You are being carbon copied ("cc:'d") on an e-mail "To" "Andre Penna" [penna.andre@gmail.com](mailto:penna.andre@gmail.com)  
CC: "Felipe Pinheiro" [flpinheiro@gmail.com](mailto:flpinheiro@gmail.com), "Fernando Oliveira" [faooliveira@gmail.com](mailto:faooliveira@gmail.com)  
  
Dear Dr. Penna,  
  
We have received the reports from our advisors on your manuscript JOBP-D-18-00067 "Universal and morphological exponents for metabolic biological growth".  
  
With regret, I must inform you that, based on the advice received, the Editors have decided that your manuscript cannot be accepted for publication in the Journal of Biological Physics.  
Below, please find the comments for your perusal.  
  
I would like to thank you very much for forwarding your manuscript to us for consideration.  
  
With kind regards,  
Journals Editorial Office  
Springer  
  
Comments for the Author:  
  
Reviewer #1  
  
This paper deals with the important subject of biological growth, and makes an attempt to blend theory and data. Unfortunately, the paper is poorly written, which makes it difficult to follow, and which does not solely appear to be due to a language deficiency. The different sections are not well introduced, and I had trouble following the steps taken. The introduction does not appear to me to properly introduce the subject matter or cite the relevant sources. The authors do not appear to be aware of the extensive literature on this subject, and they do not cite the relevant authors where they ought to have (examples are included in “Minor comments”, below). The Bertalanffy model is well studied, and the data have all been reported elsewhere, and so I am still not sure I have grasped what is novel with this submission. I do believe it is an important subject, however, and hope the authors will continue to try to make their work more accessible.  
Minor comments:  
P. 2, 1st para: There should be references for the statements made in the introduction. Particularly the claims (First) for a strict relationship between growth and metabolism, and (Second) the existence of universal laws for metabolism. There is growing evidence that the order of causality may be reversed from what is assumed and that changes in growth have downstream effects on metabolism (e.g. see Glazier 2015 “Is metabolic rate a universal pacemaker”).  
p. 2, 2nd para. It is false to state that the “dependence of growth on metabolic rate is universally accepted”. I for one do not agree, and there is abundant evidence to the contrary (see Glazier 2015, mentioned above, for example). Your conclusions seem to contradict this statement: (p. 8: “We conclude that the growth time is very robust independent of the metabolic exponent”).  
p.2, 2nd para. “allotropic” should be “allometric”. Other instances of allotropic should be treated similarly.  
p.2, section 2, 1st para. State what exponents you intend to relate.  
p.3, 1st para. The statement that delta is a universal exponent is not very meaningful and should be removed.   
p. 3 1st para. This “normal procedure” needs to be better described and a citation provided.  
p.3. after eq. 8. I do not think it is surprising that lambda is near 3 if they have remotely similar shapes as they grow.  
p. 4 after eq. (12). I do not understand what |Beta1 – Beta2|/ 2Beta is intended to show.  
p.4 I do not understand how equation 13 was obtained.  
p.4, after eq. 14. What available data is referred to?   
p. 4 2nd last paragraph. I do not understand which authors or data are being referred to.   
p. 5, eq. 15. I did not understand what the two growth times are. An introductory sentence to this section might be helpful. In fact, I think this whole section requires more work to make it more accessible and understood.   
p. 7, 1st para. From where is it inferred that maturation mass is 1-e(-1) of asymptotic mass? Is there a citation for this statement, or does it come from the preceding text?   
p. 8. References are needed for “the results existing in the literature come from different statistical methods…”)  
  
Reviewer #2: The authors claim to include all animals although they exclusively focus on fish. The manuscript clearly needs more background material in this field of research. There are more theories than just the von Bertalanffy growth equation (Dynamic Energy Budget theory, Metabolic theory of Ecology, ...). The implications of these investigations must be discussed in the light of biological processes and the variety of real growth patterns, not only in a mathematical way. As a biologist, I feel that the von Bertalanffy equation is a generalization (only applicable in constant environmental conditions for instance). The authors deem necessary to generalize this principle even more, which seems questionable to me from a practical biological perspective.  
  
  
  
\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*  
The Editorial Manager is at: <https://jobp.editorialmanager.com/>  
  
  
Recipients of this email are registered users for this journal. In line with data privacy directives, we will remove your personal information from the journal's database upon your request. Where the journal's database is shared with companion journals, this will be all-inclusive. Database sharing is indicated at the journal's homepage. At removal, your personal identifiers are hashed and your account is deactivated. We will be unable to reinstate your account history. The history of past manuscript progress is retained scholarly record, and may only be retrieved post-archiving, for official investigation, in line with COPE practices. Once your account is removed, you are no longer known to the journal. As such, it will be possible for journal Editors to re-register you anew, if your contact details and expertise are found in the public record. You will always be notified of a (re)registration, prior to invitation to participate.  If you prefer that the journal persistently  
recalls your wish to not be contacted for invitations to participate, please indicate this. This may be accommodated as a service provision, but necessitates that we maintain a record of your registration details and preference for no-contact. Publication office:  
[PublicationOfficeSPI@springernature.com](mailto:PublicationOfficeSPI@springernature.com)  
  
  
In compliance with data protection regulations, please contact the publication office if you would like to have your personal information removed from the database.