

Document Number: D1632R0
Date: 2019-04-01
Reply to: Daniel Sunderland
Sandia National Laboratories
dsunder@sandia.gov

Improving `atomic_ref` of Non Lock-free Types

```
git clone git@github.com:dsunder/draft.git dsunder-draft
cd dsunder-draft
git checkout atomic_ref_alt
```

Motivation

Many implementations do not support the current specification of `atomic_ref` for non lock-free types. Also, using an `atomic_ref` of an insufficiently aligned object of a lock-free type can fail silently, leading to subtle and difficult to debug errors.

There are proposals [*citation needed*] to remove non lock-free `atomic_ref` from freestanding. However, since implementations are not required to support lock-free atomic operations, these proposals remove the ability of using `atomic_ref` in portable code.

The following proposal extends the `atomic_ref` specification to allow more implementations to fully support `atomic_ref` on objects which are not lock-free. This proposal preserves the existing behavior of `atomic_ref` in implementations which can support the current specification while enabling additional implementations.

Question to reviewers: Should `atomic_ref` also provide deduction guides?

Proposed Wording

This font is used to provide guidance to the editors.

Make the following changes in [atomics.ref.generic].

```
namespace std {
    struct atomic_ref_assume_lock_free_t    {};
    struct atomic_ref_assume_no_user_lock_t {};
    struct atomic_ref_prefer_user_lock_t    {};

    inline constexpr atomic_ref_assume_lock_free_t  atomic_ref_assume_lock_free {};
    inline constexpr atomic_ref_prefer_user_lock_t  atomic_ref_prefer_user_lock {};
}

namespace std {

    template<class T, class LockT=unspecified> struct atomic_ref {
    private:
        T* ptr;           // exposition only
        lock_type* ulock; // exposition only
    public:
        using lock_type = LockT;
        using value_type = T;
        static constexpr bool is_always_lock_free = implementation-defined;
        static constexpr bool never_requires_user_lock = implementation-defined;
        static constexpr size_t required_lock_free_alignment = implementation-defined;

        static bool is_lock_free(const T &) noexcept;
        static bool requires_user_lock(const T &) noexcept;

        atomic_ref& operator=(const atomic_ref&) = delete;

        explicit atomic_ref(T&) noexcept;
        atomic_ref(T&, atomic_ref_assume_lock_free_t) noexcept;

        atomic_ref(T&, lock_type&) noexcept;
        atomic_ref(T&, lock_type&, atomic_ref_prefer_user_lock_t) noexcept;

        template<class Select> atomic_ref(T&, ranges::RandomAccessRange<lock_type>,
            Select = unspecified) noexcept;
        template<class Select> atomic_ref(T&, ranges::RandomAccessRange<lock_type>,
            atomic_ref_prefer_user_lock_t, Select = unspecified) noexcept;

        atomic_ref(const atomic_ref&) noexcept;

        T operator=(T) const noexcept;
        operator T() const noexcept;
```

```

    bool is_lock_free() const noexcept;
    void store(T, memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
    T load(memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
    T exchange(T, memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
    bool compare_exchange_weak(T&, T,
                               memory_order, memory_order) const noexcept;
    bool compare_exchange_strong(T&, T,
                                 memory_order, memory_order) const noexcept;
    bool compare_exchange_weak(T&, T,
                               memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
    bool compare_exchange_strong(T&, T,
                                 memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
};
}

```

Make the following changes in [atomics.ref.operations].

- ¹ The type `lock_type` can be `atomic_ref_assume_lock_free_t`, `atomic_ref_assume_no_user_lock_t`, or the type `lock_type` meets the *Cpp17BasicLockable* requirements. If `lock_type` is equivalent to `atomic_ref_assume_lock_free_t` it is a diagnosable error if the implementation does not provide lock-free atomic operations for objects of type `T` aligned to `required_lock_free_alignment`. If `lock_type` is equivalent to `atomic_ref_assume_no_user_lock_t` it is a diagnosable error if the implementation does not provide atomic operations for objects of type `T` which do not require a user provided lock.
- ² `atomic_ref` instances referencing the same value of `ptr` and `unlock` are called *equivalent*. Concurrent access to the same value through equivalent `atomic_ref` instances does not create a data race (??). [Note: Concurrent access to the value directly, or through a non-equivalent `atomic_ref` instance, can introduce a data race. — end note]
- ³ For all `atomic_ref` member functions excluding static methods, constructors, the destructor, and `is_lock_free()` one of the following statements is true:
 - (3.1) — If `unlock` points to a valid `lock_type` object which meets the *Cpp17BasicLockable* requirements then the implementation will use `unlock` to atomically perform these methods. If `lock_type` does not meet the *Cpp17BasicLockable* requirements then these methods can introduce a data race.
 - (3.2) — Otherwise, if `unlock` is equivalent to `nullptr` then the implementation will ensure that these methods happen atomically.

```
static constexpr bool is_always_lock_free;
```

- ⁴ The static data member `is_always_lock_free` is true if the `atomic_ref` type's operations are always lock-free on objects aligned to `required_lock_free_alignment`, and false otherwise.

```
static constexpr size_t required_lock_free_alignment;
```

- ⁵ The alignment required for an object to be referenced lock-free by an atomic reference, which is at least `alignof(T)`. If the implementation does not support lock-free operations on objects of type `T` then `required_lock_free_alignment` is 0.
- ⁶ [Note: Hardware could require an object referenced by an `atomic_ref` to have stricter alignment (??) than other objects of type `T`. Furthermore, whether operations on an `atomic_ref` are lock-free could depend on the alignment of the referenced object. For example, lock-free operations on `std::complex<double>` could be supported only if aligned to `2*alignof(double)`. — end note]

```
static constexpr bool never_requires_user_lock;
```

- ⁷ Is true if an implementation never requires the user to provide a lock for objects of type `T` and false otherwise.

```
static is_lock_free(T& obj) noexcept;
```

Returns: Returns true if atomic operations on the object referenced by `obj` can be lock-free or if the `lock_type` type is equivalent to `atomic_ref_assume_lock_free_t`.

```
static requires_user_lock(T& obj) noexcept;
```

Returns: Returns false if `lock_type` is equivalent to either `atomic_ref_assume_lock_free_t` or `atomic_ref_assume_no_user_lock_t`. Otherwise, returns true if `atomic_ref` requires the user to provide a valid reference to a `lock_type` object or a non-empty `ranges::RandomAccessRange<lock_type>` when constructing an `atomic_ref` from `obj`.

```
explicit atomic_ref(T& obj) noexcept;
```

8 ~~*Requires:* The referenced object shall be aligned to `required_lock_free_alignment`.~~ *Expects:* `requires_user_lock(obj)` is false.

9 ~~*Effects:* Constructs an atomic reference that references the object.~~
Equivalent to:

```
    ptr = std::addressof(obj);  
    ulock = nullptr;
```

10 *Throws:* Nothing.

11 *Remarks:* The implementation calls `terminate()` if `requires_user_lock(obj)` is true.

```
atomic_ref(T& obj, atomic_ref_assume_lock_free_t);
```

12 *Expects:* `is_lock_free(obj)` is true.

13 *Effects:* Equivalent to:

```
    ptr = std::addressof(obj);  
    ulock = nullptr;
```

14 *Throws:* Nothing.

15 *Remarks:* The implementation can call `terminate` if `is_lock_free(obj)` is false.

```
atomic_ref(T& obj, lock_type& lk);
```

16 *Effects:* Equivalent to:

```
    ptr = std::addressof(obj);  
    ulock = requires_user_lock(obj) ? std::addressof(lk) : nullptr;
```

17 *Throws:* Nothing.

```
atomic_ref(T& obj, lock_type& lk, atomic_ref_prefer_user_lock_t);
```

18 *Effects:* Equivalent to:

```
    ptr = std::addressof(obj);  
    ulock = is_lock_free(obj) ? nullptr : std::addressof(lk);
```

19 *Throws:* Nothing.

```
template <class Select>
```

```
atomic_ref(T& obj, ranges::RandomAccessRange<lock_type> lks,  
    Select sel = unspecified );
```

20 *Mandates:* `INVOKE(sel(const T&, ranges::RandomAccessRange<lock_type>))` returns a reference to a `lock_type` object.

21 *Expects:* If `requires_user_lock(obj)` is true then the range `lks` is non-empty and `INVOKE(sel(obj, lks))` returns a reference to the same `lock_type` object in the range `lks` for all `obj` which reference the same value.

22 *Effects:* Equivalent to:

```
    ptr = std::addressof(obj);  
    ulock = requires_user_lock(obj) ?  
        std::addressof(INVOKE(sel(obj, lks))) : nullptr;
```

23 *Throws:* Nothing.

24 *Remarks:* The implementation can call `terminate` if the range `lks` is empty and `requires_user_lock(obj)` is true.

```

template <class Select>
atomic_ref(T& obj, ranges::RandomAccessRange<lock_type> lks,
    atomic_ref_prefer_user_lock_t, Sel sel = unspecified );
25     Mandates: INVOKE(sel(const T&, ranges::RandomAccessRange<lock_type>)) returns a reference
        to a lock_type object.
26     Expects: The range lks is non-empty and INVOKE(sel(obj, lks)) returns a reference to the same
        lock_type object in the range lks for all obj which reference the same value.
27     Effects: Equivalent to:
        ptr = std::addressof(obj);
        ulock = is_lock_free(obj) ?
            nullptr : std::addressof(INVOKE(sel(obj, lks)));
28     Throws: Nothing.
29     Remarks: The implementation can call terminate if the range lks is empty.

atomic_ref(const atomic_ref& ref) noexcept;
30     Effects: Constructs an atomic reference that references the object referenced by ref. Equivalent to:
        ptr = ref.obj;
        ulock = ref.ulock;

void store(T desired, memory_order order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
31     Requires: Expects: The order argument shall not be memory_order_consume, memory_order_acquire,
        nor memory_order_acq_rel.
32     Effects: Atomically replaces the value referenced by *ptr with the value of desired. Memory is
        affected according to the value of order.

T load(memory_order order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
33     Requires: Expects: The order argument shall not be memory_order_release nor memory_order_-
        acq_rel.
        Effects: Memory is affected according to the value of order.
34     Returns: Atomically returns the value referenced by *ptr.

T exchange(T desired, memory_order order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
35     Effects: Atomically replaces the value referenced by *ptr with desired. Memory is affected according
        to the value of order. This operation is an atomic read-modify-write operation (?).
36     Returns: Atomically returns the value referenced by *ptr immediately before the effects.

bool compare_exchange_weak(T& expected, T desired,
    memory_order success, memory_order failure) const noexcept;

bool compare_exchange_strong(T& expected, T desired,
    memory_order success, memory_order failure) const noexcept;

bool compare_exchange_weak(T& expected, T desired,
    memory_order order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;

bool compare_exchange_strong(T& expected, T desired,
    memory_order order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
37     Requires: Expects: The failure argument shall not be memory_order_release nor memory_order_-
        acq_rel.
38     Effects: When only one memory_order argument is supplied, the value of success is order, and
        the value of failure is order except that a value of memory_order_acq_rel shall be replaced by the
        value memory_order_acquire and a value of memory_order_release shall be replaced by the value
        memory_order_relaxed.
        Equivalent to atomically performing the following:
        alignas(T) std::byte old[sizeof(T)];

```

```

memcpy(old, ptr, sizeof(T));
bool result = 0 == memcmp(std::addressof(expected), old, sizeof(T));
if (result) memcpy(ptr, std::addressof(desired), sizeof(T));
else memcpy(std::addressof(expected), old, sizeof(T));
return result;

```

39 Let R be the return value of the operation. If and only if R is **true**, memory is affected according to the value of **success**, and if R is **false**, memory is affected according to the value of **failure**.

Retrieves the value in **expected**. It then atomically compares the value representation of the value referenced by ***ptr** for equality with that previously retrieved from **expected**, and if **true**, replaces the value referenced by ***ptr** with that in **desired**. When only one **memory_order** argument is supplied, the value of **success** is **order**, and the value of **failure** is **order** except that a value of **memory_order_acquire_rel** shall be replaced by the value **memory_order_acquire** and a value of **memory_order_release** shall be replaced by the value **memory_order_relaxed**. If and only if the comparison is **false** then, after the atomic operation, the value in **expected** is replaced by the value read from the value referenced by ***ptr** during the atomic comparison. If ~~the operation returns~~ **R** is **true**, these operations are atomic read-modify-write operations (??) on the value referenced by ***ptr**. Otherwise, these operations are atomic load operations on that memory.

40 *Returns:* The result of the comparison.

41 *Remarks:* A weak compare-and-exchange operation may fail spuriously. That is, even when the contents of memory referred to by **expected** and **ptr** are equal, it may return **false** and store back to **expected** the same memory contents that were originally there. [Note: This spurious failure enables implementation of compare-and-exchange on a broader class of machines, e.g., load-locked store-conditional machines. A consequence of spurious failure is that nearly all uses of weak compare-and-exchange will be in a loop. When a compare-and-exchange is in a loop, the weak version will yield better performance on some platforms. When a weak compare-and-exchange would require a loop and a strong one would not, the strong one is preferable. — end note]

Make the following changes in [atomics.ref.int].

```

namespace std {
  template<class LockT> struct atomic_ref<integral, LockT> {
  private:
    integral* ptr;           // exposition only
    lock_type* ulock;        // exposition only
  public:
    using lock_type = LockT;
    using value_type = integral;
    using difference_type = value_type;
    static constexpr bool is_always_lock_free = implementation-defined;
    static constexpr bool never_requires_user_lock = implementation-defined;
    static constexpr size_t required_lock_free_alignment = implementation-defined;

    static bool is_lock_free(const T &) noexcept;
    static bool requires_user_lock(const T &) noexcept;

    atomic_ref& operator=(const atomic_ref&) = delete;

    explicit atomic_ref(T&) noexcept;
    atomic_ref(integral&, atomic_ref_assume_lock_free_t) noexcept;

    atomic_ref(integral&, lock_type&) noexcept;
    atomic_ref(integral&, lock_type&, atomic_ref_prefer_user_lock_t) noexcept;

    template<class Select> atomic_ref(integral&, ranges::RandomAccessRange<lock_type>,
      Select = unspecified) noexcept;
    template<class Select> atomic_ref(integral&, ranges::RandomAccessRange<lock_type>,
      atomic_ref_prefer_user_lock_t, Select = unspecified) noexcept;

```

```

    atomic_ref(const atomic_ref&) noexcept;

    integral operator=(integral) const noexcept;
    operator integral() const noexcept;

    bool is_lock_free() const noexcept;
    void store(integral, memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
    integral load(memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
    integral exchange(integral,
        memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
    bool compare_exchange_weak(integral&, integral,
        memory_order, memory_order) const noexcept;
    bool compare_exchange_strong(integral&, integral,
        memory_order, memory_order) const noexcept;
    bool compare_exchange_weak(integral&, integral,
        memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
    bool compare_exchange_strong(integral&, integral,
        memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;

    integral fetch_add(integral,
        memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
    integral fetch_sub(integral,
        memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
    integral fetch_and(integral,
        memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
    integral fetch_or(integral,
        memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
    integral fetch_xor(integral,
        memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;

    integral operator++(int) const noexcept;
    integral operator--(int) const noexcept;
    integral operator++() const noexcept;
    integral operator--() const noexcept;
    integral operator+=(integral) const noexcept;
    integral operator-=(integral) const noexcept;
    integral operator&=(integral) const noexcept;
    integral operator|=(integral) const noexcept;
    integral operator^=(integral) const noexcept;
};
}

```

Make the following changes in [atomics.ref.float].

```

namespace std {
    template<class LockT> struct atomic_ref<floating-point, LockT> {
    private:
        floating-point* ptr; // exposition only
        lock_type* ulock; // exposition only
    public:
        using lock_type = LockT;
        using value_type = floating-point;
        using difference_type = value_type;
        static constexpr bool is_always_lock_free = implementation-defined;
        static constexpr bool never_requires_user_lock = implementation-defined;
        static constexpr size_t required_lock_free_alignment = implementation-defined;

        static bool is_lock_free(const T &) noexcept;
        static bool requires_user_lock(const T &) noexcept;

        atomic_ref& operator=(const atomic_ref&) = delete;

        explicit atomic_ref(T&) noexcept;
        atomic_ref(floating-point&, atomic_ref_assume_lock_free_t) noexcept;
    };
}

```

```

    atomic_ref(floating-point&, lock_type&) noexcept;
    atomic_ref(floating-point&, lock_type&, atomic_ref_prefer_user_lock_t) noexcept;

    template<class Select> atomic_ref(floating-point&, ranges::RandomAccessRange<lock_type>,
    Select = unspecified) noexcept;
    template<class Select> atomic_ref(floating-point&, ranges::RandomAccessRange<lock_type>,
    atomic_ref_prefer_user_lock_t, Select = unspecified) noexcept;

    atomic_ref(const atomic_ref&) noexcept;

    floating-point operator=(floating-point) noexcept;
    operator floating-point() const noexcept;

    bool is_lock_free() const noexcept;
    void store(floating-point, memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
    floating-point load(memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
    floating-point exchange(floating-point,
        memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
    bool compare_exchange_weak(floating-point&, floating-point,
        memory_order, memory_order) const noexcept;
    bool compare_exchange_strong(floating-point&, floating-point,
        memory_order, memory_order) const noexcept;
    bool compare_exchange_weak(floating-point&, floating-point,
        memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
    bool compare_exchange_strong(floating-point&, floating-point,
        memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;

    floating-point fetch_add(floating-point,
        memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
    floating-point fetch_sub(floating-point,
        memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;

    floating-point operator+=(floating-point) const noexcept;
    floating-point operator-=(floating-point) const noexcept;
};
}

```

Make the following changes in [atomics.ref.pointer].

```

namespace std {
    template<class T, class LockT> struct atomic_ref<T*, LockT> {
    private:
        T** ptr; // exposition only
        lock_type* ulock; // exposition only
    public:
        using lock_type = LockT;
        using value_type = T*;
        using difference_type = ptrdiff_t;
        static constexpr bool is_always_lock_free = implementation-defined;
        static constexpr bool never_requires_user_lock = implementation-defined;
        static constexpr size_t required_lock_free_alignment = implementation-defined;

        static bool is_lock_free(const T &) noexcept;
        static bool requires_user_lock(const T &) noexcept;

        atomic_ref& operator=(const atomic_ref&) = delete;

        explicit atomic_ref(T&) noexcept;
        atomic_ref(T*, atomic_ref_assume_lock_free_t) noexcept;

        atomic_ref(T*, lock_type&) noexcept;
        atomic_ref(T*, lock_type&, atomic_ref_prefer_user_lock_t) noexcept;
    };
}

```



```

template<class Select> atomic_ref(T*, ranges::RandomAccessRange<lock_type>,
    Select = unspecified) noexcept;
template<class Select> atomic_ref(T*, ranges::RandomAccessRange<lock_type>,
    atomic_ref_prefer_user_lock_t, Select = unspecified) noexcept;

atomic_ref(const atomic_ref&) noexcept;

T* operator=(T*) const noexcept;
operator T*() const noexcept;

bool is_lock_free() const noexcept;
void store(T*, memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
T* load(memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
T* exchange(T*, memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
bool compare_exchange_weak(T*&, T*,
    memory_order, memory_order) const noexcept;
bool compare_exchange_strong(T*&, T*,
    memory_order, memory_order) const noexcept;
bool compare_exchange_weak(T*&, T*,
    memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
bool compare_exchange_strong(T*&, T*,
    memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;

T* fetch_add(difference_type, memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;
T* fetch_sub(difference_type, memory_order = memory_order_seq_cst) const noexcept;

T* operator++(int) const noexcept;
T* operator--(int) const noexcept;
T* operator++() const noexcept;
T* operator--() const noexcept;
T* operator+=(difference_type) const noexcept;
T* operator-=(difference_type) const noexcept;
};
}

```