BEFORE THE GOVERNING BOARD OF THE VALLEY CENTER-PAUMA UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT STATE OF CALIFORNIA

In the Matter of the Employment Status of:
Maria Cordero, Jascha Dolan, Satya Fleck,
Michelle Inigo, Andres Monreal, Christy
Harkins (Newburg), Violeta Rios, Eva Rosa,
Jennifer Rubio, Jaime Shuford, and Amanda
Walford, Each of Whom Received a
Preliminary Layoff Notice for the 2008-2009
School Year and Requested a Hearing,

OAH No. 2008030666

Respondents.

Individuals Who Received a Preliminary Layoff Notice for the 2008-2009 School Year But Did Not Request a Hearing:

Karla Dempsey, Denise McAndrews, and Leslie Patronik.

PROPOSED DECISION

James Ahler, Administrative Law Judge, Office of Administrative Hearings, State of California, heard this matter in Valley Center, California, on April 17, 2008.

Clifford D. Weiler, Attorney at Law, represented the Valley Center-Pauma Unified School District.

Carlos R. Perez, Attorney at Law, represented respondents Maria Cordero, Jascha Dolan, Satya Fleck, Michelle Inigo, Andres Monreal, Christy Harkins (Newburg), Violeta Rios, Eva Rosa, Jennifer Rubio, Jaime Shuford, and Amanda Walford, each of whom received a preliminary layoff notice for the 2008-2009 school year and requested a hearing.

No appearance was made by or on behalf of Karla Dempsey, Denise McAndrews, or Leslie Patronik, each of whom received a preliminary layoff notice for the 2008-2009 school year, but did not request and waived the right to a hearing.

The matter was submitted on April 17, 2008.

FACTUAL FINDINGS

The Valley Center-Pauma Unified School District

1. The Valley Center-Pauma Unified School District (the District) is located in Valley Center, California. The District was formed in July 2000 when the Valley Center Union Elementary School District unified with the Pauma Elementary School District and with Valley Center High School (previously a part of the Escondido Union High School District). The District occupies approximately 300 square miles in North San Diego County upon hilly topography filled with citrus and avocado groves. The District serves the educational needs of kindergarten through twelfth grade students. The community supports many active civic and youth organizations, and the schools enjoy a high level of community involvement.

The District currently maintains and operates Valley Center High School (grades 9-12), Oak Glen High School (grades 10-12), an adult education program, an independent study program (grades kindergarten-12), Valley Center Middle School (grades 6-8), Pauma School (grades kindergarten-8), Palomar Mountain School (kindergargen-8), Valley Center Elementary Upper School (grades 5-6), Valley Center Elementary Lower School (grades 2-4), Lilac School (grades kindergarten-6), and Valley Center Primary (grades kindergarten-2).

The District employs approximately 250 certificated employees, most of whom are teachers.

2. The District is governed by a five member Board of Trustees (the Board), each member being an elected official. The Board's Chief Executive Officer is Lou Obermeyer, EdD, Superintendent of Schools. Peggy Johnson is the District's Director of Personnel. Pamela Moe is the District's Business Manager.

The Fiscal Crisis – Economic Layoffs

3. Proposition 13 limited the imposition of local property taxes and reduced a major source of assured revenue for funding public education in California. Since the passage of Proposition 13, public school districts have looked primarily to the State of California and to other governmental entities for necessary funding.

A school district cannot determine the level of state funding it will receive until the state budget is chaptered, an event usually occurring in late June. Before then, the school

district's governing board must take steps to make certain that ends meet if the worst-case financial scenario develops.

A school board's obligation to balance its budget often requires that some teachers, administrators and/or other certificated employees be given preliminary layoff notices, warning them that their services will not be required for the next school year. Under Education Code section 44949, these preliminary layoff notices must be given to certificated employees no later than March 15.

The economic layoff statutes found in the Education Code generally require the retention of senior employees over more junior employees and the retention of permanent employees over probationary employees and other employees with less seniority. A public school district may deviate from the general rule requiring termination in reverse order of seniority if it can demonstrate that identifiable junior employees possess a credential, special training or experience necessary to teach a course of study or to provide services which more senior employees do not possess.

The District's Response

4. In early 2008, the District's administration (as well as the administrators of most other school districts) became aware of the State of California's massive budget deficit and its fiscal impact. As a result of the budget crisis, the District projected a budget deficit of about \$1.82 million for the 2007-2008 school year, about \$0.83 million for the 2008-2009 school year, and about \$0.83 million for the 2009-2010 school year.

The District was required to look into ways to trim its budget. The operation of two schools – Palomar School and Valley Center Upper Elementary School – had to be terminated for the 2008-2009 school year and the foreseeable future. In addition, the District looked into the reduction or elimination of particular kinds of services. Johnson and Moe played a key role in reviewing the particular kinds of services the District was providing.

5. The District's administrative staff prepared a recommendation that was given to the Board concerning the reduction and elimination of particular kinds of services to meet the budgetary shortfall. In accordance with this recommendation, Resolution 2008-02 was drafted.

On March 6, 2008, the Board adopted Resolution 2008-02, which provided:

VALLEY CENTER-PAUMA UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT

RESOLUTION REGARDING COMMENCEMENT OF CERTIFICATED LAYOFF AND DISCONTINUANCES AND REDUCTIONS OF PARTICULAR KINDS OF SERVICES (AS SPECIFIED HEREIN) DIRECTION TO NOTIFY AFFECTED EMPLOYEES OF RECOMMENDATION OF LAYOFF; AND RELATED ACTIONS

Resolution Number 2008-02

WHEREAS, because of financial constraints resulting from revenue being insufficient to maintain current levels of programs and services, including particular kinds of certificated services, and it being necessary to commence implementing program changes in a timely fashion within the current structure of the law, this District's Governing Board determines that it is in the best interests of the District and the welfare of the schools and the pupils thereof, to commence certificated layoff proceedings to discontinue and reduce particular kinds of services ("PKS") as hereinafter enumerated and to reduce the corresponding number of certificated staff no later than the beginning of the 2008-2009 school year (in addition to the release of temporary certificated employees and/or the expiration of their contracts without renewals or re-issuances);

WHEREAS, this discontinuance and reduction of certificated services shall result in layoffs of certificated personnel in accordance with Education Code sections 44955 and 44949 which provide a process whereby particular decisions, actions and notifications must be undertaken beginning no later than March 15 of each school year regarding layoffs of certificated personnel in order to reduce the number of certificated staff, and this Board desires to reduce certificated staff as permitted by law;

WHEREAS, this Governing Board desires to discontinue and reduce the particular kinds of certificated services as listed in Exhibit A, attached, and to that extent of full time equivalents ("FTEs") not later than the beginning of the 2008-2009 school year (in addition to the release of temporary certificated employees and/or the expiration of their contracts without renewals or reissuances);

WHEREAS, in the opinion of the Governing Board, it will be necessary as a result of the discontinuances and reductions of these particular kinds of services reflected in Exhibit A to decrease the number of certificated permanent and/or probationary employees by a corresponding number of full-time equivalent positions;

WHEREAS, in determining the extent of staff FTE reductions and services to be discontinued and reduced, the Governing Board has considered all assured and/or known attrition as of this time to the extent required by law (including as to the release of temporary certificated employees and the expirations of their contracts), so that the total referenced above and in Exhibit A have already accounted for such attrition; but for that attrition, this Board would have found it necessary to discontinue and reduce additional particular kinds of certificated services and/or full time equivalents;

NOW, THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, DETERMINED AND ORDERED by this Governing Board, as follows:

- 1. All of the above recitals are true and correct;
- 2. The particular kinds of services as listed in Exhibit A are to be and will be discontinued and reduced and otherwise eliminated to the described extent no later than the beginning of the 2008-2009 school year;
- 3. It is the opinion of this Governing Board, in view of the discontinuances and reductions of these particular kinds of services, that it is necessary to decrease the number of permanent and/or probationary employees serving in positions requiring certification qualifications within this school district at the close of this school year by a corresponding number of full-time equivalent positions as set forth within Exhibit A;

- 4. Subject to requirements (if any) within the Educational Employment Relations Act, that for purposes of "bumping" (displacement) rights and the determination of "competency" within the meaning of Education Code section 44955(b), to the extent such might apply, "competency" shall be based upon possession and current filing (no later than March 6, 2008) of a preliminary or clear credential for the subject matter into which the employee would bump for the 2008-2009 school year, highly qualified status within the meaning of the No Child Left Behind Act and an appropriate EL certification;
- 5. For purposes of seniority tie-breaking criteria within the meaning of Education Code sections 44955, subdivision (b) (third paragraph) and section 44846 (second paragraph), the Governing Board determines that seniority ties shall be broken in accordance with the criteria listed within Exhibit B, said criteria being based solely upon the needs of the District and the students thereof;
- 6. The Superintendent or the Superintendent's designee(s) is(are) instructed to take the steps necessary pursuant to the Education Code including, in part, sections 44955 and 44949, to implement the above and to reduce the certificated staff as set forth hereinabove;
- 7. The actions of this Governing Board will not, in any way, be considered to prejudice the rights of any certificated employee to whom notice will be given of the superintendent's recommendations, should any employee request a hearing to contest this matter.

IN WITNESS of the adoption of the foregoing Resolution, we, the members present and voting thereof, have hereunto set our hands this 5th day of March, 2008. Executed in Valley Center, San Diego County, California.

/Signed by all Board Members/

GOVERNING BOARD OF THE VALLEY CENTER-PAUMA UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT

I, Lou Obermeyer, Superintendent and Secretary to the Governing Board of the Valley Center-Pauma Unified School District of San Diego County, California, do hereby certify that the foregoing is a full, true, and correct copy of a Resolution duly adopted by said Board at a meeting thereof, the vote above stated, which Resolution is on file and of record in the office of the Superintendent.

Date: 3-6 , 2008

/Signed by Dr. Obermeyer/

Superintendent/Secretary to Governing Board Valley Center-Pauma Unified School District

6. Exhibit A provided:

IDENTIFICATION OF PARTICULAR KINDS OF SERVICES (PKSs) AND FULL TIME EQUIVALENCIES (FTEs) TO BE DISCONTINUED AND REDUCED NO LATER THAN THE BEGINNING OF THE ENSUING SCHOOL YEAR (2008-2009)

| Particular Kind of Service | Discontinuance or Reduction | Full time Equivalents |
|---|--------------------------------|-----------------------|
| | | |
| Counseling services (grades 9-12) | reduction | 1.0 |
| Counseling services (grades 7-8) | reduction | 1.0 |
| Classroom teaching services (grades kindergarten through 6) | reduction | 5.0 |
| Middle school math teaching services -math standards grade 7 | reduction | 0.2 |
| Middle school math teaching services- algebra 1 standards | discontinuance | 0.4 |
| Middle school math teaching services- algebra A support | discontinuance | 0.4 |
| High school math teaching services - algebra A | reduction | 0.2 |
| High school math teaching services - geometry | reduction | 0.2 |
| High school math teaching services - algebra 1 | reduction | 0.2 |
| High school math teaching services - applied math | reduction | 0.2 |
| High school AVID services | reduction | 0.2 |
| High school Earth science teaching services | reduction | 0.6 |
| Coordinator of Adult Education | reduction | 0.5 |
| Categorically funded teaching services*: middle school: | discontinuances | 1.0 |
| language arts (0.2 FTE) social studies (0.2 FTE) ELD support services (0.2 FTE) | | 2 52 |
| high school: | A second | |
| reading fundamentals_(0.4 FTE) | = | |
| 8.2 | TOTAL FTEs | 11.1 |

^{*} Inclusion of categorically funded services within this Resolution is not intended to grant those individuals who are impacted any rights greater than provided by law, nor to nullify any provisions within each impacted individual's employment contract, nor to supersede any other action by this Board to release or otherwise terminate the services of any impacted individual.

7. Exhibit B, the tie-breaking criteria, provided:

CRITERIA FOR BREAKING SENIORITY TIES

Subject to requirements (if any) within the Educational Employment Relations Act, this Governing Board determines, based solely on the needs of this District and the students of this District, that seniority ties within the meaning of Education Code sections 44955, subdivision (b) (third paragraph) and section 44846, shall be resolved by applying the following criteria, to be applied in the following order, one step at a time. Such criteria shall be applied to rank the order of individuals for purposes of layoff and reemployment, subject to exceptions allowed by law.

The criteria are as follows:

- Possession and filing of a BCLAD authorization;
- 2. Possession and filing of a CLAD authorization wins over possession and filing of an Emergency CLAD authorization;
 - 3. Completion of, and filing of proof of, a Masters degree;
- 4. Duration of continuous active teaching service in this district using a preliminary or clear credential, in the current assignment from which the individual is being removed, displaced or "bumped", with the longest duration winning the tie;
- 5. Earliest date of paid teaching service as certificated long term substitute or temporary certificated employee in this district not to include day-to-day substitute service;
- 6. Total years of teaching experience as documented in this district's official files;
- 7. Scope of clear or preliminary credentials as can be applied within this school district's current curriculum and as to which the individual is highly qualified within the meaning of the No Child Left Behind Act;
- 8. If a tie still exists, the tie would be broken by drawing numbers, with number one winning, then number two winning, and continuing so forth numerically.
- 8. Under Johnson's direction, a seniority list was prepared. The list contained each employee's name, first date of paid service with the District (or its predecessor), the types of credentials held by the employee, the employee's current assignment, and the extent to which the employee occupied a full time equivalent position. The information set forth in the seniority list was obtained from the San Diego County Department of Education and the District's personnel files.
- 9. On or before March 15, 2008, respondents Maria Cordero, Jascha Dolan, Satya Fleck, Michelle Inigo, Andres Monreal, Christy Harkins (Newburg), Violeta Rios, Eva Rosa, Jennifer Rubio, Jaime Shuford, Amanda Walford, Karla Dempsey, Denise McAndrews, and Leslie Patronik were District employees. Each respondent was served with a preliminary layoff notice for the 2008-2009 school year advising that his or her services would be terminated at the conclusion of the current school year. The notice advised each respondent of the right to request a hearing.

All respondents, except for Karla Dempsey, Denise McAndrews, and Leslie Patronik, requested a hearing.

10. On March 31, 2008, Johnson, in her official capacity as the Superintendent's designee, signed the accusation. Thereafter, the accusation (together with other required jurisdictional documents) was served on each certificated employee who requested a hearing.

Respondents Cordero, Dolan, Fleck, Inigo, Monreal, Harkins (Newburg), Rios, Rosa, Rubio, Shuford and Walford filed notices of defense.

The Administrative Hearing

11. On April 17, 2008, the record in the administrative hearing was opened. Jurisdictional documents were presented. The District withdrew the accusations previously filed and served on Cordero, Dolan, Fleck, Monreal, Rios and Rubio. There was no objection. The hearing was limited to the layoff notices issued to Inigo, Harkins (Newburg), Rosa, Shuford, and Walford. Stipulations were recited, sworn testimony and documentary evidence was received, closing argument was given, the record was closed and the matter was submitted.

The Particular Kinds of Services

12. No factual issue was raised to dispute the District's contention that the services identified in Exhibit A were services that could properly be reduced or discontinued. The elimination of those positions was neither arbitrary nor capricious, but constituted a proper exercise of the Board's discretion. The extent to which these particular kinds of services were reduced or eliminated was well within the Board's discretion. Each certificated employee providing a particular kind of service who was the subject of the layoff resolution was given a preliminary notice of the reduction of this particular kind of service in accordance with law.

Before issuing preliminary layoff notices, the staff considered all known positive attrition including resignations, retirements and probationary non-reelects in determining the number of layoff notices that needed to be served. As a result of several retirements since March 15, 2008, the District was able to maintain the employment of six senior employees previously served with a preliminary layoff notice and an accusation.

No particular kinds of services were lowered to levels less than those levels mandated by state or federal law.

The Seniority List

- 13. The District assigned seniority dates to all credentialed employees. All seniority dates related to the employee's first day of paid service with the District or its predecessor.
- A. <u>Christy Harkins (Newburg)</u>: Harkins (Newburg) had a seniority date of August 28, 2006. She was given notice that her employment would not be continued for the 2008-2009 school year. Harkins (Newburg) taught Geometry (0.2 FTE), Algebra I (0.6 FTE), and AVID (0.2 FTE) full time (1.0 FTE) in high school. Geometry, Algebra, and AVID were some of the services the Board decided to reduce.

Rita Favreau, whose seniority date was August 31, 1988, and Kate Johnson, whose seniority date was September 3, 1985, displaced (bumped) Harkins (Newburg) to teach Algebra I. Hawkins (Newburg) had a seniority date that was the same day as Eva Rosa, but

Hawkins (Newburg) lost a tie-breaker to Rosa under the District's criteria because Rosa held a full professional clear single subject credential in Math, while Hawkins (Newburg) held a preliminary credential.

No employee junior to Harkins (Newburg) was retained to render services that Harkins (Newburg) was competent and highly qualified to provide.

B. <u>Jaime Shuford</u>: Shuford had a seniority date of September 22, 2003. She was given notice that her employment would not be continued for the 2008-2009 school year. Shuford taught third and fourth grade full-time in elementary school (1 FTE). General elementary school teaching was a particular kind of service the Board reduced. Shuford was the least senior teacher within the District at the elementary school level.

No employee junior to Shuford was retained to render services that Shuford was competent and highly qualified to provide.

C. Eva Rosa: Rosa had a seniority date of August 28, 2006. She was given notice that 0.8 FTE of her employment would not be continued for the 2008-2009 school year. Rosa taught Applied Geometry (0.4 FTE), Algebra II/Trigonometry (0.4 FTE), and CASHEE (0.2 FTE) full-time in high school (1.0 FTE). Geometry and Algebra were some of the services the Board decided to reduce.

Rita Favreau, whose seniority date was August 31, 1988, and Rich Horne, whose seniority date was August 28, 1995, displaced (bumped) Rosa (Newburg) to teach Math (Middle School), Math Standards, and Algebra A Support. Lee Thor, whose seniority date was August 31, 2004, displaced (bumped) Rosa to teach Algebra A (High School).

No employee junior to Rosa was retained to render services that Rosa was competent and highly qualified to provide.

D. <u>Amanda Walford</u>: Walford had a seniority date of August 27, 2002. She was given notice that 0.2 FTE of her employment would not be continued for the 2008-2009 school year. Walford taught Geometry (0.6 FTE), Algebra B (0.4 FTE) full-time in high school (1.0 FTE). Susie Britsch, whose seniority date was August 26, 1996, displaced (bumped) Walford to teach .02 FTE Algebra because the AVID program was discontinued and because Geometry and Algebra were two services the Board reduced.

Walford lost a tie-breaker to Roger McElmell, who had the same seniority date as Walford because McElmell held a master's degree and Walford did not.

In conducting this tie breaker, other credentialed elementary school teachers who had the same seniority date as Walford and McElmell were not included in the tie-breaking process. These teachers, Tina Villalobos, Kirsten Stuckey, Nicole Scott, Michelle Saccuzzo, Christine J. Mac Neil, Mary Galanos, Lisa Eaton, Antoinette Costello, and Angie Arguello, all taught elementary school within a single classroom. Johnson concluded that they should not be included in the tie-breaker because it "was not practical" for a high school teacher who taught

blocked classes 80 percent of the day to drive an elementary school that was at least 15 minutes away and displace a teacher the students had been with in the classroom continuously from the start of the school day.

Walford was aware of one English teacher within the District who concurrently taught reading support at high school and at a middle school. She was aware of another District teacher who taught English Language Development in elementary school and middle school. These teachers provided services in "pull out" programs. Walford also expressed concern that the method by which some colleagues teaching Math at the high school level were authorized to select courses to teach may have contributed to her potential but unnecessary loss of 0.2 FTE.

Although the "not practical" criteria was not specifically expressed in the District's tie-breaking criteria, it is concluded that the exclusion of elementary school teachers from the tie-breaking process for a high school Math position and the application of the District's tie-breaking process leading to the reduction of .02 FTE to Walford was not arbitrary, capricious, or unlawful, and was in the best interests of the District and its students.

No employee junior to Walford was retained to render services that Walford was competent and highly qualified to provide.

E. <u>Michelle Inigo</u>: Inigo had a seniority date of August 28, 2001. She was given notice that 0.6 FTE of her employment would not be continued for the 2008-2009 school year. Inigo taught Biology (0.4 FTE) and Earth Sciences (0.6 FTE) full-time in high school (1.0 FTE). Earth Sciences was a particular kind of service the Board reduced.

Inigo is currently a probationary employee with a single subject teaching credential in Biology. Inigo does not hold tenure because she taught under an emergency credential for several years until she became fully credentialed in May 2005, and the time spent teaching under the emergency credential did not count towards tenure. In addition, Inigo was on maternity leave during a portion of one year, spending less than 75% of the school year in the classroom, so that her time spent teaching that year did not count towards tenure.

The full credential Inigo now possesses authorizes her to teach Biology and Physical Science, disciplines in which she is highly qualified, but she is not credentialed to teach Earth Sciences. Inigo was not aware until very recently that her credential did not authorize her to teach Earth Sciences without further authorization.

Michael Barnett has a seniority date of August 31, 2004. Barnett is a tenured teacher and he, thus, has rights of retention that are superior to those held by Inigo.

No probationary employee junior to Inigo was retained to render services that Inigo was competent and highly qualified to provide.

LEGAL CONCLUSIONS

- 1. Jurisdiction in this matter exists under Education Code sections 44949 and 44955. All notices and jurisdictional requirements contained in those sections were satisfied as to those certificated employees identified in the layoff list.
- 2. A school board's decision to reduce or discontinue particular kinds of services (PKS) need not be tied to any statistical computation, such as a reduction in the number of students. The number of terminations through PKS reductions depends totally upon the district's decision as to how many services to reduce. It is within a board's discretion to determine the extent to which it will reduce a particular service. Because elementary schools are limited in identifying a particular kind of service, the use of the term "classroom teaching" is recognized as a particular kind of service. (San Jose Teachers Assn. v. Allen (1983) 144 Cal. App. 3d 627.)
- 3. Subjects taught in secondary schools and community colleges by designated teachers at particular hours permit easy identification for purposes of PKS reductions. In elementary schools, however, a district cannot easily identify the amount by which particular subjects are to be reduced because many subjects are taught to the same students by the same teachers in the same classroom at unspecified times during the day. Because elementary schools, for the most part provide "classroom teaching," this must be recognized as a particular kind of service in order that elementary schools are able to reduce the only service they provide. (San Jose Teachers Assn. v. Allen (1983) 144 Cal.App.3d 627.)

A school board may "reduce services" by determining a certain type of services or by reducing the number of district employees who perform such services. A school board's decision to reduce or discontinue a particular kind of service is not unfair or improper because the school board made a decision it was empowered to make. (Rutherford v. Board of Trustees of Bellflower Unified School District (1976) 64 Cal.App.3d 167.)

A reduction in particular kinds of services exists where senior employees will continue to provide the same educational services by establishing larger classes or regrouping classes. (*Zalac v. Governing Bd. of Ferndale Unified School Dist.* (2002) 98 Cal.App.4th 838.)

- 4. Education Code section 44955, subdivisions (b) and (c), sets forth a general rule requiring school districts to retain senior employees over more junior employees and to retain permanent employees over temporary employees. Any exception to this general rule must be based on statute.
- 5. For employees hired on the same date, Education Code section 44955, subdivision (b) provides:

"As between employees who first rendered paid service to the district on the same date, the governing board shall determine the order of termination solely on the basis of needs of the district and the students thereof."

6. Seniority determines the order of dismissals; between employees with the same first date of paid service, the order of termination is determined on the "basis of the needs of the district and its students." Senior employees are given "bumping" rights and will not be terminated if junior employees are being retained who render services which the senior employee is certificated and competent to render. A district may move a junior employee upward from the bottom of a seniority list, "skipping" over more senior employees, so long as the junior employee being retained is certificated and competent to render services which more senior employees are not. (Alexander v. Board of Trustees (1983) 139 Cal.App.3d 567.)

A senior teacher whose position is discontinued has the right to transfer to a continuing position which he or she is certificated and competent to fill. In doing so, the senior employee may displace or "bump" a junior employee who holds that position. (*Lacy v. Richmond Unified School District* (1975) 13 Cal.3d 469.)

A school district may properly terminate one of several teachers, all of whom began service on same day, where the terminated employee, unlike the others, did not possess an equivalent elementary teaching credential when the layoff notice was issued. (*Brough v. Governing Board of El Segundo Unified School District* (1981) 118 Cal.App.3d 702.)

7. As a result of the reduction or discontinuation of particular kinds of service, cause exists under Education Code section 44955 to give notice to Christy Harkins (Newburg) that her services will not be required for the 2008-2009 school year, and to give notice to Jaime Shuford that her services will not be required for the 2008-2009 school year, and to give notice to Eva Rosa that 0.8 FTE of her services will not be required for the 2008-2009 school year, and to give notice to Amanda Walford that 0.2 FTE of her services will not be required for the 2008-2009 school year, and to give notice to Michelle Inigo that 0.6 FTE of her services will not be required for the 2008-2009 school year.

RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that the Valley Center-Pauma Unified School District give notice to Christy Harkins (Newburg) that her services will not be required for the 2008-2009 school year, to Jaime Shuford that her services will not be required for the 2008-2009 school year, to Eva Rosa that 0.8 FTE of her services will not be required for the 2008-2009 school year, to give notice to Amanda Walford that 0.2 FTE of her services will not be required for the 2008-2009 school year, and to Michelle Inigo that 0.6 FTE of her services will not be required for the 2008-2009 school year.

DATED: 422 08

JAMES AHLER

Administrative Law Judge

Office of Administrative Hearings