

Republic of the Philippines
Department of Agriculture
BUREAU OF FISHERIES AND AQUATIC RESOURCES
Regional Office No. 4-A
Purok 1 Brgy. Bambang, Los Baños, Laguna
FISHERIES MANAGEMENT AREA 12 MANAGEMENT BOARD

**MINUTES OF THE AUGUST 12, 2021 SPECIAL MEETING OF FISHERIES MANAGEMENT
AREA (FMA) 12 MANAGEMENT BOARD (MB)**

Date: August 12, 2020

Time: 09:00 AM

Location: via Online Zoom meeting

Present: FMA 12 MB Members

Chairperson	BFAR Region 4A	Sammy A. Malvas
Sectoral- Representatives		
	Municipal Fishing Sector	Rodrigo A. De Jesus
	Aquaculture Sector	Atty. Immanuel L. Sodusta
	Academe	Dr. Yasmin H. Primavera-Tirol
	Non-Government Organization	Rosalie G. Recaro
	IFARMC	Wilfredo A. Hernandez
	PAMB chairperson	Raymund Rivera

Absent: Hon. Matt Erwin V. Florido, Dyna V. Bonites, Oliver S. Tamboon,
Atty. Immanuel L. Sodusta

Other attendees:

1. Dr. Sonia G. Olaivar-Elloso, BFAR 4A
2. Dr. Maribeth H. Ramos, BFAR 4A

Republic of the Philippines
Department of Agriculture
BUREAU OF FISHERIES AND AQUATIC RESOURCES
Regional Office No. 4-A
Purok 1 Brgy. Bambang, Los Baños, Laguna
FISHERIES MANAGEMENT AREA 12 MANAGEMENT BOARD

3. Edmundo M. Amican, III; BFAR IV-A
4. Raymond A Rivera, DENR Tayabas
5. Laura David UP Diliman Marine Science Institute
6. Dr. Fernando P. Siringan, UP Diliman Marine Science Institute
7. Princess Marie Alynagen L. Roque, NSAP 4A
8. Rosalie G. Recaro, Tagasuri ng Isda sa Quezon (TNIQue)
9. Dondi M. Sarmiento, DENR MGB IV-A
10. Norberto L. Manlapas, Jr., DENR MGB IV-A
11. Jimely Flores, NGO_EDF
12. Ma. Emelyn C. Custodio, Calatagan (MAO)/ Municipal Agriculturist/ MENRO
13. Marvin M. Lumayor Calatagan (MAO)/ Municipal Agriculturist)
14. Rhea Yray-Frossard Quezon City Oceana – Observer
15. Atty. Rocky Guzman, Oceana
16. Bas Umali, Unisan Quezon
17. Rose-Liza Eisma-Osorio, Oceana
18. Gemaica C. MololobocO, BFAR IV-A
19. Kyle Cristel Dalma, BFAR 4A
20. Trina Mae B. Amparo, NSAP 4A
21. Megan Bernadeth Magno, BFAR 6 PFO-Aklan
22. Wilfredo Hernandez, LGU Calatagan
23. Ryan Doronila, BFAR Regional Office
24. Diovanie De Jesus, Oceana
25. Catherine N. Amican, BFAR 4A
26. Rex Montebon, CI Philippines

Republic of the Philippines
Department of Agriculture
BUREAU OF FISHERIES AND AQUATIC RESOURCES
Regional Office No. 4-A
Purok 1 Brgy. Bambang, Los Baños, Laguna
FISHERIES MANAGEMENT AREA 12 MANAGEMENT BOARD

Agenda:

1. Presentation on the status of Applications for Seabed Quarry in Tayabas Bay by the DENR-MGB presented by RD. Dondi Sarmiento
2. Presentation on the Effects of Seabed Quarrying in Tayabas by Dr. Fernando P. Siringan
3. FMA Resolution No. 4
4. Presentation of Internal Rules and Procedure of SAG Matters
5. Other matters – MB-SAG Discussion on Seabed Quarry Projects

The head secretariat, Ms. Sonia O. Elloso, greeted and acknowledged everyone including participants from DENR-MGB IV-A (Director Dondi M. Sarmiento and Norberto L. Manlapas, Jr.), from UP Diliman Marine Science Institute (Dr. Fernando P. Siringan), Tambuyog (Arsenio N. Tanchuling), EDF (Jimely Flores, Dr. Jose Ingles), Oceana (Rhea Yray-Frossard, Atty. Rocky Guzman and Rose-Liza Eisma-Osorio), PFO Aklan and PFO Masbate.

The Chairperson and Presiding Officer Sammy A, Malvas formally opened the session by calling the meeting to order. The Chair greeted the FMA 12 MB Members, partners NGOs present from EDF, Tambuyog and Oceana; invited guests and speakers from partner MGB Director Dondi M. Sarmiento and Dr. Siringan (UP Diliman Marine Science Institute), BFAR constituents and SAG Chairman Dr. Maribeth H. Ramos.

RD Malvas expounded on the cause of the special meeting (unfinished agenda items from the previous meeting i.e. requests for presentations for some of the issues in the areas of FMA 12).

Republic of the Philippines
Department of Agriculture
BUREAU OF FISHERIES AND AQUATIC RESOURCES
Regional Office No. 4-A
Purok 1 Brgy. Bambang, Los Baños, Laguna
FISHERIES MANAGEMENT AREA 12 MANAGEMENT BOARD

Director Malvas asked the Secretariat to flash on the screen the Agenda of the Special meeting and Dr. Ellosa to read the agenda items of the meeting.

The Chair suggested to first proceed on presented agenda items 3 and 4 (presentations) before proceeding to internal matters of the board. The Chair asked the board for an agreement to first proceed to the presentations (for resource speakers may have other meetings/commitments/schedules), to which Dr. Tirol moved and (CENRO) Mr. Raymond seconded.

Before proceeding to the first agenda, RD Malvas thanked Dir. Sarmiento for attending and agreeing to the request for the presentation of the status of the applications for seabed quarry in the areas covered by the FMA 12.

Agenda	Discussion
1. Presentation on the status of Applications for Seabed Quarry in Tayabas Bay by the DENR-MGB presented by RD. Dondi Sarmiento	<p>RD Sarmiento first greeted and thanked everyone for the invitation. He then informed everyone that MGB 4A do not issue permits and that MGB Central Office is the one responsible for the issuance and processing of applications of permits. He then directed his staff Mr. Norbert to present the two current applications for Seabed Quarry in Tayabas Bay.</p> <p>Data from MGB CO given day before the presentation showed there are currently two GSQP applications. Namely, they are OMR-009-2019 – Palasyo Mineral, Inc. filed on August 5, 2019 and OMR-008-2019 – Bird’s Nest</p>

Republic of the Philippines
 Department of Agriculture
 BUREAU OF FISHERIES AND AQUATIC RESOURCES
 Regional Office No. 4-A
 Purok 1 Brgy. Bambang, Los Baños, Laguna
FISHERIES MANAGEMENT AREA 12 MANAGEMENT BOARD

	<p>Resources Corporation filed on August 5, 2019. Both GSQPA's have deficiencies (Area Status and clearance, Certification from Panel of Arbitrators, Approved Environmental Protection and Enhancement Program/Final Mine Rehabilitation and Decommissioning Plan, Approved Social Development and Management Program, ECC, Safety and Health Program, Endorsement from LGU, National Commission on Indigenous People's Certification).</p> <p>RD Malvas solicited the board for comments on the Presentation. Dr. Tirol asked the statuses of the two current applications to which RD Sarmiento answered that both applications are still on process.</p> <p>CENRO requested the Secretariat the presentation of MGB</p>
2. Presentation on the Effects of Seabed Quarrying in Tayabas by Dr. Fernando P. Siringan	<p>Before Dr. Siringan started sharing to the group, Doctor asked where will the materials be gathered and what government projects will use the materials.</p> <p>Dir. Sarmiento answered that mostly reclamation projects will utilize the materials.</p> <p>Afterwards, Dr. Fernando started sharing points regarding the impacts and consequences of seabed quarry operations (i.e shoreline erosion, changes of seafloor morphology, etc.).</p>

Republic of the Philippines
 Department of Agriculture
 BUREAU OF FISHERIES AND AQUATIC RESOURCES
 Regional Office No. 4-A
 Purok 1 Brgy. Bambang, Los Baños, Laguna
FISHERIES MANAGEMENT AREA 12 MANAGEMENT BOARD

	<p>Dr. Siringan shared his call to review the requirements of MGB for applications of permits of seabed quarry operations.</p> <p>DR. LAURA raised two more points on the negative impacts of seabed mining/quarry operations (rise of algal blooms due to sedimentation and effects of sedimentation)</p> <p>The Chairman suggested to have technical sessions with the SAG Group for in-depth discussions on the technical aspects of various projects.</p> <p>Dr. Yas proposed that later in the meeting, there should be a discussion to make recommendations regarding the issue to be submitted in the Management Board with a certain timeline. Chairman suggested that this should be moved in the other matters.</p> <p>Without further questions, Mr. Chair thanked the presenters, the observers and everyone who attended.</p>
3. DFMA Resolution No. 4 – “A resolution adopting and institutionalizing the Fisheries Management Area (FMA) scorecard as a monitoring and evaluation	Oceana who developed the scorecards to be implemented in FMA 12 explains there will be no copyrights issue.

Republic of the Philippines
 Department of Agriculture
 BUREAU OF FISHERIES AND AQUATIC RESOURCES
 Regional Office No. 4-A
 Purok 1 Brgy. Bambang, Los Baños, Laguna
FISHERIES MANAGEMENT AREA 12 MANAGEMENT BOARD

<p>tool for compliance and reporting in accordance with the amended fisheries code of the Philippines (Republic Act 8550, as amended by Republic act 10654) and the Department of Agriculture-Bureau of Fisheries and Aquatic Resources' Fisheries Administrative Order no. 263, series of 2019"</p>	<p>Dr. Yas seconded the motion of CENRO for the approval of the Resolution. Without further motions, Resolution # 4 was thereby approved.</p>
<p>4. Presentation of Internal Rules and Procedure of SAG Matters</p>	<p>Dr. Yas suggested proper terminologies regarding the representatives from the different sectors stated in Page 1 Lines 34-46 (SAG IRP Draft)</p> <p>As the phrase in rule 1.7 was changed, Mr. Chair asked the Secretariat to further check for possible changes in order that all rules be consistent.</p> <p>Dr. Yas raised a concern regarding rule 4.2 stating that the Presiding officer should not take sides while making brief comments. The phrasing was changed: remarks of the presiding officer should be science-based.</p> <p>DR. Yas added that in (RULE VI Functions and Responsibilities of SAG) Rule 6.1 Letter C, the SAG has a</p>

Republic of the Philippines
Department of Agriculture
BUREAU OF FISHERIES AND AQUATIC RESOURCES
Regional Office No. 4-A
Purok 1 Brgy. Bambang, Los Baños, Laguna
FISHERIES MANAGEMENT AREA 12 MANAGEMENT BOARD

	<p>function of conducting science-based monitoring. The function of conducting monitoring was later agreed to be omitted. Emphasized (Difficulty to perform the function because of 8-5 JOBS)</p> <p>Minimal adjustments or changes in phrasings were led by the Chair (RD Malvas), SAG Chair (Dr. Beth) and Dr. Yas.</p> <p>Dr. Yas asked what are the scenarios in which Rule 10.3 would apply to which Ma'am Beth explained that any information or data generated should have the permission of the SAG members and FMA 12 MB.</p> <p>While there was a technical difficulty, a discussion about Non-disclosure agreement among the Chairman, Chairman of SAG and Dr. Yas.</p> <p>Dr. Yas asked about Sanctions for Disorderly Conduct to which Ma'am Beth answered that Absences for three consecutive meetings without a valid reason will constitute a Disorderly Conduct.</p> <p>RD Malvas asked where the definition for Disorderly Conduct and emphasized that there should be a common understanding for the definition.</p>
--	---

Republic of the Philippines
Department of Agriculture
BUREAU OF FISHERIES AND AQUATIC RESOURCES
Regional Office No. 4-A
Purok 1 Brgy. Bambang, Los Baños, Laguna
FISHERIES MANAGEMENT AREA 12 MANAGEMENT BOARD

	<p>Further changes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">- Rule 10.3 Confidentiality and NDA wording changed to MOA. Proper phrasings done in Rule 10.3. Discussions on proper citations of publications and raw data further clarified.- On Rule 1.1, changes were made to clarify that FMA 12 SAG members will compose of one representative and one alternate from each sector and institution. Members of the SAG should be a scientist/researcher/technical person.- On Rule 3.4, the phrasing was changed to “In case of vacancy due to death, removal and expiration of term, a new member shall be appointed in the same manner as the original member but only for the unexpired portion of the term of office”. <p>Having no more suggestions and recommendations, the Chair asked for a motion for the approval and adoption of the IRP of the FMA 12 SAG, Ma’am Rosalie moved and Dr Yas seconded. As a result of the agreed adoption and approval of the IRP of SAG, the Chairman asked if there would be a resolution about the matter. Dr. Elloso agreed that there should be an FMA 12 MB Resolution affirming the approval and adoption of the IRP of the FMA 12 SAG.</p>
--	---

Republic of the Philippines
Department of Agriculture
BUREAU OF FISHERIES AND AQUATIC RESOURCES
Regional Office No. 4-A
Purok 1 Brgy. Bambang, Los Baños, Laguna
FISHERIES MANAGEMENT AREA 12 MANAGEMENT BOARD

	<p>The Chairman asked the SAG Secretariat and MB Secretariat to assure incorporations of all the revisions, comments and recommendations in the final IRP of FMA 12 SAG.</p>
<p>5. Other matters – MB-SAG Discussion on Seabed Quarry Projects</p>	<p>The Chairman opened about the next final Agenda (Other matters) about the Seabed Quarry to which Dr. Yas raised that there should be a recommendation regarding the issue (seabed Quarry Mining). Dr. Yas further suggested that there should be a timeline to make a resolution and asked the SAG Chairman for a scientific advice (appropriate), recommendation, spatial planning for FMA Waters. Chairman emphasized that time is of essence. Ma'am Maribeth clarified TAYABAS BAY FARMC already has a position paper regarding the issue. For the MB's action, Chairman asked to concretize the recommendation based on the technical discussion made by the SAG.</p> <p>In two weeks' time, the SAG Group will provide a scientific recommendation for the MB to consider and discuss to come up with a position on the issue of seabed quarrying.</p>

Without Further concerns, Dr. Yas moved the meeting to be adjourned and was seconded by Dr. Sonia.

Republic of the Philippines
Department of Agriculture
BUREAU OF FISHERIES AND AQUATIC RESOURCES
Regional Office No. 4-A
Purok 1 Brgy. Bambang, Los Baños, Laguna
FISHERIES MANAGEMENT AREA 12 MANAGEMENT BOARD

Prepared by:

JESREEL M. NARIDO

Secretariat Member, FMA 12 MB

Certified True and Correct:

Reviewed / Attested by:

EDMUNDO M. AMICAN, III

Secretariat Member, FMA 12 MB

DR. SONIA G. OLAIVAR-ELLOSO

Head Secretariat, FMA 12 MB

Approved by:

SAMMY A. MALVAS

Chairperson, FMA 12 MB

Regional Director, BFAR 4A