# Population structure and phenotypic variation of *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* from

dry bean (*Phaseolus vulgaris*) in the United

States

<sup>5</sup> Zhian N. Kamvar<sup>1</sup>, Bimal Sajeewa Amaradasa<sup>1</sup>, Rachana Jhala<sup>1</sup>, Serena
 <sup>6</sup> McCoy<sup>1</sup>, James Steadman<sup>1</sup>, and Sydney E. Everhart<sup>1</sup>

<sup>7</sup> <sup>1</sup>Department of Plant Pathology, University of Nebraska-Lincoln, Lincoln, NE 68583

8 Current address of second author: Plant Pathology Department, University of Florida, Gainsville, FL 32611

9 Current address of third author: Nebraska Center for Virology, University of Nebraska-Lincoln, Lincoln, NE 68583

- 10 Corresponding author:
- <sup>11</sup> Sydney E. Everhart<sup>1</sup>
- 12 Email address: everhart@unl.edu

# 13 ABSTRACT

The ascomycete pathogen Sclerotinia sclerotiorum is a necrotrophic pathogen on over 400 known host 14 plants, and is the causal agent of white mold on dry bean. Currently, there are no known cultivars of dry 15 bean with complete resistance to white mold. For more than 20 years, bean breeders have been using 16 white mold screening nurseries with natural populations of S. sclerotiorum to screen new cultivars for 17 resistance. It is thus important to know if the genetic diversity in populations of S. sclerotiorum within 18 these nurseries a) reflect the genetic diversity of the populations in the surrounding region and b) are 19 stable over time. Furthermore, previous studies have investigated the correlation between mycelial 20 compatibility groups (MCG) and multilocus haplotypes (MLH), but none have formally tested these 21 patterns. We genotyped 366 isolates of S. sclerotiorum from producer fields and white mold screening 22 nurseries surveyed over 10 years in 2003-2012 representing 11 states in the United States of America, 23 Australia, France, and Mexico at 11 microsatellite loci resulting in 165 MLHs. Populations were loosely 24 structured over space and time based on analysis of molecular variance and discriminant analysis of 25 principal components, but not by cultivar, aggressiveness, or field source. Of all the regions tested, only 26 Mexico (n=18) shared no MLHs with any other region. Using a bipartite network-based approach, we 27 found no evidence that the MCGs accurately represent MLHs. Our study suggests that breeders should 28 continue to test dry bean lines in several white mold screening nurseries across the US to account for 29 both the phenotypic and genotypic variation that exists across regions. 30

# 31 INTRODUCTION

Sclerotinia sclerotiorum (Lib.) de Bary is an ascomycete plant pathogen with a worldwide distribution 32 -(Bolton et al., 2006). This is a necrotrophic pathogen that is primarily homothallic (self-fertilization) 33 and has the ability to survive for more than five years in soil using melanized survival structures called 34 sclerotia (Bolton et al., 2006; Sexton et al., 2006). It causes disease on more than 400 plant species 35 belonging to 75 families (Boland & Hall, 1994) including crops of major economic importance such as 36 sunflower (Helianthus spp.), soybean (Glycine max L.), canola (Brassica napa L., Brassica campestris 37 L.), and dry bean (*Phaseolus vulgaris* L.) (Bolton et al., 2006). 38 On dry bean, S. sclerotiorum is the causal agent of white mold, a devastating disease that can be yield-39

limiting in temperate climates (Steadman, 1983). All above-ground tissues (flowers, stems, leaves, pods)

- are susceptible to infection, first appearing as wet lesions with white mycelial tufts, and then bleaching
- 42 as the tissue senesces (Steadman, 1983; Bolton et al., 2006). For many years, white mold has been the
- 43 most serious dry bean disease in the Northwestern United States (Otto-Hanson et al., 2011; Knodel et al.,
- <sup>44</sup> 2012, 2015, 2016). The impact of white mold on the dry bean industry in the Northwestern United States

- alone has been estimated at a loss of 140 kg/ha with just 10% disease incidence (Ramasubramaniam et
   al., 2008).
- 47 Currently, there are no commercially available resistant cultivars of dry bean (Otto-Hanson et al.,
- <sup>48</sup> 2011). Organized breeding efforts have used a common-garden approach with white mold screening
- <sup>49</sup> nurseries in dry bean production areas across the United States with additional sites in <u>MexicoAustralia</u>,
- <sup>50</sup> France, and <u>Australia Mexico</u> (Steadman et al., 2003, 2004, 2005, 2006; Otto-Hanson & Steadman, 2007,
- <sup>51</sup> 2008; McCoy & Steadman, 2009). These white mold screening nurseries use no chemical or cultural
- 52 treatments against S. sclerotiorum and employ standardized protocols for screening new cultivars for
- resistance to white mold . It has previously been (Steadman et al., 2003; Otto-Hanson et al., 2011). These
- 54 protocols included three established cultivars used for comparison in the trials: Beryl (great northern
- bean, susceptible), Bunsi (a.k.a. Ex Rico, navy bean, low susceptibility), and G122 (cranberry bean,
- <sup>56</sup> partial resistance) (Tu & Beversdorf, 1982; Steadman et al., 2005; Otto-Hanson et al., 2011). It was
- <sup>57</sup> previously shown that aggressiveness (the severity of disease symptoms on the host) is significantly
- different across white mold screening nursery sites in separate geographic regions (Otto-Hanson et al., 2011). The genetic structure and mode of reproduction in these populations, however, is currently unknown.
- Understanding genetic relationships and reproduction behavior of *S. sclerotiorum* populations is
- beneficial for breeders seeking to develop new resistant cultivars for worldwide deployment (Milgroom,
   1996; McDonald & Linde, 2002). In particular, genetically diverse populations with high rates of sexual
- reproduction are more likely to overcome host resistance. Most populations of *S. sclerotiorum* are predominantly clonal with low genetic diversity and have a large degree of population fragmentation
- 66 (Kohli et al., 1995; Cubeta et al., 1997; Kohli & Kohn, 1998; Carbone & Kohn, 2001; Ekins et al., 2011;
- <sup>67</sup> Attanayake et al., 2012). Some studies, however have found populations that show signatures of sexual
- reproduction (Atallah et al., 2004; Sexton & Howlett, 2004; Attanayake et al., 2013; Aldrich-Wolfe et al.,
- <sup>69</sup> 2015).
- Nearly all population genetic studies of S. sclerotiorum employ a macroscopic assay to determine 70 mycelial compatibility, the ability for fungal hyphae from different colonies to appear to grow together 71 without forming a barrier of dead cells between them (known as a barrage line, Fig. ??B) (Leslie, 1993; 72 Sirjusingh & Kohn, 2001). Mycelial compatibility has been used as a proxy for vegetative compatibility, 73 a fungal trait controlled by several independent genes controlling the ability for two hyphae to fuse and 74 grow as a single unit (Fig. ??A) (Leslie, 1993; Schafer & Kohn, 2006). Because of the genetic connection 75 to vegetative compatibility, two isolates that are mycelially compatible were considered clones (Leslie, 76 1993); but correlation with genetic markers, such as microsatellites, have shown mixed results (Ford et 77 al., 1995; Micali & Smith, 2003; Jo et al., 2008; Attanayake et al., 2012; Papaioannou & Typas, 2014; 78 Lehner et al., 2017). Thus, the relationship between mycelial compatibility groups and clonal genotypes 79
- 80 remains unclear.

In this study, we analyze and characterize the genetic and phenotypic diversity of 366 S. sclerotiorum 81 isolates collected between 2003 and 2012 from dry bean cultivars among different geographic locations in 82 the United States Australia, France, Mexico, and Australia the United States. We wanted to know if the S. 83 sclerotiorum populations from white mold screening nurseries were representative of the fields within the 84 same region. As these nurseries were not treated with any chemical or cultural control of white mold, we 85 hypothesized that these nurseries would represent the natural population of S. sclerotiorum. Furthermore, 86 we wanted to investigate the potential effect of cultivar on genetic diversity of the pathogen by assessing 87 three dry bean cultivars with different levels of resistance, Beryl (great northern bean, susceptible), Bunsi 88 (navy bean, low susceptibility), and G122 (cranberry bean, partial resistance) (Otto-Hanson et al., 2011). 89 We additionally wanted to determine categorical or phenotypic variables that best predicted genetic 90 structure and if there was correlation between multilocus haplotype and mycelial compatibility group. 91 Knowing what variables predict genetic structure can help direct breeding efforts. By investigating these 92 aims, we hope to will effectively describe the population structure of S. sclerotiorum in the USA and 93 make available our database of isolates for use in future dry bean breeding efforts. 94

# **MATERIALS AND METHODS**

# 96 Isolate collection

Several (156) of the isolates used for this study were collected as reported in previous studies using the same methods (Otto-Hanson et al., 2011). Broadly, isolates were collected from two sources: white <sup>99</sup> mold screening nurseries (wmn) or producer fields. White mold screening nurseries were  $5m \times 10m$  in <sup>100</sup> size and maintained without application of fungicides to observe natural incidence of white mold. The <sup>101</sup> early nursery plots were incorporated with a basal dressing of N:P:K = 1:3:2 and side dressing of 0:3:2 <sup>102</sup> during the growing season (Steadman et al., 2003).

Sampling was carried out by collecting sclerotia from diseased tissue in zig-zag transects across field
 plots. Because sampling depended on disease incidence, the number of samples isolated varied from
 year to year. Although the nursery locations were the same over sampling years, sampling plots within a
 location varied for sampling years.

Sclerotia of S. sclerotiorum were collected over several years from grower fields and/or wmn in 11 107 states of the United States of America, Mexico, France, and Australia Australia, France, Mexico, and the 108 United States (Table ??). After collection, sclerotia were stored in Petri plates lined with filter paper, 109 then stored at 20 °F or -4 °C. Sclerotia were surface-sterilized with 50% Clorox bleach (at least 6% 110 NaOCLNaOCI, The Clorox Company, Oakland, CA) solution for 3 min, and double rinsed with ddH<sub>2</sub>O 111 for 3 min. The sterilized sclerotia were then placed on water agar plates (16g of Bacto agar per liter of 112 ddH<sub>2</sub>O, BD Diagnostic Systems, Sparks, MD), with four to five sclerotia of each isolate separated on 113 each plate and stored on the counter top at room temperature for 5 to 6 days. An 8-mm plug from a 5- or 114 6-day-old culture was transferred from the advancing margin of the mycelia onto a plate of Difco potato 115 dextrose agar (PDA at 39 g/liter of ddH<sub>2</sub>O) (Otto-Hanson et al., 2011). In combination with the 156 116 isolates described previously, we collected 210 isolates for a total of 366 isolates (Otto-Hanson et al., 117 2011). 118

### 119 Mycelial Compatibility

MCG was determined as described previously through co-culturing pairs of 2-day-old isolates 2.5 cm apart on Diana Sermons (DS) Medium (Fig. ??) (Cubeta et al., 2001). Incompatibility of different MCGs resulted in formation of a barrage line accompanied by formation of sclerotia on either side of the barrage line, indicating the limits of the isolates' growth (Kohn et al., 1990; Leslie, 1993; Otto-Hanson et al., 2011). Isolates were compared in a pairwise manner for each site and then representatives among sites were compared to determine mycelial compatibility groups by scoring compatible and incompatible interactions (Otto-Hanson et al., 2011). No MCGs were compatible with any other MCG.

### 127 Aggressiveness

Aggressiveness of each isolate was assessed using a straw test as described in Otto-Hanson et al. (2011) that rated necrotic lesion size (Petzoldt & Dickson, 1996; Teran et al., 2006). Briefly, the straw test uses 21-day-old G122 plants as the host in a greenhouse setting. Clear drinking straws cut to 2.5 cm and sealed were used to place two mycelial plugs of inoculum on the host plant after removing plant growth beyond 2.5 cm above the fourth node. Measurements of the necrotic lesion were taken 8 days later using the Modified Petzoldt and Dickson scale of 1–9, where 1 is no disease and 9 is plant death (Petzoldt & Dickson, 1996; Teran et al., 2006).

### 135 Microsatellite genotyping

Prior to DNA extraction, isolates were grown on PDA and plugs were subsequently transferred to 136 Potato Dextrose Broth (PDB) where they were grown until there was significant mycelial growth, but 137 before the mycelial mat became solidified (4–5 days). Each mycelial mat was collected in a filtered 138 Büchner funnel, agar plugs removed, lyophilized and pulverized manually in Whirl-pak(R) HDPE sampling 139 bags (Sigma-Aldrich, St. Louis, MO). Lyophilized mycelia was then stored in microcentrifuge tubes at 140 -20 °C until needed for DNA extraction. DNA from 25mg of pulverized mycelia was purified using a 141 phenol-chloroform extraction method followed by alcohol precipitation and evaporation, suspending the 142 DNA in 200 $\mu$ l TE (Sambrook et al., 1989). Suspended DNA was stored at 4 °C until genotyping. 143

We genotyped each *S. sclerotiorum* isolate using 16 microsatellite primer pairs developed previously (Sirjusingh & Kohn, 2001). PCR was carried out as described previously, using primers labeled with FAM fluorophore. Resulting amplicons were first resolved in a 1.5% agarose gel stained with ethidium bromide to ensure product was within the expected size range prior to capillary electrophoresis. Capillary electrophoresis (fragment analysis) of amplicons, with size standard GeneScan<sup>TM</sup> 500 LIZ®, was performed using an ABI 3730 genetic analyzer (Life Technologies Corporation, Carlsbad, CA) at the

<sup>150</sup> Michigan State University Genomic Sequencing Center (East Lansing, MI). Alleles were scored using

PeakScanner version 1.0 (Life Technologies Corporation, Carlsbad, CA) and recorded manually in a
 spreadsheet.

#### 153 Data processing and Analysis

All data processing and analyses were performed in a Rocker "verse" project container running 154 R version 3.4.1 (.2 (Boettiger & Eddelbuettel, 2017; R Core Team, 2017) and are openly available 155 and reproducible at https://github.com/everhartlab/sclerotinia-366/. Of the 16 156 microsatellite loci genotyped, five included compound repeats, which made it challenging to accu-157 rately/confidently bin alleles into fragment sizes expected for each locus based on the described repeat 158 motif. Loci with compound repeats were removed for the reported statistics. To ensure the integrity of the 159 results we additionally processed these loci and included them in concurrent analyses. We assessed the 160 power of our 11 markers by generating a genotype accumulation curve in the R package poppr version 161 2.5.0, looking for evidence of saturation, which would indicate that loci were sufficiently sampled to 162 adequately represent the full set of haplotypes (Arnaud-Hanod et al., 2007; Kamvar et al., 2015). To avoid 163 including isolates potentially collected from the same plant (which increases the probability of collecting 164 sclerotia from the same point of infection more than once), data were clone-corrected on a hierarchy 165 of Region/Source/Host/Year-meaning that duplicated genotypes were reduced to a single observation 166 when they were collected in the same year from the same host cultivar located in the same source field 167 (wmn or producer)—for subsequent analysis. We assessed haplotype diversity by calculating Stoddart and 168 Taylor's index (G) (Stoddart & Taylor, 1988), Shannon's index (H) (Shannon, 1948), Simpson's index  $(\lambda)$ 169 (Simpson, 1949), evenness ( $E_5$ ), and the expected number of multilocus haplotypes (*eMLH*) (Hurlbert, 170 1971; Heck et al., 1975; Pielou, 1975; Grünwald et al., 2003). To assess the potential for random mating, 171 we tested for linkage disequilibrium with the index of association,  $I_A$  and its standardized version,  $\bar{r}_d$ 172 using 999 permutations (Brown et al., 1980; Smith et al., 1993; Agapow & Burt, 2001). Both haplotype 173 diversity and linkage disequilibrium were calculated in poppr (Kamvar et al., 2014). 174

#### 175 Assessing Importance of Variables

#### 176 Distance-based Redundancy Analysis

A distance-based redundancy analysis (dbRDA) (Legendre & Anderson, 1999) was performed with 177 the function capscale () in the vegan package version 2.4.4 (Oksanen et al., 2017). This method 178 uses constrained ordinations on a distance matrix representing the response variable to delineate relative 179 contribution of any number of independent explanatory variables. We used this method to delineate 180 the phenotypic (Aggressiveness, Mycelial Compatibility Group (MCG)), geographic (Region, Host, 181 Location), and temporal (Year) components in predicting genetic composition of the populations. The 182 distance matrix we used as the response variable was generated using Bruvo's genetic distance from 183 clone-corrected data (procedure described above) as implemented in *poppr*, which employed a stepwise 184 mutation model for microsatellite data (Bruvo et al., 2004; Kamvar et al., 2014). Because aggressiveness 185 measures differed between isolates that were reduced to a single observation during clone-correction, 186 187 aggressiveness was first averaged across clone-corrected isolates. To identify explanatory variable(s) correlated with genetic variation, a forward-backward selection process was applied with the vegan 188 function ordistep(). An analysis of variance (ANOVA) was then performed to test for significance of 189 the reduced model and marginal effects using 999 permutations. The varpart () function of vegan was 190 used to determine variation partitioning of explanatory variables. 191

#### 192 Aggressiveness Assessment

We used ANOVA to assess if aggressiveness (determined via straw test on a scale of 1–9 as described above) was significantly different with respect to Region, MCG, or multilocus haplotype (MLH). To minimize complications due to small sample sizes, we chose the top 10 MCGs, representing 56.5% of the isolates collected, the 10 most abundant MLHs representing 26.7% of the isolates, and populations with more than five isolates. If ANOVA results were significantly different at  $\alpha = 0.05$ , pairwise differences were assessed using Tukey's HSD test ( $\alpha = 0.05$ ) using the HSD.test() function in the package *agricolae* version 1.2.8 (Mendiburu & Simon, 2015).

#### 200 Correlating Multilocus Haplotypes with Mycelial Compatibility Groups

We wanted to assess if there was correlation between MLHs and MCGs. This was performed using a network-based approach where both MLHs and MCGs were considered nodes and the number of isolates

in which they were found together was the strength of the connection between an MLH and MCG 203 node. The network-based approach allowed us to assess the associations between MLHs and MCGs. 204 To construct the network, a contingency table was created with MLHs and MCGs and converted to a 205 directed and weighted edgelist where each edge represented a connection from an MCG to an MLH, 206 207 weighted by the number of samples shared in the connection. This was then converted to a bipartite graph where top nodes represented MLHs and bottom nodes represented MCGs. To identify clusters of 208 MLHs and MCGs within the network, we used the cluster walktrap community detection algorithm as 209 implemented in the cluster\_walktrap() function in *igraph* version 1.1.2 (Csardi & Nepusz, 2006; 210 Pons & Latapy, 2006). This algorithm attempts to define clusters of nodes by starting at a random nodes 211 212 and performing short, random "walks" along the edges between nodes, assuming that these walks would stay within clusters. For this analysis, we set the number of steps within a walk to four and allowed the 213 algorithm to use the edge weights in determining the path. All of the resulting communities that had fewer 214 than 10 members were then consolidated into one. Community definitions were used to assess the average 215 genetic distance (as defined by Bruvo's distance) within members of the community (Bruvo et al., 2004). 216

### 217 Genetic Diversity

#### 218 **Population Differentiation**

We used analysis of molecular variance (AMOVA) with Bruvo's genetic distance in *poppr* to test for 219 differentiation between populations in wmn and producer fields from the same region and collected in 220 the same year (Excoffier et al., 1992; Bruvo et al., 2004; Kamvar et al., 2014). To identify Regions with 221 greater differentiation, we used discriminant analysis of principal components (DAPC) as implemented in 222 adegenet version 2.1.0, assessing the per-sample posterior group assignment probability (Jombart, 2008). 223 This method decomposes the genetic data into principal components, and then uses a subset of these as 224 the inputs for discriminant analysis, which attempts to minimize within-group variation and maximize 225 among-group variation (Jombart et al., 2010). To avoid over-fitting data, the optimal number of principal 226 components was selected by using the *adegenet* function xvalDapc(). This function implements a 227 cross-validation procedure to iterate over an increasing number of principal components on a subset 228 (90%) of the data, trying to find the minimum number of principal components that maximizes the rate of 229 successful group reassignment. To assess if cultivar had an influence on genetic diversity between wmn, 230 we first subset the clone-corrected data to contain only samples from wmn and from the cultivars Beryl, 231 Bunsi, and G122 and tested differentiation using AMOVA and DAPC as described above. We additionally 232 assessed population stability over time by calculating DAPC over the combined groups of Region and 233 Year as described above. 234

#### 235 Analysis of Shared Multilocus Haplotypes

We wanted to evaluate patterns of connectivity between shared multilocus haplotypes across geo-236 graphic regions. We first tabulated the multilocus haplotypes shared between at least two populations 237 (defined as states or countries) with the *poppr* function mlg.crosspop() (Kamvar et al., 2014). From 238 these data, we constructed a graph with populations as nodes and shared haplotypes as edges (connections) 239 between nodes using the R packages *igraph* (Csardi & Nepusz, 2006), *dplyr* version 0.7.4 (Wickham et al., 240 2017), and *purrr* version 0.2.3.4 (Henry & Wickham, 2017). Each node was weighted by the fraction of 241 shared MLHs. Each edge represented a single MLH, but because a single MLH could be present in more 242 than one population, that MLH would have a number of edges equivalent to the total number of possible 243 connections, calculated as  $(n^*(n-1))/2$  edges where n represents the number of populations crossed. Edges 244 were weighted by  $1 - P_{sex}$ , where  $P_{sex}$  is the probability of encountering the same haplotype via two 245 independent meiotic events (Parks & Werth, 1993; Arnaud-Hanod et al., 2007). This weighting scheme 246 247 would thus strengthen the connection of edges that represented genotypes with a low probability of being produced via sexual reproduction. We then identified communities (among the Regions) in the graph 248 using the cluster\_optimal () function from *igraph* (Csardi & Nepusz, 2006). The graph was plotted 249 using the R packages ggplot2 version 2.2.1 (Wickham, 2009) and ggraph 1.0.0 (Pedersen, 2017). To 250 ensure that we captured the same community signal, we additionally performed this analysis including 251 the five polymorphic markers described above. 252

# 253 **RESULTS**

A total of 366 isolates were collected from 2003 to 2012 (except 2006 and 2011) from diseased 254 dry bean plants in Australia, Mexico, 11 states in the United States as well as Australia, France, and 255 Mexico (Table ??). With the 11 states in the USA (Table ??). We loci used in the analyses (Table ??), 256 we observed a total of 165 MLHs (215 with 16 loci). These 11 loci are found on 7 chromosomes in the 257 S. sclerotiorum genome with a minimum distance of 55Kbp between two loci on the same chromosome. 258 Over 50% of the isolates came from four states, MI (62), ND (60), WA (59), NE (47). Four regions had 259 fewer than 10 isolates, Australia (6), WI (2), NY (1), ID (1). We observed 87 MCGs, the most abundant 260 of which ('MCG 5') was represented by 73 isolates over 37 MLHs (Fig. ??A,C). 261 The number of observed alleles per locus ranged from two to 10 with an average of 6.27 (Table ??). Locus 20-3, which contained only 2 alleles, showed low values of both h (0.0533) and evenness 263 (0.42), indicating that there was one dominant allele present. Analysis of the haplotype accumulation 264 curve showed no clear plateau for 11 or 16 loci (Supplemental Information)See section on 'Loading Data 265 and Setting Strata' in the MLG-distribution.md<sup>1</sup> file in the supplemental files (Kamvar et al., 2017)), 266 indicating that we would likely obtain more multilocus haplotypes if we were to genotype more loci. 267 After clone-correction on the hierarchy of Region/Source/Host/Year, we were left with a total of 268 48 isolates were removed from the data set, resulting in 318 isolates representing 165 MLHs that were 269 used in subsequent analyses (Table ??). The results show thatmost populations exhibited relatively high 270 amounts showed that, in terms of genotypic diversity, with the exception of  $(H, G, and \lambda)$ . We was the 271 most diverse population with both G (54.3) and  $e^{H}$  (55.3) being close to the observed number of MLGs 272 (56). This indicated that there are few duplicated genotypes in WA (Table ??). A more useful metric to 273 compare populations, however, is  $E_5$ , which scales from 0 to 1, where 1 indicates all unique genotypes 274 (Grünwald et al., 2003). Evaluating by  $E_5$  shows that both MI and NE, which exhibited lower-than 275 average  $E_5$  values. Mexico had the lowest average value of gene diversity, exhibit lower than average 276 values, indicating that there are over-represented genotypes in the populations (table ??). When we look 277 at Mexico, we observed that it had relatively high values of  $E_5$  and genotypic diversity, but low richness, 278 as measured by *heMLG* and the lowest. Moreover, Mexico had the lowest value for *eMLH*, suggesting 279 low overall genetic which is a measure of allelic diversity. Nearly all populations showed evidence for 280 linkage (Table ??), which serves as evidence for clonal reproduction or other forms of non-random mating. 281 The only exceptions are CA (P = 0.043) and Australia (P = 0.052). Both of these populations showed 282 only moderate significance with  $\bar{r}_d$  values of 0.03 and 0.12, respectively. 283

**Table 1.** Allelic diversity on full data set at loci used in this study. h = Nei's Gene Diversity (Nei, 1978). Average h = 0.583, average Evenness = 0.693, average no. alleles = 6.27

Locus	Range	Repeat Motif	No. alleles	h	Evenness
5-2	318-324	<del>di-</del> (GT)	4	0.45	0.62
6-2	483–495	hexa-(TTTTTC)(TTTTTG)(TT	T3TC)	0.64	0.95
7-2	158–174	<del>di-</del> (GA)	7	0.73	0.76
8-3	244-270	<del>di-</del> (CA)	7	0.74	0.79
9-2	360-382	<del>di-</del> (CA)(CT)	9	0.35	0.41
12-2	214-222	<del>di-</del> (CA)	5	0.58	0.78
17-3	342-363	tri-(TTA)	7	0.55	0.53
20-3	280-282	di-(GT)GG(GT)	2	0.05	0.42
55-4	153-216	tetra-(TACA)	10	0.72	0.66
110-4	370-386	tetra-(TATG)	5	0.76	0.91
114-4	339-416	tetra-(TAGA)	10	0.83	0.80

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>Direct link: https://github.com/everhartlab/sclerotinia-366/blob/master/results/ MLG-distribution.md#loading-data-and-setting-strata

**Table 2.** Genotypic diversity and Linkage Disequilibrium summary for geographic populations arranged by abundance after clone-correction by a hierarchy of Region/Source/Host/Year. Pop = Population, N = number of individuals (number of MLH in parentheses), eMLH = expected number of MLHs based on rarefaction at 10 individuals (standard error in parentheses), H = Shannon-Weiner Index, G = Stoddardt and Taylor's Index,  $\lambda$  = Simpson's Index, h = Nei's 1978 gene diversity,  $E_5$  = Evenness,  $\bar{r}_d$  = standardized index of association. An asterix indicates a significant value of  $\bar{r}_d$  after 999 permutations,  $P \le 0.001$ .

Рор	Ν	eMLH	Η	G	λ	$E_5$	h	$\bar{r}_d$
WA	58 (56)	9.95 (0.23)	4.0	54.3	0.98	0.98	0.60	0.07*
MI	58 (43)	9.3 (0.79)	3.6	29.0	0.97	0.78	0.54	0.14*
ND	41 (35)	9.44 (0.73)	3.5	25.9	0.96	0.82	0.54	0.1*
NE	37 (28)	8.93 (0.94)	3.2	17.8	0.94	0.75	0.55	0.25*
CO	34 (28)	9.46 (0.67)	3.3	24.1	0.96	0.92	0.56	0.27*
France	21 (14)	8.5 (0.85)	2.6	12.6	0.92	0.95	0.48	0.11*
CA	18 (15)	9.12 (0.72)	2.7	13.5	0.93	0.94	0.51	0.03
OR	17 (13)	8.52 (0.85)	2.5	10.7	0.91	0.89	0.47	0.1*
Mexico	15 (9)	7.1 (0.85)	2.1	7.3	0.86	0.89	0.28	0.37*
MN	9 (7)	7 (0)	1.9	6.2	0.84	0.93	0.47	0.19*
Australia	6 (6)	6 (0)	1.8	6.0	0.83	1.00	0.48	0.12
WI	2 (2)	2 (0)	0.7	2.0	0.50	1.00	0.27	-
NY	1(1)	1 (0)	0.0	1.0	0.00	NaN	NaN	-
ID	1 (1)	1 (0)	0.0	1.0	0.00	NaN	NaN	-

#### 284 Variable Assessment

#### 285 Variable Contributions

The forward-backward selection process of the dbRDA models on clone-corrected data revealed Year, 286 Region, Host, and MCG to be the optimal variables for the reduced model, accounting for 45% of the 287 total variation. ANOVA showed that the reduced model was significant with an adjusted  $R^2$  of 0.0675 (P 288 = 0.001). Assessment of the marginal effects showed that all variables variables significantly explained 289 genetic variation ( $P \le 0.007$ ). We found that there was multicollinearity when MCG was combined 290 with any other variable, so repeated the analysis, dropping MCG from the list of potential predictors. 291 From these results, Year, Region, Host, and Aggressiveness were found to be optimal, accounting for 292 17.6% of the total variation. ANOVA revealed significant effects with an adjusted R<sup>2</sup> of 0.0325 (P =293 0.001). While the marginal effect assessment revealed that Year, Region, and Host significantly explained 294 variation at P = 0.001, and Aggressiveness significantly explained variation at P = 0.039. Much of the 295 variation appeared to be driven by isolates from Mexico and 2005 (Fig. ??). Variance partitioning of 296 the independent variables without MCG indicated aggressiveness to be the least influential factor with 297 0.1% contributing to explaining the variation of molecular data, whereas the combination of variables 298 accounted for 3.3%. 299

#### 300 Aggressiveness

Agressiveness of the isolates ranged from 1.4 to 7.9 with a mean of 5.02 and median of 4.85. The 301 group mean averages were 4.88, 5.13, and 5.19 for Region, MCG, and MLH, respectively. A strip plot 302 showing the distribution of severity across these three variables simultaneously can be seen in Fig. ??. 303 Our assessment of aggressiveness in association with Region showed a significant effect ( $P < 1.00e^{-4}$ ), 304 with means that ranged from 5.8 (MN) to 4.0 (CA) (Fig. ??, Table ??). MCGs also showed a significant 305 effect ( $P < \frac{1.00e^{-4}0.001}{1.00e^{-4}0.001}$ ), with means that ranged from 6.0 ('MCG 44') to 4.6 ('MCG 49'; Table ??). We 306 additionally found a significant effect for MLHs ( $P = 7.44e^{-4} < 0.001$ ), with means that ranged from 6.0 307 ('MLH 78') to 4.3 ('MLH 140') (Table ??). 308

#### 309 Correlation of Mulitlocus Haplotypes and Mycelial Compatibility Groups

In our analysis, we found 165 MLHs with 70 singletons and 87 MCGs with 43 singletons (Fig. **??**A,B)

- where the eight most abundant MCGs represented > 51% of the data over 11 Regions, and all years except
- <sup>312</sup> for 2012. Our network-based approach to correlating MLHs with MCGs revealed a large and complex



**Figure 1.** Associations between Mycelial Compatibility Groups and Multilocus Haplotypes. **A**) Barplot of Mycelial Compatibility Group (MCG) abundance in descending order. Singletons (46) were truncated, leaving 41 MCGs. White bars represent sample counts and grey bars represent counts of unique multilocus haplotypes (MLH). The transparency of the bars represent the evenness of the distribution of the MLHs within a given MCG. A dashed box surrounds the eight most common MCGs representing > 51% of the data. **B**) Full graph-representation of the relationship between MCGs (open circles) and MLHs (filled circles). Details in Fig. **?**: **C**) A subset of **B** represent MLHs and open nodes represent MCGs. Node area scaled to the number of samples represented (range: 1–73). Numbers inside nodes are the MLH/MCG label (if n > 1). Edges (arrows) point from MLH to MCG where the weight (thickness) of the edge represents the number of shared isolates (range: 1–19). Edges extending from MLHs displayed to other MCGs are not shown.



**Figure 2.** Biplot showing five most influential explanatory variables (arrows) overlayed on the first two eigenvectors of distance based redundancy analysis of *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* isolates. The length of the arrows are directly proportional to the strength of the correlation between explanatory and molecular variables. Open circles represent the 318 clone-corrected haplotypes in ordination space.



**Figure 3.** Strip <u>Plot plot</u> of aggressiveness by population arranged in descending order of mean aggressiveness for all populations with N > 5. White bars represent mean value. Circles represent individual isolates where filled circles are isolates from white mold screening nurseries (wmn) and open circles are isolates from producer fields.

network (Fig. ??, Table ??). Community analysis showed 51 communities, 15 of which consisted of a 313 single MLH unconnected with any other community indicating that just 9.09% of the 165 MLHs are 314 unable to cross with any other MLH in this data set (Fig. ??). The three communities with the most 315 members contained eight of the 10 most abundant MCGs. Comparing these communities with Bruvo's 316 genetic distance showed an average distance of 0.451 among communities and an average distance of 317 0.437 within communities, which were not significantly different. When we assessed the number of times 318 two different MLHs that are in the same MCG, considering these as potential heterothallic pairings that 319 could result in sexual recombination, we found an average of 14.3 potential heterothallic parings per MLH. 320 Representing just four isolates, 'MLH 75' had 57 neighbors that shared the same mycelial compatibility 321 group (Fig. ??, ??). Overall, there was no clear pattern to the association between MLH and MCGs. 322

**Table 3.** The five most abundant Multilocus Haplotypes (MLH) with the probability of second encounter ( $P_{sex}$ ), Mycelial Compatibility Groups (MCG), and Regions with sample sizes in parentheses.

	MLH	Psex	MCG Region
25	0.016824	5	ND (15), CO (2), MI (2)
		13	ND (3)
		60	ND (2), WA (1)
		1	NE (1)
		4	MI (1)
163	0.049932	45	CO (5), ND (2), NE (1)
		5	MI (7)
65	0.000071	44	NE (10)
		5	MI (1)
140	0.000155	8	CO (5)
		5	MI (3)
		20	MI (2)
66	0.000016	9	NE (4), CO (2), MI (2)

### 323 Structure of Shared Multilocus Haplotypes

The most abundant MLH was represented by 27 isolates (Table ??) from five Regions (NE, MI, WA, CO, and ND). Within Regions, haplotypes were relatively evenly distributed with moderate to high diversity (Table ??). Of the 165 MLHs, 76 (46%) were found in at least two Regions, except those found in WI (2), ID (1), and Mexico (18) (Fig. ??).

We had performed an analysis on a network where the connections represented shared MLHs across 328 populations, weighted by  $1 - P_{sex}$  (Fig. ??, Table ??). Community analysis of the MLHs shared between 329 populations revealed 4 communities with a modularity of 0.17: A coastal community (CA, OR, WA, and 330 NY), a midwest community (CO, NE, ND, NE, MI), and an international community (MNAustralia, 331 France, AustraliaMN). Although analysis with 16 loci resulted in the removal of the NY node because 332 it no longer shared a haplotype with OR, the same overall community structure was present with a 333 modularity of 0.2 (Fig. ??). Relative to the US, the international community appears to be driven by 334 MLH 4, which is shared between all three populations and has a  $P_{sex}$  value of 2.87e<sup>-5</sup>, in contrast to the 335 abundant MLH 25, which has a  $P_{sex}$  value of 0.0168. 336

### 337 Population Differentiation

#### 338 Analysis of Molecular Variance

The analysis of molecular variance (AMOVA) for clone-corrected samples over the hierarchy of Region, Source, and Year showed significant variation between Regions and Years, but no significant variation between wmn and producer fields (Table **??**). In contrast, when we compared the three cultivars, Beryl, Bunsi, and G122, we found no significant differentiation (Supplementary Information)See section on 'Host Differentiation' in the wmn-differentiation.md<sup>2</sup> file in the supplemental files (Kamvar et al., 2017)).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>Direct\_\_\_link:\_\_\_\_https://github.com/everhartlab/sclerotinia-366/blob/master/results/ wmn-differentiation.md#host-differentiation



**Figure 4.** Network of populations (nodes/circles) and their shared multilocus haplotypes (MLH) (edges/lines) genotyped over 11 loci. Each node is labeled with **name (number of MLHs shared/number of MLHs total).** The shade and area of the nodes are proportional to the number of unique MLHs within the node and the inner nodes are proportional to the number of private MLHs to the region (bottom legend). Each edge represents a single MLH where its thickness represents the number of populations that share the MLH and the shade represents the value of *P*<sub>sex</sub>, or the probability of encountering that MLH from two independent meiotic events.

**Table 4.** Comparison of populations in the white mold screening nurseries (wmn) and producer fields using an analysis of molecular variance on Bruvo's genetic distance showing no apparent differentiation between wmn and other sources. The hierarchy was constructed as Source/Region where source is defined as belonging to a wmn or producer field. Bold  $\Phi$  values indicate significant difference (P < 0.05). S.S. = Sum of Squares, d.f. = degrees of freedom.

Hierarchy	d.f.	S.S.	% variation	$\Phi$ statistic	Р
Between Region	13	10.19	8.45	0.0845	<del>0.029</del> 0.031
Between Source within Region	8	2.74	-2.29	-0.0250	<del>0.486</del> 0.497
Between Year within Source	22	9.37	16.28	0.173	0.001
Within Year	274	47.30	77.56	0.224	0.001



**Figure 5.** Discriminant Analysis of Principal Components on regions showing that Mexico is differentiated from other populations. **A**) Scatter plot of first two components from DAPC. Points represent observed individuals connected to the population centroids with ellipses representing a 66% confidence interval for a normal distribution. The center of each component is represented as black grid lines. **B**) Mean population assignment probability from the DAPC for all populations with N > 10 (facets). Populations represented along the horizontal axis and probability of assignment on the vertical. Numbers next to source populations indicate population size. All values sum to one.

#### 345 Discriminant Analysis of Principal Components

Discriminant Analysis of Principal Components (DAPC) was performed grouping by by grouping 346 Region with the first 21 principal components, representing 88.1% of the total variance. The first 347 discriminant axis (representing 36.163.9% of the discriminatory power) separated the centroid for the 348 Mexico isolates from the rest of the data, indicating strong differentiation (Fig. ??b). The second 349 discriminant axis, representing  $\frac{25.310.8\%}{25.310.8\%}$  of the discriminatory power, separated the centroid for the 350 CA isolates. The mean population assignment probabilities for all populations with n > 10 showed that 351 only isolates from Mexico, CA, and France had > 50% probabilities of being reassigned to their source 352 populations (Fig. ??a). 353

DAPC grouping by cultivar used the first 20 principal components, representing 89% of the total 354 variance. The first two discriminant axes (representing 38.5100% of the discriminatory power) failed to 355 separate any of the cultivars where the mean posterior assignment probabilities were 34% (G122), 35.9% 356 (Beryl), and 30.1% (Bunsi). DAPC grouping by Region and Year used the first 15 principal components, 357 representing 80.3% of the total variance. The North Central USA populations (NE, MI, CO, ND) did not 358 appear to have any variation across time in contrast to WA, which showed a shift in population structure in 359 the last year of sampling, 2008 (Fig. ??). Further analysis of this population revealed that all 12 isolates 360 in WA circa 2008 originated in a wmn; nine haplotypes were shared with CA, and three were shared with 361 France (Fig. ??, ??). 362

# **363 DISCUSSION**

In this study, we characterized the diversity of *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* from dry bean fields across 364 the United States. Our results suggest that, broadly, populations from white mold screening nurseries 365 reflect the populations of the surrounding regions, indicating that resistance screening may be successful 366 within regions. We found significant population differentiation by geographic region and year, mainly 367 differentiated into three broad North American groups based on shared haplotypes and posterior groupings, 368 a Coastal Region, Midwestern Region, and Mexico. To date, with 366 isolates, this is the largest single 369 population genetic study of S. sclerotiorum assessing population structure within managed and unmanaged 370 agricultural environments. These findings indicate that the white mold screening nurseries can be effective 371 at screening for potential resistant lines within growing regions. 372



**Figure 6.** Scatter plot of Discriminant Analysis of Principal Components on Regions and Years showing non-differentiated temporal variation NE and MI and temporal variation in WA and CA. Points (text labels) represent observed individuals connected to the population centroids with ellipses representing a 66% confidence interval for a normal distribution. The center of each component is represented as black grid lines. A more detailed view is shown in Fig. **??**.

We found that the best predictors of genetic structure are Region and Year, supporting the hypothesis 373 374 that S. sclerotiorum populations are spatially structured (Carbone & Kohn, 2001). Borrowing a technique often used in the ecological literature, we used dbRDA to elucidate the effect of all variables (MCG, 375 Region, Source, Year, Host, and Aggressiveness) (Legendre & Anderson, 1999). From the initial results, 376 it appeared that the most important factors for predicting genetic structure were MCG, region, and year. 377 When we inspected the biplot of the initial results, we saw that the most important predictors were 378 'MCG 44', 'MCG 5', and 'MCG 9'. We believe that this was driven by the fact that these particular 379 MCGs have uneven MLH distributions, meaning that they are heavily associated with one particular 380 MLH (Fig. ??). We note these results with caution because of the apparent multicolinearity between 381 MCG and Region, which is a violation of the analysis (Legendre & Anderson, 1999). While the results 382 indicated that Mexico and the year 2005 were the two most important variables, it's worth noting that all 383 Mexico isolates were collected in 2005 (Fig. ??). The results also show that the Vista cultivar explains 384 385 some of the variance, but this represents six isolates in MI, and thus we cannot draw broad conclusions from this axis. Aggressiveness and source field had little to no effect on prediction of genetic diversity. 386 These results are in agreement with studies that examined differentiation based on Host (Aldrich-Wolfe 387 et al., 2015) and Aggressiveness (Atallah et al., 2004; Attanayake et al., 2012, 2013) reporting little 388 or no correlation of genetic diversity to these variables. This indicates that a) breeders should keep in 389 mind regional differences when assessing resistance and b) it is possible that we have not yet measured 390 biologically relevant variables that can predict genetic differentiation, which could include variables such 391 as soil community composition. 392

While aggressiveness was not shown to predict genetic structure, it is an important factor in breeding 393 efforts, and we observed significant differences in aggressiveness based on Region (Fig. ??, Table ??). 394 These results show a similar pattern to what was found previously in Otto-Hanson et al. (2011) with the 395 exception of North Dakota, which increased in mean aggressiveness from 5 to 5.77. This increase was 396 due in part to new data from producer field isolates collected after the previous study. These straw tests 397 were performed by a different person for these later isolates, which could suggest a more lenient or strict 398 scoring system. However, when we examined the within-region differences, we found no significant effect 399 by individual. Many of the ND isolates fell within the 6–7 range, which denotes a physical boundary 400 (disease symptoms around the second node) between intermediate and susceptible (Otto-Hanson et al., 401 2011). Thus, we observed a shift in aggressiveness without a significant shift in genotypic structure, 402 which may indicate that aggressiveness may be controlled by environmental factors as opposed to genetic 403

#### 404 profile.

The primary interest of this study was to assess if isolates sampled from white mold screening 405 nurseries represent isolates from producer fields within the region (Steadman et al., 2003; Otto-Hanson et 406 407 al., 2011). According to our AMOVA results, we have evidence for differentiation at the Region and Year, but little to no differentiation between wmn isolates and production field isolates (Table ??). This lack 408 of differentiation, however, may reflect the breeder practice of inoculating screening plots with sclerotia 409 collected from sources within the region. When we analyze the AMOVA results in light of the DAPC 410 results (Fig. ??), it becomes clear that the regional patterns of differentiation are largely driven by isolates 411 from Mexico and CA. Isolates from these Regions had a higher posterior probability (> 0.75) of being 412 reassigned to their own populations than any other (Fig. ??A). All other populations in comparison 413 (except France) has reassignment probabilities of < 0.5, which is reflected in the failure of the first two 414 discriminant functions to separate these populations (Fig. ??B). 415

Despite the evidence that Mexico and CA contributed to much of the population differentiation, 416 Regions like WA still had a large amount of internal variation. The two distinct clusters for the WA Region 417 showed that the 2008 population appeared differentiated and, under further investigation, we found that 418 all the haplotypes from this year were shared between CA and France (Fig. ??, ??, ??). All of the isolates 419 from WA in 2003–2005, and 2008 came from the same wmn; within the wmn, those in 2003–2005 came 420 a Northeastern field location cropped with dry bean since 2002, and those in 2008 from a Southeastern 421 field that was previously cropped with brassica, sundgrass, peas, beans, and potatoes (Miklas, Phil Pers. 422 comm.). Both of these fields were inoculated with sclerotia in 2002, the Northeastern field with sclerotia 423 provided by a commercial bean producer and the Southeastern field with sclerotia from peas (although 424 this was thought to be unsuccessful). Despite this information, it is still unclear what has contributed to 425 the differentiation of the 2008 population from WA -- or why it shares haplotypes with CA and France. 426 When we assessed agressiveness between the two fields across years with an ANOVA model, we found 427 that there was a slight effect based on field (P = 0.0127). While the evidence may suggest host as being a 428 factor, previous studies have shown no significant differentiation across host species (Aldrich-Wolfe et 429 al., 2015). It was of interest to compare our data with that of Aldrich-Wolfe et al. (2015), but we found 430 that, due to differences in data generation, we were unable to confidently perform a comparison (See 431 supplemental file compare-aldrich-wolfe.md<sup>3</sup> (Kamvar et al., 2017)). 432

With the exception of the WA Region, populations that were sampled across several years appeared to 433 be relatively stable over time with overlapping distributions in the DAPC (i.e. NE and MI, Fig. ??). DAPC 434 is based on the principal components of Euclidean distance between genotypes allele counts (Jombart et 435 al., 2010). Unlike Bruvo's distance, Euclidean distance this does not take into account the magnitude of 436 the difference between alleles, which could inflate the distance measure in the presence of private alleles 437 (Bruvo et al., 2004). We While we found no evidence of private alleles in the Mexico and CA isolates, 438 suggesting that this we did find that the alleles driving the first axis in Fig. ??A (alleles 174, 256, and 439 372 in loci 7-2, 8-3, and 9-2, respectively) were overrepresented in Mexico (where >75% of the alleles 440 came from the region). However, all three of these alleles, i) conform to the expected stepwise mutation 441 model (Bruvo et al., 2004) and ii) are at or near the extremes of the total range (except for allele 372 at 442 locus 9-2). Moreover, the fact that we find three alleles at three independent loci segregating for Mexico 443 suggests that the pattern separating these populations from the others was not an artifact. We believe 444 that the differences we observe in populations observed from Mexico may reflect be due to differences in 445 climate that allow greater diversification via sexual outcrossing. 446 Many of the isolates in our study were from temperate climates and the only isolates representing a 447 sub-tropical climate were from Mexico. It has been proposed within the S. sclerotiorum literature that 448 isolates from sub-tropical and tropical climates are differentiated or more variable than populations from 449

temperate climates (Carbone & Kohn, 2001); Attanayake et al. (2013); Lehner & Mizubuti (2017);
This has been attributed to the notion that the fungus has the chance to undergo more reproductive cycles
in the warmer climate (Carbone & Kohn, 2001; Attanayake et al., 2013). The strongest evidence to date
supporting this hypothesis is from Attanayake et al. (2013), showing that populations in sub-tropical
regions of China have been found to be more variable, sexually reproducing, and unrelated to populations

- in temperate regions of the USA. This result however, may be driven more by geography and agricultural
- <sup>456</sup> practice as opposed to climate.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup>Direct link: https://github.com/everhartlab/sclerotinia-366/blob/master/results/ compare-aldrich-wolfe.md

The results from our shared haplotype analysis show several populations with at least one haplotype 457 between them, except for Mexico and two states that had fewer than three samples each (Fig. ??). Our 458 network-based approach by treating the haplotypes as edges and weighting each edge with the inverse 459 of  $P_{sex}$  treated the edges as springs connecting the populations with the strength proportional to the 460 461 probability of obtaining the same haplotype as a clone. This allowed us to use a graph walking algorithm to see how close the populations were simply based off of the proportion of clones they shared. The 462 most abundant haplotype was shared across four populations, but its high value of  $P_{sex}$  meant that it did 463 not contribute significantly to the overall structure. The graph walking algorithm was able to divide the 464 network into three groups, but had a modularity of 0.17, which indicates that the groups are only weakly 465 differentiated. 466

The widespread nature of multilocus haplotypes in both wmn and production fields with relatively 467 small values of  $P_{sex}$  may indicate the spread of inoculum between regions. While seedborne transmission 468 is thought to be of insignificant epidemiological importance (Strausbaugh & Forster, 2003), it has since 469 been shown that S. sclerotiorum infections can be transmitted through seed (Botelho et al., 2013). Thus, 470 we hypothesize that shared haplotypes between populations may arise due to transmission events of seed 471 or sclerotia. This could explain the fact that we see shared genotypes with low  $P_{sex}$  values shared between 472 France, Australia, and the USAustralia, France, and the United States. While we speculate that these 473 transmission events are rare due to the genetic structuring by Region, these results suggest that seedborne 474 infections may indeed reflect a source of inoculum. This may, in turn increase the risk of introducing new 475 sources of genetic variation through potential outcrossing events. 476

When we tested for sexual reproduction, we were unable to find evidence for it in any region except for CA and Australia Australia and CA. While the Australia population had a non-significant value of  $\bar{r}_d$ —which would suggest that we cannot reject the null hypothesis of random mating—the sample size was insufficient from which to draw conclusions (Milgroom, 1996; Agapow & Burt, 2001). The low value of  $\bar{r}_d$  in the CA population may represent sexual reproduction, but we can see in Figure Fig. ?? that there is differentiation by year. Thus, this could also be an artifact of sampling two different populations, which is known to reduce the value of  $\bar{r}_d$  (Prugnolle & de Meeûs, 2010).

The previous study of the white mold screening nursery populations used MCGs to assess genotypic 484 diversity (Otto-Hanson et al., 2011). Historically, MCGs have been used as a proxy for clonal lineages, 485 and thus, of interest in this study was testing the association between multilocus haplotypes (MLHs) and 486 mycelial compatibility groups (MCGs) (Kohn et al., 1990; Leslie, 1993; Kohn, 1995; Carbone et al., 1999; 487 Schafer & Kohn, 2006; Otto-Hanson et al., 2011). Our results, however, do not support this assumption. 488 It can be seen in Fig. ??A that the most abundant MCG contains several MLHs, but the diversity of those 489 MLHs are low as indicated by the evenness (transparency), which indicates that there is one dominant 490 MLH ('MLH 25'). What is not shown in Fig. ?? A is the MLHs that are shared between MCGs. This is 491 illustrated in both Table ?? and Fig. ??B,C. It could be argued, however that 'MLH 25', with its high 492 value of Psex represents different true MLHs across the five MCGs it occupies, but this does not account 493 for the overall structure of Fig. ?? where, for example, 'MLH 75' ( $P_{sex} = 1.81e^{-4}$ ) is compatible with 57 494 other haplotypes through three MCG when the population structure of S. sclerotiorum is known to be 495 clonal. 496

<sup>497</sup> Over the past few years, researchers have noticed inconsistencies among the relationship between <sup>498</sup> MCGs and MLHs (Carbone et al., 1999; Attanayake et al., 2012; Aldrich-Wolfe et al., 2015; Lehner et al., <sup>499</sup> 2015). Either several MCGs belong to one MLH, which could be explained by insufficient sampling of <sup>500</sup> loci; several MLHs belong to one MCG, which could be explained by clonal expansion; or a mixture of <sup>501</sup> both. Some studies have shown a correlation between MCG and MLH (Carbone et al., 1999; Aldrich-<sup>502</sup> Wolfe et al., 2015; Lehner et al., 2015), whereas other studies have shown no apparent correlation, even <sup>503</sup> on small spatial scales (Atallah et al., 2004; Attanayake et al., 2012, 2013).

One long-held assumption was that MCGs (as determined via barrage reaction) represent vegetative 504 compatibility groups (VCGs) (Kohn et al., 1990; Schafer & Kohn, 2006; Lehner et al., 2015), which are 505 known to have a genetic component (Saupe, 2000; Hall et al., 2010; Strom & Bushley, 2016). While 506 our protocol for assessing MCGs utilized Diana Sermons Medium (Cubeta et al., 2001) as compared to 507 Patterson's Medium or Potato Dextrose Agar (Schafer & Kohn, 2006) for the MCG reactions, the patterns 508 509 we observe are not dissimilar from what have previously been reported in the literature. It has been demonstrated in several Ascomycetes-including Neurospora crassa (Micali & Smith, 2003), Sclerotinia 510 homoecarpa (Jo et al., 2008), Verticillium dahliae (Papaioannou & Typas, 2014), and S. sclerotiorum (Ford 511

et al., 1995)—that barrage reactions are independent from stable anastomosis. Thus, the inconsistencies

in this study and other studies indicate that researchers studying S. sclerotiorum should not rely on MCG

514 data derived from barrage reactions as an indicator for genetic diversity.

# 515 Limitations

One of the main limitations of this study is the focus on *P. vulgaris* as a host. It has been shown that *S. sclerotiorum* in the midwestern United States does not have a particular preference for host (Aldrich-Wolfe et al., 2015). If the distribution of *S. sclerotiorum* is even across agricultural hosts in the USA, then our sample may yet be representative of the genetic pool present in other crops and weedy species. Additionally, while we found no significant association between genotype and aggressiveness, it is important to note that the straw test is only one measure of aggressiveness. Additional phenotypes for aggressiveness should be evaluated for future studies.

Another limitation was the microsatellite markers used for this particular study (Sirjusingh & Kohn, 523 2001). The haplotype accumulation curve showed no indication of a plateau, indicating that if we had 524 sampled more loci, we would have resolved more multilocus haplotypes. While 16 loci showed us 525 similar results and began to show a plateau for the haplotype accumulation curve, we were unable to 526 use these results due to our uncertainty in the allele calls for these five extra loci. With the availability 527 of an optically-mapped genome (Derbyshire et al., 2017), future studies describing the genetic diversity 528 of S. sclerotiorum should employ techniques such as Genotyping-By-Sequencing (Davey et al., 2011), 529 Sequence Capture (Grover et al., 2012), or Whole Genome Sequencing. 530

# 531 Conclusions

This study represents the largest genetic analysis of S. sclerotiorum from the USA to date, giving us a 532 unique insight to continent-wide population structure and relationships between phenotypic and genotypic 533 variables. Populations in wmn appear to show no significant differentiation when compared to their 534 production field counterparts, suggesting that the wmn populations of S. sclerotiorum may be considered 535 representative of the surrounding regions. While we found no direct relationship between haplotype and 536 severity, it is evident that there is a gradient of severity by region, further supporting the need for screening 537 in multiple locations. Based on our analysis of the relationships between MCG and MLH, we found 538 no clear evidence that the two are directly related, suggesting that MCG does not necessarily represent 539 vegetative compatibility groups and thus should not be used as a proxy for identifying clones. 540

# 541 Data Availability

All scripts, data, and resources used to generate the results presented in this publication (including Supplementary Information) are fully reproducible and available at The Open Science Framework https://osf.io/ejb5y-(Kamvar et al., 2017).

# 545 Funding

Funding for this research was provided by the North Central Soybean Research Program (#639K623)
to SEE, a Layman Award (#2446) to SEE, USDA-ARS National Sclerotinia Initiative (#58-5442-2-209)
to JRS/SEE, and start-up funds from the University of Nebraska-Lincoln to SEE. The funders had no role
in study design, data collection and analysis, decision to publish, or preparation of the manuscript.

# 550 Acknowledgements

The authors would like to thank Rebecca Higgens for technical support in generating the data for the MCG assessment, aggressiveness ratings, and genotyping; and for providing valuable insights into the historical context of the data collection and curation.

# 554 Conflicts of Interest

We would also like to thank Denita Hadziabdic and two other anonymous reviewers for their valuable comments and insights that improved the quality of the manuscript. ## Conflicts of Interest {-}

<sup>557</sup> The authors declare no conflict of interest.

# **558** Author Contributions

- Zhian N. Kamvar analyzed the data, contributed analysis tools, wrote the paper, prepared figures
- and tables, edited and reviewed drafts of the paper.

• Bimal Sajeewa Amaradasa analyzed the data, contributed analysis tools, wrote drafts of the paper, 561 edited and reviewed drafts of the paper. 562 • Rachana Jhala Carried out experiments (MCG assessment, aggressiveness ratings, genotyping), 563 edited and reviewed drafts of the paper. 564 • Serena McCoy Carried out experiments (MCG assessment, aggressiveness ratings, genotyping), 565 edited and reviewed drafts of the paper. 566 • James Steadman Conceived and designed experiments, organized network of white mold screening 567 nurseries, provided S. sclerotiorum isolates, edited and reviewed drafts of the paper. 568 • Sydney E. Everhart supervised data analysis, analyzed the data, contributed analysis tools, wrote 569 the paper, edited and reviewed drafts of the paper. 570

# 571 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION

**Table S1.** Description of *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* isolates used in this study. N = Number of Isolates. Key abbreviations: wmn = white mold screening nursery, producer = producer field, unk = unknown cultivar.

Country	State	Field Code	Year	Host	N
USA	CA	wmn	2004, 2005	Beryl, Bunsi, G122	18
USA	CO	producer	2007, 2010	Pinto, Yellow	41
		wmn	2003	GH	1
USA	ID	producer	2003	GH	1
USA	MI	wmn	2003, 2004, 2005,	11A, 37, 38, B07104, Beryl,	43
			2008, 2009	Bunsi, Cornell, G122, Orion, PO7863, WM31	
		producer	2003, 2008, 2009	BL, Black, Fuji, GH, Merlot, SR06233, unk, Vista, Zorro	19
USA	MN	wmn	2003, 2004	Beryl, Bunsi, G122	11
USA	ND	producer	2007, 2010	unk	53
		wmn	2005	Beryl, Bunsi, G122	7
USA	NE	wmn	2004, 2005, 2008,	Beryl, Bunsi, G122, PO7683,	27
			2010	unk	
		producer	2003, 2007, 2009,	Beryl, Emerson, GH, Orion,	20
			2010	Pinto, Weihing	
USA	NY	producer	2003	GH	1
USA	OR	wmn	2003, 2004	Beryl, Bunsi, G122	
		producer	2003	G122, GH	2
USA	WA	wmn	2003, 2004, 2005,	11A, 37, 38, Beryl, Bunsi,	36
			2008	Cornell, G122, Orion, PO7	
				104, PO7863, WM31	
		producer	2003, 2007	GH, Merlot, Pinto, Redkid	23
USA	WI	producer	2003	GH	2
Mexico	-	wmn	2005	Beryl, Bunsi, G122	18
France	-	wmn	2004, 2005	Beryl, Bunsi, G122	18
		producer	2012	unk	4
Australia	-	wmn	2004	Beryl, Bunsi, G122	4
		producer	2004	Beryl	2

**Table S2.** Mean aggressiveness ratings for Regions with more than five samples; groupings according to 95% family-wise confidence interval.

Region	Mean Aggressiveness	Group
MN	5.84	а
ND	5.77	а
NE	5.29	ab
MI	5.13	abc
OR	4.84	abcd
CO	4.72	bcd
WA	4.67	cd
France	4.66	cd
Mexico	4.58	cd
Australia	4.12	cd
CA	4.01	d

MCG	Mean Aggressiveness	Group
44	6.03	а
3	5.50	ab
5	5.40	b
2	5.25	b
9	5.11	b
1	4.95	b
45	4.88	b
4	4.87	b
53	4.69	b
49	4.60	b

**Table S3.** Mean aggressiveness ratings for the 10 most abundant MCG; groupings according to 95% family-wise confidence interval.

**Table S4.** Mean aggressiveness ratings for the 10 MLH most abundant; groupings according to 95% family-wise confidence interval.

MLH	Mean Aggressiveness	Group
78	6.07	а
65	5.94	а
9	5.67	ab
25	5.41	ab
66	5.30	ab
104	5.22	ab
160	4.80	ab
163	4.80	ab
165	4.34	b
140	4.31	b



**Figure S1.** Example of MCG test plates showing (A) a compatible reaction with mycelia from two strains overgrowing each other and (B) an incompatible reaction with a barrage line of dead tissue forming between the two strains. Photo Credit: Rebecca Higgens.



**Figure S2.** Strip plot of aggressiveness for the eight most abundant MCGs partitioned by region. Filled circles indicate one of the five most abundant MLHs and open circles indicate a MLH of lesser abundance.



**Figure S3.** Graph showing complex associations between Mycelial Compatibility Groups (MCG) (dotted nodes) and Multilocus Haplotypes (MLH) (full nodes) where the number in each node represents the MLH/MCG assignment. Node size reflect the number of samples represented by each node (circle). Edges (arrows) point from MLH to MCG where the weight (thickness) of the edge represents the number of samples shared. Node color represents the community assignment based on the walktrap algorithm with a maximum of four steps (Pons & Latapy, 2006). An interactive version of this network can be recreated using the code in the "Interactive visualizations" section of the mlg-mcg.md file in the supplementary information (Direct Link:

https://github.com/everhartlab/sclerotinia-366/blob/master/results/
mlg-mcg.md#interactive-visualizations) (Kamvar et al., 2017).



**Figure S4.** Network of populations (nodes/circles) and their shared multilocus haplotypes (MLH) (edges/lines) haplotyped over 16 loci. Each node is labeled with **name (number of MLHs shared/number of MLHs total).** The shade and area of the nodes are proportional to the number of unique MLHs within the node and the inner nodes are proportional to the number of private MLHs to the region (bottom legend). Each edge represents a single MLH where its thickness represents the number of populations that share the MLH and the shade represents the value of  $P_{sex}$ , or the probability of encountering that MLH from two independent meiotic events.



**Figure S5.** Scatter plot of Discriminant Analysis of Principal Components on Regions and Years showing temporal variation across all Regions. Points (text labels) represent observed individuals connected to the population centroids with ellipses representing a 66% confidence interval for a normal distribution. The center of each component is represented as black grid lines.

# 572 **REFERENCES**

Agapow, P., & Burt, A. (2001). Indices of multilocus linkage disequilibrium. Molecular Ecology 573 Notes, 1, 101–102. 574 Aldrich-Wolfe, L., Travers, S., & Nelson, B. D. (2015). Genetic variation of Sclerotinia sclerotiorum 575 from multiple crops in the north central United States. PLOS ONE, 10(9), e0139188. https://doi. 576 org/10.1371/journal.pone.0139188 577 Arnaud-Hanod, S., Duarte, C. M., Alberto, F., & Serrão, E. A. (2007). Standardizing methods to 578 address clonality in population studies. *Molecular Ecology*, 16(24), 5115–5139. https://doi.org/ 579 10.1111/j.1365-294X.2007.03535.x 580 Atallah, Z. K., Larget, B., Chen, X., & Johnson, D. A. (2004). High genetic diversity, phenotypic 581 uniformity, and evidence of outcrossing in Sclerotinia sclerotiorum in the Columbia Basin of Washington 582 State. Phytopathology, 94, 737–742. 583 Attanayake, R. N., Carter, P. A., Jiang, D., del Río-Mendoza, L., & Chen, W. (2013). Scle-584 rotinia sclerotiorum populations infecting canola from China and the United States are genetically 585 and phenotypically distinct. Phytopathology, 103(7), 750-761. https://doi.org/10.1094/ 586 phyto-07-12-0159-r 587 Attanayake, R., Porter, L., Johnson, D., & Chen, W. (2012). Genetic and phenotypic diversity and random association of DNA markers of isolates of the fungal plant pathogen Sclerotinia sclerotiorum 589 from soil on a fine geographic scale. Soil Biology and Biochemistry, 55, 28-36. https://doi.org/ 590 10.1016/j.soilbio.2012.06.002 591 Boettiger, C., & Eddelbuettel, D. (2017). An introduction to rocker: Docker containers for R. CoRR, 592 abs/1710.03675. Retrieved from http://arxiv.org/abs/1710.03675 593 Boland, G., & Hall, R. (1994). Index of plant hosts of Sclerotinia sclerotiorum. Canadian Journal of 594 Plant Pathology, 16(2), 93-108. https://doi.org/10.1080/07060669409500766 595 Bolton, M. D., Thomma, B. P. H. J., & Nelson, B. D. (2006). Sclerotinia sclerotiorum (Lib.) de 596 Bary: Biology and molecular traits of a cosmopolitan pathogen. Molecular Plant Pathology, 7(1), 1–16. 597 https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1364-3703.2005.00316.x 598 Botelho, L. d., Zancan, W. L. A., Cruz Machado, J. da, & Barrocas, E. N. (2013). Performance of 599 common bean seeds infected by the fungus Sclerotinia sclerotiorum. Journal of Seed Science, 35(2), 600 153-160. https://doi.org/10.1590/s2317-15372013000200003 601 Brown, A. H. D., Feldman, M. W., & Nevo, E. (1980). Multilocus structure of natural populations of 602 Hordeum Spontaneum. Genetics, 96(2), 523-536. Retrieved from http://www.genetics.org/ 603 content/96/2/523 604 Bruvo, R., Michiels, N. K., D'Souza, T. G., & Schulenburg, H. (2004). A simple method for the 605 calculation of microsatellite genotype distances irrespective of ploidy level. Molecular Ecology, 13(7), 606 2101-2106. 607 Carbone, I., & Kohn, L. M. (2001). Multilocus nested haplotype networks extended with DNA 608 fingerprints show common origin and fine-scale, ongoing genetic divergence in a wild microbial metapop-609 ulation. Molecular Ecology, 10(10), 2409-2422. https://doi.org/10.1046/j.0962-1083. 610 2001.01380.x 611 Carbone, I., Anderson, J. B., & Kohn, L. M. (1999). Patterns of descent in clonal lineages and 612 their multilocus fingerprints are resolved with combined gene genealogies. Evolution, 53(1), 11–21. 613 https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1558-5646.1999.tb05329.x 614 Csardi, G., & Nepusz, T. (2006). The igraph software package for complex network research. 615 InterJournal, Complex Systems, 1695. Retrieved from http://igraph.org 616 Cubeta, M. A., Cody, B. R., Kohli, Y., & Kohn, L. M. (1997). Clonality in Sclerotinia sclerotiorum on 617 infected cabbage in eastern North Carolina. Phytopathology, 87, 1000–1004. 618 Cubeta, M., Sermons, D., & Cody, B. (2001). Mycelial interactions of Sclerotinia minor. Phytopathol-619 ogy, 91(6S), S19. https://doi.org/10.1094/phyto.2001.91.6.s1 620 Davey, J. W., Hohenlohe, P. A., Etter, P. D., Boone, J. Q., Catchen, J. M., & Blaxter, M. L. (2011). 621 Genome-wide genetic marker discovery and genotyping using next-generation sequencing. Nature 622 *Reviews Genetics*, 12(7), 499–510. https://doi.org/10.1038/nrg3012 623 Derbyshire, M., Denton-Giles, M., Hegedus, D., Seifbarghy, S., Rollins, J., van Kan, J., Seidl, M. F., Faino, L., Mbengue, M., Navaud, O., Raffaele, S., Hammond-Kosack, K., Heard, S., & Oliver, R. 625 (2017). The complete genome sequence of the phytopathogenic fungus Sclerotinia sclerotiorum reveals 626

insights into the genome architecture of broad host range pathogens. Genome Biology and Evolution, 627 9(3), 593-618. https://doi.org/10.1093/gbe/evx030 628 Ekins, M. G., Hayden, H. L., Aitken, E. A. B., & Goulter, K. C. (2011). Population structure of 629 630 Sclerotinia sclerotiorum on sunflower in Australia. Australasian Plant Pathology, 40, 99–108. Excoffier, L., Smouse, P. E., & Quattro, J. M. (1992). Analysis of molecular variance inferred from 631 metric distances among DNA haplotypes: Application to human mitochondrial DNA restriction data. 632 Genetics, 131(2), 479-91. 633 Ford, E., Miller, R., Gray, H., & Sherwood, J. (1995). Heterokaryon formation and vegetative 634 compatibility in Sclerotinia sclerotiorum. Mycological Research, 99(2), 241–247. 635 Grover, C. E., Salmon, A., & Wendel, J. F. (2012). Targeted sequence capture as a powerful tool for 636 evolutionary analysis. American Journal of Botany, 99(2), 312-319. https://doi.org/10.3732/ 637 ajb.1100323 638 Grünwald, N. J., Goodwin, S. B., Milgroom, M. G., & Fry, W. E. (2003). Analysis of genotypic 639 diversity data for populations of microorganisms. Phytopathology, 93(6), 738-746. https://doi. 640 org/10.1094/phyto.2003.93.6.738 641 Hall, C., Welch, J., Kowbel, D. J., & Glass, N. L. (2010). Evolution and diversity of a fungal 642 self/nonself recognition locus. PLoS ONE, 5(11), e14055. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal. 643 pone.0014055 644 Heck, K. L., van Belle, G., & Simberloff, D. (1975). Explicit calculation of the rarefaction diversity 645 measurement and the determination of sufficient sample size. *Ecology*, 56(6), 1459–1461. https: 646 647 //doi.org/10.2307/1934716 Henry, L., & Wickham, H. (2017). purr: Functional programming tools. Retrieved from https: 648 //CRAN.R-project.org/package=purrr 649 Hurlbert, S. H. (1971). The nonconcept of species diversity: A critique and alternative parameters. 650 Ecology, 52(4), 577-586. https://doi.org/10.2307/1934145 651 Jo, Y.-K., Chang, S. W., Rees, J., & Jung, G. (2008). Reassessment of vegetative compatibility of 652 Sclerotinia homoeocarpa using nitrate-nonutilizing mutants. Phytopathology, 98(1), 108–114. https: 653 //doi.org/10.1094/phyto-98-1-0108 654 Jombart, T. (2008). adegenet: A R package for the multivariate analysis of genetic markers. *Bioinfor*-655 matics, 24(11), 1403-1405. https://doi.org/10.1093/bioinformatics/btn129 656 Jombart, T., Devillard, S., & Balloux, F. (2010). Discriminant analysis of principal components: 657 A new method for the analysis of genetically structured populations. BMC Genetics, 11:94. https: 658 //doi.org/10.1186/1471--2156--11--94 659 Kamvar, Z. N., Amaradasa, B. S., Jhala, R., McCoy, S., Steadman, J., & Everhart, S. E. (2017, 660 November). Data and analysis for population structure and phenotypic variation of Sclerotinia 661 sclerotiorum from dry bean (Phaseolus vulgaris) in the United States. Open Science Framework. 662 https://doi.org/10.17605/OSF.IO/EJB5Y 663 664 Kamvar, Z. N., Brooks, J. C., & Grünwald, N. J. (2015). Novel R tools for analysis of genome-wide population genetic data with emphasis on clonality. Frontiers in Genetics, 6. https://doi.org/10. 665 3389/fgene.2015.00208 666 Kamvar, Z. N., Tabima, J. F., & Grünwald, N. J. (2014). Poppr: An R package for genetic analysis of 667 populations with clonal, partially clonal, and/or sexual reproduction. PeerJ, 2, e281. https://doi. 668 org/10.7717/peerj.281 669 Knodel, J., Beauzay, P., Franzen, D., Kandel, H., Markell, S., Osorno, J., Pasche, J., & Zollinger, R. 670 (2012). 2012 dry bean grower survey of production, pest problems and pesticide use in Minnesota and 671 North Dakota. North Dakota State University Extension, E1640. 672 Knodel, J., Beauzay, P., Franzen, D., Kandel, H., Markell, S., Osorno, J., Pasche, J., & Zollinger, R. 673 (2015). 2015 dry bean grower survey of production, pest problems and pesticide use in Minnesota and 674 North Dakota. North Dakota State University Extension, E1802. 675 Knodel, J., Beauzay, P., Franzen, D., Kandel, H., Markell, S., Osorno, J., Pasche, J., & Zollinger, R. 676 (2016). 2016 dry bean grower survey of production, pest problems and pesticide use in Minnesota and 677 North Dakota. North Dakota State University Extension, E1841. 678 Kohli, Y., & Kohn, L. M. (1998). Random association among alleles in clonal populations of 679 Sclerotinia sclerotiorum. Fungal Genetics and Biology, 23, 139–149. 680

Kohli, Y., Brunner, L. J., Yoell, H., Milgroom, M. G., Anderson, J. B., Morrall, R. A. A., & Kohn, L.

M. (1995). Clonal dispersal and spatial mixing in populations of the plant pathogenic fungus, *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum*. *Molecular Ecology*, *4*, 69–77.

Kohn, L. M. (1995). The clonal dynamic in wild and agricultural plant-pathogen populations. *Canadian Journal of Botany*, 73(S1), 1231–1240. https://doi.org/10.1139/b95-383

Kohn, L. M., Carbone, I., & Anderson, J. B. (1990). Mycelial interactions in *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum*.
 *Experimental Mycology*, *14*, 255–267.

Legendre, P., & Anderson, M. J. (1999). Distance-based redundancy analysis: Testing multispecies responses in multifactorial ecological experiments. *Ecological Monographs*, 69, 1–24.

Lehner, M. S., & Mizubuti, E. S. G. (2017). Are *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* populations from the tropics more variable than those from subtropical and temperate zones? *Tropical Plant Pathology*, 42(2), 61–69. https://doi.org/10.1007/s40858-016-0125-1

Lehner, M. S., Júnior, T. J. P., Júnior, B. T. H., Teixeira, H., Vieira, R. F., Carneiro, J. E. S., & Mizubuti, E. S. G. (2015). Low genetic variability in *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* populations from common bean

fields in Minas Gerais State, Brazil, at regional, local and micro-scales. *Plant Pathology*, 64(4), 921–931.
 https://doi.org/10.1111/ppa.12322

Lehner, M. S., Paula Júnior, T. J. de, Del Ponte, E. M., Mizubuti, E. S., & Pethybridge, S. J. (2017).
 Independently founded populations of *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* from a tropical and a temperate region have
 similar genetic structure. *PloS One*, *12*(3), e0173915. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.
 pone.0173915

Leslie, J. (1993). Fungal vegetative compatibility. *Annual Review of Phytopathology*, *31*, 127–150.
 Review. https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.py.31.090193.001015

McCoy, S., & Steadman, J. R. (2009). Use of multi-site screening to identify partial resistance to
 white mold in common bean in 2008. *Bean Improvement Cooperative Annual Report*, 86–87. Retrieved
 from https://naldc.nal.usda.gov/naldc/catalog.xhtml?id=IND44207142

McDonald, B. A., & Linde, C. (2002). Pathogen population genetics, evolutionary potential, and durable resistance. *Annual Review of Phytopathology*, *40*(1), 349–379. https://doi.org/10. 1146/annurev.phyto.40.120501.101443

Mendiburu, F. D., & Simon, R. (2015). Agricolae - ten years of an open source statistical tool for experiments in breeding, agriculture and biology. https://doi.org/10.7287/peerj.preprints. 1404v1

Micali, C. O., & Smith, M. L. (2003). On the independence of barrage formation and heterokaryon incompatibility in *Neurospora crassa. Fungal Genetics and Biology*, *38*(2), 209–219. https://doi. org/10.1016/s1087-1845(02)00533-9

Milgroom, M. G. (1996). Recombination and the multilocus structure of fungal populations. *Annual Review of Phytopathology*, *34*(1), 457–477.

Nei, M. (1978). Estimation of average heterozygosity and genetic distance from a small number of
 individuals. *Genetics*, 89, 583–590.

Oksanen, J., Blanchet, F. G., Friendly, M., Kindt, R., Legendre, P., McGlinn, D., Minchin, P. R.,
 O'Hara, R. B., Simpson, G. L., Solymos, P., Stevens, M. H. H., Szoecs, E., & Wagner, H. (2017). Ve *gan: Community ecology package*. Retrieved from https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=
 vegan

Otto-Hanson, L., & Steadman, J. R. (2007). Identification of partial resistance to Sclerotinia sclerotiorum in common bean at multiple locations in 2006. Bean Improvement Cooperative Annual Report, 133–134. Retrieved from https://naldc.nal.usda.gov/naldc/catalog.xhtml?
 id=IND43940892

Otto-Hanson, L., & Steadman, J. R. (2008). Identification of partial resistance to Sclerotinia sclerotiorum in common bean at multiple locations in 2007. Bean Improvement Cooperative Annual Report, 214–215. Retrieved from https://naldc.nal.usda.gov/naldc/catalog.xhtml?
 id=IND44063230

Otto-Hanson, L., Steadman, J. R., Higgins, R., & Eskridge, K. M. (2011). Variation in *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* bean isolates from multisite resistance screening locations. *Plant Disease*, 95(11), 1370–
 1377. https://doi.org/10.1094/pdis-11-10-0865

Papaioannou, I. A., & Typas, M. A. (2014). Barrage formation is independent from heterokaryon
 incompatibility in *Verticillium dahliae. European Journal of Plant Pathology*, *141*(1), 71–82. https:

736 //doi.org/10.1007/s10658-014-0525-3

Parks, J. C., & Werth, C. R. (1993). A study of spatial features of clones in a population of bracken

fern, Pteridium aquilinum (Dennstaedtiaceae). American Journal of Botany, 80(5), 537. https:

739 //doi.org/10.2307/2445369

Pedersen, T. L. (2017). ggraph: An implementation of grammar of graphics for graphs and networks.
 Retrieved from https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=ggraph

Petzoldt, R., & Dickson, M. H. (1996). Straw test for resistance to white mold in beans. Bean

*Improvement Cooperative Annual Report*, 39, 142–143. Retrieved from https://naldc.nal.usda.

744 gov/naldc/catalog.xhtml?id=IND20562675

- Pielou, E. (1975). *Ecological Diversity*. New York: Wiley & Sons.
- Pons, P., & Latapy, M. (2006). Computing communities in large networks using random walks.

747 Journal of Graph Algorithms and Applications, 10(2), 191–218. https://doi.org/10.7155/ 748 jgaa.00124

Prugnolle, F., & de Meeûs, T. (2010). Apparent high recombination rates in clonal parasitic organisms
due to inappropriate sampling design. *Heredity*, *104*(2), 135–140. https://doi.org/10.1038/
hdy.2009.128

R Core Team. (2017). *R: A language and environment for statistical computing*. Vienna, Austria: R
 Foundation for Statistical Computing. Retrieved from https://www.R-project.org/

Ramasubramaniam, H., del Río Mendoza, L. E., & Bradley, C. A. (2008). Estimates of yield and
 economic losses associated with white mold of rain-fed dry bean in North Dakota. *Agronomy Journal*,
 *100*(2), 315. https://doi.org/10.2134/agronj2007.0127

<sup>757</sup> Sambrook, J., Fritsch, E. F., Maniatis, T., & others. (1989). *Molecular Cloning: A Laboratory Manual*.
 <sup>758</sup> Cold spring harbor laboratory press.

Saupe, S. J. (2000). Molecular genetics of heterokaryon incompatibility in filamentous ascomycetes.
 *Microbiology and Molecular Biology Reviews*, 64(3), 489–502. https://doi.org/10.1128/
 mmbr.64.3.489-502.2000

<sup>762</sup> Schafer, M. R., & Kohn, L. M. (2006). An optimized method for mycelial compatibility testing in

763 Sclerotinia sclerotiorum. Mycologia, 98(4), 593-597. https://doi.org/10.1080/15572536.
764 2006.11832662

Sexton, A. C., & Howlett, B. J. (2004). Microsatellite markers reveal genetic differentiation among
 populations of *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* from Australian canola fields. *Current Genetics*, 46(6), 357–365.
 https://doi.org/10.1007/s00294-004-0543-3

Sexton, A. C., Whitten, A. R., & Howlett, B. J. (2006). Population structure of *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* in an Australian canola field at flowering and stem-infection stages of the disease cycle. *Genome*, 49(11),
 1408–1415. https://doi.org/10.1139/q06–101

<sup>771</sup> Shannon, C. E. (1948). A mathematical theory of communication. *ACM SIGMOBILE Mobile* <sup>772</sup> *Computing and Communications Review*, *5*(1), 3–55.

Simpson, E. H. (1949). Measurement of diversity. *Nature*, *163*(4148), 688–688. https://doi. 0rg/10.1038/163688a0

Sirjusingh, C., & Kohn, L. M. (2001). Characterisation of microsatellites in the fungal plant pathogen,
 Sclerotinia sclerotiorum. Molecular Ecology Notes, 1(4), 267–269. https://doi.org/10.1046/
 j.1471-8278.2001.00102.x

Smith, J. M., Smith, N. H., O'Rourke, M., & Spratt, B. G. (1993). How clonal are bacteria?
 *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 90(10), 4384–4388. https://doi.org/10.
 1073/pnas.90.10.4384

Steadman, J. R. (1983). White mold - a serious yield-limiting disease of bean. *Plant Disease*, 67,
 346–350.

<sup>783</sup> Steadman, J. R., Eskridge, K., & Powers, K. (2003). Identification of partial resistance to *Scle*-

*rotinia sclerotiorum* in common bean at multiple locations. *Bean Improvement Cooperative Annual Report*, 225–226. Retrieved from https://naldc.nal.usda.gov/naldc/catalog.xhtml?

786 id=IND43757287

<sup>787</sup> Steadman, J. R., Otto-Hanson, L., & Breathnach, J. (2006). Identification of partial resistance to <sup>788</sup> Sclerotinia sclerotiorum in common bean at multiple locations in 2005. Bean Improvement Cooperative

Annual Report, 223-224. Retrieved from https://naldc.nal.usda.gov/naldc/catalog.

790 xhtml?id=IND43805570

- <sup>791</sup> Steadman, J. R., Otto-Hanson, L., & Powers, K. (2004). Identification of partial resistance to *Sclero*-
- *tinia sclerotiorum* in common bean at multiple locations. *Bean Improvement Cooperative Annual Report*,
- 793 47, 281-282. Retrieved from https://naldc.nal.usda.gov/naldc/catalog.xhtml?id= 794 IND43758354
- <sup>795</sup> Steadman, J. R., Otto-Hanson, L., & Powers, K. (2005). Identification of partial resistance to
- 796 Sclerotinia sclerotiorum in common bean at multiple locations in 2004. Bean Improvement Cooperative
- 797 Annual Report, 124-125. Retrieved from https://naldc.nal.usda.gov/naldc/catalog. 798 xhtml?id=IND43759243
- Stoddart, J. A., & Taylor, J. F. (1988). Genotypic diversity: Estimation and prediction in samples.
   *Genetics*, 118(4), 705–11.
- Strausbaugh, C., & Forster, R. (2003). Management of white mold of beans. *Pacific Northwest Extension*, *PNW568*. Retrieved from http://http://www.extension.uidaho.edu/ publishing/pdf/PNW/PNW0568.pdf
- Strom, N. B., & Bushley, K. E. (2016). Two genomes are better than one: History, genetics, and biotechnological applications of fungal heterokaryons. *Fungal Biology and Biotechnology*, *3*(1). https://doi.org/10.1186/s40694-016-0022-x
- Teran, H., Lema, M., Schwartz, H. F., Duncan, R., Gilbeitson, R., & Singh, S. P. (2006). Modified Petzoldt and Dickson scale for white mold rating of common bean. *Bean Improvement Cooperative Annual Report*, 49, 115–116. Retrieved from https://naldc.nal.usda.gov/naldc/catalog. xhtml?id=IND43805401
- Tu, J. C., & Beversdorf, W. D. (1982). Tolerance to white mold (Sclerotinia sclerotiorum (Lib.)
- <sup>812</sup> De Bary) in Ex Rico 23, a cultivar of white bean (Phaseolus vulgaris L.). Canadian Journal of Plant
- 813 Science, 62(1), 65-69. https://doi.org/10.4141/cjps82-010
- Wickham, H. (2009). ggplot2: Elegant graphics for data analysis. Springer-Verlag New York.
   Retrieved from http://ggplot2.org
- Wickham, H., Francois, R., Henry, L., & Müller, K. (2017). *dplyr: A grammar of data manipulation*.
   Retrieved from https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=dplyr