Report on Recycled Text in NAGPRA Notices

Alene K. Rhea

April 2020

Preliminary data profiling on the Notices of Inventory Completion and Notices of Intent to Repatriate has revealed that text is being recycled in unexpected ways. This report will investigate unexpected repeats in the following attributes: Summary (in full-text) and Abstract (in metadata), Consultation (in full-text), Determinations (in full-text), Additional Requestors and Disposition (in full-text), and Dates (in both full-text and metadata).

Key Findings:

- Several institutions seem to be high frequency recyclers. Wisconsin Historical Society and The Peabody Museum of Archaeology and Ethnology stand out in particular.
- Similar and repeated language in non-identical entries of like sections may suggest reliance on the notice templates provided by NPS (https://www.nps.gov/subjects/nagpra/templates.htm#notices).
- Further refinement of the full-text download script may be necessary to ensure certainty of assessment, particularly for the 'Supplementary Information' and 'Determinations' sections.

Profiling summaries of each attribute of interest will be reprinted, along with the most commonly repeated entries. Up to ten entries for each attribute will be highlighted; this number will be reduced so as to include only full sets of repeated numbers. For example, if there were a column for which the most common entry was repeated 20 times, the second-most common entry was repeated 19 times, and there were nine entries which were each repeated 18 times, only the top two most common entries would be included in this report. This prevents arbitrarily choosing between equally common entries, while keeping the report to a digestible length.

1 Summary and Abstract

There are 150 unique repeated entries of the 'Summary' section of full-text notices (1); these repeated entries have been assigned to 482 notices. Similarly, there are 149 unique repeated entries of the 'Abstract' metadata field, and these repeated entries have been assigned to 481 records (2).

The seven most commonly repeated Summaries are identical to the seven most common Abstracts (3). Further work could be done to determine the strength of the relationship between these two attributes.

summary Categorical	count		<u>abstract</u> Categorical	Distinct count	1146
HIGH CARDINALITY	Unique (%)	77.5%	HIGH CARDINALITY	Unique (%)	77.5%
MISSING	Missing	1806	MISSING	Missing	1804
	Missing (%)	55.0%		Missing (%)	55.0%

Figure 1: Profiling report for 'summary' attribute, from table holding fulltext documents.

Figure 2: Profiling report for 'abstract' attribute, from table holding metadata.

	Fulltext Summary / Metadata Abstract
Number of Repeats	
18	The State Historical Society of Wisconsin has completed an inventory of human remains, in consultation with the appropriate Indian tribes or Native Hawaiian organizations, and has determined that there is no cultural affiliation between the human remains and any present-day Indian tribes or Native Hawaiian organizations. Representatives of any Indian tribe or Native Hawaiian organization not identified in this notice that wish to request transfer of control of these human remains should submit a written request to the State Historical Society of Wisconsin. If no additional requestors come forward, transfer of control of the human remains to the Indian tribes or Native Hawaiian organizations stated in this notice may proceed.
11	The Wisconsin Historical Society has completed an inventory of human remains and associated funerary objects, in consultation with the appropriate Indian Tribes or Native Hawaiian organizations, and has determined that there is no cultural affiliation between the human remains and associated funerary objects and any present-day Indian Tribes or Native Hawaiian organizations. Representatives of any Indian Tribe or Native Hawaiian organization not identified in this notice that wish to request transfer of control of these human remains and associated funerary objects should submit a written request to the Wisconsin Historical Society. If no additional requestors come forward, transfer of control of the human remains and associated funerary objects to the Indian Tribes or Native Hawaiian organizations stated in this notice may proceed.
10	The University of Michigan has completed an inventory of human remains and associated funerary objects, in consultation with the appropriate Indian tribes or Native Hawaiian organizations, and has determined that there is no cultural affiliation between the human remains and associated funerary objects and any present-day Indian tribes or Native Hawaiian organizations. Representatives of any Indian tribe or Native Hawaiian organization not identified in this notice that wish to request transfer of control of these human remains and associated funerary objects should submit a written request to the University of Michigan. If no additional requestors come forward, transfer of control of the human remains and associated funerary objects to the Indian tribes or Native Hawaiian organizations stated in this notice may proceed.
9	The Minnesota Indian Affairs Council has completed an inventory of human remains in consultation with the appropriate Indian tribes, and has determined that there is no cultural affiliation between the remains and any present-day Indian tribe. Representatives of any Indian tribe that believes itself to be culturally affiliated with the human remains may contact the Minnesota Indian Affairs Council. Disposition of the human remains to the Indian tribes stated below may occur if no additional requestors come forward.
9	Texas A&M University has completed an inventory of human remains, in consultation with the appropriate Indian tribes or Native Hawaiian organizations, and has determined that there is a cultural affiliation between the human remains and present-day Indian tribes or Native Hawaiian organizations. Lineal descendants or representatives of any Indian tribe or Native Hawaiian organization not identified in this notice that wish to request transfer of control of these human remains should submit a written request to Texas A&M University. If no additional requestors come forward, transfer of control of the human remains to the lineal descendants, Indian tribes, or Native Hawaiian organizations stated in this notice may proceed.
8	The State Historical Society of Wisconsin has completed an inventory of human remains and associated funerary objects, in consultation with the appropriate Indian tribes or Native Hawaiian organizations, and has determined that there is no cultural affiliation between the human remains and associated funerary objects and any present-day Indian tribes or Native Hawaiian organizations. Representatives of any Indian tribe or Native Hawaiian organization not identified in this notice that wish to request transfer of control of these human remains and associated funerary objects should submit a written request to the State Historical Society of Wisconsin. If no additional requestors come forward, transfer of control of the human remains and associated funerary objects to the Indian tribes or Native Hawaiian organizations stated in this notice may proceed.
8	The U.S. Army Corps of Engineers, Omaha District (Omaha District), has completed an inventory of human remains and associated funerary objects, in consultation with the appropriate Indian tribes or Native Hawaiian organizations, and has determined that there is a cultural affiliation between the human remains and associated funerary objects and present-day Indian tribes or Native Hawaiian organizations. Lineal descendants or representatives of any Indian tribe or Native Hawaiian organization not identified in this notice that wish to request transfer of control of these human remains and associated funerary objects should submit a written request to the Omaha District. If no additional requestors come forward, transfer of control of the human remains and associated funerary objects to the lineal descendants, Indian tribes, or Native Hawaiian organizations stated in this notice may proceed.

Figure 3: Seven most commonly repeated entries for the 'Summary' section of full-text notices and their 'Abstract' metadata fields. This includes all entries repeated in eight or more notices.

2 Consultation

There are 58 unique repeated entries of the 'Consultation' section of full-text notices; these repeated entries have been assigned to 176 notices (4, 5).

consultation Categorical	Distinct count	926
HIGH CARDINALITY	Unique (%)	88.7%
MISSING	Missing	2238
UNIFORM	Missing (%)	68.2%

Figure 4: Profiling report for 'consultation' attribute, from table holding fulltext documents.



A detailed assessment of the human remains was made by the ASM professional staff in consultation with representatives of the Hopi Tribe of Arizona; White Mountain Apache Tribe of the Fort Apache Indian Reservation, Arizona; and the Zuni Tribe of the Zuni Reservation, New Mexico. \n

(hereinafter referred to as \xe2\x80\x9cThe Invited and Consulted Tribes\xe2\x80\x9d). \n

A detailed assessment of the human remains was made by Grand Canyon National Park professional staff in consultation with representatives of the Havasupai Tribe of the Havasupai Reservation, Arizona; Hoji Tribe of Arizona; Hualapai Indian Reservation, Arizona; Kaibab Band of Paiute Indians of the Kaibab Indian Reservation, Arizona; Las Vegas Tribe of Paiute Indians of the Las Vegas Indian Colony, Nevada; Moapa Band of Paiute Indians of the Moapa River Indian Reservation, Nevada; Navajo Nation, Arizona, New Mexico, & Utah; Paiute Indian Tribe of Utah (Cedar Band of Paiutes, Kanosh Band of Paiutes, Koosharem Band of Paiutes, Indian Peaks Band of Paiutes, and Shivwits Band of Paiutes) (formerly Paiute Indian Tribe of Utah (Cedar City Band of Paiutes, Kanosh Band of Paiutes, Koosharem Band of Paiutes, Indian Peaks Band of Paiutes, and Shivwits Band of Paiutes)); San Juan Southern Paiute Tribe of Arizona; White Mountain Apache Tribe of the Fort Apache Reservation, Arizona; Yavapai-Apache Nation of the Camp Verde Indian Reservation, Arizona; and Zuni Tribe of the Zuni Reservation, New Mexico

Figure 5: Ten most commonly repeated entries for the 'Consultation' section of full-text notices. This includes all entries repeated in four or more notices.

3 Determinations

There are 7 unique repeated entries of the 'Determinations' section of full-text notices; these repeated entries have been assigned to 16 notices (6, 7).

We find that 2 of these repeated entries seem to have been truncated. It's not immediately clear whether the un-truncated versions would still constitute repeats.

determinations Categorical	Distinct count	1339
HIGH CARDINALITY	Unique (%)	99.3%
MISSING	Missing	1934
UNIFORM	Missing (%)	58.9%

Figure 6: Profiling report for 'determinations' attribute, from table holding fulltext documents.

Fulltext Determinations Number Repeats Determinations Made by History Colorado \n Officials of History Colorado have determined that: \n \xe2\x80\xa2 Based on osteological analysis, the human remains are Native American. \n \xe2\x80\xa2 Pursuant to 25 U.S.C. 3001(9), the human remains described in this notice represent the physical remains of one individual of Native American ancestry. \n\xe2\x80\xa2 Pursuant to 25 U.S.C. 3001(2), a relationship of shared group identity cannot be reasonably traced between the Native American and remains and any present-day Indian tribe. \n\xe2\x80\xa2 Pursuant to 43 CFR 10.11(c)(2)(ii) and the Process, the disposition of the human remains may be to the Southern Ute Indian Tribe of the Southern Ute Reservation, Colorado, and the Ute Mountain Tribe of the Ute Mountain Reservation, Colorado, New Mexico & Utah. \n Determinations Made by History Colorado \n Officials of History Colorado have determined that: \n \xe2\x80\xa2 Based on osteological analysis, the human remains are Native American. \n \xe2\x80\xa2 Pursuant to 25 U.S.C. 3001(9), the human remains described in this notice represent the physical remains of seven individuals of Native American ancestry, \n \xe2\x80\xa2 Pursuant to 25 U.S.C. 3001(2), a relationship of shared group identity cannot be reasonably traced between the Native American human remains and any present-day Indian tribe. \n \xe2\x80\xa2 Pursuant to 43 CFR 10.11(c)(2)(ii) and the Process, the disposition of the human remains may be to the Southern Ute Indian Tribe of the Southern Ute Reservation, Colorado, and the Ute Mountain Tribe of the Ute Mountain Reservation, Colorado, New Mexico & Utah. 'In Determinations Made by the Department of Anthropology at Indiana University \n Officials of the Department of Anthropology at Indiana University have determined that: \n \xe2\x80\xa2 Pursuant to 25 U.S.C. 3001(9), the human remains described in this notice represent the physical remains of one individual of Native American ancestry. \n \xe2\x80\xa2 Pursuant to 25 U.S.C. 3001(2), there is a relationship of shared group identity that can be reasonably traced between the Native American human remains Determinations Made by the University of Oregon Museum of Natural and Cultural History \n Officials of the University of Oregon Museum of Natural and Cultural History have determined that; \n \xe2\x80\xa2 Pursuant to 25 U.S.C. 3001(9), the human remains described in this notice represent the physical remains of one individual of Native American ancestry. In 1xe21x80xa2 Pursuant to 25 U.S.C. 3001(2), there is a relationship of shared group identity that can be reasonably traced between the Native American human remains and The Tribes. \r Determinations Made by the University of Tennessee, Department of Anthropology \n Officials of the University of Tennessee, Department of Anthropology have Determinations Made by the Tennessee Valley Authority \n Officials of TVA have determined that: \n \xe2\x80\xa2 Pursuant to 25 U.S.C. 3001(9), the human remains described in this notice are Native American based on their presence in prehistoric archeological contexts. \n\xe2\x80\xa2 Pursuant to 25 U.S.C. 3001(9), the human remains described in this notice represent the physical remains of 2 individuals of Native American ancestry. \n\xe2\x80\xa2 Pursuant to 25 U.S.C. 3001(2), a relationship of shared group identity cannot be reasonably traced between the Native American human remains and any present-day Indian tribe. \n \xe2\x80\xa2 According to fina judgments of the Indian Claims Commission or the Court of Federal Claims, the land from which the Native American human remains were removed is the aboriginal land of the Cherokee Nation, Eastern Band of Cherokee Indians, and the United Keetoowah Band of Cherokee Indians in Oklahoma. \n \xe2\x80\xa2 Pursuant to 43 CFR 10.11(c)(1)(ii), TVA has decided to transfer control of the culturally unidentifiable human remains to the Cherokee Nation, Eastern Band of Cherokee Indians, and the United Keetoowah Band of Cherokee Indians in Oklahoma, \r Determinations Made by the Tennessee Valley Authority \n Officials of Tennessee Valley Authority have determined that: \n

Figure 7: Seven most commonly repeated entries for the 'Determinations' section of full-text notices. This includes all entries repeated in two or more notices. Fifth and seventh entries truncated due to a programming oversight. Source data from the Federal Register is not thusly truncated.

Further investigation has revealed that the 'Determinations' sections of these notices, as viewed in the Federal Register, are in fact longer than they appear here (e.g.: https://www.federalregister.gov/documents/2018/12/21/2018-27648/notice-of-inventory-completion-the-university-of-tennessee-department-of-anthropology-knoxville-tn.) The full values have been retained in the 'messy full' attribute of the full-text table. However, the entries have been truncated in both the 'determinations' and 'supp_info' columns. This discrepancy is likely an artifact of an oversight in the script used to create those columns; it could be repaired if deemed necessary and if time permits.

4 Additional Requestors and Disposition

There are 44 unique repeated entries of the 'Additional Requestors and Disposition' section of full-text notices; these repeated entries have been assigned to 125 notices (8, 9).

Distinct count	1380
Unique (%)	94.5%
Missing	1821
Missing (%)	55.5%
	count Unique (%)

Figure 8: Profiling report for 'a_r_d' attribute (Additional Requestors and Disposition), from table holding fulltext documents.

- Representatives of any Indian tribe or Native Hawaiian organization not identified in this notice that wish to request transfer of control of these human remains should submit a written request with information in support of the request to Jennifer Kolb, Wisconsin Historical Museum, 30 North Carroll Street, Madison, WI 53703, telephone (608) 261-2461, email Jennifer, Kolb@wisconsinhistory.org, by October 10, 2014. After that date, if no additional requestors have come forward, transfer of control of the human remains to The Aboriginal Land Tribes may proceed. \n The State Historical Society of Wisconsin is responsible for notifying The Aboriginal Land Tribes that this notice has been published \n.
 - Representatives of any Indian tribe or Native Hawaiian organization not identified in this notice that wish to request transfer of control of these human remains and associated funerary objects should submit a written request with information in support of the request to Dr. Ben Secunda, NAGPRA Project Manager, University of Michigan, Office of the Vice President for Research, 4080 Fleming Building, 503 Thompson St., Ann Arbor, MI 48109-1340, telephone (734) 647-9085, email bsecunda@umich.edu, by December 2, 2013. After that date, if no additional requestors have come forward, transfer of control of the human remains and associated funerary objects to The Tribes may proceed. In The University of Michigan is responsible for notifying The Tribes that this notice has been published. In
- Representatives of any Indian tribe or Native Hawaiian organization not identified in this notice that wish to request transfer of control of these human remains should submit a written request with information in support of the request to Patricia Capone, Museum Curator and Director of Research and Repatriation, Peabody Museum of Archaeology and Ethnology, Harvard University, 11 Divinity Avenue, Cambridge, MA 02138, telephone (617) 496-3702, email pcapone@fas.harvard.edu by November 2, 2016. After that date, if no additional requestors have come forward, transfer of control of the human remains to The Aboriginal Land Tribes may proceed. \n The Peabody Museum of Archaeology and Ethnology is responsible for notifying The Invited and Consulted Tribes that this notice has been published. \n
- Representatives of any Indian Tribe or Native Hawaiian organization not identified in this notice that wish to request transfer of control of these human remains should submit a written request with information in support of the request to Jeffrey Sommer, Historical Society of Saginaw County, Inc., 500 Federal Avenue, Saginaw, MI 48607, 6 telephone (989) 752-2861 Ext. 308, email jsommer@castlemuseum.org, by April 17, 2019. After that date, if no additional requestors have come forward, transfer of control of the human remains to The Consulted and Invited Tribes may proceed. \n The Historical Society of Saginaw County, Inc. is responsible for notifying The Consulted and Invited Tribes that this notice has been published. \n
- Representatives of any Indian tribe that believes itself to be culturally affiliated with the human remains or any other Indian tribe that believes it satisfies the criteria in 43 CFR 10.11(e)(1) should contact James L. (Jim) Jones, Cultural Resource Director, Minnesota Indian Affairs Council, 3801 Bemidji Avenue NW., Suite 5, Bemidji, MN 56801, telephone (218) 755-3223, before January 4, 2012. Disposition of the human remains to The Tribes may proceed after that date if no additional requestors come forward.

 \[\text{N The Minnesota Indian Affairs Council is responsible for notifying The Tribes that this notice has been published. \text{Nn} \]
- Representatives of any Indian tribe or Native Hawaiian organization not identified in this notice that wish to request transfer of control of these human remains should submit a written request with information in support of the request to Sissel Schroeder, University of Wisconsin-Madison, Department of Anthropology, 1180 Observatory Drive, 5240 Social Sciences Building, Madison, WI 53706, telephone (608) 262-0317, email sschroeder/@wisc.edu, by June 16, 2014. After that date, if no additional requestors have come forward, transfer of control of the human remains to The Tribes may proceed. In The University of Wisconsin-Madison Department of Anthropology is responsible for notifying The Tribes that this notice has been published. In

Figure 9: Six most commonly repeated entries for the 'Additional Requestors and Disposition' section of full-text notices. This includes all entries repeated in four or more notices.

5 Dates

There are 134 unique repeated entries of the 'Dates' section of full-text notices; these repeated entries have been assigned to 382 notices (10, 12).

There are 181 unique repeated entries of the 'Dates' metadata field; these repeated entries have been assigned to 968 notices (11, 13). This is by far the highest frequency of recycling we have seen, but the repeats appear to be meaningless. The metadata dates seem to have been truncated before the actual dates appear. Further investigation reveals that the source data, as provided by the Federal Register, is indeed truncated this way. The reason for this shortening is unclear, however it is doubtful that this attribute would have such a high recycling rate without the truncation.

dates Categorical	Distinct count	1204
HIGH CARDINALITY	Unique (%)	82.9%
MISSING	Missing	1830
UNIFORM	Missing (%)	55.8%

dates Categorical	count	009
HIGH CARDINALITY	Unique (%)	45.9%
MISSING	Missing	1826
	Missing (%)	55.6%

Distinct

660

Figure 10: Profiling report for 'dates' attribute, from table holding fulltext documents.

Figure 11: Profiling report for 'dates' attribute, from table holding metadata.

	Fulltext Dates
Number of Repeats	
11	Representatives of any Indian tribe or Native Hawaiian organization not identified in this notice that wish to request transfer of control of these human remains should submit a written request with information in support of the request to the State Historical Society of Wisconsin at the address in this notice by October 10, 2014.
9	Lineal descendants or representatives of any Indian tribe or Native Hawaiian organization not identified in this notice that wish to request transfer of control of these human remains should submit a written request with information in support of the request to Texas A&M University at the address in this notice by May 19, 2014.
8	Representatives of any Indian tribe or Native Hawaiian organization not identified in this notice that wish to request transfer of control of these human remains should submit a written request with information in support of the request to the Peabody Museum of Archaeology and Ethnology at the address in this notice by November 2, 2016.
7	Representatives of any Indian tribe or Native Hawaiian organization not identified in this notice that wish to request transfer of control of these human remains and associated funerary objects should submit a written request with information in support of the request to the University of Wisconsin-Madison Department of Anthropology at the address in this notice by June 16, 2014.
6	Representatives of any Indian Tribe that believes it has a cultural affiliation with the human remains should contact the museum at the address below by March 21, 2011.
6	Representatives of any Indian Tribe or Native Hawaiian organization not identified in this notice that wish to request transfer of control of these human remains and associated funerary objects should submit a written request with information in support of the request to the Wisconsin Historical Society at the address in this notice by May 21, 2018.
6	Representatives of any Indian tribe or Native Hawaiian organization not identified in this notice that wish to request transfer of control of these human remains and associated funerary objects should submit a written request with information in support of the request to the University of Michigan at the address in this notice by December 2, 2013.
6	Representatives of any Indian Tribe or Native Hawaiian organization not identified in this notice that wish to request transfer of control of these human remains should submit a written request with information in support of the request to the Peabody Museum of Archaeology and Ethnology at the address in this notice by January 22, 2019.
6	Representatives of any Indian Tribe or Native Hawaiian organization not identified in this notice that wish to request transfer of control of these human remains should submit a written request with information in support of the request to the Historical Society of Saginaw County, Inc. at the address in this notice by April 17, 2019.
6	Representatives of any Indian tribe that believes it has a cultural affiliation with the human remains should contact the Minnesota Indian Affairs Council at the address below by February 13, 2012.

Figure 12: Ten most commonly repeated entries for the 'Dates' section of full-text notices. This includes all entries repeated in six or more notices.

	Metadata Dates
Number of Repeats	
75	Lineal descendants or representatives of any Indian tribe or Native Hawaiian organization not identified in this notice that wish to request transfer of control of these human remains and associated funerary objects should submit a written request with information in
61	Lineal descendants or representatives of any Indian Tribe or Native Hawaiian organization not identified in this notice that wish to request transfer of control of these human remains and associated funerary objects should submit a written request with information in
55	Lineal descendants or representatives of any Indian tribe or Native Hawaiian organization not identified in this notice that wish to request transfer of control of these human remains should submit a written request with information in support of the request to the
51	Representatives of any Indian tribe or Native Hawaiian organization not identified in this notice that wish to request transfer of control of these human remains and associated funerary objects should submit a written request with information in support of
43	Representatives of any Indian Tribe or Native Hawaiian organization not identified in this notice that wish to request transfer of control of these human remains and associated funerary objects should submit a written request with information in support of
38	Lineal descendants or representatives of any Indian Tribe or Native Hawaiian organization not identified in this notice that wish to request transfer of control of these human remains should submit a written request with information in support of the request to the
29	Representatives of any Indian tribe that believes it has a cultural affiliation with the human remains should contact the
27	Representatives of any Indian tribe that believes it has a cultural affiliation with the human remains and associated funerary
20	Representatives of any Indian tribe or Native Hawaiian organization not identified in this notice that wish to request transfer of control of these human remains should submit a written request with information in support of the request to the State
19	Representatives of any Indian tribe or Native Hawaiian organization not identified in this notice that wish to request transfer of control of these human remains should submit a written request with information in support of the request to the University of

Figure 13: Ten most commonly repeated entries in the 'Dates' metadata field. This includes all entries repeated in 19 or more notices. Entries truncated due to truncated source data from the Federal Register.