Comparison: CEMon v/s OSG Info Services

Parag Mhashilkar (Computing Division, Fermilab)

Evaluation Criteria

- Evaluation Criteria
 - Performance
 - Need to advertise to ReSS every 600 sec
 - Need to advertise to BDII every 300 sec
 - Security
 - Expertise
 - Maintenance
 - Support

Test Setup

- ReSS HA setup similar to Production and ITB
 - Input to the CEMon is raw LDIF
 - Same input is provided to the OSG Info Services
 Tool via --uri="file://" argument
- During evaluation, production ReSS had
 - 21,878 classads
 - 90 gatekeepers advertising
 - 243 average classads per Gatekeeper (avg/CE)

Evaluation

	OSG Information Services	CEMon
Performance: Site: fermigridosg1.fnal.gov Speed (Formatting* + Transmitting)	489 classads 639** sec (380 sec + 359 sec)	549 classads < 28* sec (< 25 sec + 1 to 3 sec)
Performance: Site: fngposg1.fnal.gov Speed (Formatting* + Transmitting)	Failed advertising the info to ReSS ??? (860 sec + ??? sec)	1930 classads < 164* sec (< 100 sec + 64 sec)
Support for secure registration	Yes	Yes
Source Code Size we maintain	900 lines	1150 lines (osg-ce-plugin)
Dependencies	OSG GIP	OSG GIP, Tomcat, Apache
Pros	 Lightweight and fewer dependencies Knowledge would be local 	 Stable and in production for 2+ yrs Undergone security review
Cons	Yet to be deployed/tested in production	 Heavyweight, we use subset of functionality, more dependencies, Have local experts but still dependent on CEMon team at times
Support	GIP group	CEMon developers have been very responsive to the support requests.

^{*} Actual info formatting time for CEMon is much lower than that mentioned

^{**} It's not clear how the tool will behave if the second advertising cycle starts before first one completes

Summary

CEMon

- Working and stable
- We have RSV probes to help admins
- Configuration and Operations well documented
- No GOC tickets since Jan 10, 2010. Overall ticket traffic is extremely low
- Considerable time and effort spent to reach the stable operations
- Successful collaboration with the European groups
- Heavyweight and has more dependencies.

OSG Info Services

- Was not able to successfully run some of the test cases.
- Performance is a major concern
- Need to go through several level of iterations to achieve stable operations
- New tool for site admins to learn
- Lightweight and fewer dependencies
- Smaller sites don't have to install Apache and Tomcat