

# Another Cone for Integration

Fred J. Hickernell

*Room E1-208, Department of Applied Mathematics, Illinois Institute of Technology,  
10 W. 32<sup>nd</sup> St., Chicago, IL 60616*

---

## Abstract

*Keywords:* adaptive, automatic, cones, function recovery, guarantee, integration, quadrature

*2010 MSC:* 65D05, 65D30, 65G20

---

## 1. Introduction

In [1] we considered the problem of integration and the cone of integrands

$$\mathcal{C}_\tau := \{f \in \mathcal{V}^1 : \text{Var}(f') \leq \tau \|f' - f(1) + f(0)\|_1\}, \quad (1)$$

where the total variation and the  $\mathcal{L}_p$  norms are defined as

$$\begin{aligned} \text{Var}(f) &:= \sup_{\substack{n \in \mathbb{N} \\ 0=x_0 < x_1 < \dots < x_n=1}} \sum_{i=1}^n |f(x_i) - f(x_{i-1})|, \\ \|f\|_p &:= \begin{cases} \left[ \int_0^1 |f(x)|^p dx \right]^{1/p}, & 1 \leq p < \infty, \\ \sup_{0 \leq x \leq 1} |f(x)|, & p = \infty, \end{cases} \\ \mathcal{V}^k &:= \mathcal{V}^k[0, 1] = \{f \in C[0, 1] : \text{Var}(f^{(k)}) < \infty\}. \end{aligned}$$

We derived an algorithm [1, Algorithm 4] that was guaranteed for integrands in  $\mathcal{C}_\tau$ . In this note we consider another algorithm and other cones.

First we recall some notation and results from [1]. For all  $n \in \mathcal{I} := \{2, 3, \dots\}$  we have the linear spline:

$$x_{i,n} := x_i := \frac{i-1}{n-1}, \quad i = 1, \dots, n, \quad (2a)$$

$$\begin{aligned} A_n(f)(x) &:= (n-1) [f(x_i)(x_{i+1} - x) + f(x_{i+1})(x - x_i)] \\ &\quad \text{for } x_i \leq x \leq x_{i+1}. \end{aligned} \quad (2b)$$

---

*Email address:* hickernell@iit.edu (Fred J. Hickernell)

The cost of each function value is one and so the cost of  $A_n$  is  $n$ . The dependence of the nodes,  $x_i$  on  $n$  is often suppressed for simplicity. Integrating the linear spline gives us the trapezoidal rule based on  $n - 1$  trapezoids:

$$T_n(f) := \int_0^1 A_n(f) dx = \frac{1}{2n-2} [f(x_1) + 2f(x_2) + \cdots + 2f(x_{n-1}) + f(x_n)].$$

The error of the trapezoidal rule has the following upper bound:

$$\left| \int_0^1 f(x) dx - T_n(f) \right| \leq \frac{\text{Var}(f' - A_n(f'))}{8(n-1)^2} \leq \frac{\text{Var}(f')}{8(n-1)^2}. \quad (3)$$

The variation of the first derivative of  $f$  is bounded below by the variation of the first derivative of the linear spline of  $f$ :

$$\begin{aligned} \text{Var}(f') &\geq F_n(f) := \text{Var}(A_n(f')) \\ &= \begin{cases} 0, & n = 2, \\ (n-1) \sum_{i=1}^{n-2} |f(x_i) - 2f(x_{i+1}) + f(x_{i+2})|, & n \geq 3. \end{cases} \end{aligned} \quad (4)$$

## 2. New Cone, New Algorithm

The new cone considered here is defined as

$$\widehat{\mathcal{C}}_{\hat{\tau}} := \{f \in \mathcal{V}^1 : \text{Var}(f' - A_n(f')) \leq \hat{\tau}(n) \text{Var}(f') \ \forall n \in \mathcal{I}\}, \quad (5)$$

Here  $\hat{\tau} : \mathcal{I} \rightarrow [0, 1]$  is some specified non-increasing function that defines the cone. Integrands in this cone satisfy the following useful properties.

**Lemma 1.** *Let  $N_{\min} = \min\{n \in \mathcal{I} : \hat{\tau}(n) < 1\}$ , and  $\widehat{\mathcal{I}} = \{N_{\min}, N_{\min} + 1, \dots\}$ . For  $f \in \widehat{\mathcal{C}}_{\hat{\tau}}$  it follows that*

$$\text{Var}(f') \leq \frac{F_n(f)}{1 - \hat{\tau}(n)}, \quad \text{Var}(f' - A_n(f')) \leq \frac{\hat{\tau}(n)F_n(f)}{1 - \hat{\tau}(n)}, \quad \forall n \geq \widehat{\mathcal{I}}.$$

*Proof.* Because  $f \mapsto \text{Var}(f')$  is a semi-norm, it follows that for all  $f \in \widehat{\mathcal{C}}_{\hat{\tau}}$  and all  $n \in \mathcal{I}$ ,

$$\text{Var}(f') \leq \text{Var}(f' - A_n(f')) + \text{Var}(A_n(f')) \leq \hat{\tau}(n) \text{Var}(f') + F_n(f).$$

Rearranging the terms in this inequality leads to the desired results provided that  $\hat{\tau}(n) < 1$ .  $\square$

**Algorithm 1** (New Cone Adaptive Univariate Integration). Let the sequence of algorithms  $\{T_n\}_{n \in \mathcal{I}}$ ,  $\{F_n\}_{n \in \mathcal{I}}$ , and  $\widehat{\mathcal{C}}_{\hat{\tau}}$  be as described above. Set  $i = 1$ , and let  $n_1 = N_{\min}$ . For any error tolerance  $\varepsilon$  and input function  $f$ , do the following:

**Step 1. Bound  $\text{Var}(f')$  and check for convergence.** Compute  $F_{n_i}(f)$  in (4).  
Check whether  $n_i$  is large enough to satisfy the error tolerance, i.e.

$$\hat{\tau}(n)F_{n_i}(f) \leq 8(n-1)^2\varepsilon.$$

If this is true, then return  $T_{n_i}(f)$  and terminate the algorithm.

**Step 2. Increase the number of trapezoids.** If the above condition is false, choose

$$n_{i+1} = \min\{n \in \mathbb{N} : (n-1)/(n_i-1) \in \{2, 3, \dots\}, \hat{\tau}(n)F_{n_i}(f) \leq 8(n-1)^2\varepsilon\}.$$

Go to Step 1.

### 3. The New Cone's Relationship to Other Cones

The cone defined in (5) makes Algorithm 1 work. In this section we show that it contains and is contained in other cones that might be more intuitive. The family of cones of interest are defined as

$$\mathcal{C}_{\tilde{\tau}} := \{f \in \mathcal{V}^1 : \text{Var}(f' - A_n(f)') \leq \tilde{\tau}(n) \|f' - A_n(f)'\|_1, \ n \in \mathcal{I}\}, \quad (6)$$

where  $\tilde{\tau} : \mathcal{I} \rightarrow (1, \infty)$ . Under this definition  $\mathcal{C}_{\tau}$  corresponds to defining  $\tilde{\tau}(2) = \tau$ ,  $\tilde{\tau}(n) = \infty$  for  $n > 2$ . To facilitate the comparison of  $\mathcal{C}_{\tilde{\tau}}$  and  $\hat{\mathcal{C}}_{\hat{\tau}}$  we prove the following lemma.

**Lemma 2.** *Let  $n = p(m-1) + 1$  for some positive integer  $p$ . Then*

$$F_n(f) \leq 2^{p-1} \|f' - A_n(f)'\|_1, \quad \forall f \in \mathcal{V}^1$$

*Proof.* For all  $f$

$$\begin{aligned}
F_n(f) &= (n-1) \sum_{i=1}^{n-2} \left| f\left(\frac{i-1}{n-1}\right) - 2f\left(\frac{i}{n-1}\right) + f\left(\frac{i+1}{n-1}\right) \right| \\
&= (n-1) \sum_{k=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{p-2} \left| f\left(\frac{k-1}{m-1} + \frac{j-1}{p(m-1)}\right) - 2f\left(\frac{k-1}{m-1} + \frac{j}{p(m-1)}\right) \right. \\
&\quad \left. + f\left(\frac{k-1}{m-1} + \frac{j+1}{p(m-1)}\right) \right| \\
&= (n-1) \sum_{k=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{p-2} |f(x_{p(k-1)+j}) - 2f(x_{p(k-1)+j+1}) + f(x_{p(k-1)+j+2})| \\
&\leq (n-1) \sum_{i=1}^{n-2} \left| f(x_i) - f(x_{i+1}) + \frac{f(1) - f(0)}{n-1} \right| \\
&\quad + (n-1) \sum_{i=1}^{n-2} \left| -f(x_{i+1}) + f(x_{i+2}) - \frac{f(1) - f(0)}{n-1} \right| \\
&\leq 2 \sum_{i=1}^{n-1} \left| f(x_{i+1}) - f(x_i) - \frac{f(1) - f(0)}{n-1} \right| \\
&= 2(n-1) \|A_n(f)' - f(1) + f(0)\|_1 \\
&\leq 2(n-1) \|f' - f(1) + f(0)\|_1.
\end{aligned} \tag{7}$$

□

Recall from [1] that

$$\begin{aligned}
\|f' - f(1) + f(0)\|_1 &\geq \tilde{F}_n(f) := \|A_n(f)' - A_2(f)'\|_1 \\
&= \sum_{i=1}^{n-1} \left| f(x_{i+1}) - f(x_i) - \frac{f(1) - f(0)}{n-1} \right|.
\end{aligned}$$

Moreover, for all  $f \in \mathcal{V}^1$

$$\begin{aligned}
F_n(f) &= (n-1) \sum_{i=1}^{n-2} |f(x_i) - 2f(x_{i+1}) + f(x_{i+2})| \\
&\leq (n-1) \sum_{i=1}^{n-2} \left| f(x_i) - f(x_{i+1}) + \frac{f(1) - f(0)}{n-1} \right| \\
&\quad + (n-1) \sum_{i=1}^{n-2} \left| -f(x_{i+1}) + f(x_{i+2}) - \frac{f(1) - f(0)}{n-1} \right| \\
&\leq 2 \sum_{i=1}^{n-1} \left| f(x_{i+1}) - f(x_i) - \frac{f(1) - f(0)}{n-1} \right| \\
&= 2(n-1) \|A_n(f)' - f(1) + f(0)\|_1 \\
&\leq 2(n-1) \|f' - f(1) + f(0)\|_1.
\end{aligned} \tag{8}$$

**Theorem 1.** For any non-increasing  $\hat{\tau} : \mathcal{I} \rightarrow (1, \infty)$ , let

$$\tau = \min\{2(n-1)\hat{\tau}(n) : n \geq N_{\min}\}.$$

It follows that  $\widehat{\mathcal{C}}_{\hat{\tau}} \subseteq \mathcal{C}_{\tau}$ .

*Proof.* For all  $f \in \widehat{\mathcal{C}}_{\hat{\tau}}$  it follows from (9) that

$$\text{Var}(f') \leq \hat{\tau}(n)F_n(f) = 2(n-1)\hat{\tau}(n)\|f' - f(1) + f(0)\|_1 \quad \forall n \geq N_{\min}.$$

Applying the definition of  $\tau$  completes the proof.  $\square$

Now we define a cone that is contained in  $\widehat{\mathcal{C}}_{\hat{\tau}}$ . Let

$$\widetilde{\mathcal{C}}_{\hat{\tau}} := \{f \in \mathcal{V}^1 : \text{Var}(f') \leq \tilde{\tau}(n)\|f' - f(1) + f(0)\|_1 \quad \forall n \geq 3\}, \tag{9}$$

**Theorem 2.** For any non-increasing  $\hat{\tau} : \mathcal{I} \rightarrow (1, \infty)$ , let

$$\tau = \min\{2(n-1)\hat{\tau}(n) : n \geq N_{\min}\}.$$

It follows that  $\widehat{\mathcal{C}}_{\hat{\tau}} \subseteq \mathcal{C}_{\tau}$ .

*Proof.* For all  $f \in \widehat{\mathcal{C}}_{\hat{\tau}}$  it follows from (9) that

$$\text{Var}(f') \leq \hat{\tau}(n)F_n(f) = 2(n-1)\hat{\tau}(n)\|f' - f(1) + f(0)\|_1 \quad \forall n \geq N_{\min}.$$

Applying the definition of  $\tau$  completes the proof.  $\square$

## References

- [1] N. Clancy, Y. Ding, C. Hamilton, F.J. Hickernell, Y. Zhang, The cost of deterministic, adaptive, automatic algorithms: Cones, not balls, 2013. Submitted for publication, arXiv.org:1303.2412 [math.NA].