**Title:** Medical Council of India’s new Guidelines on admission of person with specified disabilities- Unfair, Discriminatory & Unlawful

**Author**: Satendra Singh

**Reviewer comments**

It is a well written paper.   
  
But, the author needs to provide end notes and references in the paper, especially with regard to the number of people who sat in on the meeting and decided on the new MCI Rules, and who they were… if the author has some documents to back it – would be good.. or is it the author’s personal knowledge on the issue? It is better to have the backing of some minutes of such meetings or agenda and composition of such committees or authorities deciding on the issue. Highlighted portions in the paper attached needs to be referenced.  
  
The special candidates are being harassed to get certificates from specific institutes – I think only four in the entire country, to be eligible for the disability quota. This is also problematic and could be mentioned in the paper, as it is intrinsic to the topic. Also See:

1. *Anju Talukdar & Anr. v. St. of Assam & ors.* AIR 2009 Guwahati 54 – denial of medical admission to persons with visual disability - illegal.
2. <https://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/city/mumbai/bombay-hc-comes-to-rescue-of-ld-student-directs-authorities-to-verify-documents/articleshow/59563473.cms>
3. <https://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/city/nagpur/admission-for-specially-abled-in-pg-medicine-courses-now/articleshow/63720576.cms>
4. <https://www.thehindu.com/news/cities/chennai/five-disabled-candidates-allotted-mbbs-seats/article19556147.ece>
5. <https://www.youthkiawaaz.com/2018/07/why-medical-counselling-committee-is-refusing-udid-to-harass-candidates-with-disabilities/>
6. <https://indianexpress.com/article/india/mumbai-medical-student-questions-state-panel-to-assess-intellectual-disability-5122391/>

**Editor comments**

The author may avoid expression such as "Nirmal Bhavan bureaucrat" in scholarly article though the same may be fine in other forms of communication. Besides, when he quotes or refers to the MCI positions and claims, he needs to give references. If such claims of the MCI are reported in the newspaper, he should refer to them. Any unsubstantiated attribution to the MCI would weaken the claim of the article to be a piece of scholarship.