



Republic of the Philippines
Department of Agriculture
Bureau of Fisheries and Aquatic Resources IV-A
Fisheries Management Area 12 Management Board
Purok 3, Barangay Bambang, Los Baños, Laguna



MINUTES OF THE 4th QUARTER MEETING OF FISHERIES MANAGEMENT AREA 12
(FMA 12) MANAGEMENT BOARD (MB)

Date : December 6, 2022

Time : 9:45 A.M.

Location: BFAR 4A Regional Office, Los Baños, Laguna (blended manner)

MB Members Present:

Chairperson : BFAR Region 4A - **Sammy A. Malvas**

Co-chairperson Local Chief Executive **Hon. Matt Erwin V. Florido** (virtual)

Sectoral-

Representatives : Municipal Fishing Sector - **Rodrigo A. De Jesus**

Commercial Fishing Sector - **Melanie P. Catapang**

Academe - **Dr. Yasmin H. Primavera-Tirol** (virtual)

NGO - **Rosalie G. Recaro**
Pacifico D. Beldia II (alternate-virtual)

IFARMC - **Wilfredo A. Hernandez**

PAMB - **Dir. Nilo B. Tamoria, CESO III** represented
by **Mr. Joseph Gascon**

PNP-Maritime Group - **PCPT Edwin A. Cabalag**

Philippine Coast Guard - **CG CAPT Victorino Ronaldo Y Acosta IV**
represented by **CG LTJG Angeline Victoria**
A. Madrona

PFDA **Custodio L. Balaoing, Jr.**

DILG **Michael Casto A. Ras, II** (virtual)

Absent: Aquaculture Sector - **Atty. Immanuel L. Sodusta**

Marketing/Processor - **Dyna V. Bonites**

Indigenous People - **Oliver S. Tamboon**

IFARMC - **Eddy P. De Mesa**



13

14 **FMA 12 Secretariat (BFAR Region 4A)**

- 15 1. Dr. Sonia G. Olaivar-Elloso, Head Secretariat
16 2. Edmundo M. Amican, III, OIC - FRMS/ FMA Coordinator
17 3. Catherine N. Amican, Aquaculturist I, PFO Batangas
18 4. Gemaica C. Moloboco, FMA Secretariat
19 5. Jomar L. Villamor, FMA Secretariat
20 6. Jesreel M. Narido, FMA Secretariat

21

22 Online Attendees:

23 **BFAR Region 4A**

- 24 1. Dr. Maribeth H. Ramos, SAG Chair/Project Leader, NSAP4A
25 2. Princess Marie Alynagen L. Roque, NSAP 4A

26

27 **BFAR Region V**

- 28 1. Diomedes P. Ballebar, OIC – PFO Masbate
29 2. Richmar B. Villas, FMA Focal
30 3. Darwin B. Altabano, PLGU Masbate

31

32 **BFAR Region VI**

- 33 1. Lorna H. Angor, OIC-FMRED
34 2. Edwin Javier – PFO Capiz
35 3. Alvin Beltran – FMA Focal
36 4. Ryan Doronila – Alternate Focal-FMA 12

37

38 **Other Attendees (face-to-face):**

- 39 1. Franciso SB. Torres Jr., Sr. SRS, NFRDI
40 2. Nicko Amor L. Flores, SRS I, NFRDI

41

42



Republic of the Philippines
Department of Agriculture
Bureau of Fisheries and Aquatic Resources IV-A
Fisheries Management Area 12 Management Board
Purok 3, Barangay Bambang, Los Baños, Laguna



Agenda:

1. Orientation on the meaning and significance of Reference Points, Harvest Control Rules, and Harvest Control Measures in relation to the management measures to be adopted in Fisheries Management Areas
2. Presentation on the results of findings on *Sardinella lemuru* (Bali sardines) in Tayabas Bay
3. Presentation and approval of FMA 12 EAFM Framework Plan (final draft)
4. Other matters

The 4th quarter meeting of FMA 12 MB was conducted in a blended manner on December 06, 2022, that started at 9:45 A.M. It began through an Audio-Visual Presentation (AVP) and was followed by the singing of the Philippine National Anthem. The Chair, RD Sammy Malvas formally opened the session by calling the meeting to order. The head secretariat, Dr. Sonia G. Olaivar-Elloso, called the roll; and having a majority of the members present, a quorum was declared.

The Presiding Officer read the agenda of the meeting and asked for inputs/comments from the members of the Board. Dr. Maribeth H. Ramos, the FMA 12 Science Advisory Group Chairperson, made a clarification on agenda item No. 2, regarding its title. After some discussions, it was made clear that the presentation will cover the data and analysis conducted on *Sardinella lemuru*. This included the data and analysis for the 42 species that were submitted by the National Fisheries Research Development Institute to the Secretary of the Department of Agriculture. Without any more comments and suggestions, the agenda items were moved to be approved by Ms. Rosalie Recaro, the NGO representative, and was seconded by the Co-Chairperson, Mayor Matt Erwin V. Florido.

Hearing no motion to dispense the reading of the minutes, the meeting proceeded with the Reading and Approval of the Minutes Previous Meeting. Mr. Edmundo M. Amican, III, the Secretariat member read the minutes of the 3rd Quarter FMA 12 MB Meeting. The Presiding Officer asked the Board for any corrections and comments. Dr. Yasmin H. Primavera-Tirol, the Academe Sector representative, suggested a revision of the



Republic of the Philippines
Department of Agriculture
Bureau of Fisheries and Aquatic Resources IV-A
Fisheries Management Area 12 Management Board
Purok 3, Barangay Bambang, Los Baños, Laguna



terminology to be used, changing it from "instructed" to "suggested". Without any further observations, minutes of the previous meeting were moved for approval by PCPT Edwin A. Cabalag, representative of the Philippine National Police – Maritime Group, and was duly seconded by Ms. Melanie Catapang, the Commercial Fishing Sector representative.

The meeting proceeded with the Chair asking the secretariat if there were any business arising from previous minutes. Mr. Amican responded that there was none, except for the Memorandum of Understanding to be signed by the head of the Philippine National Police. PCPT Cabalag provided more details on the topic, explaining that only the Chief PNP at the national headquarters is authorized to sign the MOU. To support his statement, he mentioned the most recent MOA regarding the Marine Protected Area Network for Tayabas and Lamon Bay which was signed by the Chief PNP and witnessed by Colonel Greg R. Togonon, the Chief of the Regional PNP-Maritime Group. The Chair instructed the Secretariat to coordinate with the PNP-Maritime Group regarding the matter. The Chair directed the Secretariat to communicate with the PNP-Maritime Group to coordinate the MOU signing with the PNP-Chief.

Dr. Tirol brought up two points regarding the business arising from previous minutes. Firstly, she inquired about the scientific studies that were presented and asked whether the SAG could give a summary with relevant points of the studies that might be useful for the Management Board. In response, Dr. Ramos stated that the SAG could provide abstracts of the studies. The Chair then requested the SAG to provide Dr. Tirol and other interested Members with copies of the abstracts.

The second point that Dr. Tirol emphasized was the agreement made during the previous meeting that Reference Points and Harvest Control Rules would be presented in the current MB Meeting. Dr. Tirol sought clarification as to why there was a need for another delay in the presentation.

Chair Malvas recalled that in the previous MB meeting, the Board Members asked the SAG to present the resolution regarding the recommended RPs, HCRs, and HCMs for *Sardinella lemuru* species in Tayabas Bay in the next MB meeting. In response, the SAG Chair said that the resolution findings would be available before the scheduled MB meeting.



However, the Chair informed the Body that Dr. Ramos informed him through a letter stating that the SAG would be unable to fulfill the agreed presentation during the current meeting.

Dr. Ramos clarified that the delay was due to the necessity for more refinement of data from Tayabas and Batangas Bay areas. She also stated that the training for data refinement analysis had just been recently concluded, which was why the participants begged off to present the data in January 2023 instead.

Ms. Catapang asked Dr. Ramos regarding the data and recommendations that the SAG had agreed to present at the current meeting, and which Dr. Ramos had promised to provide. Dr. Ramos responded by saying that the SAG is currently working on refining and validating the data. She explained that the recommended data to be presented to the MB needs to be carefully examined and analyzed; and that proper consultation with NFRDI is necessary.

The Chair inquired the Secretariat on the progress of Dr. Tirol's suggestion regarding the copyright protection for FMA 12 Logo from the Intellectual Property Office of the Philippines. The Chair then inquired about the progress made by the Secretariat in this regard. Mr. Amican responded that the objective was to apply the Logo by January 2023. The Chair advised that the application might incur expenses and specified that the Board will keep track of the progress of the FMA 12 Logo application.

Agenda 1: Orientation on the meaning and significance of Reference Points, Harvest Control Rules and Harvest Control Measures in relation to the management measures to be adopted in Fisheries Management Areas

Mr. Franciso SB. Torres Jr., Senior Science Research Specialist of the National Fisheries Research and Development Institute presented the meaning of Reference Points (RPs), and Harvest Control Measures (HCMs) in Fisheries Management Areas (FMAs) with the following outline:

- I. What is NSAP? Why NSAP (Description of the program history, rationale and objectives)
- II. Where can we find NSAP?



130 III. Who are part of NSAP, and what do they do? (policy formulators, analysts, data
131 managers/encoders, fish catch monitoring enumerators)

132 IV. How is NSAP Data utilized in fisheries management? (RPs, HCRs, and HCMs)

133 Mr. Torres presented Resolution 2021-02, Series of 2021, a Resolution Approving and
134 Endorsing the Submission of 47 Policy Recommendations of the NFRDI to the
135 Department of Agriculture – Office of the Secretary; and highlighted the portion for FMA
136 12's exploited species (*Sardinella lemuru*) along with its computed performance
137 indicators, recommended HCRs and HCMs.

138 The Presiding Officer highlighted the key points of the presentation and sought any
139 clarification from members of the Board. Dr. Yasmin H. Primavera-Tirol, the Academe
140 Sector Representative, inquired if there were any reference materials or experiences that
141 can be used to guide the policy-making process assuming that the correct data was
142 obtained since a recommended management action had already been proposed. The
143 Presiding Officer emphasized the need to determine if the management action presented
144 was ready for adoption.

145 Mr. Torres suggested that the SAG should first discuss the recommended specific actions,
146 taking into account the technicalities involved, such as the exact number of fishing days
147 per boat and the specific number of fishing boats operating. The Presiding Officer agreed
148 that the SAG should provide the deliberated numbers for the specific action.

149 Dr. Tirol reiterated her query regarding the policy-making process and stressed the
150 importance of consultation with stakeholders since compliance with the policies (HCMs
151 through Municipal Ordinance or FAO) as agreed upon by the Management Board was
152 necessary when implemented. The Chair explained the possible two tracks for the
153 implementation of the HCMs, namely the adoption of the measures through a local
154 ordinance and the process of consultation and elevation through a Fisheries
155 Administrative Order (FAO) specific to Sardines in Tayabas Bay.

156 Dr. Tirol emphasized the significance of the participation of stakeholders in the process.
157 The stakeholders' engagement and consultation must consider flexibility in the



Republic of the Philippines
Department of Agriculture
Bureau of Fisheries and Aquatic Resources IV-A
Fisheries Management Area 12 Management Board
Purok 3, Barangay Bambang, Los Baños, Laguna



discussions or agreements, including policies that are acceptable and feasible to implement for the stakeholders, in line with the goal of reducing sardine mortality. In addition, she stressed that stakeholders must be involved in decision-making, with careful consideration of the potential impacts of agreed policies.

Mr. Pacifico Beldia, the alternate representative for NGOs, concurred that the decision-making process should be balanced and noted that the process can be fragmented at the municipal level. He pointed out that the track of adopting the HCMs through a local resolution or ordinance could be slow and fragmented since not all LGUs may adopt them. Instead, he emphasized a better track for the Management Board to adopt, which is the formulation of a policy through a Fisheries Administrative Order to be implemented by the municipalities.

The Chair concluded that a quicker approach would be to adopt the HCMs through a Fisheries Administrative Order, rather than relying on LGUs to adopt them through local ordinances or resolutions. The adoption process at the LGU level may take longer and not all LGUs may choose to adopt the HCMs through local ordinances, resulting in a fragmented implementation.

The Chair sought advice from Mr. Torres on whether the Management Board should wait for the refined data from the SAG or to proceed with using the presented HCRs, Management Actions, and Specific Actions for policy-making. Dr. Tirol also inquired whether the refinement from the SAG would greatly alter the recommended HCRs, Management Actions, and Specific Actions. Mr. Torres replied that there would not be significant changes, but rather the management measures would be strengthened.

Dr. Ramos stated that the refined data, including the HCRs, Management Actions, and Specific Actions, will be presented in January 2023. Chair Malvas acknowledged the date given by Dr. Ramos. The Chair directed the Secretariat to inform the Management Board of the next scheduled meeting after the SAG's refinement.



Agenda 2: Presentation on the results of findings on *Sardinella lemuru* (Bali sardines) in Tayabas Bay

Princess Marie Alynagen L. Roque, Head Secretariat of FMA 12 SAG presented the briefer on the status of Philippine Capture Fisheries issued by NFRDI (As of August 17, 2022).

Flashed on the screen was attachment 1. List of species found exploited and their performance indicators, specifically for Region 4A, the indicators for *Sardinella lemuru*.

The Chair sought a detailed explanation, visual representations, or graphs that can help them understand the figures presented. He inquired about how the SAG arrived at the Reference Points. Dr. Ramos stated that the details will be provided in January and that explaining it in just an hour is not possible.

Mr. Custodio Baloing, representative from the Philippine Fisheries Development Authority, asked about the meaning of the indicators on the screen and their relevance to policy formulation, while Ms. Melanie Catapang inquired about the methodology used to establish the Standard Limit Reference Points. Mr. Torres explained how Bali sardinella became exploited.

Mr. Torres provided an explanation of how the Bali sardinella in Tayabas Bay was overfished, citing that two out of three indicators exceeded the limit reference points.

Dr. Tirol asked about the years covered by the analyzed data set and whether the refined data would be presented in January 2023, and if there would be any changes in the methodology. Dr. Ramos replied that the current report was based on data from 2018, but a different data set would be used as required by NFRDI. She explained that data from 2020 and 2021 are erratic due to the pandemic, so the agreed-upon data set for analysis would only cover until 2019.

The Chair asked if the pandemic could have resulted in an increase in fish stocks due to fishing restrictions. Dr. Tirol also asked if it would be possible to compare the 2021-2022 data (if available) to the 2018-2019 data to determine if the pandemic had an impact on the fish stock. Dr. Ramos responded that the 2021-2022 data could be analyzed, but only



in terms of production data since length frequencies were not measured in 2020 and 2021.

Mr. Torres mentioned that he would try to review the most recent data and see if it could be analyzed to identify any significant differences between pre-pandemic and post-pandemic periods. Dr. Ramos added that they would explore which statistical analysis would be suitable for that dataset, and suggested that analyzing the production trend could be a basic analysis. Chair Malvas requested Mr. Torres' assistance in analyzing the latest data on *Sardinella lemuru*, to which Mr. Torres agreed to provide guidance

Mr. Beldia mentioned that it would be useful to present the confidence level of the analyzed data to stakeholders, indicating how representative it is of the entire fishing ground or management area. Mr. Torres acknowledged the comment and suggested that they can incorporate statistical confidence in their analysis.

Agenda 3: Presentation and approval of FMA 12 EAFM Framework Plan (final draft)

Mr. Amican presented the final draft of FMA 12 EAFM Framework Plan with the following Outline:

- I. FMA Framework Plan Overview
- II. Executive Summary
- III. Chapter 1 – Introduction: The 12 FMA in Philippine Waters, Overview of the Framework Planning Process
- IV. Chapter 2 – FMA Profile
- V. Chapter 3 - Issues and Threats
- VI. Chapter 4 – Management Framework: Vision, Goals, Objectives, Management Actions, Monitoring and Evaluation, and Communication Strategy

According to Mr. Amican, the presentation contains the definitive content for the FMA 12 Framework Plan, which will be subject to approval. After it's approved, the layout design of the Framework Plan will be created for widespread production and publication. The subsequent phase involves distributing a copy of the final FMA 12 Framework plan to



Republic of the Philippines
Department of Agriculture
Bureau of Fisheries and Aquatic Resources IV-A
Fisheries Management Area 12 Management Board
Purok 3, Barangay Bambang, Los Baños, Laguna



coastal municipalities within FMA 12. By 2023, the plan will be rolled out to initiate the consultation and implementation process of the framework plan.

Dr. Tirol congratulated the whole team of FMA 12 EAFM Technical Working Group who underwent a series of workshops to craft the final draft of the FMA 12 EAFM Framework Plan. Dr. Tirol suggested coming up with a simplified 5-year calendar or matrix where the yearly targets and major activities are reflected.

Mr. Amican replied that the TWG will prepare a simplified 5-year implementation schedule or matrix to be included in the Monitoring and Evaluation section of the Framework plan.

Regarding the cover photo of the Framework Plan, Chair Malvas suggested to the TWG that they can come up with 3 options for the final cover photo of the framework plan to be decided by majority votes of the members of the Board.

In conclusion, the FMA 12 MB unanimously approved in principle the adoption of the FMA 12 Management Framework Plan.

The Presiding Officer asked for any other matters to be discussed. Without any further concern, the meeting was adjourned at 3:36 PM.

Prepared by:

Certified True and Correct:

JESREEL M. NARIDO
Member-Secretariat, FMA 12
Aquacultural Tech. I, BFAR 4A

EDMUNDO M. AMICAN, III
Member-Secretariat, FMA 12
FMA Coordinator

Reviewed/Attested by:

Approved by:

DR. SONIA G. OLAIVAR-ELLOSO
FMA Focal, Head Secretariat
Chief, FMRED

SAMMY A. MALVAS
Chairperson, FMA 12 MB
Regional Director, BFAR 4A