



CITY OF PALO ALTO CITY COUNCIL FINAL MINUTES

Special Meeting
February 24, 2020

The City Council of the City of Palo Alto met on this date in the Council Chambers at 5:05 P.M.

Present: Cormack, DuBois, Filseth, Fine, Kniss, Kou, Tanaka

Absent:

Closed Session

1. CONFERENCE WITH LABOR NEGOTIATORS

City Designated Representatives: City Manager and his Designees Pursuant to Merit System Rules and Regulations (Ed Shikada, Rumi Portillo, Sandra Blanch, Nicholas Raisch, Molly Stump, Terence Howzell, and Kiely Nose)

Employee Organization: (1) Utilities Management and Professional Association of Palo Alto (UMPAPA)

Authority: Government Code Section 54957.6 (a).

MOTION: Council Member Kniss moved, seconded by Council Member Cormack to go into the Closed Session.

MOTION PASSED: 7-0

Council went into Closed Session at 5:06 P.M.

Council returned from Closed Session at 6:10 P.M.

Mayor Fine announced no reportable action.

Study Session

2. Study Session on Community Policing.

Robert Jonsen, Police Chief reported his expectation for the Police Department was to provide excellence in all activities, to proactively enforce the law and to serve the Palo Alto community with professionalism and respect. [Recruiting video shown.] The Police Department's annual reports for 2018 and 2019 were available online. Personnel totaled 150, 69 percent of whom were male and 31 percent female. Thirty-two personnel spoke multiple different languages. The dispatch center was the third busiest in Santa Clara

FINAL MINUTES

County and responded to approximately 175,000 calls annually, 51,000 of which were directed to the Police Department. In 2019, the dispatch center began receiving 9-1-1 text messages. Property-related crimes had increased while home burglaries and assaults had declined in 2019. Over the past ten years, the City had averaged far less than one homicide per year. Goals for response times were less than 6 minutes for emergency calls, less than 10 minutes for urgent calls, and less than 45 minutes for routine calls. The Police Department had the most robust recording system of any agency in Santa Clara County. Recordings generated evidence for court cases, assisted with officer accountability and protected personnel and the public. [Video shown.] The Department purchased 60 body-worn cameras. In 2019, 30,000 hours of video were recorded. Over the past two years, cameras captured 163,000 incidents. Personnel had not experienced any equipment failures that impacted the ability to capture either video or audio. Cameras within patrol vehicles captured incidents outside the vehicle. Based on requests from the community, the traffic team returned to service in 2018. During the second half of 2019, the traffic team visited six targeted locations identified by the Chief's Advisory Group and issued 650 citations. Enforcement helped reduce traffic collisions. Community Service Officers (CSO) returned to service and were well received. He hoped to expand the program over the next few years. He formed the Chief's Advisory Group to communicate with residents and to obtain input. The Department sponsored basic and advanced Citizen Police Academies and National Night Out, and Officers engaged in community events. Recognizing that crime observed no boundaries, the Police Department participated in several regional task forces, but the Police Department did not participate in Immigration and Customs Enforcement (ICE) raids. The Department upgraded the 9-1-1 system and vehicles with mobile computers. The online reporting system was hopefully going to be online in 2020. The numbers for use of force incidents and administrative investigations were extremely low, compared to the number of services offered. All use of force incidents were required to be reported, investigated and documented. Investigation of incidents was comprehensive and documented. Three-quarters of the time, use of force was use of physical strength to restrain an individual. The Independent Police Auditor's (IPA) role was to review citizen complaints, administrative complaints, TASER use, administrative investigations and to recommend actions. The IPA was reviewing one TASER use in 2019 and two citizen complaints. The Department was investigating two citizen complaints and four administrative complaints, all of which were going to be sent to the IPA for review. Senate Bill (SB) 1421 allowed the public to request and access specific types of previously confidential police records. Assembly Bill (AB) 748 implemented new disclosure provisions related to video and audio recordings. SB 978 required all police departments to publish policies, practices, operational procedures and training material for public consumption. The number of vacant sworn

FINAL MINUTES

positions was currently eight. The Police Department was interested in hiring any individual who was mentally and physically able and could pass a background check. The increasing suicide rate for police officers was disturbing. He appreciated the City offering resiliency assistance to all City employees. He committed to adding to the traffic team, enforcing traffic laws, attempting to reduce the number of property-related crimes and exploring innovative approaches to serving the community. He was extremely proud of Police personnel and held each of them to high standards.

Aram James disagreed with the decision to categorize certain incidents for Police Department investigation only. He remarked regarding the Zach Perron incident.

Winter Dellenbach commented that accountability should be embedded in the Annual Report. The Annual Report minimized use of force incidents, which signaled that no improvement was needed. The lack of current IPA reports was unacceptable.

Roberta Ahlquist, Women's International League for Peace and Freedom inquired regarding the ethnic make-up of the Police Department. The League opposed the use of TASERS and supported the use of body-worn cameras. The Police Department needed to be more transparent and accountable.

Sunita de Turreil asked about the definitions of a complaint and use of force.

Mayor Fine requested Chief Jonsen respond to Ms. de Turreil's questions.

Mr. Jonsen advised that both definitions could be found online in the Department's Use of Force Policy and the Citizen Complaint Protocols and Procedures.

Council Member Kniss inquired about the Ring Service.

Mr. Jonsen indicated the Police Department was not connected to Ring in any way.

Council Member Kniss asked if video captured by a Ring Doorbell could be given to the Police Department.

Mr. Jonsen replied yes. Police Officers always requested any evidence of a crime. Ring video assisted the investigation and prosecution of crimes. Information was a key component of solving crimes.

Council Member Tanaka asked if the Department compared the number of auto break-ins with the number in surrounding cities.

FINAL MINUTES

Mr. Jonsen related that every city in the region experienced an increase in the number of auto break-ins. The vast number of break-ins was being conducted by organized crime. Almost all of the perpetrators who were apprehended did not reside in Palo Alto.

Council Member Tanaka stated his research indicated the per capita rate of auto break-ins in Menlo Park, Mountain View and Sunnyvale had decreased over the past few years. He requested data on this issue from the Police Department.

Mr. Jonsen explained that the cities were not comparable because most of Palo Alto's break-ins happened in mall parking structures while Menlo Park did not have a mall. A strategy that worked in one city was not necessarily going to work in another city.

Council Member Tanaka noted the larceny rate had almost doubled and requested Chief's thoughts.

Mr. Jonsen reported the focus on traffic enforcement caused the number of arrests for other offenses to decrease. His joining the City in 2018 was possibly related to an increase in the number of arrests in 2018. He suggested the 2019 statistics may have returned to normal levels. Property-related crimes and recruitment were priorities for 2020.

Council Member Tanaka concurred with bringing the traffic team back into service. The community appreciated proactive enforcement against car break-ins. He inquired regarding potential strategies to combat car break-ins.

Chief Jonsen advised that high visibility worked well over the past six months with ghost cars and an additional officer patrolling Simon Properties and the Downtown area.

Council Member Tanaka suggested Chief Jonsen consult Police Chiefs in other cities because their efforts seemed to be working. He inquired regarding the three-day parking restriction.

Chief Jonsen explained that an Officer marked a vehicle to begin the 72-hour time limit and returned after 72 hours to see if the vehicle had been moved. The vast majority of vehicles had been moved, perhaps only 100 feet but they had been moved. If the vehicle had not been moved, the Officer issued a warning for the vehicle to be moved in another 72 hours. If the vehicle had not been moved at the end of the second 72-hour period, the Officer issued a citation. The Police Department received approximately 1,200 complaints about parking each year.

FINAL MINUTES

Council Member Tanaka related that community members told him that the Police Department had not responded to their complaints. He asked if the Police Department addressed all complaints about parking.

Chief Jonsen indicated the Police Department attempted to address all complaints, but its capacity was affected by staffing.

Council Member Tanaka requested the rationale of issuing a citation immediately for exceeding a two-hour parking limit but issuing a warning for exceeding a 72-hour parking limit.

Chief Jonsen explained that the Police Department had separate protocols for short-term parking and long-term parking issues. He had discussed changing the Ordinance and related protocols with the City Manager and City Attorney. State law required the issuance of a warning at the end of 72 hours.

Mayor Fine felt the Council and community were pleased with the return of the traffic team. He inquired whether traffic enforcement improved driver behavior for long periods of time or only when Officers were visible.

Chief Jonsen suggested repeated enforcement in the same area led to better driver behavior because drivers expected Officers to be present. If Officers were stationed across the City, there was likely going to be a dramatic change in driver behavior. If the Police Department was able to fill all their vacancies, the number of Officers assigned to the traffic team was expected to increase.

Council Member Cormack felt the City was safe. She appreciated the visibility of Officers throughout the City and asked if Officers issued citations to individuals using alternative modes of travel, such as bicycles, scooters and foot traffic.

Chief Jonsen responded yes. Each year, the Police Department did a lot of enforcement for student bicyclists. Rather than receiving a citation, a student bicyclist was able to attend a training program. The vast majority of citations for moving violations were issued to drivers.

Council Member Cormack requested Chief Jonsen share crime prevention tips for the community.

Chief Jonsen noted prevention tips were shared through social media. Many victims of crime were not residents and, thus, did not follow the Police Department on social media.

Council Member Cormack inquired about tools the Council should consider for the Police Department.

FINAL MINUTES

Chief Jonsen reported new tools would be developed over the next five years, and those tools could provide tremendous value to the community. In the near future, drones were probably going to be used as a response protocol.

Council Member Kou hoped the number of Officers on the traffic team would increase. She asked if two Officers were assigned to the bike team.

Chief Jonsen clarified that the Department did not have an official bike team. Typically, Sergeants determined when staffing was adequate for patrols on bicycle. When staffing was adequate, any Police Officer was able to use a bike to patrol neighborhoods.

Council Member Kou requested Officers monitor the California Avenue tunnel because there were many in the community that had noted numerous violations in that area. She inquired about the qualifications and vetting of Reserve Officers.

Chief Jonsen indicated the hiring process for Reserve Officers was the same. Reserve Officers were able to patrol the City, but typically the Department used them for special events. While the Police Department had eight vacancies, four Police Officers were in patrol training, and five Police Officers were attending the academy.

Council Member Kou asked if population growth was factored into the statistics.

Chief Jonsen replied yes. A metric for use of force incidents was the number of interactions with the public for each officer. In this manner, one was able to understand whether one officer was using force more than any other officer. Most use of force incidents during his tenure had resulted from apprehending individuals under the influence or resisting arrest.

Council Member Kou appreciated Police Officers talking to her children when they snuck out of the house, and she hoped that community service continued.

Ed Shikada, City Manager advised that Chief Jonsen and he consulted almost daily about police issues. When needed, consultations included the City Attorney and the Human Resources Department.

Vice Mayor DuBois asked if Police Officers could turn off cameras when they wished.

Chief Jonsen replied no. Vehicle cameras activated when an Officer made a stop or activated the lights. Police Officers had to manually activate the body cameras. Policy required body cameras to be active when Police Officers

FINAL MINUTES

interacted with the public. However, it was possible for incidents occurring prior to a Police Officer activating a body camera.

Vice Mayor DuBois felt the increased number of use of force incidents was difficult to interpret. He appreciated Chief Jonsen stating officer misconduct would not be tolerated and requested Chief Jonsen's opinion of electric scooters.

Mr. Shikada indicated the issue would be before the Council in the next few weeks.

Chief Jonsen advised that everyone had to be observant of all modes of transportation and to avoid distractions.

NO ACTION TAKEN.

Agenda Changes, Additions and Deletions

Mayor Fine thanked the Marin County Sheriff's Office and other Public Safety Agencies involved in the search and rescue of Carol Kiparsky and Ian Irwin.

Oral Communications

Aram James commented on attempts to reverse the Supreme Court decision in New York Times vs Sullivan. The Chief's Advisory Group was not subject to the Brown Act, which belied Chief Jonsen's claims of transparency. The Police Department's Command Staff showed no ethnic diversity.

Winter Dellenbach noted the Policy and Services Committee's six-month review of the Code enforcement audit did not occur. The issues with Code enforcement dealt with more than staffing.

Grant Brians reported the compostable bags required by City Ordinance actively decomposed leafy greens. Leaving greens and herbs in the compostable bags for as little as one hour reduced the lifespan of the produce by one day. If left in the bags for four to five days, produce was partially decomposed even with proper handling and refrigeration. He requested the Council allow reusable plastic bags for produce.

Ed Shikada, City Manager promised to follow up with Staff and commented that Staff was focusing on constructive implementation of the Ordinance rather than issuing citations.

FINAL MINUTES

Minutes Approval

3. Approval of Action Minutes for the February 1, 3, and 10, 2020 Council Meetings.

MOTION: Council Member Cormack moved, seconded by Council Member Filseth to approve the Action Minutes for the February 1, 3, and 10, 2020 Council Meetings.

MOTION PASSED: 7-0

Consent Calendar

Aram James addressing Agenda Item Number 10, believed the Council should hold a serious discussion of services for the homeless and requested removal of the item from the Consent Calendar.

Council Member Tanaka registered a no vote on Agenda Item Number 7.

MOTION: Council Member Kou moved, seconded by Vice Mayor DuBois to approve Agenda Item Numbers 4-11.

4. Approval of Contract Number C20175301 With S. Groner and Associates, Inc. in the Amount of \$296,000 for Graphic Design and Public Outreach Services for Public Works Watershed Protection.
5. Approval of Amendment Number 1 to Contract Number C18169791 With BKF Engineers to Increase the Third Year Funding by \$150,000 and Extend the Contract Term for an Additional two Years at \$300,000 per Year, for a new Not-to-Exceed Total of \$1,200,000 to Provide Surveying and Design Services.
6. Approval of Contract Number C20176783 With AECOM Technical Services, Inc. for Professional Services Related to the 2020 Sustainability and Climate Action Plan (S/CAP) Update and SB743 Implementation in the Amount of \$573,228; and Approval of an Exemption from Competitive Solicitation for SB743 Scope of Work.
7. Approval of a Three-year Agreement with Insight Public Sector for Citywide Microsoft Licensing, Utilizing the County of Riverside Agreement, in the Annual Amount of \$497,486 and a Contingency of ten Percent in the Annual Amount of \$49,748, for a Total Not-to-Exceed Amount of \$547,234.
8. Approval of a Blanket Purchase Order with Oldcastle Infrastructure, Inc., as the City's Standard Supplier of Certain Equipment for the Utility's

FINAL MINUTES

Electric Underground System, in an Annual Amount of \$350,000 for a Total Purchase Amount of \$1,600,000 Over the Next 4.5 Years.

9. Approval to Acquire Replacement Pre-hospital Monitors/Defibrillators for Emergency Responses in a Not-to-Exceed Amount of \$709,644 for Fiscal Years 2020-2026.
10. Interim Ordinance 5490 Entitled, "Ordinance of the Council of the City of Palo Alto Amending Title 18 (Zoning) of the Palo Alto Municipal Code to Temporarily Allow Overnight Safe Parking on Sites in all Zoning Districts With a Church or Religious Institution;" Establishing Related Regulations, and Finding the Ordinance Exempt From the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Under Guidelines Section 15301 (FIRST READING: January 13, 2020, PASSED 7-0).
11. Approval of the Appointment of Council Member Kniss as the Alternate to the Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority (VTA) Group 2 Cities Working Group.

MOTION PASSED FOR AGENDA ITEM NUMBERS 4-6, 8-11: 7-0

MOTION PASSED FOR AGENDA ITEM NUMBER 7: 6-1 Tanaka no

Council Member Tanaka found the cost of the Microsoft licenses to be higher than shown on Microsoft's website, and the Staff Report did not contain a good explanation of the difference.

City Manager Comments

Ed Shikada, City Manager announced the Rail Town Hall scheduled for February 27, 2020 had been postponed to March 26, 2020, tentatively. A recent blog posting to medium.com/atpaloaltoconnect addressed the City's efforts to increase public safety and emergency response. The Police Department conducted undercover investigations at licensed tobacco retailers in Palo Alto and citations were issued to three retailers that did not properly check the age of the purchaser. Staff wanted to present proposed revisions to the Tobacco Ordinance to the Council in April, 2020. Palo Alto homeowners were possibly eligible for grants for seismic retrofits through the Earthquake Brace and Bolt Program. The deadline to apply for the Human Relations Commission (HRC), Library Advisory Commission (LAC), Public Art Commission and Utilities Advisory Commission (UAC) was March 31, 2020. The Rail Expanded Community Advisory Panel (XCAP) were going to meet February 26, 2020. The North Ventura Coordinated Area Plan (NVCAP) open house, workshop and Family Science Night were scheduled for February 27, 2020.

FINAL MINUTES

Action Items

12. Evaluation of the Neighborhood Traffic Safety and Bicycle Boulevard Phase 1 Project, Including; Acceptance of Findings Regarding Increasing Bicycle Usage, Affirmation or Approval of Project Modifications, Affirmation of Planned Education Activities, and Process to Update Community Engagement; and Acknowledgement of Associated Actions by Staff.

Council Member Cormack advised she would not participate in this item as she owned property in the area.

Philip Kamhi, Chief Transportation Official reported Palo Alto's bicycle rates were comparable to those in the Netherlands. In addition, the City's rate for children biking to school was among the highest in the Nation. A bicycle boulevard was defined as low-volume, through-streets where bicycles had priority over automobiles, conflicts between bicycles and automobiles were minimized and bicycle travel time was reduced by the removal of stop signs and other impediments to bicycle travel. Work was performed on Phases 1-5 of the Neighborhood Traffic Safety and Bicycle Boulevard (NTSBB) Project, which had a total of nine phases. After construction began on Ross Road, Staff responded to community feedback and paused construction in March, 2018. In August, 2018, construction was formally stopped.

Wayne Tanda, MRG advised of some changes to traffic installations: a roundabout was installed at East Meadow; speed bumps, bulb-outs and islands were installed at various locations; a raised intersection was installed at Mayview; and stop signs were not removed as planned. Community feedback to temporary installations for Phase 4 was primarily negative, so Staff did not pursue permanent construction. Evaluation of bicycle boulevards was planned for 2019, but the lack of personnel delayed the evaluation. Staff undertook community surveys and stakeholder interviews. Approximately 80 percent of residents and 60 percent of other road users felt the bicycle boulevard needed to be modified. Staff had collected data regarding vehicle, bicycle and pedestrian volumes, vehicle speeds, traffic collisions and motorist/bicyclist and pedestrian behaviors. Unfortunately, data gathered in 2016 was limited. Notably, there were no reported accidents where bicycles were rear-ended or sideswiped on Ross Road, Amarillo or Moreno. In January, 2020, Staff made 14,000 observations of vehicle, bicycle and pedestrian behaviors over two days. The devices installed on Ross Road increased bicycle usage, but the number of traffic collisions also increased. The intersection of Ross Road and East Meadow needed to be controlled by a two-way stop for East Meadow. To facilitate larger vehicles, the geometric modification of the roundabout at Ross Road and East Meadow needed to be modified. To address speeding on Ross

FINAL MINUTES

Road, south of Mayview, a speed bump needed to be considered. The devices installed on Amarillo and Moreno did not change bicycle usage or the number of traffic collisions. Stop signs needed to be placed at the intersections of Louis with Moreno, Fielding and Amarillo.

Mr. Kamhi indicated lessons learned from the Ross Road Project were the need for greater community engagement and education for all road users, cost-effective use of devices, an update of the 2001 Neighborhood Traffic Calming Program and the Public Works Department to lead large street projects.

Ken Joye urged the Council to reaffirm the goal of maintaining the network of bicycle boulevards.

Nicole Boelens supported the improvements planned for Ross Road.

Arwin Boelens encouraged the Council to implement new cycling infrastructure to increase safety. A network of bicycle infrastructure was needed for safe commutes and to address congestion.

Liz Gardner supported bicycle infrastructure as a way to address single-occupancy vehicle travel and the jobs/housing imbalance. The State was offering vouchers for the purchase of cargo bikes.

Paul Goldstein noted the Pedestrian and Bicycle Advisory Committee (PABAC), City/School Transportation Safety Committee and the Planning and Transportation Commission (PTC) had not reviewed the Staff Report. A two-way stop at the Ross/Meadow traffic circle was not appropriate. Street closures needed to be considered.

Gary Bradski remarked that the bulb-outs were causing issues and questioned the data that supported their installation.

Sonya Bradski supported continued improvement of bicycle boulevards to increase bicycle travel.

Arthur Liberman urged the Council to consider the stress level of bicyclists using bike boulevards. Bicyclists preferred bikeways with low stress levels.

David Coale supported the Staff recommendation and the Word on the Street program. Improvements needed to be simple and straightforward.

Stephen Rock commented that stop signs in the traffic circle at Ross and East Meadow would be disastrous. Enforcement was a better solution.

Eric Nordman noted the Council had directed Staff to utilize traffic calming measures rather than street closures on Ross Road. He encouraged the

FINAL MINUTES

Council to continue developing a bicycle network and to allow Staff to use street closures for bicycle boulevards.

Eric Balin Watkins commented that bicycle boulevards improved residents' lives and asked the Council to finish the work it had begun.

Keri Wagner supported bicycle boulevards because they reduced vehicle speeds. South Palo Alto needed bicycle improvements.

Suzanne Usiskin liked the bicycle improvements on Ross Road because they made her feel safer while biking.

Steve Raney, Palo Alto Transportation Management Association (TMA) supported the objective to double bicycle travel in Palo Alto.

Penny Ellson requested the Council direct Staff to reconsider the policy prohibiting street closures. The bicycle and pedestrian boulevard network played an important part in the planned approach to safer, multimodal transportation and a sustainable community.

Cedric de La Beaujardiere noted the rate of collisions per bicyclist decreased. Street closures contributed to the popularity and success of the Bryant Bike Boulevard. He urged the Council to allow the Office of Transportation to consider road closures as a tool for bicycle boulevards.

Frank Viggiano commented that traveling Ross Road with the improvements did require a bit more time, but no more time than waiting through two traffic signals. People needed time and experience to become familiar with traffic circles.

Pat Burt encouraged Staff to obtain community feedback and suggestions. Bicyclists and the whole community benefited from bicycle boulevards.

Ken Kershner believed a robust bikeway network could triple the transit corridor for reasonable, 30-minute, Citywide access. A wider corridor with safe bikeway networks was key to improving both housing and congestion.

Robert Neff suggested "yield ahead" or "slow to 15 mph" signs and selective speed enforcement should be tried at the East Meadow traffic circle. The Idaho stop needed to be allowed for stop signs.

Kathy Durham concurred with Staff's recommendations except for the two-way stop at the East Meadow traffic circle.

Council Member Tanaka requested the rationale for not presenting the Staff Report to PABAC, the PTC and other advisory bodies for review.

FINAL MINUTES

Mr. Kamhi explained that additional review further delayed the Report. The findings identified safety concerns that Staff felt should be addressed immediately.

Council Member Tanaka requested the rationale for placing a stop sign in a traffic circle.

Mr. Tanda advised that typically stop signs were installed to assign right-of-way and to avoid conflicts. The criterion for installing a stop sign was five collisions, and four collisions had occurred. Seven of the eight traffic circles in Palo Alto were controlled with stop signs and two-way stop signs were better than all-way stop signs.

Council Member Tanaka asked if Staff had developed a list of prioritized streets for installation of improvements.

Mr. Kamhi advised that Staff wanted to present prioritization to the Council. With the Bike Bridge under construction, that segment needed to occur soon. Phases 6-9 of the NTSBB Project was going to likely follow next.

Council Member Tanaka asked if temporary installations would be a component of future projects.

Mr. Kamhi answered yes.

MOTION: Council Member Tanaka moved, seconded by Mayor Fine to:

- A. Accept this report on the Ross Road Bicycle Boulevard and Moreno/Amarillo Bicycle Boulevard project;
- B. Affirm the implemented modifications that have been made to the Bicycle Boulevard Phase 1 plan originally approved by the City;
- C. Approve proposed modifications including the designation of Ross Road and E. Meadow Drive as a two-way stop with the stops on E. Meadow Drive, the reassignment of stop controls on Louis Road at Moreno Avenue (west), at Moreno Avenue (east), at Fielding Drive and at Amarillo Avenue, and the installation of supplemental warning and guide signs and pavement markings;
- D. Affirm planned efforts by Staff to enhance educational activities to address the observed unsafe behavior of motorists, bicyclists, and pedestrians;
- E. Affirm that the community engagement process will be updated to reflect the lessons learned with the input of the Planning and

FINAL MINUTES

Transportation Commission, the Pedestrian and Bicycle Advisory Committee, and the City/School Traffic Safety Committee, and return the process to the City Council for discussion;

- F. Acknowledge that the guidelines, criteria, and design standard for the application of speed humps will be updated; and
- G. Acknowledge that the Office of Transportation is undertaking steps to build its staffing and capacity to manage projects like the Bicycle Boulevards.

Council Member Tanaka noted mobility was a City initiative. He concurred with constructing low-stress bicycle facilities. Biking reduced congestion and greenhouse gas emissions.

Mayor Fine preferred not to install stop signs in roundabouts. Perhaps, the PTC and PABAC needed to review the East Meadow roundabout.

INCORPORATED INTO THE MOTION WITH THE CONSENT OF THE MAKER AND SECONDER to add to the Motion, "Direct the Planning and Transportation Commission to look at the roundabout on East Meadow." (New Part H)

Mayor Fine questioned the cost of constructing and revising the improvements and suggested the Motion direct Staff to consider cost-effective options.

Mr. Kamhi reported yield signs were installed at the roundabout, but the signs could be larger. More cost-effective measures were able to be implemented.

Mayor Fine believed the policy for road closures and traffic diverters should be re-evaluated.

INCORPORATED INTO THE MOTION WITH THE CONSENT OF THE MAKER AND SECONDER to add to the Motion, "Direct Staff to consider the full range of cost-effective options for bicycle infrastructure, including traffic diverters." (New Part I)

Mayor Fine asked if there were any policies or positions regarding Vision Zero, Complete Streets or Idaho stops.

Mr. Kamhi indicated Complete Streets and Vision Zero could be incorporated into an update of the Bicycle and Pedestrian Transportation Plan.

Council Member Kniss felt the community needed more experience with roundabouts to feel comfortable with them. She received community

FINAL MINUTES

feedback opposing any changes to the Bryant Bike Boulevard and asked if Staff had considered planting a tree in a roundabout.

Mr. Kamhi recommended not planting a tree in a roundabout because he advised emergency vehicles to traverse roundabouts if necessary.

Council Member Kniss requested Staff comment regarding the bulb-outs on Ross Road.

Mr. Tanda explained that bulb-outs shortened the crosswalk for pedestrians and reduced vehicle speeds. Ross Road was designed for vehicles and bicyclists to share the roadway.

Council Member Kniss commented that Ross Road was not wide enough to accommodate bicyclists and vehicles. She inquired whether additional signage was needed on Bryant St. to direct traffic to Mountain View.

Mr. Kamhi indicated increased signage for bicycle boulevards was a component of the project.

Council Member Kniss hoped stop signs at the traffic circle would not be necessary. Signage at the traffic circle on Bryant St. had potential for improvement.

Council Member Filseth appreciated the data and asked how the accidents occurred at the traffic circle on Ross Road.

Mr. Tanda reported in each case the motorist failed to yield and broad sided a bicyclist or another motorist.

Council Member Filseth inquired whether the bicycle ran into the car as the car went by or if the car ran into the bicycle as the bicycle entered the circle.

Mr. Tanda related that in each case the bicycle was in the intersection, and the motorist failed to yield.

Mr. Kamhi reported the Police Department had asked Staff to redact the citations issued for accidents.

Council Member Filseth asked if a two-way stop sign could prevent some of the collisions.

Mr. Tanda believed a two-way stop sign would reduce the number of collisions.

Council Member Filseth did not feel the two-way stop at the roundabout on Emerson and Everett was confusing. He had not observed vehicles traveling

FINAL MINUTES

in the wrong direction in a roundabout. A bicyclist was able to travel in the wrong direction to turn left in a roundabout. The cost to install stop signs on Ross Road was minimal. If they were not effective in reducing collisions, they were able to be removed.

Ed Shikada, City Manager suggested the Council direct Staff to install the stop signs and refer the matter to the PTC to evaluate alternatives.

Council Member Filseth proposed adding a referral of the stop sign issue to the PTC to the Motion.

Council Member Tanaka inquired regarding the length of time needed for the PTC or PABAC to review the issue.

Mr. Shikada was not able to suggest a timeframe.

Council Member Tanaka requested a timeframe for installing a stop sign.

Mr. Kamhi believed it could be installed within a month.

Council Member Tanaka inquired regarding the PTC's ability to agendaize an item.

Carolyn Templeton, Planning and Transportation Commission Chair indicated the PTC could probably discuss the issue in one of the next two meetings.

INCORPORATED INTO THE MOTION WITH THE CONSENT OF THE MAKER AND SECONDER to amend Motion Part H to state, "... after installation of stop signs."

Vice Mayor DuBois asked if Staff would return to the Council in August, 2020 with Phases 6-9.

Mr. Kamhi clarified that Staff would return in August, 2020 with a community engagement process and education efforts. The status of the NTSBB Project was likely going to return to the Council in November, 2020.

Vice Mayor DuBois believed the results were mixed as far as whether the project had achieved its objectives. About half of motorists and bicyclists did not feel safe traveling Ross Road after the improvements were constructed. Many people found the roundabout confusing before and after the improvements were constructed. He was skeptical that education would improve the safety of Ross Road. He requested additional details of the changes that Staff would make at Ross and Meadow.

FINAL MINUTES

Mr. Tanda reported the proposed modifications had been driven by the input from service providers, particularly GreenWaste and the Fire Department. The nose of Splitter Islands was to be cut down similar to the intersection of Moreno and Ross. The tactile domes in the splitter islands were to be removed to comply with Federal standards. The boulders within the traffic island were to be removed. Signage was going to be relocated so that large vehicles could travel the traffic circle without striking them.

Vice Mayor DuBois suggested removing the roundabout as it was small and made primarily of concrete. Installing the stop signs was preferable to awaiting a recommendation from the PTC. The roundabout was not attractive. The landscaping had died and should be replaced. He asked if vegetation could be changed to make the roundabout more attractive.

Mr. Kamhi replied yes.

Mr. Shikada advised that maintenance of landscaping was an ongoing issue for the City.

Vice Mayor DuBois asked if the PTC could review signage as well as the stop signs.

Mayor Fine understood the intent of the Motion was for the PTC to review the intersection as a whole.

Vice Mayor DuBois inquired whether Part I of the Motion was limited to Ross Road.

Mayor Fine explained that Part I directed Staff to consider a full range of cost-effective infrastructure for bicycle projects across the City.

Council Member Kou questioned whether the Council could refer review of street landscaping to the Parks and Recreation Commission. She asked if the roundabout had a water supply.

Mr. Shikada responded no.

INCORPORATED INTO THE MOTION WITH THE CONSENT OF THE MAKER AND SECONDER to add to the Motion, "Direct the Parks and Recreation Commission to look at more greenery features in the roundabouts." (New Part J)

Council Member Kou expressed concern about children navigating the Ross Road improvements. She asked if a bike lane could be constructed between the curb and parked cars.

FINAL MINUTES

Mr. Kamhi indicated the roadway was not wide enough for on-street parking and a protected bike lane.

Council Member Kou inquired whether a shared-use path could be constructed on Ross Road.

Mr. Kamhi advised that parking on one side of the street would have to be removed or the travel lanes would have to be one way if a shared-use path was constructed.

Council Member Tanaka suggested the PTC review future bicycle projects to determine the feasibility of a protected bike lane.

Mr. Kamhi related that Staff had spoken with the City of Cambridge, Massachusetts, regarding its parking-protected bike lanes. This feature could be included in an updated Bicycle and Pedestrian Transportation Plan.

Council Member Kou wanted to ensure all users were safe and comfortable traveling along Ross Road. She asked if approval of the Staff recommendation would direct Staff to proceed with Phases 6-9.

Mr. Kamhi clarified that Staff would work on a Community Engagement Plan and engage the community before constructing any project.

Council Member Kou inquired regarding Staff's plans for education.

Mr. Kamhi hoped to expand the Safe Routes to School model to additional road users.

MOTION AS AMENDED RESTATED: Council Member Tanaka moved, seconded by Mayor Fine to:

- A. Accept this report on the Ross Road Bicycle Boulevard and Moreno/Amarillo Bicycle Boulevard project;
- B. Affirm the implemented modifications that have been made to the Bicycle Boulevard Phase 1 plan originally approved by the City;
- C. Approve proposed modifications including the designation of Ross Road and E. Meadow Drive as a two-way stop with the stops on E. Meadow Drive, the reassignment of stop controls on Louis Road at Moreno Avenue (west), at Moreno Avenue (east), at Fielding Drive, and at Amarillo Avenue, and the installation of supplemental warning and guide signs and pavement markings;

FINAL MINUTES

- D. Affirm planned efforts by Staff to enhance educational activities to address the observed unsafe behavior of motorists, bicyclists, and pedestrians;
- E. Affirm that the community engagement process will be updated to reflect the lessons learned with the input of the Planning and Transportation Commission, the Pedestrian and Bicycle Advisory Committee, and the City/School Traffic Safety Committee, and return the process to the City Council for discussion;
- F. Acknowledge that the guidelines, criteria, and design standard for the application of speed bumps will be updated; and
- G. Acknowledge that the Office of Transportation is undertaking steps to build its staffing and capacity to manage projects like the Bicycle Boulevards;
- H. Direct the Planning and Transportation Commission to look at the roundabout on East Meadow after installation of stop signs;
- I. Direct Staff to consider the full range of cost-effective options for bicycle infrastructure, including traffic diverters; and
- J. Direct the Parks and Recreation Commission to look at more greenery features in the roundabouts.

MOTION AS AMENDED PASSED: 6-0 Cormack recused

Council took a break at 9:59 P.M. and returned at 10:07 P.M.

- 13. Update from the Ad Hoc Committee (Vice Mayor DuBois and Council Member Cormack) on Boards and Commissions and Potential Next Steps

Mayor Fine reported Council Member Cormack and Vice Mayor DuBois were appointed and reappointed to an Ad Hoc Committee to explore the use, efficiency and direction of City Boards and Commissions.

Council Member Cormack advised that the Ad Hoc Committee had issued a survey, interviewed Staff who worked with Boards and Commissions, and reviewed documents from other jurisdictions. The response rate for the survey was approximately 50 percent. The Ad Hoc Committee developed six recommendations for the Council. The Ad Hoc Committee requested Council input regarding annual work plans, a process to change work plans during the year, term limits, a single interview period, and changes to Boards and Commissions. Next steps were to draft a handbook for Boards and Commissions and revise the Council Protocols and Procedures and Ordinances.

FINAL MINUTES

Vice Mayor DuBois noted the handbooks from other jurisdictions were useful, and the Ad Hoc Committee had requested Staff begin preparing a handbook for City Boards and Commissions. Most cities used work plans and imposed term limits.

David Coale, Carbon Free Palo Alto suggested a Climate or Sustainability Commission would slow the process for implementing changes.

Cari Templeton, Planning and Transportation Commission (PTC) Chair believed separating planning and transportation would be difficult. In 2019, the PTC's Agenda did not include transportation projects because the Office of Transportation was short staffed. If necessary, the PTC was able to find a way to ensure transportation projects were not overlooked.

Bob Moss, Library Advisory Commissioner remarked that Boards and Commissions served to obtain public input and to resolve issues before they became serious concerns.

Valerie Stinger, Human Relations Commission (HRC) Vice Chair appreciated the Ad Hoc Committee's recommendations for work plans, roles and responsibilities, and training.

Ed Lauing, Planning and Transportation Commissioner remarked that the existing interview process was neither comprehensive nor lengthy. Additional vetting of candidates' applications was a good idea. The PTC had the capacity to review transportation and planning projects. The transportation and planning aspects of projects were often intertwined.

Jeff Greenfield, Parks and Recreation Commissioner supported work plans for Boards and Commissions but expressed concern that Council approval of work plans was anticipated to delay the work of Boards and Commissions. A limit of three terms was necessary to ensure at least one member had experience on the Board or Commission.

Penny Ellson did not know how the PTC could be separated because planning and transportation were inextricably linked.

Mayor Fine asked Council Members to respond to the Ad Hoc Committee's request for input. A handbook was a necessity. A cover sheet for applications, a handbook, one interview period and the filtering of candidates were good ideas. The work plans were able to cover two years to avoid delays in Board and Commission work. He requested the number of Board and Commission members who had served two or more terms. He supported disbanding the Library Advisory Commission (LAC) once their Bond Oversight duties were complete. He did not recommend the PTC be separated; however, the PTC

FINAL MINUTES

rather than the Architectural Review Board (ARB) needed to review development projects' compliance with the Zoning Code. He wanted to understand the role of a Sustainability or Climate Board or Commission. The HRC reviewed some issues pertaining to seniors, and seniors in the community frequently provided relevant comments to the Council.

Council Member Filseth indicated work plans, a handbook and a single interview period should be explored. The remaining points did not appear to be problems that needed solutions.

Council Member Kniss asked if the Ad Hoc Committee spoke with the Chairs of Boards and Commissions and, if so, did they provide input.

Council Member Cormack related that many Chairs sent emails.

Council Member Kniss inquired regarding's Staff's involvement.

Council Member Cormack reported Staff executed the survey and Staff from the City Manager's Office met with the Ad Hoc Committee and Staff liaisons of Boards and Commissions. The City Attorney's Office provided good document exemplars from other jurisdictions.

Council Member Kniss felt a Senior Commission was a terrific idea if Staff had the capacity. A Sustainability Board was not needed. Planning and Transportation were completely intertwined. Work plans and term limits were good ideas. She inquired regarding the number of Board and Commission members.

Beth Minor, City Clerk, replied 58.

Council Member Kniss related that one interview period would not be sufficient to replace members.

Ms. Minor added that two interview periods had been conducted over the past several years.

Council Member Kniss agreed that further discussion of changes to Boards and Commissions was needed. She requested copies of the handbooks from other jurisdictions.

Council Member Cormack advised that the Staff Report contained links to the handbooks.

Council Member Kniss asked if the many aspects of Boards and Commissions were different in each jurisdiction.

FINAL MINUTES

Council Member Cormack indicated a few jurisdictions had more Boards and Commissions.

Council Member Kou understood senior issues fell under the HRC's purview. She felt the PTC should not be separated and concurred with Mr. Greenfield's comment regarding term limits. New members needed training. The Boards and Commissions needed to be relevant to the Council. Staff needed to utilize existing technology to assist Boards and Commissions during meetings.

Council Member Tanaka believed the purpose of Boards and Commissions was to obtain community input and to review issues in depth. The Council needed to trust their Boards and Commissions and delegate more issues to them. Perhaps each Council Member should appoint one person to each Board and Commission. Separating the PTC was not logical. One interview period did not seem feasible.

Vice Mayor DuBois indicated the intent behind a Work Plan was to align the Council and Boards and Commissions. Work plans did not have to coincide with the calendar year. Many cities used a Seniors Commission to look at issues of aging, which were separate from the HRC's concerns. The proposal to separate the PTC was based on the City having separate Planning and Transportation Departments. Like the City Council, Board and Commission members were able to serve two terms, sit out one term and apply for another term. The regular recruitment was able to occur in the spring, and recruitment for unexpected vacancies was able to occur in the fall. Staff leveraged some Boards and Commissions to complete their annual goals. He had no preference for retaining or disbanding the LAC. The Council had pushed sustainability into all City departments, and a sustainability commission was probably not needed.

Council Member Cormack believed a handbook would address the few issues with Boards and Commissions. The Ad Hoc Committee did not discuss interactions between and among Board and Commissions, but that was able to be sorted in the description of each Board and Commission. Work plans helped Boards and Commissions set their agendas and work with the Council. Term limits were beneficial. She supported disbanding the LAC and forming a Senior Commission.

MOTION: Mayor Fine moved, seconded by Council Member Kniss to direct the ad hoc to continue their good work and explore the following issues:

- A. Annual work plans and process to change them;
- B. Make a proposal on term limits;

FINAL MINUTES

- C. Explore moving to a single interview period in the Spring;
- D. Throw a party for and disband the Library Advisory Commission; and
- E. Scope out and provide feedback on what other cities do for both the Senior and Sustainability Commissions.

Mayor Fine requested the Ad Hoc Committee explore providing the PTC with discretionary review and approval.

Council Member Kniss requested Part C of the Motion include a second recruitment in the fall.

Ms. Minor reported in 2013 recruitment was changed to interview candidates twice a year.

INCORPORATED INTO THE MOTION WITH THE CONSENT OF THE MAKER AND SECONDER to add to Motion Part C, "including Fall as a backup."

Vice Mayor DuBois noted some City Councils used a subcommittee to filter candidates for select Boards and Commissions.

Council Member Kou inquired regarding the input the Ad Hoc Committee received for Part D of the Motion and from whom.

Council Member Cormack clarified the Chair and Vice Chair had recommended disbanding the LAC during the Study Session with the Council. The Friends of the Library had submitted a letter indicating they had no opinion and no significant concerns about disbanding the LAC. The former Library Director provided information about the significant amount of time Staff utilized on behalf of the LAC.

MOTION AS AMENDED RESTATED: Mayor Fine moved, seconded by Council Member Kniss to Direct the Ad hoc to continue their good work and explore the following issues:

- A. Annual work plans and process to change them;
- B. Make a proposal on term limits;
- C. Explore moving to a single interview period in the Spring, including Fall as a backup;
- D. Throw a party for and disband the Library Advisory Commission; and

FINAL MINUTES

- E. Scope out and provide feedback on what other cities do for both the Senior and Sustainability Commissions.

MOTION AS AMENDED PASSED: 7-0

Council Member Questions, Comments and Announcements

Council Member Cormack reported Council Member Filseth, City Manager Shikada and she were in Sacramento the prior week to follow up on the request for funding to design grade separation. She requested an update regarding the lease for Cubberley Community Center.

Council Member Filseth added that \$1 million in funding for grade separation was contained in the prior year's Senate Budget but not the Assembly's Budget. Momentum was building for Faster Bay Area if it was combined with a Housing Bill. If Faster Bay Area was proposed for the 2020 ballot, it was going to require a higher majority vote to be adopted.

Council Member Kniss advised that a City delegation was to travel to Washington, D.C., on March 7, 2020 regarding Rail Crossings.

Adjournment: The meeting was adjourned at 11:18 P.M. with gratitude to the Marin County First Responders who rescued Palo Alto citizens, Carol Kiparsky and Ian Irwin.