Peer review for Sonny Kjellberg sk222sw et al , https://github.com/sk222sw/OOAD/wiki

Software

The program is overall nice to work with GUI wise. A few annoying things:

- No way to end the program in a nice way (by GUI choice)
- If you list members you don't have an option to return to main menu but have to work with one of the listed members
- If you chose to update a member you have to fill in all fields, even those you don't want to change
- Error text "something wrong with ssn" could indicate what it should look like.

The code is well written, follow standards and are divided into a Model-View design in a nice way. It should be easy to maintain.

The controller method MenuChoice() have direct access to the GUI by calling Console.WriteLine() and Console.ReadKey(). Should be placed in the view layer

The user feedback "Member saved" is actually given before the call to model.DAL.MemberDAL.AddMember(newMember); which obviously in rare cases can wrong giving the user all false confirmation.

Design

Sequence diagrams are good and corresponds to the implementation but the methods should have dotted lines for to the calling component indicating something is returned [Larman Figure 10.2], e.g. the case for Controller call to memberDAL MemberList() and BoatList().

The class diagram is complete but not immediately easy to grasp with all crossing connecting lines.

Dependencies and associations are correctly described by UML notation in the class diagram [Larman Figure 16.1]

As a developer would the diagrams help you and why/why not?

Yes they are easy to understand

What are the strong points of the design/implementation, what do you think is really good and why?

It is well written, using code standard and have a OO Model-View concept.

What are the weaknesses of the design/implementation, what do you think should be changed and why?

Not much, I have mentioned a few flaws above.

Do you think the design/implementation has passed the grade 2 criteria? Sure.

References:

Larman C., Applying UML and Patterns 3rd Ed, 2005, ISBN: 0-13-148906-2