

SAN FRANCISCO PLANNING COMMISSION



Meeting Minutes

Commission Chambers, Room 400
City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Thursday, November 10, 2022
1:00 p.m.
Regular Meeting

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT: Tanner, Moore, Braun, Diamond, Imperial, Koppel, Ruiz
COMMISSIONERS ABSENT: None

THE MEETING WAS CALLED TO ORDER BY PRESIDENT TANNER AT 1:06 PM

STAFF IN ATTENDANCE: Jenny Delumo, AnMarie Rodgers, Wade Wietgreffe, Lily Langlois, Michael Li, Mary Woods, Rebecca Salgado, David Winslow, Corey Teague – Zoning Administrator, Liz Watty – Director of Current Planning, Rich Hillis – Planning Director, Jonas P. Ionin – Commission Secretary

SPEAKER KEY:

- + indicates a speaker in support of an item;
- indicates a speaker in opposition to an item; and
- = indicates a neutral speaker or a speaker who did not indicate support or opposition.

A. CONSIDERATION OF ITEMS PROPOSED FOR CONTINUANCE

The Commission will consider a request for continuance to a later date. The Commission may choose to continue the item to the date proposed below, to continue the item to another date, or to hear the item on this calendar.

- 1a. 2019-022404ENX (E. SAMONSKY: (628) 652-7417)
1458 SAN BRUNO AVENUE – west side at terminus of San Bruno Avenue; Lots 015 and 006A in Assessor's Block 4277 (District 9) – Request for **Large Project Authorization** pursuant to Planning Code Sections 329, and 841 to demolish three light industrial buildings that contained an unauthorized dwelling unit and new construction of more

than 25,000 gross square feet for a seven-story residential building, with a maximum height of approximately 73-feet, containing in total 232 dwelling units (two three-bedroom, 91 two-bedroom, two one-bedroom, and 137 studios) and 134 Class One bicycle parking spaces, under the Individually Requested State Density Bonus Program pursuant to Planning Code Section 206.6 and California Government Code Section 65915. The project seeks waivers from development standards, including Rear Yard (Section 134), Dwelling Unit Exposure (Section 140), Off-Street Loading (section 151.1), and Height Limit (Section 260) requirements of the Planning Code, and concessions from the Open Space (Section 135) and Permitted Obstructions (Section 136), pursuant to State Density Bonus Law. The Project is located in a MUR (Mixed-Use Residential) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District. The Planning Department issued a Community Plan Evaluation pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). The Commission's action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section [31.04\(h\)](#).

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

(Continued from a Regular hearing on September 15, 2022)

(Proposed for Continuance to December 8, 2022)

SPEAKERS: Chris Goode – Continuance

Speaker – Community meeting

ACTION: Continued to December 8, 2022

AYES: Braun, Ruiz, Diamond, Imperial, Koppel, Moore, Tanner

- 1b. 2019-022404CUA (E. SAMONSKY: (628) 652-7417)
1458 SAN BRUNO AVENUE – west side at terminus of San Bruno Avenue; Lots 015 and 006A in Assessor's Block 4277 (District 9) – Request for **Conditional Use Authorization** pursuant to Planning Code Sections 303, 317 and 841 to demolish three light industrial buildings that contained an unauthorized dwelling unit and construct a seven-story residential building, with a maximum height of approximately 73-feet, containing in total 232 dwelling units (two three-bedroom, 91 two-bedroom, two one-bedroom, and 137 studios) and 134 Class One bicycle parking spaces, in a MUR (Mixed-Use Residential) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

(Continued from a Regular hearing on September 15, 2022)

(Proposed for Continuance to December 8, 2022)

SPEAKERS: Same as item 1a.

ACTION: Continued to December 8, 2022

AYES: Braun, Ruiz, Diamond, Imperial, Koppel, Moore, Tanner

- 1c. 2019-022404SHD (E. SAMONSKY: (628) 652-7417)
1458 SAN BRUNO AVENUE – west side at terminus of San Bruno Avenue; Lots 015 and 006A in Assessor's Block 4277 (District 9) – Request for adoption of **Shadow Findings** pursuant to Planning Code Section 295 that net new shadow from the project would not adversely affect the use of Potrero Del Sol Park and James Rolph Jr. Playground under the jurisdiction of the Recreation and Park Commission, in a MUR (Mixed-Use Residential) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve

(Continued from a Regular hearing on September 15, 2022)

(Proposed for Continuance to December 8, 2022)

SPEAKERS: Same as item 1a.
ACTION: Continued to December 8, 2022
AYES: Braun, Ruiz, Diamond, Imperial, Koppel, Moore, Tanner

- 8a. [2021-001922ENV](#) (M. LI: (628) 652-7538)
3150 CALIFORNIA STREET – north side between Presidio Avenue and Lyon Street; Lot 013 in Assessor’s Block 1022 (District 2) Other project addresses include: 3065 Jackson Street and 3150 Washington Street (Lot 034 in Assessor’s Block 0982), 3185 Washington Street (Lot 026 in Assessor’s Block 0999), and 3220 Sacramento Street (Lot 008 in Assessor’s Block 1007) – **Appeal of Preliminary Negative Declaration** for the proposed demolition of the existing commercial, office, and surface parking uses and the construction of a three-story-over-basement 40-foot-tall, 46,300-gross-square-foot educational/institutional building (“San Francisco University High School”). The project includes increasing the total campus enrollment from 410 to 550 students throughout the existing four San Francisco University High School buildings and the subject property. The project site is in a NC-2 (Neighborhood Commercial, Small-Scale) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District. *Preliminary Recommendation: Uphold*
(Continued from a Regular hearing on October 13, 2022)
WITHDRAWN

SPEAKERS: None
ACTION: Withdrawn

B. CONSENT CALENDAR

All matters listed hereunder constitute a Consent Calendar, are considered to be routine by the Planning Commission, and may be acted upon by a single roll call vote of the Commission. There will be no separate discussion of these items unless a member of the Commission, the public, or staff so requests, in which event the matter shall be removed from the Consent Calendar and considered as a separate item at this or a future hearing

C. COMMISSION MATTERS**2. Commission Comments/Questions****President Tanner:**

Thank you. I’ll begin with our land acknowledgement and just want to, I think, Commissioner Braun was not here when we started doing this practice, but just to remind Commissioners that you’re welcome to take part in reading it and just let me know. You can even let me know the moment before I begin reading it that you want to read it. And you can find it on the second page of our agenda packet, the land acknowledgement.

The Planning Commission acknowledges that we are on the unceded ancestral homeland of the Ramaytush Ohlone, who are the original inhabitants of the San Francisco Peninsula. As the indigenous stewards of this land and in accordance with their traditions, the Ramaytush Ohlone have never ceded, lost, nor forgotten their responsibilities as the caretakers of this place, as well as for all peoples who reside in their traditional territory. As

guests, we recognize that we benefit from living and working on their traditional homeland. We wish to pay our respects by acknowledging the Ancestors, Elders, and Relatives of the Ramaytush Ohlone community and by affirming their sovereign rights as First Peoples.

D. DEPARTMENT MATTERS

3. Director's Announcements

None.

4. Review of Past Events at the Board of Supervisors, Board of Appeals and Historic Preservation Commission

None.

5. [Office Development Annual Limit Update](#)

SPEAKERS: = Corey Teague – Staff report
- Sue Hestor – Projects under 50,000 sq. ft. (49ers), how are projects built, monitored
= Liz Watty – Response to comments and questions
ACTION: Reviewed and Commented

E. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT

SPEAKERS: Georgia Schuttish – Re: Email w/photos sent November 8th. The project on the left in the photos applied for the Permit in June 2012. It was issued in May 2014. The CFC was issued in 2016. There was a complaint filed with DBI in January 2015 for work beyond the scope contending “the building is completely demolished”. The case was quickly closed contending the contractor was “in compliance”. However, the Matrix on the SFPIM 2013 plans does not conform to Section 317 template. Additionally the Vertical Area Calculations do not account for the corrections made to the Clarifications in the June 2020 Section 317 Code Implementation Document. The project on the right in the photos applied for the Permit in December 2014. It was issued in July 2017. The CFC was issued in 2018. The two adjacent projects were after the Joe Eskenazi December 2012 article. <https://www.sfweekly.com/news/bringing-down-the-housing-howbuilders-game-the-system/>
Sue Hestor – Request for a joint meeting with DBI
David Pilpel – Hold a hearing on CEQA materials, staff unavailable
Francisco DeCosta – Quality of life issues

F. REGULAR CALENDAR

The Commission Hearing Procedures provide for presentations by staff; when applicable, followed by a presentation of the project sponsor team; followed by public comment. Please be advised

that the project sponsor team includes: the sponsor(s) or their designee, lawyers, architects, engineers, expeditors, and/or other advisors.

6. [2022-009014PCA](#) (J. DELUMO: (628) 652-7568)
ELECTRIC VEHICLE CHARGING LOCATIONS (BF 220851) – Planning Code Amendment – Ordinance, introduced by Mayor Breed and duplicated by Supervisor Peskin, amending the Planning Code to include new criteria under Planning Code section 303(cc) for assessing whether to grant a Conditional Use Authorization for Fleet Charging locations, which is a definition created under the EV Charging Locations Ordinance (BF 220036) that was passed by the Board of Supervisors on September 6, 2022 and approved by Mayor Breed on September 19, 2022; affirming the Planning Department's determination under the California Environmental Quality Act; and making findings of consistency with the General Plan, and the eight priority policies of Planning Code, Section 101.1, and findings of public necessity, convenience, and welfare under Planning Code, Section 302.
 (Continued from a Regular hearing on October 20, 2022)
Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Modifications

SPEAKERS: = Jenny Delumo – Staff report
 - Judy Lee – Carbonize transportation, ordinance will add significant cost
 - Mark Gleason – Fleet charging should go through a CUA process
 - Phil Lonsdale – Protect PDR space that could be lost
 = Corey Teague – Response to comments and questions
 = AnMarie Rodgers – Response to comments and questions
 = Rich Hillis – Response to comments and questions
 = Wade Wietgreffe – Response to comments and questions
 = Austin Yang, Deputy City Attorney – Response to comments and questions
ACTION: Approved with Modifications
AYES: Braun, Diamond, Koppel, Tanner
NAYS: Ruiz, Imperial, Moore
RESOLUTION: [21197](#)

7. [2019-004879CWP](#) (L. LANGLOIS: (628) 652-7472)
WATERFRONT RESILIENCE PROGRAM – Informational Presentation – Staff will provide an update on the Waterfront Resilience Program (“WRP”) which works to ensure the waterfront, and its critical regional and citywide assets, are resilient to hazards and increasingly accessible to everyone it serves. Since 2018, the WRP has achieved several key milestones towards developing a more resilient waterfront, including: completion of the Multi-Hazard Risk Assessment, launch of the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers San Francisco Waterfront Coastal Flood Study, development of Draft WRP program goals, development of seismic and flood measures, and identification of early projects for the Embarcadero Seawall. The Department supported and collaborated with the Port of San Francisco (in partnership with the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers and other city agencies) to develop seven Draft Waterfront Adaptation Strategies (Alternatives) (“Strategies”) based on over five years of public engagement. The informational presentation will describe the seven Strategies. The Strategies are options to be evaluated that reduce flood and seismic risk along the waterfront. Following this presentation, the Strategies will be presented to the public for feedback and will be evaluated across a range of technical measures with a goal

of reaching a Draft Waterfront Adaptation Plan (Tentatively Selected Plan) by summer 2023.

Preliminary Recommendation: None – Informational

SPEAKERS: = Lily Langlois – Staff presentation
 + Adam Varat - Port of SF presentation
 = AnMarie Rodgers – Response to comments and questions
 ACTION: Reviewed and Commented

- 8b. [2021-001922CUA](#) (M. WOODS: (628) 652-7350)
3150 CALIFORNIA STREET – north side between Presidio Avenue and Lyon Street; Lot 013 in Assessor's Block 1022 (District 2); Other project addresses include: 3065 Jackson Street and 3150 Washington Street (Lot 034 in Assessor's Block 0982), 3185 Washington Street (Lot 026 in Assessor's Block 0999), and 3220 Sacramento Street (Lot 008 in Assessor's Block 1007) – Request for **Conditional Use Authorization** pursuant to Planning Code Sections 121.1, 121.2, 303, and 711, to allow the construction of an educational institutional building ("San Francisco University High School"), 40 feet tall, three-story over basement, and approximately 46,300 gross square feet, to allow a development lot size over 10,000 square feet, to allow a use size over 4,000 square feet, and to modify previous Commission authorization (Motion No. 19066) to increase the total campus enrollment from 410 to 550 students throughout the existing four buildings and the subject property. The subject property related to the new construction is located within a NC-2 (Neighborhood Commercial, Small-Scale) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District. The Planning Department issued a preliminary mitigated negative declaration pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). The Commission's action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section [31.04\(h\)](#).

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions.

SPEAKERS: = Michael Li – Staff report
 = Mary Woods – Staff report
 + Matt Levinson – Project sponsor presentation
 + Bill Leddy – Design presentation
 + Richard Stacy – Design presentation
 - Rod Howard – Too large of an expansion, traffic
 - Steve Mitchell – Construction will put them out of business, project will change the character of the neighborhood
 + Tim Bartlett – Good for the community, appropriate use of an urban site
 + Roger – Needs to be upgraded
 + Clayton Kimbrell – Supports the improvement
 + Holly Huggins – Significant commitment
 - Kate Ringness – No to increase in enrollment, traffic
 - William Fleishhacker – Construction impacts to hotel guests of Laurel Inn
 + Alec Perkins – Great school, very considerate
 + Alexandra – Outstanding academics
 + Tom – Matches with the volume of buildings in the neighborhood
 + Jack Lancey – School is not big enough, will appreciate a bigger space
 + Julia Durvall – Lab is small and not enough space to collaborate
 + Jordan Chow – Provide a better work environment

+ Joey Kennedy – Bigger gym
 + Matt Levinson – Project Sponsor response to comments and questions
 = William Fleishhacker – Neighbor response to comments and question
 + Joel – Project Sponsor response to comments and questions
 + Tara Sullivan – Project Sponsor response to comments and questions
 = Corey Teague – Variance
 + Project Sponsor – Response to comments and questions
 = Elizabeth Gordon-Jonckheer – Response to comments and questions
 ACTION: After hearing and closing public comment; Continued to the November 17, 2022 Consent Calendar
 AYES: Braun, Ruiz, Diamond, Imperial, Moore, Tanner
 NAYS: Koppel

- 8c. [2021-001922VAR](#) (M. WOODS: (628) 652-7350)
3150 CALIFORNIA STREET – north side between Presidio Avenue and Lyon Street; Lot 013 in Assessor's Block 1022 (District 2) – Request for **Variances** to address the Planning Code requirements for Rear Yard [PC 134] and Class 2 Bicycle Parking [PC 155.1], for the proposed project involving new construction of a three-story over basement building approximately 40 feet in height, 46,300 gross square feet in size, increasing the total campus enrollment from 410 to 550 students throughout the existing four SFUHS buildings and the subject property. The project would provide minimally 44 Class 1 bicycle parking spaces, and two Class 2 bicycle parking spaces within a NC-2 (Neighborhood Commercial, Small-Scale) Zoning District, and 40-X Height and Bulk District.

SPEAKERS: Same as item 8b.
 ACTION: ZA Closed the PH and Continued to the November 17, 2022

- 9a. [2021-005720DNX](#) (R. SALGADO: (628) 652-7332)
2 STOCKTON STREET – northeast corner of Stockton Street; Lot 002 in Assessor's Block 0328 (District 3) – Request for **Downtown Project Authorization** pursuant to Planning Code Sections 210.2 and 309 with exceptions for reduction of wind currents in a C-3 District (Section 148), Height (Section 263.8), and Bulk Limits (Section 272) for a Project proposing to replace the facades of the building, construct a three-story vertical addition on top of the existing four-story structure, and convert the subject property from a predominantly retail use to a mix of retail and office uses. The project site is located within a C-3-R (Downtown-Retail) Zoning District and 80-130-F Height and Bulk District. The Planning Department found that the project is exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act CEQA (CEQA). The Commission's action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section [31.04\(h\)](#).
Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

SPEAKERS: = Rebecca Salgado – Staff report
 + Katie Hofstetter – Project sponsor presentation
 + Sam Wasserstein – Will benefit Union Square
 + Speaker – POPOS, in-lieu fees
 + Speaker – Response to comments and questions
 = Rich Hillis – Response to comments and questions
 + John Kevlin – Response to comments and questions
 = Liz Watty – Response to comments and questions

= Corey Teague – Response to comments and questions
ACTION: Approved with Conditions
AYES: Braun, Ruiz, Diamond, Koppel, Moore, Tanner
NAYS: Imperial
MOTION: [21198](#)

- 9b. [2021-005720CUA](#) (R. SALGADO: (628) 652-7332)
2 STOCKTON STREET – northeast corner of Stockton Street; Lot 002 in Assessor's Block 0328 (District 3) – Request for **Conditional Use Authorization** pursuant to Planning Code Section 145.4, 210.2, and 303, to allow the linear frontage of a single retail use to exceed 75 feet and to allow office uses exceeding 5,000 gross square feet on the fourth through sixth floors of the building for a Project proposing to replace the facades of the building, construct a three-story vertical addition on top of the existing four-story structure, and convert the subject property from a predominantly retail use to a mix of retail and office uses. The project site is located within a C-3-R (Downtown-Retail) Zoning District and 80-130-F Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

SPEAKERS: Same as item 9a.
ACTION: Approved with Conditions as amended, with Condition 14 revised by staff and further amended, striking the word "submittal" and replacing it with "Planning Department Approval," and adding the sentence: "If an in-lieu option becomes available in the future, the Sponsor may elect to exercise it."
AYES: Braun, Ruiz, Diamond, Koppel, Moore, Tanner
NAYS: Imperial
MOTION: [21199](#)

- 9c. [2021-005720OFA](#) (R. SALGADO: (628) 652-7332)
2 STOCKTON STREET – northeast corner of Stockton Street; Lot 002 in Assessor's Block 0328 (District 3) – Request for **Office Allocation** pursuant to Planning Code Sections 320–325, to establish up to 49,999 square feet of new office use for a Project proposing to replace the facades of the building, construct a three-story vertical addition on top of the existing four-story structure, and convert the subject property from a predominantly retail use to a mix of retail and office uses. The project site is located within a C-3-R (Downtown-Retail) Zoning District and 80-130-F Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

SPEAKERS: Same as item 9a.
ACTION: Approved with Conditions
AYES: Braun, Ruiz, Diamond, Koppel, Moore, Tanner
NAYS: Imperial
MOTION: [21200](#)

- 9d. [2021-005720VAR](#) (R. SALGADO: (628) 652-7332)
2 STOCKTON STREET – northeast corner of Stockton Street; Lot 002 in Assessor's Block 0328 (District 3) – Request for the Zoning Officer to consider a **Variance** from Privately Owned Public Open Space requirements (Section 138) to allow a ground-floor interior public space measuring approximately 365 square feet in lieu of an exterior POPOS for a Project

proposing to replace the facades of the building, construct a three-story vertical addition on top of the existing four-story structure, and convert the subject property from a predominantly retail use to a mix of retail and office uses. The project site is located within a C-3-R (Downtown-Retail) Zoning District and 80-130-F Height and Bulk District.

SPEAKERS: Same as item 9a.

ACTION: ZA closed the PH and indicated an intent to grant.

G. DISCRETIONARY REVIEW CALENDAR

The Commission Discretionary Review Hearing Procedures provide for presentations by staff; followed by the DR requestor team; followed by public comment opposed to the project; followed by the project sponsor team; followed by public comment in support of the project. Please be advised that the DR requestor and project sponsor teams include: the DR requestor and sponsor or their designee, lawyers, architects, engineers, expeditors, and/or other advisors.

10. [2021-004987DRP](#) (D. WINSLOW: (628) 652-7335)
2760 DIVISADERO STREET – southeast corner of Green Street; Lot 020 in Assessor's Block 0953 (District 2) – Request for **Discretionary Review** of Building Permit No. 2021.0223.5187 for the construction of a fourth level rear deck extension including new railings over an existing flat roof of an existing single-family dwelling within a RH-1 (Residential-House, One Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District. The Planning Department found that the project is exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). The Commission's action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section [31.04\(h\)](#).
Preliminary Recommendation: Do Not Take Discretionary Review and Approve
 (Continued from Regular hearing on October 6, 2022)

SPEAKERS: - Gordon Atkinson – DR presentation

+ Stephen Sutro – Project sponsor presentation

- William – Work with neighbors

ACTION: No DR

AYES: Braun, Ruiz, Diamond, Imperial, Koppel, Moore, Tanner

DRA: [801](#)

11. [2021-011322DRP](#) (D. WINSLOW: (628) 652-7335)
264 DIAMOND STREET – west side between 19th and 20th Streets; Lot 009B in Assessor's Block 2698 (District 8) – Request for **Discretionary Review** of Building Permit No. 2021.0506.9906 for the construction of a three-story rear horizontal addition to an existing single-family dwelling within a RH-3 (Residential-House, Three Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District. Planning Department found that the project is exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). The Commission's action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section [31.04\(h\)](#).
Preliminary Recommendation: Take Discretionary Review and Approve with Modifications

SPEAKERS: - Gabe Zeldin - DR presentation

+ Betsy Bayha - Project sponsor presentation

+ Matthew De Costa – Request for 3 ft. set back will ruin the project

ACTION: + Matthew – View
AYES: + Scott – Project sponsor rebuttal
NAYS: No DR
DRA: Braun, Ruiz, Diamond, Koppel, Tanner
[802](#)

ADJOURNMENT 7:02 PM
ADOPTED DECEMBER 1, 2022