

Experimenting with (Conditional) Perfection.

Online Appendix: Stimulus Vignettes

Fabrizio Cariani and Lance J. Rips

This document is a companion to “Experimenting with (Conditional) Perfection” listing all the vignettes we used for our experimental items.

We list the 16 stimulus vignettes from Experiment 2 in the form they appeared for Denying the Antecedent inferences. [CONS?] indicates consequent-directed questions, and [ANT?] antecedent-directed questions. The content of the vignettes was the same in the remaining experiments, but the exact form of the problems differed as described for the individual experiments in Section 4.

1. John has taken a test on Chapters 4-6 that has not been graded yet.

[CONS?] You ask Mary, "What are all the ways John could manage to do well on the test?"

[ANT?] You ask Mary, "What are all the things that could happen in case John understood Chapter 5?"

Mary responds, "If John understood Chapter 5, then John did well on the test."

Assume that John did not understand Chapter 5.

Given this information, does Mary's statement then imply that John did not do well on the test?

2. On Tuesday, Alicia was in Centerville, Eastlake, or Grand Island.

[CONS?] You ask Mary, "What are all the ways Alicia could manage to get wet?"

[ANT?] You ask Mary, "What are all the things that could happen in case Alicia was in Grand Island?"

Mary responds, "If Alicia was in Grand Island, then Alicia got wet."

Assume that Alicia was not in Grand Island.

Given this information, does Mary's statement then imply that Alicia did not get wet?

3. Paul took the morning or afternoon off work.

[CONS?] You ask Mary, "What are all the ways Paul could manage to cut the grass?"

[ANT?] You ask Mary, "What are all the things that could happen in case Paul took the afternoon off work?"

Mary responds, "If Paul took the afternoon off work, then Paul cut the grass."

Assume that Paul did not take the afternoon off work.

Given this information, does Mary's statement then imply that Paul did not cut the grass?

4. Martha has been working on a complicated crossword puzzle.

[CONS?] You ask Mary, "What are all the ways Martha could manage to finish the puzzle?"

[ANT?] You ask Mary, "What are all the things that could happen in case Martha remembered her geography facts?"

Mary responds, "If Martha remembered her geography facts, then Martha finished the puzzle."

Assume that Martha did not remember her geography facts.

Given this information, does Mary's statement then imply that Martha did not finish the puzzle?

Experimenting with (Conditional) Perfection / 2

5. Calvin found a match or a lighter in this backpack.

[CONS?] You ask Mary, "What are all the ways Calvin could manage to light a campfire?"

[ANT?] You ask Mary, "What are all the things that could happen in case Calvin found a lighter?"

Mary responds, "If Calvin found a lighter, then Calvin lit a campfire."

Assume Calvin did not find a lighter.

Given this information, does Mary's statement imply that Calvin did not light a campfire?

6. Jenny has turned on the air conditioner, turned on the fan, or opened the window.

[CONS?] You ask Mary, "What are all the ways Jenny could manage to feel cool?"

[ANT?] You ask Mary, "What are all the things that could happen in case Jenny turned on the air conditioner?"

Mary responds, "If Jenny turned on the air conditioner, then Jenny felt cool."

Assume that Jenny did not turn on the air conditioner.

Given this information, does Mary's statement imply that Jenny did not feel cool?

7. Jim repaired some wiring, reset a circuit breaker, or paid the electric bill for his loft.

[CONS?] You ask Mary, "What are all the ways Jim could manage to fix the electricity in his loft?"

[ANS?] You ask Mary, "What are all the things that could happen in case Jim repaired some wiring?"

Mary responds, "If Jim repaired the wiring, then Jim fixed the electricity in his loft."

Assume that Jim did not repair the wiring.

Given this information, does Mary's statement imply that Jim did not fix the electricity in his loft?

8. Tim cooked a meal, went to the Cellar Door, or got take out from Charlie's.

[CONS?] You ask Mary, "What are all the ways Tim could manage to have a pleasant dinner?"

[ANT?] You ask Mary, "What are all the things that could happen in case Tim cooked a meal?"

Mary responds, "If Tim cooked a meal, then Tim had a pleasant dinner."

Assume that Tim did not cook a meal.

Given this information, does Mary's statement imply that Tim did not have a pleasant dinner?

9. Someone has put a fertilizer, either Easy-gro or Bloom-builder, on the plants.

[CONS?] You ask Mary, "What are all the ways the plants could manage to grow quickly?"

[ANT?] You ask Mary, "What are all the things that could happen in case Easy-gro was put on the plants?"

Mary responds, "If Easy-gro was put on the plants, then the plants grew quickly."

Assume that the Easy-gro was not put on the plants.

Given this information, does Mary's statement imply that the plants did not grow quickly?

10. Rosa met one of her three sisters, June, Fran, or Barbara.

[CONS?] You ask Mary, "What are all the ways Rosa could manage to go to a movie?"

[ANT?] You ask Mary, "What are all the things that could happen in case Rosa met June?"

Mary responds, "If Rosa met June, then Rosa went to a movie."

Assume that Rosa did not meet June.

Given this information, does Mary's statement imply that Rosa did not go to a movie?

Experimenting with (Conditional) Perfection / 3

11. Todd's Sports has kayaks, canoes, or pontoons for rent.

[CONS?] You ask Mary, "What are all the ways Laura could manage to rent a boat?"

[ANT?] You ask Mary, "What are all the things that could happen in case Todd's Sports had canoes available?"

Mary responds, "If Todd's Sports had canoes available, then Laura rented a boat."

Assume that Todd's Sports did not have canoes available.

Given this information, does Mary's statement imply that Laura did not rent a boat?

12. Michael forgot to add some ingredients to the cake batter.

[CONS?] You ask Mary, "What are all the ways that the cake could manage to fall?"

[ANT?] You ask Mary, "What are all the things that could happen in case Michael forgot to add eggs?"

Mary responds, "If Michael forgot to add eggs, then the cake fell."

Assume that Michael did not forget to add eggs.

Given this information, does Mary's statement imply that the cake did not fall?

13. Elisa had an essay to write, a final exam, or a research project due for Anthropology 281.

[CONS?] You ask Mary, "What are all the ways Elisa could manage to study late in the library?"

[ANT?] You ask Mary, "What are all the things that could happen in case Elisa had an essay to write?"

Mary responds, "If Elisa had an essay to write, then Elisa studied late in the library."

Assume that Elisa did not have an essay to write.

Given this information, does Mary's statement imply that Elisa did not study late in the library?

14. Flight 6044 flew through bad weather on its way to Kansas City.

[CONS?] You ask Mary, "What are all the ways Flight 6044 could crash?"

[ANT?] You ask Mary, "What are all the things that could happen in case Flight 6044 flew through thunderstorms?"

Mary responds, "If Flight 6044 flew through thunderstorms, then the plane crashed."

Assume that Flight 6044 did not fly through thunderstorms.

Given this information, does Mary's statement imply that the plane did not crash?

15. Recently, Sam's car was filled with gas, had the spark plugs replaced, or had the ignition switch replaced.

[CONS?] You ask Mary, "What are all the ways Sam's car could manage to start?"

[ANT?] You ask Mary, "What are all the things that could happen in case Sam's car had the ignition switch replaced?"

Mary responds, "If Sam's car had the ignition switch replaced, then Sam's car started."

Assume that Sam's car did not have the ignition switch replaced.

Given this information, does Mary's statement imply that Sam's car did not start?

16. Susan has recently snacked on almonds, chips, or peanut butter cookies.

[CONS?] You ask Mary, "What are all the ways Susan could manage to get cavities?"

[ANT?] You ask Mary, "What are all the things that could happen in case Susan snacked on peanut butter cookies?"

Experimenting with (Conditional) Perfection / 4

Mary responds, "If Susan snacked on peanut butter cookies, then Susan got cavities."

Assume that Susan did not snack on peanut butter cookies.

Given this information, does Mary's statement imply that Susan did not get cavities?