

**Document Number:** DXXXXR0  
**Date:** 2019-03-27  
**Reply to:** Daniel Sunderland  
Sandia National Laboratories  
dsunder@sandia.gov

## Alternate `atomic_ref` for Non-Lockfree Types

```
git clone git@github.com:dsunder/draft.git dsunder-draft
cd dsunder-draft
git checkout atomic_ref_alt
```

## Motivation

Enable implementations of `atomic_ref` which do not require a global lock array while perserving current behavior as much as possible.

## Proposed Wording

*This font is used to provide guidance to the editors.*

*Make the following changes in [atomics.ref.generic].*

```
namespace std {
    struct atomic_ref_assume_lock_free_t    {};
    struct atomic_ref_assume_no_user_lock_t  {};
    struct atomic_ref_perfer_user_lock_t     {};

    inline constexpr atomic_ref_assume_lock_free_t  atomic_ref_assume_lock_free {};
    inline constexpr atomic_ref_perfer_user_lock_t  atomic_ref_perfer_user_lock {};
}

namespace std {

    template<class T, class Lock = mutex> struct atomic_ref {
    private:
        T* ptr;           // exposition only
        Lock* ulock;      // exposition only
    public:
        using value_type = T;
        static constexpr bool is_always_lock_free = implementation-defined;
        static constexpr bool never_requires_user_lock = implementation-defined;
        static constexpr size_t required_lock_free_alignment = implementation-defined;

        static bool is_lock_free(const T &) noexcept;
        static bool requires_user_lock(const T &) noexcept;

        atomic_ref& operator=(const atomic_ref&) = delete;

        explicit atomic_ref(T&) noexcept(see below);
        atomic_ref(T&, atomic_ref_assume_lock_free_t) noexcept;

        atomic_ref(T&, Lock&) noexcept;
        atomic_ref(T&, Lock&, atomic_ref_perfer_user_lock_t) noexcept;

        atomic_ref(T&, ranges::RandomAccessRange<Lock>) noexcept;
        atomic_ref(T&, ranges::RandomAccessRange<Lock>, atomic_ref_perfer_user_lock_t) noexcept;

        atomic_ref(const atomic_ref&) noexcept;

        T operator=(T) const noexcept;
        operator T() const noexcept;

        bool is_lock_free() const noexcept;
        void store(T, memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
        T load(memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
        T exchange(T, memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
        bool compare_exchange_weak(T&, T,
                                   memory_order, memory_order) const noexcept;
        bool compare_exchange_strong(T&, T,
                                     memory_order, memory_order) const noexcept;
        bool compare_exchange_weak(T&, T,
                                   memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
        bool compare_exchange_strong(T&, T,
                                     memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
    };
}
```

*Make the following changes in [atomics.ref.operations].*

```
static constexpr bool is_always_lock_free;
```

- 1 The static data member `is_always_lock_free` is `true` if the `atomic_ref` type's operations are always lock-free on objects aligned to `required_lock_free_alignment`, and `false` otherwise.

```
static constexpr size_t required_lock_free_alignment;
```

- 2 The alignment required for an object to be referenced lock-free by an atomic reference, which is at least `alignof(T)`.

- 3 [Note: Hardware could require an object referenced by an `atomic_ref` to have stricter alignment (??) than other objects of type `T`. Furthermore, whether operations on an `atomic_ref` are lock-free could depend on the alignment of the referenced object. For example, lock-free operations on `std::complex<double>` could be supported only if aligned to `2*alignof(double)`. — end note]

```
static constexpr bool never_requires_user_lock;
```

- 4 Is `true` if an implementation never requires the user to provide a lock for objects of type `T` and `false` otherwise.

```
static is_lock_free(T& obj) noexcept;
```

*Returns:* Returns `true` if atomic operations on the object referenced by `obj` can be lock-free or if the Lock type is equivalent to `atomic_ref_assume_lock_free_t`.

```
static requires_user_lock(T& obj) noexcept;
```

*Returns:* Returns `false` if the type `Lock` is equivalent to `atomic_ref_assume_lock_free_t` or `Lock` is equivalent to `atomic_ref_assume_no_user_lock_t`. Otherwise, returns `true` if `atomic_ref` requires the user to provide a valid reference to a `Lock` object or a non-empty `ranges::RandomAccessRange<Lock>` when constructing an `atomic_ref` from `obj`.

```
explicit atomic_ref(T&) noexcept(see below);
```

- 5 *Mandates:* If type `Lock` is either equivalent to `atomic_ref_assume_lock_free_t` or `atomic_ref_assume_no_user_lock_t` then the implementation can possibly be lock-free or not require a user provided lock for some objects of type `T` respectively.

- 6 ~~*Requires:* The referenced object shall be aligned to `required_lock_free_alignment`.~~ *Expects:* The type `Lock` either meets the *Cpp17BasicLockable* requirements, `Lock` is equivalent to `atomic_ref_assume_lock_free_t`, or `Lock` is equivalent to `atomic_ref_assume_no_user_lock_t`. Furthermore, `requires_user_lock(obj)` is `false`.

- 7 ~~*Effects:* Constructs an atomic reference that references the object.~~  
Equivalent to:

```
ptr = &obj;
unlock = nullptr;
```

- 8 *Throws:* Nothing if type `never_requires_user_lock` is `true`, or if `Lock` is either equivalent to `atomic_ref_assume_lock_free_t` or `atomic_ref_assume_no_user_lock_t`. Otherwise, throws `????_error` if `requires_user_lock(obj)` is `true`;

```
atomic_ref(T& obj, atomic_ref_assume_lock_free_t);
```

- 9 *Mandates:* If type `Lock` is either equivalent to `atomic_ref_assume_lock_free_t` or `atomic_ref_assume_no_user_lock_t` then the implementation can possibly be lock-free or not require a user provided lock for some objects of type `T` respectively.

- 10 *Expects:* The type `Lock` either meets the *Cpp17BasicLockable* requirements, `Lock` is equivalent to `atomic_ref_assume_lock_free_t`, or `Lock` is equivalent to `atomic_ref_assume_no_user_lock_t`. Furthermore, the object referenced `obj` is be aligned to `required_lock_free_alignment` and this constructor is used for all `atomic_ref` objects which concurrently reference the object referenced by `obj`.

11 *Effects:* Equivalent to:

```
ptr = &obj;
unlock = nullptr;
```

12 *Throws:* Nothing.

```
atomic_ref(T& obj, Lock& lk);
```

13 *Mandates:* If type `Lock` is either equivalent to `atomic_ref_assume_lock_free_t` or `atomic_ref_assume_no_user_lock_t` then the implementation can possibly be lock-free or not require a user provided lock for some objects of type `T` respectively.

14 *Expects:* The type `Lock` either meets the *Cpp17BasicLockable* requirements, `Lock` is equivalent to `atomic_ref_assume_lock_free_t`, or `Lock` is equivalent to `atomic_ref_assume_no_user_lock_t`. Furthermore, for all `atomic_ref` objects which concurrently reference the object referenced by `obj` either `requires_user_lock(obj)` is `false` or the following conditions are true:

(14.1) — `lk` references the same `Lock` object, and

(14.2) — this constructor is used for all the `atomic_ref` objects mentioned above.

15 *Effects:* Equivalent to:

```
ptr = &obj;
unlock = requires_user_lock(obj) ? &lk : nullptr;
```

16 *Throws:* Nothing.

```
atomic_ref(T& obj, Lock& lk, atomic_ref_perfer_user_lock_t);
```

17 *Mandates:* If type `Lock` is either equivalent to `atomic_ref_assume_lock_free_t` or `atomic_ref_assume_no_user_lock_t` then the implementation can possibly be lock-free or not require a user provided lock for some objects of type `T` respectively.

18 *Expects:* The type `Lock` either meets the *Cpp17BasicLockable* requirements, `Lock` is equivalent to `atomic_ref_assume_lock_free_t`, or `Lock` is equivalent to `atomic_ref_assume_no_user_lock_t`. Furthermore, for all `atomic_ref` objects which concurrently reference the object referenced by `obj` either the following conditions are true:

(18.1) — `lk` references the same `Lock` object, and

(18.2) — this constructor is used for all the `atomic_ref` objects mentioned above.

19 *Effects:* Equivalent to:

```
ptr = &obj;
unlock = is_lock_free(obj) ? nullptr : &lk;
```

20 *Throws:* Nothing.

```
atomic_ref(T& obj, ranges::RandomAccessRange<Lock> lks);
```

21 *Mandates:* If type `Lock` is either equivalent to `atomic_ref_assume_lock_free_t` or `atomic_ref_assume_no_user_lock_t` then the implementation can possibly be lock-free or not require a user provided lock for some objects of type `T` respectively.

22 *Expects:* The type `Lock` either meets the *Cpp17BasicLockable* requirements, `Lock` is equivalent to `atomic_ref_assume_lock_free_t`, or `Lock` is equivalent to `atomic_ref_assume_no_user_lock_t`. Furthermore, for all `atomic_ref` objects which concurrently reference the object referenced by `obj` either `requires_user_lock(obj)` is `false` or the following conditions are true:

(22.1) — `lks` is a non-empty range of `Lock` objects,

(22.2) — `lks` represents equivalent ranges of `Lock` objects, and

(22.3) — this constructor is used for all the `atomic_ref` objects mentioned above.

23 *Effects:* Equivalent to:

```
ptr = &obj;
unlock = requires_user_lock(obj) ?
    &ranges::begin(lks)[std::hash(&obj)%ranges::size(lks)] : nullptr;
```

24 *Throws:* Nothing.

```
atomic_ref(T& obj, ranges::RandomAccessRange<Lock> lks, atomic_ref_perfer_user_lock_t);
```

25 *Mandates:* If type `Lock` is either equivalent to `atomic_ref_assume_lock_free_t` or `atomic_ref_assume_no_user_lock_t` then the implementation can possibly be lock-free or not require a user provided lock for some objects of type `T` respectively.

26 *Expects:* The type `Lock` either meets the *Cpp17BasicLockable* requirements, `Lock` is equivalent to `atomic_ref_assume_lock_free_t`, or `Lock` is equivalent to `atomic_ref_assume_no_user_lock_t`. Furthermore, for all `atomic_ref` objects which concurrently reference the object referenced by `obj` all of the following conditions are true:

- (26.1) — `lks` is a non-empty range of `Lock` objects,
- (26.2) — `lks` represents equivalent ranges of `Lock` objects, and
- (26.3) — this constructor is used for all the `atomic_ref` objects mentioned above.

27 *Effects:* Equivalent to:

```
ptr = &obj;
unlock = is_lock_free(obj) ?
    nullptr : &ranges::begin(lks)[std::hash(&obj)%ranges::size(lks)];
```

28 *Throws:* Nothing.

```
atomic_ref(const atomic_ref& ref) noexcept;
```

29 *Effects:* ~~Constructs an atomic reference that references the object referenced by `ref`.~~ Equivalent to:

```
ptr = ref.obj;
unlock = ref.unlock;
```

```
void store(T desired, memory_order order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
```

30 ~~*Requires:*~~ *Expects:* The order argument shall not be `memory_order_consume`, `memory_order_acquire`, nor `memory_order_acq_rel`.

31 ~~Atomically replaces the value referenced by `*ptr` with the value of `desired`.~~ *Effects:* If `unlock` is equivalent to `nullptr` then the operation is equivalent to atomically performing the following:

```
memcpy(ptr, &desired, sizeof(T));
```

Otherwise, equivalent to:

```
unlock->lock();
memcpy(ptr, &desired, sizeof(T));
unlock->unlock();
```

Memory is affected according to the value of `order`.

```
T load(memory_order order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
```

32 ~~*Requires:*~~ *Expects:* The order argument shall not be `memory_order_release` nor `memory_order_acq_rel`.

33 *Effects:* If `unlock` is equivalent to `nullptr` then the operation is equivalent to atomically performing the following:

```
T result;
memcpy(&result, ptr, sizeof(T));
return result;
```

Otherwise, equivalent to:

```
T result;
unlock->lock();
memcpy(&result, ptr, sizeof(T));
unlock->unlock();
return result;
```

Memory is affected according to the value of `order`.

34 ~~*Returns:* Atomically returns the value referenced by `*ptr`.~~

T exchange(T desired, memory\_order order = memory\_order\_seq\_cst) const noexcept;

35 ~~Atomically replaces the value referenced by \*ptr with desired.~~ *Effects:* If ulock is equivalent to nullptr then the operation is equivalent to atomically performing the following:

```
T result;
memcpy(&result, ptr, sizeof(T));
memcpy(ptr, &desired, sizeof(T));
return result;
```

Otherwise, equivalent to:

```
T result;
ulock->lock();
memcpy(&result, ptr, sizeof(T));
memcpy(ptr, &desired, sizeof(T));
ulock->unlock();
return result;
```

Memory is affected according to the value of order. This operation is an atomic read-modify-write operation (??).

36 *Returns:* Atomically returns the value referenced by \*ptr immediately before the effects.

```
bool compare_exchange_weak(T& expected, T desired,
                           memory_order success, memory_order failure) const noexcept;
```

```
bool compare_exchange_strong(T& expected, T desired,
                             memory_order success, memory_order failure) const noexcept;
```

```
bool compare_exchange_weak(T& expected, T desired,
                           memory_order order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
```

```
bool compare_exchange_strong(T& expected, T desired,
                             memory_order order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
```

37 ~~Requires:~~ Expects: The failure argument shall not be memory\_order\_release nor memory\_order\_acq\_rel.

38 *Effects:* When only one memory\_order argument is supplied, the value of success is order, and the value of failure is order except that a value of memory\_order\_acq\_rel shall be replaced by the value memory\_order\_acquire and a value of memory\_order\_release shall be replaced by the value memory\_order\_relaxed.

If ulock is equivalent to nullptr then the operation is equivalent to atomically performing the following:

```
T old;
memcpy(&old, ptr, sizeof(T));
bool result = 0 == memcmp(&expected, &old, sizeof(T));
if (result) memcpy(ptr, &desired, sizeof(T));
else memcpy(&expected, &old, sizeof(T));
return result;
```

Otherwise, equivalent to:

```
T old;
ulock->lock()
memcpy(&old, ptr, sizeof(T));
bool result = 0 == memcmp(&expected, &old, sizeof(T));
if (result) {
    memcpy(ptr, &desired, sizeof(T));
    ulock->unlock();
} else {
    ulock->unlock();
    memcpy(&expected, &old, sizeof(T));
}
return result;
```

39 Let R be the return value of the operation. If and only if R is true, memory is affected according to the value of success, and if R is false, memory is affected according to the value of failure.

Retrieves the value in `expected`. It then atomically compares the value representation of the value referenced by `*ptr` for equality with that previously retrieved from `expected`, and if `true`, replaces the value referenced by `*ptr` with that in `desired`. When only one `memory_order` argument is supplied, the value of `success` is `order`, and the value of failure is `order` except that a value of `memory_order_acquire` shall be replaced by the value `memory_order_acquire` and a value of `memory_order_release` shall be replaced by the value `memory_order_relaxed`. If and only if the comparison is `false` then, after the atomic operation, the value in `expected` is replaced by the value read from the value referenced by `*ptr` during the atomic comparison. ~~If the operation returns `true`, these operations are atomic~~ read-modify-write operations (??) on the value referenced by `*ptr`. Otherwise, these operations are atomic load operations on that memory.

40 *Returns:* The result of the comparison.

41 *Remarks:* A weak compare-and-exchange operation may fail spuriously. That is, even when the contents of memory referred to by `expected` and `ptr` are equal, it may return `false` and store back to `expected` the same memory contents that were originally there. [Note: This spurious failure enables implementation of compare-and-exchange on a broader class of machines, e.g., load-locked store-conditional machines. A consequence of spurious failure is that nearly all uses of weak compare-and-exchange will be in a loop. When a compare-and-exchange is in a loop, the weak version will yield better performance on some platforms. When a weak compare-and-exchange would require a loop and a strong one would not, the strong one is preferable. — end note]

*Make the following changes in [atomics.ref.int].*

```
namespace std {
  template<Lock> struct atomic_ref<integral, Lock> {
  private:
    integral* ptr;           // exposition only
    Lock* ulock; // exposition only
  public:
    using value_type = integral;
    using difference_type = value_type;
    static constexpr bool is_always_lock_free = implementation-defined;
    static constexpr bool never_requires_user_lock = implementation-defined;
    static constexpr size_t required_lock_free_alignment = implementation-defined;

    static bool is_lock_free(const T &) noexcept;
    static bool requires_user_lock(const T &) noexcept;

    atomic_ref& operator=(const atomic_ref&) = delete;

    explicit atomic_ref(T&) noexcept(see above);
    atomic_ref(integral&, atomic_ref_assume_lock_free_t) noexcept;

    atomic_ref(integral&, Lock&) noexcept;
    atomic_ref(integral&, Lock&, atomic_ref_prefer_user_lock_t) noexcept;

    atomic_ref(integral&, ranges::RandomAccessRange<Lock>) noexcept;
    atomic_ref(integral&, ranges::RandomAccessRange<Lock>, atomic_ref_prefer_user_lock_t) noexcept;

    atomic_ref(const atomic_ref&) noexcept;

    integral operator=(integral) const noexcept;
    operator integral() const noexcept;

    bool is_lock_free() const noexcept;
    void store(integral, memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
    integral load(memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
    integral exchange(integral,
                      memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
```

```

bool compare_exchange_weak(integral&, integral,
                           memory_order, memory_order) const noexcept;
bool compare_exchange_strong(integral&, integral,
                             memory_order, memory_order) const noexcept;
bool compare_exchange_weak(integral&, integral,
                           memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
bool compare_exchange_strong(integral&, integral,
                             memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;

integral fetch_add(integral,
                   memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
integral fetch_sub(integral,
                   memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
integral fetch_and(integral,
                   memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
integral fetch_or(integral,
                  memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
integral fetch_xor(integral,
                   memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;

integral operator++(int) const noexcept;
integral operator--(int) const noexcept;
integral operator++() const noexcept;
integral operator--() const noexcept;
integral operator+=(integral) const noexcept;
integral operator--=(integral) const noexcept;
integral operator&=(integral) const noexcept;
integral operator|=(integral) const noexcept;
integral operator^=(integral) const noexcept;
};
}

```

Make the following changes in *[atomics.ref.float]*.

```

namespace std {
  template<Lock> struct atomic_ref<floating-point, Lock> {
  private:
    floating-point* ptr; // exposition only
    Lock* ulock; // exposition only
  public:
    using value_type = floating-point;
    using difference_type = value_type;
    static constexpr bool is_always_lock_free = implementation-defined;
    static constexpr bool never_requires_user_lock = implementation-defined;
    static constexpr size_t required_lock_free_alignment = implementation-defined;

    static bool is_lock_free(const T &) noexcept;
    static bool requires_user_lock(const T &) noexcept;

    atomic_ref& operator=(const atomic_ref&) = delete;

    explicit atomic_ref(T&) noexcept(see above);
    atomic_ref(floating-point&, atomic_ref_assume_lock_free_t) noexcept;

    atomic_ref(floating-point&, Lock&) noexcept;
    atomic_ref(floating-point&, Lock&, atomic_ref_prefer_user_lock_t) noexcept;

    atomic_ref(floating-point&, ranges::RandomAccessRange<Lock>) noexcept;
    atomic_ref(floating-point&, ranges::RandomAccessRange<Lock>, atomic_ref_prefer_user_lock_t) noexcept;

    atomic_ref(const atomic_ref&) noexcept;

    floating-point operator=(floating-point) noexcept;
    operator floating-point() const noexcept;
  };
}

```



```

bool is_lock_free() const noexcept;
void store(floating-point, memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
floating-point load(memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
floating-point exchange(floating-point,
                        memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
bool compare_exchange_weak(floating-point&, floating-point,
                           memory_order, memory_order) const noexcept;
bool compare_exchange_strong(floating-point&, floating-point,
                              memory_order, memory_order) const noexcept;
bool compare_exchange_weak(floating-point&, floating-point,
                           memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
bool compare_exchange_strong(floating-point&, floating-point,
                              memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;

floating-point fetch_add(floating-point,
                        memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
floating-point fetch_sub(floating-point,
                        memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;

floating-point operator+=(floating-point) const noexcept;
floating-point operator-=(floating-point) const noexcept;
};
}

```

*Make the following changes in [atomics.ref.pointer].*

```

namespace std {
template<class T, Lock> struct atomic_ref<T*, Lock> {
private:
    T** ptr; // exposition only
    Lock* ulock; // exposition only
public:
    using value_type = T*;
    using difference_type = ptrdiff_t;
    static constexpr bool is_always_lock_free = implementation-defined;
    static constexpr bool never_requires_user_lock = implementation-defined;
    static constexpr size_t required_lock_free_alignment = implementation-defined;

    static bool is_lock_free(const T &) noexcept;
    static bool requires_user_lock(const T &) noexcept;

    atomic_ref& operator=(const atomic_ref&) = delete;

    explicit atomic_ref(T&) noexcept(see above);
    atomic_ref(T*, atomic_ref_assume_lock_free_t) noexcept;

    atomic_ref(T*, Lock&) noexcept;
    atomic_ref(T*, Lock&, atomic_ref_perfer_user_lock_t) noexcept;

    atomic_ref(T*, ranges::RandomAccessRange<Lock>) noexcept;
    atomic_ref(T*, ranges::RandomAccessRange<Lock>, atomic_ref_perfer_user_lock_t) noexcept;

    atomic_ref(const atomic_ref&) noexcept;

    T* operator=(T*) const noexcept;
    operator T*() const noexcept;

    bool is_lock_free() const noexcept;
    void store(T*, memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
    T* load(memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
    T* exchange(T*, memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
    bool compare_exchange_weak(T*&, T*,
                              memory_order, memory_order) const noexcept;

```

```
bool compare_exchange_strong(T*&, T*,
                             memory_order, memory_order) const noexcept;
bool compare_exchange_weak(T*&, T*,
                           memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
bool compare_exchange_strong(T*&, T*,
                             memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;

T* fetch_add(difference_type, memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
T* fetch_sub(difference_type, memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;

T* operator++(int) const noexcept;
T* operator--(int) const noexcept;
T* operator++() const noexcept;
T* operator--() const noexcept;
T* operator+=(difference_type) const noexcept;
T* operator-=(difference_type) const noexcept;
};
}
```