

SAN FRANCISCO PLANNING COMMISSION

Meeting Minutes

Commission Chambers, Room 400
City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Thursday, December 5, 2024
12:00 p.m.
Regular Meeting

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT: SO, MOORE, CAMPBELL, BRAUN, IMPERIAL, WILLIAMS
COMMISSIONERS ABSENT: MCGARRY

THE MEETING WAS CALLED TO ORDER BY PRESIDENT SO AT 12:07 PM

STAFF IN ATTENDANCE: Aaron Starr, Audrey Merlone, Veronica Flores, Oscar Grande, Malena Leon-Farrera, Monica Giacomucci, Gabriela Pantoja, Elizabeth Watty – Director of Current Planning, Rich Hillis – Planning Director, Jonas P. Ionin – Commission Secretary

SPEAKER KEY:

- + INDICATES A SPEAKER IN SUPPORT OF AN ITEM;
- INDICATES A SPEAKER IN OPPOSITION TO AN ITEM; AND
- = INDICATES A NEUTRAL SPEAKER OR A SPEAKER WHO DID NOT INDICATE SUPPORT OR OPPOSITION.

A. CONSIDERATION ITEMS PROPOSED FOR CONTINUANCE

The Commission will consider a request for continuance to a later date. The Commission may choose to continue the item to the date proposed below, to continue the item to another date, or to hear the item on this calendar.

1. 2024-004122CUA (M. DONG: (628) 652-7426)
1533 SLOAT BOULEVARD – south side between Clearfield Drive and Everglade Drive; Lot 003 in Assessor's Block 7255 (District 4) – Request for **Conditional Use Authorization** pursuant to Planning Code Sections 121.2, 303, 303.1, 713, 780.1 to establish an approximately 11,842 square-foot Formula Retail use for Gym (d.b.a "Planet Fitness") and to allow the use to operate 24 hours daily, within an existing one-story commercial-use building, within a NC-S (Neighborhood Commercial, Shopping Center) Zoning District and 26-40-X Height and Bulk

District. The Planning Department found that the project is exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). The Commission's action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section [31.04\(h\)](#).

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions
(Proposed for Continuance to January 30, 2025)

SPEAKERS: None
 ACTION: Continued to January 30, 2025
 AYES: Campbell, Williams, Braun, Imperial, Moore, So
 NAYS: None
 ABSENT: McGarry

12. [2024-007142CRV](#) (M. GIACOMUCCI: (628) 652-7414)
1035 HOWARD STREET – south side between Russ Street and Harriet Street; Lot 094 in Assessor's Block 3731 (District 6) – Resolution **Approving** a waiver of the Active Use requirements of Planning Code Section 145.1(c)(3) to allow less than 25 feet of Active Use at the ground floor and less than 15 feet at upper floors as part of a project that would include 1,540 gross square feet of Social Services Use, 23,911 gross square feet (gsf) of Self-Storage Use, and 43,996 gsf of Commercial Storage (a PDR use). Pursuant to Planning Code Section 145.1(d)(1), the Planning Commission may waive or modify certain street frontage requirements for historic buildings when the Historic Preservation Commission advises that the proposed project would enhance the feasibility of preserving the subject property. The Project was heard at the Historic Preservation Commission on December 4. The Project is located within a MUG (Mixed Use-General) Zoning District and 65-X, 85-X Height and Bulk District. The Planning Department found that the project is exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). The Commission's action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section [31.04\(h\)](#).

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve

SPEAKERS: None
 ACTION: Continued to January 16, 2025
 AYES: Campbell, Williams, Braun, Imperial, Moore, So
 NAYS: None
 ABSENT: McGarry

14. [2023-004904DRP-02](#) (T. GREENAN: (628) 652-7324)
2459-2461 FRANCISCO STREET – south side between Baker and Broderick Streets; Lot 029 in Assessor's Block 0931 (District 2) – Request for **Discretionary Review** of Planning Application No. 2023-004904PRJ for the construction of a 1250 sq. ft. addition on the third floor of an existing two-story building, interior remodeling on the second and third floors, a new roof deck on the first floor roof bump-out, addition of stairs from the second to third floor, and a small roof deck on the third floor within a RH-3 (Residential-House, Three Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District. The Planning Department found that the project is exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). The Commission's action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section [31.04\(h\)](#).

Preliminary Recommendation: Do Not Take Discretionary Review and Approve

SPEAKERS: None
 ACTION: Withdrawn

B. CONSENT CALENDAR

All matters listed hereunder constitute a Consent Calendar, are considered to be routine by the Planning Commission, and may be acted upon by a single roll call vote. There will be no separate discussion of these items unless a member of the Commission, the public, or staff so requests, in which event the matter shall be removed from the Consent Calendar and considered as a separate item at this or a future hearing.

2. [2024-005293CUA](#) (M. WOODS: (628) 652-7350)
 1515 UNION STREET – southwest corner of Van Ness Avenue; Lot 068 in Assessor’s Block 0546 (District 2) – Request for **Conditional Use Authorization** pursuant to Planning Code Sections 209.3, 303, and 303.1 to establish an approximately 3,000-square-foot Formula Retail Personal Service use for pilates studio (d.b.a. “Club Pilates”) within a vacant tenant space at the ground floor of an existing seven-story mixed-use building, within a RC-3 (Residential Commercial, Medium Density) Zoning District, Family and Senior Housing Opportunity SUD (Special Use District), Van Ness Avenue Area Plan, and 65-A Height and Bulk District. No exterior alterations are proposed to the subject building. The Planning Department found that the project is exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). The Commission’s action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section [31.04](#)(h).
Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

SPEAKERS: None
 ACTION: Approved with Conditions
 AYES: Campbell, Williams, Braun, Imperial, Moore, So
 NAYS: None
 ABSENT: McGarry
 MOTION: [21654](#)

C. COMMISSION MATTERS

3. LAND ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

Commissioner Imperial:

The Planning Commission acknowledges that we are on the unceded ancestral homeland of the Ramaytush Ohlone, who are the original inhabitants of the San Francisco Peninsula. As the indigenous stewards of this land and in accordance with their traditions, the Ramaytush Ohlone have never ceded, lost, nor forgotten their responsibilities as the caretakers of this place, as well as for all peoples who reside in their traditional territory. As guests, we recognize that we benefit from living and working on their traditional homeland. We wish to pay our respects by acknowledging the ancestors, elders, and relatives of the Ramaytush Ohlone community and by affirming their sovereign rights as first peoples.

4. CONSIDERATION OF ADOPTION:

- [Draft Minutes for November 14, 2024](#)

SPEAKERS: None
 ACTION: Adopted as Corrected
 AYES: Campbell, Williams, Braun, Imperial, Moore, So
 NAYS: None
 ABSENT: McGarry

- [Draft Minutes for November 21, 2024](#)

SPEAKERS: None
 ACTION: Adopted
 AYES: Campbell, Williams, Braun, Imperial, Moore, So
 NAYS: None
 ABSENT: McGarry

5. COMMISSION COMMENTS/QUESTIONS

Commissioner Campbell:

Thank you. I want to shine a light, no pun intended, on Let's Glow SF which is happening right now downtown. It's a wonderful free art festival. It's actually a projection art festival where 16 artists from around the world who have created light and projection art. It gets projected onto the buildings downtown, various buildings downtown, and it's a really wonderful intersection between art and architecture. I encourage everyone to go check it out again. It's free. It runs from December 6th to the 15th, so it starts tomorrow night. And I think there's a big kickoff party at the Ferry Building. So, if you want more information, Let's Glow SF has a website, just google it and you can get the map and all the buildings that are part of the festival. Thanks.

Commissioner Braun:

I just want to agree that it's a wonderful event. I go and look at all of the projections every year that it's been running. So, absolutely. It's wonderful.

6. [2025 HEARING SCHEDULE](#)

SPEAKERS:	None
ACTION:	Adopted as amended to include January 30th for the Lunar NY, April 24th for Easter, and September 4th for Labor Day.
AYES:	Campbell, Williams, Braun, Imperial, Moore, So
NAYS:	None
ABSENT:	McGarry

D. DEPARTMENT MATTERS

7. DIRECTOR'S ANNOUNCEMENTS

None.

8. REVIEW OF PAST EVENTS AT THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS, BOARD OF APPEALS AND HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Aaron Starr, Manager of Legislative Affairs:

Good afternoon, Commissioners Aaron Starr Manager of Legislative Affairs.

Land Use

The week Chair Melgar was absent from the Committee so she could attend Jury Duty. Supervisor Dorsey sat in on the committee but was not a voting member.

Planning Code, Zoning Map - 2301 Chestnut Street Special Sign District. Sponsor: Dorsey

The first item on the land use committee's agenda was Supervisor Stephaie's ordinance that would create a special sign district at 2301 Chestnut Street. Commissioners you heard this item on November 14th and recommended approval with one modification. This modification was to amend the Ordinance to allow all corner Commercial businesses in NC Districts to have two projecting signs.

Because Supervisor Stefani was recently elected and sworn into the state Assembly, Supervisor Dorsey took up sponsorship of this ordinance. While the commission's modification was not added to the original file, the ordinance was duplicated and Supervisor Doresy indicated that he would work on the amending the duplicated ordinance to allow two projecting signs for corner businesses in all NC Districts. The new ordinance would also likely sunset the special sign district as it would no longer be necessary.

The item was passed out of committee unanimously.

Planning Code - Impact Fees for Changes of Use From Production, Distribution, and Repair to Other Non-Residential Uses] 240901 Sponsor: Mayor

Next the Committee considered the mayor's proposed ordinance to remove Impact Fees for Changes of Use from Production, Distribution, and Repair to Other Non-Residential Uses. This item was continued from the Land Use Committee on 11/18 to allow for more community outreach.

During the committee hearing, Katy Tang, Director of the Mayor's office of Small Business, said the mayor was not in favor of amending the ordinance and requested it be passed out of committee as is. Supervisor Peskin then made a motion to table the ordinance given the mayor's unwillingness to amend it based on community feedback and concerns. The Committee then voted unanimously to table the ordinance effectively killing it.

Planning Code, Zoning Map - 30 Van Ness Avenue Special Use District; Amendment of Agreement for Sale of Real Estate

Next the Committee took up the 30 Van Ness SUD. This item was continued from 11/18. Supervisor Peskin indicated he still had more amendments he was working on for this ordinance and proposed continuance to 12/9. The Committee voted unanimously to continue the item to that date.

Planning Code - Minimum Densities for Residential Projects in RM, RC, and RTO Districts] 230596 Sponsors: Peskin; Chan

Last but not least the Land Use Committee took up Supervisor Peskin's ordinance that would institute minimum density requirements for Residential Projects in RM, RC, and RTO Districts. Our newer commissioners won't be familiar with this one, as it was originally heard by the Planning Commission on July 20, 2023. At that time the Commission voted to recommend approval with modifications. Those modifications were to:

1. Modify the Ordinance to replace the Conditional Use authorization requirement with objective, minimum density standards for new construction projects in the RM, RC, and RTO districts at 75% of the maximum density.
2. For new construction projects in the subject zoning districts, require that no unit be smaller than 1/3 the size of the largest unit in the building.
3. Replace the Ordinance's proposed list of exceptions to minimum densities and unit sizes with a simplified, single exception. That exception would be "Expansions of single-family homes may expand their Gross Floor Area by no more than 25% measured over 10 years, or to result in a home no more than 3,000sqft, whichever is greater.
4. Incentivize projects in the subject zoning districts to build "ideal" projects by removing the Conditional Use authorization for demolition, and public-initiated Discretionary Review.

During the hearing Supervisor Peskin introduced amendments to include all but one of the Planning Commissions' recommendations. The one not included would have allowed for demolition project to be exempt Conditional Use and DR hearings if specific standards were met.

The Committee accepted all Peskin's amendments, and the item was continued for one week as the amendments were substantive.

Full Board

Planning Code - 524 and 530 Howard Street - Transit Center District Open Space Impact Fee Waiver for 524 Howard Street, LLC] 240879 Sponsor: Dorsey Passed first read

Jonas P. Ionin, Commission Secretary:

I have no report from the Board of Appeals but the Historic Preservation Commission did meet yesterday and they considered several Legacy Business Registry applications and Adopted Recommendations for Approval for all four. The first was Ace Mailing, the second was African American Shakespeare Company, the third was J's Laundry, and finally, the Walter Adams Framing Retail were all adopted for recommendations for approval. And as stated, they considered 1035 Howard Street, and the modifications that they made was to not provide for exceptions for the ground floor, 25-foot depth active use, but allowing the exception to the upper floors, and so they were also very concerned about providing a robust streetscape and lighting plan along Howard and Russ Streets. So, hence the continuance into January for this project, when it will come back to you then. They also heard an informational presentation on the Chinese American historic context statement.

E. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT

SPEAKERS: Georgia Schuttish – Astoundingly there were no Demo Calcs from Planning for project in pdf even though Section 317 Code Implement Document (CID) approved and published in 2009 and 2010. Remains astounding that the Commission has never used their legislative authority to adjust the Demo Calcs. Permit for 4267 24th Street applied in October 2012. Planning staff signed off in April 2013. December 2012, SF Weekly published article quoting how developers of 125 Crown Terrace used Demo Calcs getting around Section 317, getting approval as Alteration for project that had been denied approval as Demolition. With recent sale at \$6.8 million, 4267 24th Street is now a comp in real estate terms. Another SFH approved as Demo, constructing two units. needed Enforcement. “De facto merged” into 7 bedroom house asking \$8.1 million at same time as SFH in pdf on market for \$6.8 million. Waiting Rezoning Financial Feasibility Studies for over a year.

F. REGULAR CALENDAR

The Commission Hearing Procedures provide for presentations by staff; when applicable, followed by a presentation of the project sponsor team; followed by public comment. Please be advised that the project sponsor team includes: the sponsor(s) or their designee, lawyers, architects, engineers, expeditors, and/or other advisors.

9. [2024-008951PCA](#) (A. MERLONE: (628) 652-7523)
HEALTH SERVICE USES IN WEST PORTAL NEIGHBORHOOD COMMERCIAL DISTRICT [BF 240903] – Planning Code Amendments – An ordinance, sponsored by Supervisor Melgar, amending the Planning Code to permit certain Health Service Uses up to 5,000 gross square feet without a conditional use permit in the West Portal Neighborhood Commercial District; affirming the Planning Department’s determination under the California Environmental Quality Act; making findings of consistency with the General Plan, and the eight priority policies of Planning Code, Section 101.1; and making findings of public necessity, convenience, and welfare pursuant to Planning Code, Section 302.
Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval with Modification

SPEAKERS: = Aaron Starr – Staff report
 + Dr. Lillie Mosaddegh – Delay will cause closure of her practice
 + Michael Farrah, Legislative aide to Sup. Melgar -
 + Paul Barbagelata – Do not delay

ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation of Approval as proposed by the Supervisor

AYES: Campbell, Williams, Braun, Imperial, Moore, So

NAYS: None

ABSENT: McGarry

RESOLUTION: [21655](#)

10. [2024-009362PCA](#) (V. FLORES: (628) 652-7525)
THIRD STREET ALCOHOL RESTRICTED USE DISTRICT [BF 240932] – Planning Code Amendments – An ordinance, sponsored by Supervisor Walton, to amend the Planning Code to create an exception for certain distilleries, wineries, and breweries to establish on-sale liquor establishments in the Bayview Neighborhood Commercial District, subject to a conditional use authorization; affirming the Planning Department's determination under the California Environmental Quality Act; making findings of consistency with the General Plan, and the eight priority policies of Planning Code, Section 101.1; and making findings of public necessity, convenience, and welfare pursuant to Planning Code, Section 302.
Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval with Modification

SPEAKERS: = Veronica Flores – Staff report
 = Rich Hillis – Response to comments and questions
 ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation of Approval as proposed by the Supervisor
 AYES: Williams, Braun, Imperial, Moore, So
 NAYS: Campbell
 ABSENT: McGarry
 RESOLUTION: [21656](#)

11. [2015-000988CWP](#) (O. GRANDE: (628) 652-7501)
MISSION ACTION PLAN 2030 STRATEGIES – Endorsement – Staff will present updates on the Mission Action Plan 2030 (originally entitled MAP2020), a key community-driven planning initiative within the Mission Plan Area and District 9 Supervisorial boundaries. MAP2030 facilitates collaboration between Mission District residents, community organizations, small businesses, and government agencies to address housing affordability, cultural preservation, and economic stability. Over the past eight years, this partnership has successfully advanced affordable housing production and preservation, small business support along cultural commercial corridors, and targeted solutions to community-identified challenges. The Planning Commission will be asked to endorse the updated MAP strategies to sustain and expand this vital community-based planning work.
Preliminary Recommendation: Endorsement of Mission Action Plan 2030 Strategies

SPEAKERS: = Rich Hillis – Staff introduction
 = Oscar Grande – Staff presentation
 + Lucia Obregon – MAP presentation
 = Georgia Schuttish – Housing = Income Inequality Issues? 25th and Alabama Streets before/after. Approved as Alteration prior to Section 317 and Demo Calcs. Became illegal AirBnB. Later high-end rental. How would Citywide Survey staff analyze today? A-rated? York Street before/after. Alteration, after Section 317 Demo Calcs approved. Completed 2018. Did create a second unit, both equal in size sold almost \$2.5 million each. Appears to have been UDU in the original building. Comparing these: One project was pre-Section 317 Demo Calcs and one was post-Section 317 Demo Calcs. Strongly suggests that TTD thresholds are inadequate preservation tool and the Demo Calcs should be adjusted. Finally 166-168 Hampshire, there are actually four flats there. One of the oldest structures in the Calle 24. Sold Summer 2017 \$1.5 Million. Tenants evicted in 2018. Flats turned into TICs sold \$900K each. Million dollar profit for the developer. Adult and child in 2016 photo before eviction.
 + Jessica Rubio, Mission Economic Agency – Support from businesses
 + Mary Travis Allen - Commitment
 - Tess Malek – Impacts to residents
 - Lucy – Excludes the majority of residents and businesses
 + Mary Jean Robertson – Responsibility to the land, cultural events
 + Lou – History of the neighborhood
 - Craig Weber – Missing a lot of information, flaws in the report
 + Roberto Alfaro, HOMEY – Vision of the community
 + Jose Luis Pabon – Cannot afford to live in the Mission
 + Speaker – Affordable housing
 + Speaker – Impacts of gentrification

+ Jenny Aguirre – Small business owner, concerns on safety, street cleanliness, lack of parking, graffiti, homelessness
 + Lizette Parilla – Small business owner, safety concerns
 + Alicia Bustos Sandoval – Prevent displacements
 + Aristos Kemiji, MEDA – Support to local small businesses, neighborhood programs
 + Natalie Ortiz – Events and activities
 + Crystal San Luna – Safety of kids in the neighborhood
 + Jessica – Safety of kids in the neighborhood
 + Angel, BAAITS – Housing, education
 + Dr. Martina Ayala, MCCLA – Lack of proper funding, accountability
 + Francisco – Displacement
 + Guillermina – Displacement
 + Ana Tolico – Support
 + Elsa – Support
 + Omar Del Real – Support
 + Ani Rivera, Galeria de la Raza – Support
 + Sofia – Support
 + Pedro – Support
 + Rodrigo Lopez, Mission Street Vendors – Prevent displacement in the neighborhood
 + Ruel Valderama – Support
 + Kelly Hill – Effective community-based planning
 + Reina – Stability, will benefit the whole city
 + Tere Almaguer, PODER – Support and funded
 + Antonio Martinez, Calle 24 – Support for small business and public schools
 + Annette Garcia, Mission Housing – Equitable community development
 + Speaker – Necessity for projects like MAP2030
 + Carolyn Fang – Displacement
 + Larissa Pedroncelli – Support
 + Martha Sanchez – Importance of affordable housing
 + Eric Arguello, Calle 24 – Continue initiative
 + Susana Rojas, Calle 24 – Equity
 + Paloma Tracy – Equity initiative
 = Rich Hillis – Response to comments and questions

ACTION: Endorsed
 AYES: Campbell, Williams, Braun, Imperial, Moore, So
 NAYS: None
 ABSENT: McGarry
 RESOLUTION: [21657](#)

13. [2021-010728CUA](#) (G. PANTOJA: (628) 652-7380)
4994 MISSION STREET – west side between Seneca and Onondaga Streets; Lot 006 in Assessor's Block 6968 (District 11) – Request for **Conditional Use Authorization** pursuant to Sections 202.2, 303, and 720 for the establishment of a Cannabis Retail Use (D.B.A. "Basanova, Inc.") at an existing approximately 1,305 square foot tenant space with no on-site consumption of cannabis products within the Excelsior Outer Mission NCD (Neighborhood Commercial District) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District. The Planning Department found that the project is exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). The Commission's action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section [31.04\(h\)](#).
Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions
 (Continued from Regular hearing on November 14, 2024)
[Disclosure from President So 3:29:47 – 3:30:22](#)

SPEAKERS: = Gabriela Pantoja – Staff report
 + Gary Gee – Project sponsor presentation
 + Virginia Fernandez – Will benefit a lot of people especially people with special needs
 + Speaker – Great addition to the community

- Yan Sing – Located next to a WIC center, no community meetings
- Joyce Chen – Owner of the WIC center, impact to children
- Susana Chen – Bad influence for students
- Ronaldo – Close to daycare facilities
- + Speaker – Employment

ACTION: Approved with Conditions
AYES: Campbell, Braun, Imperial, Moore, So
NAYS: Williams
ABSENT: McGarry
MOTION: [21658](#)

ADJOURNMENT 4:06 PM

ADOPTED JANUARY 9, 2025