

MAGISTRATES CASES 1990 INDEX

Magistrates' Court Victoria

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN 1990

	Case	No.
Altmann v Moloney	26	/90
Antoniadis v Koutroubas	31	/90
Austin v Atkinson		
Bayly v Scarica (1990) VR 731		
Bakker v O'Connor		
Bergin v Brown (1990) VR 888		
Binting v Wilson		
Bolton, Re		
Bracken v O'Sullivan		
Burns v Rae		
Carpet Call (Vic) Pty Ltd v Suckling		
Carroll v Young	24	/90
Chugg v Pacific Dunlop Ltd (1990) 64 ALJR 599; 95 ALR 481; 170 CLR 249; 34 IR 412; 50 A Crim R 85		
Clifford v Davis		,
Cosgriff v Bateman		
Czarnecki v McInnis		
David Syme & Co Pty Ltd v Ryan		
Delmastro v Sergi		
Dickinson v Brown		
Durose, Re [1991] 1 VR 176		
Entwistle v Parkes [1991] 1 VR 317	11	/90
FAI Insurances Ltd v Herscu		
Flanagan v Castles		
Francis v Rice		
Fraser v Spencer-Gardner		
Gabriel v Campbell	56	/90
Gates v Lloyd		
Humphrey v Edwards		
Kearney v City Saab		
Kearon v Grant [1991] 1 VR 321		
Kennan v Mears		
Kennedy v Osman	42	/90
Latoudis v Casey (1990) 65 ALJR 151; 97 ALR 45; 170 CLR 534; 50 A Crim R 287		
Lisiecki v Grigg		
Marble Meadows Pty Ltd v Robin Daley Holdings Pty Ltd		
Mills v Meeking 91 ALR 16; (1990) 64 ALJR 10; 169 CLR 214; 45 A Crim R 373; 10 MVR 257	5	/90
Mooney v Edwards		
Nicholson v Avon (1991) 1 VR 212		
Patten v Adams		
Petrie v Wells		
R v Cummins (1991) 1 VR 44	39	/90
R v Dailakis		
R v Gherghe		
R v Hodge R v Mav		
R v Marabito (1990) 50 A Crim R 412		
R v Newman		
R v Nuri (1990) VR 641; 49 A Crim R 253		
R v Young (1990) VR 951; (1990) 45 A Crim R 147		
Ross v Garvey		
SBI Sales Pty Ltd v Chick Pty Ltd		
Scutchings v George 94 ALR 557; (1991) 1 VR 732	16	/90
Social Security Dept v Heath Insurance		
Stafford v Redmond		
Walsh v Loughnan		
Welsh v Enders		,
Woodward v Morgan (1990) 10 MVR 474		
Zev Eizik Corp Pty Ltd v Pro-Image Pty Ltd		
Zurich Insurance Ltd v Contour Mobel Pty Ltd		
Sales modules but a contour model ity but	20	, , , ,

SUBJECT MATTER

SUBJECT MATTER

AGENCY

- Estate agency - commission - "legally bound": 30/90

BAIL

- Adjournment for pre-sentence report - refused - public interest: 15/90

CIVIL PROCEEDINGS

- Jurisdictional limit "amount sought to be recovered": 55/90
- Repairer's lien car in police possession entitlement to sue: 36/90

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW

- Boundary between Vic. and NSW - test to determine: 27/90

CONTRACT

- Quantum meruit - work done by solicitor - onus of proof: 24/90

COSTS

- Civil proceedings to follow event in ordinary circumstances: 29/90
- Summary proceedings should generally be awarded to successful defendant: 43A/90

CRIMINAL LAW

- Breach of peace arrest trespassing: 48/90
- Conduct endangering life recklessness elements: 7/90
- Committal suppressing publication: 10/90
 - test for Court intervention: 26/90
 - time limit extent of application of: 22/90
- DNA reasonable belief of police officer: 44/90
- Drug of dependence Cannabis familiarity with: 40/90
 - continuity: 40/90
 - possession of deeming provision: 50/90
- Fingerprints order duty of court upon application for: 45/90
- Unlawful possession burden on prosecution/defendant: 12/90
- Wilful damage test to be applied: 13/90

DEBT

- Recovery of judgment debt - instalment order: 37/90

EVIDENCE

- Voir dire - held to determine service: 47/90

FENCES

- Whether fence sufficient for both occupiers: 49/90

GAMING AND BETTING

- Poker video machine judicial notice of game of "poker": 3/90
- Video poker machine part time employee occupier "possession": 4/90

INSURANCE

- Non-disclosure - "reduced to the amount": 28/90

MOTOR TRAFFIC

- Drink/driving certificate "in the prescribed form": 33/90
- certificate inadmissible: 46/90
- failure to go for breath test dismissal as trifling not appropriate: 54/90
- meaning of "breath analysing instrument": 38/90
- service of certificate voir dire: 47/90
- two episodes of driving one charge not bad for duplicity: 34/90
- Driving whilst disqualified penalty considerations: 21/90
- Insecure load novus actus interveniens: 17/90
- Parking infringement owner onus: 51/90
- Radar detector use of proscribed by State Act: 16/90
- Refusing breath test availability of instrument not relevant: 2/90
- Refusing to allow taking of blood sample reasonable time limit: 20/90
- S49(1)(f) RSAct 1986 accident not pre-condition for a charge abuse of process: 5/90
- compliance with Regulations: 14/90
- Speeding strict liability imposed for: 25/90

SUBJECT MATTER

- medical practitioner - defence of necessity: 8/90

NATURAL JUSTICE

- CBO to be made unqualified consent not forthcoming: 35/90
- Witness absent adjournment refused denial of natural justice: 53/90

OCCUPATIONAL HEALTH AND SAFETY

- Duty on employer - onus of proof on informant: 53/90

PARTNERSHIP

- Dissolved - distribution of bank balance - within jurisdiction: 31/90

PROCEDURE

- Adjournment-
 - for pre-sentence report bail pending: 15/90
 - witness absent: 47, 52/90
- A-G's consent not first obtained orders a nullity may be re-heard: 42/90
- Civil proceedings stay pending commercial arbitration: 23/90
- Committals intervention by Supreme Court: 26/90
 - time limits extent of: 22/90
- Duplicity one charge for 2 episodes: 34/90
- Evidence given in other cases cannot be used where not common knowledge: 3/90
- Fingerprint applications duty to take notes: 45/90
- Minimum term pre-sentence imprisonment not relevant in fixing: 18/90
- Reasons for decision not necessary where obvious: 2/90
- Reopening prosecution: 14/90
- Suppression order in committal proceedings: 10/90

SENTENCING

- Approach to not a two-stage process: 19/90
- Assault by spitting cumulative sentence: 56/90
- Drink/driving repeated offending: 6/90
- Driving whilst disqualified: 21/90
- Drugs of dependence cultivate/possess/use Cannabis conviction: 9/90
- trafficking heroin/cocaine: 41/90
- Motor car theft custodial sentence not inappropriate: 18/90
- Offender suffering mental illness Hospital order: 39/90
- Serious injury bouncer imprisonment: 57/90
- Theft from employer: 1, 43/90

STATUTORY INTERPRETATION

- Act may be divisible "or days": 11/90
- DNA blood sample "believes on reasonable grounds": 44/90
- Second or subsequent offence must be a first conviction: 6/90
- "Sufficient": 49/90
- Where language of Act not ambiguous: 5/90
- Workers' compensation "person liable to pay compensation": 32/90

WORDS AND PHRASES, CATCHWORDS, TRIGGERWORDS, KEYWORDS, CONCEPTS ETC.

[Note: Words and phrases judicially considered are in inverted commas. Ed.]

Abuse of process: 5/90

Accessory: 4/90

Adjournments: 15, 47, 52/90 A-G's consent to prosecution: 42/90

Agent's commission: 30/90 Ambiguous claim: 55/90 Amendment of claim: 55/90

"Amount sought to be recovered": 55/90

"Arbitration agreement": 23/90 Arbitration, commercial: 23/90 Arrest, power of: 48/90 Assault by spitting: 56/90 Autrefois convict: 42/90

Bail pending pre-sentence report: 15/90 "Believes on reasonable grounds": 44/90

Bill of costs: 24/90

Avulsion: 27/90

WORDS AND PHRASES, CATCHWORDS, CONCEPTS etc.

Blood sample, refusal to give: 20, 44/90

Bouncer causing injury: 57/90

Boundary between Vic. and NSW: 27/90

Breach of Peace: 48/90 Breathalyser operator: 14/90 "Breath analysing instrument": 38/90 Cancellation of registration: 21/90

Cannabis-

- familiarity with: 40/90 - sentencing: 9/90

Care and management: 4/90

CBO, consent: 35/90

Certificate in drink/driving cases: 33, 46/90

Cocaine, sentencing: 41/90 Commercial arbitration: 23/90

Commission: 30/90

Committal-

- intervention in: 26/90 - suppression order: 10/90 - time limitation: 22/90

Common gaming house: 4/90 Compliance with Regulations: 14/90 Conduct endangering life: 7/90

Consent-

- to CBO: 35/90

- to prosecution: 42/90

Constitutional law: 27/90

Continuity: 40/90 Costs: 29, 43A/90 "Covers the field": 16/90 Debt recovery: 37/90

Defence-

- of necessity: 8/90

- novus actus interveniens: 17/90 - Proudman v Dayman: 25/90

"Description of the specifications": 38/90

Dismissal as trifling: 54/90

DNA: 44/90

Drink/driving: 2, 5,6, 14, 33, 34, 38, 46, 54/90

Driving whilst disqualified: 21/90 Drug of dependence: 9, 40, 50/90

Duplicity: 34/90

Duty to give reasons: 45, 54/90 Estate agent's commission: 30/90 "Evidence to the contrary": 14/90

Exceptions: 53/90

Familiarity with drug: 40/90

"Order": 42/90 Owner onus: 51/90 Parking infringement: 51/90 Partnership assets: 31/90 Peace, breach of: 48/90

"Person liable to pay compensation": 32/90

Pleadings: 23/90 "Poker": 3/90 "Possession": 4, 50/90

Possessory lien: 36/90 "Practicable": 53/90 "Prescribed": 33/90

Pre-sentence report detention: 15/90

Prior convictions: 6/90

Privilege, public interest immunity: 26/90 Proudman v Dayman defence: 25/90

Quantum meruit: 24/90 Radar detector: 16/90 "Reasonable grounds": 44/90 "Reasonable suspicion": 44/90 Reasons for decision: 2, 9, 45, 54/90

Recklessness: 7, 13/90

"Reduced to the amount": 28/90 Refusal of bail pending report: 15/90

CASES REFERRED TO, APPLIED, CONSIDERED etc.

Refuse blood sample: 20/90 Refuse breath test: 2/90 Registration cancellation: 21/90

Rehearing: 42/90

Reopening Prosecution case: 14/90

Repairer's lien: 36/90

Road Safety Act 1986 operation: 11/90 Sample of blood refused: 20/90 Second or subsequent offence: 6/90

Sentencing: 1, 6, 9, 15, 19, 39, 40, 43, 56, 57/90

Serious injury by bouncer: 57/90

Solicitor's costs: 24/90

"So far as is practicable": 53/90

Speeding-

necessity: 8/90strict liability: 25/90

Spitting: 56/90

Statutory interpretation: 5, 6, 11, 16/90

Strict liability: 25/90
"Sufficient": 49/90
"Sufficient evidence": 14/90
Suppression order: 10/90
"Suspicion": 44/90

Theft from employer: 1, 43/90 Threatened breach of peace: 48/90 Time limitation on committals: 22/90

Trafficking sentencing: 41/90

Trespassing: 48/90
Trifling offence: 54/90
Unconditional sale note: 30/90
Unlawful possession: 12/90
"Value of the subject matter": 31/90

Venue: 55/90

Video poker machine: 3, 4/90

Voir dire: 47/90 Wilful damage: 13/90 "Wilfully": 13/90

Workers compensation: 32/90

CASES REFERRED TO, APPLIED, CONSIDERED ETC.

Ackroyd & Sons v Hasan (1960) 2 QB 144, referred to: 30/90

Addicoat v Dillon, MC 49/1989, referred to: 46/90

Advance (NSW) Insurance Agencies Pty Ltd v Matthews (1987) 4 ANZ Insur Cases 60-813, referred to: 28/90

A-G (NSW) v Hill and Halls Ltd (1923) 32 CLR 112, applied: 36/90

Alexandra Private Hospital v Commonwealth 162 CLR 271, referred to: 32/90

Alister v R (1984) 58 ALJR 97, applied: 26/90

Anglim and Cooke v Thomas (1974) VR 363, referred to: 40/90

Bell v Feehan (1985) VR 841, applied: 6/90

Bellgrove v Eldridge (1954) 90 CLR 613, referred to: 55/90 Berwin v Donohue (1915) 21 CLR 1, referred to: 42/90

Bloch v Bloch (1981) 37 ALR 55, referred to: 47/90

Bogdanovski v Buckingham (1989) VR 896, referred to: 2, 14/90; distinguished: 38/90

Bourke v Hamilton (1977) 1 NSWLR 470, applied: 26/90

British Medical Association v Commonwealth (1949) 79 CLR 201, referred to: 32/90

Broome v Chenoweth (1946) 73 CLR 583, referred to: 42/90

Buckoke v Greater London Council (1971) 1 Ch 655, explained: 8/90

Cahill v Howe (1986) VR 630, referred to: 37/90 Campbell v Epping (1970) TSR 215, referred to: 2/90 Carter v Inham (1984) WAR 123, referred to: 6/90 Cilli v Abbott (1981) 53 FLR 108, referred to 43/90

City of Brisbane v A-G Queensland (1908) 5 CLR 720, applied: 11/90

Commercial Radio Coffs Harbour v Fuller (1986) 161 CLR 47, referred to: 16/90

Cook v Blackburn (1989) VR 35, applied: 45/90

Cooper Brookes (Wollongong) Pty Ltd v FCT (1981) 35 ALR 151, applied: 5/90

Currie v Dempsey (1967) 2 NSWLR 532, distinguished: 24/90

Daire v Rollins (1982) 30 SASR 156, referred to: 20/90

Deeley v Stirrey (1932) VLR 159, discussed: 4/90

CASES REFERRED TO, APPLIED, CONSIDERED ETC.

Donald Campbell & Co. v Pollack (1927) AC 732, followed: 29, 43/90

Donelan v The Incorporated Nominal Defendant (1973) VR 490, applied: 55/90

Dowling v Bowie (1952) 86 CLR 136, applied: 53/90 Draper v Morgan (1979) TSR 247, applied: 2/90

Farrington v Thomson & Bridgland (1959) VR 286, referred to: 6/90

Ferrcom Pty Ltd v CU Assurance (1989) 5 ANZ Insur Cases 60-917, referred to: 28/90

Fisher v Automobile Finance Co of Aust (1928) VLR 496, applied: 36/90

Foley v Moloney (1987) 6 MVR 22, applied: 17/90

Gayford v Chouler (1898) 1 QB 316, referred to: 13/90

Gerlach v Pearson (1950) VLR 321, referred to: 30/90

George v Rockett (1990) 93 ALR 483, applied: 44/90

Georgianni v R (1985) 156 CLR 473, applied: 4/90

Halliday v Nevill (1984) 155 CLR 1, discussed: 48/90

Hamdorf v Riddle (1979) SASR 398, approved: 43/90

Hammond v Wolt (1975) VR 108, referred to: 23/90

Hazlett v Presnell (1982) 149 CLR 107, applied: 27/90

Hearn v McCann (1982) 29 SASR 448, applied: 25/90

Henry v Hasty, unrep, VSC. Murphy J, 30/11/77, applied: 40/90

He Kaw Teh v R (1985) 157 CLR 523, distinguished: 50/90

Hoare v R (1989) 86 ALR 361, referred to: 19/90

Hudson vMonahan (1970) VR 84, referred to: 2/90

Humphrey v Wills (1989) VR 439, referred to: 47/90

Iacovo v Lacanale (1957) VR 553, referred to: 2/90

Jeffcott v Andrew Motors Ltd (1960) NZLR 721, applied: 36/90

King v McLellan (1974) VR 773, referred to: 48/90

Kingshott v Goodyear Tyre and Rubber Co (No. 2) (1987) 8 NSWLR 707, distinguished: 53/90

Knox v Bible (1907) VLR 485, applied: 6/90

Lamb v Morrow (1986) VR 623, referred to: 5/90

Lombard Aust Ltd v Wells Park Motors Pty Ltd (1960) VR 693, applied: 36/90

Luxor (Eastbourne) Ltd v Cooper (1941) AC 108, referred to: 30/90

McArthur v McRae (1974) VR 353, applied: 3/90

McColl v Lehmann (1987) VR 505, referred to: 47, 52/90

McInnis v R (1979) 27 ALR 449, applied: 47/90

McLean, ex parte (1930) 43 CLR 472, applied: 16/90

McWaters v Day (1989) 64 ALJR 41, applied: 16/90

Meeking v Crisp (1989) VR 740, affirmed: 5/90; referred to: 46/90

Mesley v Ralte (1988) 7 MVR 170, referred to: 20/90

Midgley Estate Ltd v Hand (1952) 2 QB 432, referred to: 30/90

Miles v Gilmore (1989) VR 413, referred to: 46/90

Mintern-Lane v Kercher (1968) VR 552, referred to: 2/90

Morris v Beardmore (1981) AC 446, referred to: 48/90

Moors v Burke (1919) 26 CLR 265, referred to: 4/90

Nimmo v Alexander Cowan & Sons Ltd (1968) AC 107, distinguished: 53/90

O'Connor v Bini (1908) VLR 567, applied: 6/90

O'Hara v Harrington (1962) TSR 165, referred to: 6/90

Peebles v Hotchin (1988) 8 MVR 147, referred to: 34/90

Ritter v Godfrey (1922) KB 47, applied: 29/90

Riverside Motors Pty Ltd v Abrahams (1945) VLR 45, referred to: 24/90

Roper v Knott (1898) 1 QB 868, referred to: 13/90

R v Bates (1911) 1 KB 964, referred to: 42/90

R v Brattoli (1971) VR 446, referred to 42/90

R v Bridges (1986) 20 ACR 271, referred to: 9/90

R v Clarke & Johnstone (1986) VR 643, applied: 50/90

R v Chin (1985) 157 CLR 671, discussed: 14/90

R v Cox (1960) VR 665, referred to: 47/90

R v Crabbe (1985) 156 CLR 464, applied: 7/90

R v Dainer; xp Milevich (1988) 91 FLR 33, referred to: 43/90

R v Dole (1975) VR 754, referred to: 19/90

R v Fox (1985) 1 WLR 1126, referred to: 48/90

R v Hill (1983) 2 VR 231, referred to: 35/90

R v Judge Bland; xp DPP (1987) VR 225, referred to: 42/90

R v Loughnan (1981) VR 433, referred to: 8/90

R v Lee (1950) 82 CLR 133, referred to: 48/90

R v Maio (1989) VR 281, referred to: 50/90

R v Martin (1989) 1 All ER 652, applied: 8/90

R v McGill (1967) VR 683, referred to: 47/90

R v Pantorno (1988) VR 195, applied: 9/90

TABLE OF STATUTORY/REGULATORY OFFENCES

R v Robinson (1975) VR 816, applied: 39/90 R v Waterfield (1964) 1 QB 164, applied: 48/90

R v Williscroft (1975) VR 292, applied: 19/90

Sankey v Whitlam (1979-80) 142 CLR 1, applied: 26/90 Scott v Dunstone (1963) VR 575, not followed: 2/90

Spicer v Holt (1977) AC 987, referred to: 48/90

Stillman v Falla (1977) VR 212, applied: 17/90

Sun Alliance Insurance Ltd v Massoud (1989) VR 8, applied: 45/90

Taylor v Pope (1979) 21 SASR 468, referred to: 13/90 Tepper v Kelly (1987) 45 SASR 340, referred to: 12/90

Tri-Continental Corp Ltd v Comm'r Taxn (1987) 87 FLR 453, referred to: 32/90

Twenty-first Maylux Pty Ltd v Mercantile Mutual (1989) 6 ANZ Insur Cases 76, 302, followed: 28/90

Tynan v A'Beckett (1923) VLR 412, referred to: 30/90 Veen v R (No 2) 164 CLR 465, referred to: 6, 19/90

Victoria v Commonwealth (1937) 58 CLR 618, applied: 16/90

Ward v R (1980) 142 CLR 308, referred to: 27/90 Welsh v Donnelly (1983) 2 VR 173, referred to: 25/90

White v Feast (1872) LR 7 QB 353, referred to: 13/90

White, Re (1987) 9 NSWLR 427, applied: 8/90

Williams v Booth (1910) 10 CLR 341, referred to: 27/90

Yorkshire Insurance v Clayton 8 QBD 421, referred to: 11/90

TABLE OF STATUTORY/REGULATORY REFERENCES

Bail Act 1977, s4(1)(c): 15/90

Commercial Arbitration Act 1984, s53: 23/90 Constitution (Cth.), s51: 32/90 s109: 16/90 Crimes (Aircraft) Act 1963 (Cth.), ss6, 21: 42/90

Crimes Act 1958, s22: 7/90; ss464K, M, O, P: 45/90; s464U: 44/90; ss457, 458, 459A, 462: 48/90 Drugs, Poisons and Controlled Substances Act 1981, s5: 50/90; s72: 9/90; s73: 9, 40, 50/90 ss 75, 76: 9/90; s120: 40/90

Environment Protection Act 1970, ss48A, 56: 48/90

Fences Act 1968, ss4, 7: 49/90

Fishing (General) Regulations 1981, R76: 27/90 Insurance Contracts Act 1984 (Cth.), s28(3): 28/90

Interpretation of Legislation Act 1984, s7: 11/90; s10A: 11/90; s5: 5/90

Judgment Debt Recovery Act 1984, s6: 37/90 Listening Devices Act 1969, ss4A, 5: 26/90

Lotteries Gaming and Betting Act 1968, s66B: 4/90; s68: 3, 4/90; s69: 4/90

Magistrates' Courts Act 1971, s3: 42/90; s50: 55/90; s51(2): 31, 55/90; s53(2): 23/90; s60: 4/90

Magistrates (Summary Proceedings) Act 1975, s44(4): 10/90; s47A: 22/90; s76: 55/90; s89A-P: 51/90; s97(b): 43A/90; s168: 53/90

Magistrates' Courts Rules 1980, R157: 29/90

Mental Health Act 1986, s15: 39/90

Occupational Health and Safety Act 1985, ss4, 21: 53/90

Penalties and Sentences Act 1985, s7(1): 18/90; s28: 35/90; s39: 35/90; s81: 54/90

Police Regulation Act 1958, s125: 36/90

Radio Communications Act 1983: 16/90

Road Safety Act 1986, s3: 38/90; ss30, 31: 21/90; s47: 5/90; s48(2): 6/90; s49(1)(b): 5, 6/90; s49(1)(e): 2, 54/90; s49(1)(f): 5, 6, 11, 14, 33, 38, 46/90; s50(1): 6, 54/90; s53: 5/90; s55(1) 2, 5, 38, 54/90; s55(4): 33/90; s55(9): 20/90; s56: 20/90; s57: 47/90; s58(1)(2): 33, 46/90; s58(4)(5): 14, 38/90; s74: 16/90; ss85, 86: 51/90

Road Safety (Procedures) Regulations 1987, rr104, 302: 14/90; rr314-318: 33/90

Road Safety (Traffic) Regulations 1988, r1001: 8, 25/90; r1606: 17/90

Social Security Act 1947, s135R: 32/90

Summary Offences Act 1966, s9(1)(c): 13/90; s26: 12/90

Supreme Court Act 1958, s87: 24/90

Workers Compensation Act 1958, s26: 32/90

Edited by: Patrick Street LL B, Dip Crim

C/o Magistrates' Court,

GPO Box 882G,

Melbourne Vic. 3001

© 1990-2007 The Magistrates' Court of Victoria