



1 **MINUTES OF THE 3rd QUARTER MEETING OF THE MANAGEMENT BOARD (MB) OF**
2 **FISHERIES MANAGEMENT AREA (FMA) 12**

3 Date : September 08, 2023

4 Time : 9:00 A.M.

5 Location: via Google Meet

6 MB Members Present:

Chairperson : BFAR Region 4A - **Sammy A. Malvas**

Sectoral-

Representatives : Municipal Fishing Sector - **Rodrigo A. De Jesus**

Commercial Fishing Sector - **Melanie P. Catapang**

Academe - **Dr. Yasmin H. Primavera-Tirol**

NGO - **Rosalie G. Recaro**
Pacifico D. Beldia II (alternate)

IFARMC - **Wilfredo A. Hernandez (Balayan Bay)**

PAMB - **Dir. Nilo B. Tamoria, CESO III; represented**
by Rico Edaniel Manalo

PNP-Maritime Group - **PCPT ROMEO L. OGASNA JR.**

Philippine Coast Guard - **CG COMMO GERONIMO B. TUVILLA**
Represented by an attendee from CGS
BATANGAS

DILG - **Engr. Michael Casto A. Ras, II**

Region VI - **Erwin Ilaya**

7

8 Absent: Local Chief Executive - **Hon. Matt Erwin V. Florido**

9 Marketing/Processor - **Dyna V. Bonites**

10 Indigenous People - **Oliver S. Tamboon**

11 IFARMC - **Eddy P. De Mesa (Tayabas Bay)**

12 PFDA - **Custodio L. Balaoing, Jr.**

13 Region MIMAROPA - **RD Emmanuel H. Asis, DFT, CESE**

14 Region V - **RD Ariel U. Piquinto**



FMA 12 Secretariat (BFAR Region 4A)

1. Allan U. Castillo, Head Secretariat
2. Edmundo M. Amican, III, OIC - FRMS/ FMA Coordinator
3. Jomar L. Villamor, FMA Secretariat
4. Jesreel M. Narido, FMA Secretariat

BFAR Region 4A

1. Dr. Maribeth H. Ramos, SAG Chair/Project Leader, NSAP4A
2. Wilfredo O. Fajardo Jr., OIC-Chief, ERMSOC
3. Catherine N. Amican - PFO Batangas
4. Princess Marie Alynagen L. Roque, NSAP 4A

BFAR Region VI

- Ryan O. Doronila –FMA 12 Focal

Other Participants:

- Joseph Alfonso T. Ascalon – Program Head, Bantay Kalikasan (ABS-CBN Foundation, Inc.)
- Khay Ann J. Ramos-Danila – Project Manager (ABS-CBN Foundation, Inc.)
- Roel Quenamot - Project Support Specialist (ABS-CBN Foundation, Inc.)

Agenda:

1. Presentation of INSPIRE Project “Community Resilience through Citizen Science Coral Reef Scorecards and Reporting”
2. Updates of FMA 12 SAG
3. Review of draft Resolution No. 13 “Urging DILG and BFAR to request LGUs to conduct Boat and Gear Inventory”
4. Review of draft Internal Rules of Procedure of FMA 12 TWG
5. Updates of the last Joint Meeting of FMA 12 SAG and FMA 12 TWG
6. Overview of IUU Fishing Index Tool
7. Other matters: MB Members with Consecutive Absences



Republic of the Philippines
Department of Agriculture
Bureau of Fisheries and Aquatic Resources IV-A
Fisheries Management Area 12 Management Board
Purok 3, Barangay Bambang, Los Baños, Laguna



The 3rd quarter meeting of FMA 12 MB was conducted virtually via Google Meet on September 8, 2023, starting at 9:15 A.M. The Chair, RD Sammy A. Malvas, formally opened the meeting by calling it to order. The meeting began with an Audio-Visual Presentation (AVP) of the prayer, followed by the singing of the Philippine National Anthem and the BFAR hymn. Member-Secretariat, Jomar L. Villamor, called the roll, and with a majority of the members present, a quorum was declared.

The Chair directed the Secretariat to reorganize the program of activities, specifying that, following the Declaration of Quorum, the subsequent item should be the Approval of the Business and Agenda. Consistent with this guidance, the Chair initiated a discussion among the board members regarding the approval of the presented agenda items and subsequently sought the board's approval. Mr. Edmundo M. Amican, III, a member of the Secretariat, expressed the necessity of including an agenda item addressing the Overview of the IUU Fishing Index Tool (IFIT) in the meeting's agenda. The motion to include this agenda item was presented for approval by Ms. Rosalie Recaro and seconded by Ms. Melanie Catapang. With no additional agenda items suggested, Engr. Michael Casto A. Ras, II, moved for the approval of the agenda items, and this motion was duly seconded by Ms. Recaro.

The meeting continued with the reading and approval of the minutes from the previous meeting. Jesreel M. Narido, member Secretariat, proceeded to read the minutes of the 2nd Quarter FMA 12 MB Meeting. Pacifico D. Beldia II, the Alternate Representative of the NGO Sector, provided corrections in the document. Following the completion of the review and corrections, and with no further comments, the minutes of the 2nd Quarter MB Meeting was moved for approval by Ms. Recaro and seconded by Dr. Yasmin H. Primavera-Tirol, representative of the Academe Sector.

The Chair initiated discussions on matters arising from the previous minutes, inquiring with the Secretariat about any business to address. Mr. Amican responded, noting an agreement recorded in the minutes concerning Mr. Beldia's scheduled presentation. Seeking clarity, the Chair confirmed with Mr. Beldia whether he would be able to present, to which Mr. Beldia indicated he would send presentation slides instead.



In addition, the Chair provided comments on the discussion concerning amendments to the Fisheries Code, emphasizing the importance of endorsing these to the National Technical Working Group responsible for such amendments. Mr. Amican affirmed the Secretariat's commitment to preparing the necessary documentation and endorsement.

With no further comments or suggestions, the meeting moved to Agenda Item 1.

Agenda 1: Presentation of INSPIRE Project “Community Resilience through Citizen Science – Coral Reef Scorecards and Reporting”

Joseph Alfonso T. Ascalon, Program Head of Bantay Kalikasan at ABS-CBN Foundation Inc., presented the Citizen Science Program, a community empowerment initiative engaging multiple stakeholders in reef monitoring and protection. Stakeholders include local government units (LGUs), Bantay Dagat, People's Organizations (POs), resort staff, and non-governmental organizations (NGOs). The program aims to facilitate early detection of impacts from environmental changes and human activities, inform policy and decision-making, and establish a sustainable management structure.

The methodology, known as the ALWAN Method, incorporates science-based indicators developed by experts such as Dr. Kent Carpenter, Dr. Terrence Gosliner, and Dr. Wilfredo Licuanan. The ALWAN Method simplifies training, enabling completion in one day. The survey process involves marking out the area, conducting fish, invertebrate, and coral surveys, and, if applicable, a trash survey for neighboring beachfronts.

Citizen Scientists, selected volunteers from the community, record butterfly fish as indicators of reef health, invertebrates as indicators of water quality and Marine Protected Area (MPA) management, and conduct a coral survey using freedive methods. Mr. Ascalon reported training 85 Citizen Scientists in six of the seven target areas.



Post-survey, Information, Education, and Communication (IEC) activities are conducted for public outreach and community involvement. The program follows a three-year plan: Year 1 involves training, Year 2 focuses on surveys and data generation, and Year 3 concentrates on institutionalizing the method.

The Chair thanked Mr. Ascalon, emphasizing the project's significance for policy formulation and conservation within FMA 12. RD highlighted the program's role as a valuable data source for fishery resource conservation measures. The Chair stressed the need for complementary activities and the importance of community involvement in ensuring project continuity and fostering resource appreciation.

Dr. Yasmin H. Primavera-Tirol commended the project and suggested expanding Citizen Science Monitoring to include seagrass beds and mangroves. Mr. Ascalon affirmed ongoing monitoring efforts for mangroves and seagrass. Dr. Tirol proposed including beach forests in the initiative, envisioning the project as a model for replication in other coastal communities.

The Chair proposed considering Citizen Science as a strategy for the entire Ecosystem Approach to Fisheries Management (EAFM) Plan. Mr. Amican affirmed Citizen Science's inclusion in the framework plan but noted the introduction of the ALWAN method. He suggested integrating ALWAN method results into the framework plan, recognizing them as achievements for FMA 12.

Dr. Maribeth H. Ramos, SAG Chairperson, thanked Mr. Ascalon and confirmed close coordination with the group. The Chair sought clarification on the project timeline, ending in 2025, and Dr. Ascalon detailed plans for the second year, including workshops and collaboration with the FMA 12 SAG and Management Board.



The Chair encouraged continued coordination and collaboration. Mr. Ascalon expressed the intention to gather inputs from the SAG for the steering committee meeting, emphasizing data generation and linkage in the second year.

The Chair extended well wishes for the program's success and anticipated future collaborations with FMA 12.

Agenda 2: Updates of FMA 12 SAG:

Dr. Maribeth H. Ramos presented updates on the Implementation of FMA 12 SAG, covering accomplishments from January to July 2023. The presentation highlighted the following:

Highlights of Accomplishments:

A. Validation and Consultation with Stakeholders on the Assessment of Tayabas Bay Fisheries – Quezon side in February 21, 2023. Outputs included results of analyses and performance indicators generated by the National Stock Assessment Program (NSAP) IV-A, Formulated Harvest Control Rules (HCRs), Harvest Control Measures (HCMs), and Management Actions for *Sardinella lemuru* (tamban) in Tayabas Bay, Quezon-side.

B. Consultation with Commercial Fisherfolk Associations on the Recommended Harvest Control Rules, Harvest Control Measures, and Specific Management Actions for *Sardinella lemuru* (tamban) in Tayabas Bay, Quezon-side in March 14, 2023. This included the presentation of outputs and agreements from the February 21, 2023, consultation, further consultation with the commercial fishing sector, and finalizing the resolution with the recommended HCRs, HCMs, and Specific Management Actions for *Sardinella lemuru*.

C. FMA 12 SAG 1st Quarter Meeting in March 20, 2023, where FMA 12 SAG Resolution No. 1 was discussed and approved for endorsement to the Management Board.



D. Presentation and Endorsement of FMA 12 SAG Resolution on the recommended HCRs, HCMs, and Specific Management Actions for *S. lemuru* during the FMA 12 1st Quarter MB Meeting in March 22-24, 2023.

E. FMA 12 SAG 2nd Quarter Meeting in July 13, 2023, covering the presentation of preliminary results for *Selar crumenophthalmus*, *Auxis rochei*, and *Decapterus tabi* in Tayabas Bay, and *Sardinella lemuru* in Balayan/Calatagan Bay. Resolutions No. 2 and 3 recommending HCRs, HCMs, and Specific Management Actions for other priority species were formulated. Dr. Joseph Alfonso T. Ascalon presented the Community Resilience through Citizen Science-Coral Reef Scorecards and Reporting.

Dr. Ramos announced the FMA 12 SAG's upcoming 3rd Quarter Meeting on September 20, 2023, with an agenda including the endorsement and finalization of Resolutions No. 2 and 3, presentation of common violations and recurring apprehensions within FMA 12, and the selection of the new Chairperson and Vice-Chairperson.

After the confirmation of drafts FMA 12 SAG Resolutions No. 2 and 3 are set for finalization in the upcoming meeting, the Chair mentioned that these resolutions would be discussed in the 4th Quarter MB Meeting.

Dr. Ramos added that they are requesting FMRED and PCG to present common violations and apprehensions within FMA 12 for specific management action formulation. RD Malvas suggested sending an invitation or letter request to the Philippine Coast Guard for the FMA 12 SAG 4th Quarter Meeting and instructing FMRED internally for the presentation.



Agenda 3: Review of draft Resolution No. 13 “Urging DILG and BFAR to request LGUs to conduct Boat and Gear Inventory”

Mr. Amican presented Resolution No. 13 titled "Urging DILG and BFAR to request LGUs to conduct Boat and Gear Inventory." The Chair suggested that, once approved, a copy of the resolution should be provided to all other FMAs to encourage a nationwide adoption of the Boat and Gear Inventory (BGI) activity, adding more pressure on National Agencies for its implementation.

Engr. Ras recommended specifying the coverage area of FMA 12 in the resolution and translating it into Filipino for easier comprehension by LGUs and fisherfolks. He also suggested including a cover or briefier explaining the purpose of the activity. The Chair agreed and instructed the Secretariat to take note on incorporating these recommendations into the resolution.

Dr. Maribeth H. Ramos proposed omitting the name NSAP in the forms, as the project is a joint effort of DA [Department of Agriculture] and DILG. The Chair agreed, suggesting that the acknowledgment of using forms from NSAP be noted in the resolution.

Ms. Rosalie G. Recaro sought clarification on the need for training before the BGI implementation, emphasizing that LGUs expect training, especially in form-filling, and raised a question regarding the length measurement used in the forms. The Chair confirmed the need for training and clarified that the resolution's purpose is to trigger national agencies for BGI implementation. He assured that a more detailed discussion on the survey forms would occur once the BGI becomes a program.

Engr. Ras suggested incorporating in the resolution that the training should precede the BGI implementation to ensure uniform data collection. The Chair agreed and provided inputs to the resolution accordingly.



Mr. Beldia raised a question about the FMA 12 TWG's capability to collate data, and Mr. Amican explained that designated focals in each region and province would be responsible for collating. Mr. Beldia recommended reflecting this clarification in the resolution.

After incorporating suggestions from RD Malvas, Mr. Beldia, and Engr. Ras, the resolution was revised, specifying that the inventory would commence after completing capacity building and training by MARINA and BFAR.

With no further comments, the Secretariat was instructed to finalize the resolution for signing by FMA 12 MB members.

Agenda 4: Review of draft Internal Rules of Procedure of FMA 12 TWG

Mr. Amican presented Resolution No. 13 titled "Urging DILG and BFAR to request LGUs to conduct Boat and Gear Inventory." Mr. Beldia raised concerns about potential duplication of roles and responsibilities between FMA 12 Science Advisory Group and Management Board. He questioned the addition of another layer of decision-making and emphasized that the TWG's function should be limited to executing tasks instructed by the MB without decision-making authority. The Chair agreed and instructed the Secretariat to ensure there's no additional layer of decision-making.

Given the recent distribution of the draft IRP, Engr. Ras moved to defer its approval, requesting more time for MB members to review and provide comments. Ms. Recaro seconded the motion. Engr. Ras proposed forming a small group from the FMA 12 MB to assist the Secretariat in crafting the IRP, drawing on members' understanding with the expected functions of the TWG.



The Chair instructed the Secretariat to organize a technical session for reviewing the TWG's IRP, inviting willing MB members to participate. The draft IRP would be circulated to MB members after the meeting, allowing a week for further review and input. The technical session was scheduled for October 16, 2023.

FMA 12 MB Chairperson allocated a week for members to provide input. The Secretariat would collect all comments and present the updated document during the scheduled technical session for a comprehensive review. With no additional comments, the meeting proceeded to the next agenda item.

Agenda 5: Updates of the last Joint Meeting of FMA 12 SAG and FMA 12 TWG

Mr. Amican emphasized that the joint meeting between the FMA 12 TWG and SAG aimed to prepare for the implementation of the adopted recommended HCRs and HCMs for the conservation of Bali Sardines. The meeting covered the Results of Stock Assessment of Bali Sardines in Tayabas Bay, Presentation of FMA 12 Adopted Reference Points, HCRs, HCMs, Specific Management Actions, and the Plan of Actions for these measures.

During the joint meeting, the Technical Working Group (TWG) discussed on the necessity for a standardized methodology for capacity building in the Boat and Gear Inventory (BGI). The TWG also tackled on the idea that the issuance of a Regional Special Order/Memorandum Circular by the Department of the Interior and Local Government (DILG) would be optimal in response to FMA 12 MB Resolution No. 13.

Additional discussions included crafting an FMA-wide enforcement plan, detailing the inventory of assets for each law enforcement agency within FMA 12, specific areas or fishing grounds, and baseline data for apprehensions. The possibility of conducting the Overview of IUU Fishing Index Tool (IFIT) for Tayabas Bay and other specific management actions, such as requiring CFV operators to submit catch reports, was also raised. This specific action involves collating catch data from PFOs, analyzing the data,



and sending a letter to NFRDI [National Fisheries Research and Development Institute] regarding the potential use of data trends.

The Chair observed that some TWG activities seemed to lack coordination from the Management Board, emphasizing that all TWG actions should be approved by the MB. The Chair reiterated the importance of obtaining MB approval to maintain a consistent decision-making process and avoid adding an extra layer of decision-making authority.

Mr. Amican confirmed the Chair's suggestion, proposing that the TWG draft necessary communications for specific management actions to be presented to the MB for final decisions. The Chair endorsed the idea, noting that the TWG should urge agencies or seek partnerships with institutions interested in value chain analysis. The Chair instructed the TWG to proceed with the necessary steps for implementing the discussed specific management actions.

For the specific management action involving catch documentation and value chain analysis, the Chair suggested urging government agencies like BFAR to conduct the analysis due to resource constraints within FMA 12. Regarding the capacity building for reviewing and validating measurements, the Chair clarified that it is up to BFAR to decide on the strategy and conduct the training.

The Chair addressed Mr. Beldia's comments on the Seasonal Closure implementation, suggesting that the TWG, with the Secretariat, create a draft FAO. Mr. Amican confirmed that the TWG holds a draft FAO resolution, and the process involves consultations. The Chair instructed the TWG to explore possibilities to initiate the process for a Fisheries Administrative Order for Seasonal Closure in Tayabas Bay for Bali Sardines after completing the deliberation on the reproductive biology of Bali Sardines.

With no other further comments, the meeting proceeded with the next agenda item.



Agenda 6: Overview of IUU Fishing Index Tool

Mr. Wilfredo O. Fajardo Jr. began the presentation by offering an extensive overview of the IUU Fishing Index and Threat Assessment Tool. Due to a poor connection, Mr. Amican took over the presentation on the IUU Fishing Index Tool.

The Chair noted that MB Members would likely find the report on the pilot testing of the IFIT Tool more valuable. Mr. Amican suggested inviting representatives from the Central Office or the national assessment for IFIT, or possibly reinviting the BFAR4A ERMSOC to present the results conducted within CALABARZON.

The Chair concurred, stating that a more detailed presentation of the IFIT Tool results would be included in the agenda for the next quarter meeting.

Other Matters: MB Members with Consecutive Absences

The Chair addressed the issue of observed absences among some members of the Management Board, specifically highlighting that Dyna V. Bonites, the representative from the Trading, Market, and Processing Sector, and Oliver S. Tamboon, the Indigenous People Sector Representative, have been absent for four consecutive meetings. Mr. Amican added that the FMA Focals from Region 6 have been unable to contact these representatives, prompting the Secretariat to bring the matter to the attention of the Management Board. According to the Internal Rules of Procedure (IRP) of the FMA 12 MB, Rule 12.1 states that a member may face removal or revocation of membership due to more than three (3) consecutive and unjustified absences in scheduled meetings. Mr. Amican mentioned that, as the secretariat, they plan to send formal letters notifying these representatives of their four consecutive absences and requesting justifiable reasons for their non-participation.

The Chair instructed the Secretariat to draft letters to be signed by the Chair reminding the representatives of their responsibilities and informing that these representatives incurred four (4) consecutive absences and that based on the IRP of the



Republic of the Philippines
Department of Agriculture
Bureau of Fisheries and Aquatic Resources IV-A
Fisheries Management Area 12 Management Board
Purok 3, Barangay Bambang, Los Baños, Laguna



340 FMA 12 MB, that these are grounds for revocation of their membership in the FMA 12 but
341 still in the letter they will be asked if their reason for the absences are justifiable.

342

343 After a photo documentation, Engr. Ras moved for the adjournment at 1 p.m. and
344 was seconded by Ms. Rosalie G. Recaro.

345

346 Prepared by:

Certified True and Correct:

347

348

349 **JESREEL M. NARIDO**

EDMUNDO M. AMICAN, III

350 Member-Secretariat, FMA 12

Member-Secretariat, FMA 12

351 Aquacultural Tech. I, BFAR 4A

FMA Coordinator

352

353 Reviewed/Attested by:

Approved by:

354

355

356 **ALLAN U. CASTILLO**

SAMMY A. MALVAS

357 FMA Focal, Head Secretariat

Chairperson, FMA 12 MB

358 Chief, FMRED

Regional Director, BFAR 4A