

Republic of the Philippines Department of Agriculture

Bureau of Fisheries and Aquatic Resources IV-A Fisheries Management Area 12 Management Board



Purok 3, Barangay Bambang, Los Baños, Laguna

1 MINUTES OF THE 2nd QUARTER MEETING OF THE MANAGEMENT BOARD (MB) OF

2 FISHERIES MANAGEMENT AREA (FMA) 12

3 Date : June 29, 2023

4 Time : 9:00 A.M.

5 Location: via Google Meet

6 MB Members Present:

Chairperson : BFAR Region 4A - Sammy A. Malvas

Co-chairperson Local Chief Executive Hon. Matt Erwin V. Florido

Sectoral-

Representatives : Municipal Fishing Sector - Rodrigo A. De Jesus

Academe - Dr. Yasmin H. Primavera-Tirol

NGO - Rosalie G. Recaro

Pacifico D. Beldia II (alternate)

IFARMC - **Wilfredo A. Hernandez** (Balayan Bay)

PAMB - Dir. Nilo B. Tamoria, CESO III; represented

by Rico Edaniel Manalo

PNP-Maritime Group - **PCPT EDWIN A. CABALAG**

Philippine Coast Guard - John Paul Taan

DILG - Engr. Michael Casto A. Ras, II

Region VI - Erwin Ilaya

7

8	Absent:	Aquaculture Sector	-	Atty. Immanuel L. Sodusta

9 Commercial Fishing Sector - **Melanie P. Catapang**

10 Marketing/Processor - **Dyna V. Bonites**

11 Indigenous People - Oliver S. Tamboon

12 IFARMC - **Eddy P. De Mesa** (Tayabas Bay)

13 PFDA - Custodio L. Balaoing, Jr.

14 Region MIMAROPA - **RD Emmanuel H. Asis, DFT, CESE**

15 Region V - **RD Ariel U. Piquinto**

16



43

44

45

Republic of the Philippines Department of Agriculture

Bureau of Fisheries and Aquatic Resources IV-A Fisheries Management Area 12 Management Board



Purok 3, Barangay Bambang, Los Baños, Laguna

	O F A R	ANAGEMENT ARE	
17	FMA 12 Secretariat (BFAR Region 4A)		
18	1. Allan U. Castillo, Head Secretariat		
19	2. Edmundo M. Amican, III, OIC - FRMS/ FMA Coordinator		
20	3. Gemaica C. Moloboco, FMA Secretariat		
21	4. Jomar L. Villamor, FMA Secretariat		
22	5. Jesreel M. Narido, FMA Secretariat		
23			
24	BFAR Region 4A		
25	1. Dr. Maribeth H. Ramos, SAG Chair/Project Leader, NSAP4A		
26	2. Krystine O. Escosura – PFO Batangas		
27	3. Catherine N. Amican - PFO Batangas		
28	4. Ernest John R. Laureles - PFO Quezon		
29	5. Donna Fe B. Valenzuela - PFO Batangas		
30	6. Princess Marie Alynagen L. Roque, NSAP 4A		
31			
32	BFAR Region VI		
33	 Ryan O. Doronila –FMA 12 Focal 		
34	 Alvin D. Beltran – EAFM FMA 12 Focal/ FMA 12 TWG Member 		
35			
36	Agenda:		
37	1. Updates on the Oil spill in Mindoro Province		
38	2. Updates on FMA plan implementations		
39	3. Other matters		
40	The 2nd quarter meeting of FMA 12 MB was conducted virtually via Go	ogle Meet	
41	on June 29, 2023, starting at 9:15 A.M. It began with an Audio-Visual Presentation (AVP)		

of the prayer, followed by the singing of the Philippine National Anthem and the BFAR

hymn. The Chair, RD Sammy A. Malvas, formally opened the meeting by calling it to order.

Member-Secretariat, Ms. Gemaica C. Moloboco, called the roll, and with a majority of the

members present, a quorum was declared.



Recaro, the NGO representative.

Republic of the Philippines Department of Agriculture

Bureau of Fisheries and Aquatic Resources IV-A Fisheries Management Area 12 Management Board Purok 3, Barangay Bambang, Los Baños, Laguna



The Chair suggested starting the discussion by agreeing upon the agenda items. The Secretariat then displayed the agenda items on the screen. Ms. Moloboco provided an update on agenda number 1, which involved the oil spill in Mindoro Province and its presentation by the Philippine Coast Guard (PCG). She mentioned that she had been coordinating with the PCG and confirmed their participation for agenda number one. However, she also noted that, currently, there was no representative from the PCG present in the meeting. The Chair suggested that while waiting for the PCG representative to join, the meeting should proceed with agenda number 2: Updates on FMA Plan Implementations. With no comments regarding the agenda items, Mayor Florido proposed the approval of the meeting's agenda, which was seconded by Ms. Rosalie G.

The meeting continued with the reading and approval of the minutes from the previous meeting. Mr. Edmundo M. Amican, III, member Secretariat, proceeded to read the minutes of the 1st Quarter FMA 12 MB Meeting.

Pacifico D. Beldia II, the Alternate Representative of the NGO Sector, commented that the secretariat should thoroughly review the audio recordings of the meeting in order to capture all the inputs provided during the discussions. He pointed out that there may be missing inputs from the discussions on the Oil Spill and the Studies in Tayabas Bay regarding the spawning season. He suggested that there might be inputs from other sectors as well that were not included in the minutes. In response, the Chair instructed the Secretariat to review the audio recordings of the previous meeting and ensure that all members' inputs and comments are incorporated into the minutes.

With no further comments, the Chair instructed the Secretariat to circulate the revised minutes to the management board members after the revision. The MB members would then have one week to provide comments on the revised minutes. If no additional comments or inputs were received within that period, the minutes would be considered approved. The Chair specified that the Secretariat would review and prepare the minutes until Tuesday (July 4, 2023). The revised minutes would be circulated to the MB members on Wednesday (July 5, 2023), giving them a week to review and provide comments. If no



Republic of the Philippines Department of Agriculture

Bureau of Fisheries and Aquatic Resources IV-A Fisheries Management Area 12 Management Board Purok 3, Barangay Bambang, Los Baños, Laguna



further inputs were received during this period, the minutes of the meeting would be deemed approved.

The Chair asked the Secretariat if there were any business arising from the previous minutes. Mr. Amican responded that there was none. The Chair then inquired about two subjects mentioned in the minutes. Firstly, the Chair noted that the Secretariat was tasked with preparing the Internal Rules of Procedure (IRP) for the elevated Technical Working Group of FMA 12, as mentioned in the minutes. Mr. Amican confirmed that the Secretariat was currently in the process of drafting the IRP. Initially, the members of BFAR4A who are part of the Secretariat would take the lead in this effort. He also mentioned that Atty. Rhea from Oceana would be providing assistance in creating the IRP. Secondly, with regards to line 322 of the previous minutes, which addressed the issue of superlights, the Chair highlighted that the Secretariat had been instructed to forward the discussion on Fisheries amendments to the National Technical Working Group responsible for such amendments. Mr. Amican clarified that the current option involved considering the creation of a resolution or endorsement, with the assistance of Oceana and other technical working group members, to craft a document. This document would then be endorsed to the National Technical Working Group.

PCPT Edwin A. Cabalag reiterated the need for finalizing the Internal Rules of Procedures (IRP) and Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) for FMA 12. He reminded RD Malvas about the response letter sent by BFAR4A, which addressed the concerns raised by PNP-Maritime's legal department regarding the IRP and MOU of FMA 12. PCPT Cabalag stressed the importance of incorporating the role of PNP-Maritime in the documents. Mr. Amican assured that the revisions would be included. He further elaborated on the challenges associated with signing the documents and suggested that it would be preferable to conduct the signing during the upcoming face-to-face MB Meeting. Subsequently, the next step would involve sending the signed and revised IRP and MOU to the Chief of the Philippine National Police.

Since the representative from the Philippine Coast Guard was still unavailable, the meeting decided to proceed with the main agenda item number two.



Republic of the Philippines Department of Agriculture

Bureau of Fisheries and Aquatic Resources IV-A Fisheries Management Area 12 Management Board Purok 3, Barangay Bambang, Los Baños, Laguna



105

Agenda 2: Updates on the FMA 12 Plan implementation

107 108

109

106

Jesreel M. Narido, FMA 12 Secretariat member presented updates on the FMA 12 Plan implementation with the following highlights:

- 110 111
- FMA 12 Framework Plan Implementation Schedule and Year Implementation with emphasis on the key activities for year 1
- 112 113
- Identified baseline data for Year 1 Implementation and for Year 2 Activities focusing on the critical marine habitats
- 114
- FMA 12 Framework Plan Roll-out in Oriental Mindoro
- 115
- Ways Forward:
- 116
- 117
- 118 119
- 120
- 121
- 122

123

124

125

126

127

128

129

130

131

132

133

- 1. Conduct of Joint Meeting of FMA 12 SAG (Science Advisory Group) and FMA 12 TWG this July 2023
- 2. Consultation Meeting with Commercial Fishing Vessel Operators and Stakeholders of Tayabas Bay targeting Sardinella lemuru
- 3. Consultation Meeting with Fisherfolk engaging in Beach Seine in Tayabas Bay

Mr. Amican elaborated on the discussion for Ways Forward. He mentioned that for the upcoming Joint Meeting of FMA 12 SAG and FMA 12 TWG in July 2023, one of the agenda items to be discussed would be the adopted Reference Points (RPs), Harvest Control Rules (HCRs) and Harvest Control Measures (HCMs), of the FMA 12 MB. As an example, he highlighted the need for specific management actions regarding the conduct of Boat and Gear Inventory (BGI). In the preparation of the resolution requesting the Department of Interior and Local Government (DILG) to urge the Local Government Units (LGUs) for the immediate conduct of inventory, it would be necessary to include details such as the format and specific information required for the BGI. The NSAP (National Stock Assessment Program) could provide the needed information, data, and format for the BGI based on their experience. The TWG could consider adopting the strategies and



Republic of the Philippines Department of Agriculture

Bureau of Fisheries and Aquatic Resources IV-A Fisheries Management Area 12 Management Board



Purok 3, Barangay Bambang, Los Baños, Laguna

procedures utilized during the previous BGI. Another agenda for the joint meeting would focus on preparing the FAO (Fisheries Administrative Order) and potentially developing an Enforcement Plan for in relation to the adopted HCRs of the FMA 12 MB the strict implementation of Fishery Laws. Following these discussions, the Chair directed the Secretariat to finalize the agenda of the meeting and coordinate with the SAG to arrange the scheduled meeting.

RD Malvas provided an overview of the forthcoming consultation meetings to the board. He highlighted that these consultations are the subsequent actions following the adoption of RPs, HCRs, HCMs, and Specific Management Actions for *Sardinella lemuru* by the FMA 12 MB, and emphasized the importance of presenting these adopted management measures to the stakeholders, especially those involved in commercial fishing and beach seine operations targeting *Sardinella lemuru* in Tayabas Bay.

Mr. Beldia raised concerns about the fishing gears mentioned, specifically beach seine. He mentioned that they had conducted a gear mapping study for *Dulong* catch from San Juan down to Balayan Bay and found certain areas where using beach seine may not be feasible due to rocky beach shores and coral reefs. Mr. Beldia suggested that there might be other fishing gear used to catch *Dulong* in those areas, which hasn't been identified yet.

RD Malvas agreed with Mr. Beldia's point and suggested that NSAP might have data or records on other fishing gear used to catch *Dulong*. Dr. Maribeth H. Ramos, Chairperson of the FMA 12 SAG, asked Mr. Beldia to specify the areas concerning the *Dulong* catch data, and they discussed the possibility of complementing or coordinating with the LGU to address this matter.

Mr. Beldia identified San Juan and Lobo as the areas where this concern is applicable. Dr. Ramos replied that they would validate the data once provided by Mr. Beldia, and mentioned that there are recorded catches of *Dulong* in Sariaya.



Republic of the Philippines Department of Agriculture

Bureau of Fisheries and Aquatic Resources IV-A Fisheries Management Area 12 Management Board



Purok 3, Barangay Bambang, Los Baños, Laguna

The Chair suggested that Dr. Ramos should collaborate with Mr. Beldia to precisely identify the areas and explore the possibility of engaging NSAP Enumerators or other means to obtain additional information or raw data on the fishing gears used to catch *Dulong* other than beach seine.

Dr. Ramos expressed her concern to the Secretariat regarding the resolution agreed upon during the last FMA 12 MB meeting to conduct a Boat and Gear Inventory. She inquired about the progress or actions taken regarding this resolution. Additionally, Dr. Ramos asked for an update on the status of the FMA 12 SAG's endorsed RPs, HCRs, HCMs, and Specific Management Actions for *Sardinella lemuru*. She mentioned that they are also in the process of preparing to endorse RPs, HCRs, HCMs, and Specific Management Actions for other species in preparation for the next FMA 12 MB Meeting.

Mr. Amican responded that during the previous TWG meeting, it was decided to have a Joint Meeting for the FMA 12 SAG and FMA 12 TWG. The main objective of this meeting is to discuss the contents of the resolution regarding the Boat and Gear Inventory (BGI), with a specific emphasis on meeting the request by Engr. Michael Casto A. Ras, II, representative of DILG. The focus will be on providing detailed information and specifying the format for conducting the BGI.

Mr. Amican suggested that the TWG could adopt the format used by NSAP in their previous BGI since NSAP has already conducted relevant research on this matter. Additionally, the meeting will also serve as an opportunity for the TWG and SAG to level-off on the adopted RPs, HCRs, HCMs, and Specific Management Actions for *Sardinella lemuru* by the FMA 12 MB. The aim is to establish a general understanding between the SAG and the TWG concerning the RPs and the Study of the Reproductive Biology of *Sardinella lemuru*. He concluded by stating that the joint meeting will be held virtually and is scheduled for this July.

Dr. Ramos assured that they can provide the required form immediately after the meeting. The Secretariat duly took note of this commitment.



Republic of the Philippines Department of Agriculture **Bureau of Fisheries and Aquatic Resources IV-A**

Bureau of Fisheries and Aquatic Resources IV-A Fisheries Management Area 12 Management Board



Purok 3, Barangay Bambang, Los Baños, Laguna

The Chair inquired with the Secretariat about any plans for the roll-out of the FMA 12 Framework Plan in other provinces. Mr. Amican responded that for other provinces, they are facing challenges in integrating the FMA 12 Roll-out into their already programmed annual investment plans and PPA (Plans, Programs and Activities). However, they are actively seeking opportunities for strategic partnerships and collaborations where the FMA 12 Roll-out can be incorporated. Mr. Amican cited the example of the successful roll-out of the FMA 12 Framework Plan in Oriental Mindoro, which was a joint effort involving BFAR MIMAROPA, the Provincial Government of Oriental Mindoro, and the Malampaya Foundation Inc.

Mr. Amican emphasized that TWG Member Ms. Marilyn M. Alcanices suggested conducting face-to-face roll-outs due to their effectiveness in receiving immediate feedback. The plan involves sending invitations to the provinces and NGOs that can actively engage in the roll-out process. Another strategy is to incorporate the roll-out into the regular meetings of the provinces or align it with ongoing activities of NGOs.

Regarding the forthcoming consultation meetings, RD Malvas instructed the Secretariat to finalize and confirm the suitable months for conducting these meetings. Furthermore, he directed them to collaborate with the SAG to prepare the presentation of RPs and, if applicable, HCRs, HCMs, and Specific Management Actions for other species in FMA 12 for the upcoming MB Meeting.

Dr. Ramos mentioned that the SAG will first deliberate before the endorsement for other species to the FMA 12 MB. The Chair took note of this comment and instructed the Secretariat to coordinate with the SAG to determine the completion of the deliberation process for the other species.

With no additional remarks, the Chair inquired about the attendance of a representative from the PCG to present the next agenda item. Ms. Moloboco responded by giving updates and mentioning that the designated presenter is currently attending another meeting. However, she assured the board that there is a representative available to share the updates on the oil spill as planned.



Republic of the Philippines Department of Agriculture

Bureau of Fisheries and Aquatic Resources IV-A Fisheries Management Area 12 Management Board



Purok 3, Barangay Bambang, Los Baños, Laguna

Agenda 1: Updates on the Oil Spill

Ensign John Paul Taan provided updates on the MV Princess Oil Spill incident. Approximately 800,000 liters of oil and fuel have been released and contained from the sunken ship, affecting the Municipalities of Naujan, Calapan, Pola, and Puerto Galera. A total of 893 responders, including 416 Philippine Coast Guard personnel, 232 harbor starship personnel, 34 local volunteers, and 211 from other agencies such as AFP, PNP, and BFP, are involved in the response efforts.

The strategy to address the oil spill in Oriental Mindoro involves the use of protection booming, water flushing, and the deployment of water assets of the Philippine Coast Guard to disperse the oil. As of June 13, 2023, 6,879 sacks of oil-contaminated materials, 22 drums of oil-contaminated sorbent materials, and indigenous booms have been collected. The affected shoreline stretches approximately 64.54 kilometers, with 64.41 kilometers already cleaned. Only a small portion of the shoreline is still covered by the oil spill. The affected mangrove area is approximately 9589 sq. meters, with 99.81% of the oil spill contained. The Philippine Coast Guard continues to work diligently to collect the remaining oil from the sunken ship.

The Chair requested input from anyone in the meeting who had knowledge of the oil spill incident, particularly those within the affected area. Mr. Beldia shared that the Malampaya Foundation has focal sites within the areas severely impacted by the oil spill, which include Pola, Pinamalayan, Gloria, and Bulalacao in the south. In the north, focal sites for marine conservation are located in Baco, San Teodoro, and Puerto Galera.

Mr. Beldia mentioned that Pola was one of the areas hardest hit by the oil spill. Over the past ten years, active reef monitoring has been carried out in the marine protected areas (MPAs) within the mentioned focal sites. This monitoring effort involves the Provincial Agriculture Office, BFAR, representatives from the DENR, and other sectors, including fisherfolks. Last year, in 2022, the team completed a species inventory of the MPAs in the designated areas.



Republic of the Philippines Department of Agriculture eau of Fisheries and Aquatic Resources

Bureau of Fisheries and Aquatic Resources IV-A Fisheries Management Area 12 Management Board Purok 3, Barangay Bambang, Los Baños, Laguna



Mr. Beldia reported that in areas where the fishing ban has been lifted, such as Gloria in the south, no significant changes in the abundance of reef fishes within the MPAs were observed. He added that biomass estimates in the MPAs, including in Pinamalayan and Pola, have high to very high biomass estimates.

So far, there have been no significant impacts observed in the biomass and abundance of marine life due to the oil spill. However, since the fishing ban is still in effect in Pinamalayan and Pola, Mr. Beldia's team has not been allowed to dive in those areas yet.

In areas where fishing has been allowed, fishermen have reported notable observations. Due to an extended ban on fishing, in addition to the annual closed season in Oriental Mindoro from November 15 to January 15, followed by strong waves that hindered fishing activities, the sea experienced an extended period of break. After the oil spill incident, fishermen observed a more productive fishing environment, with larger fish catches as the main result.

Mr. Beldia shared that a Network Meeting of Mindoro is scheduled for tomorrow, during which they will be presenting the details of the species inventory. He suggested that in the upcoming FMA 12 MB Meeting, he could allocate 5-10 minutes to present the findings or alternatively submit a copy of the presentation to the SAG for inclusion in the records of the FMA 12 MB. The information from the presentation could hold significance in enhancing the general understanding of the FMA 12 MB Members regarding the impact of the oil spill.

The Chair mentioned that the Oil Spill has reportedly reached the Visayas Area in Panay. To gain more information, the Chair inquired with representatives from Region 6 about the situation of the Oil Spill in their area. Mr. Erwin Ilaya responded that the oil spill is contained within the region's area.

RD Malvas added that a similar situation is observed in Region 4A, particularly in the Batangas area, where sightings of the Oil Spill a few weeks after the incident were promptly contained without significant spread or impact.



Department of Agriculture Bureau of Fisheries and Aquatic Resources IV-A Fisheries Management Area 12 Management Board Purok 3, Barangay Bambang, Los Baños, Laguna

Republic of the Philippines



Based on the updates provided and information shared by Mr. Beldia, the Chair is confident that there is a general understanding of the oil spill situation. Additionally, he mentioned that the BFAR Central Office is conducting regular water quality monitoring and fish sampling to check for harmful substances or chemicals that may be transferred to fish meat. However, based on the press release from the BFAR Central Office, the monitoring indicates that the levels of these substances are currently at a safe level.

With no further inputs or comments on the agenda, the Chair moved on to other matters and inquired if any members of the board had any other issues they wished to discuss.

Dr. Ramos shared about the INSPIRE project of ABS-CBN Foundation. She mentioned that the foundation has requested to present their project to the MB. The Chair agreed and confirmed that the foundation will be notified and accommodated for the presentation in the next meeting.

Mr. Beldia provided information about the efforts of the Batangas Network in updating the policies of municipalities for their seasonal closure. Ground level activities are scheduled to begin this July, during which municipalities will pass ordinances related to the closure.

RD Malvas added that there will be no closure for Balayan Bay this year due to the expiration of the resolution from the province of Batangas, which was not renewed.

Mr. Wilfredo A. Hernandez, the representative of IFARMC Balayan Bay, commented that they are currently in the process of crafting the Ordinance for the resumption of the Closed Season in Balayan Bay. Furthermore, Mr. Hernandez inquired about the ongoing effort of DENR to manage the Verde Island Passage. He sought clarification on the stance of the FMA 12 MB regarding this matter.

Mr. Beldia provided information about the latest activity involving DENR-BMB and the VIP Management Board, where efforts were presented to declare the Verde Island Passage (VIP) as a Protected Area. They are currently conducting a protected area suitability assessment for the provinces within VIP, based on Executive Order 578 and the E-NIPAS Act. These policies aim to declare critical areas for conservation due to their



Republic of the Philippines Department of Agriculture

Bureau of Fisheries and Aquatic Resources IV-A Fisheries Management Area 12 Management Board



Purok 3, Barangay Bambang, Los Baños, Laguna

marine biodiversity significance and ensure their protection as a Protected Area. As of now, there is no specific call for the next VIP Management Board meeting, which typically involves various provinces in further discussions to advance the process of declaring VIP as a Protected Area.

Mr. Beldia mentioned that similar to the initiatives of other FMAs, there will be discussions between agencies like DENR and BFAR regarding the declaration of the Verde Island Passage (VIP) as a protected area. He believes that if VIP becomes a protected area, BFAR will be part of the Management Board responsible for overseeing it. As of the latest update, Mr. Beldia stated that he has no further information regarding the current status, despite the fact that many congressmen are actively pursuing for this effort.

RD Malvas expressed that in the event that the Verde Island Passage (VIP) becomes a Protected Area, there will be a need to examine how the FMA 12 Management Board and the Management Body of VIP as a Protected Area can work together in a complementary manner, as their shared objective is environmental protection. He also mentioned the concept of sub FMAs, where the VIP Protected Area could be managed as a Sub FMA, indicating its integration within the broader framework of fisheries management. RD Malvas also added that BFAR will be in communication with DENR regarding the efforts to designate VIP as a Protected Area.

On the matter of the close season in Balayan Bay, where the crafting of an ordinance or resolution for its implementation is currently underway, the Chair suggested that Mr. Hernandez can inform BFAR4A if any technical assistance is required during the ongoing process.

Upon the Secretariat's request for the schedule of the next meeting, the Chair proposed tentatively setting the next MB Meeting in August 2023, which will likely be conducted virtually. With no objections raised, the schedule for the next MB Meeting was approved.

Regarding the upcoming meeting, the Chair instructed the Secretariat to draft a letter inviting the ABS-CBN Foundation to present their INSPIRE project. Additionally, the Chair reminded Mr. Beldia about his presentation for the next meeting, and Mr. Beldia confirmed his commitment to do so.



Republic of the Philippines Department of Agriculture Bureau of Fisheries and Aquatic Resources IV-A Fisheries Management Area 12 Management Board



Purok 3, Barangay Bambang, Los Baños, Laguna

336					
337	After a photo documentation, Mr. Ilaya moved for the adjournment at 11:22 and				
338	was seconded by Ms. Rosalie G. Recaro.				
339					
340	Prepared by:	Certified True and Correct:			
341					
342					
343	JESREEL M. NARIDO	EDMUNDO M. AMICAN, III			
344	Member-Secretariat, FMA 12	Member-Secretariat, FMA 12			
345 346	Aquacultural Tech. I, BFAR 4A	FMA Coordinator			
340					
347	Reviewed/Attested by:	Approved by:			
240					
348					
349					
350	ALLAN U. CASTILLO	SAMMY A. MALVAS			
351	FMA Focal, Head Secretariat	Chairperson, FMA 12 MB			
352	Chief, FMRED	Regional Director, BFAR 4A			
		_			