

SAN FRANCISCO PLANNING COMMISSION



Meeting Minutes

Commission Chambers, Room 400
City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Thursday, November 3, 2022
1:00 p.m.
Regular Meeting

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT: Tanner, Braun, Diamond, Imperial, Koppel, Ruiz
COMMISSIONERS ABSENT: Moore

THE MEETING WAS CALLED TO ORDER BY PRESIDENT TANNER AT 1:02 PM

STAFF IN ATTENDANCE: Maia Small, James Pappas, Reanna Tong, Shelley Caltagirone, Joshua Switzky, Xinyu Liang, Michelle Taylor, David Winslow, Liz Watty – Director of Current Planning, Rich Hillis – Planning Director, Jonas P. Ionin – Commission Secretary

SPEAKER KEY:

- + indicates a speaker in support of an item;
- indicates a speaker in opposition to an item; and
- = indicates a neutral speaker or a speaker who did not indicate support or opposition.

A. CONSIDERATION OF ITEMS PROPOSED FOR CONTINUANCE

The Commission will consider a request for continuance to a later date. The Commission may choose to continue the item to the date proposed below, to continue the item to another date, or to hear the item on this calendar.

1. [2020-010011DRP](#) (D. WINSLOW: (628) 652-7335)
[3753 21ST STREET](#) – south side between Noe and Sanchez Streets; Lot 076 in Assessor's Block 3621 (District 8) – Request for **Discretionary Review** of Building Permit No. 2020.0821.2328 to construct a horizontal third floor front addition to an existing single-family home within a RH-1 (Residential House, One-Family) Zoning District and 40-X

Height and Bulk District. This action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section [31.04](#)(h).

Preliminary Recommendation: Do Not Take Discretionary Review and Approve

(Continued from a Regular hearing on October 6, 2022)

WITHDRAWN

SPEAKERS: None
ACTION: Withdrawn

B. CONSENT CALENDAR

All matters listed hereunder constitute a Consent Calendar, are considered to be routine by the Planning Commission, and may be acted upon by a single roll call vote of the Commission. There will be no separate discussion of these items unless a member of the Commission, the public, or staff so requests, in which event the matter shall be removed from the Consent Calendar and considered as a separate item at this or a future hearing

2. [2015-003310CUA-02](#) (M. GIACOMUCCI: (628) 652-7414)
1 ARDATH COURT – south terminus of Ardath Court between Bertha Lane and Westbrook Court; Lot 008 in Assessor's Block 4712 (District 10) – Request for **Conditional Use Authorization** pursuant to Planning Code Sections 209.1, 303, and 304, to extend the of Conditions of Approval for three years for a Planned Unit Development to construct a new approximately 5,670 square foot Community Facility for residents of the Northridge Cooperative Homes. The project was previously approved by the Planning Commission under Motion No. 20046 on November 17, 2017 and is located within a RH-2 (Residential-House, Two-Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District. This action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section [31.04](#)(h).
Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

SPEAKERS: None
ACTION: Approved with Conditions
AYES: Braun, Ruiz, Diamond, Imperial, Koppel, Tanner
ABSENT: Moore
MOTION: [21191](#)

3. [2022-002946CUA](#) (C. ENCHILL: (628) 652-7551)
581 MARKET STREET – southeast side between First and Second Streets; Lot 044 in Assessor's Block 3708 (District 6) – Request for **Conditional Use Authorization**, pursuant to Planning Code Sections 210.2 and 303, to establish an office use on the first floor and mezzanine levels of the subject property resulting in an office use tenant approximately 6,210 square feet in size, and three Class 1 bicycle parking spaces within a C-3-O(SD) (Downtown-Office (Special Development)) Zoning District and 300-S Height and Bulk District. This action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section [31.04](#)(h).
Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

SPEAKERS: None
ACTION: Approved with Conditions

AYES: Braun, Ruiz, Diamond, Imperial, Koppel, Tanner
ABSENT: Moore
MOTION: [21192](#)

C. COMMISSION MATTERS

Commissioner Diamond:

The Planning Commission acknowledges that we are on the unceded ancestral homeland of the Ramaytush Ohlone, who are the original inhabitants of the San Francisco Peninsula. As the indigenous stewards of this land and in accordance with their traditions, the Ramaytush Ohlone have never ceded, lost, nor forgotten their responsibilities as the caretakers of this place, as well as for all peoples who reside in their traditional territory. As guests, we recognize that we benefit from living and working on their traditional homeland. We wish to pay our respects by acknowledging the Ancestors, Elders, and Relatives of the Ramaytush Ohlone community and by affirming their sovereign rights as First Peoples.

4. Consideration of Adoption:

- [Draft Minutes for October 13, 2022](#)
- [Draft Minutes for October 20, 2022](#)

SPEAKERS: None
ACTION: Adopted
AYES: Braun, Ruiz, Diamond, Imperial, Koppel, Tanner
ABSENT: Moore

5. Commission Comments/Questions

Commission Imperial:

As you know, I am joining you guys remotely because I have been infected by Covid. And so, because of that I would like to request from the Commissioners and also staff and also the public in City Hall to please speak closely to the mic so I can fully hear the conversation going in the City Hall right now. So, that is my request. And also, I just would like to inquire, I got an inquiry during the weekend about the Office Allocation information and whether the Planning Department are planning to give us an update on the Office Allocation. And, whether to give us the link on that update to be also presented for the next calendar or for the next Planning Commission hearing.

Jonas P. Ionin, Commission Secretary:

Commissioner Imperial, yes that will be on your agenda for November 10th as well as a memo from staff.

Commission Imperial:

Okay. Thank you very much.

President Tanner:

I wish you a speedy recovery and we will do our best to make sure you can hear us. If you can't, please let us know so we can speak more clearly or closer to the microphone. So, thanks for joining us and hope you're feeling better.

Commissioner Imperial:
Thank you.

D. DEPARTMENT MATTERS

6. Director's Announcements

Rich Hillis, Planning Director:

Good afternoon, Commissioners. Commissioner Imperial, I hope you're feeling okay and have a speedy recovery. I just want to – one quick update with when you'll have the Office Allocation. I was going to mention that to next week, I think we're going to do it under Director's Comments. Bottom line is there's about 200,000 square feet and how will it be available in allocation for office uses. So, we'll hear more about that next week. And then also, Commissioner Diamond, you asked for a hearing around our work around economic recovery especially around downtown, and I just wanted to let you know we're working on scheduling that hearing. We think it's important to also have OEWD and perhaps some other agencies as part of that. They are leading the city's effort in this work. Obviously, we're a major partner with them in that so hopefully we'll have that in December or January. If you remember, the mayor issued a press release along with OEWD talking about recovery and their focus in about five areas – filling vacancies and diversifying industries and uses downtown, enhancing downtown vibrancy which relates primarily to the public realm but goes broader, maintaining a clean and safe downtown, improving access to downtown, and growing our labor force. And then within that framework, we, as the Planning Department, are very much focused on questions around the future of office and economic diversification, expanding opportunities for housing downtown whether they're new buildings or conversions of existing commercial buildings, the public realm, in increasing the vibrancy of the public realm and then a specific look at Union Square. So, we'll have more on that but just a preview and that will be, probably in December or January. Thanks.

7. Review of Past Events at the Board of Supervisors, Board of Appeals and Historic Preservation Commission

Jonas P. Ionin, Commission Secretary:

There is no report from the Board of Supervisors or the Board of Appeals this week. However, Mr. Starr did request that I convey that Supervisor Mandelman's fourplex ordinance did pass on its second read last week. The Historic Preservation Commission did meet yesterday, and they took up the Legacy Business Registry application for The Condor for a second time. After some deliberation, a recommendation for approval was adopted. They also adopted a recommendation for approval for the St. James Presbyterian Church at 240 Leland Avenue and then adopted a Citywide Historic Context Statement for San Francisco Neighborhood Commercial Buildings circa 1865 – 1965.

E. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT

SPEAKERS: Georgia Schuttish – Demo calcs, Mandelman-Melgar fourplex legislation
Tes Welborn - Department budget update

F. REGULAR CALENDAR

The Commission Hearing Procedures provide for presentations by staff; when applicable, followed by a presentation of the project sponsor team; followed by public comment. Please be advised that the project sponsor team includes: the sponsor(s) or their designee, lawyers, architects, engineers, expeditors, and/or other advisors.

8. [2019-016230CWP](#) (S. CALTAGIRONE: (628) 652-7425)
HOUSING ELEMENT UPDATE 2022 – Informational Presentation – The Housing Element 2022 Update of the General Plan is San Francisco's first housing plan centered on racial and social equity. This plan will express the city's collective vision and values for the future of housing in San Francisco. It will also identify priorities for decision makers, guide resource allocation for housing programs and services, and define how and where the City should create new homes for San Franciscans, or those who want to call this city home. This update is due in early 2023 and it will need to accommodate the creation of 82,000 housing units by 2031, a target set by State and Regional Agencies that has been tripled compared to the city's current targets. This hearing will allow SF Planning to provide an overview of the Housing Element draft materials submitted for state review and posted for public review in October. Materials to be presented include draft policies and actions and supporting technical analysis. The draft materials can be found at the following link for review and public comment: <https://www.sfhousingelement.org/october-2022-release>.
Preliminary Recommendation: None – Informational

SPEAKERS:

- = Maia Small – Introduction of staff changes
- = James Pappas – Staff presentation
- = Reanna Tong – Staff presentation
- = Shelley Caltagirone – Staff presentation
- = Tom Radulovich – Focus more on sustainability, climate and health, form based codes, commitment to neighborhood planning
- = Georgia Schuttish – Written comments on 10/13/2022 on SB 9
- = Jessica – Get in compliance in January
- = Christopher Roach – Remove barriers and streamline implementation
- = Alex Lansberg – Multi family infill, housing sustainability in the west side, labor capacity, equity strategies
- = Jake Price – Needs metrics and accountability
- = Anastasia Yovanopoulos – Present a more compelling strategy
- = Speaker – Impacted of rezoning
- = Robert Fruchtman – Major components still missing, very poor feasibility, social housing rents and revenues from the city
- = Mitch Mankin – Rezoning program, can't rely on federal funding
- = Mike Schiraldi - Eastern part of Glen Park
- = Lorraine Petty – Community opposition as an obstacle to building, DRs
- = Kenneth Russell – Realistic plan to build
- = Rich Hillis – Response to comments and questions
- = Joshua Switzky – Response to comments and questions

ACTION: Reviewed and Commented
RECUSED: Braun, Ruiz

9. [2021-006098CUA](#) (X. LIANG: (628) 652-7362)
1358 SOUTH VAN NESS AVENUE – west side between 24th and 25th Streets; Lot 008 in Assessor's Block 6518 (District 9) – Request for **Conditional Use Authorization**, pursuant to Planning Code Sections 209.4, 303, and 317, for a Project proposing to demolish the existing three-story single-family residence and to construct a new, 8,137 square-foot, four-story, 40-foot-tall residential building containing seven dwelling units (one studio unit, one one-bedroom unit, and five two-bedroom units). The Project is located within a RTO-M (Residential Transit Oriented – Mission) Zoning District, Calle 24 Special Use District, and 50-X Height and Bulk District. This action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section [31.04\(h\)](#).

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

SPEAKERS: = Xinyu Liang – Staff report
 + Speaker - Project sponsor presentation
 + Beau Trincia – Bringing more units is a great idea
 ACTION: Approved with Conditions
 AYES: Braun, Ruiz, Diamond, Imperial, Koppel, Tanner
 ABSENT: Moore
 MOTION: [21193](#)

10. [2021-001639CUA](#) (X. LIANG: (628) 652-7362)
2270 MCKINNON STREET – northeast corner of Upton Street; Lot 004 in Assessor's Block 5285A (District 10) – Request for **Conditional Use Authorization** of a Planned Unit Development (PUD) on a site that is over ½ acre and to establish a large-scale retail use over 120,000 square feet, pursuant to Planning Code Sections 121.6, 210.3, 249.22, 303, and 304, for a project that includes the demolition of an existing private parking lot and the construction of a five-story mixed-use building with approximately 150,940 square feet of Self-Storage use, 23,460 square feet of Production, Distribution, And Repair (PDR) use, four onsite loading spaces, six vehicle parking spaces, and six Class 1 and two Class 2 bicycle parking spaces within a PDR-2 (Production, Distribution, and Repair) Zoning District, Industrial Protection Zone SUD (Special Use District), and 65-J Height and Bulk District. This action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section [31.04\(h\)](#).

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

SPEAKERS: = Xinyu Liang – Staff report
 + Travis Duncan - Project sponsor presentation
 + Brian – Design presentation
 + Jose Jesus Villalobos – Provides good union jobs
 + Raymond Ross – Brown Bombers, opportunity to have a home
 + A.J. Thomas – SF Labor Council, will result union jobs
 + Cameron Robbins – Appropriate and a benefit to the city
 + Alex Lansberg – Community benefits
 + Sabrina Hernandez – What could be vs what it is now
 + Josh Vallis – Will bring economic vitality to the neighborhood
 + Dan Torres – Union
 + Joe Sanders – Building trade
 + Bart Pantoja – Opportunity to earn good wages and benefits

- + Eddie Reyes – Union jobs
- + Greg Hardeman – Provide living wages
- + Anthony Waters – Union jobs
- Mary McGuire – Last Cab company in SF, what will happen to employees
- + John Korso – Local 38, commitment to skilled and trained work force
- + R J Ferrari – Move this forward
- + Chris Knerr – Impact to union contractors and workers
- = Kirsten Jensen, City Attorney – Response to comments and questions

ACTION: Approved with Conditions
 AYES: Braun, Ruiz, Diamond, Imperial, Koppel, Tanner
 ABSENT: Moore
 MOTION: [21194](#)

11. [2021-011751CUA](#) (M. TAYLOR: (628) 652-7352)
1650 BROADWAY – north side between Van Ness Avenue and Franklin Street; Lots 077 and 078 in Assessor's Block 0570 (District RM-3) – Request for **Conditional Use Authorization** pursuant to Planning Code Sections 303 and 317, to permit the enlargement of one existing residential unit while reducing the size of another residential unit by more than 25% of the original floor area of an existing 34-unit condo building within a RM-3 (Residential- Mixed, Medium Density) Zoning District and 80-A Height and Bulk District. This action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section [31.04\(h\)](#).
Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

SPEAKERS: = Michelle Taylor – Staff report
 + Jeff Gibson - Project sponsor presentation
 ACTION: Approved with Conditions
 AYES: Braun, Ruiz, Diamond, Imperial, Koppel, Tanner
 ABSENT: Moore
 MOTION: [21195](#)

12. [2021-011356CUA](#) (R. BALBA: (628) 652-7331)
4849 MISSION STREET – southeast side between Russia and France Avenues; Lot 018 in Assessor's Block 6272 (District 12) – Request for **Conditional Use Authorization** pursuant to Planning Code Sections 102, 303, and 720, to establish a Religious Institution use, within an existing vacant space at the ground floor of an existing three-story mixed-use building, within the Excelsior Outer Mission Street NCD (Neighborhood Commercial District) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District. This action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section [31.04\(h\)](#).

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions
 (Continued from a Regular hearing on October 6, 2022)

SPEAKERS: = Ryan Balba – Staff report
 + Sam Chu - Project sponsor presentation
 + Speaker – Helps with the children program
 + Debra – Teaches Sunday school, safe place for kids
 - Mel Flores – Not appropriate use of space
 + Tiffany – Happy to have found this church

+ Dennis Quan – Will increase foot traffic and livelihood in the community
 ACTION: Approved with Conditions
 AYES: Braun, Ruiz, Diamond, Imperial, Koppel, Tanner
 ABSENT: Moore
 MOTION: [21196](#)

G. DISCRETIONARY REVIEW CALENDAR

The Commission Discretionary Review Hearing Procedures provide for presentations by staff; followed by the DR requestor team; followed by public comment opposed to the project; followed by the project sponsor team; followed by public comment in support of the project. Please be advised that the DR requestor and project sponsor teams include: the DR requestor and sponsor or their designee, lawyers, architects, engineers, expeditors, and/or other advisors.

13. [2022-001240DRP](#) (D. WINSLOW: (628) 652-7335)
272 NAPLES STREET – northwest side between Excelsior and Avalon Avenues; Lot 013 in Assessor's Block 6008 (District 11) – Request for **Discretionary Review** of Building Permit No. 2022.0128.6871 for the construction of a rear horizontal addition to an existing single-family dwelling within a RH-1 (Residential-House, One Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District. This action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section [31.04](#)(h).
Preliminary Recommendation: Do Not Take Discretionary Review and Approve

SPEAKERS: = David Winslow – Staff report
 - Qing Jin Wen – DR presentation
 + Adam – Project sponsor
 + Fumiko Docker – Project sponsor presentation
 + Katie – Project sponsor rebuttal
 ACTION: No DR
 AYES: Braun, Ruiz, Diamond, Imperial, Koppel, Tanner
 ABSENT: Moore
 DRA: [800](#)

ADJOURNMENT 5:22 PM
 ADOPTED NOVEMBER 17, 2022