



William Stallings

Operating Systems

Internals and Design Principles

Ninth Edition
2017

*Readers/Writers Problem,
Ver. 2*

rdr_wrt_msg_v1.pml (1/7)

\$ cat -n rdr_wrt_msg_v1.pml | expand

```

1  #define NRDRS    5
2  #define NWRTS    2
3  #define MAXRDRQ  20
4  #define MAXWRRQ  20
5
6  chan readrequest = [MAXRDRQ] of { byte, chan }
7  chan writerequest = [MAXWRRQ] of { byte, chan }
8  chan finished    = [MAXRDRQ+MAXWRRQ] of { byte }
9  chan mbox[NRDRS+NWRTS+1] = [MAXRDRQ+MAXWRRQ] of { bool }
10
11 byte count = 100
12 mtype = { reader, writer }
13 byte nr = 0, nw = 0
14
...
```

Simplificamos el modelo
creando un solo código para los
procesos de *Readers* y *Writers*.

rdr_wrt_msg_v1.pml (2/7)

```

...
15 proctype ReaderWriter(byte i; mtype who) {
16     chan ch
17     if
18     :: who == reader -> ch = readrequest
19     :: else -> ch = writerequest
20     fi
21
22     ch ! i, mbox[i]
23     atomic {
24         mbox[i] ? _
25         printf("%e %d\n", who, i)
26     }
...
```

rdr_wrt_msg_v1.pml (3/7)

```

...
27     if
28     :: who == reader -> nr++
29     :: else -> nw++
30     fi
31     assert(nw < 2)
32     assert((nw > 0 && nr == 0) || (nw == 0 && nr > 0))
33     atomic {
34         if
35         :: who == reader -> nr--
36         :: else -> nw--
37         fi
38         finished ! i
39     }
40 }
41
...
```

<div>rdr_wrt_msg_v1.pml (4/7)</div> <pre> ... 42 proctype Controller() { 43 byte p 44 45 end: 46 do 47 :: count > 0 -> 48 if 49 :: nempty(finished) -> 50 atomic { 51 finished ? p 52 printf("finished %d\n",p) 53 } 54 count++ 55 :: empty(finished) && nempty(writerequest) -> 56 atomic { 57 writerequest ? p 58 printf("request from Writer %d\n",p) 59 } 60 count = count - 100 61 ... </pre>	<div>rdr_wrt_msg_v1.pml (5/7)</div> <pre> ... 61 :: empty(finished) && empty(writerequest) && nempty(readrequest) -> 62 atomic { 63 readrequest ? p 64 printf("request from Reader %d\n",p) 65 } 66 count-- 67 atomic { 68 mbox[p] ! true 69 printf("OK to Reader %d\n",p) 70 } 71 fi 72 :: count == 0 -> 73 atomic { 74 mbox[p] ! true 75 printf("OK to Writer %d\n",p) 76 } 77 atomic { 78 finished ? p 79 printf("finished Writer %d\n",p) 80 } 81 count = 100 </pre>
<div>INF646 Métodos FormalesVK, 2017 - Readers/Writers, v25</div>	<div>INF646 Métodos FormalesVK, 2017 - Readers/Writers, v26</div>
<div>rdr_wrt_msg_v1.pml (6/7)</div> <pre> ... 82 :: count < 0 -> 83 atomic { 84 finished ? p 85 printf("finished Writer %d\n",p) 86 } 87 count++ 88 od 89 } 90 ... </pre>	<div>rdr_wrt_msg_v1.pml (7/7)</div> <pre> ... 91 init { 92 byte i 93 94 atomic { 95 for (i : 1 .. NRDRS+NWRTS) { /* R1,R2,W3,R4,W5,R6,R7 */ 96 if 97 :: i == 3 i == 5 -> 98 run ReaderWriter(i,writer) 99 :: else -> 100 run ReaderWriter(i,reader) 101 fi 102 } 103 run Controller() 104 } 105 } </pre>
<div>INF646 Métodos FormalesVK, 2017 - Readers/Writers, v27</div>	<div>INF646 Métodos FormalesVK, 2017 - Readers/Writers, v28</div>

Simulation: seed 0 (1/2) <pre>\$ spin -n0 -B rdr_wrt_msg_v1.pml expand request from Writer 5 OK to Writer 5 writer 5 finished Writer 5 request from Writer 3 OK to Writer 3 writer 3 finished Writer 3 request from Reader 7 OK to Reader 7 reader 7 request from Reader 6 OK to Reader 6 reader 6 finished 7 finished 6 request from Reader 4 OK to Reader 4 reader 4 ...</pre>	Simulation: seed 0 (2/2) <pre>... request from Reader 2 OK to Reader 2 reader 2 finished 4 finished 2 request from Reader 1 OK to Reader 1 reader 1 finished 1 timeout seed 0: W5, W3, (R7+R6), (R4+R2), R1.</pre>
--	---

INF646 Métodos Formales	VK, 2017 - Readers/Writers, v2	9	INF646 Métodos Formales	VK, 2017 - Readers/Writers, v2	10
-------------------------	--------------------------------	---	-------------------------	--------------------------------	----

Verification: 1 error <pre>\$ spin -run rdr_wrt_msg_v1.pml expand pan:1: missing pars in receive (at depth 43) pan: wrote rdr_wrt_msg_v1.pml.trail (Spin Version 6.4.6 -- 2 December 2016) Warning: Search not completed + Partial Order Reduction Full statespace search for: never claim - (none specified) assertion violations + cycle checks - (disabled by -DSAFETY) invalid end states + State-vector 620 byte, depth reached 43, errors: 1 ...</pre>	Error trail <pre>\$ spin -t -s -r -B rdr_wrt_msg_v1.pml expand using statement merging 42: proc 7 (ReaderWriter:1) rdr_wrt_msg_v1.pml:22 Send 7,9 -> queue 1 (ch) 44: proc 8 (Controller:1) rdr_wrt_msg_v1.pml:63 Recv 7,0 <- queue 1 (readrequest) request from Reader 7 spin: trail ends after 44 steps</pre> <div>Just "warning"?</div> <div>Realmente no necesitamos este parámetro.</div>
---	--

INF646 Métodos Formales	VK, 2017 - Readers/Writers, v2	11	INF646 Métodos Formales	VK, 2017 - Readers/Writers, v2	12
-------------------------	--------------------------------	----	-------------------------	--------------------------------	----

rdr_wrt_msg_v2.pml (1/7)

```
$ cat -n rdr_wrt_msg_v2.pml | expand
```

Versión 2 del modelo
(código unificado para
Readers/Writers)

```

1  #define NRDRS    5
2  #define NWRTS    2
3  #define MAXRDRQ  20
4  #define MAXWRRQ  20
5
6  chan readrequest = [MAXRDRQ] of { byte }
7  chan writerequest = [MAXWRRQ] of { byte }
8  chan finished    = [MAXRDRQ+MAXWRRQ] of { byte }
9  chan mbox[NRDRS+NWRTS+1] = [MAXRDRQ+MAXWRRQ] of { bool }
10
11 byte count = 100
12 mtype = { reader, writer }
13 byte nr = 0, nw = 0
14
...
```

rdr_wrt_msg_v2.pml (2/7)

```

...
15 proctype ReaderWriter(byte i; mtype who) {
16     chan ch
17     if
18     :: who == reader -> ch = readrequest
19     :: else -> ch = writerequest
20     fi
21
22     ch ! i
23     atomic {
24         mbox[i] ? _
25         printf("%e %d\n",who,i)
26     }
...

```

rdr_wrt_msg_v2.pml (3/7)

```

...
27     if
28     :: who == reader -> nr++
29     :: else -> nw++
30     fi
31     assert(nw < 2)
32     assert((nw > 0 && nr == 0) || (nw == 0 && nr > 0))
33     atomic {
34         if
35         :: who == reader -> nr--
36         :: else -> nw--
37         fi
38         finished ! i
39     }
40 }
41
...
```

rdr_wrt_msg_v2.pml (4/7)

```

...
42 proctype Controller() {
43     byte p
44
45     end:
46     do
47     :: count > 0 ->
48         if
49         :: nempty(finished) ->
50             atomic {
51                 finished ? p
52                 printf("finished %d\n",p)
53             }
54             count++
55         :: empty(finished) && nempty(writerequest) ->
56             atomic {
57                 writerequest ? p
58                 printf("request from Writer %d\n",p)
59             }
60             count = count - 100
...

```

<div>rdr_wrt_msg_v2.pml (5/7)</div> <pre> ... 61 :: empty(finished) && empty(writerequest) && nempty(readrequest) -> 62 atomic { 63 readrequest ? p 64 printf("request from Reader %d\n",p) 65 } 66 count-- 67 atomic { 68 mbox[p] ! true 69 printf("OK to Reader %d\n",p) 70 } 71 fi 72 :: count == 0 -> 73 atomic { 74 mbox[p] ! true 75 printf("OK to Writer %d\n",p) 76 } 77 atomic { 78 finished ? p 79 printf("finished Writer %d\n",p) 80 } 81 count = 100 </pre>	<div>rdr_wrt_msg_v2.pml (6/7)</div> <pre> ... 82 :: count < 0 -> 83 atomic { 84 finished ? p 85 printf("finished Writer %d\n",p) 86 } 87 count++ 88 od 89 } 90 ... </pre>
<div>INF646 Métodos FormalesVK, 2017 - Readers/Writers, v217</div>	<div>INF646 Métodos FormalesVK, 2017 - Readers/Writers, v218</div>
<div>rdr_wrt_msg_v2.pml (7/7)</div> <pre> ... 91 init { 92 byte i 93 94 atomic { 95 for (i : 1 .. NRDRS+NWRTS) { /* R1,R2,W3,R4,W5,R6,R7 */ 96 if 97 :: i == 3 i == 5 -> 98 run ReaderWriter(i,writer) 99 :: else -> 100 run ReaderWriter(i,reader) 101 fi 102 } 103 run Controller() 104 } 105 } </pre>	<div>Verification: 1 error</div> <pre> \$ spin -run rdr_wrt_msg_v2.pml expand pan:1: invalid end state (at depth 165) pan: wrote rdr_wrt_msg_v2.pml.trail (Spin Version 6.4.6 -- 2 December 2016) Warning: Search not completed + Partial Order Reduction Full statespace search for: never claim - (none specified) assertion violations + cycle checks - (disabled by -DSAFETY) invalid end states + State-vector 572 byte, depth reached 166, errors: 1 ... </pre>
<div>INF646 Métodos FormalesVK, 2017 - Readers/Writers, v219</div>	<div>INF646 Métodos FormalesVK, 2017 - Readers/Writers, v220</div>

Invalid End State Error trail (1/3)

```

$ spin -t rdr_wrt_msg_v2.pml | expand
      request from Reader 7
      OK to Reader 7
    reader 7
      finished 7
      request from Reader 6
      OK to Reader 6
    reader 6
      finished 6
      request from Writer 5
      OK to Writer 5
  writer 5
    finished Writer 5
    request from Reader 4
    OK to Reader 4
  reader 4
    finished 4
    request from Writer 3
    OK to Writer 3
  Writer 3
...

```

Invalid End State Error trail (2/3)

```

...
      finished Writer 3
      request from Reader 2
      OK to Reader 2
    reader 2
      finished 2
      request from Reader 1
      OK to Reader 1
    reader 1
      finished 1
spin: trail ends after 166 steps
#processes: 9
  queue 1 (readrequest):
  queue 3 (writerequest):
  queue 2 (finished):
  queue 4 (mbox[0]):
  queue 5 (mbox[1]):
  queue 6 (mbox[2]):
  queue 7 (mbox[3]):
  queue 8 (mbox[4]):
  queue 9 (mbox[5]):
...

```

Colas vacías

Invalid End State Error trail (3/3)

```

...
  queue 10 (mbox[6]):
  queue 11 (mbox[7]):
  count = 100
  nr = 0
  nw = 0
166: proc 8 (Controller:1) rdr_wrt_msg_v2.pml:48 (state 20)
166: proc 7 (ReaderWriter:1) rdr_wrt_msg_v2.pml:40 (state 27) <valid end state>
166: proc 6 (ReaderWriter:1) rdr_wrt_msg_v2.pml:40 (state 27) <valid end state>
166: proc 5 (ReaderWriter:1) rdr_wrt_msg_v2.pml:40 (state 27) <valid end state>
166: proc 4 (ReaderWriter:1) rdr_wrt_msg_v2.pml:40 (state 27) <valid end state>
166: proc 3 (ReaderWriter:1) rdr_wrt_msg_v2.pml:40 (state 27) <valid end state>
166: proc 2 (ReaderWriter:1) rdr_wrt_msg_v2.pml:40 (state 27) <valid end state>
166: proc 1 (ReaderWriter:1) rdr_wrt_msg_v2.pml:40 (state 27) <valid end state>
166: proc 0 (:init::1) rdr_wrt_msg_v2.pml:105 (state 17) <valid end state>
9 processes created

```

Invalid end state

End label is misplaced:
45 → 48

rdr_wrt_msg_v3.pml (4/7 only)

```

...
42 proctype Controller() {
43   byte p
44
45   do
46     :: count > 0 ->
47   end: if
48     :: nempty(finished) ->
49       atomic {
50         finished ? p
51         printf("finished %d\n",p)
52       }
53       count++
54     :: empty(finished) && nempty(writerequest) ->
55       atomic {
56         writerequest ? p
57         printf("request from Writer %d\n",p)
58       }
59       count = count - 100
...

```

Versión 3 del modelo
(end label correct place)

Verification: 1 error

```
$ spin -run rdr_wrt_msg_v3.pml | expand
pan:1: invalid end state (at depth 138)
pan: wrote rdr_wrt_msg_v3.pml.trail

(Spin Version 6.4.6 -- 2 December 2016)
Warning: Search not completed
+ Partial Order Reduction

Full statespace search for:
  never claim           - (none specified)
  assertion violations   +
  cycle checks           - (disabled by -DSAFETY)
  invalid end states     +

State-vector 572 byte, depth reached 166, errors: 1
...
```

Invalid End State Error trail (1/3)

```
$ spin -t rdr_wrt_msg_v3.pml | expand
      request from Reader 7
      OK to Reader 7
    reader 7
      finished 7
      request from Reader 6
      OK to Reader 6
    reader 6
      finished 6
      request from Writer 5
      OK to Writer 5
      writer 5
        finished Writer 5
        request from Reader 4
        OK to Reader 4
      reader 4
        finished 4
        request from Reader 2
        OK to Reader 2
        request from Writer 3
    ...
```

Invalid End State Error trail (2/3)

```
...
spin: rdr_wrt_msg_v3.pml:59, Error: value (-1->255 (8)) truncated in assignment
      reader 2
        finished 2
spin: rdr_wrt_msg_v3.pml:53, Error: value (256->0 (8)) truncated in assignment
      OK to Writer 2
spin: trail ends after 139 steps
#processes: 9
  queue 1 (readrequest): [1]
  queue 3 (writerequest):
  queue 2 (finished):
  queue 4 (mbox[0]):
  queue 5 (mbox[1]):
  queue 6 (mbox[2]): [1]
  queue 7 (mbox[3]):
  queue 8 (mbox[4]):
  queue 9 (mbox[5]):
  queue 10 (mbox[6]):
  queue 11 (mbox[7]):
  count = 0
  nr = 0
  nw = 0
...
```

Esto es lo más preocupante

También colas no procesadas

Invalid End State Error trail (3/3)

```
...
139:   proc 8 (Controller:1) rdr_wrt_msg_v3.pml:76 (state 28)
139:   proc 7 (ReaderWriter:1) rdr_wrt_msg_v3.pml:40 (state 27) <valid end state>
139:   proc 6 (ReaderWriter:1) rdr_wrt_msg_v3.pml:40 (state 27) <valid end state>
139:   proc 5 (ReaderWriter:1) rdr_wrt_msg_v3.pml:40 (state 27) <valid end state>
139:   proc 4 (ReaderWriter:1) rdr_wrt_msg_v3.pml:40 (state 27) <valid end state>
139:   proc 3 (ReaderWriter:1) rdr_wrt_msg_v3.pml:23 (state 10)
139:   proc 2 (ReaderWriter:1) rdr_wrt_msg_v3.pml:40 (state 27) <valid end state>
139:   proc 1 (ReaderWriter:1) rdr_wrt_msg_v3.pml:23 (state 10)
139:   proc 0 (:init::1) rdr_wrt_msg_v3.pml:104 (state 17) <valid end state>
9 processes created
```

Invalid end state

Invalid end state

Invalid end state

Observaciones

Se suponía que el algoritmo garantiza el procesamiento prioritario de las solicitudes de los *Writers*. Para este propósito sirve la variable **count**. Pero parece que su manejo no es correcto.

No nos queda otra cosa que encontrar el error y desarrollar la siguiente versión del modelo: **rdr_wrt_msg_v4.pml**.