

Data Set Citation

When using this data, please cite the data package

NCEAS 10022: Shurin: Comparing trophic structure across ecosystems , NCEAS 11981: Shurin: Comparing trophic structure across ecosystems (Extended) , National Center for Ecological Analysis and Synthesis , and Elser J. 2007. **Global analysis of nitrogen and phosphorus limitation** nceas.347.3 (<https://knb.ecoinformatics.org/knb/metacat/nceas.347.3/default>)

General Information

Title:	Global analysis of nitrogen and phosphorus limitation
Identifier:	autogen.2012062222520061343.1
Alternate Identifier:	ELSIE.NP
Abstract:	The cycles of the key nutrient elements nitrogen (N) and phosphorus (P) have been massively altered by anthropogenic activities to understand how photosynthetic production across diverse ecosystems is, or is not, limited by N and P. Via a large-scale meta-experimental enrichments, we show that P limitation is equally strong across these major habitats and that N and P limitation are both terrestrial and freshwater systems. Furthermore, simultaneous N and P enrichment produces strongly positive synergistic re environments. Thus, contrary to some prevailing paradigms, freshwater, marine and terrestrial ecosystems are surprisingly simila limitation.
Keywords:	<div>None:<ul style="list-style-type: none">◦ nutrient resources</div> <div>None:<ul style="list-style-type: none">◦ nitrogen</div> <div>None:<ul style="list-style-type: none">◦ phophorus</div> <div>None:<ul style="list-style-type: none">◦ fertilization</div> <div>None:<ul style="list-style-type: none">◦ plant community</div> <div>None:<ul style="list-style-type: none">◦ bottom-up</div> <div>None:<ul style="list-style-type: none">◦ primary producer biomass</div> <div>None:<ul style="list-style-type: none">◦ experimental manipulation</div> <div>None:</div>

○ marine, terrestrial, freshwater ecosystems

Publication Date: 2007-10-01

Data Table, Image, and Other Data Details:

Metadata download

[Ecological Metadata Language \(EML\) File](#)

Data Table:

Name:	np-analysis-dataset-out-for-datasharing.txt			
Description:	np analysis			
Physical Structure Description:				
Object Name:	np-analysis-dataset-out-for-datasharing.txt			
Size:	348062 byte			
Text Format:	Number of Header Lines:		1	
	Record Delimiter:		#x0A	
	Attribute Orientation:		column	
	Simple Delimited:		Field Delimeter:	
Number Of Records:	1062			

Online Distribution Info:

[ecogrid://knb/nceasadmin.910.2](#)

Attribute(s) Info:

Name	Column Label	Definition	Type of Value	Measurement Type	Measurement Domain	Missing Value Code	Accuracy Report	Accuracy Assessment
id_study		Initials of recorder & number (e.g., HLH001)		nominal	Def id			
system		categories: marine, terrestrial, freshwater		nominal	Def system			
strata		categories: pelagic, benthic, aboveground, belowground		nominal	Def strata			
habitat		agricultural; forest; herbaceous; tundra; shrubland; wetland; stream; lake; coral reef; coastal hard bottom; coastal soft bottom; oceanic (e.g. shrubland=savannah, categories: succesional woodland, desert scrub, oldfields {sometimes}) (e.g. herbaceous=grasslands,meadows, oldfields {sometimes}, rangeland)		nominal	Def habitat			
cat		categories: marine(BENTH HARD, BENTH SOFT, PELAGIC); freshwater(LAKE BENTHIC, LAKE PELAGIC,STREAM); terrestrial(HERBACEOUS,WETLAND,WOODY,TUNDRA)		nominal	Def categorieis			
tax_resp_class		categories: BIOMASS (standing stock), BIORATE (growth rate or increment), BIOPROD (productivity)		nominal	Def categories			
l.n.c				ratio	Unit dimensionless			
					Precision .000000001			
					Type real			
l.p.c				ratio	Unit dimensionless			
					Precision .000000001			

					Type	real			
l.int.c		natural log response ratio effect size for nitrogen + phosphorus addition		ratio	Unit	dimensionless			
					Precision	.000000001			
					Type	real			
Date_entry		Date data are entered (eg, 20050930 - YYYYMMDD)		datetime	Format	YYYYMMDD			
					Precision	1 day			
author		Authors (last names; two or more use "&&" or "et al"		nominal	Def	authors			
pubyear		Publication year		datetime	Format	YYYY			
					Precision	1 year			
citation		Journal name, volume, pages		nominal	Def	Journal name, volume, pages			
publication		Journal name - use existing syntax to enhance ability to search and sort		nominal	Def	journal name			
pubvol		Volume number of publication		nominal	Def	Volume number			
pages		pages of article		nominal	Def	page numbers			
hab_descrip		unique descriptor of habitat studied - e.g., rocky intertidal, swamp, rangeland, old field etc.		nominal	Def	description of habitat			
location		place name, country, site		nominal	Def	location			
latitud		latitude from -90 (S) to +90 (N)		ratio	Unit	degree			
					Precision	.01			
					Type	real			
longitud		longitude from -180 (W) to +180 (E)		ratio	Unit	degree			
					Precision	.01			
					Type	real			
elev		Elevation (m) Depth below sea level is negative		ratio	Unit	meter			
					Precision	.1			
					Type	real			
n_avail		Ambient concentration of available nitrogen (micromol g-1 for terrestrial micromol l-1 aquatic)		ratio	Unit	dimensionless			
					Precision	.000000001			
					Type	real			
n_total		Total N concentration (micromol g-1 for terrestrial micromol l-1 aquatic)		ratio	Unit	dimensionless			
					Precision	.000000001			
					Type	real			
p_avail		Total P concentration (micromol g-1 for terrestrial micromol l-1 aquatic)		ratio	Unit	dimensionless			
					Precision	.000000001			
					Type	real			
p_total		Total P concentration (micromol g-1 for terrestrial micromol l-1 aquatic)		ratio	Unit	dimensionless			
					Precision	.000000001			
					Type	real			
c_total		Total C concentration (micromol g-1 for terrestrial micromol l-1 aquatic)		ratio	Unit	dimensionless			
					Precision	.000000001			
					Type	real			
pH		pH		ratio	Unit	dimensionless			

					Precision .1			
					Type real			
light		Mean daily irradiance (μmol photons m-2 s-1) [manipulated]		ratio	Unit dimensionless			
					Precision .000000001			
					Type real			
temp		Mean temperature over experiment duration °C		ratio	Unit celsius			
					Precision .1			
					Type real			
precip		Average annual rainfall, during experiment if possible (mm)		ratio	Unit dimensionless			
					Precision .1			
					Type real			
npp		Net primary production (g m-2 yr-1)		ratio	Unit dimensionless			
					Precision 1			
					Type whole			
npp_typ		1=Total; 2=Aboveground; 3=Belowground		nominal	Domain Info			
ab		Total autotroph measure (standing crop) (g C m-2)		ratio	Unit dimensionless			
					Precision .000000001			
					Type real			
ab_unit		Max; min; mean; total		nominal	Def max or min or mean or total			
study_typ		Lab; field		nominal	Def Lab or field			
cons_man		Type of consumer manipulation: Exclosures; Enclosures (including most additions); Removal (e.g. pesticides, hand picking); Gradient (was Natural Variation); None; Multiple (if complex two or more of these)		nominal	Def manipulation types			
HA		1; 0 - Herbivore:Autotroph ratio in rough classes at community level; 1 = H:A much less than 1; 2 = H:A close to 1 (if you have to think about it too much, it is probably this); 3 = H:A larger than 1		ratio	Unit dimensionless			
					Precision 1			
					Type whole			
fert		1; 0		ratio	Unit dimensionless			
					Precision 1			
					Type real			
fdchlg_man		1; 2; 3 or 4 - highest level subject to manipulation (not measurement)		ratio	Unit dimensionless			
					Precision 1			
					Type real			
num_nut_tmnt		number of manipulated unique nutrient *main* factors (factorial of main tmnts does not count)		ratio	Unit dimensionless			
					Precision 1			
					Type real			
num_nut		total number of nutrients -- sum everything named ; osmocote ="21"		ratio	Unit dimensionless			
					Precision 1			
					Type real			
duration		Duration of experiment in days		ratio	Unit dimensionless			
					Precision .1			
					Type real			
fert_area		measurement area of the experimental unit : m² for fertilization manipulation		ratio	Unit squareMeter			
					Precision .000000001			

					Type	real			
cons_area		Area of the experimental unit : m² for consumer manipulation		ratio	Unit	squareMeter			
					Precision	.000000001			
					Type	real			
vol		Volume of the experimental unit : litre		ratio	Unit	liter			
					Precision	.1			
					Type	real			
fert_unit		units of fertilization added		nominal	Def	unit of measurement description			
p_rate		rate of P addition		ratio	Unit	dimensionless			
					Precision	.000000001			
					Type	real			
n_rate		rate of N addition		ratio	Unit	dimensionless			
					Precision	.000000001			
					Type	real			
meta_source		Name of database or meta-analysis that provided source data (e.g., Helmut periphyton database)		nominal	Def	Database name			
note_study		general description, notes, special conditions on study tagged with column name if relevant		nominal	Def	notes			

Involved Parties

Data Set Creators

Organization:	NCEAS 10022: Shurin: Comparing trophic structure across ecosystems
---------------	--

Organization:	NCEAS 11981: Shurin: Comparing trophic structure across ecosystems (Extended)
---------------	---

Organization:	National Center for Ecological Analysis and Synthesis
---------------	---

Individual:	James Elser
Organization:	Arizona State University
Address:	School of Life Sciences, Tempe, Arizona 85287-4501 USA
Phone:	(480)965-9747 (voice)
Phone:	(480)965-2519 (Fax)
Email Address:	j.elser@asu.edu

Data Set Contacts

Individual:	James Elser
Organization:	Arizona State University
Address:	School of Life Sciences,

	Tempe, Arizona 85287-4501 USA
Phone:	(480)965-9747 (voice)
Phone:	(480)965-2519 (Fax)
Email Address:	j.elser@asu.edu

Associated Parties

Individual:	Daniel Gruner
Individual:	Matt Bracken
Individual:	Elsa Cleland
Individual:	Stan Harpole
Individual:	Helmut Hillebrand
Individual:	Jacqueline Ngai
Individual:	Eric Seabloom
Individual:	Jonathan Shurin
Individual:	Jennifer Smith

Metadata Providers

Individual:	Daniel Gruner
-------------	---------------

Data Set Characteristics

Geographic Region:	
Geographic Description:	Meta-analysis of global data from seven continents.
Bounding Coordinates:	West: -180.0000 degrees East: 180.0000 degrees North: 90.0000 degrees South: -90.0000 degrees
Time Period:	
Begin:	2005-04-01
End:	2007-11-01

Sampling, Processing and Quality Control Methods

Step by Step Procedures

Step 1:

Description:

Global analysis of nitrogen and phosphorus limitation: methods

Relevant studies were identified by searching titles and abstracts of publications returned from searches on ISI Web of Science using keywords such as nitrogen, phosphorus, nutrient, enrichment, fertilization and bioassay. We also included studies summarized in previous syntheses (DiTommaso & Aarssen 1989; Elser et al. 1990; Tanner et al. 1998; Downing et al. 1999b) and searched all subsequent paper syntheses. For studies that included additional manipulations (such as grazer exclusion), we included only treatment combinations using controls (grazers at natural densities). Studies including such secondary manipulations were a small subset of our data. Studies were included if they involved (minimally) independent manipulations of both N and P availability or (ideally) full factorial manipulations of N and P. (Some studies included N and P enrichment but did not apply, or report data from, both treatments in all individual experiments. Thus, the numbers of observation responses are not necessarily identical.) By including only studies that manipulated both N and P, we minimized potential biases induced by focusing on particular limiting nutrients thought to be most important in particular kinds of ecosystems. Furthermore, we analysed the data in two ways: one in which all data were included and another in which only data from fully factorial experiments were included. The overall patterns were then compared between the two approaches. Thus, we present the results for the more inclusive data set in order to increase the scope of habitats and experimental approaches encompassed.

We included only studies that reported mean community-level biomass or production responses of autotrophs to nutrient enrichment. Studies in which responses were eliminated unless drawn from a mono-dominant community in the judgment of the original authors or, if several species were individually assayed for N and P response, an average across all species was taken for a given study. The preferred metric was biomass (terrestrial, wetland, benthic) or volume (pelagic). We also accepted proxy variables that are known to be correlated with standing biomass: chlorophyll concentration (most common in phytoplankton studies), ash-free dry mass, carbon mass, biovolume, percent cover and primary productivity. Many studies in forests and other systems dominated by woody plants and a small percent of marine benthos studies reported increase in height or radius rather than standing biomass. Inclusion of these studies did not qualitatively change the results of our analyses, and so we included them from the larger inclusive data set. Studies involving organism counts were excluded because of the orders-of-magnitude discrepancies among systems, and the expected inverse relation between organism size and abundance (Cohen et al. 1993; Cyr et al. 1997).

We defined a study as a temporally and spatially distinct experiment with internally consistent controls. Multiple studies could be reported in a single publication, for instance, if the same experimental treatments were performed in multiple streams with differing water quality or for water from different stations along an oceanographic transect. When multiple measures were reported over time in a single experiment, we generally used the final temporal sample to avoid phases of transient dynamics in order to capture measures closer to when the system approached a potential steady state after added nutrients. Exceptions were made to standardize duration within systems or to avoid excessively long incubations (mainly for bioassays in freshwater or marine phytoplankton). Data for multiple sampling dates in extended studies were averaged if phenological changes were not expected; otherwise mean values over all samples instead of the final value in order to be more ecologically relevant. In these cases, we used the most robust approach, deferring to the working knowledge and intuition of the original authors.

We used the ln-transformed response ratio as our primary effect size metric $RRX = \ln(E/C)$, where E is the measured value of the response in the enrichment treatment X (N or P or N P) and C is its value in the unenriched control treatment. RR is one of the most frequently used effect size metrics in ecological meta-analysis (Hedges et al. 1999; Lajeunesse & Forbes 2003). Unlike Hedges' d, the ln-response ratio does not require a measure of within-group variability. Moreover, in comparisons across systems where response variables and experimental designs can differ considerably, the response ratio relative to the control is more meaningful than standardized absolute differences between means.

For each study, we used a unique study identifier linked to the citation of the publication and obtained the following information wherever available: we categorized the system as marine, terrestrial, or freshwater and the stratum within each system by assigning aquatic studies to either pelagic or benthic subcategories and the terrestrial to either aboveground or belowground. Some studies in wetlands and salt marshes were difficult to categorize, so we used the operational approach that studies addressing submersed or floating macrophytes, or microalgae growing on them, were classified as aquatic (marine or freshwater), whereas studies on above-water rooted plants were termed terrestrial. For studies involving submersed macrophytes, only responses of the macrophytes were included. When nutrients were added to the overlying water column, responses of the epiphytes were included. Finally, we also created a standardized set of habitat subcategories consisting of: grassland; forest; shrubland; wetland; stream; lake pelagic; lake benthos; marine benthos (hard bottom), marine benthos (soft bottom); or marine benthos (soft bottom). We entered supporting data about incubation conditions and the local environment, including concentrations of available nutrients (nitrate, ammonium, and reactive phosphorus).

Data Set Usage Rights

Obtain permission from data set owner(s)

Access Control:	
Auth System:	knb
Order:	denyFirst