	3.5	15
25	Journal of Economic History	14.4	3.9	*
26	Journal of Accounting Research	14.4	4.5	10
27	Journal of Public Economics	14.3	3.9	17/15
28	Oxford Economic Papers	13.8	3.8	16/14
28	Journal of International Economics	13.8	3.8	*
30	Canadian Journal of Economics	13.7	3.0	15
31	Journal of Mathematical Economics	13.7	4.1	15
32	Journal of Human Resources	13.3	3.7	15
33	Southern Economic Journal	13.1	4.1	15/10
34	Journal of Banking and Finance	13.0	3.7	12/10
35	Economic History Review	12.9	4.6	12
36	European Economic Review	12.8	3.8	10
37	Accounting Review	12.8	5.0	15/10
38	Inter'l Monetary Funds Staff Papers	12.7	4.2	15/10
39	Review of Income and Wealth	12.6	4.5	15
10	Scandinavian Journal of Economics	12.5	3.8	14
10	Economic Inquiry	12.5	3.9	15
12	American J. of Agricultural Economics	12.4	4.1	15
12	Public Choice	12.4	4.1	15
14	Journal of Marketing Research	12.3	5.0	10
15	Oxford Bulletin of Economics and Stat.	12.2	4.1	12
16	Journal of Regional Science	12.2	4.8	10
17	Journal of Industrial Economics	12.1	3.6	12/10
18	Kyklos	12.1	4.2	10
19	Financial Analyst Journal	12.1	4.9	10
50	Harvard Business Review	12.1	5.2	*
51	Foreign Affairs	12.1	6.1	15/10

Table 1. (continued)

Rank	Journal	Mean	Standard Deviation	Mode
52	National Tax Journal	12.0	4.2	15
53	Journal of Accounting and Economics	12.0	4.4	10
53	Land Economics	12.0	4.4	10
55	Journal of Urban Economics	11.9	4.2	10
56	Economic Development and Cul. Change	11.8	3.9	10
57	Manchester School of Eco. and Soc. Studies	11.7	3.8	10
58	Journal of Portfolio Management	11.6	4.1	15
59	Public Finance	11.6	3.8	10
50	Industrial and Labor Relation Review	11.6	4.7	12
50	Weltwirtschaftliches Archiv	11.6	4.9	14/8
52	Economic Letters	11.5	4.2	10
52	Journal of Economics and Business	11.5	4.2	12/10
54	Revue économique	11.5	4.6	10
55	Journal of Risk and Insurance	11.5	4.9	10
66	Journal of Development Economics	11.4	4.2	13/10
57	History of Political Economy	11.4	5.5	12/10
68	Annals of the Amer. Acad. of Pol. & Soc. Sci.	11.3	5.1	10
69	Journal of Macroeconomics	11.3	4.2	10
70	Economic Record	11.2	3.8	*
71	Journal of Economic Studies	11.2	4.9	15
72	Economie appliquée	11.0	4.3	15/10
73	Journal of Business Fin. and Accounting	11.0	5.0	10
74	Economia	11.0	5.2	*
75	Quarterly Review of Economics and Bus.	10.9	4.2	12
76	Cambridge Journal of Economics	10.9	4.4	10
77	Recherches économiques de Louvain	10.9	5.2	12
78	Revue d'économie politique	10.8	4.3	15
79	Journal of Bank Research	10.8	4.3	12/10
80	Journal of Economic Issues	10.8	4.7	10
81	Schottish Journal of Political Economy	10.7	4.2	10
82	Annales de l'INSEE	10.7	5.2	12
33	Public Finance Quarterly	10.6	5.4	10
34	Journal of Business Research	10.5	4.2	10
34	Applied Statistics	10.5	4.3	10
36	Federal Reserve Bank of St. Louis Review	10.5	4.7	10
37	Sloan Management Review	10.5	4.7	10
38	Antitrust Bulletin	10.4	4.2	12/10
39	Journal of Development Studies	10.4	4.5	10
90	Journal of International Business Studies	10.4	5.7	10
)1	Applied Economics	10.3	3.9	10
91	Australian Economic Papers	10.3	3.9	10
93	Canadian Public Policy	10.2	4.6	12
94	Economia internationale	10.2	4.6	7
95	Industrial Labor Review	10.2	4.9	10
6	Annales du Sc. économiques appliquées	10.1	5.0	10
96	Journal of Transport Economics and Policy	10.1	5.1	10
96 96	Engineering Economist	10.1	5.0	10
99	British Journal of Industrial Relations	9.9	4.4	10
100	Federal Reserve Bank of N.Y. Quarterly Review	9.8	4.6	10
101	Regional Studies	9.8	5.0	10/9
102	Business Economics	9.8 9.7	4.3	10/9

Table 1. (continued)

			Standard	
Rank	Journal	Mean	Deviation	Mode
102	Review of Business and Economic Research	9.7	4.3	10
104	Cahiers économiques de Bruxelles	9.7	4.9	5
105	Metroeconomica	9.5	4.3	10
105	National Institute Economic Review	9.5	4.5	10
05	Banca Nazionale del Iavaro-Quarterly Review	9.5	4.6	10
108	Industrial Relations/Relations industrielles	9.4	4.6	12
109	Journal of Post-Keynesian Economics	9.4	5.0	10
10	Revue d'économie industrielle	9.4	5.0	12/6
111	Kredit and Kapital	9.2	4.9	10
112	Monthly Labor Review	9.1	4.7	10

Note: \* refers to a multimode distribution.

The decline in the mean point score is fairly continuous. The standard deviations tend to be lower than 4.0 for the first 30 journals, except for the *Journal of Financial Economics* and the *Journal of Accounting Research*<sup>3</sup>.

It is constructive to compare the rankings of this study based on a cross-country sample with the results of Hawkins, Ritter, and Walter in 1973 and those of Liebowitz and Palmer in 1984. For example, except for the *Yale Law Journal* that was not included in our list, the ranking of the first five Journals is the same as the ranking of Liebowitz and Palmer based on citations to articles published from 1975 to 1979.

Several new journals, not rated by Hawkins, Ritter, and Walter (1973), did rather well (Journal of Financial Economics, Journal of Econometrics, Journal of Monetary Economics) and our results agreed with the findings of Liebowitz and Palmer (1984) that the Bell Journal of Economics has moved up considerably, as did the Journal of Finance.

## IV. Evaluating Differences Among Respondent Groups

Statistics for the 40 most prestigious journals are presented separately for each sampled country in Table 2, the first column presenting the journals' rankings by all respondents.

It can be readily observed that the *American Economic Review* ranks first in the United States and second in the other countries. *Econometrica* is ranked first in Great Britain and Quebec, while the *Journal of Political Economy* is ranked first in France.

Great Britain's rankings differ from other countries. First, the English journals, *Review of Economic Studies* and *Economic Journal* are highly perceived in their own country. Second, some journals are only poorly rated by the English when compared to the overall ranking: *Journal of Finance, Journal of Financial Economics, Journal of Business*, and the two accounting journals.

In France and in Quebec (French language), there is a larger number of journals with a mean value over 16.0. The *Journal of Economic Theory* and *Journal of Law and Economics* are rated higher in France than anywhere else, and in Quebec *Management* 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> It should not be surprising that the standard deviations are lower for top journals: the interval is bounded.

Table 2. Comparative Ratings of Economic Journals by Respondents' Country

		U.S.A.	G.B.	France	Québec	Finance Group
_	American Economic Review	18.5	18.2	18.0	18.6	18.7
2	Journal of Political Economy	18.2	18.1	18.1	18.1	18.1
3	Econometrica	18.1	18.4	17.2	19.0	18.1
4	Journal of the American Stat. Association	17.2	17.1	15.3	17.0	16.9
5	Journal of Finance	17.3	13.9	16.6	17.7	18.1
9	Journal of Economic Theory	17.0	16.3	18.0	17.4	17.5
7	Quarterly Journal of Economics	16.7	16.5	16.5	16.1	16.6
œ	Review of Economics ans Statistics	16.2	16.6	17.4	18.1	17.1
6	Review of Economic Studies	15.8	17.2	17.0	17.4	16.0
10	Journal of Economic Literature	15.6	16.5	16.6	17.7	15.7
11	Economic Journal	15.4	17.6	15.4	15.8	14.4
12	Journal of Financial Economics	16.5	11.9	16.4	16.0	17.4
13	Bell Journal of Economics	16.4	14.4	16.1	16.9	16.4
4	Journal of the Royal Statistical Society	15.8	16.3	14.0	17.3	14.6
15	Journal of Business	16.0	13.0	16.5	16.3	16.5
16	Journal of Econometrics	16.2	14.6	14.8	15.9	15.3
17	Economica	15.3	15.3	16.1	15.0	15.1
18	Journal of Financial and Quant. Analysis	15.1	13.9	14.8	14.8	15.6
19	Journal of Money, Credit and Banking	15.0	14.0	16.3	15.3	15.3

Describes Described on Commission Assistant					
S OIL ECUIOITIE ACTIVITY	14.5	15.2	16.4	14.8	15.2
International Economic Review	15.3	14.1	15.0	15.6	14.7
Management Science	14.5	12.0	15.7	18.0	14.8
Journal of Law and Economics	14.7	13.2	16.8	15.8	14.8
Journal of Economic History	14.9	13.9	*	*	14.6
Journal of Accounting Research	14.4	7.0**	16.7	15.0	15.7
Journal of Public Economics	13.1	15.2	15.8	14.1	11.6
Oxford Economic History	13.3	13.8	16.6	14.2	13.4
Journal of International Economics	13.0	14.0	15.1	17.5	13.4
Canadian Journal of Economics	13.9	12.8	14.7	14.3	14.2
Journal of Mathematical Economics	14.0	13.3	16.0	15.7	15.1
Journal of Human Resources	13.0	13.5	15.5	16.2	0.6
Southern Economic Journal	13.2	12.0	16.3	14.1	13.1
Journal of Banking and Finance	13.0	12.7	14.0	11.8	12.9
Economic History Review	12.7	13.4	*	*	12.4
European Economic Review	12.0	12.8	15.0	14.4	12.9
Accounting Review	13.6	5.4**	14.7	13.2	14.6
International Monetary Fund Staff Papers	11.8	13.1	16.3	12.5	13.3
Review of Income and Wealth	11.5	13.8	12.0	16.6	9.6
Scandinavian Journal of Economics	11.5	13.7	14.7	11.0	11.0
Economic Inquiry	12.7	12.4	13.2	13.3	12.1

<sup>\*</sup> Not given a point score by any respondent in the indicated group.

\*\* Results are not reliable because the smallness of the sample respondents.

Table 3. Impact Ranking Across Countries [Impact = Prestige  $\times$  Familiarity]

United States	Great	Great Britain		France		Quebec	
1 American Economic Review	18.5 Econor	18.5 Economic Journal (K)	17.6	17.6 American Economic Review	16.7	16.7 American Economic Review	18.0
2 Journal of Political Economy	14.5 Americ	14.5 American Economic Review	17.5	17.5 Econometrica	16.0	16.0 Econometrica	17.0
3 Econometrica	14.3 Journal	Journal of Political Economy	16.1	16.1 Journal of Political Economy	14.6	14.6 Review of Economics and Stat.	14.8
4 Bell Journal of Economics	13.7 Review	13.7 Review of Economic Studies (K)	14.7	14.7 Quarterly Journal of Economics	13.9	13.9 Bell Journal of Economics	13.8
5 Journal of Finance	12.5 Quarter	12.5 Quarterly Journal of Economics	14.7	14.7 Annales de l'INSEE (F)	13.3	13.3 Quarterly Journal of Economics	13.8
6 Ouarterly Journal of Economics	12.3 Econor	Economica (K)	14.2	14.2 Economica (K)	13.2	13.2 Review of Economic Studies (K)	13.4
7 Review of Economics and Stat.	11.7 Journal	11.7 Journal of Economic Literature	12.6	12.6 Journal of Economic Literature	13.1	<ol> <li>Canadian Journal of Ecn (C)</li> </ol>	13.0
8 Journal of Economic Literature	11.1 Oxford	11.1 Oxford Economic Papers (K)	12.5	12.5 Review of Economic Studies (K)	13.1	13.1 Journal of Political Economy	12.2
9 Journal of Business	9.7 Econor	Econometrica	12.4	12.4 Review of Economics and Stat.	12.8	12.8 Journal of Economic Literature	12.2
10 Journal of the Amer. Stat. Assn.	9.6 Review	9.6 Review of Economics and Stat.	12.1	12.1 Economie appliquée (F)	12.5	12.5 Journal of Finance	11.9
11 Review of Economic Studies (K)	8.7 Brooki	Brookings Papers on Eco. Act.	10.5	10.5 Revue économique (F)	12.2	12.2 Economic Journal (K)	6.11
12 Journal of Financial Economics	8.2 Manch	Manch. Sch. of Eco. & Stat. (K)	10.2	10.2 Revue d'économie politique (F)	11.6	11.6 Economica (K)	11.3
13 Journal of Finan. & Quant. Anal.	7.9 J. of th	J. of the Royal Stat. Soc. (K)	8.6	9.8 Journal of Finance	11.3	11.3 Journal of Economic Theory	0.11
14 Journal of Economic Theory	7.8 Oxford	7.8 Oxford Bul. of Eco. & Stat. (K)	9.4	9.4 Oxford Economic Papers (K)	11.3	11.3 Brookings Papers on Eco. Act.	10.5
15 Brookings Papers on Econ. Act.	7.8 Bell Jo	7.8 Bell Journal of Economics	9.1	9.1 Economic Journal (K)	==	11.1 International Economic Review	8.6
16 Economica (K)	7.6 Nat'l I	7.6 Nat'l Institute Eco. Review (K)	8.6	8.6 Kyklos (S)	=	11.1 J. of Money, Credit & Banking	8.7
17 International Economic Review	7.6 Scottisl	7.6 Scottish J. of Political Eco. (K)	8.0	8.0 Banque (F)	10.8	10.8 Journal of the Amer. Stat. Assn.	8.4
18 Harvard Business Review	7.6 Journal	7.6 Journal of Economic Theory	7.4	7.4 Inter'l Monetary Fund S.P.	10.8	10.8 Southern Economic Journal	8.2
19 J. of Money, Credit & Banking	7.5 Interna	7.5 International Monetary Fund S.P.	7.1	7.1 J. of Money, Credit & Banking	9.01	10.6 Revue d'économie politique (F)	8.0

20 Southern Economic Journal	7.2 Journal of Public Economics	6.9 Rev. déconomie industrielle (F)	10.5 Canadian Public Policy (C)	8.0
21 Economic Journal (K)	6.7 European Economic Review (B)	6.7 Harvard Business Review	10.2 ' Harvard Business Review	8.0
22 Journal of Law and Economics	6.5 International Economic Review	6.4 Economie et Sociétés (S)	9.5 Oxford Economic Papers (K)	7.8
23 Economic Inquiry	5.5 Kyklos (S)	6.3 International Economic Review	9.2 Journal of Business	7.5
24 Management Science	5.4 Journal of the Amer. Stat. Assn.	6.2 Brookings Papers on Eco Activ.	9.2 Economic Devpt. and Cul. Change	7.5
25 Financial Analyst Journal	5.2 Canadian Journal of Econ. (C)	6.0 Fed. Reserve Bank of St. Louis	8.8 Journal of Econometrics	7.3
26 Journal of Econometrics	5.1 Cambridge Journal of Eco. (K)	6.0 Journal of Economic Theory	8.2 Journal of Law and Economics	7.3
27 Journal of Monetary Economics	4.8 Applied Economics (K)	5.9 Consommation (F)	8.1 Revue économique (F)	7.3
28 National Tax Journal	4.5 Journal of Econometrics	5.8 Journal of Banking & Fin. (EFA)	7.8 Federal Reserve Bank of St. Louis	8.9
29 Journal of Banking & Fin. (EFA)	4.1 Scandinavian Journal of Eco. (W)	5.7 Southern Economic Journal	<ol><li>6.8 International Monetary Fund S.P.</li></ol>	6.5
30 Journal of Accounting Research	3.9 Journal of Monetary Economics	5.4 Bell Journal of Economics	6.8 Economie appliquée (F)	6.5
31 Canadian Journal of Econ. (C)	3.8 J. of Money, Credit & Banking	5.3 European Economic Review (B)	6.8 Management Science	6.4
32 Accounting Review	3.7 Economic Letters	5.2 J. de la Soc. de Stat./Paris (F)	6.8 Journal of Monetary Economics	6.3
33 International Monetary Fund S.P.	3.6 Economic Record (Z)	4.9 Annales de Sc. Eco. Appl. (B)	6.7 J. of the Royal Stat. Soc. (K)	6.1
34 Economic Develpt. & Cul. Change	3.5 Review of Income and Wealth	4.5 Journal of Monetary Economics	6.3 European Economic Review (B)	5.9
35 Kyklos (S)	3.4 Journal of Industrial Eco. (K)	4.5 Weltwirtschaftliches Archiv. (D)	6.3 Journal of Public Economics	5.8
36 Land Economics	3.2 Journal of Developt. Economics	4.4 Journal of the Amer. Stat. Assn.	6.2 Kyklos (S)	5.8
37 J. of the Royal Soc. Stat. (K)	3.1 Journal of Law and Economics	4.3 Recherches Econ. de Louvain (B)	6.0 Annales de l'INSEE (F)	5.8
38 Oxford Economic Papers (K)	3.0 Journal of Int'l and Economics	4.1 Journal of Economic Studies (K)	6.0 Oxford Bul. of Eco. & Stat. (K)	5.4
39 American Journal of Agri. Eco.	2.7 Weltwirtschaftliches Archiv (D)	4.0 Journal of Business	5.8 Public Choice	5.2
40 Foreign Affairs	2.7 Journal of Finance	3.8 Canadian Journal of Economics (C)	5.8 Journal of Economic Studies (K)	5.1

B = Belgium; C = Canada; D = Germany; F = France; K = Great Britain; S = Switzerland; W = Scandinavian; Z = Australia; EAF = European Finance Association.

Science is ranked as the fifth. The two journals on economic history are unknown in these two groups.

For comparison purposes, the last column of Table 2 shows that the results for the group of economists in Finance are not different from the overall results. Of course, in this group the *Journal of Financial Economics* is ranked as high as the sixth, which supports the idea that ranking is also influenced by the teaching and research interests of the respondents.

Table 3 presents an alternative "impact" ranking based on the mean point score of each journal "prestige" multiplied by the proportion of "step one" respondents who claimed to know that journal. This measure gives equal weight to presumed readership and prestige in establishing the "impact" of an article published in any given journal.

The results indicate a rather important "country effect." In Great Britain, for example, nine English journals appeared in the first 20 places and, for France, six French journals that were not even ranked before, are shown. The fact that Quebec is a French speaking province of Canada and a former part of the Britain Empire, is reflected by the high impact rating of English journals and the presence of French reviews.

Table 4 presents the countries of origin of the 40 journals whose impacts are ranked in Table 3. From Table 4, one realizes that many journals originating from the U.S.A. are well read and well evaluated by all the sampled scholars, regardless of their country. It must be noted that the French do not seem to have high (if any) impact on the English speaking (U.S.A. and U.K.) scholars while the Scandinavian and Australian journals are ignored by all but the English respondents.

The common belief that American scholars are not well versed in foreign languages seems to be validated in Table 4. Indeed, only journals published in English are rated among the top 40 in the U.S.A. while some journals published in French and German appear in the lists from the other countries.

#### V. Conclusion

In this survey, we have ranked the major journals for different countries. The ranking presented in this study, based on a cross-country sample, is quite similar, at least for the top

Table 4. Countries of Origin of the 40 Journals Receiving the Highest "Impact Index" by the Respondents Distributed by Countries

0	Countries of Origin of the Respondents				
Countries of Origin of the Journals	U.S.A.	U.K.	France	Québec	
United States	32	22	19	25	
United Kingdom	5	12	5	7	
France			8	4	
Canada	1	1	1	2	
Belgium		1	3	1	
Germany		1	1		
Switzerland	1	1	2	1	
Scandinavia		1			
Australia		1			
European Finance Association	1		1		
Total	40	40	40	40	

journals, to those obtained in previous studies using criteria such as peer evaluation or citation frequency.

However, when the sample is analyzed by "country groups," important differences occur; journals tend to rank higher in their own countries. This effect is even more evident when the journals are ranked with an index that gives equal weight to perceived quality and presumed readership.

These results may help authors selecting journals in which their manuscripts are likely to provide the greatest impact in various countries.

The authors wish to express their gratitude to Professor Muhittin Oral for this invaluable suggestions on all versions of this article. The authors are also grateful to Mr. Denis Côté for his help in performing the statistical analysis of the questionnaire results. Finally, special thanks are due to the referees for their useful and constructive suggestions.

#### References

- Billings, B. B., and Viksnins, G. J. Dec. 1972. The relative quality of economics journals: An alternative rating system. *Western Economic Journal* 10:467-469.
- Bush, W. C., Hamelman, P. W., and Staaf, R. J. Feb. 1974. A quality index for economic journals. Review of Economics and Statistics 56:123-125.
- Coats, A. W. March 1969. The American Economic Association's Publications: An historical perspective. *Journal of Economic Literature* 57-68.
- Coe, R. K., and Weinstock, I. Winter 1967. Editorial policies of major economic journals. *Quarterly Review of Economics and Business* 7:37-43.
- Coe, R. K., and Weinstock, I. Winter 1983. Evaluating the finance journals: The department chairperson's perspective. *The Journal of Financial Research* 6:345-349.
- Hawkins, R. G., Ritter, L. S., and Walter, I. July 1973. What economists think of their journals. Journal of Political Economy 81(4):1017-1032.
- Jauch, Lawrence R., and Glueck, William F. Sept. 1975. Evaluation of university professors' research performance. Management Science 22(1):66-75.
- Liebowitz, S. J., and Palmer, J. P. March 1984. Assessing the relative impacts of economics journals. *Journal of Economic Literature* 22:77-88.
- McDonough, C. C. Spring 1975. The relative quality of economic journals revisited. *Quarterly Review of Economics and Business* 15(1):92-97.
- Moore, W. J. June 1972. The relative quality of economic journals: A suggested rating system. *Western Economic Journal* 10:156-169.
- Skeels, J. W., and Fairbanks, R. P. July 1968. Publish of perish: An analysis of the mobility of publishing and nonpublishing economists. *Southern Economic Journal* 35:17-25.
- Skeels, J. W., and Taylor, R. A. Dec. 1972. The relative quality of economics journals: An alternative rating system. *Western Economic Journal* 10:470–473.
- Vandermeulen, A. Fall 1972. Manuscripts in the Maelstrom: A theory of the editorial process. *Public Choice*.