

SAN FRANCISCO PLANNING COMMISSION

Meeting Minutes

Commission Chambers, Room 400
City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Thursday, May 23, 2024
12:30 p.m.
Regular Meeting

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT: DIAMOND, MOORE, BRAUN, IMPERIAL, SO, WILLIAMS
COMMISSIONERS ABSENT: KOPPEL

THE MEETING WAS CALLED TO ORDER BY PRESIDENT DIAMOND AT 1:09 PM

STAFF IN ATTENDANCE: Veronica Flores, Audrey Merlone, Kate Conner, Maggie Laush, Elizabeth Mau, Matt Dito, Elizabeth Watty – Director of Current Planning, Rich Hillis – Planning Director, Jonas P. Ionin – Commission Secretary

SPEAKER KEY:

- + INDICATES A SPEAKER IN SUPPORT OF AN ITEM;
- INDICATES A SPEAKER IN OPPOSITION TO AN ITEM; AND
- = INDICATES A NEUTRAL SPEAKER OR A SPEAKER WHO DID NOT INDICATE SUPPORT OR OPPOSITION.

A. CONSIDERATION ITEMS PROPOSED FOR CONTINUANCE

The Commission will consider a request for continuance to a later date. The Commission may choose to continue the item to the date proposed below, to continue the item to another date, or to hear the item on this calendar.

1. 2022-000438DRP (D. WINSLOW: (628) 652-7335)
320-322 FREDERICK STREET – north side between Clayton and Belvedere Streets; Lot 026 in Assessor's Block 1253 (District 8) – Request for **Discretionary Review** of Building Permit No. 2021.1208.3935 to construct a four-story horizontal rear addition and add accessory dwelling unit to a three-unit residential building within a RM-3 (Residential Mixed – High Density) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District. The Planning Department found that the project is exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). The Commission's action

constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section [31.04\(h\)](#).

Preliminary Recommendation: Do Not Take Discretionary Review and Approve

(Continued from Regular hearing on April 11, 2024)

(Proposed for Continuance to June 6, 2024)

SPEAKERS: None
 ACTION: Continued to June 6, 2024
 AYES: So, Williams, Braun, Imperial, Moore, Diamond
 ABSENT: Koppel

2. 2023-007010CUA (K. BOTN: (628) 652-7311)

1310 JUNIPERO SERRA BOULEVARD – west side of Junipero Serra Blvd at the cross street of Thomas More Way; Lot 036 in Assessor's Block 7380 (District 7) – Request for **Conditional Use Authorization** pursuant to Planning Code Section 303 and 209.1 to construct a one-story 25-foot tall accessory maintenance and facility building for the San Francisco Golf Club (approximately 20,060 gross square feet) the building will house administration offices for the maintenance staff, a repair shop for maintenance purposes for the San Francisco Golf Club. The Project also proposes a surface parking lot consisting of 25 parking spaces located to the west of the proposed maintenance facility. The subject property is located within a RH-1(D) (Residential House, One Family - Detached) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District. The Planning Department found that the project is exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). The Commission's action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section [31.04\(h\)](#).

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

(Continued from Regular hearing on April 25, 2024)

(Proposed for Continuance to June 13, 2024)

SPEAKERS: None
 ACTION: Continued to June 13, 2024
 AYES: So, Williams, Braun, Imperial, Moore, Diamond
 ABSENT: Koppel

3. 2023-011051OFA (K. AGNIHOTRI: (628)-652-7454)

350 RHODE ISLAND STREET – west side between 16th and 17th Streets; Lots 003 and 004 in Assessor's Block 3957 (District 10) – Request for **Office Allocation** pursuant to Planning Code Sections 303, 321, 322 and 838, to modify the Project Findings (2)(c)(1), (2)(c)(3), related to the quality of design of the project under Motion No. 14988 and remove the existing sunshade louvres on the east and south facades of the subject four-story building within the UMU (Urban Mixed Use) Zoning District and 48-X, 68-X Height and Bulk District. No other modifications or expansion is proposed. The Planning Department found that the project is exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). The Commission's action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section [31.04\(h\)](#).

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

(Continued from Regular hearing on April 11, 2024)

Note: On April 11, 2024, after hearing and closing public comment, continued to May 23, 2024 with direction from the Commission by a vote of +6 -0.

WITHDRAWN

SPEAKERS: None
 ACTION: Withdrawn

16. [2015-006356CUA-02](#) (M. DITO: (628) 652-7358)

336 PIERCE STREET – east side between Page and Oak Streets; Lot 020 in Assessor's Block 0844 (District 5) – Request for **Conditional Use Authorization** pursuant to Planning Code Sections 209.2, 303, and 317 to legalize the demolition of an Unauthorized Dwelling Unit (UDU) at the rear of the subject property. A legal accessory

structure in the rear yard was previously converted to a UDU and subsequently demolished. The rear structure will not be reconstructed and the UDU will not be replaced. The subject property is located within a RM-1 (Residential, Mixed – Low-Density) Zoning District, Family Housing Opportunity SUD (Special Use District), and 40-X Height and Bulk District. The project seeks to abate Planning Enforcement Case No. 2015-005370ENF.

Preliminary Recommendation: Disapprove

SPEAKERS: None
 ACTION: Continued to June 13, 2024
 AYES: So, Williams, Braun, Imperial, Moore, Diamond
 ABSENT: Koppel

17. [2022-000156CUA](#) (J. HORN: (628) 652- 7366)

1131-1133 ANZA STREET – south side between 3rd and 2nd Avenues; Lot 051 in Assessor's Block 1545 (District 1) – Request for **Conditional Use Authorization** pursuant to Planning Code Sections 303 and 317 to demolish an existing 1,859 gross-square-foot, two-story two-family dwelling and the new construction of a 5,455 gross-square-foot, four-story two-family dwelling with an accessory dwelling unit within a RH-2 (Residential-House, Two Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District. The Planning Department found that the project is exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). The Commission's action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section [31.04](#) (h).

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

SPEAKERS: Juan Lopez – Request to hear today
 Celestino Velasco – Request to hear today
 Noah – Request to hear today
 Elizabeth Watty – Response to comments and questions
 ACTION: Continued to June 13, 2024
 AYES: So, Williams, Braun, Imperial, Moore, Diamond
 ABSENT: Koppel

B. COMMISSION MATTERS

4. LAND ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

Commissioner Braun:

The Planning Commission acknowledges that we are on the unceded ancestral homeland of the Ramaytush Ohlone, who are the original inhabitants of the San Francisco Peninsula. As the indigenous stewards of this land and in accordance with their traditions, the Ramaytush Ohlone have never ceded, lost, nor forgotten their responsibilities as the caretakers of this place, as well as for all peoples who reside in their traditional territory. As guests, we recognize that we benefit from living and working on their traditional homeland. We wish to pay our respects by acknowledging the ancestors, elders, and relatives of the Ramaytush Ohlone community and by affirming their sovereign rights as first peoples.

5. CONSIDERATION OF ADOPTION:

- [Draft Minutes for May 9, 2024](#)

SPEAKERS: None
 ACTION: Adopted as Corrected
 AYES: So, Williams, Braun, Imperial, Moore, Diamond
 ABSENT: Koppel

6. COMMISSION COMMENTS/QUESTIONS

None.

C. DEPARTMENT MATTERS

7. DIRECTOR'S ANNOUNCEMENTS

None.

8. REVIEW OF PAST EVENTS AT THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS, BOARD OF APPEALS AND HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Veronica Flores:

Good afternoon, Commissioners. Veronica Flores, filling in for Aaron Starr today.

Land Use Committee

There were two Planning Department items at the Land Use Committee this week.

240193 Hearing - Parcel Delivery Service. Sponsors: Chan; Dorsey, Stefani, Mandelman, Preston, Melgar and Engardio. Staff: Flores.

First up was the Parcel Delivery Service ordinance. This was a follow-up legislation to refine the additional criteria for consideration, including the impact of Parcel Delivery Services on educational institutions and the use of artificial intelligence and autonomous vehicles. This was placed on your Consent Agenda for April 25th and was recommended for approval. During the Committee hearing, there was one public comment in support of the proposed Ordinance and there was no Supervisor discussion. The Committee recommended this item with positive recommendation as committee report.

240353 Hearing - Landmark Designation - The Gregangelo Museum. Sponsors: Melgar. Staff: LaValley.

Gregangelo Museum is an evolving San Francisco-inspired folk-art piece that possesses high artistic value as an immersive visual, performance, and circus arts environment contributing to the unique arts and culture of San Francisco. This item appeared before the Historic Preservation Commission on March 20, 2024. During the Committee hearing, Supervisors Preston and Peskin joined as co-sponsors. The Committee then forwarded this item to the full Board with positive recommendation.

Full Board

240193 Hearing - Parcel Delivery Service. Sponsors: Chan; Dorsey, Stefani, Mandelman, Preston, Melgar and Engardio. Staff: Flores. Passed First Read.

240513 Hearing - Adoption of Findings Related to Disapproval of Conditional Use Authorization - 2351 Mission Street. Sponsors: N/A. Staff: Starr. Approved.

D. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT

SPEAKERS: Georgia Schuttish – Referencing emails send on May 3, 2024 on 63 Carmel Street and on May 10, 2024 on Lot 22 for San Bruno Avenue. The issue is Demo Calcs. Project at 474 Valley Street also has this issue. Project approved with horizontal/vertical expansion, façade obliteration, complete interior remodel w/SFH becoming two units. No DR and no Board of Appeals. Entitlement currently for sale as potential SFH. Another Alteration at 565 29th Street also with Demo Calc issues and no DR or BoA sold Entitlement in the past few months. DEMO CALCS

SHOULD HAVE BEEN AND SHOULD BE ADJUSTED to more stringent levels per 317 (b)(2)(D). See handout: Reduced values “year two”. Planning and DBI should not allow revisions that skirt policies. Best solution is to adjust the Demo Calcs and encourage second unit/ADU within existing sound structure. No garage required per Planning Code makes this possible.

Juan Lopez – 1131 Anza Street, tenant history

Noah – 1131 Anza Street, tenant

Celestino Velasco – 1133 Anza Street, tenant

Sue Hestor – Advance Calendar on San Bruno Avenue

E. REGULAR CALENDAR

The Commission Hearing Procedures provide for presentations by staff; when applicable, followed by a presentation of the project sponsor team; followed by public comment. Please be advised that the project sponsor team includes: the sponsor(s) or their designee, lawyers, architects, engineers, expeditors, and/or other advisors.

9. [2024-001873PCAMAP](#) (A. MERLONE: (628) 652-7534)

RESIDENTIAL ENCLAVE-MIXED DISTRICT, REZONE 135 KISSLING STREET [BF 240173] – Planning Code and Zoning Map Amendments – Ordinance, sponsored by Supervisor Dorsey, amending the Planning Code to conditionally permit vehicle storage lots in the Residential Enclave-Mixed (RED-MX) District and to update citations and cross-references in the text and tables of specified Mixed Use Districts; amending the Zoning Map to rezone 135 Kissling Street, Assessor’s Parcel Block No. 3516, Lot No. 068, from Residential Enclave (RED) to RED-MX; affirming the Planning Department’s determination under the California Environmental Quality Act; making findings of consistency with the General Plan, and the eight priority policies of Planning Code, Section 101.1; and making findings of public necessity, convenience, and welfare pursuant to Planning Code, Section 302.

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Modifications

(Continued from Regular hearing on May 2, 2024)

SPEAKERS: = Audrey Merlone – Staff report
 + Madison Tam, Legislative Aide to Sup. Dorsey – Introduction to the ordinance
 + John Kevlin – Will come back for the CUA later
 = Rich Hillis – Response to comments and questions

ACTION: Approved with Modifications

AYES: So, Williams, Braun, Diamond

NAYS: Imperial, Moore

ABSENT: Koppel

RESOLUTION: [21566](#)

10. [2023-006117PCA](#) (A. MERLONE: (628) 652-7534)

DENSITY EXCEPTION ON SPECIFIED LOTS WITH NUMERICAL DENSITY LIMITS [BF 230734, VERSION 3] – Planning Code Amendments – Ordinance, introduced by Mayor Breed and Supervisor Melgar, amended by President Peskin, amending the Planning Code to allow density exceptions on lots subject to Numerical Density Limits; affirming the Planning Department’s determination under the California Environmental Quality Act; and making public necessity, convenience, and welfare findings under Planning Code, Section 302, and findings of consistency with the General plan and the eight priority policies of Planning Code, Section 101.1.

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Modifications

SPEAKERS: = Audrey Merlone – Staff report
 = Nate Horrell, Legislative aide to Sup Peskin – Introduction to the ordinance
 - Georgia Schuttish – RHNA audit, survey in the neighborhood before zoning
 - Reina Tello – Piece mail approach, lack of family sized units, public participation
 - Calvin Mulch – Economic impact on neighborhood serving retail uses
 - Jane Cook – Residents were not aware, effect on parking, traffic and neighborhood
 - Monica Morse – Limited notice received, many are historic districts,

- Angelica Cabande – An attempt to circumvent HomeSF
- Marty Delalas – Rent destabilization is not the same as affordable housing
- Emily Wang – Density deregulation, no community outreach
- Ana Cristina Arana – Ignoring equity-oriented actions
- Steve Lee – Ensure tenants and neighborhood are protected from displacements
- Erica Swag – Ignores the fair housing laws and concepts
- Cathy Lipscomb – Focus on racial and social equity, low-income households
- Jake Price – Letter of concerns email
- Annie Fryman – How will apply on commercial corridor
- = Rich Hillis – Response to comments and questions

ACTION: Motion to Approve without Staff Modifications failed
 AYES: Williams, Imperial, Moore
 NAYS: So, Braun, Diamond
 ABSENT: Koppel

11. [2024-002694PCA](#) (V. FLORES: (628) 652-7525)

DIVISADERO STREET NEIGHBORHOOD COMMERCIAL TRANSIT DISTRICT [BF 240263] – **Planning Code Amendments** – Ordinance, sponsored by Supervisor Preston, amending the Planning Code to permit liquor stores in the buildings with off-street parking accessed on Broderick Street within the Divisadero Street Neighborhood Commercial Transit District; affirming the Planning Department’s determination under the California Environmental Quality Act; and making public necessity, convenience, and welfare findings under Planning Code, Section 302, and findings of consistency with the General Plan, and the eight priority policies of Planning Code, Section 101.1.

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Modifications

SPEAKERS: = Veronica Flores – Staff report
 + Preston Kilgore, Legislative aide to Sup Preston – Introduction to ordinance
 + James Lewis Falletti – Local and small business
 ACTION: Approved with Modification No. 2 and the technical footnote provided by Staff, encouraging the Board to consider Modification No. 1.
 AYES: So, Williams, Braun, Imperial, Moore, Diamond
 ABSENT: Koppel
 RESOLUTION: [21567](#)

12. [2024-003742PPS](#)

880 MCALLISTER STREET – north side between Laguna and Gough Streets; Lot 027 in Assessor’s Block 0770 (District 5) – **Informational Presentation** for the proposed construction of a housing development project pursuant to Government Code Section 65913.4 (SB 423), in an area subject to Government Code section 65913.4(q). The project consists of a 115-unit 100% affordable senior housing building with a 1,200 square foot ground floor limited corner commercial use. The project includes demolition of existing buildings at 880 and 870 McAllister Street and a portion of the adjacent surface parking area. The project sponsor submitted a notice of intent to construct the project on April 8, 2024. After the hearing, a formal application may be submitted following the project sponsor’s review of any public testimony and written comments from the hearing.

Preliminary Recommendation: None – Informational

SPEAKERS: = Kate Conner – Staff report
 + Landon Taylor – Project sponsor presentation
 + Faraaz Mirza – Design presentation
 + Maddie Scott – Will benefit the community
 + Bobby Sisk – Bethel AME church, affordability will be maintained
 + Chancellor Yu – Redevelopment
 ACTION: Reviewed and Commented

13. [2023-009969CUA](#) (M. LAUSH: (628) 652-7339)
249 TEXAS STREET – east side between Mariposa and 18th Streets; Lot 017A in Assessor's Block 4001 (District 10)
 – Request for **Conditional Use Authorization** pursuant to Planning Code Sections 303 and 317 to demolish an existing three-story over basement building with one Dwelling Unit and one Unauthorized Dwelling Unit and to construct a four-story over basement building with two Dwelling Units within a RH-2 (Residential-House, Two Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District. The Planning Department found that the project is exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). The Commission's action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section [31.04](#) (h).
Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

SPEAKERS: = Maggie Laush – Staff report
 + John Maniscalco – Project sponsor presentation
 - Sasha Gala – Organized opposition
 - Kathleen Roberts Block – Organized opposition
 - Speaker – Organized opposition
 - Emily Block – Organized opposition
 - Georgia Schuttish – Does not meet the preponderance of the criteria, consider taking off the top floor
 + Speaker – Response to comments and questions
 = Liz Watty – Response to comments and questions
 = Kate Conner – Response to comments and questions
 + Joanne Siu – Response to comments and questions
 = Austin Yang, Deputy City Attorney – Response to comments and questions

ACTION: After a motion to approve failed +3 -3 (Williams, Imperial, Moore against; Koppel absent); Continued to June 13, 2024

AYES: So, Braun, Moore, Diamond

NAYS: Williams, Imperial

ABSENT: Koppel

14. [2022-006764CUA](#) (E. MAU: (628) 652-7583)
680 MISSION STREET – north side between Annie and 3rd Streets; Lot 063 in Assessor's Block 3707 (District 6) – Request for **Conditional Use Authorization** pursuant to Planning Code Sections 202.10, 210.2, and 303 to classify 35 dwelling units at the subject property as Intermediate Length Occupancy (ILO) units. Classification as an ILO unit allows a dwelling unit to be offered for occupancy for an initial stay with a duration of greater than 30 days but less than one year (365 days). ILO units are a use characteristic. The units proposed for ILO classification will remain dwelling units. The subject property is located within a C-3-O (Downtown-Office) Zoning District and a 500-I Height and Bulk District.
Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions
 (Continued from Regular hearing on May 9, 2024)

SPEAKERS: = Elizabeth Mau – Staff report
 + Speaker – Project sponsor presentation
 = Matt Dito – Response to comments and questions

ACTION: Approved with Conditions

AYES: So, Braun, Imperial, Moore, Diamond

NAYS: Williams

ABSENT: Koppel

MOTION: [21568](#)

15. [2023-002811CUA](#) (M. DITO: (628) 652-7358)
466 ELIZABETH STREET – north side between Noe and Sanchez Streets; Lot 020 in Assessor's Block 3653 (District 8) – Request for **Conditional Use Authorization** pursuant to Planning Code Sections 303 and 317 to legalize the Residential Demolition (as defined by Planning Code Section 317(b)(2)(B) and (C)) of the existing two-story two-

family dwelling. The project proposes excavation to create a new first story, a horizontal addition at the front and rear of the existing stories, and a one-story vertical addition. The Project results in a four-story two-family dwelling. The subject property is located within a RH-3 (Residential, House – Three-Family) Zoning District, the Central Neighborhoods Large Residence Special Use District, Family and Senior Housing Opportunity SUD (Special Use District), and 40-X Height and Bulk District. The project seeks to abate Planning Enforcement Case No. 2023-000513ENF.

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

SPEAKERS: = Matt Dito – Staff report
 + Daniel Turner – Project sponsor presentation
 + Speaker – Project sponsor presentation
 - Georgia Schuttish – Project was a Demolition of sound housing from the beginning due to scope of work, not dry rot. Demo Calcs manipulated. See all the Matrices in submission sent May 17th. In order to legalize Demolition: Should there be two front doors for each Flat with direct egress to Elizabeth Street? Will the kitchens both be complete or will one be a large wet bar with a minimal stove? Is the interior space efficiently used? Should there be an ADU? Is there any possibility of the project being “affordable by design”? Should the original breezeway or Tradesman’s Entrance be preserved? Does the project need a parking garage since that requirement has been removed from the Code? Does this project as proposed comply with the housing goals for this High Resource Area? Or the housing goals of the Family and Senior Housing SUD? Does this project comply with the Residential Flat Policy?
 = Liz Watty – Response to comments and questions
ACTION: Approved with Conditions
AYES: So, Williams, Braun, Imperial, Moore, Diamond
ABSENT: Koppel
MOTION: [21569](#)

ADJOURNMENT 6:31 PM

ADOPTED JUNE 6, 2024