

SAN FRANCISCO PLANNING COMMISSION



Meeting Minutes

Commission Chambers, Room 400
City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Thursday, October 13, 2022
1:00 p.m.
Regular Meeting

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT: Tanner, Moore, Braun, Diamond, Imperial, Koppel, Ruiz
COMMISSIONERS ABSENT: None

THE MEETING WAS CALLED TO ORDER BY VICE PRESIDENT MOORE AT 1:05 PM

STAFF IN ATTENDANCE: Carla De Mesa, Miriam Chion, Gabriela Pantoja, Jeff Horn, Allison Vanderslice, Devyani Jain, Dan Sider, Christopher May, Corey Teague – Zoning Administrator, David Winslow, Liz Watty – Director of Current Planning, Rich Hillis – Planning Director, Jonas P. Ionin – Commission Secretary

SPEAKER KEY:

- + indicates a speaker in support of an item;
- indicates a speaker in opposition to an item; and
- = indicates a neutral speaker or a speaker who did not indicate support or opposition.

A. CONSIDERATION OF ITEMS PROPOSED FOR CONTINUANCE

The Commission will consider a request for continuance to a later date. The Commission may choose to continue the item to the date proposed below, to continue the item to another date, or to hear the item on this calendar.

1. 2021-001922ENV (M. LI: (628) 652-7538)
3150 CALIFORNIA STREET – north side between Presidio Avenue and Lyon Street; Lot 013
in Assessor's Block 1022 (District 2) – **Appeal of Preliminary Negative Declaration** for the

proposed demolition of the existing retail, office, and surface parking uses and the construction of a three-story, 40-foot-tall building (50 feet tall including the rooftop mechanical equipment) for San Francisco University High School. The new building would contain classrooms, a student center, athletic facilities, a food service and dining area, faculty and administrative offices, and an outdoor roof terrace. The new building would not include any off-street parking. Approximately 150 feet of curb along the project's California Street frontage would be converted to passenger loading. The project site is in a NC-2 (Neighborhood Commercial, Small-Scale) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Uphold

(Proposed for Continuance to November 10, 2022)

SPEAKERS: None

ACTION: Continued to November 10, 2022

AYES: Braun, Ruiz, Diamond, Imperial, Koppel, Moore, Tanner

2. 2020-009836DRP (D. WINSLOW: (628) 652-7335)
133 GRAND VIEW AVENUE – east side between Romain and 21st Streets; Lot 023A in Assessor's Block 2753 (District 8) - Request for **Discretionary Review** of Building Permit no. 2020.0923.4782 for the construction of a rear horizontal addition to an existing single-family dwelling within a RH-2 (Residential-House, Two Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District. This action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section [31.04\(h\)](#).

Preliminary Recommendation: Do Not Take Discretionary Review and Approve

WITHDRAWN

SPEAKERS: None

ACTION: Withdrawn

13. [2016-011827ENX](#) (X. LIANG: (628) 652-7316)
1500 15TH STREET – northwest corner of South Van Ness Avenue; Lots 016 and 018 in Assessor's Block 3548 (District 9) – Request for **Large Project Authorization**, pursuant to Planning Code (PC) Sections 329 and 843, to permit a project greater than 25,000 square feet of floor area and 75 feet in height within a UMU (Urban Mixed Use) Zoning District and 58-X Height and Bulk District, to construct an eleven-story, 120-foot tall, 72,289 square foot, mixed-use building with approximately 2,871 square feet of ground-floor commercial uses, 189 residential group housing units (189 beds), and 64 Class 1 and 6 Class 2 bicycle parking spaces, under the Individually Requested State Density Bonus Program (PC Section 206.6 and California Government Code Section 65915). The Project seeks waivers from development standards for Rear Yard (PC Section 134) and Building Height (PC Section 260) to achieve a 50% density bonus, and a concession or incentive for Open Space (Section 135) to reduce housing costs. This action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section [31.04\(h\)](#).

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

SPEAKERS: John Kevlin – Requesting for continuance

Steven – Against continuance

ACTION: Continued to November 17, 2022

AYES: Braun, Ruiz, Diamond, Imperial, Koppel, Moore, Tanner

15. [2021-011845DRP](#) (D. WINSLOW: (628) 652-7335)
1950 FRANKLIN STREET – southeast corner of Washington Street; Lot 009 in Assessor's Block 0618 (District 2) – Request for **Discretionary Review** of Building Permit no. 2021.1214.4367 for the construction of four new accessory dwelling units to the existing garage of four-story multi-family apartment building per CA Government Code Section 65852.2(e); and renovation of existing storage space to relocate parking within a RM-2 (Residential-Mixed, Medium Density) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District. This action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section [31.04\(h\)](#).
Preliminary Recommendation: Do Not Take Discretionary Review and Approve

SPEAKERS: None
ACTION: Withdrawn

B. CONSENT CALENDAR

All matters listed hereunder constitute a Consent Calendar, are considered to be routine by the Planning Commission, and may be acted upon by a single roll call vote of the Commission. There will be no separate discussion of these items unless a member of the Commission, the public, or staff so requests, in which event the matter shall be removed from the Consent Calendar and considered as a separate item at this or a future hearing

3. [2022-002437CUA](#) (J. SACCHI: (628) 652-7308)
270 COLUMBUS AVENUE – southeast corner at Broadway; Lots 022 and 023 of Assessor's Block 0162 (District 3) – Request for **Conditional Use Authorization**, pursuant to Planning Code Section 303 and 714 to establish a Bar use within an approximately 5,478 square-foot vacant commercial space on the basement, ground floor, and mezzanine level of the subject property within the Broadway NCD (Neighborhood Commercial District) Zoning District and 65-A-1 Height and Bulk District. No interior or exterior alterations are proposed. This action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section [31.04\(h\)](#).
Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

SPEAKERS: None
ACTION: Approved with Conditions
AYES: Braun, Ruiz, Diamond, Imperial, Koppel, Moore, Tanner
MOTION: [21182](#)

5. [2022-003802CUA](#) (S. YOUNG: (628) 652-7349)
1869 UNION STREET – south side between Laguna Street and Octavia Street; Lot 026A in Assessor's Block 0543 (District 2) – Request for **Conditional Use Authorization** pursuant to Planning Code Sections 303, 303.1, 703.4, and 725 to establish a Formula Retail Use (d.b.a. StretchLab, a membership and drop-in Personal Service Use offering group and one-on-one assisted stretching) in an approximately 1,124 square foot vacant ground floor commercial space which was previously occupied by another retail use (d.b.a. Jest Jewels). Interior modifications to the ground floor commercial space and minor storefront improvements are proposed. There will be no expansion of the existing building envelope

with the proposed project. The project site is located within the Union Street NCD (Neighborhood Commercial District) Zoning District and 40-X height and Bulk District. This action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section [31.04\(h\)](#).

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

SPEAKERS: None
ACTION: Approved with Conditions
AYES: Braun, Ruiz, Diamond, Imperial, Koppel, Moore, Tanner
MOTION: [21183](#)

6. [2022-008360CUA](#) (K. BOTN: (628) 652-7311)
580 GREEN STREET – northeast corner of Stockton Street; Lot 020A in Assessor's Block 0116 (District 3) – Request for **Conditional Use Authorization**, pursuant to Planning Code Sections 178, 303 and 722 to establish an approximately 3,070 square foot General Grocery Store use (dba. Lukes Local) on the first floor of the subject property. There will be no expansion of the existing building envelope with the proposed project. The project site is located within the North Beach NCD (Neighborhood Commercial District) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District. This action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section [31.04\(h\)](#).

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

SPEAKERS: None
ACTION: Approved with Conditions
AYES: Braun, Ruiz, Diamond, Imperial, Koppel, Moore, Tanner
MOTION: [21184](#)

C. COMMISSION MATTERS

7. Consideration of Adoption:
- [Draft Minutes for September 29, 2022](#)

SPEAKERS: None
ACTION: Adopted
AYES: Braun, Ruiz, Diamond, Imperial, Koppel, Moore, Tanner

8. Commission Comments/Questions

President Tanner:

Thank you. I'll begin this portion with our land acknowledgement.

The Planning Commission acknowledges that we are on the unceded ancestral homeland of the Ramaytush Ohlone, who are the original inhabitants of the San Francisco Peninsula. As the indigenous stewards of this land and in accordance with their traditions, the Ramaytush Ohlone have never ceded, lost, nor forgotten their responsibilities as the caretakers of this place, as well as for all peoples who reside in their traditional territory. As guests, we recognize that we benefit from living and working on their traditional homeland. We wish to pay our respects by acknowledging the Ancestors, Elders, and

Relatives of the Ramaytush Ohlone community and by affirming their sovereign rights as First Peoples.

Commissioner Imperial:

Yeah, I'd like to make a comment on, I think just in general for me, I'd like to have a, and I'm still thinking in terms of like, to have a joint hearing with the Historical Preservation but in what topic, that's something I'm trying to think about as well in terms, I would like to hear about the discussions, especially that there is also an upcoming, a very public demanded Castro Theater. But I hope in the future, we can have a joint hearing with the Historical Preservation Commission.

President Tanner:

A joint hearing on a, not necessarily on that specific topic but a more maybe broader discussion.

Commissioner Imperial:

Not necessarily. Yes, more on a broader discussion.

President Tanner:

Okay, great. That would be, I think, exciting. I don't know if there are any comments or questions.

Commissioner Imperial:

Or an interest if the Commissioners would like to focus on something.

Rich Hillis, Planning Director:

And certainly, you've heard here and they've been hearing in more detail about the Citywide Surveys so that may be a topic we want to talk to them or have at a joint hearing. The Housing Element is also something that's been before the Preservation Commission as well so that's another topic we could discuss in a joint hearing.

President Tanner:

I think the Survey is quite robust and it would be good to get an update.

Rich Hillis, Planning Director:

Yup.

Vice President Moore:

I too would also like to suggest a joint meeting with Public Health Commission. I heard last night that the Laguna Honda decision has been extended by one year which is obviously a big sigh of relief for everybody but that would indeed give us more room to hear what the Health Commission is thinking and how they are trying to prepare for the upcoming year.

President Tanner:

Great. Thank you, Commissioners.

D. DEPARTMENT MATTERS**9. Director's Announcements****Rich Hillis, Planning Director:**

Commissioners, I just wanted to make you aware and some of you are aware because we've spoken to you about a potential change to our schedule to adopt the Housing Element. And we will have this on calendar next week so we can have a back and forth on it because it could be fairly significant. The change we need to make in our schedule. Just a quick summary, we, the Housing Element is due to the state by January 31st but there is a grace period built into the code of 120 days which we've been working under the assumption that if we have until May 31st to submit our Housing Element, we would not be out of compliance during that grace period. We've received, just last week a clarification from HCD who has been very much aware of our schedules throughout this entire process. That that may not be correct, that we may be out of compliance come January 31st if we do not have an approved Housing Element. And we don't want to be out of compliance because it could jeopardize potential funding sources that the state has around housing or transportation. It could also lead to projects being submitted under what's called the Builder's Remedy where zoning wouldn't necessarily, we wouldn't take into account our current zoning, and we can talk more about this next week. But I just wanted to give you a heads up. There's been some media coverage about it in the Examiner and the Business Times. So, we will come talk to you and we will calendar this next week.

10. Review of Past Events at the Board of Supervisors, Board of Appeals and Historic Preservation Commission

None.

E. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT

SPEAKERS: Georgia Schuttish – October 12th was anniversary of Commission approving Residential Flat Policy. Vote to approve it was 5 to 1, Some of the extreme Alterations involving Flats created "Monster Homes" by absorbing one flat, reduced in size, relegated to a location behind the garage. This was facilitated by Section 317 "loophole" beyond Demo Calcs not being stringent enough because the Calcs have never been adjusted as the Commission has the Legislative Authority to do per Section 317 (b) (2) (D). The intent of the Policy is to prevent housing from "disappearing" by being absorbed into the larger unit. Which would mean the loss of a FLAT, which is likely to occur when a FLAT is relocated within a structure. Exposure and location of the Flats within the Structure are as important as size in preserving this typology of housing going forward, particularly since the Draft Housing Element proposes to codify this Policy.

Eileen Boken - Safety and Resilience Element, 1906 post earthquake catastrophic fires, FEMA grant

F. REGULAR CALENDAR

The Commission Hearing Procedures provide for presentations by staff; when applicable, followed by a presentation of the project sponsor team; followed by public comment. Please be advised that the project sponsor team includes: the sponsor(s) or their designee, lawyers, architects, engineers, expeditors, and/or other advisors.

11. [2020-002065CWP](#) (C. DE MESA: (628) 652-7476)
SUNSET FORWARD STRATEGIES – Planning Department staff, District 4 Supervisor Gordon Mar, and representatives from the District 4 Youth and Families Network will present the Sunset Forward community planning process and strategies. The Strategies aimed to stabilize low- and moderate-income families and seniors in the Sunset with a focus on housing, small businesses and commercial corridors, and neighborhood services. Staff is seeking an **Endorsement** from the Planning Commission of Sunset Forward Strategies and that the Commission and City review and consider community needs, priorities, and strategies outlined in Sunset Forward when taking future actions on projects in District 4.
Preliminary Recommendation: Endorsement

SPEAKERS: = Rich Hillis – Introduction
 = Carla De Mesa – Staff presentation
 + Ben Wong, Wah Mei School – Presentation
 + Supervisor Gordon Mar – Closing remarks
 + Lily Wong – Quality community engagement
 + Cody Friesenborg Lee – Community will greatly benefit
 + Lamar Heystek – Safer Westside
 + Jessica Win – Great bridge building process
 + Speaker – Serves as a model to community engagement
 + Matt Pemberton – Great opportunity for community voice is heard
 + Jessica Ho – Endorse
 + Dawn Stickle – New era for the community to work together
 + Don – Demonstrate an honest attempt to voice community efforts
 + Annie Cheung – Access to senior housing and other resources for the well-being of seniors
 + Jeff – SB50
 = Eileen Boken – Document inconsistency
 = Miriam Chion – Response to comments and questions
 ACTION: Adopted a Resolution of Endorsement
 AYES: Braun, Ruiz, Diamond, Imperial, Koppel, Moore, Tanner
 RESOLUTION: [21185](#)

- 12a. [2018-002524CUA](#) (G. PANTOJA: (628) 652-7380)
20-28 FOUNTAIN STREET – west side between 24th and 25th Streets; Lots 085 and 086 in Assessor's Block 6501 (District 8) – Request for **Conditional Use Authorization** pursuant to Planning Code Sections 207, 209.1, and 303 for the merger of two existing lots, the construction of two three-story over basement duplexes, and the addition of an Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) at an existing single-family residence for a total of six dwelling units within a RH-2 (Residential-House, Two-Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District. This action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section [31.04\(h\)](#).

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

SPEAKERS: = Gabriela Pantoja – Staff report
 + Earle Weiss – Project sponsor presentation
 - Carl – Reject the front façade variance
 - Chris Lewis – Size and scope is too large
 = Georgia Schuttish – Entitlement process
 - Speaker - Do not allow merging of the two lots
 - Speaker – Steep grade
 = Corey Teague – Response to comments and questions
 ACTION: Approved with Conditions
 AYES: Braun, Ruiz, Diamond, Imperial, Koppel, Moore, Tanner
 MOTION: [21186](#)

- 12b. [2018-002524VAR](#) (G. PANTOJA: (628) 652-7380)
20-28 FOUNTAIN STREET – west side of Fountain Street and between 24th and 25th Streets; Lots 085 and 086 in Assessor's Block 6501 (District 8) – Request for **Variance** pursuant to **Planning Code Sections 132 and 134** for the merger of two existing lots, the construction of two three-story over basement duplexes, and the addition of an Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) at an existing single-family residence for a total of six dwelling units within a RH-2 (Residential-House, Two-Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.

SPEAKERS: Same as item 12a.
 ACTION: ZA Closed the PH and took the matter under advisement.

- 14a. [2019-000499PRJ](#) (J. HORN: (628) 652-7366)
1 LA AVANZADA STREET – Sutro Tower; Lot 003 in Assessor's Block 2724 (District 8) – Staff will provide an **Informational Presentation** on the design alternatives and procedures related to the legalization of work completed without benefit of a permit at Sutro Tower.
Preliminary Recommendation: None – Informational
 (Continued from a Regular hearing on September 8, 2022)

SPEAKERS: = Jeff Horn – Staff report
 + Supervisor Myrna Melgar – Character defining feature was removed. Improvements required by the Federal communication commission with deadline for funding. Look at judicially. Staff review time.
 + Kristen – Project sponsor presentation
 + Darren Moshel – Permanent removal of cladding
 + Jim Rose – New cladding would impact operating budget
 + Tom Subrowsky – Tower essential for news/information/emergency
 + Scott Warren – Expedite the EIR. Tower importance, safety priority
 - Charlene Chen – Prioritize the safety of the neighborhood, keep the vertical cladding off the tower permanent
 - Walter Kaplan – Cladding merely an embellishment
 + Christine – Does not require the aviation paneling, no vertical cladding
 + Christian French, KCNS – Statutory deadline, expedite EIR process
 + Anne Bovak – Expedite EIR
 = Allison Vanderslice – Response to comments and questions

= Devyani Jain – Response to comments and questions
 = Dan Sider – Response to comments and questions

ACTION: None - Informational

- 14b. [2021-012569DRM](#) (J. HORN: (628) 652-7366)
1 LA AVANZADA STREET – Sutro Tower; Lot 003 in Assessor's Block 2724 (District 8) – Request for **Mandatory Discretionary Review**, pursuant to Planning Code Section 306.9, of Building Permit Application No. 2021.1123.3043 proposing the replacement of existing metal panels located on the lower three horizontal trusses of Sutro Tower within a RH-1(D) (Residential-House, One Family-Detached) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District. The Project has undergone environmental review pursuant to CEQA and Chapter 31 of the San Francisco Administrative Code. On October 23, 2008, the Final Environmental Impact Report (EIR) was certified by the Planning Commission through approval of Motion No. 20635. On May 18, 2022, the Planning Department published an Addendum to the Final EIR for the re-phase plan, finding that the Final EIR remains valid and no additional environmental review is required.
Preliminary Recommendation: Do Not Take Discretionary Review and Approve with Conditions
 (Continued from a Regular hearing on September 8, 2022)

SPEAKERS: Same as item 14a.
 ACTION: Took DR and Approved with Conditions
 AYES: Braun, Ruiz, Diamond, Imperial, Koppel, Moore, Tanner
 DRA: [798](#)

G. DISCRETIONARY REVIEW CALENDAR

The Commission Discretionary Review Hearing Procedures provide for presentations by staff; followed by the DR requestor team; followed by public comment opposed to the project; followed by the project sponsor team; followed by public comment in support of the project. Please be advised that the DR requestor and project sponsor teams include: the DR requestor and sponsor or their designee, lawyers, architects, engineers, expeditors, and/or other advisors.

16. [2018-017283DRP](#) (D. WINSLOW: (628) 652-7335)
476 LOMBARD STREET – north side between Stockton Street and Grant Avenue; Lot 017A in Assessor's Block 0062 (District 3) – Request for **Discretionary Review** of Building Permit no. 2018.1019.3722 for the construction a three-story horizontal addition to an existing three-story, one-family residence within a RH-3 (Residential-House, Three Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District. This action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section [31.04](#)(h).
Preliminary Recommendation: Do Not Take Discretionary Review and Approve

SPEAKERS: = David Winslow – Staff report
 - Shelley Bradford Bell – DR requestor
 + Renee Tannenbaum – Project sponsor
 ACTION: No DR
 AYES: Braun, Ruiz, Diamond, Imperial, Koppel, Tanner
 NAYS: Moore
 DRA: [799](#)

4. [2022-001239CUA](#) (C. MAY: (628) 652-7359)
1700 CALIFORNIA STREET – northwest corner Van Ness Avenue; Lots 037 and 040 in Assessor's Block 0642 (District 2) – Request for **Conditional Use Authorization** pursuant to Planning Code Sections 209.3 and 303 to permit a change of use on the third floor of the subject property from a General Office use to a Health Service use and to legalize a change of use on the second floor of the subject property from a General Office use to a Health Service use within a RC-4 (Residential-Commercial, High-Density) Zoning District, Van Ness SUD (Special Use District), Van Ness Automotive SUD (Special Use District), and 80-D Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

SPEAKERS: = Christopher May – Staff report
+ David Valva – Project sponsor report
- Brittany Wilson – Request to pull from Consent Calendar due to concerns
ACTION: Approved with Conditions
AYES: Braun, Ruiz, Diamond, Imperial, Koppel, Tanner
ABSENT: Moore
MOTION: [21187](#)

ADJOURNMENT 5:25 PM

ADOPTED NOVEMBER 3, 2022