

GS FOUNDATION
BATCH FOR CSE (2023-24)
ETHICS IN GOVERNANCE - HANDOUT 17
Case Studies

Practice Case Study 1

You are Vice Principal of a degree college in one of the middle-class towns. Principal has recently retired, and management is looking for his replacement. There are also feelers that the management may promote you as principal. In the meantime, during annual examination the flying squad which came from the university caught two students red-handed involved in unfair means.

A senior lecturer at the college was personally helping these students in this act. This senior lecturer also happens to be close to the management. One of the students was son of a local politician who was responsible in getting college affiliated to the present reputed university. The second student was son of a local businessman who has donated maximum funds for running of the college.

You immediately informed the management regarding this unfortunate incident. The management told you to resolve the issue with flying squad at any cost. They further said that such incident will not only tarnish the image of the college but also the politician and businessman are very important personalities for the functioning of the college.

Practice Case Study 1

You were also given hint that your further promotion to Principal depends on your capability in resolving this issue with flying squad. In the meantime, you were intimidated by your administrative officer that certain members of the student union are protesting outside the college gate against the senior lecturer and the students involved in this incident and demanding strict action against defaulters.

(a) Discuss the ethical issues involved in the case.
(b) Critically examine the options available with you as Vice Principal. What option will you adopt and why?

a) Discuss the ethical issues involved in the case.

- Unfair practices by the two students during the annual examination with the support of a senior Faculty
- Direction of management to settle down the matter amicably
- The reputation of the college
- Professional Responsibility to act fairly to ensure justice
- Promotion & Professional Growth at Stake

Practice Case Study 1

b) Critically examine the options available with you as Vice Principal. What option will you adopt and why?

1. Resolve the issue with the flying squad by hook or by crook and warn the students union to immediately call off the protest or to face strict action.
2. Promise the students union on the one hand to take strict action against those involved in unfair practices with an ulterior motive of letting it go once the tension diffuses & on the other hand resolving the issue with the flying squad by hook or by crook.
3. Try to Convince the management to act against those involved in unfair practices and if the effort is not successful submit the resignation letter.
4. Take appropriate action as per the rules against both the students & the senior faculty helping them in unfair practices and face the consequences

Practice Case Study 2

- You are a district magistrate and in one of the remote villages in your district a landslide has occurred on middle of a night due to continuous & heavy rain resulting in damage to life & property
- You reach the place immediately with all the support system including medical, NGO, Media, Police & Support staff to oversee rescue operation.
- A man seeking help to provide urgent medical attention to his pregnant wife & upon examination it was found she requires immediate blood transfusion.
- Your team also informs that few blood collection bags & blood group test kits are available and some of the members volunteer to donate blood.
- As a physician graduated from AIIMS you know as per the rules blood for transfusion must be procured from recognised transfusion banks.
- The doctors in team are ready to facilitate the transfusion provided they are not penalised. However, the team is divided on the issue & you are also having an ethical dilemma

a) What are the ethical issues involved in the case?

b) Evaluate the options available to you being the district magistrate of the area

Practice Case Study 2

a) What are the ethical issues involved in the case?

1. Relief of the affected people
2. Professional responsibility Vs Laws, Rules & Regulations
3. Accountability Vs Saving precious life

b) Evaluate the options available to you being the district magistrate of the area

1. Make arrangements to immediately move her to nearest hospital & also coordinate with the hospital.
2. Ask the doctors to start the blood transfusion considering the urgency & inform them they will be responsible for any mishap.
3. Inform the Husband to take her to the nearest hospital as he can't give personal attention but rather, he has to take care of the entire relief operation.
4. Request the doctors to start the blood transfusion and assure them he will take personal responsibility of the outcome.

Practice Case Study 3

- Vinod is an upright, honest and sincere IAS officer recently taken charge as Managing Director of State Road Transport Corporation.
- It is also known from his service records that he is frequently transferred. This is his sixth in the past three years.
- Vinod comes to know many alleged irregularities in the financial matters & high handedness of the chairman in the same. The chairman is a powerful politician and found to be close to the Chief Minister.
- In the meantime, a members of the board who belong to the opposition party meets Vinod & hands over some proofs were the chairman demands bribe from QMR tyres for approving a tender in their favour.
- Vinod could recollect as how the chairman was speeding up clearing the pending bills for QMR tyres.
- Vinod Confronts the board member as to why he shouldn't expose the chairman with solid proof. However, the board member suggest it could boost the public image of Vinod if he does this & also informally assure his party support.
- Vinod is in a dilemma as for this action he may be penalized but the opposition party also has a better chance of winning the election & he may also be used by the politician in the process.

Practice Case Study 3

- a) As a Conscientious Civil Servant, evaluate the options available to Vinod
- b) In the light of the above case, Comment upon the ethical issues that may arise due to the politicization of bureaucracy

- a) As a Conscientious Civil Servant, evaluate the options available to Vinod

1. Vinod may ignore this matter as it appears to have a political angle & you don't wish to politicise the matter.
2. After verifying the authenticity & credibility of the proof Vinod may forward the proof to media as it will give the publicity and at the same time prevent financial irregularities. It also provides a scope for Vinod to benefit when the Opposition party comes to power.
3. Vinod may ask the board member to give a formal complaint & take it forward through proper channel.
4. After verifying the authenticity of the proof with or without a formal complaint from the board member, Vinod can initiate an enquiry following proper channel neither fearing the repercussion nor expecting any benefit in return

Practice Case Study 3

- b) In the light of the above case, Comment upon the ethical issues that may arise due to the politicization of bureaucracy

1. Trust deficit between Political & Permanent Executive
2. Erodes civil service Values – Honesty, Integrity etc.
3. Affects the Morale & Development Process
4. Perpetuate bias & Corruption

Practice Case Study 4

You are appointed as an officer heading the section in Environment Pollution Control Board to ensure compliance and its follow-up. In that region, there were large number of small and medium industries which had been granted clearance. You learnt that these industries provide employment to many migrant worker. Most of the industrial units have got environmental clearance certificate in their possession.

The environmental clearance seeks to curb industries and projects that supposedly hamper environment and living species in the region, But in practice most of these units remain to be polluting units in several ways like air, water and soil pollution. As such, local people encountered persistent health problems.

It was confirmed that majority of the industries were violating environmental compliance. You issued notice to all the industrial units to apply for fresh environmental clearance certificate from the competent authority. However, your action met with hostile response from a section of the industrial units, other vested interest persons and a section of the local politicians.

Practice Case Study 4

The workers also became hostile to you as they felt that your action would lead to the closure of these industrial units, and the resultant unemployment will lead to insecurity uncertainty in their livelihood. Many owners of the industries approached you with the plea that you should not initiate harsh action as it would compel them their units, and cause huge financial loss, shortage of their products in the market.

These would obviously add to the sufferings of the labourers and the consumers alike. The labour union also sent you representation requesting against the closure of the units. You simultaneously started receiving threats from unknown corners. You however received supports from some of your colleagues, who advised you to act freely to ensure environmental compliance. Local NGOs also came to your support, and they demanded the closure of the polluting units immediately.

- (a) What are the options available to you under the given situation?
- (b) Critically examine the options listed by you.
- (c) What type of mechanism would you suggest to ensure environmental compliance?

Practice Case Study 4

(a) What are the options available to you under the given situation? &

(b) Critically examine the options listed by you.

1. Strictly enforcing the notice & shut down all industrial establishment which lacks compliance
2. Silently dilute the matter & let it go as you don't want take any personal risk in line of duty
3. Call upon various stakeholders including Industrial establishment representatives, Labour Unions, Local Community, NGOs & try to address the issue transparently & order for a time bound compliance to pollution standards as per the law.

Practice Case Study 4

c) What type of mechanism would you suggest to ensure environmental compliance?

- Strict compliance & enforcement of Water Pollution & Air Pollution Act.
- Regular Inspection & Sample Collection
- Testing of effluents
- Notice for compliance in case of minor non-compliance
- Immediate suspension of operation in case of serious non-compliance till clearances are given.
- Polluters pay principle
- Sensitization of all the stakeholders
- Preventive measures & roping in the NGOs