

Analysis of **repeated records**

Filippo Biscarini

(Biostatistician, bioinformatician and quantitative geneticist) **CNR**, Milan (Italy)



Repeated records?

- multiple milk production measurements for cows
- multiple blood pressure measurements of patients
- multiple Covid-10 test results for individuals
- repeated measurements of field coverage (crop growth)
- repeated measurements of root development (rhizotrons)
- etc.



Repeated records?

| Cow | Sire | Dam | Parity | HYS | Fat yield (kg) |
|-----|------|-----|--------|-----|----------------|
| 4 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 201 |
| 4 | 1 | 2 | 2 | 3 | 280 |
| 5 | 3 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 150 |
| 5 | 3 | 2 | 2 | 4 | 200 |
| 6 | 1 | 5 | 1 | 2 | 160 |
| 6 | 1 | 5 | 2 | 3 | 190 |
| 7 | 3 | 4 | 1 | 1 | 180 |
| 7 | 3 | 4 | 2 | 3 | 250 |
| 8 | 1 | 7 | 1 | 2 | 285 |
| 8 | 1 | 7 | 2 | 4 | 300 |

HYS, herd-year-season.

[From Mrode, 2013]



Repeated records - **analysis**

There are tons of ways to analyse repeated records

We'll see just one possible approach: the so called

- **repeatability model** (a.k.a. **repeated-records/measurements model**)

Originated - and still popular- in genetics, specifically plant and animal breeding

It can be applied to many other data problems with repeated measurements, though



Repeatability model

Borrowing from genetics:

$$P = (G) + PE + E$$

$$\sigma_P^2 = (\sigma_G^2) + \sigma_{PE}^2 + \sigma_E^2$$



$$P = PE + E$$

$$\sigma_P^2 = \sigma_{PE}^2 + \sigma_E^2$$



Repeatability model

From the biological (physical) to the statistical model:

$$\mathbf{y} = \mathbf{X}\mathbf{b} + \mathbf{W}\mathbf{pe} + \mathbf{e}$$

Linear mixed model:

- \mathbf{y} , \mathbf{b} , \mathbf{pe} , \mathbf{e}
- \mathbf{X} , \mathbf{W}
- $\text{Var}(\mathbf{pe}) = \mathbf{I}\sigma_{\text{pe}}^2$
- $\text{Var}(\mathbf{e}) = \mathbf{I}\sigma_{\text{e}}^2$



Repeatability model

MME: mixed model equations

$$\mathbf{y} = \mathbf{X}\mathbf{b} + \mathbf{W}\mathbf{pe} + \mathbf{e}$$

$$\begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{X}'\mathbf{X} & \mathbf{X}'\mathbf{W} \\ \mathbf{W}'\mathbf{X} & \mathbf{W}'\mathbf{W} + \mathbf{I}\frac{\sigma_e^2}{\sigma_{pe}^2} \end{bmatrix} \cdot \begin{bmatrix} \hat{\mathbf{b}} \\ \hat{\mathbf{pe}} \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{X}'\mathbf{y} \\ \mathbf{W}'\mathbf{y} \end{bmatrix}$$

$$\begin{bmatrix} \hat{\mathbf{b}} \\ \hat{\mathbf{pe}} \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{X}'\mathbf{X} & \mathbf{X}'\mathbf{W} \\ \mathbf{W}'\mathbf{X} & \mathbf{W}'\mathbf{W} + \mathbf{I}\frac{\sigma_e^2}{\sigma_{pe}^2} \end{bmatrix}^{-1} \cdot \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{X}'\mathbf{y} \\ \mathbf{W}'\mathbf{y} \end{bmatrix}$$



Repeatability model: illustration

| Cow | Sire | Dam | Parity | HYS | Fat yield (kg) |
|-----|------|-----|--------|-----|----------------|
| 4 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 201 |
| 4 | 1 | 2 | 2 | 3 | 280 |
| 5 | 3 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 150 |
| 5 | 3 | 2 | 2 | 4 | 200 |
| 6 | 1 | 5 | 1 | 2 | 160 |
| 6 | 1 | 5 | 2 | 3 | 190 |
| 7 | 3 | 4 | 1 | 1 | 180 |
| 7 | 3 | 4 | 2 | 3 | 250 |
| 8 | 1 | 7 | 1 | 2 | 285 |
| 8 | 1 | 7 | 2 | 4 | 300 |

HYS, herd-year-season. [From Mrode, 2013]

- same data as previous slide
- $y = Xb + Wpe + e$
- $y = ?$
- $X = ?$ [parity, HYS]
- $W = ?$



Repeatability model: illustration

| Cow | Sire | Dam | Parity | HYS | Fat yield (kg) |
|-----|------|-----|--------|-----|----------------|
| 4 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 201 |
| 4 | 1 | 2 | 2 | 3 | 280 |
| 5 | 3 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 150 |
| 5 | 3 | 2 | 2 | 4 | 200 |
| 6 | 1 | 5 | 1 | 2 | 160 |
| 6 | 1 | 5 | 2 | 3 | 190 |
| 7 | 3 | 4 | 1 | 1 | 180 |
| 7 | 3 | 4 | 2 | 3 | 250 |
| 8 | 1 | 7 | 1 | 2 | 285 |
| 8 | 1 | 7 | 2 | 4 | 300 |

HYS, herd-year-season. [From Mrode, 2013]

$$y = Xb + Wpe + e$$

$$y = [\text{you tell me!}]$$



Repeatability model: illustration

| Cow | Sire | Dam | Parity | HYS | Fat yield (kg) |
|-----|------|-----|--------|-----|----------------|
| 4 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 201 |
| 4 | 1 | 2 | 2 | 3 | 280 |
| 5 | 3 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 150 |
| 5 | 3 | 2 | 2 | 4 | 200 |
| 6 | 1 | 5 | 1 | 2 | 160 |
| 6 | 1 | 5 | 2 | 3 | 190 |
| 7 | 3 | 4 | 1 | 1 | 180 |
| 7 | 3 | 4 | 2 | 3 | 250 |
| 8 | 1 | 7 | 1 | 2 | 285 |
| 8 | 1 | 7 | 2 | 4 | 300 |

HYS, herd-year-season. [From Mrode, 2013]

$$y = Xb + Wpe + e$$

$X =$ [you tell me!]



Repeatability model: illustration

| Cow | Sire | Dam | Parity | HYS | Fat yield (kg) |
|-----|------|-----|--------|-----|----------------|
| 4 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 201 |
| 4 | 1 | 2 | 2 | 3 | 280 |
| 5 | 3 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 150 |
| 5 | 3 | 2 | 2 | 4 | 200 |
| 6 | 1 | 5 | 1 | 2 | 160 |
| 6 | 1 | 5 | 2 | 3 | 190 |
| 7 | 3 | 4 | 1 | 1 | 180 |
| 7 | 3 | 4 | 2 | 3 | 250 |
| 8 | 1 | 7 | 1 | 2 | 285 |
| 8 | 1 | 7 | 2 | 4 | 300 |

HYS, herd-year-season. [From Mrode, 2013]

$$y = Xb + Wpe + e$$

$$W = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix}$$



Repeatability model: illustration - MME

| Cow | Sire | Dam | Parity | HYS | Fat yield (kg) |
|-----|------|-----|--------|-----|----------------|
| 4 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 201 |
| 4 | 1 | 2 | 2 | 3 | 280 |
| 5 | 3 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 150 |
| 5 | 3 | 2 | 2 | 4 | 200 |
| 6 | 1 | 5 | 1 | 2 | 160 |
| 6 | 1 | 5 | 2 | 3 | 190 |
| 7 | 3 | 4 | 1 | 1 | 180 |
| 7 | 3 | 4 | 2 | 3 | 250 |
| 8 | 1 | 7 | 1 | 2 | 285 |
| 8 | 1 | 7 | 2 | 4 | 300 |

HYS, herd-year-season. [From Mrode, 2013]

$$y = Xb + Wpe + e$$

- $X'X$?

$$X = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 \\ 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix}$$



Repeatability model: illustration - MME

| Cow | Sire | Dam | Parity | HYS | Fat yield (kg) |
|-----|------|-----|--------|-----|----------------|
| 4 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 201 |
| 4 | 1 | 2 | 2 | 3 | 280 |
| 5 | 3 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 150 |
| 5 | 3 | 2 | 2 | 4 | 200 |
| 6 | 1 | 5 | 1 | 2 | 160 |
| 6 | 1 | 5 | 2 | 3 | 190 |
| 7 | 3 | 4 | 1 | 1 | 180 |
| 7 | 3 | 4 | 2 | 3 | 250 |
| 8 | 1 | 7 | 1 | 2 | 285 |
| 8 | 1 | 7 | 2 | 4 | 300 |

HYS, herd-year-season. [From Mrode, 2013]

$$y = Xb + Wpe + e$$

- $W'W$?

$$W = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix}$$



Repeatability model: illustration - MME

| Cow | Sire | Dam | Parity | HYS | Fat yield (kg) |
|-----|------|-----|--------|-----|----------------|
| 4 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 201 |
| 4 | 1 | 2 | 2 | 3 | 280 |
| 5 | 3 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 150 |
| 5 | 3 | 2 | 2 | 4 | 200 |
| 6 | 1 | 5 | 1 | 2 | 160 |
| 6 | 1 | 5 | 2 | 3 | 190 |
| 7 | 3 | 4 | 1 | 1 | 180 |
| 7 | 3 | 4 | 2 | 3 | 250 |
| 8 | 1 | 7 | 1 | 2 | 285 |
| 8 | 1 | 7 | 2 | 4 | 300 |

HYS, herd-year-season. [From Mrode, 2013]

$$y = Xb + Wpe + e$$

- $W'X?$

$$X = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 \\ 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix}$$



Coefficient of **repeatability**

$$\text{rep} = \frac{\sigma_{pe}^2}{\sigma_{pe}^2 + \sigma_e^2}$$

- **repeatability**: correlation between records of an individual
- permanent environmental effects



Repeatability model: extension to genetics

$$y = Xb + Zg + Wpe + e$$

$$\begin{bmatrix} X'X & X'Z & X'W \\ Z'X & Z'Z + \textcircled{K^{-1} \frac{\sigma_e^2}{\sigma_g^2}} & Z'W \\ W'X & W'Z & W'W + I \frac{\sigma_e^2}{\sigma_{pe}^2} \end{bmatrix} \cdot \begin{bmatrix} \hat{b} \\ \hat{g} \\ \hat{pe} \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} X'y \\ Z'y \\ W'y \end{bmatrix}$$

- covariance matrix **K**
- can be any covariance structure (e.g. spatial)

