

# CALCULATION OF THE WCS INVARIANT ON THE THURSTON EXAMPLE

SATOSHI EGI, YOSHIAKI MAEDA, AND STEVEN ROSENBERG

## 1. THE CALCULATION OF THE WCS INVARIANT

We calculate the WCS invariant for the Thurston example in §4. Specifically, we prove

**Theorem 4.1.** We have

$$\int_{\overline{M}_p} \widetilde{CS}_5^W(e_1, \dots, e_5) = [2\pi p^{-1/2} \kappa] \frac{5\kappa}{128} p^2 \int_0^1 (3072p^4 - 640p^2\beta^{-2} - 25\beta^{-4}) d\theta_2. \quad (1.1)$$

**Notation:** We denote the metric  $\tilde{g}$  on the Thurston example  $M$  just by  $g$ . We abbreviate  $\theta_2 = \theta$ , and recall that

$$\beta = 1 + \theta - \theta^2.$$

The Christoffel symbols are

$$\Gamma_{bc}^a = \frac{1}{2} g^{ae} (\partial_b g_{ce} + \partial_c g_{be} - \partial_e g_{bc}).$$

The curvature tensor components are

$$R_{abc}{}^d = \partial_a \Gamma_{bc}^d - \partial_b \Gamma_{ac}^d + \Gamma_{ae}^d \Gamma_{bc}^e - \Gamma_{be}^d \Gamma_{ac}^e.$$

Recall that  $g = \tilde{g}$  has a compatible almost complex structure  $J$ .

The matrix of  $g$  is given in (4.7), so

$$g^{-1} = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & \kappa^{-1}\beta^{-1/2}(1+\theta) & \kappa^{-1}\beta^{-1/2}\theta \\ 0 & 0 & \kappa^{-1}\beta^{-1/2}\theta & \kappa^{-1}\beta^{-1/2} \end{pmatrix}.$$

The long calculations below have been checked by machine calculation using **Satoshi's program** at <https://github.com/Egi/.....>

**1.1. The curvature tensor on  $\overline{M}_p$ .** Let  $\overline{R}$  be the metric on  $\overline{M}_p$ .

**Lemma 1.1.** *In the notation of (4.8), we have*

$$\begin{aligned}\overline{R}_{abc}{}^d &= R_{abc}{}^d - p^2 J_{bc} J_a{}^d + p^2 J_{ac} J_b{}^d + 2p^2 J_{ab} J_c{}^d, \\ \overline{R}_{abc}{}^0 &= -p \nabla_a J_{bc} + p \nabla_b J_{ac} = p \nabla_c J_{ab}, \\ \overline{R}_{ab0}{}^d &= p \nabla_a J_b{}^d - p \nabla_b J_a{}^d, \\ \overline{R}_{a0b}{}^d &= p \nabla_a J_b{}^d, \\ \overline{R}_{a0b}{}^0 &= -p^2 g_{ab}.\end{aligned}$$

*Proof.* These are the local frame expressions of Lemma 3.3. □

Here we have used the identity

$$\nabla_a J_{bc} + \nabla_b J_{ca} + \nabla_c J_{ab} = 0,$$

which follows from  $d\omega = 0$  and  $g(JX, Y) = \omega(X, Y)$ . For example, with this identity and curvature tensor symmetries, the second, third and fourth formulas in Lemma A.1 are equivalent.

**1.2. The Christoffel symbols on  $M$ .**

**Lemma 1.2.** *The following is the list of the Christoffel tensors*

$$\begin{aligned}\Gamma_{33}^2 &= \frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 - 2\theta), \quad \Gamma_{34}^2 = \frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} (1 + \frac{\theta}{2}), \quad \Gamma_{44}^2 = -\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 + 3\theta), \\ \Gamma_{23}^3 &= -\frac{1}{4} \beta^{-1}, \quad \Gamma_{24}^3 = -\frac{1}{2} \beta^{-1}, \quad \Gamma_{23}^4 = -\frac{1}{2} \beta^{-1}, \quad \Gamma_{24}^4 = \frac{1}{4} \beta^{-1}.\end{aligned}$$

*All other Christoffel symbols are zero.*

*Proof.* We have

$$\Gamma_{ab}^1 = \frac{1}{2} g^{1e} (\partial_a g_{be} + \partial_b g_{ae} - \partial_e g_{ab}) = \frac{1}{2} g^{11} (\partial_a g_{b1} + \partial_b g_{a1} - \partial_1 g_{ab}) = 0,$$

because  $g_{\ell 1}$  is constant and  $\partial_1 g_{ab} = 0$ .

Since  $\Gamma_{ab}^2 = \frac{1}{2} g^{2e} (\partial_a g_{be} + \partial_b g_{ae} - \partial_e g_{ab}) = \frac{1}{2} (\partial_a g_{b2} + \partial_b g_{a2} - \partial_2 g_{ab})$  and  $g_{22} = 1$ , we get

$$\Gamma_{11}^2 = \Gamma_{12}^2 = \Gamma_{12}^2 = 0$$

Note that  $g_{b2} = 0$ ,  $g_{b1} = 0$  and  $g_{b2} = 0$  if  $b = 3, 4$ .

Therefore,

$$\Gamma_{1b}^2 = \Gamma_{2b}^2 = 0$$

for  $b = 3, 4$ . We also get

$$\Gamma_{33}^2 = \frac{1}{2} (\partial_3 g_{32} + \partial_3 g_{32} - \partial_2 g_{33}) = -\frac{1}{2} \partial_2 (\kappa \beta^{-1/2}) = \frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 - 2\theta),$$

$$\begin{aligned}
\Gamma_{34}^2 &= \frac{1}{2}(\partial_3 g_{42} + \partial_4 g_{32} - \partial_2 g_{34}) = -\frac{1}{2}\partial_2(-\theta\kappa\beta^{-1/2}) \\
&= \frac{\kappa}{2}\beta^{-3/2}(1 + \frac{1}{2}\theta), \\
\Gamma_{44}^2 &= \frac{1}{2}(\partial_4 g_{42} + \partial_4 g_{42} - \partial_2 g_{44}) = -\frac{1}{2}\partial_2 g_{44} = -\frac{1}{2}\partial_2((1 + \theta)\kappa\beta^{-1/2}) \\
&= -\frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-3/2}(1 + 3\theta).
\end{aligned}$$

Since  $\Gamma_{ab}^3 = \frac{1}{2}g^{3e}(\partial_a g_{be} + \partial_b g_{ae} - \partial_e g_{ab})$ , we have

$$\Gamma_{11}^3 = \Gamma_{12}^3 = \Gamma_{22}^3 = \Gamma_{13}^3 = \Gamma_{14}^3 = 0$$

$$\begin{aligned}
\Gamma_{23}^3 &= \frac{1}{2}g^{3e}(\partial_2 g_{3e} + \partial_3 g_{2e} - \partial_e g_{23}) = \frac{1}{2}g^{3e}(\partial_2 g_{3e}) = \frac{1}{2}(g^{33}\partial_2 g_{33} + g^{34}\partial_2 g_{34}) \\
&= -\frac{1}{4}\beta^{-1},
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
\Gamma_{24}^3 &= \frac{1}{2}g^{3e}(\partial_2 g_{4e} + \partial_4 g_{2e} - \partial_e g_{24}) = \frac{1}{2}g^{3e}\partial_2 g_{4e} = \frac{1}{2}(g^{33}\partial_2 g_{43} + g^{34}\partial_2 g_{44}) \\
&= -\frac{1}{2}\beta^{-1}.
\end{aligned}$$

Also, since  $e = 3, 4$ ,

$$\Gamma_{33}^3 = \Gamma_{34}^3 = \Gamma_{44}^3 = 0$$

Furthermore, we have  $\Gamma_{ab}^4 = \frac{1}{2}g^{4e}(\partial_a g_{be} + \partial_b g_{ae} - \partial_e g_{ab}) = \frac{1}{2}g^{4e}(\partial_a g_{be} + \partial_b g_{ae})$ , since  $e = 3, 4$ . For these values of  $e$ ,  $g_{1e} = 0$ ,  $g_{24} = 0$ ,  $g_{2e} = 0$ , so

$$\Gamma_{11}^4 = \Gamma_{12}^4 = \Gamma_{22}^4 = \Gamma_{13}^4 = \Gamma_{14}^4 = 0.$$

Also,

$$\begin{aligned}
\Gamma_{23}^4 &= \frac{1}{2}g^{4e}(\partial_2 g_{3e} + \partial_3 g_{2e}) = \frac{1}{2}(g^{43}\partial_2 g_{33} + g^{44}\partial_2 g_{34}) \\
&= \frac{1}{2}(\theta\kappa^{-1}\beta^{-1/2}\partial_2(\kappa\beta^{-1/2}) + \kappa^{-1}\beta^{-1/2}\partial_2(-\theta\kappa\beta^{-1/2})) \\
&= -\frac{1}{2}\beta^{-1}, \\
\Gamma_{24}^4 &= \frac{1}{2}g^{4e}(\partial_2 g_{4e} + \partial_4 g_{2e}) = \frac{1}{2}(g^{43}\partial_2 g_{43} + g^{44}\partial_2 g_{44}) \\
&= \frac{1}{2}(\theta\kappa^{-1}\beta^{-1/2}\partial_2(-\theta\kappa\beta^{-1/2}) + \kappa^{-1}\beta^{-1/2}\partial_2((1 + \theta)\kappa\beta^{-1/2})) \\
&= \frac{1}{4}\beta^{-1}.
\end{aligned}$$

Finally, we have

$$\Gamma_{33}^4 = \Gamma_{34}^4 = \Gamma_{44}^4 = 0.$$

This proves the Lemma.  $\square$

**1.3. The curvature tensor on  $M$ .** We compute the curvature components  $R_{abc}{}^d = \partial_a \Gamma_{bc}^d - \partial_b \Gamma_{ac}^d + \Gamma_{ae}^d \Gamma_{bc}^e - \Gamma_{be}^d \Gamma_{ac}^e$ .

**Lemma 1.3.**

- (i)  $R_{abc}{}^d = 0$  if any of  $a, b, c, d = 1$ .  
(ii)

$$\begin{aligned} R_{233}{}^2 &= -\frac{\kappa}{16} \beta^{-5/2} (9 - 16\theta + 16\theta^2), \quad R_{232}{}^3 = \frac{1}{16} \beta^{-2} (9 - 8\theta), \\ R_{232}{}^4 &= \frac{1}{2} \beta^{-2} (1 - 2\theta), \\ R_{3232} &= -R_{233}{}^a g_{a2} = -R_{233}{}^2 = \frac{\kappa}{16} \beta^{-5/2} (9 - 16\theta + 16\theta^2). \end{aligned}$$

- (iii)

$$\begin{aligned} R_{2424} &= R_{4242} = R_{424}{}^a g_{a2} = R_{424}{}^2 = -R_{244}{}^2 = \frac{\kappa}{16} (1 + \theta + 24\theta^2) \beta^{-5/2}, \\ R_{242}{}^4 &= \frac{1}{16} \beta^{-2} (1 + 8\theta), \quad R_{242}{}^3 = \frac{1}{2} \beta^{-2} (1 - 2\theta). \end{aligned}$$

- (iv)

$$\begin{aligned} R_{234}{}^2 &= \frac{\kappa}{16} \beta^{-5/2} (-8 + 17\theta + 8\theta^2), \\ R_{2342} &= R_{234}{}^a g_{a2} = R_{234}{}^2 = \frac{\kappa}{16} \beta^{-5/2} (-8 + 17\theta + 8\theta^2), \\ R_{3242} &= -R_{2342} = -\frac{\kappa}{16} \beta^{-5/2} (-8 + 17\theta + 8\theta^2). \end{aligned}$$

- (v)

$$\begin{aligned} R_{343}{}^3 &= -\frac{5}{16} \kappa \theta \beta^{-5/2}, \quad R_{343}{}^4 = -\frac{5}{16} \kappa \beta^{-5/2}, \quad R_{344}{}^3 = \frac{5}{16} \kappa (1 + \theta) \beta^{-5/2}, \\ R_{344}{}^4 &= \frac{5}{16} \kappa \theta \beta^{-5/2}, \quad R_{3434} = -R_{3443} = -\frac{5}{16} \kappa^2 \beta^{-2}. \end{aligned}$$

*Proof.* (i)  $R_{1bc}{}^d = \partial_1 \Gamma_{bc}^d - \partial_b \Gamma_{1c}^d + \Gamma_{1e}^d \Gamma_{bc}^e - \Gamma_{be}^d \Gamma_{1c}^e = 0$ , because  $\Gamma_{1b}^d = 0$ . Similarly,

$$R_{a1c}{}^d = -R_{1ac}{}^d = 0, \quad R_{ab1}{}^d = R_{b1a}{}^d + R_{1ab}{}^d = 0.$$

Using  $\Gamma_{bc}^1 = 0$ , we get  $R_{abc}{}^1 = \partial_a \Gamma_{bc}^1 - \partial_b \Gamma_{ac}^1 + \Gamma_{ae}^1 \Gamma_{bc}^e - \Gamma_{be}^1 \Gamma_{ac}^e = 0$ .

(ii)

$$\begin{aligned}
R_{233}^2 &= \partial_2 \Gamma_{33}^2 - \partial_3 \Gamma_{23}^2 + \Gamma_{2e}^2 \Gamma_{33}^e - \Gamma_{3e}^2 \Gamma_{23}^e = \partial_2 \Gamma_{33}^2 - \Gamma_{33}^2 \Gamma_{23}^3 - \Gamma_{34}^2 \Gamma_{23}^4 \\
&= \partial_2 \left( \frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 - 2\theta) \right) - \left( \frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 - 2\theta) \right) \left( -\frac{1}{4} \beta^{-1} \right) \\
&\quad - \left( \frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} \left( 1 + \frac{\theta}{2} \right) \right) \left( -\frac{1}{2} \beta^{-1} \right) \\
&= -\frac{\kappa}{16} \beta^{-5/2} (9 - 16\theta + 16\theta^2),
\end{aligned}$$

and

$$\begin{aligned}
R_{232}^3 &= \partial_2 \Gamma_{32}^3 - \partial_3 \Gamma_{22}^3 + \Gamma_{2e}^3 \Gamma_{32}^e - \Gamma_{3e}^3 \Gamma_{22}^e \\
&= \partial_2 \Gamma_{32}^3 + \Gamma_{23}^3 \Gamma_{32}^3 + \Gamma_{24}^3 \Gamma_{32}^4 \\
&= \partial_2 \left( -\frac{1}{4} \beta^{-1} \right) + \left( -\frac{1}{4} \beta^{-1} \right)^2 + \left( -\frac{1}{2} \beta^{-1} \right)^2 \\
&= \frac{1}{16} \beta^{-2} (9 - 8\theta), \\
R_{232}^4 &= \partial_2 \Gamma_4^{32} - \partial_3 \Gamma_4^{22} + \Gamma_4^{2e} \Gamma_e^{32} \\
&= \frac{1}{2} \beta^{-2} (1 - 2\theta).
\end{aligned}$$

(iii)

$$\begin{aligned}
R_{2424} &= R_{242}^a g_{a4} = R_{242}^3 g_{34} + R_{242}^4 g_{44} \\
&= \frac{8}{16} \beta^{-2} (1 - 2\theta) (-\kappa \theta \beta^{-1/2}) + \frac{1}{16} \beta^{-2} (1 + 8\theta) (\kappa (1 + \theta) \beta^{-1/2}) \\
&= \frac{\kappa}{16} \beta^{-5/2} (1 + \theta + 24\theta^2), \\
R_{242}^4 &= \partial_2 \Gamma_{42}^4 - \partial_4 \Gamma_{22}^4 + \Gamma_{2e}^4 \Gamma_{42}^e - \Gamma_{4e}^4 \Gamma_{22}^e \\
&= \partial_2 \Gamma_{42}^4 + \Gamma_{23}^4 \Gamma_{24}^4 + \Gamma_{24}^4 \Gamma_{42}^4 \\
&= \partial_2 \left( \frac{1}{4} \beta^{-1} \right) + \left( -\frac{1}{2} \beta^{-1} \right) \left( -\frac{1}{2} \beta^{-1} \right) + \left( \frac{1}{4} \beta^{-1} \right) \left( \frac{1}{4} \beta^{-1} \right) \\
&= \frac{1}{16} \beta^{-2} (1 + 8\theta), \\
R_{242}^3 &= \partial_2 \Gamma_{42}^3 - \partial_4 \Gamma_{22}^3 + \Gamma_{2e}^3 \Gamma_{42}^e - \Gamma_{4e}^3 \Gamma_{22}^e \\
&= \partial_2 \Gamma_{42}^3 + \Gamma_{23}^3 \Gamma_{42}^3 + \Gamma_{24}^3 \Gamma_{42}^4 \\
&= -\frac{1}{2} \partial_2 \beta^{-1} + \left( -\frac{1}{4} \beta^{-1} \right) \left( -\frac{1}{2} \beta^{-1} \right) + \left( -\frac{1}{2} \beta^{-1} \right) \left( \frac{1}{4} \beta^{-1} \right) \\
&= \frac{1}{2} \beta^{-2} (1 - 2\theta).
\end{aligned}$$

(iv)

$$\begin{aligned}
R_{234}^2 &= \partial_2 \Gamma_{34}^2 - \partial_3 \Gamma_{24}^2 + \Gamma_{2e}^2 \Gamma_{34}^e - \Gamma_{3e}^2 \Gamma_{24}^e = \partial_2 \Gamma_{34}^2 - \Gamma_{33}^2 \Gamma_{24}^3 - \Gamma_{34}^2 \Gamma_{24}^4 \\
&= \frac{\kappa}{2} \partial_2 (\beta^{-3/2} (1 + \frac{\theta}{2})) - (\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 - 2\theta)) (-\frac{1}{2} \beta^{-1}) \\
&\quad - (\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} (1 + \frac{\theta}{2})) (\frac{1}{4} \beta^{-1}) \\
&= \frac{\kappa}{16} \beta^{-5/2} (-8 + 17\theta + 8\theta^2).
\end{aligned}$$

The other formulas follow immediately.

(v)  $R_{34a}^b = \partial_3 \Gamma_{4a}^b - \partial_4 \Gamma_{3a}^b + \Gamma_{3e}^b \Gamma_{4a}^e - \Gamma_{4a}^b \Gamma_{3a}^e = \Gamma_{3e}^b \Gamma_{4a}^e - \Gamma_{4e}^b \Gamma_{3a}^e$ , so

$$\begin{aligned}
R_{344}^2 &= \Gamma_{32}^2 \Gamma_{44}^2 - \Gamma_{43}^2 \Gamma_{34}^3 - \Gamma_{44}^2 \Gamma_{34}^4 = 0, \\
R_{343}^4 &= \Gamma_{32}^4 \Gamma_{43}^2 - \Gamma_{42}^4 \Gamma_{33}^2 = (-\frac{1}{2} \beta^{-1}) (\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} (1 + \frac{\theta}{2})) - (\frac{1}{4} \beta^{-1}) (\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 - 2\theta)) \\
&= -\frac{\kappa}{16} \beta^{-5/2} (4(1 + \frac{\theta}{2}) + (1 - 2\theta)) = -\frac{5}{16} \kappa \beta^{-5/2}, \\
R_{344}^3 &= \Gamma_{32}^3 \Gamma_{44}^2 - \Gamma_{42}^3 \Gamma_{34}^2 = (-\frac{1}{4} \beta^{-1}) (-\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 + 3\theta)) - (-\frac{1}{2} \beta^{-1}) (\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} (1 + \frac{\theta}{2})) \\
&= \frac{\kappa}{16} \beta^{-5/2} (1 + 3\theta + 4(1 + \frac{\theta}{2})) = \frac{5}{16} \kappa \beta^{-5/2} (1 + \theta), \\
R_{344}^4 &= \Gamma_{32}^4 \Gamma_{44}^2 - \Gamma_{42}^4 \Gamma_{34}^2 = (-\frac{1}{2} \beta^{-1}) (-\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 + 3\theta)) - (\frac{1}{4} \beta^{-1}) (\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} (1 + \frac{\theta}{2})) \\
&= \frac{\kappa}{8} \beta^{-5/2} (1 + 3\theta - (1 + \frac{\theta}{2})) = \frac{5}{16} \kappa \theta \beta^{-5/2}, \\
R_{343}^3 &= \Gamma_{32}^3 \Gamma_{43}^2 - \Gamma_{42}^3 \Gamma_{33}^2 = (-\frac{1}{4} \beta^{-1}) (\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} (1 + \frac{\theta}{2})) - (-\frac{1}{2} \beta^{-1}) (\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 - 2\theta)) \\
&= \frac{\kappa}{8} \beta^{-5/2} (-(1 + \frac{\theta}{2} + (1 - 2\theta))) = -\frac{5}{16} \kappa \theta \beta^{-5/2}, \\
R_{3434} &= R_{343}^b g_{b4} = R_{343}^3 g_{34} + R_{343}^4 g_{44} \\
&= (-\frac{5}{16} \theta \kappa \beta^{-5/2}) (-\theta \kappa \beta^{-1/2}) + (-\frac{5}{16} \kappa \beta^{-5/2}) (1 + \theta) \kappa \beta^{-1/2} \\
&= -\frac{5}{16} \kappa^2 \beta^{-3} (1 + \theta - \theta^2) = -\frac{5}{16} \kappa^2 \beta^{-2}.
\end{aligned}$$

□

1.4. **The covariant derivatives of the almost complex structure on  $M$ .** We note for later use that

$$(\omega_{ab}) = (J_a^c g_{cb}) = (J_{ab}) = \begin{pmatrix} 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ -1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & \kappa \\ 0 & 0 & -\kappa & 0 \end{pmatrix}. \quad (1.2)$$

We now compute the covariant derivatives of  $J$ .

**Lemma 1.4.** (i)

$$\nabla_1 J_{ab} = \nabla_2 J_{ab} = 0.$$

(ii)

$$\begin{aligned} \nabla_3 J_{13} &= -\frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-3/2}(1-2\theta), \quad \nabla_3 J_{14} = -\frac{\kappa}{2}\beta^{-3/2}(1+\frac{\theta}{2}), \\ \nabla_3 J_{23} &= -\frac{\kappa}{2}\beta^{-1}, \quad \nabla_3 J_{24} = \frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-1}. \end{aligned}$$

(iii)

$$\begin{aligned} \nabla_4 J_{13} &= -\frac{\kappa}{2}\beta^{-3/2}(1+\frac{\theta}{2}), \quad \nabla_4 J_{14} = \frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-3/2}(1+3\theta) \\ \nabla_4 J_{23} &= \frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-1}, \quad \nabla_4 J_{24} = \frac{\kappa}{2}\beta^{-1}. \end{aligned}$$

All other  $\nabla_i J_{ab}$  vanish.

*Proof.* (i) Using  $\Gamma_{1a}^e = 0$ , we have  $\nabla_1 J_{ab} = \partial_1 J_{ab} - \Gamma_{1a}^e J_{eb} - \Gamma_{1b}^e J_{ae} = 0$ .

We also have

$$\nabla_2 J_{ab} = \partial_2 J_{ab} - \Gamma_{2a}^e J_{eb} - \Gamma_{2b}^e J_{ae} = -\Gamma_{2a}^e J_{eb} - \Gamma_{2b}^e J_{ae}.$$

Thus

$$\begin{aligned} \nabla_2 J_{12} &= -\Gamma_{21}^e J_{e2} - \Gamma_{22}^e J_{1e} = -\Gamma_{22}^e J_{1e} = -\Gamma_{22}^2 J_{12} = 0, \\ \nabla_2 J_{34} &= -\Gamma_{23}^e J_{e4} - \Gamma_{24}^e J_{3e} = -\Gamma_{23}^3 J_{34} - \Gamma_{24}^4 J_{34} \\ &= -(-\frac{1}{4}\beta^{-1})J_{34} - (\frac{1}{4}\beta^{-1})J_{34} = 0, \\ \nabla_2 J_{11} &= -\Gamma_{21}^e J_{e1} - \Gamma_{21}^e J_{1e} = 0, \\ \nabla_2 J_{22} &= -\Gamma_{22}^e J_{e2} - \Gamma_{22}^e J_{2e} = 0, \\ \nabla_2 J_{aa} &= -\Gamma_{2a}^e J_{ea} - \Gamma_{2a}^e J_{ae} = 0, \text{ (Does this include } a = 1, 2 \text{ above?)} \\ \nabla_2 J_{13} &= -\Gamma_{21}^e J_{e3} - \Gamma_{23}^e J_{1e} = -\Gamma_{21}^4 J_{43} - \Gamma_{23}^2 J_{12} = 0, \\ \nabla_2 J_{14} &= -\Gamma_{21}^e J_{e4} - \Gamma_{24}^e J_{1e} = -\Gamma_{24}^2 J_{12} = 0, \\ \nabla_2 J_{23} &= -\Gamma_{23}^e J_{e3} - \Gamma_{23}^e J_{2e} = -\Gamma_{22}^4 J_{43} - \Gamma_{23}^1 J_{21} = 0, \\ \nabla_2 J_{24} &= -\Gamma_{22}^e J_{e4} - \Gamma_{24}^e J_{2e} = -\Gamma_{22}^3 J_{34} - \Gamma_{24}^1 J_{21} = 0. \end{aligned}$$

Therefore,  $\nabla_2 J_{ab} = 0$ .

(ii) In general,

$$\nabla_3 J_{ab} = -\Gamma_{3a}^e J_{eb} - \Gamma_{3b}^e J_{ae}.$$

Thus

$$\nabla_3 J_{1b} = -\Gamma_{31}^e J_{eb} = 0,$$

$$\nabla_3 J_{12} = -\Gamma_{31}^e J_{e2} - \Gamma_{32}^e J_{1e} = -\Gamma_{31}^1 J_{12} - \Gamma_{32}^2 J_{12} = 0,$$

$$\begin{aligned} \nabla_3 J_{13} &= -\Gamma_{31}^e J_{e3} - \Gamma_{33}^e J_{1e} = -\Gamma_{31}^4 J_{43} - \Gamma_{33}^2 J_{12} = -\Gamma_{33}^2 J_{12} = -\Gamma_{33}^2 \\ &= -\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 - 2\theta), \end{aligned}$$

$$\nabla_3 J_{14} = -\Gamma_{34}^2 J_{12} = -\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} \left(1 + \frac{\theta}{2}\right),$$

$$\nabla_3 J_{21} = -\Gamma_{32}^2 J_{21} - \Gamma_{31}^e J_{2e} = 0,$$

$$\nabla_3 J_{23} = -\Gamma_{32}^4 J_{43} - \Gamma_{33}^1 J_{21} = \kappa \Gamma_{32}^4 = -\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1},$$

$$\nabla_3 J_{24} = -\Gamma_{32}^3 J_{24} - \Gamma_{34}^1 J_{21} = -\kappa \Gamma_{32}^3 = -\kappa \left(-\frac{1}{4} \beta^{-1}\right) = \frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1},$$

$$\nabla_3 J_{31} = -\Gamma_{33}^2 J_{21} - \Gamma_{31}^e J_{3e} = \Gamma_{33}^2 = \frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 - 2\theta),$$

$$\nabla_3 J_{32} = -\Gamma_{33}^1 J_{12} - \Gamma_{32}^4 J_{34} = -\Gamma_{32}^4 J_{34} = -\kappa \Gamma_{32}^4 = -\kappa \left(-\frac{1}{2} \beta^{-1}\right) = \frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1},$$

$$\nabla_3 J_{34} = -\Gamma_{33}^3 J_{34} - \Gamma_{43}^4 J_{34} = 0,$$

$$\nabla_3 J_{41} = -\Gamma_{34}^2 J_{21} - \Gamma_{31}^e J_{4e} = \Gamma_{34}^2 = \frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} \left(1 + \frac{\theta}{2}\right),$$

$$\nabla_3 J_{42} = -\Gamma_{34}^1 J_{43} - \Gamma_{32}^3 J_{43} = -\Gamma_{32}^3 (-\kappa) = \kappa \Gamma_{32}^3 = -\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1},$$

$$\nabla_3 J_{43} = -\Gamma_{34}^4 J_{43} - \Gamma_{33}^3 J_{43} = 0,$$

(iii) Since  $\nabla_4 J_{ab} = -\Gamma_{4a}^e J_{eb} - \Gamma_{4b}^e J_{ae}$ , we have

$$\nabla_4 J_{12} = -\Gamma_{43}^2 = -\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} \left(1 + \frac{\theta}{2}\right),$$

$$\begin{aligned} \nabla_4 J_{14} &= -\Gamma_{44}^2 J_{12} = -\left(-\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 + 3\theta)\right) \\ &= \frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 + 3\theta), \end{aligned}$$

$$\nabla_4 J_{21} = -\Gamma_{42}^2 J_{21} - \Gamma_{41}^e J_{2e} = 0,$$

$$\nabla_4 J_{23} = -\Gamma_{42}^4 J_{43} - \Gamma_{43}^1 J_{21} = -\Gamma_{42}^4 (-\kappa) = \kappa \Gamma_{42}^4 = \frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1},$$

$$\nabla_4 J_{24} = -\Gamma_{42}^3 J_{34} - \Gamma_{44}^1 J_{21} = -\kappa \Gamma_{42}^3 = \frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1},$$



$$\begin{aligned}
\nabla_4 J_{31} &= -\Gamma_{43}^2 J_{21} - \Gamma_{41}^e J_{3e} = \Gamma_{43}^2 = \frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} \left(1 + \frac{\theta}{2}\right), \\
\nabla_4 J_{32} &= -\Gamma_{43}^1 J_{12} - \Gamma_{42}^4 J_{34} = \kappa \Gamma_{42}^4 = -\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1}, \\
\nabla_4 J_{34} &= -\Gamma_{43}^3 J_{34} - \Gamma_{44}^4 J_{34} = 0, \\
\nabla_4 J_{41} &= -\Gamma_{44}^2 J_{21} = -\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 + 3\theta), \\
\nabla_4 J_{42} &= -\Gamma_{42}^3 J_{43} = -\Gamma_{42}^3 (-\kappa) = \kappa \Gamma_{42}^3 = -\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1}, \\
\nabla_4 J_{43} &= -\Gamma_{44}^2 J_{23} - \Gamma_{43}^3 J_{43} = 0.
\end{aligned}$$

□

**1.5. The computation of (1.1). First steps.** The goal is to show

$$S := \sum_{\sigma \in \mathfrak{S}_5} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \bar{R}_{\sigma_0 \ell_1 0} {}^n \bar{R}_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2 \ell_2} {}^{\ell_1} \bar{R}_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4 n} {}^{\ell_2} = \frac{\kappa}{16} p^2 (3072 p^4 - 640 p^2 \beta^{-2} - 25 \beta^{-4}), \quad (1.3)$$

(see (4.8)).

For  $i \in \{0, 1, 2, 3, 4\}$ , we set

$$S_i = \sum_{\substack{\sigma \in \mathfrak{S}_5 \\ \sigma_i = 0}} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \bar{R}_{\sigma_0 \ell_1 0} {}^n \bar{R}_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2 \ell_2} {}^{\ell_1} \bar{R}_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4 n} {}^{\ell_2},$$

so

$$S = \sum_{i=0}^4 S_i.$$

Interchanging  $\sigma_1$  and  $\sigma_2$  gives  $S_1 = S_2$ , since both  $\text{sgn}(\sigma)$  and a curvature term change sign, and interchanging  $\sigma_3$  and  $\sigma_4$  gives  $S_3 = S_4$ . Thus,

$$S = S_0 + 2S_1 + 2S_3. \quad (1.4)$$

For  $m = 0, 1, 3$ , we set

$$S_m = S_{m,2} + S_{m,4} + S_{m,6},$$

where  $S_{m,k}$  is the  $p^k$ -term of  $S_m$ . In this notation, (1.3) is equivalent to:

**Proposition 1.5.**

$$\begin{aligned}
\bar{S}_{[2]} &:= S_{0,2} + 2S_{1,2} + 2S_{3,2} = \frac{\kappa}{16} p^2 (-25 \beta^{-4}), \\
\bar{S}_{[4]} &:= S_{0,4} + 2S_{1,4} + 2S_{3,4} = \frac{\kappa}{16} (-640 p^2 \beta^{-2}), \\
\bar{S}_{[6]} &:= S_{0,6} + 2S_{1,6} + 2S_{3,6} = \frac{\kappa}{16} 3072 p^6.
\end{aligned}$$

This will be proved in a number of steps.  $\bar{S}_{[6]}$  is computed in Prop. 1.9,  $\bar{S}_{[2]}$  is computed in Prop. 1.11, and  $\bar{S}_{[4]}$  is computed in Prop. 1.13.

For notation, the metric  $\bar{g}$  on  $\bar{M}$  is given by

$$\bar{g} = (\bar{g}_{ij}) = \left( \begin{array}{c|cccc} 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ \hline 0 & & & & \\ 0 & & & & \\ 0 & & \bar{g}_{ab} & & \\ 0 & & & & \end{array} \right)$$

where  $i, j, k, \dots \in \{0, 1, 2, 3, 4\}$  and  $a, b, \dots \in \{1, 2, 3, 4\}$ . Thus  $\bar{g}_{00} = \bar{g}(\partial_0, \partial_0)$ ,  $\bar{g}_{ab} = \bar{g}(\partial_{\theta_a}^L, \partial_{\theta_b}^L) = g(\partial_{\theta_a}, \partial_{\theta_b})$ .

We now compute  $S_0$ , using the formulas in Lemma 1.1. In the obvious notation,

$$\begin{aligned} S_0 &= \sum_{\sigma_0=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \bar{R}_{0a_1 0}{}^b \bar{R}_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2 \ell_2}{}^{a_1} \bar{R}_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4 b}{}^{\ell_2} \\ &= \sum_{\sigma_0=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \bar{R}_{0a_1 0}{}^b [\bar{R}_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2 a_2}{}^{a_1} \bar{R}_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4 b}{}^{a_2} + \bar{R}_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2 0}{}^{a_1} \bar{R}_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4 b}{}^0]. \end{aligned}$$

Since  $\bar{R}_{0a_1 0}{}^b = -p^2 \delta_{a_1}^b$ , we get

$$\begin{aligned} S_0 &= -p^2 \sum_{\sigma_0=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) [\bar{R}_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2 a_2}{}^{a_1} \bar{R}_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4 a_1}{}^{a_2} + \bar{R}_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2 0}{}^{a_1} \bar{R}_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4 a_1}{}^0] \\ &= -p^2 \sum_{\sigma_0=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) [\bar{R}_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2 a_2}{}^{a_1} \bar{R}_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4 a_1}{}^{a_2} - \bar{R}_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2 a_1'}{}^0 \bar{R}_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4 a_1}{}^0 g^{a_1 a_1'}] \\ &= -p^2 \sum_{\sigma_0=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) [\bar{R}_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2 a_2}{}^{a_1} \bar{R}_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4 a_1}{}^{a_2} - \bar{R}_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2 a_1'}{}^0 \bar{R}_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4 a_1}{}^0 g^{a_1 a_1'}] \\ &= -p^2 \sum_{\sigma_0=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \bar{R}_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2 a_2}{}^{a_1} \bar{R}_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4 a_1}{}^{a_2} + p^4 \sum_{\sigma_0=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \nabla_{a_1'} J_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2} \nabla_{a_1} J_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4} g^{a_1 a_1'} \\ &:= S_{0,*} + S_{0,4,1}. \end{aligned}$$

We will see below (Lemma 1.14) that

$$S_{0,4,1} = -S_{1,4,1} = 5p^4 \kappa \beta^{-2}. \quad (1.5)$$

(For the definition of  $S_{1,4,1}$ , see (1.13). The first equality follows from a “change of variables” sending  $\sigma$  to  $(01)\sigma$ .) For  $S_{0,*}$ , we have

$$\begin{aligned} S_{0,*} &= -p^2 \sum_{\sigma_0=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \bar{R}_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2 a_2}{}^{a_1} \bar{R}_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4 a_1}{}^{a_2} \\ &= -p^2 \sum_{\sigma_0=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) (R_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2 a_2}{}^{a_1} - p^2 J_{\sigma_2 a_2} J_{\sigma_1}{}^{a_1} + p^2 J_{\sigma_1 a_2} J_{\sigma_2}{}^{a_1} + 2p^2 J_{\sigma_2 \sigma_2} J_{a_2}{}^{a_1}) \\ &\quad \cdot (R_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4 a_1}{}^{a_2} - p^2 J_{\sigma_4 a_1} J_{\sigma_3}{}^{a_2} + p^2 J_{\sigma_3 a_1} J_{\sigma_4}{}^{a_2} + 2p^2 J_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4} J_{a_1}{}^{a_2}) \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
&= -p^2 \sum_{\sigma_0=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) [(R_{\sigma_1\sigma_2a_2}^{a_1} R_{\sigma_3\sigma_4a_1}^{a_2}) \\
&\quad + p^2 (-J_{\sigma_2a_2} J_{\sigma_1}^{a_1} + J_{\sigma_1a_2} J_{\sigma_2}^{a_1} + 2J_{\sigma_1\sigma_2} J_{a_2}^{a_1}) R_{\sigma_3\sigma_4a_1}^{a_2} \\
&\quad + p^2 R_{\sigma_1\sigma_2a_2}^{a_1} (-J_{\sigma_4a_1} J_{\sigma_3}^{a_2} + J_{\sigma_3a_1} J_{\sigma_3}^{a_1} + 2J_{\sigma_3\sigma_4} J_{a_1}^{a_2}) \\
&\quad + p^4 (-J_{\sigma_2a_2} J_{\sigma_1}^{a_1} + J_{\sigma_1a_2} J_{\sigma_2}^{a_1} + 2J_{\sigma_1\sigma_2} J_{a_2}^{a_1})] \\
&\quad \cdot (-J_{\sigma_4a_1} J_{\sigma_3}^{a_2} + J_{\sigma_3a_1} J_{\sigma_3}^{a_1} + 2J_{\sigma_3\sigma_4} J_{a_1}^{a_2}).
\end{aligned}$$

The  $p^4$  term in  $S_{0,*}$  is

$$\begin{aligned}
S_{0,4,2} &:= -p^4 \sum_{\sigma_0=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) [(-J_{\sigma_2a_2} J_{\sigma_1}^{a_1} + J_{\sigma_1a_2} J_{\sigma_2}^{a_1} + 2J_{\sigma_1\sigma_2} J_{a_2}^{a_1}) R_{\sigma_3\sigma_4a_1}^{a_2} \\
&\quad + R_{\sigma_1\sigma_2a_2}^{a_1} (-J_{\sigma_4a_1} J_{\sigma_3}^{a_2} + J_{\sigma_3a_1} J_{\sigma_3}^{a_1} + 2J_{\sigma_3\sigma_4} J_{a_1}^{a_2})].
\end{aligned}$$

We can simplify  $S_{0,4,2}$  using the change of variable  $\sigma \mapsto \tau = \sigma(13)(24)$  as in the calculation of  $(\beta)$  in Appendix B:

$$\begin{aligned}
S_{0,4,2} &= -p^4 \sum_{\sigma_0=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) [(-J_{\sigma_2a_2} J_{\sigma_1}^{a_1} + J_{\sigma_1a_2} J_{\sigma_2}^{a_1} + 2J_{\sigma_1\sigma_2} J_{a_2}^{a_1}) R_{\sigma_3\sigma_4a_1}^{a_2} \\
&\quad + R_{\sigma_1\sigma_2a_2}^{a_1} (-J_{\sigma_4a_1} J_{\sigma_3}^{a_2} + J_{\sigma_3a_1} J_{\sigma_4}^{a_2} + 2J_{\sigma_3\sigma_4} J_{a_1}^{a_2})] \tag{1.6} \\
&= -p^4 \sum_{\sigma_0=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) [-R_{\sigma_3\sigma_4a_1a_2} J_{\sigma_2}^{a_2} J_{\sigma_1}^{a_1} + R_{\sigma_3\sigma_4a_2a_1} J_{\sigma_1}^{a_1} J_{\sigma_2}^{a_2} - 2R_{\sigma_3\sigma_4a_1a_2} J_{\sigma_1\sigma_2} J^{a_1a_2} \\
&\quad - R_{\sigma_1\sigma_2a_2a_1} J_{\sigma_4}^{a_1} J_{\sigma_3}^{a_2} + R_{\sigma_1\sigma_2a_1a_2} J_{\sigma_3}^{a_1} J_{\sigma_4}^{a_2} - 2R_{\sigma_1\sigma_2a_2a_1} J_{\sigma_3\sigma_4} J^{a_1a_2}] \\
&= 4p^4 \sum_{\sigma_0=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) [R_{\sigma_1\sigma_2a_1a_2} J_{\sigma_3}^{a_1} J_{\sigma_4}^{a_2} + R_{\sigma_1\sigma_2a_1a_2} J^{a_1a_2} J_{\sigma_3\sigma_4}] \\
&:= S_{0,4,2,1} + S_{0,4,2,2}.
\end{aligned}$$

where

$$\begin{aligned}
S_{0,4,2,1} &= 4p^4 \sum_{\sigma_0=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) R_{\sigma_1\sigma_2a_1a_2} J_{\sigma_3}^{a_1} J_{\sigma_4}^{a_2}, \tag{1.7} \\
S_{0,4,2,2} &= 4p^4 \sum_{\sigma_0=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) R_{\sigma_1\sigma_2a_1a_2} J^{a_1a_2} J_{\sigma_3\sigma_4}.
\end{aligned}$$

Here is a summary of  $S_0$ , obtained from (1.5), (1.6), (1.7).

**Lemma 1.6.**

$$\begin{aligned}
S_{0,2} &= -p^2 \sum_{\sigma_0=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) R_{\sigma_1\sigma_2a_2}^{a_1} R_{\sigma_3\sigma_4a_1}^{a_2}, \\
S_{0,4} &= p^4 \sum_{\sigma_0=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \nabla_{a_1'} J_{\sigma_1\sigma_2} \nabla_{a_1} J_{\sigma_3\sigma_4} g^{a_1a_1'} \\
&\quad - 4p^4 \sum_{\sigma_0=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) [R_{\sigma_1\sigma_2a_1a_2} J_{\sigma_3}^{a_1} J_{\sigma_4}^{a_2} + R_{\sigma_1\sigma_2a_1a_2} J^{a_1a_2} J_{\sigma_3\sigma_4}] \tag{1.8}
\end{aligned}$$

$$S_{0,6} = -p^6 \sum_{\sigma_0=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) (-J_{\sigma_2 a_2} J_{\sigma_1}^{a_1} + J_{\sigma_1 a_2} J_{\sigma_2}^{a_1} + 2J_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2} J_{a_2}^{a_1} \\ \cdot (-J_{\sigma_4 a_1} J_{\sigma_3}^{a_2} + J_{\sigma_3 a_1} J_{\sigma_4}^{a_2} + 2J_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4} J_{a_1}^{a_2})).$$

We now turn to the computation of  $S_1$ .

$$\begin{aligned} S_1 &= - \sum_{\sigma_1=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \bar{R}_{\sigma_0 \ell_1 0}^n \bar{R}_{0 \sigma_2 \ell_2}^{\ell_1} \bar{R}_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4 n}^{\ell_2} = - \sum_{\sigma_1=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \bar{R}_{\sigma_0 \ell_1 0 b'} \bar{R}_{0 \sigma_2 \ell_2}^{\ell_1} \bar{R}_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4 b}^{\ell_2} g^{bb'} \\ &= - \sum_{\sigma_1=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \bar{R}_{\sigma_0 0 0 b'} \bar{R}_{0 \sigma_2 a}^0 \bar{R}_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4 b}^a g^{bb'} - \sum_{\sigma_1=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \bar{R}_{\sigma_0 a_1 0 b'} \bar{R}_{0 \sigma_2 \ell_2}^{a_1} \bar{R}_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4 b}^{\ell_2} g^{bb'} \\ &= - \sum_{\sigma_1=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) (p^2 g_{\sigma_0 b'}) (p^2 g_{\sigma_2 a_2}) \bar{R}_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4 b}^{a_2} g^{bb'} - \sum_{\sigma_1=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \bar{R}_{\sigma_0 a_1 0 b'} \bar{R}_{0 \sigma_2 0 a_1'} \bar{R}_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4 b 0} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 a_1'} \\ &\quad - \sum_{\sigma_1=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \bar{R}_{\sigma_0 a_1 0 b'} \bar{R}_{0 \sigma_2 a_2 a_1'} \bar{R}_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4 b}^{a_2} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 a_1'} \\ &= - \sum_{\sigma_1=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) p^4 R_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4 \sigma_0 \sigma_2} - \sum_{\sigma_1=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) (-p \nabla_{b'} J_{\sigma_0 a_1}) (-p^2 g_{\sigma_2 a_2'}) (p \nabla_b J_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4}) g^{bb'} g^{a_1 a_1'} \\ &\quad - \sum_{\sigma_1=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) (-p \nabla_{b'} J_{\sigma_0 a_1}) (-p^2 \nabla_{\sigma_2} J_{a_2 a_1'}) \bar{R}_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4 b}^{a_2} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 a_1'}. \end{aligned}$$

This can be simplified using the Bianchi identity

$$\sum_{\sigma_1=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) R_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4 \sigma_0 \sigma_2} = 0,$$

to give

$$\begin{aligned} S_1 &= - \sum_{\sigma_1=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) p^4 g^{bb'} \nabla_{b'} J_{\sigma_0 \sigma_2} \nabla_b J_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4} \\ &\quad - \sum_{\sigma_1=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) p^2 \nabla_{b'} J_{\sigma_0 a_1} \nabla_{\sigma_2} J_{a_2 a_1'} \bar{R}_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4 b a_2'} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 a_1'} g^{a_2 a_2'} \\ &= - \sum_{\sigma_1=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) p^4 g^{bb'} \nabla_{b'} J_{\sigma_0 \sigma_2} \nabla_b J_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4} \\ &\quad - \sum_{\sigma_1=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) p^2 \nabla_{b'} J_{\sigma_0 a_1} \nabla_{\sigma_2} J_{a_2 a_1'} R_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4 b a_2'} g^{a_2 a_2'} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 a_1'} \\ &\quad - \sum_{\sigma_1=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) p^4 \nabla_{b'} J_{\sigma_0 a_1} \nabla_{\sigma_2} J_{a_2 a_1'} \\ &\quad \cdot (-J_{\sigma_4 b} J_{\sigma_3 a_2'} + J_{\sigma_3 b} J_{\sigma_4 a_2'} + 2J_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4} J_{b a_2'}) g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a_2'} g^{a_1 a_1'} \\ &= - \sum_{\sigma_1=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) p^4 g^{bb'} \nabla_b J_{\sigma_0 \sigma_2} \nabla_{b'} J_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4} \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
& + \sum_{\sigma_1=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) p^4 \nabla_{b'} J_{\sigma_0 a_1} \nabla_{\sigma_2} J_{a_2 a'_1} J_{\sigma_4 b} J_{\sigma_3 a'_2} g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a'_2} g^{a_1 a'_1} \\
& - \sum_{\sigma_1=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) p^4 \nabla_{b'} J_{\sigma_0 a_1} \nabla_{\sigma_2} J_{a_2 a'_1} J_{\sigma_3 b} J_{\sigma_4 a'_2} g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a'_2} g^{a_1 a'_1} \\
& - 2 \sum_{\sigma_1=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) p^4 \nabla_{b'} J_{\sigma_0 a_1} \nabla_{\text{sig} a_2} J_{a_2 a'_1} J_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4} J_{b a'_2} g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a'_2} g^{a_1 a'_1} \\
& - \sum_{\sigma_1=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) p^2 \nabla_{b'} J_{\sigma_0 a_1} \nabla_{\sigma_2} J_{a_2 a'_1} R_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4 b a'_2} g^{a_2 a'_2} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 a'_1} \\
& = - \sum_{\sigma_1=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) p^4 g^{bb'} \nabla_b J_{\sigma_0 \sigma_2} \nabla_{b'} J_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4} \\
& + 2 \sum_{\sigma_1=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) p^4 \nabla_{b'} J_{\sigma_0 a_1} \nabla_{\sigma_2} J_{a_2 a'_1} J_{\sigma_4 b} J_{\sigma_3 a'_2} g^{a_2 a'_2} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 a'_1} \\
& - 2 \sum_{\sigma_1=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) p^4 \nabla_{b'} J_{\sigma_0 a_1} \nabla_{\sigma_2} J_{a_2 a'_1} J_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4} J_{b a'_2} g^{a_2 a'_2} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 a'_1} \\
& - p^2 \sum_{\sigma_1=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \nabla_{b'} J_{\sigma_0 a_1} \nabla_{\sigma_2} J_{a_2 a'_1} R_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4 b a'_2} g^{a_2 a'_2} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 a'_1}.
\end{aligned}$$

In summary,

**Lemma 1.7.**

$$S_1 = S_{1,2} + S_{1,4},$$

where

$$\begin{aligned}
S_{1,2} &= -p^2 \sum_{\sigma_1=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \nabla_{b'} J_{\sigma_0 a_1} \nabla_{\sigma_2} J_{a_2 a'_1} R_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4 b a'_2} g^{a_2 a'_2} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 a'_1}, \\
S_{1,4} &= -p^4 \sum_{\sigma_1=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) g^{bb'} \nabla_b J_{\sigma_0 \sigma_2} \nabla_{b'} J_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4} \\
& + 2p^4 \sum_{\sigma_1=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \nabla_{b'} J_{\sigma_0 a_1} \nabla_{\sigma_2} J_{a_2 a'_1} J_{\sigma_4 b} J_{\sigma_3 a'_2} g^{a_2 a'_2} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 a'_1} \\
& - 2p^4 \sum_{\sigma_1=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \nabla_{b'} J_{\sigma_0 a_1} \nabla_{\sigma_2} J_{a_2 a'_1} J_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4} J_{b a'_2} g^{a_2 a'_2} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 a'_1}.
\end{aligned}$$

We now compute  $S_3$ . Using  $\bar{R}_{\sigma_0 \ell_1 0}^0 = 0$ , we obtain

$$\begin{aligned}
S_3 &= - \sum_{\sigma_3=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \bar{R}_{\sigma_0 \ell_1 0}^n \bar{R}_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2 \ell_2}^{\ell_1} \bar{R}_{0 \sigma_4 n}^{\ell_2} = - \sum_{\sigma_3=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \bar{R}_{\sigma_0 \ell_1 0}^b \bar{R}_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2 \ell_2}^{\ell_1} \bar{R}_{0 \sigma_4 b}^{\ell_2} \\
&= - \sum_{\sigma_3=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \bar{R}_{\sigma_0 0 0}^b \bar{R}_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2 a_2}^0 \bar{R}_{0 \sigma_4 b}^{a_2} - \sum_{\sigma_3=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \bar{R}_{\sigma_0 a_1 0}^b \bar{R}_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2 \ell_2}^{a_1} \bar{R}_{0 \sigma_4 b}^{\ell_2}
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
&= - \sum_{\sigma_3=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \bar{R}_{\sigma_0 0 0}{}^b \bar{R}_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2 a_2}{}^0 \bar{R}_{0 \sigma_4 b}{}^{a_2} - \sum_{\sigma_3=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \bar{R}_{\sigma_0 a_1 0}{}^b \bar{R}_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2 0}{}^{a_1} \bar{R}_{0 \sigma_4 b}{}^0 \\
&\quad - \sum_{\sigma_3=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \bar{R}_{\sigma_0 a_1 0}{}^b \bar{R}_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2 a_2}{}^{a_1} \bar{R}_{0 \sigma_4 b}{}^{a_2}.
\end{aligned}$$

Since

$$\bar{R}_{0 \sigma_4 b}{}^{a_2} = \bar{R}_b{}^{a_2}{}_{0 \sigma_4} = -\bar{R}_b{}^{a_2}{}_{\sigma_4 0}, \quad \bar{R}_{0 \sigma_4 b}{}^{a_2} = -\bar{R}_b{}^{a_2}{}_{\sigma_4 0},$$

this becomes

$$\begin{aligned}
S_3 &= - \sum_{\sigma_3=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) (p^2 \delta_{\sigma_0}^b) (p \nabla_{a_2} J_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2}) (-p \nabla_{\sigma_4} J_b{}^{a_2}) - (-p^2 \nabla_{\sigma_4} J_{\sigma_0 a_1}) (-p \nabla^{a_1} J_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2}) (p^2 g_{\sigma_4 b}) \\
&\quad - \sum_{\sigma_3=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) (-p \nabla^b J_{\sigma_0 a_1}) \bar{R}_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2 a_2}{}^{a_1} (-p \nabla_{\sigma_4} J_b{}^{a_2}).
\end{aligned}$$

This further simplifies, using

$$\sum_{\sigma_3=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) p^4 \nabla_{a_2} J_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2} \nabla_{\sigma_4} J_{\sigma_0}{}^{a_2} - \sum_{\sigma_3=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) p^4 \nabla_{\sigma_4} J_{\sigma_0 a_2} \nabla^{a_2} J_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2} = 0,$$

to give

**Lemma 1.8.**

$$\begin{aligned}
S_3 &= S_{3,2} + S_{3,4} \\
&= - \sum_{\sigma_3=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) p^2 \nabla^b J_{\sigma_0 a_1} \nabla_{\sigma_4} J_b{}^{a_2} R_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2 a_2}{}^{a_1} \\
&\quad - \sum_{\sigma_3=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) p^4 \nabla^b J_{\sigma_0 a_1} \nabla_{\sigma_4} J_b{}^{a_2} (-J_{\sigma_2 a_2} J_{\sigma_1}{}^{a_1} + J_{\sigma_1 a_2} J_{\sigma_2}{}^{a_1} + 2 J_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2} J_{a_2}{}^{a_1}) \\
&= - \sum_{\sigma_3=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) p^2 \nabla^b J_{\sigma_0 a_1} \nabla_{\sigma_4} J_b{}^{a_2} R_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2 a_2}{}^{a_1} \\
&\quad + 2p^4 \sum_{\sigma_3=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \nabla^b J_{\sigma_0 a_1} \nabla_{\sigma_4} J_b{}^{a_2} [J_{\sigma_2 a_2} J_{\sigma_1}{}^{a_1} - J_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2} J_{a_2}{}^{a_1}].
\end{aligned}$$

The last equality follows from the change of variable  $\sigma \mapsto \sigma(12)$ .

**1.6. The  $p^6$  term in (1.3).** We now compute the  $p^6$  term in (1.3), or equivalently the third term in Prop. 1.5. Since  $S_{1,6} = S_{3,6} = 0$  by Lemmas 1.7, 1.8, respectively, we need only compute  $S_{0,6}$ .

**Proposition 1.9.**

$$\bar{S}_{[6]} = S_{0,6} = 192p^6\kappa.$$

*Proof.* We have

$$S_{0,6}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
&= -p^6 \sum_{\sigma_0=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) (-J_{\sigma_2 a_2} J_{\sigma_1}^{a_1} + J_{\sigma_1 a_2} J_{\sigma_2}^{a_1} + 2J_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2} J_{a_2}^{a_1}) \\
&\quad \cdot (-J_{\sigma_4 a_1} J_{\sigma_3}^{a_2} + J_{\sigma_3 a_1} J_{\sigma_4}^{a_2} + 2J_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4} J_{a_1}^{a_2}) \\
&= -p^6 \sum_{\sigma_0=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) [J_{\sigma_2 a_2} J_{\sigma_1}^{a_1} J_{\sigma_4 a_1} J_{\sigma_3}^{a_2} - J_{\sigma_2 a_2} J_{\sigma_1}^{a_1} J_{\sigma_3 a_1} J_{\sigma_4}^{a_2} - 2J_{\sigma_2 a_2} J_{\sigma_1}^{a_1} J_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4} J_{a_1}^{a_2} \\
&\quad - J_{\sigma_1 a_2} J_{\sigma_2}^{a_1} J_{\sigma_4 a_1} J_{\sigma_3}^{a_2} + J_{\sigma_1 a_2} J_{\sigma_2}^{a_1} J_{\sigma_3 a_1} J_{\sigma_4}^{a_2} + 2J_{\sigma_1 a_2} J_{\sigma_2}^{a_1} J_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4} J_{a_1}^{a_2} \\
&\quad - 2J_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2} J_{a_2}^{a_1} J_{\sigma_4 a_1} J_{\sigma_3}^{a_2} + 2J_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2} J_{a_2}^{a_1} J_{\sigma_3 a_1} J_{\sigma_4}^{a_2} + 4J_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2} J_{a_2}^{a_1} J_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4} J_{a_1}^{a_2}].
\end{aligned}$$

Using (??), we get

$$S_{0,6} = -p^6 \sum_{\sigma_0=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) (-2 \cdot 4 - 16) J_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2} J_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4} = p^6 \cdot 24 \cdot 2^3 \kappa = 192 p^6 \kappa.$$

□

**1.7. The  $p^2$  term in (1.3).** We now compute

$$\bar{S}_{[2]} = S_{0,2} + 2S_{1,2} + 2S_{3,2}.$$

We first note that there is no contribution from  $S_{0,2}$ .

**Lemma 1.10.**

$$S_{0,2} = 0.$$

*Proof.* By Lemmas 1.3(i) and 1.6, we get

$$S_{0,2} = \sum_{\sigma_0=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) R_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2 a_2}^b R_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4 b}^{a_2} = 0,$$

since every permutation has  $\sigma_a = 1$  for some  $a$ . □

Note that the middle term in the last equation is a multiple of the first Pontryagin form, which implies that the signature of  $M$  is zero.

**Proposition 1.11.**

$$\bar{S}_{[2]} = 2(S_{1,2} + S_{3,2}) = -\frac{25}{16} \kappa \beta^{-4} \quad (1.9)$$

Check that the proof below is ok – compare to v2.

*Proof.* We have

$$\begin{aligned}
S_{1,2} + S_{3,2} &= -p^2 \sum_{\sigma_1=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \nabla_{b'} J_{\sigma_0 a_1'} \nabla_{\sigma_2} J_{a_2 a_1'} R_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4 b a_2'} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 a_1'} g^{a_2 a_2'} \\
&\quad - p^2 \sum_{\sigma_3=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \nabla^b J_{\sigma_0 a_1} \nabla_{\sigma_4} J_b^{a_2} R_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2 a_2}^{a_1} \\
&= p^2 \sum_{\sigma_0=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \nabla_{a_1} J_{\sigma_1 b} \nabla_{\sigma_2} J_{a_2 b'} R_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4 a_2' a_1'} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 a_1'} g^{a_2 a_2'}
\end{aligned}$$

$$+ p^2 \sum_{\sigma_0=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \nabla_{b'} J_{\sigma_1 a_1} \nabla_{\sigma_2} J_{a'_2 b} R_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4 a_2 a'_1} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 a'_1} g^{a_2 a'_2},$$

where we use the change of variable  $\sigma \mapsto (01)\sigma$  on the third line and  $\sigma \mapsto (301)(24)\sigma$  on the fourth line. We know

$$(\sigma_3, \sigma_4) \in \{(2, 3), (3, 2), (2, 4), (4, 2), (3, 4), (4, 3)\}.$$

**Case (1):**  $(\sigma_3, \sigma_4) = (2, 3)$  or  $(3, 2)$

In this case, in cycle notation

$$\sigma \in \{(243), (1432), (24), (142)\},$$

with signs  $+1, -1, -1, +1$ , respectively. There is no contribution to  $S_{1,2} + S_{3,2}$  if  $\sigma = (1432)$  or  $\sigma = (142)$ , since  $\nabla_1 J_{ab} = 0$ . Thus for  $(S_{1,2} + S_{3,2})(1)$  the contribution to  $S_{2,2} + S_{4,2}$  from Case (1), we get

$$\begin{aligned} (S_{1,2} + S_{3,2})(1) &= 2p^2 \nabla_{a_1} J_{1b} \nabla_4 J_{a_2 b'} R_{23a'_2 a'_1} g^{a_1 a'_1} g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a'_2} \\ &\quad + 2\nabla_{b'} J_{1a_1} \nabla_4 J_{a'_2 b} R_{23a_2 a'_1} g^{a_1 a'_1} g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a'_2} \\ &= 2p^2 \nabla_{a_1} J_{1b} \nabla_4 J_{a_2 b'} R_{23a'_2 a'_1} g^{a_1 a'_1} g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a'_2} \\ &\quad + 2p^2 \nabla_{a_1} J_{1b'} \nabla_4 J_{a_2 b} R_{23a_2 a'_1} g^{a_1 a'_1} g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a'_2} \\ &= 4p^2 \nabla_{a_1} J_{1b} \nabla_4 J_{a_2 b} R_{23a'_2 a'_1} g^{a_1 a'_1} g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a'_2}. \end{aligned}$$

Since  $\nabla_1 J_{ab} = \nabla_2 J_{ab} = 0$ , we must have  $a_1 = 3$  or  $4$ , and so

$$\begin{aligned} (S_{2,2} + S_{4,2})(1) &= 4p^2 \nabla_3 J_{1b} \nabla_4 J_{a_2 b'} R_{23a'_2 b'} g^{3a'_1} g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a'_2} \\ &\quad + 4p^2 \nabla_4 J_{1b} \nabla_4 J_{a_2 b'} R_{23a'_2 a'_1} g^{4a'_1} g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a'_2} \\ &= 4p^2 \nabla_3 J_{1b} \nabla_4 J_{2b'} R_{232}^3 g^{bb'} \\ &\quad + 4p^2 \nabla_4 J_{1b} \nabla_4 J_{2b'} R_{232}^4 g^{bb'}. \end{aligned}$$

In summary,

$$(S_{2,2} + S_{4,2})(1) = 4p^2 (\nabla_3 J_{1b'} \nabla_4 J_{2b} R_{232}^3 g^{bb'} + \nabla_4 J_{1b'} \nabla_4 J_{2b} R_{232}^4 g^{bb'}). \quad (1.10)$$

**Case (2):**  $(\sigma_3, \sigma_4) = (2, 4)$  or  $(4, 2)$

Now

$$\sigma \in \{(23), (234), (132), (1342)\}$$

with signs  $-1, +1, +1, -1$ , respectively. There is no contribution to  $S_{2,2} + S_{4,2}$  if  $\sigma = (132)$  or  $\sigma = (1342)$ , since  $\nabla_1 J_{ab} = 0$ . Thus for  $(S_{2,2} + S_{4,2})(2)$  in the notation of Case (1), we get

$$(S_{1,2} + S_{3,2})(2) = -2(\nabla_{a_1} J_{1b'} \nabla_3 J_{a'_2 b} R_{24a_2}^{a_1} g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a'_2})$$



$$+ \nabla_{b'} J_{1a_1} \nabla_3 J_{a'_2 b} R_{24a_2}{}^{a_1} g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a'_2}).$$

As above, we only get a nonzero contribution to this equation if  $a_1 = 3$  or  $4$ . Thus, we get

$$\begin{aligned} (S_{1,2} + S_{3,2})(2) &= -2(\nabla_3 J_{1b'} \nabla_3 J_{a'_2 b} R_{24a_2}{}^3 g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a'_2} + \nabla_4 J_{1b'} \nabla_3 J_{a'_2 b} R_{24a_2}{}^4 g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a'_2} \\ &\quad + \nabla_{b'} J_{13} \nabla_3 J_{a_2 b} R_{24a_2}{}^3 g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a'_2} + \nabla_{b'} J_{14} \nabla_3 J_{a_2 b} R_{24a_2}{}^3 g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a'_2}) \\ &= -4(\nabla_3 J_{1b'} \nabla_3 J_{2b} R_{242}{}^3 g^{bb'} + \nabla_4 J_{1b'} \nabla_3 J_{2b} R_{242}{}^4 g^{bb'}), \end{aligned} \quad (1.11)$$

because only  $a_2$  and  $a'_2$  remain.

**Case (3):**  $(\sigma_3, \sigma_4) = (3, 4)$  or  $(4, 3)$

Since  $\sigma_2 = 1$  or  $2$ , we have  $\nabla_{\sigma_2} J_{a_2 b'} = 0$ . Thus,

$$(S_{1,2} + S_{3,2})(3) = 0.$$

In summary, at this point we have

$$\frac{1}{2} \bar{S}_{[2]} = S_{1,2} + S_{3,2} = (S_{1,2} + S_{3,2})(1) + (S_{1,2} + S_{3,2})(2). \quad (1.12)$$

We continue by simplifying the explicit expressions in (1.10), (1.11).

**Lemma 1.12.** (i)  $\nabla_4 J_{1b'} \nabla_4 J_{2b} g^{bb'} = 0$  and  $\nabla_3 J_{1b'} \nabla_3 J_{2b} g^{bb'} = 0$ .

(ii)

$$\nabla_3 J_{1b'} \nabla_4 J_{2b} g^{bb'} R_{232}{}^3 = -\frac{5\kappa}{4^4} \beta^{-4} (9 - 8\theta),$$

$$\nabla_4 J_{1b'} \nabla_3 J_{2b} g^{bb'} R_{232}{}^4 = \frac{5\kappa}{4^4} \beta^{-4} (1 + 8\theta).$$

$$(iii) \nabla_3 J_{1b'} \nabla_4 J_{2b} g^{bb'} R_{232}{}^3 - \nabla_4 J_{1b'} \nabla_3 J_{2b} g^{bb'} R_{242}{}^4 = -\frac{50}{4^4} \kappa \beta^{-4}.$$

*Proof.* (i) By Lem. 1.4,

$$\begin{aligned} \nabla_4 J_{1b'} \nabla_4 J_{2b} g^{bb'} &= \nabla_4 J_{13} + \nabla_4 J_{23} g^{33} + \nabla_4 J_{13} \nabla_4 J_{24} g^{34} + \nabla_4 J_{14} \nabla_4 J_{23} g^{43} + \nabla_4 J_{14} + \nabla_4 J_{24} g^{44} \\ &= (-\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} (1 + \frac{1}{2} \theta)) (\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1}) (\kappa^{-1} (1 + \theta) \beta^{-1/2}) \\ &\quad + (-\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} (1 + \frac{\theta}{2})) (\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1}) (\theta \kappa^{-1} \beta^{-1/2}) \\ &\quad + (\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 + 3\theta)) (\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1}) (\theta \kappa^{-1} \beta^{-1/2}) \\ &\quad + (\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 + 3\theta)) (\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1}) (\kappa^{-1} \beta^{-1/2}) \\ &= \kappa \beta^{-3} (-\frac{1}{8} (1 + \frac{\theta}{2}) (1 + \theta) - \frac{1}{4} (1 + \frac{\theta}{2}) \theta + \frac{1}{16} (1 + 3\theta) \theta + \frac{1}{8} (1 + 3\theta)) \\ &= \frac{\kappa}{16} \beta^{-3} (-2(1 + \frac{3\theta}{2} + \frac{1}{2} \theta^2) - 4\theta - 2\theta^2 + \theta + 3\theta^2 + 2 + 6\theta) \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
&= \frac{\kappa}{16} \beta^{-3} (-2 - 3\theta - \theta^2 - 4\theta - 2\theta^2 + \theta + 3\theta^2 + 2 + 6\theta) \\
&= 0,
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
&\nabla_3 J_{1b'} \nabla_3 J_{2b} g^{bb'} \\
&= \nabla_3 J_{13} + \nabla_3 J_{23} g^{33} + \nabla_3 J_{13} + \nabla_3 J_{24} g^{34} + \nabla_3 J_{14} \nabla_3 J_{23} g^{43} + \nabla_3 J_{14} \nabla_3 J_{24} g^{44} \\
&= \left(-\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 - 2\theta)\right) \left(-\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1}\right) (\kappa^{-1} (1 + \theta) \beta^{-1/2}) \\
&\quad + \left(-\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 - 2\theta)\right) \left(\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1}\right) (\theta \kappa^{-1} \beta^{-1/2}) \\
&\quad + \left(-\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} \left(1 + \frac{\theta}{2}\right)\right) \left(-\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1}\right) (\theta \kappa^{-1} \beta^{-1/2}) \\
&\quad + \left(-\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} \left(1 + \frac{\theta}{2}\right)\right) \left(\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1}\right) (\kappa^{-1} \beta^{-1/2}) \\
&= \kappa \beta^{-3} \left(\frac{1}{8} (1 - 2\theta) (1 + \theta) - \frac{1}{16} (1 - 2\theta) \theta + \frac{\theta}{4} \left(1 + \frac{\theta}{2}\right) - \frac{1}{8} \left(1 + \frac{\theta}{2}\right)\right) \\
&= \frac{\kappa}{16} \beta^{-3} (2(1 - 2\theta)(1 + \theta) - \theta(1 - 2\theta) + 4\theta \left(1 + \frac{\theta}{2}\right) - 2 \left(1 + \frac{\theta}{2}\right)) \\
&= \frac{\kappa}{16} \beta^{-3} (2(1 - \theta - 2\theta^2) - \theta + 2\theta^2 + 4\theta + 2\theta^2 - 2 - \theta) \\
&= \frac{\kappa}{4} (2 - 2\theta - 4\theta^2 - \theta + 2\theta^2 + 4\theta + 2\theta^2 - 2 - \theta) \\
&= 0.
\end{aligned}$$

(ii) From

$$\begin{aligned}
&\nabla_3 J_{1b'} \nabla_4 J_{2b} g^{bb'} \\
&= \nabla_3 J_{13} \nabla_4 J_{23} g^{33} + \nabla_3 J_{14} \nabla_4 J_{24} g^{43} + \nabla_3 J_{13} \nabla_4 J_{24} g^{34} + \nabla_3 J_{14} \nabla_4 J_{24} g^{44} \\
&= \left(-\frac{\kappa}{4} (1 - 2\theta)\right) \left(\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1}\right) (\kappa^{-1} (1 + \theta) \beta^{-1}) \\
&\quad + \left(-\frac{\kappa}{2} \left(1 + \frac{\theta}{2}\right)\right) \left(\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1}\right) (\theta \kappa^{-1} \beta^{-1/2}) \\
&\quad + \left(-\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 - 2\theta)\right) \left(\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1}\right) (\theta \kappa^{-1} \beta^{-1/2}) \\
&\quad + \left(-\frac{\kappa}{2} \left(1 + \frac{\theta}{2}\right)\right) \left(\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1}\right) (\kappa^{-1} \beta^{-1/2}) \\
&= \kappa \beta^{-3} \left(1 \frac{1}{16} (1 - 2\theta) (1 + \theta) - \frac{1}{8} (1 + \theta) \theta - \frac{1}{8} \theta (1 - 2\theta) + \frac{1}{4} \left(1 + \frac{\theta}{2}\right)\right) \\
&= -\frac{\kappa}{16} \beta^{-1} ((1 - 2\theta)(1 + \theta) + 2 \left(1 + \frac{\theta}{2}\right) \theta + 2\theta(1 - 2\theta) + 4 \left(1 + \frac{\theta}{2}\right)) \\
&= -\frac{5}{16} \kappa \beta^{-3} (1 + \theta - \theta^2)
\end{aligned}$$

$$= -\frac{5}{16}\kappa\beta^{-2},$$

we get

$$\nabla_3 J_{1b'} \nabla_4 J_{2b} g^{bb'} R_{232}^3 = -\frac{5}{16}\kappa\beta^{-2} \frac{1}{16}\beta^{-2}(9-8\theta) = -\frac{5}{4^4}\kappa\beta^{-4}(9-8\theta).$$

Similarly, from

$$\begin{aligned} & \nabla_4 J_{1b'} \nabla_3 J_{2b} g^{bb'} \\ &= \nabla_4 J_{13} \nabla_3 J_{23} g^{33} + \nabla_4 J_{14} \nabla_3 J_{23} g^{43} + \nabla_4 J_{13} \nabla_3 J_{24} g^{43} + \nabla_4 J_{14} \nabla_3 J_{24} g^{44} \\ &= \left(-\frac{\kappa}{2}\beta^{-3/2}\left(1+\frac{\theta}{2}\right)\right)\left(-\frac{\kappa}{2}\right)(\kappa^{-1}(1+\theta)\beta^{-1/2}) \\ &\quad + \left(\frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-3/2}(1+3\theta)\right)\left(-\frac{\kappa}{2}\beta^{-1}\right)(\theta\kappa^{-1}\beta^{-1/2}) \\ &\quad + \left(-\frac{\kappa}{2}\beta^{-3/2}\left(1+\frac{\theta}{2}\right)\right)\left(\frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-1}\right)(\theta\kappa^{-1}\beta^{-1/2}) \\ &\quad + \left(\frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-3/2}(1+3\theta)\right)\left(\frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-1}\right)(\kappa^{-1}\beta^{-1/2}) \\ &= \kappa\beta^{-3}\left(\frac{1}{4}\left(1+\frac{\theta}{2}\right)(1+\theta) - \frac{1}{8}\theta(1+3\theta) - \frac{1}{8}\left(1+\frac{\theta}{2}\right)\theta + \frac{1}{16}(1+3\theta)\right) \\ &= \frac{\kappa}{16}\beta^{-3}\left(4\left(1+\frac{3}{2}\theta + \frac{1}{2}\theta^2\right) - 2\theta - 6\theta^2 - 2\theta - \theta^2 + 3\theta\right) \\ &= \frac{\kappa}{16}\beta^{-3}(5+5\theta-5\theta^2) \\ &= \frac{5}{16}\kappa\beta^{-2}, \end{aligned}$$

we get

$$\nabla_4 J_{1b'} \nabla_3 J_{2b} g^{bb'} R_{242}^4 = \frac{5}{16}\kappa\beta^{-2}\left(\frac{1}{16}\beta^{-2}(1+8\theta)\right) = \frac{5}{4^4}\kappa\beta^{-4}(1+8\theta).$$

(iii)

$$\begin{aligned} & \nabla_3 J_{1b'} \nabla_4 J_{2b} g^{bb'} R_{232}^3 - \nabla_4 J_{1b'} \nabla_3 J_{2b} g^{bb'} R_{242}^4 \\ &= -\frac{5}{4^4}\kappa\beta^{-4}(9-8\theta) - \frac{5}{4^4}\beta^{-4}(1+8\theta) = \frac{5}{4^4}\kappa\beta(-10\theta) = -\frac{50}{4^4}\kappa\beta^{-4}. \end{aligned}$$

□

Combining (1.10), (1.11), (1.12), we obtain

$$\begin{aligned} S_{2,2} + S_{4,2} &= (S_{2,2} + S_{4,2})(1) + (S_{2,2} + S_{4,2})(2) = 4p^2\left(\frac{5}{4^4}\kappa\beta^{-4}(-10)\right) \\ &= -\frac{25}{16}\kappa\beta^{-4}, \end{aligned}$$

which finishes the proof of Prop. A.11. □

1.8. **The  $p^4$  term in (1.3).** We compute the  $p^4$ -term of  $S$  by the following Proposition, which finishes the proof of (1.3) and hence Theorem 4.1.

**Proposition 1.13.**  $\bar{S}_{[4]} = -\frac{640}{16}\kappa\beta p^4$ .

The proof is a long calculation. We know

$$\bar{S}_{[4]} = S_{0,4} + 2S_{1,4} + 2S_{3,4},$$

where by Lemmas 1.6, 1.7, 1.8, we have

$$(1) \quad S_{0,4} = S_{0,4,1} + S_{0,4,2}, \text{ with}$$

$$S_{0,4,1} = p^4 \sum_{\sigma_0=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \nabla_{a'_1} J_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2} \nabla_{a_1} J_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4} g^{a_1 a'_1},$$

$$\begin{aligned} S_{0,4,2} &= 4p^4 \sum_{\sigma_0=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) R_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2 a_2 b} J_{\sigma_4}{}^b J_{\sigma_3}{}^{a_2} - 4p^4 \sum_{\sigma_0=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) R_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2 a_2}{}^b J_b{}^{a_2} J_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4} \\ &:= S_{0,4,2,1} + S_{0,4,2,2}. \end{aligned}$$

$$(2)$$

$$\begin{aligned} S_{1,4} &= -p^4 \sum_{\sigma_1=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) g^{bb'} \nabla_b J_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2} \nabla_{b'} J_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4} \\ &\quad + 2p^4 \sum_{\sigma_1=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \nabla_{b'} J_{\sigma_1 a_1} \nabla_{\sigma_2} J_{a_2 a'_1} J_{\sigma_4 b} J_{\sigma_3 a'_2} g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a'_2} g^{a_1 a'_1} \\ &\quad - 2p^4 \sum_{\sigma_1=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \nabla_{b'} J_{\sigma_1 a_1} \nabla_{\sigma_2} J_{a_2 a'_1} J_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4} J_{b a'_2} g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a'_2} g^{a_1 a'_1} \\ &:= S_{1,4,1} + S_{1,4,2} + S_{1,4,3}. \end{aligned} \tag{1.13}$$

Check the last term.

$$(3)$$

$$\begin{aligned} S_{3,4} &= 2p^4 \sum_{\sigma_3=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \nabla^b J_{\sigma_1 a_1} \nabla_{\sigma_4} J_b{}^{a_2} J_{\sigma_2 a_2} J_{\sigma_1}{}^{a_1} \\ &\quad - 2p^4 \sum_{\sigma_3=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \nabla^b J_{\sigma_3 a_1} \nabla_{\sigma_4} J_b{}^{a_2} J_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2} J_{a_2}{}^{a_1} \\ &:= S_{3,4,1} + S_{3,4,2}. \end{aligned}$$

These terms are computed as follows.

**Lemma 1.14.**

- (i)  $S_{0,4,1} = 5\kappa\beta^{-2}p^4$ ,  $S_{0,4,2,1} = -10\kappa\beta^{-2}p^4$ ,  $S_{0,4,2,2} = -10\kappa\beta^{-2}p^4$ ;
- (ii)(a)  $S_{1,4,1} = -5\kappa\beta^{-2}p^4$ , (b)  $S_{1,4,2} = -\frac{5}{2}\kappa\beta^{-2}p^4$ , (c)  $S_{1,4,3} = 5\kappa\beta^{-2}p^4$ ;
- (iii)(a)  $S_{3,4,1} = -5\kappa\beta^{-2}p^4$ , (b)  $S_{3,4,2} = -5\kappa\beta^{-2}p^4$ .

Can some of the results in this Lemma be derived from other results in the Lemma by a change of variables?

Assuming the Lemma, we get

$$\begin{aligned}\bar{S}_{[4]} &= (S_{0,4,1} + S_{0,4,2}) + 2(S_{1,4,1} + S_{1,4,2} + S_{1,4,3}) + 2(S_{3,4,1} + S_{3,4,2}) \\ &= -40p^4\kappa\beta^{-2} = -\frac{640}{16}p^4\kappa\beta^{-2},\end{aligned}$$

finishing the proof of Proposition 1.13.

*Proof of Lemma 1.14.* (i) It suffices to prove the last two equalities. For  $S_{0,4,2,1} = p^4 \sum_{\sigma_0=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) R_{\sigma_1\sigma_2a_2b} J_{\sigma_3}^{a_2} J_{\sigma_4}^b$ , the only possible  $\sigma$  have  $(\sigma_1, \sigma_2) \in \{(2, 3), (2, 4), (3, 4)\}$ . This gives

$$\sigma \in \{(123), (1234), (13)(24)\},$$

with signs  $+1, -1, +1$ , respectively. (Associated to e.g.,  $(123)$  is another permissible permutation  $(14)(123) = (1234)$  switching the assignment of 1 and 4, but these permutations give the same contribution to  $S_{0,4,2,1}$ .) Thus, we have

$$\begin{aligned}S_{0,4,2,1} &= 4p^4[4R_{23a_2b}J_1^{a_2}J_4^b - 4R_{24a_2b}J_1^{a_2}J_3^b + 4R_{34a_2b}J_1^{a_2}J_2^b] \\ &= 16p^4[R_{232b}J_4^b - R_{242b}J_3^b + R_{342}^bJ_2^b] \\ &= 16p^4[R_{2323}J_4^3 + R_{232}^4J_4^4 - R_{2423}J_3^3 - R_{2424}J_3^4 + R_{3423}J_2^3 + R_{3434}J_2^4] \\ &= 16p^4[R_{232b}J_4^b - R_{242b}J_3^b + R_{342}^bJ_2^b] \\ &= 16p^4[R_{2323}J_4^3 + R_{232}^4J_4^4 - R_{2423}J_3^3 - R_{2424}J_3^4],\end{aligned}$$

since  $J_2^3 = J_2^4 = 0$ . Therefore,

$$\begin{aligned}S_{0,4,2,1} &= 16p^4 \left[ \frac{\kappa}{16} \beta^{-5/2} (9 - 16\theta + 16\theta^2) (- (1 + \theta) \beta^{-1/2}) \right. \\ &\quad + (-\frac{\kappa}{16} \beta^{-5/2} (-8 + 17\theta + 8\theta^2)) (-\theta \beta^{-1/2}) \\ &\quad - (-\frac{\kappa}{16} \beta^{-5/2} (-8 + 17\theta + 8\theta^2)) (\theta \beta^{-1/2}) \\ &\quad \left. - (\frac{\kappa}{16} (1 + \theta + 24\theta^2) \beta^{-5/2}) (\beta^{-1/2}) \right] \\ &= -10\kappa\beta^{-2}p^4.\end{aligned}$$

For  $S_{0,4,2,2} = -4p^4 \sum_{\sigma_0=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) R_{\sigma_1\sigma_2a_2} J_b^{a_2} J_{\sigma_3\sigma_4}$ , the only possible  $\sigma$  have  $(\sigma_1, \sigma_2) \in \{(2, 3), (2, 4), (3, 4)\}$ . This gives

$$\sigma \in \{(123), (1243), (13)(24)\},$$

with signs  $+1, -1, +1$ , respectively. (As above, each permutation has a partner switching the assignment of 3 and 4.) This gives

$$\begin{aligned}S_{0,4,2,2} &= -4p^4[4R_{23a_2} J_b^{a_2} J_{14} - 4R_{24a_2} J_b^{a_2} J_{13} + 4R_{34a_2} J_b^{a_2} J_{12}] \\ &= -4p^4 \cdot 4R_{34a_2} J_b^{a_2} \\ &= -16p^4[R_{343}^4 J_3^3 + R_{343}^4 J_4^3 + R_{344}^3 J_3^4 + R_{344}^4 J_4^4]\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
&= -16p^4 \left[ \left( -\frac{5}{16} \theta \kappa \beta^{-5/2} \right) (\theta \beta^{-1/2}) + \left( -\frac{5}{16} \kappa \beta^{-5/2} \right) (-(1+\theta) \beta^{-1/2}) \right. \\
&\quad \left. + \left( \frac{5}{16} \kappa (1+\theta) \beta^{-5/2} \right) (\beta^{-1/2}) + \left( \frac{5}{16} \theta \kappa \beta^{-5/2} \right) (-\theta \beta^{-1/2}) \right] \\
&= -16p^4 \left( \frac{5}{16} \kappa \beta^{-3} \right) [-\theta^2 + (1+\theta) + (1+\theta) - \theta^2] \\
&= -10\kappa \beta^{-2} p^4.
\end{aligned}$$

(ii)(a) We have

$$\begin{aligned}
S_{1,4,1} &= -4p^4 (g^{bb'} \nabla_b J_{12} \nabla_{b'} J_{34} - g^{bb'} \nabla_b J_{13} \nabla_{b'} J_{24} + g^{bb'} \nabla_b J_{14} \nabla_{b'} J_{23} - g^{bb'} \nabla_b J_{23} \nabla_{b'} J_{41} \\
&\quad - g^{bb'} \nabla_b J_{24} \nabla_{b'} J_{13} + g^{bb'} \nabla_b J_{34} \nabla_{b'} J_{12}) \\
&= -8p^4 (-g^{bb'} \nabla_b J_{13} \nabla_{b'} J_{24} + g^{bb'} \nabla_b J_{14} \nabla_{b'} J_{23}) \\
&= -8p^4 (-g^{33} \nabla_3 J_{13} \nabla_3 J_{24} - g^{34} \nabla_3 J_{13} \nabla_4 J_{24} - g^{43} \nabla_4 J_{13} \nabla_3 J_{24} - g^{44} \nabla_4 J_{13} \nabla_4 J_{24} \\
&\quad + g^{33} \nabla_3 J_{14} \nabla_3 J_{23} + g^{34} \nabla_3 J_{14} \nabla_4 J_{23} + g^{43} \nabla_4 J_{14} \nabla_3 J_{23} + g^{44} \nabla_4 J_{14} \nabla_4 J_{23}).
\end{aligned}$$

Recall that

$$g^{-1} = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & \frac{(1+\theta)\kappa}{\beta^{1/2}\kappa^2} & \frac{\theta\kappa}{\beta^{1/2}\kappa^2} \\ 0 & 0 & \frac{\theta\kappa}{\beta^{1/2}\kappa^2} & \frac{\kappa}{\beta^{1/2}\kappa^2} \end{pmatrix} \quad (1.14)$$

After plugging in from (1.14) and Lemma 1.4, we find

$$\begin{aligned}
S_{1,4,1} &= -8p^4 \left[ -(\kappa^{-1}(1+\theta)\beta^{-1/2}) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1-2\theta) \left( \frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1} \right) \right. \right. \\
&\quad - (\theta \kappa^{-1} \beta^{-1/2}) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1-2\theta) \right) \left( \frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1} \right) \\
&\quad - (\theta \kappa^{-1} \beta^{-1/2}) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} \left( 1 + \frac{\theta}{2} \right) \right) \left( \frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1} \right) \\
&\quad - (\kappa^{-1} \beta^{-1/2}) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} \left( 1 + \frac{\theta}{2} \right) \right) \left( \frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1} \right) \\
&\quad + (\kappa^{-1} (1+\theta) \beta^{-1/2}) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} \left( 1 + \frac{\theta}{2} \right) \right) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1} \right) \\
&\quad + (\theta \kappa^{-1} \beta^{-1/2}) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} \left( 1 + \frac{\theta}{2} \right) \right) \left( \frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1} \right) \\
&\quad + (\theta \kappa^{-1} \beta^{-1/2}) \left( \frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1+3\theta) \right) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1} \right) \\
&\quad \left. \left. + (\kappa^{-1} \beta^{-1/2}) \left( \frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1+3\theta) \right) \left( \frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1} \right) \right] \right] \\
&= -\frac{8}{16} p^4 \kappa \beta^{-3} [10 + 10\theta - 10\theta^2]
\end{aligned}$$

$$= -5\kappa\beta^{-2}p^4.$$

(ii)(b) For  $S_{1,4,2} = 2p^4 \sum_{\sigma_1=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \nabla_{b'} J_{\sigma_1 a_1} \nabla_{\sigma_2} J_{a_2 a'_1} J_{\sigma_4 b} J_{\sigma_3 a'_2} g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a'_2} g^{a_1 a'_1}$ , we use  $\nabla_1 J_{ab} = \nabla_2 J_{ab} = 0$  to obtain

$$\begin{aligned} S_{1,4,2} &= 2p^4 \sum_{\sigma_1=0, \sigma_2=3} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \nabla_{b'} J_{\sigma_1 a_1} \nabla_3 J_{a_2 a'_1} J_{\sigma_4 b} J_{\sigma_3 a'_2} g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a'_2} g^{a_1 a'_1} \\ &\quad + 2p^4 \sum_{\sigma_1=0, \sigma_2=4} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \nabla_{b'} J_{\sigma_1 a_1} \nabla_4 J_{a_2 a'_1} J_{\sigma_4 b} J_{\sigma_3 a'_2} g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a'_2} g^{a_1 a'_1} \\ &:= S_{1,4,2}(\sigma_2 = 3) + S_{1,4,2}(\sigma_2 = 4). \end{aligned} \quad (1.15)$$

For  $S_{1,4,2}(\sigma_2 = 3)$ , the possible  $\sigma$  are  $\sigma \in \{(243), (24), (1423), (14)(23), (123), (124)\}$ , with signs  $-1, +1, -1, +1, +1, -1$ , respectively. (Here we include all possible  $\sigma$ , not just half of them.) Thus

$$\begin{aligned} S_{1,4,2}(\sigma_2 = 3) &= 2p^4 \left( -\nabla_{b'} J_{1a_1} \nabla_3 J_{1a'_1} J_{43} J_{21} g^{3b'} g^{a_1 a'_1} + \nabla_{b'} J_{2a_1} \nabla_3 J_{2a'_1} J_{43} J_{12} g^{3b'} g^{a_1 a'_1} \right) \\ &= -2p^4 J_{34} J_{12} \left( \nabla_{b'} J_{1a_1} \nabla_3 J_{1a'_1} g^{3b'} g^{a_1 a'_1} + \nabla_{b'} J_{2a_1} \nabla_3 J_{2a'_1} g^{3b'} g^{a_1 a'_1} \right). \end{aligned} \quad (1.16)$$

Similarly, we have

$$\begin{aligned} S_{1,4,2}(\sigma_2 = 4) &= 2p^4 \cdot \left( \nabla_{b'} J_{1a_1} \nabla_4 J_{a_2 a'_1} J_{3b} J_{21} g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a'_2} g^{a_1 a'_1} \right. \\ &\quad - \nabla_{b'} J_{1a_1} \nabla_4 J_{a_2 a'_1} J_{2b} J_{3a'_2} g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a'_2} g^{a_1 a'_1} \\ &\quad (\pm - \text{which?}) \nabla_{b'} J_{3a_1} \nabla_4 J_{a_2 a'_1} J_{2b} J_{2a'_1} g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a'_2} g^{a_1 a'_1} \\ &\quad - \nabla_{b'} J_{3a_1} \nabla_4 J_{a_2 a'_1} J_{1b} J_{2a'_2} g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a'_2} g^{a_1 a'_1} \\ &\quad - \nabla_{b'} J_{2a_1} \nabla_4 J_{a_2 a'_1} J_{3b} J_{1a'_2} g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a'_2} g^{a_1 a'_1} \\ &\quad \left. + \nabla_{b'} J_{2a_1} \nabla_4 J_{a_2 a'_1} J_{1b} J_{3a'_2} g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a'_2} g^{a_1 a'_1} \right) \\ &= -2p^4 J_{34} J_{12} (\nabla_{b'} J_{1a_1} \nabla_4 J_{1a'_1} g^{4b'} g^{a_1 a'_1} + \nabla_{b'} J_{2a_1} \nabla_4 J_{2a'_1} g^{4b'} g^{a_1 a'_1}). \end{aligned} \quad (1.17)$$

Combining (1.15), (1.16), (1.17), we get

$$\begin{aligned} S_{1,4,2} &= -2p^4 J_{34} J_{12} \left( \nabla_{b'} J_{1a_1} \nabla_3 J_{1a'_1} g^{3b'} g^{a_1 a'_1} + \nabla_{b'} J_{2a_1} \nabla_3 J_{2a'_1} g^{3b'} g^{a_1 a'_1} \right. \\ &\quad \left. + \nabla_{b'} J_{1a_1} \nabla_4 J_{1a'_1} g^{4b'} g^{a_1 a'_1} + \nabla_{b'} J_{2a_1} \nabla_4 J_{2a'_1} g^{4b'} g^{a_1 a'_1} \right) \\ &= -2p^4 J_{34} J_{12} \left( g^{33} \nabla_3 J_{1a_1} \nabla_3 J_{1a'_1} g^{a_1 a'_1} + g^{34} \nabla_4 J_{1a_1} \nabla_3 J_{1a'_1} g^{a_1 a'_1} \right. \\ &\quad \left. + g^{33} \nabla_3 J_{2a_1} \nabla_3 J_{2a'_1} g^{a_1 a'_1} + g^{34} \nabla_4 J_{2a_1} \nabla_3 J_{2a'_1} g^{a_1 a'_1} \right) \end{aligned} \quad (1.18)$$

$$\begin{aligned}
& + g^{43} \nabla_3 J_{1a_1} \nabla_4 J_{1a'_1} g^{a_1 a'_1} + g^{44} \nabla_4 J_{1a_1} \nabla_4 J_{1a'_1} g^{a_1 a'_1} \\
& + g^{43} \nabla_3 J_{2a_1} \nabla_4 J_{1a'_1} g^{a_1 a'_1} + g^{44} \nabla_4 J_{2a_1} \nabla_4 J_{2a'_1} g^{a_1 a'_1} \Big) \\
& := -2p^4 J_{34} J_{12} (\langle 1 \rangle + 2\langle 2 \rangle + 2\langle 3 \rangle + \langle 4 \rangle + \langle 5 \rangle + \langle 6 \rangle)
\end{aligned}$$

where

$$\begin{aligned}
\langle 1 \rangle &= g^{33} \nabla_3 J_{1a_1} \nabla_3 J_{1a'_1} g^{a_1 a'_1}, \quad \langle 2 \rangle = g^{34} \nabla_4 J_{1a_1} \nabla_3 J_{1a'_1} g^{a_1 a'_1}, \\
\langle 3 \rangle &= g^{34} \nabla_4 J_{2a_1} \nabla_3 J_{2a'_1} g^{a_1 a'_1}, \quad \langle 4 \rangle = g^{33} \nabla_3 J_{2a_1} \nabla_3 J_{2a'_1} g^{a_1 a'_1}, \\
\langle 5 \rangle &= g^{44} \nabla_4 J_{1a_1} \nabla_4 J_{1a'_1} g^{a_1 a'_1}, \quad \langle 6 \rangle = g^{44} \nabla_4 J_{2a_1} \nabla_4 J_{2a'_1} g^{a_1 a'_1}.
\end{aligned}$$

We claim that

**Claim 1.15.**

$$\begin{aligned}
\langle 1 \rangle &= \frac{5}{16} (1 + \theta) \beta^{-3}, \quad \langle 2 \rangle = -\frac{5}{16} \theta^2 \beta^{-3}, \quad \langle 3 \rangle = -\frac{5}{16} \theta^2 \beta^{-3}, \\
\langle 4 \rangle &= \frac{5}{16} (1 + \theta) \beta^{-3}, \quad \langle 5 \rangle = \frac{5}{16} (1 + \theta) \beta^{-3}, \quad \langle 6 \rangle = \frac{5}{16} (1 + \theta) \beta^{-3}.
\end{aligned} \tag{1.19}$$

Assume the claim. Plugging (1.19) into (1.18) and using (1.2) for  $J_{34}$ ,  $J_{12}$ , we obtain

$$\begin{aligned}
S_{1,4,2} &= -2p^4 J_{34} J_{12} \left( \frac{5}{16} (1 + \theta) \beta^{-3} + 2 \left( -\frac{5}{16} \theta^2 \beta^{-3} \right) + 2 \left( -\frac{5}{16} \theta^2 \beta^{-3} \right) + \frac{5}{16} (1 + \theta) \beta^{-3} \right. \\
&\quad \left. + \frac{5}{16} (1 + \theta) \beta^{-3} + \frac{5}{16} (1 + \theta) \beta^{-3} \right) \\
&= -\frac{5}{2} p^4 \beta^{-2} \kappa.
\end{aligned}$$

We now prove Claim 1.15, which will finish (ii)(b).

*Proof of Claim 1.15.* The proofs are all direct calculations.

$$\begin{aligned}
\langle 1 \rangle &= g^{33} \nabla_3 J_{1a_1} \nabla_3 J_{1a'_1} g^{a_1 a'_1} \\
&= g^{33} (\nabla_3 J_{13} \nabla_3 J_{13} g^{33} + \nabla_3 J_{13} \nabla_3 J_{14} g^{34} + \nabla_3 J_{14} \nabla_3 J_{13} g^{43} + \nabla_3 J_{14} \nabla_3 J_{14} g^{44}) \\
&= g^{33} (\nabla_3 J_{13} \nabla_3 J_{13} g^{33} + 2 \nabla_3 J_{13} \nabla_3 J_{14} g^{34} + \nabla_3 J_{14} \nabla_3 J_{14} g^{44}) \\
&= \kappa (1 + \theta) \beta^{-1/2} \left( \kappa^{-1} (1 + \theta) \beta^{-1/2} \left( -\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 - 2\theta) \right) \right. \\
&\quad \left. + 2\theta \kappa^{-1} \beta^{-1/2} \left( -\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} \left( 1 + \frac{\theta}{2} \right) \right) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} \left( 1 + \frac{\theta}{2} \right) \right) \right. \\
&\quad \left. + \kappa^{-1} \beta^{-1/2} \left( -\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} \left( 1 + \frac{\theta}{2} \right) \right) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} \left( 1 + \frac{\theta}{2} \right) \right) \right) \\
&= \frac{5}{16} \beta^{-3} (1 + \theta).
\end{aligned}$$



$$\begin{aligned}
\langle 2 \rangle &= g^{34} \nabla_4 J_{1a_1} \nabla_3 J_{1a'_1} g^{a_1 a'_1} \\
&= g^{34} (\nabla_4 J_{13} \nabla_3 J_{13} g^{33} + \nabla_4 J_{13} \nabla_3 J_{14} g^{34} + \nabla_4 J_{14} \nabla_3 J_{13} g^{43} + \nabla_4 J_{14} \nabla_3 J_{14} g^{44}) \\
&= g^{34} \left( \left( -\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} \left( 1 + \frac{\theta}{2} \right) \right) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 - 2\theta) \right) (\kappa^{-1} (1 + \theta) \beta^{-1/2}) \right. \\
&\quad + \left( -\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} \left( 1 + \frac{\theta}{2} \right) \right) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} \left( 1 + \frac{\theta}{2} \right) \right) (\kappa^{-1} \theta \beta^{-1/2}) \\
&\quad + \left( \frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 + 3\theta) \right) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 - 2\theta) \right) (\kappa^{-1} \theta \beta^{-1/2}) \\
&\quad \left. + \left( \frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 + 3\theta) \right) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} \left( 1 + \frac{\theta}{2} \right) \right) (\kappa^{-1} \beta^{-1/2}) \right) \\
&= -\frac{5}{16} \theta^2 \beta^{-3},
\end{aligned}$$

where the last line follows from (1.14) and a direct calculation.

$$\begin{aligned}
\langle 3 \rangle &= g^{34} \nabla_4 J_{2a_1} \nabla_3 J_{2a'_1} g^{a_1 a'_1} \\
&= g^{34} \left( \nabla_4 J_{23} \nabla_3 J_{23} g^{33} + \nabla_4 J_{23} \nabla_3 J_{24} g^{34} + \nabla_4 J_{24} \nabla_3 J_{23} g^{43} + \nabla_4 J_{24} \nabla_3 J_{24} g^{44} \right) \\
&= g^{34} \left( \left( \frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1} \right) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1} \right) (\kappa^{-1} (1 + \theta) \beta^{-1/2}) + \left( \frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1} \right) \left( \frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1} \right) (\kappa^{-1} \theta \beta^{-1/2}) \right. \\
&\quad \left. + \left( \frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1} \right) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1/2} \right) + \left( \frac{\kappa}{2} \right) \left( \frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1} \right) (\kappa^{-1} \beta^{-1/2}) \right) \\
&= -\frac{5}{16} \theta^2 \beta^{-3}.
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
\langle 4 \rangle &= g^{33} \nabla_3 J_{2a_1} \nabla_3 J_{2a'_1} g^{a_1 a'_1} \\
&= g^{33} (\nabla_3 J_{23} \nabla_3 J_{23} g^{33} + \nabla_3 J_{23} \nabla_3 J_{24} g^{34} + \nabla_3 J_{24} \nabla_3 J_{23} g^{43} + \nabla_3 J_{24} \nabla_3 J_{24} g^{44}) \\
&= g^{33} \left( \left( -\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1} \right) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1} \right) (\kappa^{-1} (1 + \theta) \beta^{-1/2}) + \left( -\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1} \right) \left( \frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1} \right) (\theta \kappa^{-1} \beta^{-1/2}) \right. \\
&\quad \left. + \left( \frac{\kappa}{4} \right) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1} \right) (\theta \kappa^{-1} \beta^{-1/2}) + \left( \frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1} \right) \left( \frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1} \right) (\kappa^{-1} \beta^{-1}) \right) \\
&= \frac{5}{16} (1 + \theta) \beta^{-3}.
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
\langle 5 \rangle &= g^{44} \nabla_4 J_{1a_1} \nabla_4 J_{1a'_1} g^{a_1 a'_1} \\
&= g^{44} (\nabla_4 J_{13} \nabla_4 J_{13} g^{33} + \nabla_4 J_{13} \nabla_4 J_{14} g^{34} + \nabla_4 J_{14} \nabla_4 J_{13} g^{43} + \nabla_4 J_{14} \nabla_4 J_{14} g^{44})
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
&= g^{44} \left( \left( -\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} \left( 1 + \frac{\theta}{2} \right) \right) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} \left( 1 + \frac{\theta}{2} \right) (\kappa^{-1} (1 + \theta) \beta^{-1/2}) \right) \right. \\
&\quad + \left( -\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} \left( 1 + \frac{\theta}{2} \right) \right) \left( \frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 + 3\theta) \right) (\kappa^{-1} \theta \beta^{-1/2}) \\
&\quad + \left( \frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 + 3\theta) \right) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} \left( 1 + \frac{\theta}{2} \right) (\kappa^{-1} \theta \beta^{-1/2}) \right) \\
&\quad \left. + \left( \frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 + 3\theta) \right) \left( \frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 + 3\theta) \right) (\kappa^{-1} \beta^{-1/2}) \right) \\
&= g^{44} \kappa \beta^{-7/2} \left( \frac{1}{4} \left( 1 + \frac{\theta}{2} \right) \left( 1 + \frac{\theta}{2} \right) (1 + \theta) - \frac{1}{8} \left( 1 + \frac{\theta}{2} \right) (1 + 3\theta) \theta \right. \\
&\quad \left. - \frac{1}{8} (1 + 3\theta) \left( 1 + \frac{\theta}{2} \right) \theta + \frac{1}{16} (1 + 3\theta) (1 + 3\theta) \right) \\
&= \frac{1}{16} g^{44} \kappa \beta^{-7/2} \left( 4 \left( 1 + \frac{\theta}{2} \right) \left( 1 + \frac{\theta}{2} \right) (1 + \theta) - 2 \left( 1 + \frac{\theta}{2} \right) (1 + 3\theta) \theta \right. \\
&\quad \left. - 2 (1 + 3\theta) \left( 1 + \frac{\theta}{2} \right) \theta + (1 + 3\theta) (1 + 3\theta) \right) \\
&= \frac{5}{16} (1 + \theta) \beta^{-3},
\end{aligned}$$

after some calculation.

$$\begin{aligned}
\langle 6 \rangle &= g^{44} \nabla_4 J_{2a_1} \nabla_4 J_{2a'_1} g^{a_1 a'_1} \\
&= g^{44} (\nabla_4 J_{23} \nabla_4 J_{23} g^{33} + \nabla_4 J_{23} \nabla_4 J_{24} g^{34} + \nabla_4 J_{24} \nabla_4 J_{23} g^{43} + \nabla_4 J_{24} \nabla_4 J_{24} g^{44}) \\
&= \frac{5}{16} (1 + \theta) \beta^{-3}.
\end{aligned}$$

□

(ii)(c) We have

$$S_{1,4,3} = -2p^4 \sum_{\sigma_1=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \nabla_{b'} J_{\sigma_1 a_1} \nabla_{\sigma_2} J_{a_2 a'_1} J_{\sigma_3 \sigma_4} J_{ba'_2} g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a'_2} g^{a_1 a'_1}. \quad (1.20)$$

If  $(\sigma_1, \sigma_2)$  equals  $(1, 2)$  or  $(2, 1)$ , then  $\nabla_1 J = \nabla_2 J = 0$  implies that the summand in (1.20) vanishes. Thus,  $(\sigma_3, \sigma_4) \in \{(1, 2), (2, 1)\}$ , so

$$\sigma \in \{(13)(24), (1324), (1423), (14)(23)\},$$

with signs  $+1, -1, -1, +1$ , respectively. Thus by an easy symmetry argument,

$$\begin{aligned}
S_{1,4,3} &= -4p^4 (\nabla_{b'} J_{3a_1} \nabla_4 J_{a_2 a'_1} J_{ba'_2} g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a'_2} g^{a_1 a'_1} - \nabla_{b'} J_{4a_1} \nabla_3 J_{a_2 a'_1} J_{ba'_2} g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a'_2} g^{a_1 a'_1}) \\
&\quad - 4p^4 (\nabla_{b'} J_{31} \nabla_4 J_{a_2 a'_1} J_{ba'_2} g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a'_2} g^{a'_1 1} + \nabla_{b'} J_{32} \nabla_4 J_{a_2 a'_1} J_{ba'_2} g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a'_2} g^{a'_1 1})
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
& -\nabla_{b'} J_{41} \nabla_3 J_{a_2 a'_1} J_{ba'_2} g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a'_2} g^{a'_1 1} - \nabla_{b'} J_{42} \nabla_3 J_{a_2 a'_1} J_{ba'_2} g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a'_2} g^{a'_1 1}) \\
& = -4p^2 (\nabla_{b'} J_{31} \nabla_4 J_{31} J_{ba'_2} g^{bb'} g^{3a'_2} + \nabla_{b'} J_{31} \nabla_4 J_{41} J_{ba'_2} g^{bb'} g^{4a'_2} + \nabla_{b'} J_{32} \nabla_4 J_{32} J_{ba'_2} g^{bb'} g^{3a'_2} \\
& \quad + \nabla_{b'} J_{32} \nabla_4 J_{42} J_{ba'_2} g^{bb'} g^{4a'_2} - \nabla_{b'} J_{41} \nabla_3 J_{31} J_{ba'_2} g^{bb'} g^{a'_2 3} - \nabla_{b'} J_{41} \nabla_3 J_{41} J_{ba'_2} g^{bb'} g^{a'_2 4} \\
& \quad - \nabla_{b'} J_{42} \nabla_3 J_{32} J_{ba'_2} g^{bb'} g^{a'_2 3} - \nabla_{b'} J_{42} \nabla_3 J_{42} J_{ba'_2} g^{bb'} g^{a'_2 4}) \\
& = -4p^4 (\nabla_3 J_{31} \nabla_4 J_{31} J_{ba'_2} g^{b3} g^{3a'_2} + \nabla_4 J_{31} \nabla_4 J_{31} J_{ba'_2} g^{b4} g^{3a'_2} + \nabla_3 J_{31} \nabla_4 J_{41} J_{ba'_2} g^{b3} g^{4a'_2} \\
& \quad + \nabla_4 J_{31} \nabla_4 J_{41} J_{ba'_2} g^{b4} g^{4a'_2} + \nabla_3 J_{32} \nabla_4 J_{32} J_{ba'_2} g^{b3} g^{3a'_2} + \nabla_4 J_{32} \nabla_4 J_{32} J_{ba'_2} g^{b4} g^{3a'_2} \\
& \quad + \nabla_3 J_{32} \nabla_4 J_{42} J_{ba'_2} g^{b3} g^{4a'_2} + \nabla_4 J_{32} \nabla_4 J_{42} J_{ba'_2} g^{b4} g^{4a'_2} - \nabla_3 J_{41} \nabla_3 J_{31} J_{ba'_2} g^{b3} g^{a'_2 3} \\
& \quad - \nabla_4 J_{41} \nabla_3 J_{31} J_{ba'_2} g^{b4} g^{a'_2 3} - \nabla_3 J_{41} \nabla_3 J_{41} J_{ba'_2} g^{b3} g^{a'_2 4} - \nabla_4 J_{41} \nabla_3 J_{41} J_{ba'_2} g^{b4} g^{a'_2 4} \\
& \quad - \nabla_3 J_{42} \nabla_3 J_{32} J_{ba'_2} g^{b3} g^{a'_2 3} - \nabla_4 J_{42} \nabla_3 J_{32} J_{ba'_2} g^{b4} g^{a'_2 3} - \nabla_3 J_{42} \nabla_3 J_{42} J_{ba'_2} g^{b3} g^{a'_2 4} \\
& \quad - \nabla_4 J_{42} \nabla_3 J_{42} J_{ba'_2} g^{b4} g^{a'_2 4}) .
\end{aligned}$$

Note that

$$\begin{aligned}
J_{ba'_2} g^{b3} g^{3a'_2} &= J_{34} g^{33} g^{34} + J_{43} g^{43} g^{33} = 0, \quad J_{ba'_2} g^{b4} g^{4a'_2} = J_{34} g^{34} g^{44} + J_{43} g^{44} g^{43} = 0, \\
J_{ba'_2} g^{b4} g^{3a'_2} &= J_{34} g^{34} g^{34} - J_{43} g^{44} g^{33} = J_{34} ((g^{34})^2 - g^{44} g^{33}) \\
&= -\kappa^{-2} J_{34} = -\kappa^{-1}, \\
J_{ba'_2} g^{b3} g^{4a'_2} &= \kappa^{-2} J_{34} = \kappa^{-1}.
\end{aligned}$$

This gives

$$\begin{aligned}
S_{1,4,3} &= -4p^2 (-\kappa^{-2} \nabla_4 J_{31} \nabla_4 J_{31} + \kappa^{-2} \nabla_3 J_{31} \nabla_4 J_{41} - \kappa^{-2} \nabla_4 J_{32} \nabla_4 J_{32} \\
& \quad + \kappa^{-2} \nabla_3 J_{32} \nabla_4 J_{42} + \kappa^{-2} \nabla_4 J_{41} \nabla_3 J_{31} - \kappa^{-2} \nabla_3 J_{41} \nabla_3 J_{41} \\
& \quad + \kappa^{-2} \nabla_4 J_{42} \nabla_3 J_{32} - \kappa^{-2} \nabla_3 J_{42} \nabla_3 J_{42}) \\
&= -4p^2 \kappa^{-1} \left( -\left(\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} (1 + \frac{\theta}{2})\right) \left(\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} (1 + \frac{\theta}{2})\right) \right. \\
& \quad + \left(\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 - 2\theta)\right) \left(-\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 + 3\theta)\right) - \left(-\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1}\right) \left(-\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1}\right) \\
& \quad + \left(\frac{\kappa}{2}\right) \left(-\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1}\right) + \left(-\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 + 3\theta)\right) \left(\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 - 2\theta)\right) \\
& \quad - \left(\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} (1 + \frac{\theta}{2})\right) \left(\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} (1 + \frac{\theta}{2})\right) + \left(-\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1}\right) \left(\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1}\right) \\
& \quad \left. - \left(-\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1}\right) \left(-\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1}\right) \right) \\
&= 5p^4 \beta^{-2} \kappa.
\end{aligned}$$

(iii)(a) We compute  $S_{3,4,1}$  as follows:

$$\begin{aligned}
S_{3,4,1} &= 2p^4 \sum_{\sigma_3=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \nabla_b J_{\sigma_3 a_1} \nabla_{\sigma_4} J_{b' a_2} J_{\sigma_2 a_2} J_{\sigma_1 a'_1} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 a'_1} g^{a_2 a'_2} \\
&= 2p^4 \sum_{\sigma_3=0, \sigma_4=3} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \nabla_b J_{\sigma_3 a_1} \nabla_3 J_{b' a'_2} J_{\sigma_2 a_2} J_{\sigma_1 a'_1} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 a'_1} g^{a_2 a'_2} \\
&\quad + 2p^4 \sum_{\sigma_3=0, \sigma_4=4} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \nabla_b J_{\sigma_3 a_1} \nabla_4 J_{b' a'_2} J_{\sigma_2 a_2} J_{\sigma_1 a'_1} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 a'_1} g^{a_2 a'_2} \\
&:= S_{3,4,1}(\sigma_4 = 3) + S_{3,4,1}(\sigma_4 = 4).
\end{aligned}$$

For  $S_{3,4,1}(\sigma_4 = 3)$ , the possible  $\sigma$  are  $\sigma \in \{(34), (12)(34), (1432), (243), (143), (1243)\}$ , with signs  $-1, +1, -1, +1, +1, -1$ , respectively. Thus

$$\begin{aligned}
&S_{3,4,1}(\sigma_4 = 3) \\
&= 2p^4 \left( -\nabla_b J_{4a'_1} \nabla_3 J_{b' a'_2} J_{1a_2} J_{1a_1} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 a'_1} g^{a_2 a'_2} + \nabla_b J_{4a'_1} \nabla_3 J_{b' a'_2} J_{1a_2} J_{2a_1} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 a'_1} g^{a_2 a'_2} \right. \\
&\quad - \nabla_b J_{2a'_1} \nabla_3 J_{b' a'_2} J_{1a_2} J_{4a_1} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 a'_1} g^{a_2 a'_2} + \nabla_b J_{2a'_1} \nabla_3 J_{b' a'_2} J_{4a_2} J_{1a_1} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 a'_1} g^{a_2 a'_2} \\
&\quad \left. + \nabla_b J_{1a'_1} \nabla_3 J_{b' a'_2} J_{2a_2} J_{4a_1} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 a'_1} g^{a_2 a'_2} - \nabla_b J_{1a'_1} \nabla_3 J_{b' a'_2} J_{4a_2} J_{2a_1} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 a'_1} g^{a_2 a'_2} \right).
\end{aligned}$$

From  $\nabla_1 J_{ab} = \nabla_2 J_{ab} = 0$ , we conclude

$$\nabla_b J_{2a'_1} \nabla_3 J_{b' a'_2} J_{4a_2} J_{1a_1} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 a'_1} g^{a_2 a'_2} = 0, \quad \nabla_b J_{1a'_1} \nabla_3 J_{b' a'_2} J_{4a_2} J_{2a_1} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 a'_1} g^{a_2 a'_2} = 0.$$

Therefore,

$$\begin{aligned}
&S_{3,4,1}(\sigma_4 = 3) \\
&= 2p^4 \left( -\nabla_b J_{42} \nabla_3 J_{b'1} J_{21} J_{12} g^{bb'} g^{22} g^{11} - \nabla_b J_{42} \nabla_3 J_{b'1} J_{21} J_{12} g^{bb'} g^{22} g^{11} \right. \\
&\quad \left. - \nabla_b J_{42} \nabla_3 J_{b'1} J_{21} J_{12} g^{bb'} g^{22} g^{11} - \nabla_b J_{42} \nabla_3 J_{b'1} J_{21} J_{12} g^{bb'} g^{22} g^{11} \right) \\
&:= 2p^4 \left( \langle\langle 1 \rangle\rangle + \langle\langle 2 \rangle\rangle + \langle\langle 3 \rangle\rangle + \langle\langle 4 \rangle\rangle \right).
\end{aligned}$$

Similarly, for  $S_{3,4,1}(\sigma_4 = 4)$ , we have  $\sigma \in \{\text{id}, (12), (123), (13), (23), (132)\}$ , with signs  $+1, -1, +1, -1, -1, +1$ , respectively. Thus

$$\begin{aligned}
&S_{3,4,1}(\sigma_4 = 4) \\
&= 2p^4 \left( \nabla_b J_{3a_1} \nabla_4 J_{b' a'_2} J_{2a_1} J_{1a'_1} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 a'_1} g^{a_2 a'_2} - \nabla_b J_{3a_1} \nabla_4 J_{b' a'_2} J_{1a_2} J_{2a'_1} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 a'_1} g^{a_2 a'_2} \right. \\
&\quad \left. + \nabla_b J_{1a_1} \nabla_4 J_{b' a'_2} J_{3a_2} J_{2a'_1} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 a'_1} g^{a_2 a'_2} - \nabla_b J_{1a_1} \nabla_4 J_{b' a'_2} J_{2a_2} J_{3a'_1} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 a'_1} g^{a_2 a'_2} \right)
\end{aligned}$$

$$- \nabla_b J_{2a_1} \nabla_4 J_{b'a'_2} J_{3a_2} J_{1a'_1} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 a'_1} g^{a_2 a'_2} + \nabla_b J_{2a_1} \nabla_4 J_{b'a'_2} J_{1a_2} J_{3a'_1} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 a'_1} g^{a_2 a'_2} \Big)$$

Using  $\nabla_b J_{11} = \nabla_b J_{22} = 0$ , we obtain

$$\nabla_b J_{1a_1} \nabla_4 J_{b'a'_2} J_{3a_2} J_{2a'_1} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 a'_1} g^{a_2 a'_2} = 0, \quad \nabla_b J_{2a_1} \nabla_4 J_{b'a'_2} J_{3a_2} J_{1a'_1} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 a'_1} g^{a_2 a'_2} = 0.$$

Therefore,

$$\begin{aligned} & S_{3,4,1}(\sigma_4 = 4) \\ &= 2p^4 \left( \nabla_b J_{32} \nabla_4 b'1 J_{21} J_{12} g^{bb'} g^{22} g^{11} - \nabla_b J_{31} \nabla_4 b'2 J_{12} J_{21} g^{bb'} g^{11} g^{22} \right. \\ &\quad \left. - \nabla_b J_{1a_1} \nabla_4 b'1 J_{21} J_{34} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 4} g^{11} + \nabla_b J_{2a_1} \nabla_4 b'2 J_{12} J_{34} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 4} g^{22} \right) \\ &:= 2p^4 \left( \langle\langle 5 \rangle\rangle + \langle\langle 6 \rangle\rangle + \langle\langle 7 \rangle\rangle + \langle\langle 8 \rangle\rangle \right). \end{aligned}$$

We now compute  $\langle\langle 1 \rangle\rangle - \langle\langle 8 \rangle\rangle$ .

$$\begin{aligned} & \langle\langle 1 \rangle\rangle \\ &= (J_{12})^2 \nabla_b J_{42} \nabla_3 J_{b'} g^{bb'} \\ &= (J_{12})^2 (\nabla_3 J_{42} \nabla_3 J_{31} g^{33} + \nabla_3 J_{42} \nabla_3 J_{41} g^{34} \nabla_4 J_{42} \nabla_3 J_{31} g^{43} + \nabla_4 J_{42} \nabla_3 J_{41} g^{44}) \\ &= \left(-\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1}\right) \left(\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 - 2\theta)\right) (\kappa^{-1} (1 + \theta) \beta^{-1/2}) \\ &\quad + \left(-\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1}\right) \left(\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} \left(1 + \frac{\theta}{2}\right)\right) (\theta \kappa^{-1} \beta^{-1/2}) \\ &\quad + \left(-\frac{1}{2} \kappa \beta^{-1}\right) \left(\frac{1}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 - 2\theta)\right) (\theta \kappa^{-1} \beta^{-1/2}) \\ &\quad + \left(-\frac{1}{2} \kappa \beta^{-1}\right) \left(\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} \left(1 + \frac{\theta}{2}\right)\right) (\kappa^{-1} \beta^{-1/2}) \\ &= -\frac{5}{16} \kappa \beta^{-2}. \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & \langle\langle 2 \rangle\rangle \\ &= \nabla_b J_{41} \nabla_3 J_{b'2} (-J_{12})^2 g^{bb'} \\ &= -(J_{12})^2 \left( \nabla_3 J_{41} \nabla_3 J_{32} g^{33} + \nabla_4 J_{41} \nabla_3 J_{42} g^{34} + \nabla_4 J_{41} \nabla_3 J_{32} g^{43} + \nabla_4 J_{41} \nabla_3 J_{42} g^{44} \right) \\ &= (-1) \left(\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} \left(1 + \frac{\theta}{2}\right)\right) \left(\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1}\right) (\kappa^{-1} (1 + \theta) \beta^{-1/2}) \\ &\quad + \left(\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} \left(1 + \frac{\theta}{2}\right)\right) \left(-\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1}\right) (\kappa^{-1} \theta \beta^{-1/2}) \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
& + \left(-\frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-3/2}(1+3\theta)\right)\left(\frac{\kappa}{2}\beta^{-1}\right)(\kappa^{-1}\theta\beta^{-1/2}) \\
& + \left(-\frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-3/2}(1+3\theta)\right)\left(-\frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-1}\right)(\kappa^{-1}\beta^{-1/2}) \\
& = -\frac{5}{16}\kappa\beta^{-2}.
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
& \langle\langle 3 \rangle\rangle \\
& = -\nabla_b J_{2a'_1} \nabla_3 J_{b'2} J_{12} J_{43} g^{a'_1 3} g^{bb'} \\
& = (-\kappa)(-1)(g^{33} \nabla_b J_{23} \nabla_3 J_{b'2} g^{bb'} + g^{34} \nabla_b J_{24} \nabla_3 J_{b'2} g^{bb'}) \\
& = \kappa \left( g^{33} (\nabla_3 J_{23} \nabla_3 J_{32} g^{33} + \nabla_3 J_{23} \nabla_3 J_{42} g^{34} + \nabla_4 J_{23} \nabla_3 J_{32} g^{43} + \nabla_4 J_{23} \nabla_3 J_{42} g^{44}) \right. \\
& \quad \left. + g^{34} (\nabla_3 J_{24} \nabla_3 J_{32} g^{33} \nabla_3 J_{24} \nabla_3 J_{42} g^{34} + \nabla_4 J_{24} \nabla_3 J_{32} g^{43} + \nabla_4 J_{24} \nabla_3 J_{42} g^{44}) \right) \\
& = \kappa \left[ \kappa^{-1}(1+\theta)\beta^{-1/2} \left( \left(-\frac{1}{2}\kappa\beta^{-1}\right)\left(\frac{\kappa}{2}\beta^{-1}\right)(\kappa^{-1}(1+\theta)\beta^{-1/2}) \right. \right. \\
& \quad \left. \left. + \left(-\frac{\kappa}{2}\beta^{-1}\right)\left(-\frac{1}{4}\beta^{-1}\right)(\kappa^{-1}\theta\beta^{-1}) + \left(\frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-1}\right)\left(\frac{\kappa}{2}\beta^{-1}\right)(\kappa^{-1}\theta\beta^{-1}) \right. \right. \\
& \quad \left. \left. + \left(\frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-1}\right)\left(-\frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-1}\right)(\kappa^{-1}\beta^{-1}) \right) \right] \\
& \quad + \kappa\theta\beta^{-1/2} \left[ \left(\frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-1}\right)\left(\frac{\kappa}{2}\beta^{-1}\right)(\kappa^{-1}(1+\theta)\beta^{-1/2}) + \left(\frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-1}\right)\left(-\frac{1}{4}\beta^{-1}\right)(\kappa^{-1}\theta\beta^{-1/2}) \right. \\
& \quad \left. + \left(\frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-1}\right)\left(\frac{\kappa}{2}\beta^{-1}\right)(\kappa^{-1}\theta\beta^{-1/2}) + \left(\frac{\kappa}{2}\beta^{-1}\right)\left(-\frac{1}{4}\beta^{-1}\right)(\kappa^{-1}\beta^{-1/2}) \right] \\
& = -\frac{5}{16}\kappa\beta^{-2}.
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
& \langle\langle 4 \rangle\rangle \\
& = -\nabla_b J_{42} \nabla_3 J_{b'1} J_{21} J_{12} g^{bb'} g^{22} g^{11} \\
& = \kappa \left[ \kappa^{-1}(1+\theta)\beta^{-1/2} \left( \left(-\frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-3/2}(1-2\theta)\right)\left(\frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-3/2}(1-2\theta)\right)(\kappa^{-1}(1+\theta)\beta^{-1/2}) \right. \right. \\
& \quad \left. \left. + \left(-\frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-3/2}(1-2\theta)\right)\left(\frac{\kappa}{2}\beta^{-3/2}(1+\frac{\theta}{2})\right)(\kappa^{-1}\theta\beta^{-1/2}) \right. \right. \\
& \quad \left. \left. + \left(-\frac{\kappa}{2}\beta^{-3/2}(1+\frac{\theta}{2})\right)\left(\frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-3/2}(1-2\theta)\right)(\kappa^{-1}\theta\beta^{-1/2}) \right. \right. \\
& \quad \left. \left. + (\kappa^{-1}\theta\beta^{-1/2})\left(-\frac{\kappa}{2}\beta^{-3/2}(1+\frac{\theta}{2})\right)\left(\frac{\kappa}{4}(1-2\theta)\right)(\kappa^{-1}(1+\theta)\beta^{-1/2}) \right) \right]
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
& + \left( -\frac{\kappa}{2}\beta^{-3/2}(1 + \frac{1}{2}\theta) \right) \left( \frac{\kappa}{2}\beta^{-3/2}(1 + \frac{1}{2}\theta) \right) (\kappa^{-1}\theta\beta^{-1/2}) \\
& + \left( \frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-3/2}(1 + 3\theta) \right) \left( \frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-3/2}(1 - 2\theta) \right) (\kappa^{-1}\theta\beta^{-1/2}) \\
& + \left( \frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-3/2}(1 + 3\theta) \right) \left( \frac{\kappa}{2}\beta^{-3/2}(1 + \frac{1}{2}\theta) \right) (\kappa^{-1}\beta^{-1/2}) \Bigg] \\
& = -\frac{5}{16}\kappa\beta^{-2}.
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
& \langle\langle 5 \rangle\rangle \\
& = \nabla_b J_{32} \nabla_4 J_{b'1} (-(J_{12})^2) g^{bb'} = -1 \nabla_b J_{32} \nabla_4 J_{b'1} g^{bb'} \\
& = -(\nabla_3 J_{32} \nabla_4 J_{31} g^{33} + \nabla_3 J_{32} \nabla_4 J_{41} g^{34} + \nabla_4 J_{32} \nabla_4 J_{31} g^{43} + \nabla_4 J_{32} \nabla_4 J_{41} g^{44}) \\
& = -\left( \frac{\kappa}{2}\beta^{-1} \right) \left( \frac{\kappa}{2}\beta^{-3/2}(1 + \frac{1}{2}\theta) \right) (\kappa^{-1}(1 + \theta)\beta^{-1/2}) \\
& \quad - \left( \frac{\kappa}{2}\beta^{-1} \right) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-3/2}(1 + 3\theta) \right) (\theta\kappa^{-1}\beta^{-1/2}) \\
& \quad - \left( -\frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-1} \right) \left( \frac{\kappa}{2}\beta^{-3/2}(1 + \frac{1}{2}\theta) \right) (\theta\kappa^{-1}\beta^{-1/2}) \\
& \quad - \left( -\frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-1} \right) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-3/2}(1 + 3\theta) \right) (\kappa^{-1}\beta^{-1/2}) \\
& = -\kappa\beta^{-3} \left( \frac{1}{4}(1 + \frac{1}{2}\theta)(1 + \theta) - \frac{1}{8}\theta(1 + 3\theta) - \frac{1}{8}(1 + \frac{1}{2}\theta)\theta + \frac{1}{16}(1 + 3\theta) \right) \\
& = -\frac{\kappa}{16}(4 + 6\theta; 2\theta^2 - 2\theta - 6\theta^2 - 2\theta - \theta^2 + 1 + 3\theta) \\
& = -\frac{1}{16}\kappa\beta^{-3}(5 + 5\theta - 5\theta^2) \\
& = -\frac{5}{16}\kappa\beta^{-2}.
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
& \langle\langle 6 \rangle\rangle \\
& = -\nabla_b J_{31} \nabla_4 J_{b'2} (-(J_{12})^2) g^{bb'} = \nabla_b J_{31} \nabla_4 J_{b'2} g^{bb'} \\
& = \nabla_3 J_{31} \nabla_4 J_{32} g^{33} + \nabla_3 J_{31} \nabla_4 J_{42} g^{34} + \nabla_4 J_{31} \nabla_4 J_{32} g^{43} + \nabla_4 J_{31} \nabla_4 J_{42} g^{44} \\
& = \left( \frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-3/2}(1 - 2\theta) \right) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-1} \right) (\kappa^{-1}(1 + \theta)\beta^{-1/2}) \\
& \quad + \left( \frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-3/2}(1 - 2\theta) \right) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{2}\beta^{-1} \right) (\kappa^{-1}\theta\beta^{-1/2}) \\
& \quad + \left( \frac{\kappa}{2}\beta^{-3/2}(1 + \frac{1}{2}\theta) \right) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-1} \right) (\kappa^{-1}\theta\beta^{-1/2})
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
& + \left(\frac{\kappa}{2}\beta^{-3/2}\left(1 + \frac{1}{2}\theta\right)\right)\left(-\frac{\kappa}{2}\beta^{-1}\right)(\kappa^{-1}\beta^{-1/2}) \\
& = -\frac{5}{16}\kappa\beta^{-2}.
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
& \langle\langle 7 \rangle\rangle \\
& = -\nabla_b J_{1a_1} \nabla_4 J_{b'1} J_{21} J_{34} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 4} = \kappa \nabla_b J_{1a_1} \nabla_4 J_{b'1} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 4} \\
& = \kappa (g^{34} \nabla_b J_{13} \nabla_4 J_{b'1} g^{bb'} + g^{44} \nabla_b J_{14} \nabla_4 J_{b'1} g^{bb'}) \\
& = \kappa \left( g^{34} (\nabla_3 J_{13} \nabla_4 J_{31} g^{33} + \nabla_3 J_{13} \nabla_4 J_{41} g^{34} + \nabla_4 J_{13} \nabla_4 J_{31} g^{43} + \nabla_4 J_{13} \nabla_4 J_{41} g^{44}) \right. \\
& \quad \left. + g^{44} (\nabla_3 J_{14} \nabla_4 J_{31} g^{33} + \nabla_3 J_{14} \nabla_4 J_{41} g^{34} + \nabla_4 J_{14} \nabla_4 J_{31} g^{43} + \nabla_4 J_{14} \nabla_4 J_{41} g^{44}) \right) \\
& = \kappa \left[ \kappa^{-1} \theta \beta^{-1/2} \left( \left(-\frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-3/2}\right)(1-2\theta) \left(\frac{\kappa}{2}\beta^{-3/2}\left(1 + \frac{1}{2}\theta\right)\right) (\kappa^{-1}(1+\theta)\beta^{-1/2}) \right. \right. \\
& \quad + \left(-\frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-3/2}(1-2\theta)\right) \left(-\frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-3/2}(1+3\theta)\right) (\kappa^{-1}\theta\beta^{-1/2}) \\
& \quad + \left(-\frac{\kappa}{2}\beta^{-3/2}\left(1 + \frac{1}{2}\theta\right)\right) \left(\frac{\kappa}{2}\beta^{-3/2}\left(1 + \frac{1}{2}\theta\right)\right) (\kappa^{-1}\theta\beta^{-1/2}) \\
& \quad \left. + \left(-\frac{\kappa}{2}\beta^{-3/2}\left(1 + \frac{1}{2}\theta\right)\right) \left(-\frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-3/2}(1+3\theta)\right) (\kappa^{-1}\beta^{-1/2}) \right) \\
& \quad + \kappa^{-1} \beta^{-1/2} \left( \left(-\frac{\kappa}{2}\beta^{-3/2}\left(1 + \frac{1}{2}\theta\right)\right) \left(\frac{\kappa}{2}\beta^{-3/2}\left(1 + \frac{1}{2}\theta\right)\right) (\kappa^{-1}(1+\theta)\beta^{-1/2}) \right. \\
& \quad + \left(-\frac{\kappa}{2}\beta^{-3/2}\left(1 + \frac{1}{2}\theta\right)\right) \left(-\frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-3/2}(1+3\theta)\right) (\kappa^{-1}\theta\beta^{-1/2}) \\
& \quad + \left(\frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-3/2}(1+3\theta)\right) \left(\frac{\kappa}{2}\beta^{-3/2}\left(1 + \frac{1}{2}\theta\right)\right) (\kappa^{-1}\theta\beta^{-1/2}) \\
& \quad \left. + \left(\frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-3/2}(1+3\theta)\right) \left(-\frac{\kappa}{4}\beta^{-3/2}(1+3\theta)\right) (\kappa^{-1}\beta^{-1/2}) \right) \right] \\
& = -\frac{5}{16}\kappa\beta^{-2}.
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
& \langle\langle 8 \rangle\rangle \\
& = \nabla_b J_{2a_1} \nabla_4 J_{b'2} J_{12} J_{34} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 4} = J_{12} J_{34} (\nabla_b J_{23} \nabla_4 J_{b'2} g^{bb'} g^{34} + \nabla_b J_{24} \nabla_4 J_{b'2} g^{bb'} g^{44}) \\
& = \kappa (\nabla_b J_{23} \nabla_4 J_{b'2} g^{bb'} g^{34} + \nabla_b J_{24} + \nabla_4 J_{b'2} g^{bb'} g^{44}) \\
& = \kappa \left( (\nabla_3 J_{23} \nabla_4 J_{32} g^{33} \nabla_3 J_{23} \nabla_4 J_{42} g^{34} + \nabla_4 J_{23} \nabla_4 J_{32} g^{43} + \nabla_4 J_{23} \nabla_4 J_{42} g^{44}) g^{34} \right.
\end{aligned}$$



$$\begin{aligned}
& + (\nabla_3 J_{24} \nabla_4 J_{32} g^{33} + \nabla_3 J_{24} \nabla_4 J_{42} g^{34} + \nabla_4 J_{24} \nabla_4 J_{32} g^{43} + \nabla_4 J_{24} \nabla_4 J_{42} g^{44}) g^{44} \\
& = \kappa \left[ \kappa^{-1} \theta \beta^{-1/2} \left( \left( -\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1} \right) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1} \right) (\kappa^{-1} (1 + \theta) \beta^{-1/2}) + \left( -\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1} \right) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1} \right) (\kappa^{-1} \theta \beta^{-1/2}) \right. \right. \\
& \quad \left. \left. + \left( \frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1} \right) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1} \right) (\kappa^{-1} \theta \beta^{-1/2}) + \left( \frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1} \right) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1} \right) (\kappa^{-1} \beta^{-1/2}) \right) \right. \\
& \quad \left. + \kappa^{-1} \beta^{-1/2} \left( \left( \frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1} \right) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1} \right) (\kappa^{-1} (1 + \theta) \beta^{-1/2}) + \left( \frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1} \right) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1} \right) (\kappa^{-1} \theta \beta^{-1/2}) \right. \right. \\
& \quad \left. \left. + \left( \frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1} \right) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1} \right) (\kappa^{-1} \theta \beta^{-1/2}) + \left( \frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1} \right) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1} \right) (\kappa^{-1} \theta \beta^{-1/2}) \right) \right] \\
& = -\frac{5}{16} \kappa \beta^{-2}.
\end{aligned}$$

Thus

$$S_{3,4,1} = 2p^4 (\langle \langle 1 \rangle \rangle + \dots + \langle \langle 8 \rangle \rangle) = 2p^4 \cdot 8 \cdot \left( -\frac{5}{16} \kappa \beta^{-2} \right) = -5p^4 \beta^{-2}.$$

(iii)(b) We compute  $S_{3,4,2}$  as follows.

$$\begin{aligned}
S_{3,4,2} & = -2p^4 \sum_{\sigma_3=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \nabla_b J_{\sigma_3 a_1} \nabla_{\sigma_4} J_{b' a_2} J_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2} J_{a_2}^{a_1} g^{bb'} \\
& = -2p^4 \sum_{\sigma_3=0} \text{sgn}(\sigma) \nabla_b J_{\sigma_3 a_1} \nabla_{\sigma_4} J_{b' a_2'} J_{a_2 a_1'} J_{\sigma_1 \sigma_2} g^{bb'} g^{a_1 a_1'} g^{a_2 a_2'}.
\end{aligned}$$

We must have  $(\sigma_1, \sigma_2) \in \{(1, 2), (2, 1), (3, 4), (4, 3)\}$  From the form of the symplectic structure, it follows that  $\sigma \in S = \{\text{id}, (34), (13)(24), (1324)\}$ . (There are also permutations of the form  $(12)\tau, (34)\tau$  for  $\tau \in S$ , but by the skew-symmetry of  $J_{ab}$ , only the terms in  $S$  contribute to  $S_{3,4,2}$ .) The signs of the permutations in  $S$  are  $+1, -1, +1, -1$ , respectively.

Keeping track of the extra permutations and their signs, we have

$$\begin{aligned}
& S_{3,4,2} \\
& = -2p^4 \cdot 2 \left( \nabla_b J_{3a_1} \nabla_4 J_{b' a_2'} J_{a_2 a_1'} J_{12} g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a_2'} g^{a_1 a_1'} - \nabla_b J_{4a_1} \nabla_3 J_{b' a_2'} J_{a_2 a_1'} J_{12} g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a_2'} g^{a_1 a_1'} \right. \\
& \quad \left. + \nabla_b J_{1a_1} \nabla_2 J_{b' a_2'} J_{a_2 a_1'} J_{34} g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a_2'} g^{a_1 a_1'} - \nabla_b J_{2a_1} \nabla_1 J_{b' a_2'} J_{a_2 a_1'} J_{34} g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a_2'} g^{a_1 a_1'} \right).
\end{aligned}$$

Using  $\nabla_1 J_{ab} = \nabla_2 J_{ab} = 0$ , and  $J_{12} = 1$ , we get

$$\begin{aligned}
& S_{3,4,2} \\
& = -4p^4 \left( \nabla_b J_{3a_1} \nabla_4 J_{b' a_2'} J_{a_2 a_1'} g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a_2'} g^{a_1 a_1'} - \nabla_b J_{4a_1} \nabla_3 J_{b' a_2'} J_{a_2 a_1'} g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a_2'} g^{a_1 a_1'} \right)
\end{aligned}$$

$$= 4p^4 \left( \nabla_b J_{3a'_1} \nabla_4 J_{b'a'_2} J_{a_1 a_2} g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a'_2} g^{a_1 a'_1} - \nabla_b J_{4a'_1} \nabla_3 J_{b'a'_2} J_{a_1 a_2} g^{bb'} g^{a_2 a'_2} g^{a_1 a'_1} \right).$$

The only nonzero terms come from  $(a_1, a_2) \in \{(1, 2), (2, 1), (3, 4), (4, 3)\}$ . Therefore,

$$\begin{aligned} S_{3,4,2} &= -4p^4 \left( \nabla_b J_{3a'_1} \nabla_4 J_{b'a'_2} J_{12} g^{bb'} g^{2a'_2} g^{1a'_1} + \nabla_b J_{3a'_1} \nabla_4 J_{b'a'_2} J_{21} g^{bb'} g^{1a'_2} g^{2a'_1} \right. \\ &\quad - \nabla_b J_{4a'_1} \nabla_3 J_{b'a'_2} J_{12} g^{bb'} g^{2a'_2} g^{1a'_1} - \nabla_b J_{4a'_1} \nabla_3 J_{b'a'_2} J_{21} g^{bb'} g^{1a'_2} g^{2a'_1} \\ &\quad + \nabla_b J_{3a'_1} \nabla_4 J_{b'a'_2} J_{34} g^{bb'} g^{4a'_2} g^{3a'_1} + \nabla_b J_{3a'_1} \nabla_4 J_{b'a'_2} J_{43} g^{bb'} g^{3a'_2} g^{4a'_1} \\ &\quad \left. - \nabla_b J_{4a'_1} \nabla_3 J_{b'a'_2} J_{34} g^{bb'} g^{4a'_2} g^{3a'_1} - \nabla_b J_{4a'_1} \nabla_3 J_{b'a'_2} J_{43} g^{bb'} g^{3a'_2} g^{4a'_1} \right) \\ &= 4p^4 \left( \nabla_b J_{31} \nabla_4 J_{b'2} g^{bb'} - \nabla_b J_{32} \nabla_4 J_{b'1} g^{bb'} - \nabla_b J_{41} \nabla_3 J_{b'2} g^{bb'} + \nabla_b J_{42} \nabla_3 J_{b'1} g^{bb'} \right. \\ &\quad + \nabla_b J_{3a'_1} \nabla_4 J_{b'a'_2} g^{bb'} \kappa g^{4a'_2} g^{3a'_1} - \nabla_b J_{3a_1} \nabla_4 J_{b'a'_2} g^{bb'} \kappa g^{3a'_2} g^{4a'_1} \\ &\quad \left. - \nabla_b J_{4a'_1} \nabla_3 J_{ba'_2} g^{bb'} \kappa g^{4a'_2} g^{3a'_1} + \nabla_b J_{4a_1} \nabla_3 J_{ba'_2} g^{bb'} \kappa g^{3a'_2} g^{4a'_1} \right) \\ &:= 4p^4 \left( [[1]] + [[2]] + [[3]] + [[4]] + [[5]] + [[6]] + [[7]] + [[8]] \right). \end{aligned}$$

We now compute  $[[1]] - [[8]]$ .

$$\begin{aligned} [[1]] &= \nabla_b J_{31} \nabla_4 J_{b'2} g^{bb'} \\ &= \nabla_3 J_{31} \nabla_4 J_{32} g^{33} + \nabla_3 J_{31} \nabla_4 J_{42} g^{34} + \nabla_4 J_{31} \nabla_4 J_{32} g^{43} + \nabla_4 J_{31} \nabla_4 J_{42} g^{44} \\ &= \left( \frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 - 2\theta) \right) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1} \right) (\kappa^{-1} (1 + \theta) \beta^{-1/2}) \\ &\quad + \left( \frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 - 2\theta) \right) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1} \right) (\theta \kappa^{-1} \beta^{-1/2}) \\ &\quad + \left( \frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} \left( 1 + \frac{1}{2} \theta \right) \right) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1} \right) (\theta \kappa^{-1} \beta^{-3/2}) \\ &\quad + \left( \frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} \left( 1 + \frac{1}{2} \theta \right) \right) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1} \right) (\kappa^{-1} \beta^{-1/2}) \\ &= -\frac{5}{16} \kappa \beta^{-2}. \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} [[2]] &= -\nabla_b J_{32} \nabla_4 J_{b'1} g^{bb'} \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
&= - \left( \nabla_3 J_{32} \nabla_4 J_{31} g^{33} + \nabla_3 J_{32} \nabla_4 J_{41} g^{34} + \nabla_4 J_{32} \nabla_4 J_{31} g^{43} + \nabla_4 J_{32} \nabla_4 J_{41} g^{44} \right) \\
&= - \left( \left( \frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1} \right) \left( \frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} \left( 1 + \frac{1}{2} \theta \right) \right) (\kappa^{-1} (1 + \theta) \beta^{-1/2}) \right. \\
&\quad + \left( \frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1} \right) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 + 3\theta) \right) (\kappa^{-1} \theta \beta^{-1/2}) \\
&\quad + \left( -\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1} \right) \left( \frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} \left( 1 + \frac{1}{2} \theta \right) \right) (\kappa^{-1} \theta \beta^{-1/2}) \\
&\quad \left. + \left( -\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1} \right) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 + 3\theta) \right) (\kappa^{-1} \beta^{-1/2}) \right) \\
&= \frac{5}{16} \kappa \beta^{-2}.
\end{aligned}$$

[[3]]

$$\begin{aligned}
&= -\nabla_b J_{41} \nabla_3 J_{b'2} g^{bb'} \\
&= - \left( \nabla_3 J_{41} \nabla_3 J_{32} g^{33} + \nabla_3 J_{41} \nabla_3 J_{42} g^{34} + \nabla_4 J_{41} \nabla_3 J_{32} g^{43} + \nabla_4 J_{41} \nabla_3 J_{42} g^{44} \right) \\
&= - \left( \left( \frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} \left( 1 + \frac{1}{2} \theta \right) \right) \left( \frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1} \right) (\kappa^{-1} (1 + \theta) \beta^{-1/2}) \right. \\
&\quad + \left( \frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} \left( 1 + \frac{1}{2} \theta \right) \right) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1} \right) (\kappa^{-1} \theta \beta^{-1/2}) \\
&\quad + \left( -\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 + 3\theta) \right) \left( \frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1} \right) (\kappa^{-1} \theta \beta^{-1/2}) \\
&\quad \left. + \left( -\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 + 3\theta) \right) \left( -\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1} \right) (\kappa^{-1} \beta^{-1/2}) \right) \\
&= -\frac{5}{16} \kappa \beta^{-2}.
\end{aligned}$$

[[4]]

$$\begin{aligned}
&= \nabla_b J_{42} \nabla_3 J_{b'1} g^{bb'} \\
&= \nabla_3 J_{42} \nabla_3 J_{31} g^{33} + \nabla_3 J_{42} \nabla_3 J_{41} g^{43} + \nabla_4 J_{42} \nabla_3 J_{31} g^{43} + \nabla_4 J_{42} \nabla_3 J_{41} g^{44} \\
&= \left( -\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1} \right) \left( \frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 - 2\theta) \right) (\kappa^{-1} (1 + \theta) \beta^{-1/2}) \\
&\quad + \left( -\frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-1} \right) \left( \frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-3/2} \left( 1 + \frac{1}{2} \theta \right) \right) (\kappa^{-1} \theta \beta^{-1/2}) \\
&\quad + \left( -\frac{\kappa}{2} \beta^{-1} \right) \left( \frac{\kappa}{4} \beta^{-3/2} (1 - 2\theta) \right) (\kappa^{-1} \theta \beta^{-1/2})
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
& + \left(-\frac{\kappa}{2}\beta - 1\right)\left(\frac{\kappa}{2}\beta^{-3/2}\left(1 + \frac{1}{2}\theta\right)\right)(\kappa^{-1}\beta^{-1/2}) \\
& = -\frac{5}{16}\kappa\beta^{-2}.
\end{aligned}$$

We have

$$[[5]] = \kappa \nabla_b J_{3a'_1} \nabla_4 J_{b'a_2} g^{bb'} g^{4a'_2} g^{3a'_1} = 0,$$

since we must have  $a'_1 = 3$  or  $4$ , and  $\nabla_b J_{33} = \nabla_b J_{34} = 0$ . For the same reason,

$$[[6]] = -\kappa \nabla_b J_{3a'_1} \nabla_4 J_{b'a_2} g^{bb'} g^{3a'_2} g^{4a'_1} = 0.$$

Similarly,

$$[[7]] = -\kappa \nabla_b J_{4a'_1} \nabla_3 J_{b'a_2} g^{bb'} g^{4a'_2} g^{3a'_1} = 0,$$

since  $a'_1 = 3$  or  $4$ , and  $\nabla_b J_{43} = 0$ ,  $\nabla_b J_{44} = 0$ . For the same reason,

$$[[8]] = \kappa \nabla_b J_{4a'_1} \nabla_3 J_{b'a_2} g^{bb'} g^{3a'_2} g^{4a'_1} = 0.$$

Thus, we have

$$S_{3,4,2} = 4p^4 \left( -\frac{5}{16}\kappa\beta^{-2} \right) \cdot 4 = -5\kappa\beta^{-2}p^4.$$

This finishes the proofs of Lemma 1.14 and Proposition 1.13.

As explained below Proposition 1.5, this finishes the demonstration of (1.3).

RAKUTEN INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY

*Email address:* `egi@egison.org`

TOHOKU CENTER FOR CREATIVITY, TOHOKU UNIVERSITY

*Email address:* `yoshimaeda@m.tohoku.ac.jp`

DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICS AND STATISTICS, BOSTON UNIVERSITY

*Email address:* `sr@math.bu.edu`