Siddiqui Case study of an elderly patient in the ICU

Review Comments

1. Overall, this is a well written case study. However, I have a few concerns and comments that need to be clarified.
2. On the one hand it is very good that the author declared up front that the case study is fictional. However, I see a need for justifying using a fictional case study to highlight the ethics of care of the elderly patient. A brief justification would add a lot of meaning.
3. My second concern is that the text is verbose and the authors can substantially reduce the word count while still retaining the essence of the discussion.
4. There are some inconsistencies in the narrative. The author states that decision to proceed with surgery was taken without consulting the elderly lady. The author states that her children refer to their mother as being highly stressed and not in a position to make decisions and they also ask the doctor not to tell anything ‘serious’ to the mother. But later on the author mentions that the patient is delirious and lacks the mental capacity to consent.
5. The author does not include the important aspect of the young surgeon, Dr. Omar’s aspirations, heroism and sense of not accepting futility of care. Physicians and surgeons should know where to draw the line and this should be evidence informed and informed by patients’ preference.
6. The four box approach has been mentioned and is very useful. However, the author should give a clear depiction of the patient preference box and the contextual issues box. These are not explained clearly.

---------------------------------------------------------------

----------------------------------------------------