From:	"Piero Bonissone" <bonissone@ge.com>
Subject:	FUZZ-IEEE 2010 Paper #263 Decision Notification
Date:	Sun, March 14, 2010 1:34 pm
To:	rrd09@aber.ac.uk,qqs@aber.ac.uk

Dear Author(s),

Congratulations! On behalf of the FUZZ-IEEE 2010 Technical Program Committee
and the program chairs, we are pleased to inform you that your paper:

    Paper ID: 263
    Author(s): Ren Diao and Qiang Shen
    Title: Two Novel Approaches to Feature Selection with Harmony Search

has been accepted for presentation at the 2010 IEEE International Conference
on Fuzzy Systems and for publication in the conference proceedings published
annually by IEEE. This email provides you with all the information you require
to complete your paper and submit it for inclusion in the proceedings. A
notification of the presentation format (oral or poster) and timing of that
presentation will be sent by mid-April.

Here are the steps you must follow:

1. Please see the attached FORMATTING REQUIREMENTS and REVIEWERS' COMMENTS for
your paper, which are intended to help you to improve your paper for final
publication. The listed comments should be addressed, as acceptance is
conditional on appropriate response to the requirements and comments.

2. Please prepare your manuscript for final camera ready submission following
the same PDF format guidelines as for the initial submission. Papers are
limited to eight (8) pages in length, must be IEEE Xplore-compatible, and must
follow the formatting instructions provided at:

   http://www.wcci2010.org

When you have completed your paper and are ready to submit it, please go to:

   http://ieee-cis.org/conferences/fuzzieee2010/upload.php?PaperID=263

to submit your final camera-ready paper. On this page you will need to use
the following password:

   z427x25v2

which is valid only for a single submission of your final camera-ready paper
and you cannot submit any subsequent revision. Final papers MUST be submitted
by May 2, 2010. Any papers submitted after this date run the risk of not being
included in the proceedings. The paper must be re-submitted even if the
reviewers indicated that no changes are required.

IMPORTANT: Please note that once you submit your paper, you cannot submit any
subsequent revision. All papers submitted through the web site are considered
to be in final form and ready for publication. Do not submit your paper until
you are ready. A good suggestion is to have a few colleagues review your
paper to provide final remarks on its suitability before submitting it through
the web site. In addition please note that the proceedings will be printed in
black and white, not in color and it is the author's responsibility to ensure
that all figures/plots can be printed and understood in black and white.

3. In order for your paper to be published in the conference
proceedings, a *signed IEEE Copyright Form* must be submitted for each
paper. WCCI 2010 has registered to use the IEEE Electronic Copyright
(eCF) service. The confirmation page shown after submitting
your final paper contains a button linking directly to a secure IEEE
eCF site which allows electronic completion of the copyright assignment
process. In case it fails, please have the completed IEEE Copyright
Form, found at
http://www.ieee.org/web/publications/rights/copyrightmain.html faxed to
the Registration Chair, Carlos Molina, at +34 953 21 28 83 or email
it to carlosmo@ujaen.es.

If the fax machine does not answer or is busy, please try again later.

IMPORTANT: No paper can be published in the proceedings without being
accompanied by a Completed IEEE Copyright Transfer Form. You must
complete and submit this form to have your paper included in the
conference proceedings.

4. Register for the conference at http://www.wcci2010.org by clicking on the
conference registration link on the left-hand side of the main page. This link
will be activated very soon.

IMPORTANT: Each paper must have a corresponding registered author to be
included in the proceedings. Papers that do not have an associated registered
author will not be included in the proceedings. The deadline for author
registration is May 2, 2010 so be sure to register by that time to ensure that
your paper is included in the proceedings. Registering late may mean that

your paper may not appear in the proceedings. Please ensure that you complete
your registration early.

5. Make your hotel reservation for the 2010 IEEE WCCI with information
obtained on the hotel reservation link "Accommodation" of the main I2010 IEEE
WCCI page at http://www.wcci2010.org.

If you have any questions regarding the reviews of your paper please contact
Piero Bonissone <bonissone@ge.com>. Thank you for participating in what
promises to be an excellent meeting.

Sincerely, Piero Bonissone <bonissone@ge.com>

FORMATTING REQUIREMENTS

Your paper does not need any formatting changes.

REVIEWERS' COMMENTS

REVIEW NO. 1

Originality: Weak Accept
Significance of topic: Weak Accept
Technical quality: Accept
Relevance to FUZZ-IEEE 2010:Accept
Presentation: Accept
Overall rating: Accept

Reviewer's expertise on the topic: High
Suggested form of presentation: Oral
Best Paper Award nomination: No

Comments to the authors:
   This is a well-written and interesting paper on heuristic search for fuzzy-rough
feature selection. The

   experimental results are encouraging.

REVIEW NO. 2

Originality: Weak Accept
Significance of topic: Neutral
Technical quality: Weak Accept
Relevance to FUZZ-IEEE 2010:Strong Accept
Presentation: Weak Accept
Overall rating: Weak Accept

Reviewer's expertise on the topic: High
Suggested form of presentation: Poster
Best Paper Award nomination: No

Comments to the authors:
   1. I would suggest adding more thorough analysis of time complexity in order to

   understand how fast the proposed method is in comparison to other heuristics.

   2. I would strongly recommend comparing the results to those obtained using o-

   GA, that is order-based hybrid genetic algorithm implemented to search for

   reducts in the RSES system. As far as I know, this is the most successful (at

   least in most of the cases) algorithm known so far. For some references please

   look at some papers co-authored by Jakub Wroblewski.

   3. I would also recommend working with multiple reducts instead of a single

   reduct, which is now a strong trend in data mining (not only with regards to

   the rough set approaches). I understand that basing on a single reduct search

   provides convenient means for comparisons, but the classification results are

   not competitive to the state of the art, in general.

   4. In Introduction, when writing about extensions of rough sets, it would be

   good to mention also about those based on tolerance relations (see e.g. papers

co-authored by Stepaniuk) or massive discretization (so called roughfication -

Slezak and Wroblewski). Fuzzy extensions are very powerful but they are not the

only ones. It's important to make the paper complete.

5. Minor issues: Please decide whether you write "harmony search" or "Harmony

Search". In Section A, page 2, line 12 there is "are" - I'm not sure whether

it's right. There may be also some other minor corrections needed.

REVIEW NO. 3

Originality: Weak Accept
Significance of topic: Accept
Technical quality: Accept
Relevance to FUZZ-IEEE 2010: Strong Accept
Presentation: Weak Accept
Overall rating: Accept

Reviewer's expertise on the topic: Medium
Suggested form of presentation: Oral
Best Paper Award nomination: No

Comments to the authors:
   This work presents two new approaches for feature selection based on harmony

   search to solve feature selection problems.

   Detailed comments:

   1. It's better to change "novel" into "new" in this paper.

   2. The experiment part needs to enhance.