

Dr. Undo Uus
Tartu Observatory
Estonia
E-mail: uus@obs.ee

Dr. Keith Sutherland
Imprint Academic
PO Box 1
Thorverton EX5 5YX

5th May 1997

Dear Dr. Sutherland,

Herewith I send you a copy of a manuscript of my article "The Libertarian Imperative and its implications for consciousness studies." I intend to submit this article to the *Journal of Consciousness Studies* in the hope that they will publish it. However, I send this copy to you not as the publisher of the JCS, but as one of the scholars whom I know of being seriously interested in the free will issue (I regularly watch jcs-online and psyche-d discussions of consciousness problems), and whose opinion about my paper I should like to know before submitting it for publishing. I shall send the copies of this manuscript also to Daniel Dennett, Peter van Inwagen, David Hodgson, John Beloff, Timothy Sprigge and Piet Hut. If you would have any critical comments on this paper, would you please let me know of them, no matter in how concise a form. (My email address is: uus@obs.ee)

With best regards,
Yours
Undo Uus

From uus Wed Jun 4 12:53:29 1997

Subject: submission

To: jcs@imprint.co.uk

June 4, 1997

Dear Sirs,

I have completed an article on the free will problem "The Libertarian Imperative and its implications for consciousness studies" and should like to submit it for publication in the Journal of Consciousness Studies. Could you please tell me to whom of the editors of JCS you recommend to send the manuscript of this article?

I should like to send the text of my article to you also in an ordinary (ascii) email. Could you please send me by email an example (template) of such a file (e.g. an article already published in JCS; I subscribe for JCS) so that I could indicate captions, quotations, references, different fonts, etc in the way most advantageous for you.

My address: Undo Uus, Tartu Observatory, EE2444, ESTONIA

My e-mail address: uus@obs.ee

Yours sincerely,

Undo Uus

From jcs@imprint.co.uk Wed Jun 4 14:24:57 1997

From: jcs <jcs@imprint.co.uk>

Subject: Re: submission

In message <199706040953.MAA05846@cathy.obs.ee>, Undo Uus <uus@obs.ee> writes

>June 4, 1997

>

>Dear Sirs,

>

>I have completed an article on the free will problem "The Libertarian
>Imperative and its implications for consciousness studies" and should
>like to submit it for publication in the Journal of Consciousness
>Studies. Could you please tell me to whom of the editors of JCS you
>recommend to send the manuscript of this article?

I'd be quite interested in seeing it myself (address below).

>I should like to send the text of my article to you also in an
>ordinary (ascii) email. Could you please send me by email an example
>(template) of such a file (e.g. an article already published in JCS;
>I subscribe for JCS) so that I could indicate captions, quotations,
>references, different fonts, etc in the way most advantageous for you.

The thing is we need it in a form that's suitable for peer review,
rather than pre-coded for typesetting. This is why we encourage rtf or
encoded submissions of original wordprocessor files, rather than plain
ascii

--

Keith Sutherland

JKB SUTHERLAND, PUBLISHER

JOURNAL OF CONSCIOUSNESS STUDIES HISTORY OF POLITICAL
THOUGHT

IMPRINT ACADEMIC, PO BOX 1, THORVERTON EX5 5YX, UK

TEL: +44 (0)1392 841600. Fax: 841478. EMAIL: keith@imprint.co.uk

WWW: <http://www.zynet.co.uk/imprint>

From uus Wed Jun 4 15:39:24 1997
Subject: Re: submission
To: jcs@imprint.co.uk (jcs)

Dear Dr Sutherland,

Thank you for your prompt response to my query. I will send you copies of the manuscript of my article "The Libertarian Imperative and its implications for consciousness studies" in a few days.

Yours, Undo Uus

From:
Dr. Undo Uus
Tartu Observatory
Estonia
E-mail: uus@obs.ee

Dr. Keith Sutherland, Publisher
Journal of Consciousness Studies
Imprint Academic
PO Box 1
Thorverton EX5 5YX
U. K.

June 6, 1997

Dear Dr. Sutherland,

Herewith I send you four copies of a manuscript of my article "The Libertarian Imperative and its implications for consciousness studies." (Three copies are double-spaced, whereas the page format of the fourth copy is in a good approximation homologous to the new page format of the JCS so that it is possible to judge about the article's length in pages if printed in the JCS.)

I would be very glad if this my paper will be published in the Journal of Consciousness Studies. Could you please tell me when (approximately) you suppose you would reach the conclusion about whether or not this article is suitable for being printed in JCS. (My e-mail address is: uus@obs.ee)

Yours, Undo Uus

From keith@imprint.co.uk Tue Jun 10 18:11:35 1997
From: Keith Sutherland <keith@imprint.co.uk>
Subject: The Libertarian Imperative

Dear Undo Uus

Many thanks for sending me your interesting paper, which I greatly enjoyed reading. I'm personally sympathetic to your argument, but the paper would need to go through several iterations before it could be released for peer review in a hostile intellectual environment. I can think of a number of pre-reviewers who should be asked to read it, but it would need a lot of work done on it first.

The first task would be to read E.J. Lowe's "Subjects of Experience" (CUP 1996), which is an excellent critique of materialism, in many ways similar to your own. I will send you my personal copy. It might also help to start with a short review of scientists' attempts to resolve the problem -- in particular Schrödinger's debate on free will with Einstein and his puzzling on the topic in "What is Life":

'My body functions as a pure mechanism according to the laws of nature. Yet I know, by incontrovertible direct experience, that I am directing its motions, of which I foresee the effects, that may be fateful and all-important, in which case I feel and take full responsibility for them. To avoid a contradiction here, he said, "The only possible inference from these two facts is, I think, that I -- I in the widest meaning of the word, that is to say, every conscious mind that has ever said or felt 'I' -- am the person, if any, who controls the 'motion of the atoms' according to the laws of nature." And this would lead you to say, Schroedinger provocatively suggested: "Hence I am God Almighty".'

I've marked a number of small textual corrections on the manuscript which I will return to you. But the biggest problem is the last few pages, beginning with your attack on Crick and Koch. Why do you single them out for mention? Your paper focuses on volition and free will and C&K have chosen to research an area which is arguably furthest removed from this. I think you also do your case a disservice by suggesting that many scientists are guilty of a lack of private honesty. I'm sure that this may well be true of some, but it is an unfair generalisation.

As regards "ideological bias", this is something that we all suffer from in one form or another. The paper then ends up more as an exercise in rhetoric than a careful argument.

Also given the wide criticisms of attempting to equate free will with quantum indeterminacy I would be inclined to cut this section back, along with anything else that distracts from your central thesis. After all you have no need to prove the existence of free will, so why not let others take the flack?

What I'm getting at is that it would be a shame to spoil a well argued paper by alienating most of the readers with the final section. Far better to simply state the argument and to let readers draw their own conclusions, which are staring them in the face. I would feel much more confident about sending it out for pre-review after these major alterations are done. I had in mind Lowe, Chalmers, Hodgson, Mangan, Rosenberg and also a colleague in political philosophy.

As an illustration of the validity of this sort of psychology, when your own book came in for review some time ago, our reviews editor took one look at the title and then sidelined it into the "rants, tracts and diatribes" section. Far better to present radical critiques in a moderate temperate style.

--

Keith Sutherland

JKB SUTHERLAND, PUBLISHER
JOURNAL OF CONSCIOUSNESS STUDIES HISTORY OF POLITICAL
THOUGHT

IMPRINT ACADEMIC, PO BOX 1, THORVERTON EX5 5YX, UK
TEL: +44 (0)1392 841600. Fax: 841478. EMAIL: keith@imprint.co.uk

WWW: <http://www.zynet.co.uk/imprint>