**Title: Parenthood: Assisted Reproductive technology in Nigeria is the law fit for purpose?**

**Authors: Simisola O Akintola, Olohikhuae O Egbokhare**

**Review Comments**

**Reviewer 1**

1. The study is based on specific aspects and communities in Nigeria; most interpretations are warranted and well developed.
2. The paper can be revised as per comments mentioned in the manuscript and the authors may consider the position in India as an addition to the paper.

**Reviewer 2**

1. Title: Perhaps this title would read better with a full colon after ‘Nigeria’.
2. Importance of the paper: This paper is important as it addresses a real situation in Nigeria that calls for scrutiny of the Constitution of Nigeria to ensure that the rights or children and parents (of ART) are protected in case of a dispute. It addresses issues relevant to medical ethics and bioethics in Nigeria, a developing country.
3. Conclusion: in the conclusion - (end of paragraph 1 on page 22 – the authors suggest that Islamic law on parenthood and ART was discussed when it was not discussed. This is the first mention of Islamic law in the paper.
4. Other comments:
   1. Acronyms or abbreviations should be spelt out at first mention and the acronym/abbreviations put in brackets. Thereafter the acronym may be used freely.
   2. Last sentence under 1.1 on page 5 reads: “especially in a country like Nigeria where culture is very important.” I doubt that the writers here mean to refer to culture. Culture is important in all human societies. What they may be referring to is ‘social sensitivity’ or ‘social acceptability’
   3. Line 12 page 14 – reads: “It is clear that these laws do accommodate children conceived” Should there not be the word NOT after do?

**Editor comments**This is an interesting paper which discusses important aspects about the issue of and complexity surrounding the concept and practice of "parenthood" in Nigeria, especially in the light of a plethora of medical technologies. This does not discuss the medical nuances and ethical challenges of practicing ART, but rather highlights the social consequences when set-off against a legal system that is ambiguous at times. The manuscript, after a diligent revision, has the potential to make an impact. That said, the manuscript has to be thoroughly revised in line with comments and observations inserted in the text, before resubmitting. It has to be shortened as well.