**Kumar Ethical implications of RNTCP in India: a framework based analysis**

Internal review comments:

1. This could be a useful paper. It has approached the revised national tuberculosis control programme with the elements of the Nancy Kass framework of public health ethics. However there are some problems in the way the various ethical issues have been handled.

2. Firstly the RNTCP that has been discussed in this paper has evolved a lot over the past few years. Since the 2017 national strategic plan revisions there have been a lot of changes which have been implemented including strategies for active case finding and strategies for treatment of latent TB infections. I think handling these important new changes is very important in this paper. However this paper does not handle the new modifications that has now been introduced in the RNTCP.

3. Moreover the tuberculosis control programme has been rechristened as national tuberculosis elimination program. This brings along with it several important ethical issues. These have also got to be discussed in any ethical discussion.

Recommendation: Therefore my recommendation is for the authors to revise the paper based on new developments and consider a fresh resubmission.