

# 1 PROJECT PLANS FOR NEXT YEAR

## 1.1 Summarize the Project Plan

With the completion of our initial conditions generator and our first production simulation at full resolution, our project now turns to efforts to meet our on-going Research Objectives (see Table 1) by achieving our remaining Research Milestones (see Table 2) via our planned Research Simulations (see Table 3). Our broad Project Plan is to perform the largest numerical simulations of isolated disk galaxies ever attempted, while including the physics relevant for generating and characterizing the properties of galactic-scale winds. We have a suite of six production simulations planned (three in Semester 2 in 2017, two in Semester 3 in 2018, and one in Semester 4 in 2018), each including the critical radiative cooling physics. The three production simulations conducted in 2018 will include detailed models for feedback and wind-driving from individual supernovae events in the ISM, allowing us to self-consistently produce galactic scale winds and characterize their multiphase structure. All simulations planned use at least 17 billion cells, and as many as 68 billion cells, exceeding comparable simulations in the literature by two orders of magnitude in computational elements. The computational approach and resource requirements are unchanged, as we will use our *Cholla* code on *Titan* to execute these simulations using our remaining 2017 allocation and the 54M core hours requested for 2018. Our first production-scale simulation executed at the end of Semester 1 provides us an accurate benchmark for our computational resource request, and we are confident our research goals can be met with the originally estimated core hour allocation. These plans match the scope of our original INCITE proposal, and will be conducted using the same project personnel (PI Robertson and Co-PI Schneider).

### 1.1.1 Research Milestones

We will *model the multiphase structure and radiative cooling on galactic outflows on  $\sim 10$ kpc scales* (RM.C) and *determine the role of full three-dimensionality on the velocity and density structure of galactic outflows* (RM.D) by performing three production-scale Radiatively Cooling Wind Simulations with 2048x2048x4096 cells (RS.D). The goal will be to determine how the properties of the supernovae driving mechanism influence the winds and their ability to cool into a multiphase structure with rapid outflow velocities. The main determinate of the cooling efficiency is expected to be the wind density (e.g., Thompson et al. 2016), as the radiative cooling mechanisms increase their luminosity in proportion to the square of the gas density. Winds that are heavily mass-loaded, such that the amount of ISM mass driven into the hot wind per supernovae is high, will tend to cool more rapidly than winds that are less mass-loaded and therefore more rarified. Correspondingly, the planned Radiatively Cooling Wind Simulation suite will include 1) a simulation using a fiducial model for supernovae feedback parameters appropriate for an M82-like system, 2) a “light wind” simulation with lower mass and energy loading into the wind than the fiducial case, and 3) a “heavy wind” simulation with higher mass and energy loading. Based on the expectations from our initial moderate-resolution radiatively cooling simulation we expect to show that the fiducial model of an M82-like galactic wind can radiatively cool into a multiphase wind, in agreement with observations. We further expect that a well-chosen “light wind” model will mimic the results from our production simulation of an adiabatic wind model from Semester 1, perhaps with some radiative cooling at very large radii. Given these expectations, the “heavy wind” model should also cool quickly, and closer to the disk than the fiducial model.

As originally envisioned, all of the production simulations from Semester 2 were going to be quadrants of a galaxy, because the computing time required would have been too great to carry out a global simulation according to our original calculations. However, two factors have made it possible to carry out global

simulations in Semester 2. First, we are able to use a more efficient hydrodynamics algorithm than the one used in our estimated time for the original proposal. Second, the simulations do not need to run as long as we initially estimated in order to set up a steady-state wind. While our original proposal specified 400 Myr of evolution, we have found that 100 Myr is sufficient to see the properties of the wind evolve on a global scale. As a result, our original Research Milestone D: "Determine the role of full three-dimensionality on the velocity and density structure of galactic outflows" will be fulfilled by the simulations being carried out in Semester 2. Thus, we have restructured our milestone timeline somewhat, to better take advantage of the time awarded us in Year 1, and to progress through our proposed research objectives with an approach in which each builds naturally on the next. Despite this restructuring, our overall computational needs have not changed from the original proposal. Below we show the new set of Milestones for our project, along with their associated Research Objectives.

The main effort of the program in 2018 will be to *determine the mass and energy coupling of ISM gas to supernova-driven winds* (RO.C). This goal requires a more sophisticated model for supernovae feedback than our 2017 simulations, as the mass- and energy- loading into the winds must be generated self-consistently via the modeling of supernova events in the disk. Achieving this goal will require us to *simulate galactic outflows at large dynamic range to generate an initial  $\sim 10$  kpc scale winds from  $\sim pc$ -scale supernovae bubbles* (RM.E), implement and test physical models for feedback from star formation, and study the resulting character of the galactic outflow. These studies will enable us to understand how different physical considerations (thermal energy input, momentum driving, spatial and time-clustering of supernovae) change the detailed structure of the galactic wind including the mass-loading, wind velocity and temperature, and the ionization / phase structure of the outflowing gas. The associated Developmental Work is described below. The critical new capability afforded by our calculations is the reliable tracking of the hydrodynamics and possible cooling of the outflow via fixed grid calculations with massive numbers of cells ( $>10$  billion) densely sampling in the low-density wind regions near the galactic disk. Lagrangian or AMR methods with resolutions that track the gas density provide no gain over *Cholla* in this regime, as such approaches purposefully sacrifice resolution in low-density wind regions to more affordably reach high resolution in the star-forming disk.

The Research Simulations supporting these objectives and enabling the milestones are two radiative cooling models, incorporating either a primarily "thermal feedback" or "momentum feedback" from supernova (see below), with the expectation that these models can lead to different mass and momentum loading, thermal energy, and ionization/phase structure in the wind. These simulations will be performed at the same resolution as the Radiative Cooling (RS.D) simulations from 2017, allowing us to directly compare the idealized supernova feedback model from the 2017 efforts with more sophisticated models employed in 2018 and see whether winds driven by individual supernova events differ substantially from winds driven by an engine supplying a constant mass and energy flux into the outflow.

**Table 1: On-going INCITE Proposal Research Objectives**

<b>RO.B</b>	Quantify the importance of radiative cooling for the multiphase structure of observed galactic outflows (PARTIALLY COMPLETE).
<b>RO.C</b>	Determine the mass and energy coupling of ISM gas to supernova-driven outflows.

Because we have restructured the timeline somewhat, we have updated set of proposed simulations for Year 2. In Table 2, we list the simulations that will be completed in Year 1 and 2, along with the research objectives and milestones being addressed by each. Note that the total allocation request has not changed for Year 2.

**Table 2: On-going INCITE Proposal Research Milestones**

Milestone		Objective
<i>Semester 2</i>		
<b>RM.C</b>	Model the multiphase structure and radiative cooling of galactic outflows on $\sim 10\text{kpc}$ scales (PARTIALLY COMPLETE).	RO.B
<i>Semester 3</i>		
<b>RM.D</b>	Determine the role of full three-dimensionality on the velocity and density structure of galactic outflows (PARTIALLY COMPLETE).	RO.B
<i>Semester 4</i>		
<b>RM.E</b>	Simulate galactic outflows at large dynamic range to generate <i>ab initio</i> $\sim 10\text{kpc}$ -scale winds from $\sim\text{pc}$ -scale supernovae bubbles.	RO.B, RO.C

**Table 3: On-going and Planned Research Simulations**

Simulation Type and Details		Objective Milestone	/	Resolution	Titan Nodes	Titan Core Hours
<i>Semester 2: 33M core hours in 2017 (already allocated)</i>						
<b>RS.D</b>	3 Radiatively Cooling Wind Simulations	RO.B, RM.C, RM.D		$N = 2048^2 \times 4096$	8192	33M
<i>Semester 3 (2018): 22M core hours</i>						
<b>RS.F</b>	2 Radiatively Cooling Simulations with discrete SN feedback	RO.B, RO.C, RM.D, RM.E		$N = 2048^2 \times 4096$	8192	36M
<i>Semester 4 (2018): 32M core hours</i>						
<b>RS.G</b>	High-Res Radiatively Cooling Simulation with discrete SN feedback	RO.B, RO.C, RM.D, RM.E		$N = 4096^3$	16,384	32M
Core Hour Budget for Analysis and Data Manipulation						5M
<b>Second Year Total Titan Core Hour Request (Unchanged):</b>						<b>54M</b>

## 1.2 Developmental Work

DESCRIBE DEVELOPMENTAL WORK FROM 2017 DESCRIBE SN MODEL WORK IN 2018  
ESTIMATE PROJECT TIME FOR DEVELOPMENTAL COMPUTING

- Developmental work has been carried out? What was the outcome?
- Additional developmental work to be executed and when?
- Estimate a percentage of project time spent on developmental computing?

For our radiatively cooling simulations with discrete SN feedback, we will implement and test two or more supernovae feedback models. The first model will input stochastic energy sources in  $10\text{pc} \times 10\text{pc}$  regions with a spatial sampling following the expected star formation rate density in the disk and a time sampling appropriate of averages over the lifetimes and initial mass function of massive stars in stellar clusters (e.g., Gentry et al. 2017). Given that these supernova-heated regions will marginally resolve the size of the supernovae remnants as they enter the momentum-conserving phase, we will use the local density around the supernovae to estimate any missing momentum deposition and add that as a radially-diverging kinetic feedback. A second model will combine a smooth volumetric heating of the disk gas from a time-averaged supernovae rate with stochastic momentum feedback from star formation (e.g., Ostriker et al. 2010), which is expected to have a similar net effect but may lead to differing temperature, momentum, and ionization

structure in the wind. . Given that the disk gas will be allowed to cool radiatively, heating from supernovae directly or secondary heating from supernova-driven turbulence will be required to maintain the observed disk thickness of M82. We will perform a small series of resolution studies focused on the disk to verify the implementation of each feedback prescription, calibrate its efficiency to drive galactic winds, and develop yet further prescriptions if they prove unsuccessful. We have extensive experience implementing ISM and feedback models (Robertson and Kravtsov 2008) that are widely used in galaxy simulations, and correspondingly this phase of the program poses little risk to our research objectives.

### **1.3 New Code Applications (where relevant)**

We do not plan to use any new codes in Year 2. We will continue to update and improve our primary hydrodynamics code, *Cholla*, used to carry out all of the described simulations. We do not require additional resources beyond those requested in our original proposal.