Notes and Errata

(I will continue to update this document as necessary)

- P. 25

I used the wrong objects to try to illustrate the failure of the Relativized Indiscernibility of Identicals for the relative identity theorist on pg. 25. Instead of using the statue (Statue) and the lump of clay (Lumpy) in this example, I should have used two statues, Statue 1 and Statue 2, formed out of the same lump of clay. The relationship between Statue 1 and Statue 2 is as follows: First, the lump is molded into Statue 1 (at t_1)—say, in the shape of a pigeon—then Statue 1 is squashed. Later, the same lump is molded into Statue 2 (at t_2)—say, in the shape of a horse.

The problem for the relative identity theorist is that Statue 1 is the same lump as Statue 2, but Statue 1 and Statue 2 are not the same statue. For example, Statue 1 has the property *being pigeon shaped* while Statue 2 lacks this property. Consequently, we will have a failure of the Relativized Indiscernibility of Identicals:

Relativized Indiscernibility of Identicals: $\forall x \forall y \forall K(x \text{ is the same } K \text{ as } y \supset \forall P(x \text{ has } P \equiv y \text{ has } P))$

In short: The failure of this version of the indiscernibility of identicals is supposed to occur between Statue 1 and Statue 2, *not* between Statue and Lumpy.

- To my horror, the Element is missing an Acknowledgements section!