**Manuscript evaluation guidelines**Title: Marketing of Oxycontin  
  
1. Importance of the paper  
  
           Does it address issues relevant to the fields of bioethics and medical ethics in the developing countries?

**Yes. The issues are global issues.**  
  
2. Is it topical?  
  
           Is the issue discussed from another country's/culture perspective?  
  
           Will it influence practice or policy?  
  
           Is it too specialized for the journal?

**It is of some importance. It is not too specialized but it is somewhat incomplete.**

3. Originality  
  
           Is the information /comment new?

Is there any likelihood of plagiarism?  
  
**It is not especially novel. This has been one of the consuming issues in healthcare for the last decade. This article provides a good entry to the problem for readers coming new to the issue. There is little likelihood of plagiarism**

4. Conclusions  
           Is the interpretation warranted, unwarranted, well developed?  
  
           Does the article contain loose generalisations?  
  
           Are there any important omissions?

**The difficulty with the article is that the authors describe intense marketing but do not explain how physicians succumbed and changed behavior in such a dramatic fashion. Unless American physicians are the most naïve consumers on earth (an explanation worth considering), it is difficult to explain why this marketing was so successful. It was intense but also crude and obvious. Why did it work?**

5. Other comments  
  
  
6. Recommendation  
  
 Accept as is  
  
 Accept with modifications (specify)  
  
 - style

- substance  
  
**This article is acceptable as is. It would be good if the authors attempted to take on the bigger issue – why the marketing worked. They might be wrong but I think at this stage of this issue, authors have to do more than say – hey the company marketed their drug.**

7. Separate comments for the author

**These comments can all be shown to the author.**

----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

\***Please let us know whether you would like your name to be published as a reviewer of the manuscript. This is optional.**

**Happy to be named.**