



Magistrates' Court
Victoria

MAGISTRATES CASES 1998

INDEX

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN 1998

	Case No.
Akbulut v Grimshaw (Hampel J)	4/98
Bailey v Attorney-General for Victoria (Kellam J)	25/98
Bayne v Martin (Hampel J)	18/98
Blanksby v Barnes (Hampel J) 26 MVR 471; (1997) 96 A Crim R 92; [1998] 2 VR 164	3/98
Chapman v Kavanagh (Smith J) 26 MVR 43	6/98
Clifford v Adams (Smith J)	33/98
Commonwealth Bank of Australia v Zolis (Hampel J)	23/98
DPP (Cwth) v Abbott (Gillard J) (1997) 97 A Crim R 19	2/98
DPP v Constantinou (Hedigan J) 27 MVR 120; (1997) 98 A Crim R 558	9/98
DPP v Dahl (Smith J) (1997) 96 A Crim R 502	11/98
DPP v Drucker (Gillard J) (1997) 98 A Crim R 142; 27 MVR 248	8/98
DPP v McKee (Beach J)	32/98
DPP v Miers (Smith J) (1997) 96 A Crim R 408	10/98
DPP v Nicholson (Hedigan J) 27 MVR 120; (1997) 98 A Crim R 558	9/98
DPP v Rogers (Harper J)	22/98
DPP v Williams (Smith J)	30/98
Foskett v Burgess & Anor (Harper J)	28/98
Graco v Magistrates' Court of Victoria & Anor (Beach J)	26/98
Herald & Weekly Times v Hansard & Anor (Beach J)	12/98
Jones v Tysoe (McDonald J) 27 MVR 218	17/98
Kaschke v Hornsby & Anor (Balmford J) (1998) 27 MVR 337	21/98
Knowles v Haritos & Anor (Hampel J)	19/98
Long v Magistrates' Court of Victoria (Gillard J) (1997) 96 A Crim R 149	1/98
Lovejoy v Johnson (Coldrey J)	7/98
Mutemeri v Cheeseman (Mandie J)	20/98
O'Dea & Anor v Magistrates' Court & Anor (Gillard J)	29/98
Perry v Van Maanen (Hedigan J) (1998) 27 MVR 299	27/98
R v Alexopoulos (Hampel J)	15/98
R v Majeric (Gillard J)	31/98
R v Parsons (Court of Appeal) (1997) 97 A Crim R 267; [1998] 2 VR 478	16/98
Sailah v Lakeside Packaging Pty Ltd & Ors (Coldrey J)	13/98
Shocked v Goldschmidt [1998] 1 All ER 372 (Court of Appeal (England))	14/98
Siomos Bros Pty Ltd v Amocet Pty Ltd (Hampel J)	24/98
Wright v Morton (Court of Appeal) [1998] 3 VR 316 (1997) 95 A Crim R 125; 26 MVR 159..	5/98

SUBJECT MATTER

BAIL

Application for bail — Possession of heroin — must show exceptional circumstances — personal difficulties with applicant's family — undue delay — bail granted: 15/98 cf 31/98

Application for bail — Possession of heroin — must show exceptional circumstances — considerations in bail applications — parity: 2/98

Application for variation of bail — accused committed for trial for murder — bail granted — variation must be heard by committing magistrate — "exceptional circumstances": 32/98

CIVIL PROCEEDINGS

Application to set aside — different categories — judgment in default of defence or appearance — relevant considerations: 14/98

Application to set aside — judgment in default of defence — complaint sufficiently particularised — application properly refused — particulars — sufficiency of: 13/98

Certificate of judgment filed in Supreme Court — no power in magistrate to hear an application to set aside: 23/97 cf 29/98

Contract — sale of land — special conditions attached — appropriate test — "Absolute discretion" — "Prosecute an appeal": 24/98

Garnishee order made on bank — not necessary to produce passbook to withdraw funds: 23/98

Particulars of complaint — must disclose a cause of action: 13/98

Rehearing application — order irregularly obtained — considerations: 29/98

COSTS

On dismissal of charge — relevant considerations — interest not allowable: 7/98

Search warrant issued — order made on return of warrant — court has power to make an order for costs: 26/98

CRIMINAL LAW

Abuse of process — accused acquitted of culpable driving charges — lesser driving charges sought to be proceeded with — not an abuse of process: 17/98

Interstate transfer of prisoner — "harsh or oppressive" — meaning of: 25/98

Obtaining property by deception — cheques obtained by false pretences — such cheques are "property belonging to another" and capable of being dishonestly obtained: 16/98

Recklessly endangering life — test to be applied — proof of the endangering conduct: 20/98

Unlawful possession — property in motor car — driver arrested — property found in boot of motor car — driver not guilty of unlawful possession: 10/98

Unlawful possession — suspected property in house — owner of property under informal arrest — not guilty of unlawful possession: 11/98

LIQUOR CONTROL

Condition of liquor permit breached - nominee absent at time of breach - case to answer: 22/98

MOTOR TRAFFIC Drink/driving—

Blood test — outside 3-hour period — presumption of continuance cannot be applied: 5/98

Blood test — whether within 3-hour period — no admissions — effect of: 6/98

Breath test held in police car — "police station or other place" — police car not "other place": 30/98

Preliminary breath test — not an element of offence that officer inform driver of result of PBT: 9/98

Presumption of continuance — cannot be applied where 3-hour period expired — failure to give evidence — no adverse inference to be drawn — where prosecution seeks to rely on certificate must comply with time limit: 5/98

Pre-trial disclosure — order made for uncontrolled delivery of breath analysing instrument, software and documents — order too wide: 21/98

Reading 0.101 — whether more than 0.10 — for penalty purposes the two decimal place measurement should be applied: 3/98

Requirement to undergo breath test — person not told reason why required to go to police station — element of offence — charge dismissed: 9/98

Sentencing — expert evidence called on — such evidence may be called if relevant and admissible — "relevant time" is when result of the breath analysis was recorded: 8/98

Driving-

Speeding — proposal to call expert evidence — letter not sufficient: 28/98

NATURAL JUSTICE

Suppression order made — order temporary until arrival of legal practitioner — practitioner to be heard on variation of order: 12/98

PRACTICE AND PROCEDURE

Amendment of charge — error as to year — appropriate to amend charge: 18/98

Certificate of judgment — filed in Supreme Court — no power in magistrate to hear application to set aside: 23/97 cf 29/98

Interstate transfer of prisoner — "harsh or oppressive" — meaning of: 25/98

TABLE OF CASES REFERRED TO, CONSIDERED, APPLIED ETC.

TABLE OF CASES REFERRED TO, CONSIDERED, APPLIED ETC.

Alderson v Booth [1967] 2 QB 216, referred to: 10, 11/98
 Allen v Taylor [1992] 1 PIQR P255, referred to: 14/98
 Allitt v Sullivan (1988) VR 621, referred to: 1, 33/98
 Arno v Forsyth (1986) 65 ALR 125, referred to: 33/98
 Attorney-General of Hong Kong v Nai-Keung [1987] 1 WLR 1339, distinguished: 4/98
 Australian Paper Manufacturers v American International [1994] 1 VR 685, applied: 24/98
 Ayrton v Abbott 14 QB 17, referred to: 30/98
 Baker v Campbell (1983) 153 CLR 52, referred to: 1/98
 Black-Clawson Ltd v Papierwerke AG (1975) AC 591, referred to: 1/98
 Bolton v Glover (1986) MVR 463, referred to: 30/98
 Bond v Reynolds [1960] VR 601, distinguished: 22/98
 Broome v Chenoweth (1946) 73 CLR 583, applied: 18/98
 Browne-Kerr, Application for bail by, unrep, Coldrey J, 10 August 1993, referred to: 2/98
 Bunning v Cross (1977-78) 141 CLR 54, referred to: 9, 33/98
 Chappell v A Ross & Sons Pty Ltd (1969) VR 376, followed: 22/98
 Cheney v Spooner (1928) 41 CLR 532, applied: 26/98
 Chitty v Mason [1926] VLR 419, referred to: 13, 29/98
 Clayton v Thomas C Denton & Co Pty Ltd [1972] VR 46, referred to: 13/98
 Coward & Ors v Allen & Ors (1984) 52 ALR 320, referred to: 30/98
 Craddock v Barber [1986] CA Transcript 159, cited: 14/98
 Dalzotto v Lowell MC6/93, referred to: 3/95; applied: 9/98
 Danny Kidron & Anor v Garrett (1994) 35 NSWLR 572, followed: 29/98
 Doney v R [1990] 171 CLR 207, referred to: 10/98
 DPP v Constantinou 27 MVR 120, followed: 30/98
 DPP v Miers MC10/98, referred to: 11/98
 DPP v Schevella, unrep, Beach J, 12 January 1997, referred to: 2/98
 DPP v Spiridon (1989) VR 352, not followed: 2/98
 DPP v Webb [1993] 2 VR 403, applied: 22/96; 18, 30/98
 Elsun v Jameson [1974] VR 529, cited: 13/98
 Entick v Carrington (1765) 19 State Tr 1029, referred to: 1/98
 Entwistle v Parkes, unrep, Hedigan J, 25/9/92, referred to: 5/98
 Evans v Bartlam [1937] 2 All ER 646, applied: 14/98
 Filmer v Barclay [1994] 2 VR 269, followed: 20/98
 Gaffee v Johnson (1996) A Crim R 157, applied: 21/98
 George v Rockett (1990) 170 CLR 104, followed: 33/98
 Goodman v Stafford [1992] 15 MVR 145, applied: 18/98
 Grima v Hender, unrep, Beach J, 21 December 1995, followed: 1/98
 Grimshaw v Dunbar [1953] 1 All ER 350, cited: 14/98
 Hackwill v Kay [1960] VR 632, referred to: 18/98
 Hatzinikolaou v Snape (1989) 41 A Crim R 389, referred to: 11/98
 Herald & Weekly Times Ltd v Braun & Ors [1994] 1 VR 705, distinguished: 12/98; referred to: 20/98
 Heywood v Robinson [1975] VR 562, not followed: 5/98
 Hofstetter v Thomas [1968] VR 199, explained: 10/98
 Holland v Jones (1917) 23 CLR 149, followed: 20/98
 Hynes v Bux MC17/97, referred to: 32/98
 Intrac (Sales) Pty Ltd v Riverside Plumbing & Gasfitting Pty Ltd, unrep, Eames J, 2 July 1997, followed: 13/98
 Jones v Dunkel (1959) 101 CLR 298, referred to: 6/98
 Kerr v Hannon [1992] 1 VR 43, distinguished: 18/98
 Kisilinsky v Spence (1989) 10 MVR 163, considered: 6/98
 Kitchen v Cox (1996) 85 A Crim R 328, applied: 10, 11/98
 Kostokanellis v Allen (1974) VR 596, referred to: 29/98
 Khyat v Schmidt [1924] VLR 499, cited: 29/98
 Latoudis v Casey (1990) 170 CLR 534, applied: 21/97; 7/98
 Long v Magistrates' Court (1997) 96 A Crim R 149, referred to: 33/98
 Lowe v Blease [1975] Crim L Rev 513, referred to: 4/98
 Lowe v R (1984) 154 CLR 606, applied: 2/98
 Madin v McMahon [1986] VR 134, followed: 29/98
 Maloney, Application for bail by, unrep, Vincent J, 31 October 1990, referred to: 2/98
 McCardy v McCormack [1994] 2 VR 517, applied: 9/98
 McDonald v McDonald [1965] ALR 166, referred to: 25/98
 McKeown v Hill [1984] VR 350, considered: 10/98
 McPherson v Goldstone [1920] VLR 331, referred to: 11/98
 Midland Bank Trust v Green (No 3) [1979] 2 All ER 193, cited: 14/98
 Moors v Burke (1919) 26 CLR 265, applied: 10/98
 Norton v Morphet and Anor (1995) 83 A Crim R 90; MC 15/95, applied: 7/98

TABLE OF CASES REFERRED TO, CONSIDERED, APPLIED ETC.

O'Donnell v Reichard [1975] VR 916, referred to: 6/98
Olholm v Clink [1923] VLR 556, referred to: 11/98
Packer v Denny [1986] CA Transcript 310, cited: 14/98
Perry v Lean and Fry (1985) 39 SASR 515, cited: 25/98
Pippos v Craig [1993] 1 VR 603, referred to: 5/98
Postiglione v R (1997) 71 ALJR 875, referred to: 2/98
Quazi v Quazi [1980] AC 744, followed: 30/98
R v Adams, unrep, CA, 15 February 1996, referred to: 20/98
R v Alexopoulos MC15/98, explained: 31/98
R v Campbell (1995) 80 A Crim R 461, referred to: 20/98
R v Cheer [1979] VR 541, not followed: 5/98
R v D, unrep, Hampel J, 3 July 1995, cited: 20/98
R v Danger (1857) 7 Cox CC 303, considered: 16/98
R v Duru [1974] 1 WLR 2, followed: 16/98
R v Governor of Brixton Prison, xp Stallmann [1912] 3 KB 424, followed: 16/98
R v Inglis [1917] VLR 672, referred to: 8/98
R v Inwood (1973) 1 WLR 647, referred to: 10, 11/98
R v Koene [1982] VR 916, referred to: 12/96
R v Kohn (1979) 69 Cr App R 395, cited: 4/98
R v Murphy [1965] VR 187, cited: 8/98
R v Nuri [1990] VR 641, applied: 20/98
R v O' Donoghue (1988) 34 A Crim R 397, referred to: 10, 11/98
R v Olejarnik (1994) 33 NSWLR 567, followed: 5/98
R v Perry (No 2) (1981) 28 SASR 112, referred to: 30/98
R v Preddy & Ors [1996] AC 815, not followed: 16/98
R v Sobh 74 A Crim R 453, referred to: 7/98
R v Tiddy (1969) SASR 575, applied: 2/98
Re Alstergren and Nosworthy [1947] 1 VLR 23, applied: 25/98
Re ANZ Bank Ltd v Evriniadis [1972] VR 690, distinguished: 23/98
Re Barraclough (decd) [1965] 2 All ER 311, cited: 14/98
Re Dalton, unrep. Teague J, 20 June 1995, referred to: 25/98
Re Maher (1983) 76 FLR 284, applied: 25/98
Redl v Toppin MC23/93, applied: 12/95; referred to: 33/96
Renowden v McMullin (1970) 123 CLR 584, referred to: 13/98
Rogers v R (1994) 123 ALR 417, applied: 17/98
Rowe v Galvin [1984] VR 350, considered: 10/98
Rushton v Braun & Whydah Solutions Pty Ltd MC23/97, not followed: 29/98
Ruzeu v Massey-Ferguson (Rust) Ltd [1983] 1 VR 733, cited: 13/98
Scilley v Potter (1991) 13 MVR 23, considered: 6/98
Scott v Dunstone (1963) VR 579, followed: 30/98
Smith v Maddison [1967] VR 307, not followed: 5/98
Smith v Van Maanen (1991) 14 MVR 365, referred to: 9/98
Sobh v Police Force of Victoria [1994] 1 VR 41, referred to: 21/98
The Saudi Eagle [1986] 2 Lloyd's Rep 221, cited: 14/98
Topfelt Pty Ltd v State Bank of NSW (1993) NSW Conv R 1155-676, followed: 24/98
Trent Brewery v Lehan (1895) 21 VLR 283, followed: 29/98
Vann v Awford (1986) 130 SJ 682, cited: 14/98
Walton v Gardiner (1993) 177 CLR 378, followed: 17/98
Weissensteiner v R (1993) 178 CLR 217, referred to: 5, 6/98
Wilson v R (1992) 174 CLR 313, referred to: 20/98
Wright v Bastin (No 2) [1979] VR 329, not followed: 5/98
Wrixon v Deehan (1865) 2 WW&A'B(L) 16, followed: 29/98
Zambelis v Nahas MC35/92, not followed: 13/98
Zoeller v Federal Republic of Germany (1989) 64 ALJR 137, cited: 2/98

WORDS AND PHRASES, CATCHWORDS, CONCEPTS ETC.

[Note: Words and phrases judicially considered are in inverted commas. Ed.]

"Absolute discretion": 24/98
Abuse of process: 17, 33/98
"Actual possession": 10, 11/98
Adverse inference: 5, 6/98
Amendment of charge: 18/98
Application to set aside: 13, 14, 29/98
Appropriation: 4/98
Arithmetic: 3/98

Arrest, person under: 10, 11/98
Bail exceptional circumstances: 2, 15, 31, 32/98
Bill of costs: 7/98
Blood sample for BAC: 5, 6/98
Blood sample taken outside 3-hr period: 5, 6/98
Breath test -
 - in police car: 30/98
 - to 3rd decimal point: 3/98
Certificate -
 - admissibility of in BAC cases: 5/98
 - for Supreme Court 29/98
 - validity of: 5/98
Cheques capable of being stolen: 16/98
Closure of court: 21/96: 12/98
Complaint, particularity of: 13/98
Compliance with rules: 11/95; 13/98
Conduct endangering life: 20/98
Continuance, presumption of: 5/98
Contract for sale of land: 24/98
Costs: 7, 26/98
Culpable driving acquittal: 17/98
"Damaged motor vehicle": 5/95
Deception obtaining property by: 16/98
Decimal place reading: 3/98
Delay in relation to bail: 15, 31/98
Drink/driving: 3, 5, 6, 8, 9, 21, 30/98
Earnings, attachment of: 13/97
Elements of drink/driving charge: 9/98
Error in charge: 18/98
Estoppel: 17/98
"Exceptional" circumstances: 2, 15, 31, 32/98
Exclusive possession: 10, 11/98
Form of search warrant: 1/98
Free agent: 11/98
Functus officio: 12/98
Garnishee order: 23/98
Guilty plea, effect of: 8/98
"Harsh": 25/98
HIV positive: 20/98
Indemnity basis costs: 7/98
Inference, drawing adverse: 5, 6/98
Intangible property: 4/98
Interest on costs claim: 7/98
Issue estoppel in criminal proceedings: 17/98
Judgment in default of -
 - appearance: 14/98
 - defence: 14/98
Judicial notice: 20/98
Liquor permit breached: 22/98
Mathematician's evidence: 3/98
"Matter": 26/98
Natural justice, breach of rules of: 12/98
Obtaining property by deception: 16/98
"Oppressive": 25/98
Order for demonstration: 19/98
"Other place": 30/98
Parity in bail applications: 2/98
Particulars of complaint: 13/98
Passbook: 23/98
PBT result: 9/98
"Permit": 22/98
Pleadings in Magistrates' Court: 13/98
Plea of guilty: 8/98
Preliminary breath test: 9/98
Pre-trial disclosure: 21/98
Presumption of continuance: 5/98
Prisoner transfer interstate: 25/98

Privilege: 33/98
"Proceeding": 26/98
"Property": 4/98
"Property belonging to another": 16/98
"Prosecute an appeal": 24/98
Public interest immunity: 33/98
Radar device: 28/98
Reading to 3rd decimal point: 3/98
Reasons -
 - for granting bail: 2/98
 - to be given: 7/98
Recklessly endangering life: 20/98
Rehearing: 13, 14, 29/98
"Relevant time": 8/98
Requirement, particularity of: 9/98
Search warrant -
 - costs of: 26/98
 - issue of: 1, 33/98
Sentencing: 8/98
Special conditions of contract: 24/98
Speed measuring device: 28/98
"Statement": 28/98
Statement of reasons: 2/98
Suppression order: 12, 20/98
Supreme Court certificate: 29/98
Telephone calls, theft of: 4/98
Temporal impossibility: 18/98
Theft of telephone calls: 4/98
Three-hour period expired: 5, 6/98
To be dealt with according to law: 26/98
"To prosecute an appeal": 24/98
Transfer of prisoner interstate: 25/98
Unlawful possession: 10, 11/98
Variation of bail: 32/98
Vexatious or oppressive: 17/98
Warrant to search: 1, 33/98
Withdrawal of funds from bank: 23/98

TABLE OF STATUTES AND REGULATIONS

Bail Act 1977 s4(2)(aa)(ii): 2, 15, 31/98 s4(4): 2/98; s13(2)(b): 32/98 s18: 32/98
Children and Young Persons Act 1989 s64: 12/98
Crimes Act 1958 s22: 20/98; s71(1): 4/98 s72: 4/98
 s81(1): 16/98; s82: 4/98; s465(1): 1, 33/98
Crimes (Form of Search Warrant) Regulations 1992 r5: 1, 26/98
Customs Act 1901 (Cwth) s233B(1)(ea): 2/98
Health Act 1958 s129(1): 20/98
Judicial Proceedings Reports Act 1958 s4(1A): 12/98
Liquor Control Act 1987 s122: 22/98
Magistrates' Court Act 1989 s37: 28/98; s50(1): 18/98; s75, 77, 78: 1/98; s111: 29/98; s112(2): 29/98;
 s126: 12/98; s131(1): 7, 26/98; s136: 19, 21/98; Sched 2, cl 1A(8): 28/98
Magistrates' Court Civil Procedure Rules 1989 r4.02(d): 13/98; r27.01(2): 23/98; r37.01: 21/98
Prisoners (Interstate Transfer) Act 1983 ss 15(b), 16: 25/98
Road Safety Act 1986 s48(1A): 5, 8/98; s49(1)(b): 5, 9, 30/98
 s49(1)(f): 8, 9, 30/98; s49(1)(g): 22/96; 5, 6/98; s53(1): 9/98
 s50(1A) (1AB): 3, 8/98; s55(1): 9, 30/98; s55(2): 9/98; s57(2)(3)(4): 5/98
Rules of the Supreme Court r71.03: 23/98
Summary Offences Act 1966 s26: 10, 11/98
Supreme Court Act 1986 s66(2): 7/98

Edited by: **Patrick Street LL B, Dip Crim**
 C/o Magistrates' Court, GPO Box 882G,
 Melbourne Vic. 3001