

A typology of case competition in headless relatives

Fenna Bergsma

Goethe-Universität Frankfurt

Syntax colloquium

November 27, 2020

Introduction — case

- (1) Der Lehrer mag den Schüler.
the.NOM teacher likes the.ACC student
'The teacher likes the pupil.'

Introduction — case

- (1) Der Lehrer mag den Schüler.
the.NOM teacher likes the.ACC student
'The teacher likes the pupil.'
- (2) Der Schüler mag den Lehrer.
the.NOM student likes the.ACC teacher
'The pupil likes the teacher.'

Introduction — (headless) relative clauses

- (3) Der Lehrer mag den Schüler, der nach draußen guckt.
the.NOM teacher likes the.ACC student REL.SG.M.NOM to outside looks
'The teacher likes the pupil that is looking outside.'

Introduction — (headless) relative clauses

- (3) Der Lehrer mag den Schüler, der nach draußen guckt.
the.NOM teacher likes the.ACC student REL.SG.M.NOM to outside looks
'The teacher likes the pupil that is looking outside.'
- (4) Der Lehrer mag den Schüler, den er beim
the.NOM teacher likes the.ACC student REL.SG.M.ACC he at the
Versteckspiel sucht.
hide-and-seek game searches
'The teacher likes the pupil that he is searching for playing hide-and-seek.'

Introduction — (headless) relative clauses

- (3) Der Lehrer mag den Schüler, der nach draußen guckt.
the.NOM teacher likes the.ACC student REL.SG.M.NOM to outside looks
'The teacher likes the pupil that is looking outside.'
- (4) Der Lehrer mag den Schüler, den er beim
the.NOM teacher likes the.ACC student REL.SG.M.ACC he at the
Versteckspiel sucht.
hide-and-seek game searches
'The teacher likes the pupil that he is searching for playing hide-and-seek.'
- (5) Der Lehrer mag, wen er beim Versteckspiel sucht.
the.NOM teacher likes REL.SG.M.ACC he at the hide-and-seek game searches
'The teacher likes the pupil that he is searching for playing hide-and-seek.'

Introduction — case competition

- (6) gaarma þan -ei arma
pity.PRES.1SG_[ACC] REL.SG.M.ACC -COMP pity.PRES.1SG_[ACC]
'I pity him whom I pity' (Gothic, ROM 9:15, adapted from **harbert1978**: 339)

Introduction — case competition

- (6) gaarma þan -ei arma
pity.PRES.1SG_[ACC] REL.SG.M.ACC -COMP pity.PRES.1SG_[ACC]
'I pity him whom I pity' (Gothic, ROM 9:15, adapted from **harbert1978**: 339)
- (7) **þan** -ei **frijos** siuks ist
REL.SG.M.ACC -COMP love.PRES.2SG._[ACC] sick be.PRES.3SG_[NOM]
'the one whom you love is sick'
(Gothic, JOHN 11:3, adapted from **harbert1978**: 342)

Matching cases

- (8) **ei** **sa** **-ei** **þis** **matjai**, **ni** **gadaupnai**
COMP REL.SG.M.NOM -COMP DEM.SG.M.GEN eat.OPT.3SG_[NOM] not die.OPT.3SG_[NOM]
'that the one, who eats of this may not die'
(Gothic, JOHN 6:50, after **harbert1978**: 337)

Matching cases

- (8) ei sa -ei þis matjai, ni gadaupnai
 COMP REL.SG.M.NOM -COMP DEM.SG.M.GEN eat.OPT.3SG_[NOM] not die.OPT.3SG_[NOM]
 ‘that the one, who eats of this may not die’
 (Gothic, JOHN 6:50, after **harbert1978**: 337)
- (9) gaarma þan -ei arma
 pity.1SG_[ACC] REL.SG.M.ACC -COMP pity.1SG_[ACC]
 ‘I pity him, whom I pity’ (Gothic, ROM 9:15, after **harbert1978**: 339)

Matching cases

- (8) ei sa -ei þis matjai, ni gadaupnai
COMP REL.SG.M.NOM -COMP DEM.SG.M.GEN eat.OPT.3SG_[NOM] not die.OPT.3SG_[NOM]
'that the one, who eats of this may not die'
(Gothic, JOHN 6:50, after **harbert1978**: 337)
- (9) gaarma þan -ei arma
pity.1SG_[ACC] REL.SG.M.ACC -COMP pity.1SG_[ACC]
'I pity him, whom I pity' (Gothic, ROM 9:15, after **harbert1978**: 339)
- (10) nist mein du giban, alja þaim -ei
is not 1SG.POSS.NOM to give.INF_[DAT] except for REL.SG.M.DAT -COMP
manwiþ was
prepare.PTCP be.PRET.3SG_[DAT]
'it is not mine to give except for to the one, for whom it was prepared'
(Gothic, MARK 10:49, after **harbert1978**: 339)

Gothic headless relatives (matching)

<small>INT</small> ^{EXT}	[NOM]	[ACC]	[DAT]
[NOM]	NOM		
[ACC]		ACC	
[DAT]			DAT

- (11) **pan** **-ei** **frijos** siuks ist
REL.SG.M.ACC -COMP love.PRES.2SG._[ACC] sick be.PRES.3SG_[NOM]
'the one whom you love is sick'
(Gothic, JOHN 11:3, adapted from **harbert1978**: 342)

- (11) **pan** **-ei** **frijos** siuks ist
 REL.SG.M.ACC -COMP love.PRES.2SG._[ACC] sick be.PRES.3SG._[NOM]
 ‘the one whom you love is sick’
 (Gothic, JOHN 11:3, adapted from **harbert1978**: 342)
- (12) jah po **-ei** **ist** **us** **Laudeikaion** jus
 and REL.SG.N.ACC -COMP be.PRES.3SG._[NOM] from Laodicea 2.PL.NOM
 ussiggwaid
 read._[ACC]
 ‘and you read the one which is from Laodicea’
 (Gothic, COL 4:16, adapted from **harbert1978**: 357)

Gothic headless relatives (NOM — ACC)

	[NOM]	[ACC]	[DAT]
[NOM]	NOM	*NOM ACC	
[ACC]	ACC *NOM	ACC	
[DAT]			DAT

NOM VS. DAT

- (13) ip þamm -ei leitið fraletada leitið frijod
 but REL.SG.M.DAT -COMP little forgive.PASS.PRES.3SG_[DAT] little love._[NOM]
 ‘but the one whom little is forgiven loves little’
 (Gothic, LUKE 7:47, adapted from **harbert1978**: 342)

NOM VS. DAT

- (13) ip þamm -ei leitol fraletada leitol frijod
but REL.SG.M.DAT -COMP little forgive.PASS.PRES.3SG_[DAT] little love._[NOM]
'but the one whom little is forgiven loves little'
(Gothic, LUKE 7:47, adapted from **harbert**1978: 342)
- (14) þaim -ei iupa sind frapjaip
REL.PL.N.DAT -COMP above be.PRES.3PL_[NOM] think about.OPT.PRES.2PL_[DAT]
'think about those which are above'
(Gothic, COL 3:2, adapted from **harbert**1978: 339)

Gothic headless relatives (NOM — DAT)

	[NOM]	[ACC]	[DAT]
[NOM]	NOM	ACC *NOM	DAT *NOM
[ACC]	ACC *NOM	ACC	
[DAT]	DAT *NOM		DAT

ACC VS. DAT

- (15) ushafjands **ana** **þamm** -ei lag
pick up.PRES.PTCP_[ACC] on_[DAT] REL.SG.N.DAT -COMP lie.PRET.3SG
'picking up that what he lay on'
(Gothic, LUKE 5:25, adapted from **harbert1978**: 343)

ACC VS. DAT

- (15) ushafjands ana þamm -ei lag
pick up.PRES.PTCP_[ACC] on_[DAT] REL.SG.N.DAT -COMP lie.PRET.3SG
'picking up that what he lay on'
(Gothic, LUKE 5:25, adapted from **harbert1978**: 343)
- (16) ei galaubjaip þamm -ei **insandida**
that believe.OPT.PRES.2PL_[DAT] REL.SG.M.DAT -COMP send.PRET.3SG_[ACC]
jains
DEM.SG.M.NOM
'that you believe in him whom he sent' (Gothic, JOHN 6:29)

Gothic headless relatives (ACC — DAT)

	[NOM]	[ACC]	[DAT]
[NOM]	NOM	*NOM ACC	*NOM DAT
[ACC]	ACC *NOM	ACC	*ACC DAT
[DAT]	DAT *NOM	(DAT) *ACC	DAT

Internal and external case allowed

INT^{EXT}	[NOM]	[ACC]	[DAT]
[NOM]	NOM	ACC	DAT
[ACC]	ACC	ACC	DAT
[DAT]	DAT	DAT	DAT

Only internal case allowed

INT^{EXT}	[NOM]	[ACC]	[DAT]
[NOM]	NOM	*	*
[ACC]	ACC	ACC	*
[DAT]	DAT	DAT	DAT

Only external case allowed

INT^{EXT}	[NOM]	[ACC]	[DAT]
[NOM]	NOM	ACC	DAT
[ACC]	*	ACC	DAT
[DAT]	*	*	DAT

Only matching allowed: Modern German

INT^{EXT}	[NOM]	[ACC]	[DAT]
[NOM]	NOM	*	*
[ACC]	*	ACC	*
[DAT]	*	*	DAT

Modern German: matching

- (17) Uns besucht, **wer** **Maria** **mag.**
 2PL.ACC visit.PRES.3SG_[NOM] REL.AN.NOM Maria.ACC like.PRES.3SG_[NOM]
 ‘Who visits us likes Maria.’

(Modern German, adapted from **vogel2001**: 343)

Modern German: matching

- (17) Uns besucht, **wer** **Maria** **mag**.
2PL.ACC visit.PRES.3SG_[NOM] REL.AN.NOM Maria.ACC like.PRES.3SG_[NOM]
'Who visits us likes Maria.'
(Modern German, adapted from **vogel2001**: 343)
- (18) Ich lade ein, **wen** **auch** **Maria** **mag**.
1SG.NOM invite.PRES.1SG_[ACC] REL.AN.ACC Maria.NOM like.PRES.3SG_[ACC]
'I invite who Maria also likes.'
(Modern German, adapted from **vogel2001**: 344)

Modern German: matching

- (17) Uns besucht, **wer** **Maria** **mag**.
2PL.ACC visit.PRES.3SG_[NOM] REL.AN.NOM Maria.ACC like.PRES.3SG_[NOM]
'Who visits us likes Maria.'
(Modern German, adapted from **vogel2001**: 343)
- (18) Ich lade ein, **wen** **auch** **Maria** **mag**.
1SG.NOM invite.PRES.1SG_[ACC] REL.AN.ACC Maria.NOM like.PRES.3SG_[ACC]
'I invite who Maria also likes.'
(Modern German, adapted from **vogel2001**: 344)
- (19) Ich folge, **wem** **immer ich**
1SG.NOM follow.PRES.1SG_[DAT] REL.AN.DAT ever 1SG.NOM
vertraue.
vertraue.PRES.3SG_[DAT].
'I follow whoever I trust.' (Modern German, adapted from **vogel2001**: 342)

Modern German headless relatives (matching)

_{INT} ^{EXT}	[NOM]	[ACC]	[DAT]
[NOM]	NOM		
[ACC]		ACC	
[DAT]			DAT

Modern German: NOM vs. ACC

- (20) Uns besucht, **wen** **Maria** mag.
2PL.ACC visit.PRES.3SG_[NOM] REL.AN.ACC Maria.NOM like.PRES.3SG_[ACC]
'Who visits us, Maria likes.'

(Modern German, adapted from **vogel2001**: 343)

Modern German: NOM vs. ACC

- (20) Uns besucht, **wen** **Maria** **mag.**
2PL.ACC visit.PRES.3SG_[NOM] REL.AN.ACC Maria.NOM like.PRES.3SG_[ACC]
‘Who visits us, Maria likes.’
(Modern German, adapted from **vogel2001**: 343)
- (21) *Uns besucht, **wer** **Maria** **mag.**
2PL.ACC visit.PRES.3SG_[NOM] REL.AN.NOM Maria.NOM like.PRES.3SG_[ACC]
‘Who visits us, Maria likes.’
(Modern German, adapted from **vogel2001**: 343)

Modern German: NOM vs. ACC

- (20) Uns besucht, **wen** **Maria** **mag**.
2PL.ACC visit.PRES.3SG_[NOM] REL.AN.ACC Maria.NOM like.PRES.3SG_[ACC]
'Who visits us, Maria likes.'
(Modern German, adapted from **vogel2001**: 343)
- (21) *Uns besucht, **wer** **Maria** **mag**.
2PL.ACC visit.PRES.3SG_[NOM] REL.AN.NOM Maria.NOM like.PRES.3SG_[ACC]
'Who visits us, Maria likes.'
(Modern German, adapted from **vogel2001**: 343)
- (22) *Ich lade ein, wen **mir** **sympathisch**
1SG.NOM invite.PRES.1SG_[ACC] REL.AN.ACC 1SG.DAT nice
ist.
be.PRES.3SG_[NOM]
'I invite who I like.'
(Modern German, adapted from **vogel2001**: 344)

Modern German: NOM vs. ACC

- (20) Uns besucht, **wen** **Maria** **mag**.
2PL.ACC visit.PRES.3SG_[NOM] REL.AN.ACC Maria.NOM like.PRES.3SG_[ACC]
'Who visits us, Maria likes.'
(Modern German, adapted from **vogel2001**: 343)
- (21) *Uns besucht, **wer** **Maria** **mag**.
2PL.ACC visit.PRES.3SG_[NOM] REL.AN.NOM Maria.NOM like.PRES.3SG_[ACC]
'Who visits us, Maria likes.'
(Modern German, adapted from **vogel2001**: 343)
- (22) *Ich lade ein, **wen** **mir** **sympathisch**
1SG.NOM invite.PRES.1SG_[ACC] REL.AN.ACC 1SG.DAT nice
ist.
be.PRES.3SG_[NOM]
'I invite who I like.' (Modern German, adapted from **vogel2001**: 344)
- (23) *Ich lade ein, **wer** **mir** **sympathisch**
1SG.NOM invite.PRES.1SG_[ACC] REL.AN.NOM 1SG.DAT nice
ist.
be.PRES.3SG_[NOM]
'I invite who I like.' (Modern German, adapted from **vogel2001**: 344)

Modern German headless relatives (NOM — ACC)

<small>INT</small> ^{EXT}	[NOM]	[ACC]	[DAT]
[NOM]	NOM	*	
[ACC]	ACC	ACC	
[DAT]			DAT

Modern German: NOM vs. DAT

- (24) Uns besucht, **wem** **Maria** vertraut.
2PL.ACC visit.PRES.3SG_[NOM] REL.AN.DAT Maria.NOM trust.PRES.3SG_[DAT]
'Who visits us, Maria trusts.'

(Modern German, adapted from **vogel2001**: 343)

Modern German: NOM vs. DAT

- (24) Uns besucht, **wem** **Maria** **vertraut.**
2PL.ACC visit.PRES.3SG_[NOM] REL.AN.DAT Maria.NOM trust.PRES.3SG_[DAT]
‘Who visits us, Maria trusts.’
(Modern German, adapted from **vogel2001**: 343)
- (25) *Uns besucht, **wer** **Maria** **vertraut.**
2PL.ACC visit.PRES.3SG_[NOM] REL.AN.NOM Maria.NOM trust.PRES.3SG_[DAT]
‘Who visits us, Maria trusts.’
(Modern German, adapted from **vogel2001**: 343)

Modern German: NOM vs. DAT

- (24) Uns besucht, **wem** **Maria** **vertraut.**
2PL.ACC visit.PRES.3SG_[NOM] REL.AN.DAT Maria.NOM trust.PRES.3SG_[DAT]
‘Who visits us, Maria trusts.’
(Modern German, adapted from **vogel2001**: 343)
- (25) *Uns besucht, **wer** **Maria** **vertraut.**
2PL.ACC visit.PRES.3SG_[NOM] REL.AN.NOM Maria.NOM trust.PRES.3SG_[DAT]
‘Who visits us, Maria trusts.’
(Modern German, adapted from **vogel2001**: 343)
- (26) *Ich vertraue, **wem** **Hitchcock** **mag.**
1SG.NOM trust.PRES.1SG_[DAT] REL.AN.DAT Hitchcock.ACC like.PRES.3SG_[NOM]
‘I trust who likes Hitchcock.’
(Modern German, adapted from **vogel2001**: 345)

Modern German: NOM vs. DAT

- (24) Uns besucht, **wem Maria vertraut.**
2PL.ACC visit.PRES.3SG_[NOM] REL.AN.DAT Maria.NOM trust.PRES.3SG_[DAT]
'Who visits us, Maria trusts.'
(Modern German, adapted from **vogel2001**: 343)
- (25) *Uns besucht, **wer Maria vertraut.**
2PL.ACC visit.PRES.3SG_[NOM] REL.AN.NOM Maria.NOM trust.PRES.3SG_[DAT]
'Who visits us, Maria trusts.'
(Modern German, adapted from **vogel2001**: 343)
- (26) *Ich vertraue, **wem Hitchcock mag.**
1SG.NOM trust.PRES.1SG_[DAT] REL.AN.DAT Hitchcock.ACC like.PRES.3SG_[NOM]
'I trust who likes Hitchcock.'
(Modern German, adapted from **vogel2001**: 345)
- (27) *Ich vertraue, **wer Hitchcock mag.**
1SG.NOM trust.PRES.1SG_[DAT] REL.AN.NOM Hitchcock.ACC like.PRES.3SG_[NOM]
'I trust who likes Hitchcock.'
(Modern German, adapted from **vogel2001**: 345)

Modern German headless relatives (NOM — DAT)

_{INT} ^{EXT}	[NOM]	[ACC]	[DAT]
[NOM]	NOM	*	*
[ACC]	ACC	ACC	
[DAT]	DAT		DAT

Modern German: ACC vs. DAT

- (28) Ich lade ein, **wem** **auch Maria** **vertraut**.
1SG.NOM invite.PRES.1SG_[ACC] REL.AN.DAT also Maria.NOM trust.PRES.3SG_[DAT].

‘I invite whoever Maria also trusts.’

(Modern German, adapted from **vogel2001**: 344)

Modern German: ACC vs. DAT

- (28) Ich lade ein, **wem** **auch Maria** **vertraut**.
1SG.NOM invite.PRES.1SG_[ACC] REL.AN.DAT also Maria.NOM trust.PRES.3SG_[DAT].

‘I invite whoever Maria also trusts.’

(Modern German, adapted from **vogel2001**: 344)

- (29) *Ich lade ein, **wen** **auch Maria** **vertraut**.
1SG.NOM invite.PRES.1SG_[ACC] REL.AN.ACC also Maria.NOM trust.PRES.3SG_[DAT].

‘I invite whoever Maria also trusts.’

(Modern German, adapted from **vogel2001**: 344)

Modern German: ACC vs. DAT

- (28) Ich lade ein, **wem** **auch Maria** **vertraut**.
1SG.NOM invite.PRES.1SG_[ACC] REL.AN.DAT also Maria.NOM trust.PRES.3SG_[DAT].

‘I invite whoever Maria also trusts.’

(Modern German, adapted from **vogel2001**: 344)

- (29) *Ich lade ein, **wen** **auch Maria** **vertraut**.
1SG.NOM invite.PRES.1SG_[ACC] REL.AN.ACC also Maria.NOM trust.PRES.3SG_[DAT].

‘I invite whoever Maria also trusts.’

(Modern German, adapted from **vogel2001**: 344)

- (30) *Ich vertraue, **wem** **auch Maria** **mag**.
1SG.NOM trust.PRES.1SG_[DAT] REL.AN.DAT also Maria.NOM like.PRES.3SG_[ACC].

‘I trust whoever Maria also likes.’

(Modern German, adapted from **vogel2001**: 345)

Modern German: ACC vs. DAT

- (28) Ich lade ein, **wem** **auch Maria** **vertraut**.
1SG.NOM invite.PRES.1SG_[ACC] REL.AN.DAT also Maria.NOM trust.PRES.3SG_[DAT].

‘I invite whoever Maria also trusts.’

(Modern German, adapted from **vogel2001**: 344)

- (29) *Ich lade ein, **wen** **auch Maria** **vertraut**.
1SG.NOM invite.PRES.1SG_[ACC] REL.AN.ACC also Maria.NOM trust.PRES.3SG_[DAT].

‘I invite whoever Maria also trusts.’

(Modern German, adapted from **vogel2001**: 344)

- (30) *Ich vertraue, **wem** **auch Maria** **mag**.
1SG.NOM trust.PRES.1SG_[DAT] REL.AN.DAT also Maria.NOM like.PRES.3SG_[ACC].
‘I trust whoever Maria also likes.’

(Modern German, adapted from **vogel2001**: 345)

- (31) *Ich vertraue, **wen** **auch Maria** **mag**.
1SG.NOM trust.PRES.1SG_[DAT] REL.AN.ACC also Maria.NOM like.PRES.3SG_[ACC].
‘I trust whoever Maria also likes.’

Modern German headless relatives (ACC — DAT)

_{INT} ^{EXT}	[NOM]	[ACC]	[DAT]
[NOM]	NOM	*	*
[ACC]	ACC	ACC	*
[DAT]	DAT	DAT	DAT

