|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Reviewer B  2017-05-19 01:05 AM  For author and editor | Subject: The Nurse's Role in the Decision Making intransplanted Kidney Donation: A qualitative research  The premise of the study is interesting since it seeks to reflect the psychosocial and cultural views in Iran regarding kidney donation (living and deceased) and transplantation.    However, the article needs extensive revision before it is considered for publication as illustrated by the following five points:  1. Title is ambiguous: The Nurse’s Role in Decision Making in **Transplanted (delete)** Kidney Donation **and transplantation** **(add)** – a qualitative research  2. Introduction – Some of the statements and references in this section are superfluous and/or incorrect. Given below are some examples -  a) *“The transplanted kidney donor could be dead or alive* ***(4).”- Incorrect reference.***    **(4)** Miñambres E, Pérez-Villares JM, Chico-Fernández M, et al. Lung donor treatment protocol in brain dead-donors: A multicenter study. [J Heart Lung Transplant](https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/?term=Lung+donor+treatment+protocol+in+brain+dead-donors%3A+A+multicenter+study)2015;34(6):773-780.doi: 10.1016/j.healun.2014.09.024.    b) *“Research has shown that the survival rate and quality of life in patients with a cadaveric transplanted kidney is more than those who received a kidney from a living donor* ***(5).”- Incorrect statement.***    **(5)** Jochmans I, Darius T, Kuypers D, et al. Kidney donation after circulatory death in a country with a high number of brain dead donors: 10-year experience in Belgium. [Transpl Int.](https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/?term=Kidney+donation+after+circulatory+death+in+a+country+with+a+high+number+of+brain+dead+donors%3A+10-year+experience+in+Belgium)*.* 2012;25(8):857-866.doi: 10.1111/j.1432-2277.2012.01510.x.    *The reference cited actually reads -* Extensive worldwide experience with living kidney donation, the safety of unilateral nephrectomy in selected healthy living donors [[**43–45**](http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/j.1432-2277.2012.01510.x/full#b43)], the development of minimally invasive surgery, and the **superior results of living versus deceased donor kidney transplantation** [[**46**](http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/j.1432-2277.2012.01510.x/full#b46)], support the further development of living donation in Belgium.    c) *“Statistics show that every month more than 3,000 people will be added to the waiting list for Kidney transplantation.From which 12 people have lost their lives in each day. Therefore, about 4270 patients waiting for Kidney transplantation lost their lives by 2014* ***(10).”- Incorrect reference.***    **(10)** Robinson A, Light D, Nice C. Meta-analysis of Sonography in the Diagnosis of Inguinal Hernias. J Ultrasound Med 2013;32(2):339-346.    d) *Annually 2500 Kidney transplantations are performed in Iran, two-thirds of them are transplanted from living donors and recipients and one-third belong to the patients with brain death****(13)****. –* ***This reference (below) could not be accessed.***     (**13)**    Agency FN. Available at: http://www.farsnews.com/printable.php?nn=13930705000876, 2015.    As per personal email communication from Dr. Katayoun Najafizadeh, Pulmonologist and Intensive Care Specialist, Director of Organ Donation Network Office, Ministry of Health, Tehran, Iran – “There are 5000 to 8000 brain dead annually in Iran. **Nowadays 46 % of kidneys are from brain dead.”**  3. There are a lot of grammatical and syntax errors in the entire article which can be remedied.  ***Example: Under “Counseling”  para 3 line 1* -** People who applied for kidney transplantation did not believe in **donating (should read receiving)** a kidney from the cadaver.  4. ***Incorrect statement*** ***by Nurse Consultant 2 during counseling*** – “…it is proven that life of people who had a kidney transplant from a deceased donor is longer than those who received a kidney from a living donor.” ***This*** ***reiterates authors’ incorrect statement (see 2b above) in the introduction, and therefore affects interpretation.***    5. In the Discussion in Para 7: Regarding spiritual motivation the authors state that participants did not mention nurses inviting missionaries/clergymen as motivators. This seems to be contradicting the previous para 6 where it states that nurses supported spiritual motivation. This point needs to be clarified.  Also in para 8 the phrase  “sense of humanity” is repeated thrice. |
| Reviewer B  2017-05-19 01:05 AM  For editor | Subject: The Nurse's Role in the Decision Making intransplanted Kidney Donation: A qualitative research  As above.  The article is relevant to the Indian medical scene as it applies to Muslims in India also. The article however does not present any significant new insights.  The writing is an impediment to ease of communications of ideas. |